Spirituality and development discourses in Namibia

This item was submitted to Loughborough University’s Institutional Repository by the/an author.

Additional Information:

- A Doctoral Thesis. Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy of Loughborough University.

Metadata Record: [https://dspace.lboro.ac.uk/2134/14092](https://dspace.lboro.ac.uk/2134/14092)

Publisher: © Mary E. Liao

Please cite the published version.
This item was submitted to Loughborough University as a PhD thesis by the author and is made available in the Institutional Repository (https://dspace.lboro.ac.uk/) under the following Creative Commons Licence conditions.

For the full text of this licence, please go to: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/
Pilkington Library

Author/Filing Title: LIAO

Vol. No. Class Mark

Please note that fines are charged on ALL overdue items.

Open Shelf Copy
SPIRITUALITY AND DEVELOPMENT

DISCOURSES IN NAMIBIA

by

MARY E. LIAO

A Doctoral Thesis

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements

for the award of

Doctor of Philosophy

Department of Geography of the Loughborough University of Technology

June 16 2000

© Mary E. Liao 2000
Abstract

The overall goal of this thesis is to examine the newly emerging ideas and practices of spirituality and development. Spirituality and development will be discussed within the broader discourses of alternative development critiques. The issues that arise in the attempts to translate ideas of spirituality and development into practice are examined. The theoretical underpinnings of spirituality and development are analyzed, based on a literature review of spiritual, anti-colonial, post-colonial, feminist, environmental, radical economic, eco-feminist, ecumenical, geographical and anthropological critiques of development. The thesis then explores the discourses of spirituality and development within three Northern donor agencies; the International Development and Research Centre (IDRC), the World Bank and the World Council of Churches (WCC).

The discourses of spirituality and development in Namibia, a country where spirituality has been used both as a tool of oppression and liberation, are then examined. Based on interviews with a variety of Namibian respondents and examination of externally-supported water and sanitation projects serving informal settlements in northern Namibia, the thesis concludes that Namibian discourses on development differ from the constructs of mainstream development ideas and practice, particularly those associated with many Northern donors. It will be seen that Namibian discourses on development clearly encompass spirituality.

It is recognized however that there are problematic issues associated with the translation of spirituality and development into practice. The first concerns the role of institutionalized religion in spirituality and development. The second relates to the potential dangers of cultural relativism. Thirdly, the positionality of the donor agencies initiating spirituality and development discourses deserves comment. Finally the problem of incorporation and how Northern donor agencies can subvert potentially transformative ideas into the mainstream.
The most important contribution this thesis makes to development discourses is the idea that development might well be having a negative impact on the spiritual well being of 'recipients'. Namibian discourse of development spoke of the dehumanizing effects of participation in development projects. There was a profound awareness that the structures and processes of external support projects compromised their dignity, pride and ultimately their soul.

For Northern donor agency initiatives in spirituality and development to be ‘authentic’, they must pay attention to the broadest sense of what spirituality means, not just to ‘Third World recipients’, but equally importantly, to themselves. There can be no single paradigm of spirituality and development.

**Key Words:**

Spirituality and development; post-modern consciousness; global spirituality; spiritual values; cultural relativism; universal values; alternative development; Namibia; pre-colonial ‘traditions’; ‘experiences of spirituality’, development policy and delivery approaches; donor-recipient relations; role of religion/church in development.
Acknowledgements

I am grateful to my supervisor, Dr. Morag Bell who has been extraordinarily patient and supportive over the many years it has taken me to complete this thesis. She gave me the freedom to explore the topic, yet ultimately showed me that idealism could be enhanced with rigorous and critical intellectual scrutiny.

Throughout, my husband Harry has been a stalwart support. Our countless conversations and debates thread their way through all of the ideas written herein. His much greater experience of international development grounded my many wayward ideas. Thank you also for the immeasurable support in taking care of home and family, for enduring desperate trans-Atlantic phone calls, and for always believing in me.

To our children Dominic and Gabby who were 'born into the thesis' and have never know their mother without the specter of it looming overhead, and who, especially Dominic, have listened solemnly to my assurances that I would be done very soon.

I am grateful to my sister Katie who perused bookstores and libraries, photocopying and buying references she knew I would need. Your love and care for Dominic, Gabby and myself are deeply embedded in this thesis.

In Namibia I wish to thank Kauna Ekandjo, who took personal interest in the topic of spirituality and development, shared her candid opinions of development and whose commitment to communities in Namibia fortified my convictions that development needed to change. I am also indebted to Nangula Kathindi and Magdalena Shamena who gave life to the women's church workshops. I am also deeply grateful to all the people who took the time to answer my questions and for sharing their extraordinary insights into development.

A special thanks to Noma Musabayane for sharing some very good times in Oshakati and for teaching me the powers of participatory development.

Many people have helped me along the way. I wish to thank John Kalbermatten and Claudia Sadoff formerly and of, the World Bank not just for organising the difficult access into the World Bank, but also for their interest and encouragement.

Thanks also to Louise Appleton at Loughborough. Although the time was short, it was enormously refreshing to connect with a fellow student after years of academic isolation.

My everlasting gratitude to Ed Hergott, who exposed me to the spiritual wonders of the mountains. Our conversation under the pines sustained me through many a hot dry day in Namibia. Your teaching endures.
# Table Of Contents

Abstract

Acknowledgements

Chapter One Why Spirituality and Development?

1.0 Why Spirituality and Development? 1

1.1 Thesis Goals and Objectives 6

1.2 Thesis Approach 8

1.3 Thesis Outline 10

1.4 Meanings of Spirituality 13

1.4.1 Cosmological Construct 19

1.4.2 Absolute Morals 20

1.4.3 Fusion of Personal and Prophetic Mission: The Larger Purpose 22

1.5 Critiques of Development: Towards an Understanding of Spirituality and Development 27

1.4.1 The Significance of Culture 31

1.4.2 The Transformation of Western Meta-Physics 36

1.4.3 Relational Ethics and North-South Relations 40

1.6 Common Ground with Spirituality and the Broader Context of Spirituality and Development 49

1.6.1 Cultural Relativism, Absolute Morals and Development Ethics 51

Chapter Two Thesis Methodology

2.0 Introduction 64

2.1 Ethics of Geography and Feminist Methodologies 64

2.2 The Standpoint of My Research 66

2.3 Conceptual Approach 69

2.3.1 Research Methodologies 69

2.3.1.1 Literature Review 70

2.3.1.2 Research at the WCC, The World Bank and the IDRC 71

2.3.1.3 Research in Namibia, The Case Study 73

2.3.1.3.1 An Overview of the Case Study 73

2.3.1.3.2 The Ovambo Area: Factors of Selection 76

2.3.1.3.3 Professional Involvement and Research of Two
5.3 Donor-Recipient Relations

5.3.1 Policy Environments of GTZ and IBIS

5.3.1.1 GTZ

5.3.1.2 IBIS

5.3.2 Delivery Approaches of GTZ and IBIS

5.3.2.1 The GTZ Delivery Approach

5.3.2.2 The IBIS Delivery Approach

5.3.3 Overview of the Projects

5.3.3.1 GTZ SWAM

5.3.3.2 The OHSIP Project

5.3.4 Project Experiences

5.3.4.1 Project Planning and Analysis Processes

5.3.4.1.1 ZOPP V Workshop

5.3.4.1.2 Project Identification and Strategy Workshop

5.3.4.1.3 Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation Workshop

5.3.4.1.4 GTZ Gender Workshop

5.3.4.2 Project Management Systems

5.3.4.3 Community Development Approaches

5.4 The Incongruities of Intent and Reality

Chapter Six Namibian Discourses of Development

6.0 Introduction

6.1 Rationale and Information Sought

6.1.1 Elders

6.1.2 Traditional Leaders

6.1.3 Church leaders

6.1.4 CCN staff

6.1.5 Community leaders

6.1.6 Namibian development agents

6.1.7 Informal settlement community members

6.1.8 Churchwomen’s groups

6.1.9 Traditional healers

6.2 Responses

6.2.1 Views on External Support Projects

6.2.2 Concepts of Development

6.2.2.1 Concepts of Spirituality

6.2.2.2 Concepts of Spirituality and Development
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.2.2.3 The Role of the Church in Development</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Development: Negative Impact or Positive?</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Seven Realities of Spirituality and Development</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.0 Introduction</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 What is Spirituality and Development?</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 From Idea to Practice</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1 Institutionalising Spirituality and Development</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2 Cultural Significance</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.3 Donor Positionality</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.4 Incorporation of Spirituality and Development</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Spirituality and Development: Another 'MAD' Discourse?</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Contribution to Knowledge</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1 List of Interviewees</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2 Interview and Questionnaire Content</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 3 Interview and Questionnaire Results</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 4 Background Information on the Project Cycle</td>
<td>418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 5 Background Information on the Logical Framework Analysis LFA</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Maps

Chapter 2:

2.1 Namibia, Showing the Ovambo Area 76
2.2 The Ovambo Area: Four Regions of Oshana, Omusati, Oshikoto, and Ohangwena 77
2.3 The Ovambo Area: Ethnic Boundaries 78
2.4 The Ovambo Area: Main Roads 88
2.4 Location of Interviews in the Ovambo Area 91

Chapter 4:

4.1 Administrative Divisions of Namibia 140
4.2 The Routes of Bantu Migration 153
4.3 Pre-Colonial Settlement Patterns c 1880 154
4.4 The Odentael Plan 1969 163
Tables

Chapter 1:

1.1 Development Models 30

Chapter 5:

5.1 Total External Assistance to Namibia, 1991-1996 192

5.2 Macro-Economic Importance of External Assistance To Namibia 1990-1996 192

5.3 ZOPP Workshops 205

5.4 SWAM and OHSIP Project Descriptions 210-11

5.5 Monitoring and Evaluation Approaches 228

Chapter 6:

6.1 What is Most Important to Development? 277
Figures

Chapter 5:

5.1 GTZ Project Cycle 203
5.2 IBIS Project Cycle 207

Chapter 6:

6.1 Informal Settlement Methodology 261

Appendix 5

AP5-1 Logical Framework Analysis 421
AP5-2 Logical Framework Analysis Linked Hypothesis 422
CHAPTER 1

Why Spirituality and Development?

1.0 Why Spirituality and Development?

... of all historical cultures, that of modernity is perhaps the most one-dimensional and the least open to transcendence. It is marked by spiritual poverty and alienation where many people are deeply spiritually wounded or atrophied. The modern world is a culture with no windows on the wonders of life. While modern psychoanalysis is exploring ever further the recesses of our conscious and unconscious mind, we seem to have lost a sense of soul, a sense of the spiritual nature and destiny of the human being (King 1998, p.104).

Yet Ursula King (1998) believes that humanity is at a cross-roads. More and more, King feels, people are searching for new direction, purpose and meaning in their lives. She believes that this is due to the coming of the post-modern age, and that a new post-modern spirituality is emerging. Astell (1994) describes the two emancipatory and tyrannical impulses that have led to a new post-modern spirituality. “The insistence on empowerment tends to endorse a ruthless battle of power where might determines right. Difference itself becomes totalised, and ethics unmoored; the self-identity of identity politics spawns racism and oppression; the economy consumes the consumer; technology produces the producer; the many are reduced to the one…” (Astell 1994, p. 3). The emancipatory impulse by contrast is one which is intellectually manifested in “incredulity towards metanarratives; politically in demands for empowerment of the marginalised and the destruction of hierarchies; economically in the free play of late capitalist consumerism; technologically in the valorisation of performance; aesthetically in eclecticism, in strategies of multiple perspective, fragmentation and double-coding” (Astell 1994, p. 2).
King (1998) believes that the space between these two impulses has given rise to a new post-modern spirituality. Post-modernism involves the celebration of diversity and recognises that ambiguity and complexity are present in all intellectual, political and cultural positions. King notes that there is much that is ambiguous and contradictory in post-modernism, not least its tendency towards extreme relativism. However, she emphasises that its intellectual stance has allowed us to re-examine all previous approaches to knowledge, power, art and religion. The post-modern critique, she notes, has been particularly valuable in addressing what has been called the "transcendental pretence of modernity" (King 1998, p. 95), a position that has exalted and universalised thinking itself and assumed the workings of one's mind and one's own culture (read Western culture) reflect what is universally rational and human.

King (1998) believes that the post-modern recognition of difference and the 'other' has brought a clearer recognition of our global interdependence, and with it, the urge to move towards the wholeness of the individual and society, and the acknowledgement of the need for profound personal and social transformation. The rise of post-modernism, she argues, has provided new opportunities to elucidate the relationship between praxis and action and thereby created new openings and challenges for theological and religious reflections. Religion, she cautions, however, no longer offers the wisdom that a post-modern society seeks. A simple return to the traditions of spiritual resources afforded by world religions is not enough to meet contemporary spiritual needs. This is particularly true, she argues, in the context of feminism. A comparative study of spiritual traditions in different religions reveals the spiritual search of men was often related to contempt for the body and specifically for women. Thus spirituality and religious traditions must evolve within a context of an open secular society in search of meaning and integration, of greater coherence and new identity.

Development is not immune to this emerging post-modern consciousness. Increasingly, the term spirituality is being explored for its relevance to
development. The World Bank, the International Research and Development Centre in Canada, and the World Council of Churches, as well as some less high profile organisations such as COMPAS, an agricultural NGO based in the Netherlands, The Sister Fund, a foundation that fosters women's and girls' economic, social, political and spiritual lives, nationally and internationally, based in New York City, and the University of Calgary International Centre (DID) in Calgary, have all mentioned spirituality in their mission, vision, or policy statements. For example, the DID states its understanding of development to mean much more than traditional economic growth. “Development is a process anchored to indigenous values and knowledge, defined and controlled through participation of those whose lives are most directly affected. This idea of development encompasses and builds upon notions of community, spirituality, sustainability, and empowerment” (www.ucalgary.ca/international/did/did.html, p. 2).

The Sister Fund Report on the First Five Years (1998) records the Sister Fund's “consistent commitment to the women's movement and social justice as well as the gradual intensification of the spiritual dimension of that commitment” (p. 2). It continues:

Spirituality and justice don't exist without each other. To achieve justice, to create compassionate community, one must organise with tenderness and kindness; to establish peace, one must be at peace. .... The Network addresses mind, body, spirit, and mending relationships, healing the wounds created by racism, patriarchy, and heterosexism. We have pioneered healing methodologies, particularly the use of spirituality and culture in organising, that have helped us to counter burnout....We are learning...to centre ourselves in the spirituality of social justice work (Sister Fund 1998, p.12).

The Fund even allocates specific grants to a “spirituality” category of its programme areas, some 8.82% of its regular grants.

---

1 DID has been designated by CIDA (Canadian International Development Agency) a Centre of Excellence (COE) in Participatory Development.
However, before I began this thesis, I was not aware of the existence of such initiatives, nor of the growing perception within international agencies, of the need to include spirituality in development. I began this thesis purely from a space of personal perceptions and disillusionment with development as a result of working on, and analysing development projects over a five-year period in Namibia. I was disturbed by the bureaucracy of management, the externality of the evaluation/planning processes, the fact that 'recipient communities' held very little decision making power, and that these 'target groups' whose well being were supposedly the ultimate goal of development projects, were, in reality not benefiting to anywhere near the extent that donor agency claimed. I was also disturbed by the superficiality of how gender concerns were being integrated into projects, and at how male-dominated the profession was. Most especially, I was disillusioned about the ways in which relations were structured between the actors involved.

I began to search for perspectives that shared ground with my own perspectives, first within the vast literature of critique and criticism on development within academia and within the work of practitioners. I found that my feelings about development were most closely expressed in those earlier writings of 'Third World' intellectuals and politicians such as Jomo Kenyatta (1938) and Kenneth Kaunda (1962; 1973) and the demands of feminists\(^2\) to remember the humanity of women. Essentially they were talking about the dignity that comes from control over their own lives and the power of self-determination. However they were talking about more than just political autonomy, or economic independence; something much deeper that peered into the soul of what it means to be human. Although the word spirituality, and the term spirituality and development were not used explicitly, it did not take

\(^2\) Numerous feminist authors/references can be cited here for example- Enloe 1989; hooks 1984 and1989; Waring 1988. Specifically in development literature, see Boserup 1989; Denkelman & Davidson 1988; Mohanty 1991; Pietila & Vickers 1990; Rogers 1980 to name just a few.
much to see the relations between concepts such as dignity, cultural freedom, and humanity, and spirituality.

My understanding of spirituality was that it was centrally about the search for identity and the meaning of life. The potential for spirituality and development thus seemed significant. But regardless of my personal feelings on the relevance of spirituality and development, as I came into contact with organisational initiatives on spirituality and development, it seemed important to examine how these organisations defined and enacted spirituality and development. The rationale for why they were promoting spirituality and development, and a means of assessing the validity of both the idea, and the 'authenticity' of its translation into practice needed attention. The underlying principle of this assessment would be whether spirituality and development, both the idea and the practice, held resonance for the people who were supposed to be 'spiritually developed'.

This first chapter provides the background against which spirituality and development has emerged. It has not emerged from an intellectual or practical vacuum, and although its proponents may seek to claim its special transformative powers, it can be seen to belong to a genre of transformative ideas that have periodically shaken up the dominant model of development and caused significant reform. However, evidence suggests that as these ideas are translated into the mainstream of development practice, their reformative powers frequently become diluted.

A perspective on the gender development movement, as represented by Women in Development or WID, is illustrative. Goetz (1994) describes how bureaucratic procedures in development stripped away the political content of feminist concerns, leaving a set of generalised needs for development bureaucracies to administer. "The dominant economic paradigm for evaluating and packaging information for development planning tends to obliterate the implications of women's experiences of development" (Goetz 1994, p. 28). Mueller (1985) calls this process the "bureaucratisation of feminist knowledge". It has been hypothesised that feminism in development, as represented by
WID, has encountered profound bureaucratisation and political resistance for two reasons. First, WID policy proposals were seen as having the potential to undermine male authority, an intrusion that predominantly male staff could not personalise and identify with. Second, it was perceived as being a Western cultural ideology exported inappropriately to the ‘Third World’ (Goetz 1994). Rather than being about gender policy supporting the needs and interests of women in development, WID was de-politicised to the notion of efficiency where the focus became what development needs from women. Crew & Harrison (1998) summarise: “...the commitment to gender analysis only rarely becomes gender-sensitive practice. More frequently it is translated into ‘targeting women’ and gradually exchanged for the practical exigencies of project reality” (p.55).

This is what Porter (1991) refers to in his idea of the master metaphor where revolutionary ideas are swallowed up by the sheer power of the mainstream model of development. Braidotti et al (1988) describes the process:

As solutions to the development crisis become a matter of global survival, and large-scale development programmes introduced to the South represent a formidable legacy of failure, the voices of grassroots’ people have been incorporated into the development discourse enunciated by mainstream development agencies. In a movement of inner reform of development and a response to alternative development thinking and peoples’ movements in the South, Northern NGOs and the development industry at large have continually adopted and operationalised the newly emerging idea from development critics and citizens’ movements. But as these new reformatory elements move from the margins to the centres of power, new and more sophisticated structures of domination are emerging simultaneously (Braidotti et al 1988, p. 133).

1.1 Thesis Goals and Objectives

There are thus three main questions that can be asked of spirituality and development. First, what is spirituality and development? What meanings are accorded it in the literature? How do three specific Northern donor agencies define it? What are Namibian perspectives on it?
Second, how does it fit within the broader discourses of alternative-mainstream development? How does spirituality and development differ from the many alternative critiques of development that have preceded it? What does it offer to development discourses above and beyond what alternative discourses have subjoined to the mainstream perspective?

Third, how does spirituality and development translate from theory into practice? As will be seen, there are some very esoteric ideas encompassed by spirituality and development. How do these translate into concrete methodologies? Additionally, as the idea/s become translated into practice, and merged with mainstream development, do the radical ideas become diluted and assimilated into the dominant model or do they retain their transformative ideals?

The goals and objectives of this thesis relate closely to these three questions. The overall goal of this thesis is to examine both the ideas and the practices of spirituality and development. The various meanings of spirituality and development will be examined, in the literature, in the meanings given to it by three Northern development agencies, and in the discourses of development offered by Namibians.

In examining the concept or notion of spirituality and development, this thesis has two complementary objectives.

The first is to examine whether the ideas and practices of spirituality and development can or do offer to development above and beyond what has already been offered in the many critiques of development that have preceded it. An examination of three Northern donor agency initiatives on spirituality and development provide examples of some conceptualisations of the link between spirituality and development. It will be questioned whether it has become just another buzzword, a new utopian construct designed by intellectuals to support the dominant modernisation paradigm, or whether it represents a different kind of consciousness growing in the development circles that will lead to a total transformation of development.
The second is to examine what issues arise in the attempts to apply the ideas of spirituality and development. The ways in which spirituality and development is being translated into practice will also be examined. Does it manifest itself as a code of ethics, or as 'spiritual awareness' training, or as new processes and tools incorporated into project methodologies? A number of problematic issues surrounding both the ideas and practices of spirituality and development will be highlighted.

1.2 Thesis Approach

For these purposes, the thesis will follow a three-fold approach. First a framework of analysis that identifies the key ideas that spirituality and development encompasses will be developed. This framework will offer a means to examine both the potentials, and problematic issues of both the ideas and the practices of spirituality and development. Because the ideas and the practices of spirituality and development are just emerging in the development profession, there is as yet no established body of theory. I therefore seek to offer a theoretical understanding of spirituality and development by finding common ground between spirituality and the many alternative critiques of development.

It became apparent during the course of my study that there can be no consensus on what spirituality is. I stress that what I offer in this chapter is not a personal definition of spirituality, but rather a synthesis of many understandings and definitions offered by a diverse and vast literature. I also stress that the description of spirituality and development offered in this chapter emerges solely out of theoretical review and does not represent a definitive definition.

Secondly the notions and practical initiatives of spirituality and development being explored in three Northern development agencies - the World Bank, the International Development and Research Centre (Ottawa) and the World Council of Churches are critically examined. The rationales and main tenets of each organisations' concepts and applications of spirituality and development
are outlined and a number of problematic issues involved with their ideas and applications are outlined.

Thirdly, this thesis then focuses on Namibia, a country in which I have lived and worked for five years. Namibia shall serve as the case study and empirical basis in which to address the three objectives of this thesis.

A note should be made as to the convergence of the Namibia as the case study area, and the selection of spirituality and development as the topic of research. My main concerns revolved around how development (read mainstream, economic, modernisation) was involved with further decimating the spirit of Namibian people. It seemed to me that before colonial annexation by the Germans, Namibians existed as peoples and cultures with their own beliefs and values. Political and economic exploitation was accompanied by the spiritual bludgeoning of those beliefs and values. However, after withstanding the abuses of their oppressors, Namibians turned the tables on their Christian colonisers and constructed a theology of liberation that gave them the faith to resist and overcome. Namibian beliefs and values were re-emerging, free of colonial subjectivities. However, just as this re-emergence was taking place, foreign aid agencies, however well intended, began flooding the country with assistance.

With full cognisance of the neo-colonial tendencies of aid it became imperative for me to question whether aid may in fact be more detrimental to the reconstruction of Namibia than helpful. Would it not be better for Namibia and Namibians to be able to rebound from years of oppression, to have the chance to define the values it would now, as a free people and country, espouse as their own? Would it not be better for Namibia to be able to come to terms with its own identity, however 'hybridised', so that it may, as a country and as a people, critically examine the values carried with development and the garrison of accompanying donor agencies? Namibia thus provides the impetus to explore the concept of spirituality and development. Although I cannot say with certainty that the topic of spirituality and development could not have been analysed in any other country, certainly Namibia provided, because of its
particular history, the context in which spirituality and development emerges as a concern. In effect I am asking what impact development is having on the spiritual health of Namibia.

I study two external support projects being conducted in the case study area. Specifically I examine the various mechanisms and processes involved in structuring the relationship between ‘donors’ and ‘recipients’. I then attempt to uncover Namibian discourses of development; what meanings, if any, a selection of respondent groups give to spirituality and development and how they react to donor development projects.

The objective of the case study is to ground the examination of the three thesis goals and objectives into reality. Is spirituality and development a worthwhile concept or is it just another theoretical ideal belonging to the boardrooms of Northern donor agencies? Is development having a negative impact on Namibian society and development? What conceptualisations do Namibians have of spirituality and development? How can spirituality and development be applied? How can Northern donor agencies support projects to ‘incorporate’ conceptualisations of spirituality and development?

1.3 Thesis Outline

Following this introductory chapter, Chapter Two will describe the conceptual and methodological process utilised in the research for this thesis. The research methodology is placed within the context of the politics of research, particularly in relation to North-South ethics. The reflexive position of my research is examined. The conceptual process followed in the research will then be described to show the underlying logic involved. Finally the research methodologies will be outlined, detailing the specific methods used and the objectives for each.

The thesis will then be divided into five further chapters. Chapter Three outlines the initiatives of spirituality and development that have emerged in three development organisations in the ‘First World’. The rationales behind
why these three Northern donor agencies are exploring the idea and practice of spirituality and development and the main tenets of these ideas and practices are examined. A number of problematic issues surrounding the idea of spirituality and development as it is being translated into practice are highlighted.

Chapters Four, Five and Six document the empirical exploration into the idea of spirituality and development in Namibia. Chapter Four presents the background ‘experiences of spirituality’ in Namibia. The relationship between ‘traditional’ beliefs, religion, and spirituality is examined. The ‘experiences of spirituality’ in Namibia illustrate the complex transformations of Namibian spirituality through colonial rule and enforced missionary conversion, the struggle for independence and post-independent reconciliation and reconstruction. Chapter Four introduces the question explored in Chapters Five and Six. Is international development assistance, and its cadre of donor agencies having a negative impact on the spiritual well being of Namibian society, and in so doing, jeopardising the very ‘project of development’?

Chapter Five thus analyses the extent of control that Northern development assistance maintains over development in Namibia, using the water sector as an example. The analysis then focuses on two external support projects conducted in Northern Namibia. It examines how relations between the donor and the recipient are structured and processed in terms of both policy environments and delivery approaches. The perspectives of a number of recipients of the projects highlight the existence of tensions in donor-recipient relations.

Chapter Six then explores Namibian discourses of development. A number of Namibians – elders, traditional leaders, community leaders, church leader, staff from the Council of Churches of Namibia, traditional healers, church women’s groups, and informal settlement community members - were interviewed to ascertain their views on external support projects, and on their conceptualisations of development. Their conceptualisations of spirituality and the relationship (if any) between spirituality and development were also sought.
The concluding chapter then sums up the findings in relation to the three main questions of this thesis. A summary of a conceptualisation of spirituality and development shall be derived from the literature review, the initiatives of the three Northern donor agencies and the conceptualisations of spirituality and development that emerged from the interviews of case study respondents.

This description of spirituality and development then lends a focus to the issues that arise from the translation of spirituality and development into practice. The three Northern donor initiatives as well as the development discourses of Namibians provide four main issues that need to be addressed if spirituality and development is to gain practical acceptance as an approach, methodology or even paradigm of development.

The first concerns the problems of institutionalising the idea of spirituality and development, including the role of formalised religion, specifically the church. The second examines the problems associated with the significance of culture, specifically the dynamics between cultural relativism and development ethics. The third issue relates to the positionality of the three Northern donor agencies, the IDRC, the World Bank and the WCC in their approaches to spirituality and development. The fourth concern relates to the issue of incorporation and the potential for spirituality and development to be subverted into mainstream models of development.

This leads to a discussion of the relationship of spirituality and development to the broader discourses of development. Does it represent a radical departure from other alternative development critiques, and if so, in what way/s? Or is it just another slightly reworded version of preceding critiques?

The main contributions of this thesis to knowledge deserve final attention.
1.4 Meanings of Spirituality


Based on these readings, it became obvious that it would be impossible to offer one meaning of spirituality that would apply equally to different spiritual schools, practices and traditions. In The Spirit of One Earth (1989b) Ursula King writes in her introduction to Teilhard de Chardin’s perspectives on global spirituality that “for some, it seemed that spirituality meant a relationship to ‘God’. For others it means a deep existential commitment to a transcendent dimension within and beyond life, an experience of the powerful presence of the spirit” (King 1989b p.2). She continues that spirituality can be understood as a dynamic process of transformation and growth.

King (1989b) then offers a number of meanings of spirituality based on her interpretations of the reflections of Teilhard de Chardin. First, it can be
understood as an integral part of human development towards maturity, in both an individual and collective sense. Second, spirituality can be described as an exploration into what is involved in becoming human. Third, it can mean an attempt to grow in sensitivity to self, others, to non-human creation and to 'God' who is within and beyond this totality. Fourthly, spirituality can be referred to as a quality of experience, intuition, reflection, and being which permeates all human activities. Thus the whole of life can be seen as being related to spiritual practice. Spirituality, King (1989b) summarises, “concerns the heart of human existence, and its practice is linked to the use of our imagination as a faculty for seeing more deeply into the ground and meaning of things and experience” (Ibid, p. 2).

One of the main issues within the discourse on spirituality is the debate surrounding the distinction between spirituality and religion. Beck (1986) reviews a number of writers who address this issue. For example, Madan Handa, a political theorist and educator who writes from a Ghandian Hindu perspective who believes that one does not have to be religious to be spiritual. Handa (1982) believes that:

We should make a distinction between religion and spirituality, the former being a special institution and the latter referring to the inner state of consciousness. To the extent religious knowledge deals with inner refinement it may help spiritual development, but more often it works as a stumbling block because of he bigotry it teaches (cited from Beck 1986, p. 149).

Beck further describes Handa’s belief that humans can work towards spirituality by following principles inherent in our nature and in the nature of the universe rather than awaiting the doctrines of a supernatural 'God'. Beck notes that Handa defines spirituality with reference to a number of moral virtues such as temperance, humility, gentleness, and kindness rather than in religious terms.

Beck (1986) however, questions whether it is really possible to be spiritual without being religious but states his belief that an acceptable concept of
spirituality can be used in both religious and non-religious contexts if the ‘definition’ of spirituality is made with full clarity. He proceeds to clarify this definition.

He acknowledges that religious and non-religious people will often mean something different in relation to the term spirituality. A religious person may believe that spirituality involves a “divine indwelling” (Ibid, p.150) which has been brought about at least in part by supernatural intervention while a non-religious person does not believe in a ‘divinity’. However, he feels that there is a large area of common ground between the religious and non-religious perspectives. He proposes that this common ground can be found in the characteristics of a spiritual person, which transcends all boundaries of religions and cultures. Beck goes on to name a number of ‘spiritual characteristics’ which include awareness, breadth of outlook, a holistic outlook, integration, wonder, gratitude, hope, courage, energy, detachment, acceptance, love and gentleness.

For all of these ‘spiritual characteristics’, Beck acknowledges the ways in which they are similar to, or different from, various religious interpretations. The main thrust of his argument, however, is that a spiritual person can be religious and follow specific doctrines or non-religious as long as they encompass these characteristics.

Bailin (1986) however, criticises Beck’s concept of spirituality, namely, his argument that spirituality may not necessarily be linked to a supernatural support. She also critiques Beck’s idea that a spiritual person is ‘made up of’ his/her chosen number of ‘spiritual characteristics’.

Let us examine the traits more closely. They range from awareness and breadth of outlook to gratitude and detachment to gentleness and love. Essentially I would have to say that these traits describe a nice person, the kind of person we would probably all like to be with. Thus, it is difficult to object to an educational enterprise directed toward the formation of such nice individuals. Yet there are questions which can be asked. Why choose these particular traits? What is the basis for picking out just these? It is possible to say
about any one of the traits that it is not positive in all
circumstances, that there are occasions when it is best not to
be detached but engaged, not to be gentle but forceful, not to
accept but to challenge. Moreover there are notorious
philosophical problems in attempting to specify a set or “bag”
of virtues. There are always the possibility that such virtues
are tied to the ethos of a society or some segment thereof, a
thesis which has been argued by many, including Marxist and
feminist theorists (Bailin 1986, p. 157).

Bailin (1986) challenges Beck’s thesis that these characteristics need not be
grounded in a supernatural element. She argues that there must be a basis for
assembling and connecting them with spirituality. From the religious view,
the common ground would be provided by postulation of a transcendent
spirit: spiritual qualities are those which partake in the supernatural element.
She questions what the common ground for these spiritual traits would be for
the non-religious and argues that Beck’s sense of spirituality makes more
sense in the context of recent re-introductions of notions of virtue and
conceptions of the ‘good life’ into ethical debate. “Indeed, Beck’s description
of spirituality, with its specific sort of inner experience connected to certain
virtues, might well be seen as an attempt to describe the good life, to describe
what makes life worthwhile or meaningful” (Bailin 1986, p. 158).

It is obvious from this review that the meanings of spirituality are diverse and
complex. This is well demonstrated in this dialogue between Beck and Bailin
in regards to these so-called ‘traits of spirituality’. The distinction between
religion and spirituality is of foremost debate. This issue cannot be resolved
in this thesis and it is not the intention of this thesis to attempt to do so.

However, I would like to point to the writings of the Dalai Lama in Ethics
for a New Millennium (1999). The Dalai Lama believes to counter the radical
scientific materialism and extreme relativism that pervades ‘modern’ society,
we need a spiritual revolution. However, in calling for a spiritual revolution,
he emphasises that he is not advocating a religious solution. He describes
how, in his life in exile meeting people of different cultures and religions, he
has come to recognise that all faiths encompass basic values which are
directed towards facilitating human beings achieve happiness, and that there are some universal ethical principles that transcend all religions.

Religion, he believes to be “concerned with faith in the claims to salvation of one faith tradition or another, an aspect of which is acceptance of some form of metaphysical or spiritual reality, including perhaps an idea of heaven or nirvana. Connected to this are religious teaching or dogma, ritual, prayer and so on” (Dalai Lama 1999, p. 22). Spirituality, by contrast is “concerned with those qualities of the humans spirit - such as love and compassion, patience, tolerance, forgiveness, contentment, as sense of responsibility, a sense of harmony - which bring happiness to both self and others” (Ibid, p. 22).

He argues that while we can do without religious belief systems, we cannot do without these basic spiritual qualities. He acknowledges that each of the religious traditions have a well-developed ethical system. However, in today's increasingly globalised world, there is always the question, which religion is the right one. Additionally there are billions of people who have rejected religious practice either because they find no message in them, or because they are unconcerned with the deeper questions of human existence. The Dalai Lama argues that we cannot suppose that such people are without a sense of right and wrong. Further, religious belief is no guarantee of moral integrity. He notes that many of the major troublemakers in the world, those who have inflicted violence, brutality and destruction on their fellow human beings, have professed their religious faith loudly.

Thus, he argues that religions can help us establish basic ethical principles, but we can still talk about ethics and morality without recourse to religion. However, he acknowledges then that without this religious basis of ethics, then everyone and anyone’s ethics must be considered morally appropriate. Or, it may also be argued that there can be no basic principles upon to base ‘right’ and ‘wrong’ action. He argues that it is essential that we do so. Humanity is in dire need of a “radical reorientation away from the habitual preoccupation with self, and to turn towards the wider community of beings with whom we are connected” (Ibid, p. 23). We must be able to show that
violence towards others is 'wrong'. We must "find some way of doing so which avoids the extremes of crude absolutism on the one hand, and of trivial relativism on the other" (Ibid, p. 28).

It is apparent that the 'topic' of spirituality is complex with varying understandings of what spirituality is and how it can be described. This issue of relativism versus absolutism, and in general, how culture is constructed within development, it will be seen, emerges as a critical issue that must be addressed in the examination of spirituality and development. The distinction between spirituality and religion will also re-merge as an issue of importance in the case study. With reference to Namibia, the additional distinction between spirituality, religion (specifically Christianity) and African religions or 'traditional' beliefs must be made. This will be discussed both later in this chapter and in Chapter Four when the background on Namibia is given.

With full cognisance of this complexity, however, it is useful for the purposes of this thesis to offer some frame of reference for spirituality that can be utilised in connecting it to development. From my readings, three major 'features' or common ground between the many and diverse understandings of spirituality emerged. First, spirituality is concerned with asking why humanity, the universe and the cosmos were created. Does life have purpose or are we here just to while away time? If life is just a random gathering of atoms into unintelligent life forms, then these questions do not need to be asked, but if life is intelligent, then there must be a reason for our lives. Belief in life as intelligent and purposeful is central to spirituality. The dominant paradigm of contemporary Western society is based on a belief in life as random, an accident of evolution with no real meaning and therefore no real purpose other than to progress through a random sequence of events. To believe this takes the value out of life. It deprives life of its soul. Spirituality offers a cosmological construct which infers that the cosmos, all life forms, are created in intelligence, and with purpose. Second, spirituality implies that there are absolute morals that guide humanity in proper action and right relation and assist humanity to live life's greater purpose, which is spiritual.
Third, spirituality emphasises that there must be a fusion of personal and prophetic mission to create a harmonious and compassionate world.

### 1.4.1 Cosmological Construct

Thomas Berry (1988) explains the significance of a cosmological construct.

> For peoples, generally, their story of the universe and the human role in the universe is their primary source of intelligibility and value. Only through this story of how the universe came to be in the beginning and how it came to be as it is does a person come to appreciate the meaning of life or to derive the psychic energy needed to deal effectively with those crisis moments that occur in the life of the individual and in the life of society (Berry 1988, p. xi).

Allen (1996) also offers an explanation of its significance. The myth, explains Allen, in North American Indian cultures carried their cosmological construct. The myth is a kind of story that allows a holistic image to pervade and shape consciousness, thus providing a coherent and empowering matrix for action and relationship. The myth functions as an affirmation of self that transcends the temporal. It shows us the eternal as part of ourselves. It allows a marriage between the conscious and the unconscious. It shows us the possibility of relating ourselves both to the familiar landscape of home, and the grand mysterious universe that surrounds and informs our being. In the myth, all humans—ancestors, contemporaries, and descendants are one. The myth essentialises the whole. “For in relating separate experiences to one another, it weaves them into coherence and a sense of wholeness arises, a totality, which by virtue of our active participation constitutes direct and immediate comprehension of ourselves and the universe of which we are integral parts” (Allen 1996, p. 117).

Thus cosmology lies at the foundation of spirituality. Life was formed in intelligence and purpose rather than as an accidental conglomeration of random particles and events. Life therefore has intrinsic value and meaning. Humanity, and all life on earth and in the universe, also then have a specific role and purpose, to which they must aspire.
1.4.2 Absolute Morals

Central to spirituality is also cognisance of the existence of 'spiritual laws' or 'spiritual principles'. These are guides to assist us in fulfilling spiritual destiny. We cannot just depend upon the powers of human rationalism. Much literature on spirituality emphasises that there are 'spiritual laws' that are immutable and which guide and determine the course of everything in 'Creation'. These 'laws' have existed since eternity and all life can only continue in existence through the operation of these 'laws'. The 'laws' have their origin in that which created us. They can be known as the 'Laws of Creation', the 'Divine Laws', the 'Eternal Laws', or the 'Laws of Life'. Only those activities which are inherent in the 'Laws of Creation' can flourish and be sustained by 'Creation'. Attempts at carrying out activities not permitted by the 'Laws' must come to grief and are guaranteed to fail. Lampe (1994) argues that these 'Laws of Creation' have not always been clearly recognised, that they have often been misinterpreted, misunderstood, or taken out of context. This he says is the origin of the problems of today's religious fundamentalism. Deviation from the path indicated by the 'Laws of Creation' is the cause also of the strains and stress in human affairs found today.

“Solutions to all problems of life and existence can and will be found only through conscious, correct, and consistent application of these immutable Laws.” (Lampe 1994, p. 23).

Vandant (1992) describes her understanding of spiritual laws as based on the ancient spiritual tradition and culture of the Yoruba (Nigeria). She believes that there are specific principles and understandings that one must accept and incorporate into one's life philosophy in the quest for spiritual purification, enlightenment and evolution. "The 'Spiritual Code of Conduct' provides a basic framework for the development of individual desire, thought and action which embodies the true nature of the spirit. It is not enough to pray, meditate or purify one's body of toxins; one must also behave in accordance with principles of universal law. The 'Spiritual Code of Conduct' requires accepting your 'oneness' with the 'Creator' as the source of power,
knowingness, truth and order in your life" (Vandant 1992, p. 108). These laws regulate life, call upon humanity to do good and to fulfil one's spiritual destiny.

The idea of absolute morals or 'right action and relation' can also be found in eco-feminist spirituality. Starhawk (1990) posits that when we understand that the Earth itself embodies spirit and that the cosmos is alive, then we also understand that everything is inter-connected. What happens in the Amazon rain forest affects how we breathe in America. When we understand how we are inter-connected, we know that we are all part of a living community. We are thus called to a politics and a set of actions that build upon community. Earth-based spirituality thus calls humanity to live with integrity. Once we know that we are all part of the living body of Earth and cosmos, this world becomes the terrain where we live out spiritual growth and development. We must take responsibility for all our actions because everything we do affects another.

The 'Laws of Creation' (Lampe 1994) also express this notion of inter-connectedness. The 'Law of Reciprocal Action' variously expressed as the 'Law of Sowing and Reaping', the 'Law of Karma', the 'Law of Cause and Effect' or the 'Law of Retributive Justice', ensures the maintenance of order and perfect justice in 'Creation'. Lampe (1994) argues that every effect has a cause and every cause must result in an effect. If what we sow is good, we reap the harvest of blessings; if they are evil, then we reap evils on ourselves.

Notwithstanding this ecclesiastic terminology, spirituality thus forms a vision and a means of living 'correctly'. There are ultimate and absolute standards on which to base human relatedness, on which to judge the character of relations. There is an immutable measure of right and wrong. At the heart of spirituality is the acknowledgement that ethics are not relative but absolute.
1.4.3 Fusion of Personal and Prophetic Mission: The Larger Purpose

There is much discussion within 'spiritual writings' in regards to the purpose of spirituality. Most authors seem to stress that whilst 'interiority' is an essential part of the 'spiritual journey', it must extend into the outside world of human interaction (with humanity and nature). Spirituality is a personal experience, yet it has a larger purpose. For example, Thomas Berry (1988) calls for a “public spirituality” which he describes as “the functional values and their means of attainment in an identifiable human community”. He considers this public spirituality much more significant than the cultivated spirituality of marginal groups or individuals engaged in intensive prayer and meditation apart from the dynamics of the larger human community. “Their lives and their guidance are of significant import for the human venture, but the ultimate spiritual issues are those dealt with in the cruel and compassionate world of active human existence, in the marketplace, in the halls of justice and injustice, in the places where the populace lives and works and suffers and dies.” (Berry 1988, p. 111).

Matthew Fox (1988) writes:

On today's spiritual scene, we have two distortions. One distortion occurs in certain trends in the New Age movement which is all space and no time; all consciousness and no conscience; all mysticism and no prophecy; all past life experiences, angelic encounters and no critique of injustice or acknowledgement of the suffering and death that the toll of time takes. To these movements, the Cosmic Christ says, enter time. “Behold my wounds. Love your neighbour. Set the captives free.” A second distortion occurs among the good-intentioned persons working intensely and sacrificing much for peace and justice – in other words, struggling to right the times, to see messianic times happen, to taste the promise of peace and justice flowing like waters, as prophets promised. The danger is too much time consciousness cut off from mysticism or space consciousness embroils and attaches one to the struggle of time that leads to burn out, pessimism, lack of creativity, spirit and imagination. To these persons the Cosmic Christ says, “behold the universe. Behold its fulsome mysteries. Behold its glory which is that of my Creator. Behold your universe within, your ever-expanding psyche, your powers of creativity, wetness, rebirth, generativity, youthfulness. Behold your connection to all things, great and
small. Beauty abounds. Partake of it. You are of it. Be still and
know that I am God (Ps.46:10) And you are too" (Fox 1988
p. 838).

In Creation Spirituality Matthew Fox (1991) specifically addresses the
interdependent relationship between the North and South and the need for a
liberation theology for "First Worlders" (Fox 1991, p.xi). He believes that
people of the 'First World' can no longer escape seeking out ways to liberate
themselves from structures that are a menace to 'Third World' peoples' efforts at liberation. While institutional criticism is necessary, he believes that
'First World' liberation must come from within individuals' psyches and ways
of perceiving the world. A 'First World' liberation theology must address
both the spiritual impoverishment that is palatable where consumerism reigns
and materialism runs peoples' lives and the lack of "righteous indignation"
(Ibid, p. 70) and moral outrage that 'First Worlders' should have at the
unnecessary fact of poverty and at the despair and violence it produces.

Teilhard de Chardin (in King 1989b) believed that:

...the search for spirituality and transcendence in our age
cannot find its sole answer in intense private devotion and an
escapist religious life. Contemporary spirituality, if it is to have
any effect on our lives, cannot flourish apart from the world,
in cloisters, chapels, and churches, or whatever one's religious
institution may be. It has to grow and live in the market place;
it has to be a source of meaning for all of life and relate to our
daily problems, our family and community, our science, our
politics, our whole world as we scientifically explore and
experience it today. This spirituality which we so much need
as a true leaven and "bread of life" can only be a transforming
agent in our world of today, a true spirit to live and grow by,
if nourished and nurtured within our secular institutions as

3 See Boff, Leonardo and Boff, Clodovis (1987) Introducing Liberation
Theology. Their main point of reference for introducing liberation theology is
the 'Third World' but they show how liberation theology is equally relevant for
the 'First World'. They argue that the oppressions from which the 'First World'
stands in need of liberation have different names – atheism, materialism,
consumerism, individualism – but are equally real.
well as within our traditional religious ones. Otherwise it will be impossible to create a world of peace and justice (in King 1989b, p. 17).

Thus we are reminded that a larger object exists in being spiritual. It is not just to have personal fulfilment in isolation but to partake in the promise of peace and justice for all. Our lives and our actions need to be for the collective whole, and not for individual gratification. A fusion of personal and prophetic spirituality gives one the strength to tackle social and environmental issues and to actively create that vision of the world.

The distinction between spirituality and religion again surfaces in the discourse surrounding the 'larger purpose' of spirituality. Lampe (1994) believes that spirituality, specifically the 'spiritual laws or principles' (outlined in the previous section) are distinct from religious beliefs and dogma and that many of the problems in today's society are caused by a "misinterpretation of the spiritual principles by world religions" (Ibid, p. 22), especially by fundamentalist segments of religions. Religions are human (culturally based) institutions established to interpret and 'intuit' the 'spiritual laws'. If they help specific societies understand the 'laws of creation' then they have played their part. However, Lampe argues, it would be wrong to believe that membership in any religion or sect would guarantee salvation. Religions are thus not an end in themselves, but a means to an end. That end is spiritual salvation that can only be attained by accurate interpretation of, and adherence to, the 'spiritual laws'.

A major distinction between religion and spirituality must also be made in terms of the belief that societies have in the role religion should play in public affairs. Lampe (1994) argues that many people and societies believe that religious principles (which they equate with spiritual principles but which Lampe feels is not always the case) should be isolated from matters of governance. However, he argues, religions have been a main source of humanity's ills – hatred, war and conflict and have been transformed into platforms for the acquisition of earthly power and influence, and no longer fulfil the function of encouraging the search for the "Will of God" (Ibid, p. 24).
The messages on which existing religions are based were adjusted to the levels of intellectual understanding, spiritual maturity, and the needs of the people to whom they were addressed at the time they were given. Moreover, Lampe believes, that the religious messages as they are understood and interpreted today no longer faithfully reflect the actual teachings of their “original bringers” (Ibid, p. 16). There have been textual distortions, and errors in their interpretations, inadvertently or deliberately. For these reasons, Lampe believes that religions have very little relevance to the resolution of crises humanity faces today.

Spiritual ‘laws or principles’, by contrast, Lampe believes, are untainted, pure and a direct interpretation of the ‘truth’. He believes that “the right spiritual knowledge, coupled with an understanding of the spiritual nature of human beings, and the spiritual purpose of human existence, can lead us out of the prevailing chaos and confusion” (Ibid, p. 15). He believes that unlike religious dogma and beliefs, spiritual principles will have a positive effect on the “survival and transformation of humanity” (Ibid, p. 15) and that an increasing number of people at all levels of society and across cultures are calling for an infusion of spiritual values into social, political and economic arenas. He proceeds to offer an analysis of how spiritual principles inform such issues of concern as: the individual, society and the Government; political arrangements and the national question; leadership and “followership” (Ibid, p.83); the economy and economic issues; equality and equity on earth; race and ethnic issues; womanhood and gender issues; humanity and the environment; international affairs; and international economic relations.

Ursula King’s (1989b) interpretations of the reflections of Teilhard de Chardin provides another perspective on the distinction between spirituality and religion, and of their roles in world development. Teilhard, she interprets, believed that mysticism or spirituality is not necessarily linked to one traditional religious ‘way’ but this does not preclude convergence of methods, images, symbols, and insights from different religious and cultural traditions. According to King (Ibid), Teilhard assigned a central place to religion in the
ongoing development of humankind. However, although Teilhard was a staunch Christian, he was also a radical one who questioned Christianity's central and distinctive doctrines in the context of other world faiths. He asked what religious teachings, whether Eastern or Western, can contribute to the "building of the earth" (Ibid, p. 94) and to the shaping of the future. Teilhard looked for "the active and animating elements of different religious traditions, for pointers towards a new religious breakthrough, and for a yet unformulated new mysticism or spirituality" (Ibid, p. 94). He felt that religions of the past did not face the "problem of human progress" (Ibid, p. 95) but that there was a great urgency for religion to do so. However, religions did not seem to be able to meaningfully relate to contemporary society's most urgent task of "building the earth and shaping the future" (Ibid, p. 95). This is the heart of Teilhard's quest for a new mysticism or spirituality.

In summary, some key terms or phrases can be highlighted to provide a 'profile' or description of the meanings of spirituality. Spirituality seems to be about an understanding of life as intelligent; that there is an intrinsic meaning to life with specific purpose. The story of life is what gives individuals and societies/cultures their context, their comprehension and affirmation of self, others and the universe. There is recognition that all life is interdependent and connected. It is this context that empowers individuals and societies to make 'right' decisions in action and relation. There is a belief that there are 'guidelines' both for individuals and societies to pursue not just an inward spiritual quest, but also to fully participate in the building of secular society, to relate the interdependence of person and community, individual and society, and to create a truly peaceful world at the global level. Thus the purpose of spirituality is larger than just inward reflection. Religion and spirituality can be one in the same, however, 

4 King notes that Teilhard used the term mysticism instead of spirituality but that in essence Teilhard's definition of mysticism is similar to how spirituality is defined or described by more contemporary authors.
misinterpretation and worldly objectives have distorted the unchanging and absolute principles of spirituality in many religions. Thus religions do not necessarily encompass the consciousness needed for social transformation in the present world of crises.

This brief overview of spirituality is necessary in order to develop a framework of analysis of spirituality and development. There is so far, little literature specifically dealing with spirituality and development. However, I believe that there is much common ground between spirituality and the many ‘alternative’ critiques of ‘mainstream’ development. Such critiques have introduced a number of alternative ideas about both the means and ends of development that I feel, even though the language differs, converge with those ideas of cosmological construct, absolute morals and fusion of personal and prophetic mission encompassed by the meanings of spirituality. For this purpose, these alternative critiques shall be reviewed to discern what common ground, as well as divergence between spirituality and alternative development theory there may be.

1.5 Critiques of Development: Towards an Understanding of Spirituality and Development

Since the formalised inception of development in the immediate aftermath of the post-war years, there has been a rich and varied diversity of critique of development both of its ideas and its practices. Within these critiques the many strands of ideas can be identified which have contributed to the emergence of the idea of spirituality and development. These belong to theories (and practices) that have been referred to, sometimes interchangeably, as alternative development, anti-development, maldevelopment, alternatives to development, post-development and countermodernist.

Alternative development, according to Pieterse (1998) has been concerned with alternative practices of development - participatory and people-centred - and with redefining the goals of development. He traces the genesis of
alternative development back to the 1970's, specifically to the 1975 report of the Dag Hammarskjold Foundation, "What Now? Another Development" (1975) which emphasised that development should be "geared to the satisfaction of needs, "endogenous and self-reliant"", and "in harmony with the environment" (taken from Pieterse 1998, p. 346). Over the years, Pieterse argues that alternative development has been "...reinforced and associated with virtually any form of criticism of mainstream developmentalism, including anti-capitalism, green thinking, feminism, eco-feminism, democratisation, new social movements, Buddhist economics, cultural critiques, and poststructuralist analysis of development discourse" (Ibid, p. 346). Watts (1993) focuses on the alternative development concern with the discursive formation of development. Development is seen as a diagram of power, a system of power relations which, following Foucault (1979), produce "domains of objects and rituals of truths" (Watts, 1993, p. 265).

However, it is also important to point out that there are also some distinctions between the various alternative theories of development. Pieterse (1998) for example, outlines alternative versus post development positions. Post development or anti-development, as it is also referred to as, starts from the position that attaining a middle-class life style for the majority of the world population is impossible (Pieterse 1998). According to Pieterse (1998) the keynotes of this position is extreme dissatisfaction not only with business-as-usual in mainstream development theory and practice, but also disillusionment with alternative development. Post-development belongs to the era of the 'post' - poststructuralism, postmodernism and Pieterse argues that it shares an acute lack of direction and ability to translate critique into construction.

Manzo (1991) in outlining the common heritage of modernist discourses of developmentalism and dependency theory provides a glimpse of countermodernist developmentalism. Dependency theory, Manzo argues has not broken modernist ranks for three reasons. It relies on the principles of nineteenth century liberal philosophy. It treats the individual nation-state in
the ‘Third World’ as the sovereign subject of development. Thirdly, it accepts
the Western model of national autonomy with growth as the appropriate one
to emulate. Countermodernist developmentalism, however, starts from the
premise that “each culture has the right to forge its own modernity” (Manzo
1991, p. 28). She outlines a countermodernist approach known as
Participatory Action Research (PAR) which is rooted in the rejection of
abstract ‘top down’ development plans which attempt to universalise the
western experience. It encourages local grassroots initiatives and stresses the
need for economic processes that are both rooted in the needs of specific
communities and appropriate for local ecosystems. PAR stresses diversity,
plurality and empowerment.

However, Manzo also notes a number of potential dangers in PAR’s being
considered a panacea for all development theory’s problems. She stresses that
PAR should only be considered as an approach, not a theory. “If instead of
leading development theorists to question their own ontological and
epistemological assumptions, PAR becomes appropriated as a ‘third
paradigm’ to replace developmentalism and dependency, it will not have lived
up to its revolutionary or radical billing” (Manzo 1991, p. 29). PAR can also
be appropriated into official development jargon. Manzo argues that
participation has been plucked from PAR by mainstream institutions such as
the World Bank to who are more concerned about finding the most
appropriate participatory ways to convince the ‘uneducated’ of the merits of
their own (ie the World Bank’s) convictions” (Ibid, p. 29). Manzo’s analysis
parallels those of Goetz (1994), Mueller (1985), Porter (1991) and Braidotti et
al (1988), mentioned earlier in this chapter.

According to Pieterse (1998) the entire body of alternative theories of
development have grown stronger (relative to mainstream development) for
three main reasons. First there has been an enormous growth of non-
governmental organisations (NGOs) in numbers and influence generating a
growing demand for strategy and therefore theory. Second, the importance of
environmental concerns and sustainability has weakened the economic
growth paradigm and given boost to alternative and ecological economies. Third, the glaring failures of several development decades have contributed to the unsettlement of the mainstream paradigm of growth. In Table 1.1 he provides a comparative profile of the mainstream and alternative development ‘models’.

Table 1.1 Development Models

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Models</th>
<th>Growth</th>
<th>Social transformation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>Accumulation</td>
<td>Capacitation, Human development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources</td>
<td>Capital, technology, trade, Foreign investment, external expertise</td>
<td>Human skills, local resources, social capital, local knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Features</td>
<td>Growth-led</td>
<td>Equity-led</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency</td>
<td>State-led, Or market-led. Development banks</td>
<td>People, community, Synergies society, government, business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epistemology</td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>Critique of science and indigenous knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modalities</td>
<td>Exogenous examples, demonstration effect, technology transfer, Modernity vs. tradition</td>
<td>Endogenous development, modernisation from within, Modernisation of tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Import substitution, industrialisation, export-led growth, growth poles, innovation, SAP</td>
<td>Participation, micro credit, sustainability, democratisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social policy</td>
<td>Trickle-down, Safety net.</td>
<td>Trickle-up, Social capacitation through redistribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development co-operation</td>
<td>Aid, assistance</td>
<td>Partnership, mutual obligation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicators</td>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Green GDP, HDI, Institutional densities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


This table provides an overview of the main emphases of alternative critiques of mainstream development. However, there is, based on my review of alternative critiques, also an emotive, spiritual dimension to these critiques that has not been revealed in this overview. I thus review a range of alternative critiques, including those of feminists, anti-colonialists, post-colonialists, environmentalists, radical economists, ecumenical perspectives, feminist eco-spirituality perspectives, post-colonial geographers, and the work of ethnographers to draw out this dimension. A description of spirituality and development can then be surmised.

---

5 Because a central aspect of his analysis of alternative development is to assess whether it can actually be called a paradigm he uses the term model rather than paradigm in his comparison.
Three main themes seem to emerge from this review of the literature: (1) the significance of culture; (2) the transformation of Western meta-physics; and (3) relational ethics and North-South relations.

1.5.1 The Significance of Culture

There is a strong element of the need to recognise the significance of culture in anti-colonial, post-colonial and ethnographic writing. Such writing tends to emphasise the negative effect that colonialism and/or neo-colonialism (read aid) have had on the cultural integrity of peoples in the South. Culture is frequently interpreted as a framework for defining whom people are, how they came to be, and how they should live their lives. It gives people purpose and direction. According to some anti-colonial and post-colonial perspectives colonialism imposed the Western cosmological construct of scientific materialism. This served to disintegrate 'traditional' constructs and in so doing, demoralised peoples of the South.

Jomo Kenyatta (1938) for example, described the effect of land appropriation on the cultural integrity of the Kikuyu way of life. When the British annexed the land, it was not just a system of production that was destroyed. The destruction extended to the harmony and stability of the African's mode of life. The land had a spiritual role, connecting the living with the dead and the unborn. Communication with ancestral spirits was a means of attaining direction for collective life, for maintaining sanctions and for discerning approval and disapproval of individual action. Thus the annexation of ancestral lands robbed Africans not only of their economic livelihood but also disrupted the whole tribal organisation whose co-operation was based on communication with the ancestral spirits through which tribal law and custom, morality, and religion were maintained.

Kenneth Kaunda (1962) believed that the drunkenness prevalent in both urban and rural areas of Zambia was due to the moral disintegration associated with colonial intervention.
The Western way of life has been so powerful that our own social, cultural and political set-up has been raped by the powerful and greedy Western civilisation. To crown it all, the economic disequilibrium is such that our people, having lost their social and cultural background, are now hovering to catch up with the outwardly superior social and cultural levels of the West. This needs a certain standard of economic strength which is absent. The result in the desire to have what they cannot have or what foreign rule has deprived them of; and so what? Of course, moral DESTRUCTION (Kaunda 1962, p.114).

In Letter to My Children (1973) Kaunda related the impact of colonialism and racism and the oppositional position of Zambian Humanism to apartheid. He contended that apartheid struck at the root of what it is to be human.

The philosophy of apartheid denies to Black people the right to be; it forces them to conform to an image which the so-called master race has created of them to prove Black inferiority and White superiority. This is the terrible sin of robbing a people of their future. They are fixed, frozen as it were, in a given point of time. There can be no development of their personality, no room for spiritual attainment, for excellence or equality; no better tomorrow. Whereas a White child has the potential for excellence.... the Black child can only be what his fathers were. He is consigned to primitive darkness, imprisoned within a system which hampers his movements, confined his energies and cripples his spirit. Humanism, by contrast believes that God has given to every man, regardless of his ethnic origins, an open future — the power to become what he might be, the guarantee of equality, the possibility of excellence. Whereas apartheid declares the degradation of some men, Humanism affirms the glory of all men. It seeks to evoke from all men a response better than their best — to increase the sum of human power and fulfilment (Kaunda 1973, p.54-55).

There is much in common between Kaunda's original notion of Zambian Humanism and spirituality. Humanism, according to Kaunda, operated on the boundary between religion and politics as a channel for the best gifts of all true faith: compassion, service and love — to be lavished on the nation's people (Ibid, p. 23). Zambian Humanism offered a challenge to all religious believers to put their spiritual power at the service of their neighbours. It made the welfare of 'Man' the central aim of national policy and invites all religious believers to harness the power inherent in their faith for socially desirable ends.
Kaunda urged his children: “I hope you will come to appreciate that spiritual power locked up in every personality which can be released by faith” (Ibid, p. 24).

Williams (1997) describes post-colonialism as operating at several levels at the same time - first as a set of discursive tools for ‘plotting’ the dynamics of the Third World after colonialism, second as a psychological delineation of the condition and status of colonial subjects after independence, and third, as a description of actually existing historical spaces (Williams 1997, p. 823). It is within this second level that post-colonialism appeals to spirituality and development. The narrative given by Nanda Shrestha (1995) is exemplary of this post-colonial condition. He narrates:

I was mentally slow to scale its ideological contours, to comprehend how development ideology is produced and reproduced, how it is propagated across space and through time, how it conquers the minds of native elites, and how it paves the path for a monolithic culture of materialism which stigmatises poverty and the poor (Shrestha 1995, p. 266).

His personal narrative is intended to reveal “how and why the discourse of development, with the help of foreign aid, solidifies the colonial mindset in the post-imperial world, crafting cultural values, thinking, behaviour and actions” (Ibid, p.266). He argues that under the guise of development, the culture of imperialism has been methodologically reproduced in order to maintain Western dominance over the myriad of post-colonial nation-states, where they continue to rule morally and intellectually. Shrestha reflects on the colonisation of his mind. “We have been seduced by the goddess of development, by the voices of the North Atlantic material culture. There has been a structural violence of our psyche” (Ibid, p. 276). Shrestha urges fellow Nepalese to unlearn the Western values and development thinking, consciously deconstruct the colonial mindset to create a future of human dignity and relative economic autonomy.

Ngugi wa Thiong’o (1993) also speaks to the mindset of the colonised. He argues that cultural imperialism had a much more insidious and damaging
effect than political and economic imperialism. Culture, according to Wa Thiong’o holds society together. It carries the values, ethical, moral and aesthetic – by which people conceptualise or see themselves and their place in history and in the universe. These values are the basis of a society’s consciousness and outlook, the whole area of a society’s make-up, its identity. He argues that culture is the most important measure of a nation’s independence and its people’s humanity. Western dominance has undermined people’s belief in their self and made them look up to European cultures as a measurement of themselves and their abilities.

Ngugi wa Thiong’o (1993) emphasises the central role of racism in destroying the cultural integrity of peoples and societies. He argues that racism is not an accident but rather a deliberate ideology of control through divide and rule, a weakening of resistance through a weakening of the sense of identity. It is this sense of identity, which affects the whole political, economic, cultural, and physical well being of a people and a nation that is the subject of development. A people can only truly develop and be free when they are in control of all of the means of definition and survival – political, economic, physical, cultural and psychological. The colonial impact on the cultural integrity of colonised countries was a primary focus of Chinweizu’s (1987) work. In Decolonising the African Mind (Chinweizu 1987) he cited Amilcar Cabral and Okot p’Bitek:

The experience of colonial domination shows that in the effort to perpetuate exploitation, the coloniser not only creates a system to repress the cultural life of the colonised people; he also provoked and develops the cultural alienation of a part of the population...As a result...a considerable part of the population...assimilates the coloniser’s mentality...A reconversion of minds – of mental set- is thus indispensable to the true integration of people into the liberation movement. Such reconversion – reAfricanization, in our case – may take place before the struggle, but it is completed only during the course of the struggle.... (Chinweizu 1987, p. 1)

- Amilcar Cabral

Africa must re-examine herself critically. She must discover her true self, and rid herself of ‘apemanship’. For only then
can she begin to develop a culture of her own. Africa must redefine all cultural terms according to her own interests. As she has broken the political bondage of colonialism, she must continue the economic and cultural revolution until she refuses to be led by the nose by foreigners. We must also reject the erroneous attempts of foreign students to interpret her and present her. We must interpret and present Africa in our own way, in our own interest (Ibid, p. x).

- Okot p'Bitek

Chinweizu (1987) argued that the central objective in decolonising the African mind is to overthrow the authority which alien traditions exercise over the African. This demands the dismantling of white supremacist beliefs, and the structures that uphold them in every area of African life.

Crewe & Harrison (1998), from an ethnographic perspective, also argue that culture is frequently conceptualised by Western aid workers as if it only exists among the local people who are to be developed whilst those in the West are above culture and guided only by modern rationality. They argue that culture is something that everybody is a part of, aid workers and recipients alike. Culture, they argue is the “creation of ideologies, rules, and practices that allow people to make sense of the world” (Crew & Harrison 1998, p. 133). Culture defines appropriate behaviour within a particular context. Rather than seeing culture as a barrier to development, development should be seen as “a barrier to a delicate cultural process of regulating people’s behaviour within the context of social relations” (Ibid, p. 153).

There is thus a demand made to understand what culture really means. It is not just art, music, folklore or aesthetics. Rather, it has been described as that which harmonises and stabilises the mode of life; as that which carries the values and ethics of a people by which people can conceptualise themselves and their place in the universe; and as that which measures the identity of a people, their nation and their humanity. Mainstream development has tended to marginalise, if not totally exclude the importance of these more emotive dimensions of society and people. Thus the intellectual, moral, psychological and spiritual well being of the people being ‘developed’ have been jeopardised.
1.5.2 The Transformation of Western Meta-Physics

Critiques of development have criticised the emphasis placed on the material, economic focus of mainstream development. However, radical economists, environmentalists, including eco-feminists, and ecumenical writers go further in elaborating on this critique. They perceive the need to change the underlying foundation of the Western meta-physics so that economics becomes a subsystem of our 'cosmo-ecological' being and thus engendering a principle of respect for the intrinsic value of all living forms.

For example, many writers and activists within the environmental movement argue that the solution to the ecological problem will be found in regaining our spirituality (Berry 1994; Brown 1998; Daly 1996; Diamond & Orenstein 1990; Gare 1995; Gore 1993; Fox 1991, 1994; Jensen 1995; MacDaniel 1995; Norgaard 1994; Ruether 1996; Schumacher 1973; Shiva 1988; Swimme & Berry 1992). For many of these commentators, the solutions to the ecological crisis can only be found in humanity, (specifically Western society) regaining its sense of spirituality, re-imagining the place of humanity within the cosmos.

In short, we need a spiritual revolution.

Some twenty-five years ago, Schumacher (1973) wrote:

We know too much about ecology today to have any excuse for the many abuses that are currently going on in the management of land, in the management of animals. In food storage, food processing, and in heedless urbanisation. If we permit them, this is not due to poverty, as if we could not afford to stop them; it is due to the fact that, as a society, we have no firm basis of belief in any meta-economic values, and when there is no such belief the economic calculus takes over.

...when the available “spiritual space” is not filled by some higher motivation, then it will necessarily be filled by something lower – by the small, mean, calculating attitude to life which is rationalised in the economic calculus (Schumacher 1973, p. 96).
He concluded that before our policies with regard to the land will really be changed, there will have to be a great deal of philosophical, not to say religious (spiritual), change.


The more deeply I search for the roots of the environmental crisis, the more I am convinced that it is an outer manifestation of an inner crisis that is, for lack of a better word, spiritual. As a politician I know full well the special hazards of using "spiritual" to describe a problem like this one...But what other word describes the collection of values and assumptions that determines our basic understanding of how we fit into the universe? (Gore 1992, p. 12).

Gore argues that the key to sustainable development lies not in science and technology, but in healing the relationship between civilisation and the earth. Global environmental degradation, global warming, ozone depletion, the loss of living species, deforestation, all are symptoms of an underlying problem - that we do not recognise ourselves in relationship with the earth. Humanity needs a new "central organising principle" (Ibid, p. xv) upon which we should base our actions. He proposes it to be - the task of protecting the earth's environment while fostering economic progress.

Schumacher (1973) and Daly (1996) argue that economics is derived from a framework of values and beliefs, our meta-physics. These form the basis of our interpretation of the world. Our current meta-physics is based on a conception of the universe, of the cosmos as an absurd accident, and life to be no more than another accident ultimately reducible to dead matter in motion. Scientific materialism believes in 'man', through an economic system based on science and technology, to be the true creator. The natural world is considered to be a pile of "accidental stuff", to be used up in the arbitrary projects of one's purposeless existence (Daly 1996, p. 20).

Daly (1996) and Schumacher (1973) describe present day economics as being characterised as isolated from the environment and therefore 'unaware' of
any problems in natural resource depletion and environmental pollution, nor of the need for limits to growth. It regards the earth’s resources as though they are income rather than natural capital. It does not recognise the fact that these resources have not been produced by us, and are largely irreplaceable. The method of the economic system is based on the market, which Schumacher (1973) calls “the institution of individualism and non-responsibility” (Ibid, p.36). What is needed Schumacher contends, is a “meta-economics” (Ibid, p. 38) which is grounded in a study of both ‘man’ and nature and not just ‘man’. It must recognise ‘man’s’ dependence on the natural world.

Writers such as Charlene Spretnak, Starhawk, Susan Griffin, Carolyn Merchant, and Vandana Shiva⁶ have asserted the eco-feminist conviction that patriarchal culture has denigrated and manipulated everything defined as ‘other’, whether nature, women or ‘Third World’ cultures. Spretnak (1990) outlines three philosophical strains of eco-feminism. One position emphasises that the earth has intrinsic value by itself. Another emphasises that because human life is dependent on the earth, our fates are interwined. Third, humanity must learn the many ways that we can walk the fine line between using the earth as a natural resource for humans and respecting the earth’s own needs, cycles, energies and ecosystems. Thus it can be seen that eco-feminist perspectives attempt to dismantle the andocentric and anthropocentric biases of male-dominated Western culture.

Alternative development critiques have criticised the materialist emphasis of mainstream development but the ecumenical perspective goes beyond this critique to by seeking to redefine the purpose of economics that development should be subject to. In 1961, Paul Abrecht wrote: “Christians seek economic development which promotes human welfare. The goal of Christians must be a “responsible economic order” (cited from de Santa Ana 1985 p.51).

⁶ See the collection of papers in Reweaving the World: The Emergence of Ecofeminism 1990 Irene Diamond and Gloris Feman Orenstein (eds).
Abrecht argued that a responsible society is one where economic measures are subject to social goals and where property is not an unconditional right but subject to the principle of justice.

Goudzwaard and de Lange (1995) question the entire ‘economic project’ of modern society. Although the majority of economists and politicians defend it as being able to solve several of contemporary society’s problems such as poverty, environmental degradation and unemployment, they argue that these three economic impasses have been steadily worsening because of the orientation towards economic growth. They argue that poverty and the failure of economic solutions indicate the need for a fundamental renewal of our economy. Humanity must search more seriously for the deeper-lying causes of poverty which are part of our foundation of societal order and culture. They are partly socio-political and partly religious (spiritual) and thus will require more than just technical solutions but also cultural solutions.

In exploring economic renewal and the definition of a new economic agenda, we shall therefore find it important to address the premises or assumptions about life that drive economic theory and practice in Western culture. Indeed, the appeal for economic renewal must include an appeal to embrace different values, values that can serve as a foundation for an analysis whose ultimate aim is to encourage the development of a more humane and sustainable society” (Goudzwaard and de Lange 1995, p. 39).

They argue that the economic system must be grounded in the main object of society, which must be in building human relationships, rather than on meeting “infinite needs”.

Thus radical economists, environmentalists, eco-feminists and ecumenical writers and theologians have, and continue to broaden the meaning of development. They try to show that life is not just about material well being but also, and more importantly, about spiritual well being. Development must be looked on as a means of achieving this spiritual well being. It must not be considered to be the ultimate goal of humanity or life.
Mudimbe (1988) believes that post-colonial discourse has the potential to open up the way for the “process of refounding and reassuming an interrupted historicity within representations” (Mudimbe 1988, p. 183), or as Escobar (1995) interprets, “the process by which Africans can have greater autonomy over how they are represented and how they can construct their own social and cultural models in ways not so mediated by a Western episteme and historicity” (Escobar 1995, p. 7).

Mohanty (1991) points to the power relations between ‘First World’ and ‘Third World’ feminists. She argues that some Western feminists have tended to produce the “third world woman” (Ibid, p. 54) as a singular monolithic subject. Mohanty argues “that it is in the production of this “third world difference” (Ibid, p. 54) that Western feminism appropriates and “colonised the constitutive complexities which characterise the lives of women in these countries” (Ibid, p. 54). This process of discursive homogenisation and systematisation of the oppression of women in the ‘Third World’ by Western feminists needs to be defined and named, and placed within the context of the global hegemony of Western scholarship – the production, publication, distribution, and consumption of information and ideas (Ibid, p.55).

There is growing recognition of the validity of such claims in the world of ‘First World’ academics and development theoreticians. For example, Crush’s collection of articles in Power of Development (1995) reflects a widening interest within geography in the politics of North-South relations and its application to development. For example, Manzo (in Crush 1995) argues that development discourses are underlain by a parent/child metaphor. She argues that in the post-colonial era, ‘development’ has replaced the colonial notion (and goal) of ‘civilisation’ and overt references to black (post-colonial) people as ‘children’ are less common. Nevertheless she argues there are important continuities between early and late-modern discourses of development. “The idea of the modern West as a model of achievement, and the rest of the world as an inferior derivative, remains integral to the concept of development. The metaphor of a healthy adult continues to inform analysis of the ‘modern’ or
‘core’ world and that of a child the status of the ‘traditional’ or ‘peripheral’” (Manzo 1995, p. 237).

Geographers also focus on relational ethics as part of the new “moral turn in geography” (Smith 1997b; Proctor 1998). Slater (1997) challenges the spatialities implicit in traditional discussions of ethical matters relating to development and argues that “justice, equality and power should be situated in a context which acknowledges the geopolitical power of the West over non-Western societies” (Slater 1997, p. 56). He also argues for the “location of ethics and politics in that geopolitical setting so that national and international relations are connected dispelling the myth of the West as a self-contained entity” (Ibid, p. 56). He considers it of paramount concern to displace that particular hegemonic reading of world history and development that portrays the West as superior and permanently central, philosophically and culturally.

Thus power is at the centre of relational ethics and North South relations. Kabeer (1994), drawing on the work of Lukes (1974), outlines three notions of power: the “power to”, the “power over” and the “power within”. The “power to” relates to the capacity of individuals to make decisions and act. However, Kabeer (1994) argues that it fails to take into account what has been excluded from this observable decision-making process— that is, the way that institutional factors may succeed in excluding certain issues from the agenda. The notion of ‘power over’ attempts to take this dimension into account and looks at how institutional rules and procedures may demarcate ‘decisionable’ from ‘non-decisionable’ issues, systematically and routinely benefiting certain individuals and groups at the expense of others. Power (of development), Kabeer (1994) argues, “should thus be seen not only in men’s ability to mobilise material resources from a variety of agendas in order to promote their individual and gender interests, but also in their ability to

---

7 See the papers of Slater, Smith, and Whatmore as well as the guest editorial essay by Sayer and Storper in Environment and Planning Development: Society and Space 1997, Volume 15.
construct the rules of the game that disguise the operations of this power and
construct the illusion of consensus and complementarity” (Ibid, p. 229). The
notion of ‘power within’ can lead to the disempowered gaining greater
knowledge of the conditions of their subordination and taking action to
change it. Kabeer argues that empowerment strategies for women must be
built on the ‘power within’ as a necessary adjunct to improving their ability to
control resources, to determine agendas and make decisions.

Ecumenical literature centres on the power relations between donors and
recipients within development projects. It is questioned whether the project
approach should be the methodology used to channel aid to ‘developing’
countries. Six objections to projects are highlighted. First, projects are seen
to be paternalistic with the Northern churches and councils seen to be the
‘head’ and the Southern churches seen to be the ‘members’. Second, the
project description becomes more important that the human relationships
around it. Third, the social coherence within the aided community is
disturbed. A number of people or elements within society may become
privileged through the project with the exclusion of, or even at the expense
of, other members of society. Fourth, it is seen that the West projects its
wishes and dislikes through the projects it supports. Projection, it is argued,
becomes dangerous as soon as one believes that the other needs what one
needs oneself. Such a helper cannot listen to the real needs of the other.
There is no relationship between equals. There is always a danger that aid is
part of the western programme, not the meeting of the needs of others. The
fifth negative aspect of project aid is recognised to be the imposition of
Western society and church on the society and churches of the poorer
countries. This is not just a function of unconscious projection but also
involves the official mandates of service agencies, missionary societies and
development agencies. Finally, it is argued that “Western ‘know-how’ gives
poorer churches the feeling that they cannot do it themselves” (Schot 1997,
p. 25). Schot argues that this know-how operates mainly in the working and
description of projects- planning, budgeting and so on. Projects are underlain
by the attitude that donors want the recipients to ‘give us your needs and
wishes as raw materials and we shall work out a responsible project for you” (Ibid, p. 25). The consequence, according to Schot (1997), is that the poorer churches no longer have the right or the courage to make their own mistakes.

The establishment of an ethically acceptable donor-recipient relationship is considered to be an urgent and important universal task within the context of the Christian community in general, and specifically, the ecumenical movement. Lamola (1995) describes three features of unequal power relations between the North and South. First, he points out that the post-Cold War patterns of competition for ownership, exploitation and control of world resources ensures that the world is progressively divided between the rich and the poor. This world is ultimately governed by a unipolar collective of economic conglomerates represented by the OECD, G7, IMF and the World Bank. Decisions taken and policies woven from these institutions, he argues, have caused negative impacts not only in the South but also amongst elements of society in the North. For relations between donors and recipients to become equal, Lamola (1995) argues, this broader macroeconomic context must be fully recognised.

Second, Lamola (1995) emphasises the fact that the church in the North has failed to adopt a sufficiently critical relationship with its secular authorities, who it is argued, are in the majority of cases, the perpetrators of the misery experienced by the poor in the South. Ecumenical agencies which receive funds from their governments also become accountable to government requirements. Because governments must remain accountable to national taxpayers, the funding process has grown increasingly complex resulting in a gap in knowledge between Northern donors and Southern recipients. Most often, the introduction of this new regime of funding relations is not accompanied by necessary training or special funding to build up the managerial capacities of project participants. Where these standards are introduced, it is argued, they only result in the creation of a category of elite development experts who become removed from the people they set out to serve. Lamola (1995) argues that the failure of Southern ‘partners’ to meet the
high standards of Northern donors has been used as an excuse to limit further assistance that is urgently required to help the poor.

Third, unequal relations between the North and South are manifested in the identification of the priorities for which funds are given. Lamola (1995) argues that the growing power of the Northern agencies forces recipients to select only those projects that they know the donors will be willing to fund. He argues that in many cases, a Christian aid agency will end up executing the geo-political objectives of its government. Even in cases where funds are raised from members of the public from some country in the North, the concerns and political sensitivities of the individuals from whom the funds are collected go a long way to dictating which projects will be funded.

Ethnographic and populist perspectives also focus on the practical means by which differential power has been structured into development processes and projects.

Porter et al (1991) argues that the application of better management techniques, logical frameworks, tight financial control and cost-benefit analyses, are responses found in major aid agencies world wide to control the uncertainty created by rural development projects. They term this response “control-orientation” (Ibid, p.93) and argue that control is part of the broader concept of development. It is understood as the systematic application of a universal rationality at a societal level to achieve desired states of affairs through the control of human and natural resources. Control is facilitated through institutions – development agencies and through projects – “the working face of practice” (Ibid, p.94). The significance of projects is that they “reflect a hierarchy of logic that links specific local actions with the overall international order. The project approach enables direct state/international control of investments and facilitates the application of project management techniques that discourages traditional, personal or politically idiosyncratic practices that might block the predictable manipulation of social change” (Ibid, p. 94).
One very important factor of control-orientation is that such techniques are usually technically complicated and professionally based. Crewe & Harrison (1998) argue that there is an obsession with scientific method, layouts of reports and classification. "Technology has been so bound up with the idea of professionalism that 'soft scientists' such as economists, market researchers, planner and social anthropologists imitate scientific styles" (Ibid, p.34). Professionalism serves to broaden the space for those with the skills and the resources to manipulate the formats and results of control-orientation techniques. The techniques incorporate an enormous amount of judgement and intuition on the part of the applicator. Gasper (1996) calls these "opportunities for forging, fudging and framing" (Ibid, p.53).

The implication of this control-orientation approach is "bounded participation" (Porter et al 1991, p. 131). Despite the rhetoric of meaningful participation, under control-orientation, Porter et al argue (1991), participation can only play a minor role. "With the degree of pre-definition given to the overall direction of the project, its objectives, inputs and outputs, participation can in practice occur only within the time and space and the intentions allocated to it" (Ibid, p.131). People are bounded by the boundaries of the project. If beneficiaries are unhappy with these boundaries they have two forms of participation open to them – violent opposition or resigned withdrawal, and I might add, resigned acceptance.

Crewe & Harrison (1998) note that the guardianship approach to development has come under severe scrutiny, forcing the emergence of the notion of partnership. It is no longer acceptable to speak in terms of beneficiaries or counterparts when referring to those that are the recipients of aid. Such terms imply passivity. "Rather, those on the receiving end are portrayed as if they were on equal terms, as partners, with implicitly the same objectives and ability to articulate these as the donors" (Ibid, p. 70). They argue that partnership is just empty rhetoric and that the "language of partnership" (Ibid, p 70) may help to relieve the donor partner's angst, but essentially does not change the structurally unequal relationship between the donor and recipient.
Crew & Harrison (1998) also note the contradictions between partnership and aid conditionality. Since the beginning of 1990, distinct demands for democratisation began to be made on African countries as a new condition for aid (Barya 1993). The aims of political conditionality are threefold: to promote democratic reform, to improve human rights, and to enhance administrative efficiency. These are often subsumed beneath the rubric of 'good governance'. The belief is that such 'framework conditions' as human rights, the rule of law, social market economy, people's participation in politics, government action committed to development, accountability for public spending and transparency, will facilitate the successful implementation of development projects (Hammel 1997). A more fundamental and longer-term objective of good governance is to facilitate improved economic performance and social welfare (Robinson 1993).

However, Barya (1993) contends that the new conditionalities are rather designed to: one, crush once-and-for-all the ideology of socialism and to replace it with the ideology of free enterprise world wide; two, create a new credible source of legitimacy for hegemony and thereby ensuring leverage over specific countries which are considered economically and politically useful to the West or specific Western countries; and three, justify the impending decline in Africa's share of global assistance as resource flows to Eastern Europe begin to mount (Barya 1993, p.16). Moore (1993) concurs. "Political conditionality is another ideological device to reinforce the hegemony in Africa of the industrial nations and the aid agencies – and ultimately the interests of global capital finance" (Moore, 1993, p.3).

The notions of the 'expert' and 'normal professionalism' also reflect a critique of the power relations between donors and recipients, the North and the South. The rationale for the use of professional expertise frequently centres on neutrality and objectivity or specialised knowledge. Although it is not a conscious strategy, experts effectively reinforce themselves by the use of language and the creation of tools and techniques that have a particular exclusionary mystique attached to them" (Crewe & Harrison 1998, p.96) and
legitimise their role by claiming more up-to-date expertise which of course can only be received/obtained in Western/Northern institutions.

Normal professionalism, argues Chambers (1994a), tends to put things before people, men before women, the rich before the poor, and the urban industrial before the rural and agricultural. He argues that participatory approaches and methods - participatory rapid appraisals (PRA), rapid rural appraisals (RRA) - “opens up one path to a better life for poor rural people, by encouraging them to express their knowledge and creativity and to conduct their own analysis; by giving them the ownership of their own plans and actions; by enhancing their confidence and competence; and through all these, by contributing to sustainable livelihoods by adding to local complexity, diversity and intensification” (Chambers 1994a, p. 10).

Notwithstanding these practices, Chambers (1994b) argues that the crucial change needed remains in the attitudes and behaviour of professionals and bureaucrats. Crewe & Harrison (1998) concur. Participatory techniques do not necessarily change the structure of unequal power relations between donor and recipients. “The moral notion of allowing people to define their needs is weakened by the fact that it is the same individual, or group who is in the relatively powerful position of choosing to allow something” (Crewe & Harrison 1998, p.161). Mayoux (1995) would concur on both fronts. She argues that the rhetoric of participatory development masks the fact that most initiatives are imposed from the outside. Outside agencies select or promote certain activities and not others, certain forms of organisation and not others.

Ultimately, as Chambers (1993) argues, the basic issue of all this discourse on development is that of power. Those with power - the North - do not easily give it up. The challenge is to find ways in which those who are powerful and privileged can be enabled to start and strengthen processes which in turn enable and empower those who are weak and deprived.
It can be seen that power - unequal power between the North and the South, 'donor' and 'recipient' is the key issue of alternative critiques of development. This is certainly not new. Dependency theorists have called attention to unequal power relations between the periphery and the centre for decades. What is perhaps different, however, is the emphasis in such critiques on the inherent powers of development, a fact that is becoming increasingly recognised even by 'First World' theoreticians and practitioners. Accompanying this recognition is the possibility of transformation, or at very least, theory advocating this transformation, and importantly, authored not just by marginalised groups such as feminists, 'Third World' women or post-colonialists, but by mainstream development 'architects'.

What is also new or more potentially transformative, is the recognition of the power of self-representation and the integration of this definition of power into development. Power is about the ability to conceptualise the 'self' within one's own cultural contexts, within one's own set of values and beliefs, and to then be able to extend these in interaction with others, on one's own terms. This need is considered to be at least as important as the material benefits that can be derived from development. Currently, mainstream development is constructed to create and perpetuate unequal power relations. In order for 'true' development to occur, development itself thus must be reconstructed.

1.6 Common Ground with Spirituality and the Broader Context of Spirituality and Development

These three themes found in the alternative development literature find common ground with the three themes that emerged in the description of spirituality.

For example, the idea of a cosmological construct converges with the emphasis placed on cultural significance found in anti-colonial, post-colonial and ethnographic writing. Culture is interpreted as a framework for defining whom people are, how they came to be, and how they should live their lives. It gives people purpose and direction. These descriptions echo those given
for the notion of cosmological construct. Similarly, one can see the similarities in intent between the spiritual focus on an 'intelligent' concept of life, and the call for a new Western meta-physics. The spiritual idea of absolute morals also finds common ground with the critique of power that underlies post-colonial, feminist, ecumenical and ethnographic focuses on relational ethics and North-South relations. Spirituality suggests that there is a 'right' way of acting and relating to others that must be followed in order to achieve life's overall spiritual purpose. Power over the South by the North and specifically within the donor-recipient relationship, as well as between men and women belies the ethics of spirituality.

It is still difficult to describe what spirituality and development is, particularly at this level of solely theoretical review. However, it can be theorised that a concept of spirituality and development would encompass the following three main themes. First, spirituality and development would be underlain by recognition that life is intelligent, that it is not a random occurrence of mechanical events, and that the ultimate goal of life is to fulfil a spiritual destiny. The role of development is to assist life in this endeavour. Thus the spiritual well being of life would be central while the materialistic objectives of development would be considered complementary, but secondary. Second, there are absolute morals that govern life and determine 'right action and relation'; and within development, these absolutes offer rules and regulations that dictate what is 'wrong' and 'right', particularly in regard to North-South, donor-recipient relations. Ultimately, development must work for the eradication of such boundaries. Thirdly, culture is defined in its most broad sense, not just as art, music or aesthetics, but as the cosmological construct that prescribes the world view of any particular society. Thus development must be contextualised within this construct; it must in essence, make sense to that culture, as determined by its values, ethics, meanings of life, and goals. Only in this way will development be meaningful, and in more development oriented terms, sustainable.
Up until this point I have not assessed the merits of the many ideas that have emerged in this literature review. However, it can be seen that there are some inherent difficulties in this description of spirituality and development. In particular is the idea that life in general, and specifically development, must be governed by absolute morals. There has been unending debate over whether morality is universal or whether it is relative to individual cultures. In order for a concept of spirituality and development to gain any real acceptance in development theory, it is critical that this problematic issue—cultural relativism versus universal ethics—is addressed.

1.6.1 Cultural Relativism, Absolute Morals and Development Ethics

It was seen that in spirituality and development there is an emphasis on the significance of culture as a cosmology, life story, myth or in less esoteric terms, a framework of analysis which allows one to mediate life, understand (one’s) life meaning, purpose, and role in life, community, society, earth and universe. This framework deciphers what is ‘right action and relation’. There is also a belief that there are absolute morals, laws that have their source in divinity, that exist to guide humanity in ‘right action and relation’. The two emphases together, the sanctity of culture and the existence of absolute morals, however, suggest an incongruity. Can there be a universal ethic to which all cultures should not only aspire, but also be subject? If so, how can cultural specificity be mediated within this intent? The central issue becomes whether a universal moral ethic exists and whether there can there be a universal conception of the good life or social justice. If so, how can cultural particularity be mediated? Within the realm of development ethics, how one can avoid imposing one's own cultural values on the meaning of development, yet also avoid treating each culture as sacrosanct and beyond criticism (Gasper 1996)?

There are many positions and perspectives taken on this debate. Ladd (1973) describes the oppositional stances of ethical relativism and anti-relativism. The first position purports that the moral ‘rightness’ and ‘wrongness’ of actions varies from society to society and that there are no absolute universal
moral standards. More specifically, cultural relativism maintains that there is an irreducible diversity among cultures because each culture is a unique whole with parts so intertwined that none of them can be understood or evaluated without reference to the cultural whole. Ethics, as part of culture, cannot be understood or evaluated apart from the distinct world of the society to which it belongs. Moral principles have only a limited validity, binding only on those within a particular group. No one thus has the right to pass judgement on another society’s ethics or to impose their own ethics on another group or society. This would be ethnocentrism. The problem with ethical relativism, argues Ladd (1973) is that there is a denial of the distinction between ‘right’ and wrong’. Ethics is only an opinion.

Two oppositional stances of antirelativism - absolutism and universalism - exist to counteract ethical or cultural relativism (Ladd 1972). According to Ladd (1973), the ‘absolutist’ approach can be traced back to Plato who believed that the validity (or truth) or moral beliefs, rules, and practices is independent of the cultural or social person of the person. Moral ‘truths’ are independent of what anybody thinks. The ‘universalist’ version of antirelativism is willing to accept that ethics is dependent on a number of factors, but these factors are universal and invariable amongst all humans. Ethics is universal but not absolute.

The literature reviewed for this thesis all fall somewhere along this ‘relativist-universalist continuum’. It was shown earlier, for example, that the Dalai Lama is of the opinion that that there is a universal ethic to which all of humanity must aspire. Corbridge (1993) also argues for a “minimally

---

8 There are also two stands on how moral ‘truths’ can be discerned. ‘Intuitionism’ maintains that ethical ‘truths’ can be known by a ‘priori cognition’ (intuition). ‘Naturalism’ holds that they can be known empirically (much like scientific laws).

9 According to Ladd (1973), the best example of the universalist approach is David Hume’s ethics. Hume maintained that morality is not a matter of reason, but sentiment and that the kind of sentiment that determines morality is the same in all ‘men’; it issues from the universal structure of human nature.
universalist account of human needs and our responsibilities to them” (Ibid, p.449). This, he suggests, is essential if we are to avoid the slide into an amoral politics of indifference, or a local politics which craves no point of contact with forms of political practice which are connected to global issues and ostensibly ‘universal’ themes” (Ibid, p. 456). However, he believes that in this post-modern era the possibilities of achieving a universal ethic of development is slim.

Similarly, Nussbaum (1992) argues, against the prevalent flow of ‘anti-essentialist subjectivism’ (read relativism), there is a basic list of human capabilities or functioning that are essential to being human\(^\text{10}\) and that there are universal values that humanity must aspire to and public policy must support. She argues “that ‘local tradition relativism’ seems to assume that all criticism (of culture) must be a form of imperialism, the imposition of an outsider’s power on local ways. It confers a bogus air of legitimacy on these deeply embedded preferences by refusing to subject them to ethical scrutiny” (Ibid, p. 232). By contrast, Nussbaum scrutinised a wide variety of self-understandings of people in many times and places, particularly myths and stories that situate the human being in some way in the universe in order to come up with her list of human functionings. For this reason, she believes that her list commands a very wide consensus that is fully international. Yet her list is also “deliberately vague in the sense that it’s multiple specification nature can encompass varied local and personal conceptions across metaphysical, religious and cultural traditions” (Ibid, p. 215).

Without such an account, Nussbaum believes that we do not have an adequate basis for an account of social justice and the ends of social

---

\(^{10}\) She lists these as: morality; the human body, capacity for pleasure and pain, cognitive capability (perceiving, imagining, thinking), early infant development, practical reason, affiliation with other human being, relatedness to other species and to nature, humour and play, and separateness. She claims that a life that lacks these basic human capabilities would be lacking in humanness and thus argues for an “internal-essentialist” (Ibid, p. 214) account of humanity, which she calls the “thick vague theory of the good” (Ibid, p. 214).
distribution. We need a list of minimalist human essentialism, she argues in order to construct an adequate account of distributive justice to guide public policy. She also argues that this minimalist human essentialism must be based on moral sentiment, specifically compassion and respect. She argues that "compassion requires the recognition of shared humanity; that without compassion, there is no reason not to be harsh and tyrannical towards others who are weaker" (Ibid, p. 238). She believes that relativist or subjectivist position allows only "narrow, self-regarding sentiments and a relatively detached and curious attitude to the situation of others" (Ibid, p. 240); that the sentiments are those of a tourist - wonder, curiosity, and amused interest. However, there is none of the feeling that is necessary to identify with the other's misfortune.

Crespo (1992) believes that in the face of increasing globalisation, there is a collective, world-wide identity crisis. Globalisation may carry a veneer of egalitarian values, but in reality it reproduces inequalities, imbalances and tensions across the planet. We are entering into an era, he argues, of "global immediacy" (Ibid, p. 11) where universalism is ceasing to be an abstraction. However, he emphasises, universalism also entails an acceptance of diversity. Both for societies and individuals, the word universality has many different meanings, contextualised by a host of historical, cultural and religious connotations. It would, he believes, be wrong to attach priority to any one of these meanings and try to impose it on everybody. Yet we must also beware of falling into the relativism trap. He argues that when differing cultures meet, some values remain inviolate, not because they serve particular interests, but because they "reach out and embrace the whole of humanity" (Ibid, p. 12). He believes that the one universal value that the world must discover a way of supporting is "the best way to equate living well with living freely" (Ibid, p. 12) He argues that this twofold demand for freedom and human dignity is the fundamental imperative at the heart of all questions relating to human rights.
Crocker (1991) also argues that explicit (universal) ethics of development are needed and that it is possible to form them within a global dialogue. He argues that to counter the claim that development ethics are but a new form of Northern cultural imperialism, development ethics requires a global dialogue. The participants must come from the South as well as the North to avoid ethnocentric imperialism. They must also go beyond theoreticians and include development policy makers, politicians, activists and journalists. Equally, they must involve women and men in order to diminish sexism. Members of minority groups must participate to reduce racism, classicism and a bias against traditional practices and popular wisdom (Crocker 1991, p. 473-474). However, he does not stipulate how this global dialogue might come about.

One such example may be found in the Parliament of the World's Religions, which passed a 'Declaration toward a Global Ethic'. In Chicago 1993, thousands of people from very different religious backgrounds agreed on a minimal ethic considered to be absolutely necessary for human survival. Hans Kung, editor of the book published from the gathering emphasises that:

>a global ethic does not mean a new global ideology or attempt to arrive at one uniform religion. It does not aim to replace the supreme ethical demands of each individual religion with an ethical minimalism. Nor does it seek to invent a new morality and impose it on the various religions. It simply aims to make known what religions in West and East, North and South already hold in common, but is so often obscured by numerous dogmatic disputes. It is not aimed against anyone, but invites all to adopt this ethic and live in accordance with it (Kung 1996, p. 2).

However, there are also many arguments against the idea of universal values. For example, Hussein (1992) argues that the West has tended to impose its vision of universal values on the world. According to Hussein:

>It forgot that other cultures and civilisations have, especially in art and religion, reached out to values transcending space and time in a bid to encompass the human condition in all its mystery; that they have produced accomplished expressions of universal preoccupations in metaphysics, ethics, aesthetics
and rational thought; and that the West drew on all these sources before creating in its turn a new vision of modern Man” (Ibid, p. 24).

He argues that in order for the world to forge ahead towards a new “planetary identity” (Ibid, p. 25), peoples of the West and peoples of the South have to find a new way of relating their own specific values to the values they have in common. The West must stop thinking that what is good for the West is good for the world, and the South has to start incorporating their version of the modern, universal dimension into their own value systems.

Another argument is that while the shift toward cultural sensibilities that accompanies the alternative development perspective is welcome, the plea for ‘people’s culture’, indigenous culture, local knowledge and culture, can lead, if not to ethnochauvinism, to reification of both culture and locality or people (Pieterse 1998).

As Hobsbawn & Ranger (1983) and Werbner (1998) point out, there are difficulties in the ‘authenticity’ of the culture that is being reified. Hobsbawn & Ranger (1983) point out the danger of “invented traditions”. They examine how tradition has been invented and what possible uses these inventions have had in cultural and political movements around the world. They define “invented tradition” as:

... a set of practices, normally governed by overtly or tacitly accepted rules and of a ritual or symbolic nature, which seek to inculcate certain values and norms of behaviour by repetition, which automatically implies continuity with the past” (p.1)

Ranger (1983) shows how during colonialism, Europeans invented traditions to bring their African subjects into line, dominantly through the use of rituals.

In Memory and the Postcolony, Werbner (1998) demonstrates how in a contemporary context independent African states have manipulated memories of cultural traditions for their own agendas. Meyer (in Webner,
1998) describes how the state policy of Ghana calls for a “national effort against the legacy of colonial cultural imperialism, the aim being to ‘retrieve and restore our history and heritage in order to protect and project them for posterity’” (Meyer 1998, p. 12). Pride in history and culture is presented by the state as “the essential motive for a modern way forward in ‘development’ and ‘progress’” (Ibid, p.12).

Werbner (1998) outlines some of the many ways of remembering used by African states. Anti-memory is imagined or buried or even repressed remembrance. “It is the accomplishment memory as if it were forgotten, almost beyond recovery, and yet somehow recovered” (Ibid, p. 74). Anti-memory may serve the ends of the nation-building regime, of the state in making, or it may become the defensive or subversive drive of subalterns asserting themselves against the state or its dominant elite. Immediate memory is that which is readily accessible, held to be unforgettable, always to be remembered and kept very much alive. What is contested here is who is to appropriate the well-known past, and how. Memory suppression is the act of concealing or deliberately avoiding memory to play down the past. It is important, argues Werbner (1998), to study memory as public practice, both moral and political, through which political subjectivity is contested. This work seeks to understand the ethical work of memory in the post-colonial construction of state, institutional and civic authority (Ibid, p. 15).

There is also a counter argument to the notion of politicised memory and invented tradition. Chinweizu (1987), Wa Thiong’o (1993), Escobar (1995) and many other post-colonial writers have argued that the reclaiming of cultures harmed by colonialism is an urgent necessity for newly independent nations trying to build a new identity. For these writers cultures have the ability to mediate between the new and the old and to discern what will be

\[\text{Memory suppression will resurface in the empirical research in Namibia as it forms a crucial strategy of the state to forge ahead with its policy of reconciliation and reconstruction.}\]
useful or harmful in the creation of that identity. Chinweizu (1987) for example, stressed that in decolonisation African nations must merge both foreign and African traditions. He argued that a renaissance of African civilisation in an industrial mode implies a far-reaching renovation of African cultures.

Renovation calls for selectivity guided by the new objectives. Like a plank, brick or tile being used to renovate a house, every cultural item for use in renovating African civilisation has to be critically appraised to see if it meets the specifications demanded by the new objectives. Elements from African tradition, no less than elements from non-African traditions, have to be thus appraised. Overthrowing the authority of alien traditions will allow for the questioning of their contents, for selection of what is useful, for adapting to African conditions and needs whatever is selected as useful. It will prevent the unexamined importation of the harmful, as well as the unexamined importation of that for which equivalent, or even superior, African counterparts exist (Chinweizu 1987, p.6-7).

Escobar (1995) contends that popular cultures are able to mediate between the familiar and the new, the local and that which comes from afar. “This cultural hybridisation results in negotiated realities in contexts shaped by traditions, capitalism and modernity” (p. 220). In defining the notion of hybrid culture, he argues that “it does not imply the belief in pure strands of tradition and modernity that are combined to create a hybrid with a new essence; nor does it amount to the combination of discrete elements from tradition and modernity, or a “sell-out” of the traditional to the modern. Rather, hybridity entails a cultural (re) creation that may or may not be (re)inscribed into hegemonic constellations” (p. 220). He cites T. Minh-ha’s (1991) concept of the “hyphenated condition” which she argues does not limit itself to a duality between two cultural heritages. Rather, it modifies, appropriates, and reappropriates without being trapped in imitation. The main thrust of Escobar’s argument is that cultural hybridity has a particular relevance to the political project of deconstructing development.
Simon (1998) also argues the case for cultural hybridity. He borrows the notion of the ‘posttraditional’ (Ibid, p.219) from Dani Nabudere, a radical Ugandan lawyer who took issue with the notion of the postcolonial. Nabudere, according to Simon, regarded the term to be too Eurocentric, implying the previous hegemony of colonial institutions, social structure, and identities, and that the experience of colonialism should be the defining point of reference. Nabudere felt that indigenous values, social structures, and identities had survived colonialism, admittedly with varying degrees of engagement and transformation with colonial impositions. Hence, the process of evolving new, people-centred and indigenously generated African alternatives to the colonial and the modern should be more accurately termed ‘posttraditional’.

Simon outlines four reasons why the term ‘posttraditional’ has potential merits. First, it encompasses a broader, less specific, sense of the traditional as the accumulated amalgam of practices and beliefs from previous epochs and domains. Second, it removes the colonial non-enclature which imposes an implicitly Northern-centric fixity of epoch and dominant peoples/identity/institutions and discourses/practices. Third, it is historically more inclusive, as not all territories and indigenous politics in the South were colonised by Europe. Fourthly it implies the possibility of greater weight being given to indigenous and hybrid pasts, which may in turn (re)combine in new hybrid ways. Simon also outlines why the notion of ‘posttraditional’ would have appeal for feminist postcolonial writers.12

---

12 The notion of the ‘posttradition’ is particularly appropriate for ‘Third World’ women’s corrections of ‘traditional’ or ‘indigenous’ discriminations against women. For example, in his article, Simon (1998) analyses the encounter between a “feminist Irish cyclist (Devla Murphy) and an Ankole (Ugandan) owner of a dukas (shop). The topic was AIDS and the risk that women with children were forced to undertake because of their “risky husbands”. Simon (1996) argues that “although this grassroots village feminist activist’s discourse would strike a ready chord with most postcolonial feminist writers, the point is that her revolution is not being launched against essentially colonialist social norms but against far older, more ingrained, precolonial indigenous values.
Thus it can be seen that there are many issues surrounding the appeal to culture. 'Pre-colonial' culture may be idealised and manipulated in such a way that is not beneficial for all of its constituent members. As well, a return to the past may be resisted by those whose memories of it are far from ideal. By placing the significance of culture in this context of memory, I do not advocate a denial of the right to cultural freedom. I simply point to the fact that the remembrance of culture is problematic. However, the counter argument is that local culture has the ability to critique its own situation, values, and practices and within the context of engagement with the global, clarify and strengthen its own identity. Culture therefore has rights. On the which were modified and overlain by the modernist disruptions and contradictions of the colonial and early postcolonial experiences" (Ibid, p. 237). Simon (1996) also details an example of a young woman rocking Zimbabwe's 'traditional' culture by becoming one of the first women to take on the mantle of tribal chief. He sees a rich tapestry of crosscutting continuity and change; of old, new and hybrid identities; of reason and reaction; of gender and power relations; of the preservation versus the transcendence of categories; of how and by whom they are negotiated, defined and safeguarded" (Ibid, p. 238), all within a chronologically and substantively postcolonial framework.

13 See for example Kukuthas' article "Are There Any Cultural Rights?" (1992); Kymlicka's article "The Rights Of Minority Cultures" (1992); and a series of public lectures at the Institute of Social Studies, The Netherlands under the title "Development Regardless of Culture?" edited by C.A.O. Van Nieuwenhuijze (1984) and Gasper 1996 who argues that there would be less need to study culture if there was only one, as it is sometimes assumed in economics. But in fact there is plurality, lack of consensus and ethical issues of inter-cultural relations. The more one emphasises the distinctiveness, persistence, centrality and value of a societal culture, the larger becomes the questions about inter-cultural relations. How do we handle these conflicts of culture? Do cultures have rights? Are there universal values that can be used to judge cultures? If the opposite stance is taken, that cultures are above criticism, that the values of each culture cannot be questioned, this relativism can sometimes be used to legitimate domination by the strong. Gasper emphasises that there is a weakness in the empirical base for cultural relativism; "that in general the 'values of a culture' are far from fully clear, consistent, or internally accepted" (Ibid, p. 638).
practical side, there is a question of how culture is or should be conceptualised within development ethics\(^\text{14}\).

The primary dilemma is whether cultural particularity or universal values should have ascendancy in development, and whether they can be reconciled within a theory of justice that is universal yet also takes account of the multiple differences between human beings. Most of the writers reviewed in this thesis seem to believe that it is not only possible, but of utmost urgency to arrive at a theory of universality, while protecting the integrity of cultures. Cultural particularity and universality are not seen to be contradictory but rather, complementary. It is because of the intricate differences between cultures that a perspective on commonality can be achieved.

Spirituality and development, at least at this level of theoretical understanding of its idea/s, is supportive of this perspective. Without culture, there is no context within which individuals and society can find meaning and purpose. Yet it is also suggested that cultures must abide by absolute laws that decree not just morality, but what it means to be human. The issue is complex and

\(^{14}\) See for example, Gasper (1996) who describes the continuum of perspectives taken on the role of culture in development. Mainstream development generally views culture as a potential instrument of development. According to Gasper, three streams within the mainstream exist. One stream of mainstream development views culture to be a "fully accommodating dependent variable" which does not influence economic development and thus can be ignored. A second mainstream development view sees culture as an obstacle to economic development while a third see culture as a policy tool to be studied and made use of. This stance stems from an understanding that failures to take into account distinctive local culture. Motives and meanings contribute to policy and project failures (p. 635). Much further along the continuum is the view that people have 'cultural needs' that development needs to be addressed to. At this point, views of culture differentiate into seven stances ranging from the liberal view that culture needs to be accorded a "separable independent" value that needs to be addressed as an important part of development, to the most extreme view that there should be "culture, not development" which sees development as being culturally unacceptable because it is too individualistic and materialistic (p. 636).
involves philosophical, anthropological, sociological, political, religious and spiritual analysis and debate. It is not the intention of this thesis to seek to resolve this issue but rather to place spirituality and development within this historical and hotly contested debate. By placing the themes of spirituality and development within this broader context of social analysis, it is my intention to uncover some problematic issues that may be considered in a rigorous critique of its concepts and practices.

According to the literature, there is a belief that humanity is in transition towards a postmodern consciousness. Acceptance of the validity of all knowledge claims and recognition of the importance of diversity has finally allowed the West to hear feminist, anti-colonial, post-colonial (and marginalised groups in general) claims that the West (white elite male) has wrongfully imposed its ideas of knowledge, values and lifestyle on others, while considering them to be superior as well as universal. It is now possible to start talking about and seeking a new global ethic that not merely defines what is ‘right’ and ‘wrong’ action and relation, but also defines what it means to be human (not just white, male and elite). Despite the postmodern emphasis on relativism, or perhaps because of this emphasis, many scholars are arguing for a minimalist theory of what it means to be human as the basis of a theory of social justice.

Development is on the front-line of this developing global ethic. Development has ‘traditionally’ been involved in the destruction, or at very least, the marginalisation of culture and global diversity. It has tended to instrumentalise culture to achieve economic development. However, increasingly it is being argued that development must be about cultural renewal; culture being defined not just as arts, music, or aesthetics, but as a cosmological construct that defines for specific societies, the meaning and purpose of life, humanity’s role on earth and within the universe, and ‘right action and relation’. Cultural renewal cannot be taken to mean Northern development agencies setting out to develop the cultural ‘traditions’ of the South, but rather, learning to become more respectful of cultures and to

62
understand that culture is central to defining what development is, and how it can be done. It cannot be just another component used to further the aims of economic development, diluted in the way of WID.

This is my understanding of spirituality and development at this theoretical level. My analysis of spirituality and development indicates that several of its component parts have been debated for many decades. They can be heard in the echoes of timeless appeals for cultural freedom made by prominent figures like Kenneth Kaunda (1962;1973) and Jomo Kenyatta (1938). They are heard in the feminist appeals for a female consciousness. They are apparent in the post-colonial language of self-representation and subaltern identities and in the ethnographic details of development practice.

Yet it is only now that attempts are being made to develop a cohesive pattern of thought and practices labelled as spirituality and development. What remains to be seen is how spirituality and development translates to the practical level. Spirituality and development seems to suggest that development must become an instrument of humanity’s spiritual transformation. Thus, at this level, spirituality and development offers to the continuum of development, a much more extended understanding to the meaning of development. The basis for the empirical research conducted for this thesis will be to test this theoretical understanding of spirituality and development and to ascertain how spirituality and development can be applied in practice. How does it translate in terms of concrete methodologies and processes? How do such concepts as cultural significance, metaphysical transformation and absolute morals translate into practice? Do these concepts become diluted and absorbed into the master metaphor of mainstream development? What incongruities emerge between idealistic theory and practical application?
Chapter 2

Thesis Methodology

2.0 Introduction

Research methodologies have come under much postcolonial, postmodern and feminist scrutiny. Integral to this examination is the idea that the positionality of the researcher, including age, class, gender, race ethnicity, sexuality, plays a central role in influencing the social process of research. After a discussion of the most recent literature on this subject, and the placement of my thesis within this critique, I provide a geographical overview of the case study area and the factors influencing its selection. I then describe the methodologies used in researching how spirituality and development is variously defined, both by Northern development agencies, and within the empirical case study in Namibia. This description offers a chronological order of the methodologies engaged in and an overview of the why such methodologies were used. I then outline the specific research methodologies utilised.

2.1 The Ethics of Research: Geographical and Feminist Methodologies

Geographers have become increasingly interested in questions of ethics or moral philosophy, particularly in respect to the social context and conditions of research. Sidaway (1992) discusses the ways in which contemporary power relations and geography's colonial legacy problematises development geography, and the praxis of overseas work. He relates these issues to the problematics of authority and representation. He argues that geography has been directly involved the projects of colonialism and capitalist modernisation and the recognition of these legacies ought to be the starting point in conducting research and writing strategies for 'First World' academics in 'Third World' contexts. There is a problem inherent in the unequal relations between foreign scholars and the societies under study and that it is "incorrect to
assume that the problems of research by ‘First World’ academics in the ‘Third World’ contexts can be reduced to those experienced by the researcher” (Ibid, p. 403). In other words, there is a context to the politics of research and knowledge production that impinges upon every ‘First World’ researcher simply because of the inherent power relationship between the ‘First and Third Worlds’.

The question of direction and uses of research is a central ethical question. Is the purpose to advance the researcher’s career without regard to the disappointed hopes of the hosts who expected useful results, correction of social problems or even joint publications? Sidaway (1992) argues that the project of research in ‘Third World’ countries should not be abandoned. Rather, the researcher should keep in mind a few working principles to guide his/her work. First, the researcher should avoid all actions that violate fundamental ethical standards and cultural understandings. The ‘researched’ should also be informed of the general purposes and the funding of the investigation. The research should also not generate any risk of harm for the ‘researched’. Finally, the merits of the research should be appraised. Does it, in the production of knowledge, challenge the frameworks and assumptions developed in the core (‘First World’) while helping to view the world as one? Does it help in the blurring of the distinctions between ‘us’ and ‘them’?

The feminist insistence on taking seriously the social construction of gendered power relations and our knowledge of them requires a critical examination of the connections between theory, method and practice in all research methodologies. It is through this combined epistemological critique that feminist analysis has the potential to transform our understandings of power relations simultaneously with the power relations themselves (Staeheli & Lawson 1995). Fundamental to feminist research processes is the relationship between the researcher and the researched. Feminists challenge the normative construction of researcher as value neutral, that is that the researcher’s choice of topic and methodology is not influenced by his/her values, experiences.
The positionality of the researcher is thus recognised as having important influences on the social process of research and that this dimension cannot be divorced from research (McEwan 1995). Rose (1997) outlines the concept of reflexivity, which refers to the full understanding of the “positionality of researcher, the researched and the research content” (Ibid, p. 305). Reflexivity is touted as a means of avoiding the false neutrality and universality claimed by so much academic knowledge. All knowledge is situated, marked by its origins, and to deny this is to make false claims to universally applicable knowledge that subjugates other knowledge and their producers. Even further, transparent reflexivity is based on a deeper critical reflection of the self as the researcher, and the relationship of that self with the researched. The power relationship inherent within this relationship should be made visible and open to debate. Thus reflexivity looks both inward to the identity of the researcher, and outward to her/his relation to the researched and the research. “Making position conscious” (Ibid p. 309), in other words, recognising that our consciousness is always the medium through which the research occurs, leads to transparent reflexivity. “This transparent self looks outward to understand its place in the world, to chart its position in the arenas of knowledge production, to see its own place in the relations of power” (Ibid p. 309).

However Rose (1997) then goes on to argue that achieving transparent reflexivity is not sustainable because of its assumptions about agency and context. The fault-line is this. “Reflecting on their respective positions, a researcher positions herself and her research subjects in the same landscape of power, which is the context of the research project in question. Differences between researcher and researched are imagined as distances in this landscape of power” (Ibid p. 312). However, difference is much more fundamental that just imagined distance. The researcher is still an outsider. She has the ability to move about in the landscape of power due to her position within a larger context of economic, social, cultural and political relations. Connectedness is therefore false. Despite the ‘messiness’ of the fallibility of transparent reflexivity, however, Rose argues that it is important to remember that the crucial goal of situating academic knowledge is to produce non-
overgeneralising knowledge and to work towards a critical politics of power/knowledge production.

England (1994) also reflects on the possibilities of “failed research” (Ibid, p. 85), recognising that the recognition or even sensitivity to power relations does not remove them and that exploitation and possibly betrayal are endemic to fieldwork. Appropriation of the voices of others (even if ‘only’ textual) is an inevitable consequence of fieldwork because as researchers we cannot escape the contradictory position in which we find ourselves. She urges researchers to remember that reflexivity can make us more aware of asymmetrical or exploitative relationships, but it cannot remove them (Ibid p.86). Ultimately, however, we should not abandon research, nor limit the subject of our research. Rather we must constantly seek to locate ourselves and to ask how “our location influences the questions we ask, how we conduct our research and how we write our research” (Ibid p.87).

Overall, the politics of research combines two problematics. First there is the problem of the politics of North-South relations and issues of authority and representation inherent in the relationship between the ‘First World’ researcher and the ‘Third World’ researched. Second, there is the issue of ethics surrounding the direction and use of research. I would like now to interpret the ‘standpoint’ (Sayer & Storper 1997) of my research both in respect to North-South relations and reflexive position, and the ultimate goal of the research.

2.2 The Standpoint of My Research

I fully acknowledge that in my research I occupied a position of power in relation to those that I researched. However, within this overall position, my relations with the researched were very divergent and this was due to the fact that in my research process, I occupied two distinct, if also inter-related positions. First, I occupied the position of a professional consultant working on the externally supported development projects that will be featured in my empirical research. In this capacity I retained enormous powers of access to the research subjects, both directly and indirectly. Because of my prior relations
that were developed as the 'expert' consultant I was able quickly and easily to establish research relations with the communities that were the 'target groups' of the project. There was really no possibility that they would refuse my request to conduct research in their communities, and I did not have to build up from scratch, a relationship with individuals to gain their trust and cooperation. This of course only applied to the communities that were the 'target groups' of the projects, not to the many other areas and research subjects that were outside of the projects. However, indirectly, my work as a consultant had exposed me to the cultural, political, economic and social environments of the case study area and this baseline knowledge gave me a considerable head-start in structuring the research methodologies.

Second, I occupied a position as an independent researcher. Again, this cannot be applied to the 'target communities' of the projects who did not distinguish between my various identities. My relationship with these development colleagues was also multi-dimensional. As the expatriate consultant I embodied Western knowledge and professionalism and all of its hegemonic privileges. At one level, and I will never know to what depth, the Namibian development professionals accepted my 'expertise' which was supported institutionally by the constructs and the practices of development. However, there was also a consciousness that this position of expertise was a false one, and that in fact they secretly, and not so secretly objected to, and did not believe in their relegation as 'not so knowledgeable' by virtue of their 'local identity'. It was at this juncture that friendships developed between myself and a few colleagues. As a friend, colleague and researcher, I was then party to discourses on development that I would not have been able to access from a single position. With all other research subjects, however, my single position as researcher did apply. Outside the project target areas, I was not known in my consultant capacity. However, in this relatively uncomplicated position, the notion of reflexivity still applied.

My overall position as outsider also has relevance in terms of concern over the expropriation of knowledge. Although it was not my intention, the fact that my
research was not based within a framework of collaborative and mutually co-operative research led by the host country meant that inevitably, the onus of feeding back the results of the research lies with me. As Sidaway (1992) points out, logistics, politics, and resources often militate against the development of such feedback loops ever being concluded.

However, despite this 'messiness' of reflexive position, I did follow some guidelines on how research should be conducted. Sidaway (1992) describes these guidelines. The researcher should avoid all actions that violate ethical standards and cultural understandings, the researched should be informed of the general purposes and funding of the investigation, and the research should not place the researched in any risk of harm due to their participation.

In my research process, I fulfilled these three guidelines. I attempted to learn as much about the culture of the researched before undertaking the fieldwork. I attempted to follow cultural practices in asking permission from the traditional leaders before conducting interviews in any given area. I was guided in my choices of informants through discussions with traditional leaders. Before every interview I embarked on a detailed introduction to my research, its objectives and purpose. When requested I would leave a copy of the questions to be asked with the prospective informants so that they could determine their desire to participate. This was especially important to church leaders in regards to the detainee issue, which will be discussed in Chapter 4.

It is important to point out that I needed an interpreter to assist me in translating between English and Oshivambo. I was fortunate to acquire the services of Anita Shivute who acted as interpreter for me in all of the interviews, women's churchgroup workshops and application of the questionnaire, and my work in the informal settlements. Of course, Anita was not just an interpreter. She belonged to the society and culture that were being researched. She offered ideas of who should be interviewed and why, be it because of their age, location, or particular knowledge of topics relevant to the thesis research. She knew the customs that should be followed to introduce ourselves and the objectives of my research, particularly in approaching
traditional leaders and elders. The existence of her position greatly affected my position. It declared my obvious difference and distance from the researched.

Both Rose and Sidaway argue that the direction and use of the research are the most important criteria in determining its ethical standards. By examining how spirituality is being variously used in Northern donor agencies and highlighting the possibility that it may become yet another totalising discourse, and by then exploring alternative ideas of spirituality and development in Namibia, I am contributing to the disruption of Western hegemonic discourses. The crucial goal of my research is thus to work towards a critical politics of power/knowledge production.

2.3 Conceptual Approach

The approach taken to the study was to focus on three areas of information that needed to be collected to achieve the objectives of the thesis. These focus areas included: (i) international and Namibian concepts, approaches and experiences of development; (ii) international and Namibian concepts of spirituality; and (iii) relationships between spirituality and development both at a conceptual and practical level. I used four research methodologies to obtain this information.

2.3.1 Research Methodologies

The three main research methodologies employed in the thesis were (i) a literature review of four main bodies of critical social theory; (ii) research at the World Council of Churches, the International Development and Research Centre and the World Bank; and (iii) case study research in Namibia. The latter encompassed two distinct methodologies. These were (i) professional involvement, interviews with, and document review within two externally supported projects (GTZ SWAM & IBIS OHSIP); and (ii) interviews, participatory group work, questionnaire application, and participant participation, and observation with community development committees,
community leaders, 'traditional' leaders, development workers, elders, 'traditional healers', churchwomen's groups, and church leaders in Namibia.

A fourth research methodology was also employed. I interviewed a number of people associated in some way with spirituality and development initiatives. For example, I interviewed Richard Barrett, whose work with the World Bank will be discussed in detail in Chapter 3, about his own personal work as a consultant in the field of spirituality and corporate transformation. I also interviewed Noel Jones who, as a private consultant working for the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank, also 'lectures' on spirituality and development. I also interviewed Alfredo Sfeirs-Younis, the World Bank Ambassador to the United Nations. He has been working on a book on spirituality and development for seven years and has developed a personal 'model' of spirituality and development based on Hindu philosophy.

These interviews, however, are not included in the thesis findings. I was not able to spend the time needed to fully comprehend the individual approaches or 'models' of spirituality and development. I certainly could not attempt to paraphrase the complexity of their ideas with the accuracy required. Thus except for Richard Barrett's work, which appears in Chapter Seven as an example of how spirituality might be applied in development, I elected not to include this information.

For each of the research methodologies I will provide a description of the process or nature of the methodology, and the specific reasons for using the methodology.

2.3.1.1 Literature Review

I undertook a literature review of three main bodies of literature. First a review of philosophical, religious, and spiritual writings was conducted in order to examine the meanings of spirituality. This included a gamut of Western, Eastern, and African perspectives. A thorough review of the various themes of development discourse was undertaken, including feminism, environmental,
post-colonial, post-modern, populist, and ethnographical and environmental economics perspectives to explore some applications of spirituality have been used for and how these may be used to analyse donor definitions of spirituality and development. A review of Namibian and South African literature, including history, culture, religion, politics, economics, development, reconciliation and reconstruction issues was undertaken in order to grasp the ethnic, social, cultural, political, economic and spiritual contexts of Namibia as a whole. I examined the popular perspectives through the daily newspapers.

2.3.1.2 Research at the World Council of Churches (WCC), the World Bank and International Research and Development Centre (IDRC)

Before reviewing the methodologies used in research at the three Northern donor agencies, I will first describe the rationale used in selecting these three agencies. As mentioned in Chapter One, as I began conceptualising spirituality and development as the topic of this thesis, I was not aware that any initiatives on spirituality and development were being conducted in any organisation. It was only due to discussions with contacts at the Council of Churches of Namibia that I was made aware that the World Council of Churches had initiated a workshop on spirituality and development. It was then only in discussion with the World Council of Churches that I was made aware that the World Bank was also conducting seminars on the topic of spirituality and development. Once I gained access to various contacts at the World Bank, I then discovered the research project that the IDRC was conducting on the topic. In discussion with the IDRC, I learned of other initiatives by various other organisations. These were mentioned in Chapter One.

I also surveyed the head offices of the two donor agencies GTZ and IBIS (DANIDA), to see if these agencies were involved in spirituality and development initiatives. As far as I am aware, no other agency is involved in a
spirituality and development initiative that encompasses a reconceptualisation of development at the policy and management level. There are, however, some spirituality type groups in organisations such as CIDA (Canadian International Development Agency) which, much the same as the World Bank's Spiritual Unfoldment Society (SUS), focuses on personal spirituality development or transformation issues. The SUS will be described in Chapter Three.

The three donor agencies were selected because they represented the most advanced initiatives so far being conducted by Northern development agencies. The goal of these initiatives went beyond personal transformation issues into transforming development policy, goals and methodologies.

A note should be made here that I did not attempt to include spirituality and development initiatives of any development organisations based in Asian countries, or Middle Eastern countries which, it might be expected, would be founded on Hindu, Buddhist, or Islamic principles. For example, the Sarvodaya Movement in Sri Lanka is founded on Buddhist Dharma principles, which according to Macy (1997), serve to help Sarvodayans, thousands of villagers, to define what development is. In the Friday Morning Group's (of the World Bank) publication (Beckmann et al 1991), Agarwala outlines the Harmonist Manifesto, a 'Hindu philosophy in action'. In the same publication, Serageldin provides his view of the intersection between the Muslim ethical framework and development. A publication forthcoming from the IDRC's spirituality and development research project also encompasses Hindu and Islamic perspectives on the intersection between science, religion and development (IDRC "The Lab, the Temple and the Market", forthcoming). However, I chose to stay within the scope of largely Christian based spirituality and development initiatives because the case study areas, Namibia is a dominantly

---

1 Due to the selection of these two agencies' projects as case studies in the case study area. DANIDA is the Danish aid agency which IBIS is ultimately accountable to.
Christian country with little Muslim, Hindu or other world faith influence, particularly in the northern Ovambo area.

Research at the World Council of Churches consisted of discussions with members of Unit III-Justice, Peace and Creation, the Women's Desk and the Executive Director of Unit IV-Sharing and Service as well as a review of documents from Unit IV and III and the Women's Desk. The specific objectives of the research at the World Council of Churches were to: gain first hand knowledge of the concepts of development that ecumenical perspectives had developed; gain perspectives on spirituality and its relation to development from members of the World Council of Churches; understand and document the relationship between ecumenical development and secular development on both the conceptual and operational levels; gain a perspective on what the role of the WCC has been playing in (transforming) society in terms of both people-people and people-nature relations.

The research at the World Bank included interviews and discussions with World Bank staff members, the Spiritual Unfoldment Society and the Friday Morning Group. It also involved a review of documentation relating to specific World Bank initiatives such as the Values Circle, Faith and Development Dialogue, and three conferences. The specific objectives of the research at the World Bank were to: gain perspectives on a number of concepts of spirituality and development held by specific staff or former staff members of the World Bank and how they integrated these concepts into their professional work; and examine the concepts and initiatives on the spirituality and development that the World Bank was undertaking, including the rationale, process and implications.

Research at the IDRC consisted of document analysis of the IDRC's initiatives in spirituality and development and telephonic communication with a primary IDRC staff member involved in spirituality and development initiatives. The objective of the research at the IDRC was to gain a perspective on what initiatives the IDRC was implementing or planning with respect to spirituality and development, including their rationale, process and implication.
2.3.1.3 Research in Namibia, The Case Study

Before describing the two methodologies in the research in the case study area, an overview of the case study area and the factors of selection are given.

2.3.1.3.1 An Overview of the Case Study

As mentioned in Chapter One, the topic of spirituality and development was chosen in part because of Namibia's particular 'experiences of spirituality'. A further focus shall be made on one particular area of Namibia; the four northern regions of Oshana, Ohangwena, Oshikot, and Omusati, formerly known as 'Ovamboland'. Map 2.1 shows the Ovambo area in relation to Namibia. Map 2.2 shows the boundaries of the four administrative regions within the Ovambo area. The four regions encompass eight ethnic Ovambo groups. Map 2.3 shows the location of these ethnic boundaries.
Map 2.1: Namibia, showing the Ovambo Area

Map 2.2 The Ovambo Area: Four Regions of Oshana, Omusati, Ohangwena and Oshikoto

2.3.1.3.2 The Ovambo Area: Factors of Selection

As will be shown in greater detail in Chapter Four, the Ovambo area was the area in which the struggle for independence was waged. Along with the Kavango area, it was the hardest hit during the war, being completely taken over by the South African Defence Forces (SADF). During the war the economic base of the area was disrupted as SADF razed agricultural fields, imprisoned and killed anyone suspected of aiding the SWAPO fighters. Many Namibians fled into exile to escape South African repression. In post-independence, it faces severe development challenges in terms of a declining productive agricultural base, an expanding population contributing to
ecological exhaustion, poor infrastructural development, severe health problems, alcohol abuse, and the low status of women. A study by the Social Sciences Division of the University of Namibia (Frayne et al. 1993) noted that since independence, a host of donor and international development agencies, local and foreign consultants and the Government of Namibia have all directed much of their efforts to the central northern regions of the country (the case study area). The area is home to over 40% of the nation's population and is perceived to hold good potential for growth and development while facing the most challenging problems and constraints to development.

Water, the report stipulated, is a particularly critical development issue for the case study area due to the low and irregular rainfall, and the lack of perennial rivers running through any of the four administrative regions and the small and varying nature of surface and underground water sources. Drought and an expanding population, both of people and livestock, have placed unsustainable pressure on the current water supply systems. The Digest of the Water Supply and Sanitation Sector Policy of the Government of Namibia (Government of Namibia 1993) states “that the supply of water to all spheres of Namibian society is one of the more significant factors determining the social behaviour of the country’s people and potential for development. The numerous requests for water and the priority attached thereto in comparison with other needs, are a clear indication of the importance of water and the magnitude of requirements” (Government of Namibia 1993, p. 1).

The two projects were selected for the case study research because I was involved professionally with one of the projects. However, it is also important to note that both projects were established in the northern regions of Oshana, Omusati, Ohangwena and Oshikotos because of the overall identification of the regions as being a development priority for post-independent Namibia, with particular regard for the water supply needs of the area.
As will be shown in Chapter Four, the cultural environment of the Ovambo people who occupy the area also provided a very rich empirical basis of research for exploring the notions of spirituality and development. It was known through reading (Nela-Williams 1991) that the pre-colonial Ovambo culture had a 'tradition' of spirituality in the sense of belief in ancestral spirits who guided individual and social conduct, animal spirits and spirits situated in nature that formed places of sacred power. It also encompassed belief in prophets who were able to communicate with the spirit world to foretell the future and give advice on present action, as well as the spiritual power of 'traditional healers' who were able to mediate spiritual energy to heal. The Ovambo people believed (and still believe) in the god figure called 'Kalunga' who, although not represented in symbolic form as in Christianity, never-the-less occupied a very real place in the cosmology of the Ovambo people.

With the coming of missionary activity, Nela-Williams (1991) describes how the old and the new merged, but in such a way that the new Christianity was 'laid on top' of 'traditional' beliefs. Outwardly the 'old' became considered as pagan and backward while everyone professed their devout belief in the Christian God. But inwardly, Nela-Williams (1991) shows how Ovambo people retained their 'traditional' beliefs during and following the departure of European missionary activity. Today an appeal to 'Namibianise' the church is strong so that such 'traditional' practices as drumming and dancing can be part of celebration (Lombard 1995). These shall be reviewed in detail in Chapter Four. In view of this evidence, there was scope in the region to explore the notion of spirituality and development.

2.3.1.3.3 Professional Involvement and Research of Two Externally Supported Projects

My professional involvement with external support projects consisted of my work as the 'Awareness' consultant for the GTZ (German Technical Cooperation) supported Sewage, Water, Management, Awareness (SWAM) project conducted in the case study area. In the course of my consultancy with this project, I was also in professional contact with the IBIS supported
Oshakati Human Settlement Improvement Project (OHSIP). As the 'Awareness' consultant to the SWAM project, I was responsible for conceptualising, in coordination with key members of the 'counterpart', the approach and strategy to be undertaken to achieve the fifth 'result' (objective) of the SWAM project. This result was phrased in the inception report for the project (Proposal for Implementation of the Project Water Supply and Sanitation in Ovambo, Namibia 1991), as "Beneficiary population motivated to save water and use sewerage system more efficiently by means of information and sensitisation" (Ibid, p. 3).

I conducted interviews and held discussions with external support agency professionals and reviewed external support agency documents on policy and project formulation and implementation. Document research included a number of reports from the two projects². These documents consisted of:

(2) SWAM ZOPP Programme Planning Workshop Report, October 11-13 1993.
(3) SWAM Baseline Study and Monitoring and Evaluation Plan May 1994.
(9) SWAM Orientation to and Integration of Poverty Alleviation and Gender Project Status Report November 1996.
project conceptualisation reports written by expatriate consultants and home agency (GTZ/IBIS/DANIDA) staff, project planning documents based on ZOPP workshops, monitoring and evaluation reports, reports of specific activities implemented within the projects, and mid-term review reports and progress reports. They offer insight into the internal workings of the two projects; the rationales for certain decisions on project design and implementation and the problems experienced in the projects in terms of working with communities, or official counterparts.

I also conducted interviews with two of the informal settlement community development committees that formed the ‘target area’ of the two projects. The


(21) IBIS/MRLGH OHSIP Progress Report No. 3 September 1994.

(22) IBIS/MRLGH OHSIP Progress Report No. 4 February 1995.


(25) Memo to Erik Madsen (Project Support Team leader) from Lazarus Hangula and Inge Tvedten Re: OHSIP January 3 1994
Amunkambja informal settlement was encompassed in the ‘target area’ of the OHSIP project and the Okangwenza informal settlement was targeted by the SWAM project.

The work in the externally supported projects allowed me to gain firsthand experience of how projects work. My particular role as ‘Awareness’ consultant placed me in a position of being able to work directly with communities, and in the context of the thesis research, examine how project processes structured relations between the donor and the recipients.

A note should be made that the two projects differed in terms of the SWAM project being bilateral and the OHSIP project being non-governmental. There is much literature dealing specifically with the differences between NGO and governmental development approaches (Jain 1995; Cremea 1988; Fowler 1991; Salamon 1987; Kotahari 1988) and the argument that NGOs are sacrificing their particular values and approaches to development as they become increasingly integrated into governmental development programme. It is not the intention of this thesis to discuss this issue. However, it will be noted whether the non-governmental/bilateral orientation affects the policy environment of the two projects studied and how they translate policy into practice.

2.3.1.3.4 Interviews with Namibians

The interview process encompassed seven methods of research. First I conducted interviews with church leaders of individual parishes of the Lutheran, Anglican, Baptist and Catholic denominations. Second, I conducted interviews with staff members of the Council of Churches of Namibia (CCN). Third, I held discussions, interviews and protocol visits with traditional leaders in the case study area. Fourth, I undertook interviews with elders, community leaders, development agents, church leaders and traditional healers in the case study area. Fifth I structured group participatory discussions with residents of informal settlements in the case study area involving a gender and age differentiation. Sixth, I participated in
the formulation and implementation of training workshops for churchwomen's groups in women's leadership and community management. Seventh, I applied a questionnaire with the churchwomen's group participating in the training workshop.

A word should be made here to justify the choice of methodologies for the field research. The ethical questions of research outlined earlier in this chapter are most relevant to this dimension of my research because it is in this setting - research within a 'developing country' that issues of positionality and power relations emerge. The key issue in terms of justifying the research methodologies is to take account of, and minimise as much as possible, the unequal power relations inherent in 'First-Third World' research relations.

There is much conjecture as to what methodologies best achieves this overall research goal. Wilkinson (1998) for example, argues that while feminist perspectives on the politics of research have eroded the traditional dominance of positivist (read quantitative, objective, neutral, value-free, hierarchical) individual research methods such as one-one-one interviews are still used as the primary research tool. She argues that feminist research would more appropriately utilise more socially situated methods such as group interviews or focus groups and that such methods “obviates many ethical concerns raised by feminists about the power and the imposition of meaning” (Ibid, p. 112). Individual interviews, she believes, gives the researcher too much control over the proceedings, including allowing her/him to regulate the conversation, impose her/his own framework of meaning in the participants, and interprets the material gathered with her/his own subjectivity. By contrast, in focus groups, the power of the researcher because she/he has much less control over a group than over an individual. Research ‘subjects’ are able to take (more) control over the discussion. Wilkinson (1998) also believes that focus group methods facilitate the collection of higher quality data by virtue of the interaction between
participants. "Participants ask questions of, disagree with, and challenge each other, thus serving to elicit the elaboration of responses" (Ibid, p. 117).

However, Rocheleau (1995) argues for an approach which is characterised as being 'methodological plural'. She argues that many feminist geographers work in a boundary zone between positivist and critical paradigms, consciously combining critical theory, empirical fieldwork, and quantitative and qualitative analysis. She believes that a flexible combination of methodologies can best serve feminist intentions to break power relations and afford a more accurate social construction of knowledge. Similarly, Lawson (1995) believes that "it is important for feminist post-structuralist research to "engage the political" by exploring the potential for interweaving methods (including counting) as part of the process of separating techniques from ontological positions" (Ibid, p. 455). Qualitative methods such as in-depth interviews assist in uncovering the research subject's subjectivity and agency.

Regardless of technique, or combination of technique, the crucial issue is that ultimately, in varying degrees, the whole of the research project is subject to interpretation, which entails objectifying and distancing from the subject of the research. In my research project, I combined a range of techniques - one-on-one interviews, groups interviews, focus groups, questionnaires, and workshop observation and participation. The primary technique used was one-on-one interviews.

One reason this technique was used was because most of the respondents were scattered throughout the case study area. Except for one incident, it would have been impossible to ask that the respondents to meet together at one location. In all honesty, I was grateful whenever I could find a respondent and they granted me an interview. Given the nature of the topic, I also felt that in-depth interviews afforded the most private means of accessing very personal opinions and feelings, as well as for me to be able to supplement interview questions with less formal discussion if the respondent was so willing.
Other than the already stated power of my positionality, I did not feel that power was any greater an issue with in-depth interviews as with focus groups discussions. These were used in the informal settlements, because the opportunity to bring together large numbers of people, differentiated by age and sex, could not be ignored. I chose to use questionnaires at the women’s church workshop because of the nature of the gathering. The churchwomen were occupied for the better part of the day with the workshop, which I observed and participated in, and felt that there was no room to conduct in-depth interviews with the women in the evenings. However, I also did not want to lose the opportunity to obtain information from them. Many of the women lived in areas that would be difficult to access. The questionnaire afforded, in my opinion, the best means of accessing their responses.

This combination of methods, or as Rocheleau (1995) would say a ‘methodological plurality’, facilitated the collection of diverse and insightful data, which assuredly has been subjected to my positionality. It can only be reiterated that the information gathered in any particular research project can only reflect the subjective interpretation of the researcher, who has, with best intentions, i.e. to work towards a critical politics of power/knowledge production, formulated her/his research methodologies to uncover as accurate construction of social knowledge as within her/his power.

That said, the specific objectives of the research in Namibia and the Ovambo area were to: gain insight into Namibian concepts of development, spirituality and development; and the relation of ‘traditional’/religious beliefs to these concepts of development; assess, if any the differences in understanding and belief about spirituality and development between various respondent groups and to Northern donor concepts; and gain information as to the role of the church in Namibian development, reconstruction and reconciliation.

The interviews with key CCN and church leaders were conducted in both the case study area and in Windhoek where many of the respondents resided. The bulk of the interviews were however, located throughout the four regions of the former ‘Ovamboland’.
The sampling method used in selecting the respondents needs some explanation. To conduct my interviews, I used an approach that had been related in Nela-Williams’ (1991) book on the anthropological history of Ovambo kingdoms. She wrote that anyone foreign to the kingdom would first request an audience with the king, relate their business and obtain permission to travel through the area. The king and his religious and secular counsellors who, would be in attendance, would advise the king as to the best approach that should be used to conduct that business. This included identifying the individuals or groups that should be worked with. Although modern culture had ruled out this need to request permission from the king, I wanted to follow this process because I wanted to explore whether I could obtain some advice on whom would be the best contacts in the various kingdoms to interview. This was in particular regard to traditional healers and elders. Basically I asked the king and whoever was in attendance, in the modern age, usually traditional headmen and queens (the wives of the king), to help brainstorm on if they knew anyone that might have particular knowledge of my research focus areas. I also asked other contacts, such as the community development liaison officers if they could offer names and locations of people, particularly elders or traditional healers, who might be appropriate to the study. In this way, I developed a list of key contacts.

It was found, during the process of research that a pattern gradually developed, based on historical patterns of colonialism and missionary activity. Although there is no formal study showing the exact geographical patterns of colonial and missionary expansion in the case study area, my interviews with elders in particular revealed that in fact missionaries did follow a pattern of expansion that basically followed the main roads, which, at that time, according to Nela-Williams (1991) were already established trading routes. Map 2.4 shows the current main and secondary roads in the case study area.

In the interviews it was described how missionaries' first point of contact with Ovambo people was at Tsumeb. They then gradually followed the main roads, first heading from Tsumeb to Ondangwa. At Ondangwa the road then
splits in two directions, directly north, and north west towards the Kaokaoveld region and Angolan border. The north route also then splits off into a secondary easterly road towards Ongolulu and the Kavango region. Respondents told that the people that were converted first were those who lived most closely to the main trading routes. Thus missionaries made first contact with Ondonga people, followed by Ukwambi and so on.
It did become apparent in the interviews that a difference in knowledge of 'traditional' beliefs existed. Respondents close to the main roads seemed to know little about 'traditional' beliefs even if they were quite old (80 years and above) while respondents located far from the main roads knew more about 'traditional' beliefs at younger ages, in one case at the age of 60. According to some of the respondents, this could be attributed to the fact that 'traditional' cultures were disturbed earlier and with greater aplomb along the main access roads.

Indeed it was found in the interviews that very few people remembered even in a non-cohesive way 'traditional' beliefs, but the respondents who did know about such beliefs were those whose parents had experienced missionary activity as late as possible in their lives. Their parents were able to transmit the 'old' ways to their children (the respondents) and these were remembered even though the respondents (and in most cases their parents) had been converted or baptised into Christianity right from birth.

It is recognised that this theory of correlation between patterns of missionary activity and knowledge of 'traditional' beliefs remains largely unsubstantiated. A great deal of detailed and assuredly fascinating research would be required to verify such a theory.

Nevertheless, the sampling methodology was based upon an attempt to access respondents with the greatest age as possible, or on information that such and such person ‘followed traditional ways’. All of this information was communicated in an ‘unscientific’ way. Anita would be told the name of the potential respondent, and a general location land-marked in relation to such and such family. Consequently we spent much time driving around difficult terrain asking directions to such and such homestead, and inevitably getting lost. Map 2.5 shows the locations of the interviews, including the informal settlements in Oshakati and Ondangwa. The implications of this sampling approach will be included in the analysis of the responses in Chapter Six.
In Chapter Six for each of the respondent groups, I provide a description of the kinds of questions, the type of information sought, and the rationale behind the questions asked. Appendix 1 lists all of the persons interviewed, and Appendix 2 carries the full description of the interview and questionnaire questions.
Map 2.5 - Location of Interviews in the Ovambo Area

Source: Interviews overlaid on "Map 2.3 — The Ovambo Area — Tribal Boundaries", taken from Regional Development Strategy for Oshana, Omusati, Ohangwena and Oshikoto (Northern Namibia), Frayne et al, Research Report 13, December 1993, Social Sciences Division, Multi-Disciplinary Research Centre, University of Namibia, P. 8.
Chapter Three

Spirituality and Development

"...the spiritual dimension of development derives from attention to creation: the universe is a vast unfolding unified event. It is filled with intelligence (such as the self-organising capacities of the galaxies) and allurement (the embrace of gravity). Each of us has a sense that our lives are unfolding over time, but because of the atomization of modern socialisation, we have lost sight of the fact that our personal story is unfolding with the unfolding of our community, our nation, the entire earth community - and all of it within the unfolding story of the cosmos, which is the most profound expression of the Divine. All human systems we create, including economics, are derivative of the earth processes, not the other way around. This is a very different orientation from the modern sense that society lives on top of nature...." Charlene Spretnak in "The Spirituality of Development", WCC Bossy Seminar 1996a)

3.0 Introduction

Three Northern development agencies have initiated explorations into a concept of spirituality and development. The International Development and Research Centre in Ottawa, Canada has initiated a study to open a dialogue between culture and spirituality and economic development. The World Council of Churches in Geneva has since the 1960’s, expoused the need for development to consider the spiritual needs of people along with their material needs. However, at least on first impression, the most significant effort seems to be placed with the World Bank. Within the organisation, no less than five initiatives dealing in some way with spirituality and development have been started.
I seek to examine how these organisations define spirituality and development and what are the main tenets of their concepts. I examine what their rationales for exploring spirituality and development are, and why they have started discussing the need for a notion and a practice of spirituality and development. I examine if they have integrated these concepts into their development policies and how these organisations have attempted to translate idea to practice. I seek to examine any similarities or divergences between the three organisations' perspectives on spirituality and development, and what problematic issues can be identified that reveal both their potentials and hazards.

3.1 The IDRC

The International Development Research Centre (IDRC), a federally funded organization based in Ottawa, Canada, is sponsoring a research and reflection project into the relationship between science, religion and development. Based on their Project Description: Science, Religion and Development Project, the objective of the project is to distill a clear understanding of the conceptual and practical linkages between science, religion and development in consultation with a wider circle of individuals from different faith traditions and with backgrounds in science, religion and development. This effort is a follow-up to preliminary research carried out by Dr. William F. Ryan and published under the title, Culture, Spirituality and Economic Development: Opening a Dialogue (Ryan 1995). Based on this initial research, IDRC sponsored an international conference in August 1995 at Val Morin, Quebec. After the conference, participants agreed that the issues uncovered in the preliminary research were “germane to the effectiveness of future development interventions in their countries” (IDRC Val Morin Conference, 1995, p. 7). They urged IDRC to pursue this research inquiry further.

The project will have three phases. In the first phase, IDCR brought together a core group of four experts in science, international development, and theology, each from a different cultural and religious background. Together and separately,
this core group works to reflect, from their different cultural, religious, and professional positions, on the relationship between the moral/spiritual and the technological/scientific paradigms, to consider the interaction of these different ways of knowing the world, and to articulate the effect that this relationship has had for development discourse and practice. It is emphasized that environmental sustainability and gender equality concerns are central to these discussions. In October 1997, this core group met in Rorschach, Switzerland to initiate their working relations and to correlate their understandings of this project. They drafted a set of issue papers and met again in June 1998 to discuss their findings. They found that their papers each had focused on different aspects of development, but each had amalgamated the personal and the professional modes of discourse, using their faith perspectives to question and illuminate their separate areas of scientific enquiry. These reflections, for example, brought up questions of the ambiguity of religion and of the role of religion in offering a basis for humility and self-limitation within the disciplines of science and development. In the spirit of inquiry, the core group saw their papers as experimental steps toward a new type of integrated and engaged scholarship and toward the introduction of a new element of discourse in the paradigm of international development.

The second phase will start with the publication of this set of reflections in book form. The core group papers will be circulated among a wider group of researchers writing and practising in relevant areas in order to stimulate debate around these questions and elicit complementary reflections incorporating other faith perspectives and scientific backgrounds. An international seminar sponsored by the IDRC in the early fall of 1999 will convene this wider group of researchers to discuss these papers and consider the validity and possibilities for this type of discourse.

In the third phase, the papers will be published in book form and widely disseminated. The extended network will provide access points into and
legitimacy for this method of discourse in various facets of international development discourse. As envisaged, this research will influence and benefit development practitioners and researchers, bilateral and multilateral policymakers, academics, as well as religious leaders and institutions, by providing them with models for a new type of discourse that could help to unify and explore the best qualities of these complementary modes of knowledge.

At this stage in the IDCR project, only two documents from the project are available, the initial exploratory research paper by Dr. Willian Ryan and the Val Morin Conference on Spirituality, Culture and Economic Development. I utilize these two papers to examine the rationale and tenants of the concept of spirituality and development being explored by the IDRC.

The initial research paper was a joint IDCR-Jesuit Order of Canada effort to begin to open a dialogue between culture, spirituality and economic development. It was recognized that while development thinking has expanded considerably over the last 25 years, including indicators of well being based on social systems, the dominant definition of development as material well being continues. It was agreed that rationalist, secular, scientific, quantitative thinking of the West has dismissed the cultural, moral and spiritual dimensions of human well being. Yet for many people around the world, what motivates them to change or not change, is rooted in deep underlying moral and spiritual assumptions that explain reality.

Reality is based not only on physical needs but on 'ontological' needs such as love, commitment and responsibility to family, clan and community; self-worth; dignity, honor and respect, sexuality and gender; roles and relationships; work as both a means of sustenance and a creative act; beauty and joy, as expressed in dance, music, art, poetry, and play; a sense of the sacred and the transcendental, spirituality and formal religion; loyalty to tribe, nation or ethnic identity; love of place; a sense of belonging; reverence for life, matter and spirit in nature, the origin of nature and its relation to self; the unseen; ancestors; and life and death (Beemans, in Ryan 1995 p.vi).
All of these are interlinked in 'cosmological visions' or worldviews that provide people with points of departure for making 'the great human choices' that really determine development. It was argued that these ontological needs are ignored at peril. If ignored, societies, like individuals, can lose their inner bearings and sense of identity.

Within the IDRC another definition of development has started to emerge—“change that improves the conditions of human well-being so that people can exercise meaningful choices for their own benefit and that of society” (Beemans, in Ryan 1995 p.v). With this definition, it is suggested that the caricatures of North and South, developing and developed fall away, leaving a path open to mutually beneficial approaches to the processes of change the global community must face together. There is therefore in the IDRC, a new understanding that there cannot be a 'new grail' or development paradigm. Rather there must be a recognition that there can only be a variety of development paradigms, each one rooted in its own ethical and spiritual world view (Beemans, in Ryan 1995, p. v).

To begin the research process, Ryan interviewed 30 IDRC staff members, including the President, Directors General, several Program Directors, and other IDRC staff. The earliest indication from the interviews was that there was little interest in theoretical discussion of the present and future of the development paradigm, except as it related to their own personal experience of development work and IDRC's mandate. All agreed that a modified or new approach to development work was needed. Collectively, they identified six general assumptions that underlie the current dominant development paradigm:

The current economic paradigm is not working.

The implicit assumption held by many about the universality of the Western scientific and technological culture is blatantly false. At the same time, the search for the 'perfect package' and the right 'technological fix' for every human development problem is proving futile.
The idea of pluralism of cultures is gaining increasing acceptance, and is prompting support for a plurality of development paradigms in the future.

The need to listen to and trust more diligently the indigenous knowledge, culture, and experience of people in developing countries is urgent. IDRC’s future may lie in incorporating the riches of local knowledge and experience of poor countries and in collaborating in true participatory-research partnerships with them.

The vast majority of people still believe in the ‘sacred’, the values, experience, and the influence of local religions and ethical paradigm must be considered an integral element in designing development-research projects.

The search for a global ethic for human development is a worthwhile, even necessary venture, provided it emerges from personal and community convictions, traditions, and experiences of local people rather than from a process of Western deductive and abstract reasoning.

After this initial interview process within IDCR it was decided to extend its application beyond IDRC to a much broader group of persons in the developing world, where IDRC’s research finds its application. Some 188 persons were interviewed in South and Southeast Asia, Africa and Latin America. The interviewees were pre-selected by the central and regional staff of IDRC and Jesuit colleagues in the regions. One major limitation Ryan pointed out in the research process was the gender discrepancy in interviewees. Because Jesuits are men and IDRC has traditionally worked primarily with men, the majority of those proposed by regional and local IDCR staff and Jesuits were men. He notes that this is a serious weakness in the process that will have to be corrected in future phases since the central role of women in human development is uncontested (Ryan 1995, p. 5). His overall objective in the interviews was to gain a view of their personal convictions, experience and views.
In the research paper, Ryan summarizes the interview results. He notes that there was remarkable convergence of the views and convictions of the interviewees across national, cultural and professional boundaries in terms of the central issues raised. All those interviewed were supportive of IDRC’s concern to better integrate local cultural and religious values, which includes spiritual and ethical values into research for sustainable and equitable development. Most also included belief systems and world religions as matters of urgent research, but several were more reticent about how to deal with the ambiguous role of organized or institutional religion. Ryan divided the interview results into two parts, the first which deals with the criticisms and concerns about the current development paradigm, and the second which explores the positive resources identified as already existing in local experiences and values, both spiritual and cultural, that will help to alleviate those concerns. It is the second part that I will examine.

In general, the interviewees saw the need to look away from unworkable and inhuman structural adjustment policies as a means to solve development problems to resources in spiritual and ethical values. Ryan summarizes the major findings of his interviews.

Most of those interviewed reject the current messianic status being given to the global free-market paradigm, but find it difficult to come up with alternatives.

The modern economic paradigm must be more inclusive, encompassing the full complexity of local human experience.

Most interviewees saw ecological concerns as a Western-imposed agenda.

Most felt that poor communities regarded Western-trained and foreign experts with suspicion and that they do not serve as ‘crucial agents to support creative development’.
Many interviewees saw the UN agencies as too bureaucratic and too beholden to the governments of the major powers to deal with sensitive areas of research such as the relationship between local cultural and religious values and development.

Many interviewees perceived that the future development of their countries will be dependent on rejuvenating civil society. A number of aspects would need to be strengthened, including a local sense of responsibility – both individual and community, political consensus, social management skills, and practical education. They were wary of a new, still-unknown development model.

Interviewees saw the recent explosion of new NGOs in the South as one of the most hopeful signs of change. NGOs can attempt to counteract the social injustices and ecological destruction incurred through the excesses of free-market economic growth.

Many of the interviewees saw harmony in human relationships as perhaps the single most important condition for human development in ‘developing countries’.

Almost every interviewee believed that religions and religious values have played and still play a significant, if often ambiguous role, in the process of human development in ‘developing countries’.

Relatedly, most believed that culture and cultural values must be seen as a determining variable of human development.

Interviewees were strongly supportive of IDRC’s interest in trying to achieve a better integration of local cultural and spiritual values into its research on human development.

Ryan (1995) found that many are searching for broader alternative approaches to development, ones that include a critical handling of cultural and spiritual values.
Many see that the global free-market model is destroying local values and identities by slowly homogenizing them into narrow Western market values. They question the viability of the narrow ‘market rationality’ which believes that human behavior is determined by the need to maximize individual desires and needs. They argue that rationality in economics must be expanded to include values and customs that foster social responsibility. In other words, a new economic model would be based on a principle that the “market can only function humanely if the moral force of shared community values acts a necessary restraint on it” (Ryan 1995, p.46).

People seem to be rejecting secularistic approach of duality between matter and spirit, body and soul, faith and knowledge and examining the possibilities of spirituality to guide humanity's future. People are recognizing that we no longer know what development is, how to distinguish between progress and failure because we do not know what our goals are. People are searching, however, not just for an ethical basis, but for a transcendent reference of religion and faith on which to base their committed action, especially where rational ethics is based on narrow individualistic premises.

People are challenging assumptions of Western science, namely that human progress is linear and determined, and the excessively narrow limitation of “rationality” imposed by Western economics, that is, a “rationality limited to a maximization of individual desires and needs” (Ibid, p.47). It is being argued that Western societies must begin to see individuals as part of a community, with social responsibilities in caring for others.

It is increasingly becoming clear, Ryan argues, that religion parallels the process of development in ‘developing countries’ and that both religious teachings and development strategies need to be integrated in the local peoples’ cultures, not simply layered on top of cultural practices, or substituted for them. In Africa for example, theologians are exploring how to integrate the deep reverence for ancestors and the spirit world into their Gospel teachings.
The Conference on Spirituality, Culture and Economic Development held in Val Morin from 16-18 August 1995 sought to reexamine and broaden the definition of research in the development field. The participants sought to place a greater emphasis on people’s values and beliefs, both cultural and religious. A central theme that emerged was the need to expand the notion of science and technology to incorporate into research other forms of knowledge and alternative perspectives of reality. There was a strong consensus that religious or spiritual values and systems must have a role in development research promotion.

However, there was an uncertainty as to how to do research in this area or what phenomena should be researched. It was agreed that some options were to provide forums in which religious leaders and development specialists can engage in open dialogue, working with small, local NGOs to build civil society inclusive of their religious and spiritual values, and to pilot small projects and comparative case studies on the role of cultural and religious values in local development.

The participants challenged IDRC to examine the evaluation process of development agencies, including IDRC so that they take into account indigenous spiritual and cultural values. They also saw the urgent need for IDRC to bring together a competent forum to address the fundamental question: “What is a successful development project?” and “What is an unsuccessful or failed development project?”

The group decided on a strategy of:

Generating more knowledge on development processes through case studies to broaden the vision, report on what alternatives have worked to make people better off, and to encourage a rethinking of the vision of development.
Questioning what is needed to broaden the notion of scientific research to include culture, values, and belief systems to encourage dialogue among spiritual and development practitioners and theoreticians.

Encouraging a dialogue among those with different scientific world views by encouraging dialogue among scientists from different traditions.

Promoting the reexamination of the nature of evaluation to bring together those concerned with issues of accountability for public finance, development banks, political leadership, with researchers and practitioners.

At the time of completion of this thesis, the IDRC was in the stage of preparing for the next phases of the project, the publication of the reflections of the four-member core group, and the dissemination of these to a wider network of informants. The exploration into the relationship between spirituality and development is thus in its earliest stages.

3.2 The World Council of Churches

Itty (1967) describes the rationale for ecumenical concern and involvement in development.

Development is a matter of deep moral concern. It is intolerable for poverty to exist when humanity possesses the resources and skills to provide for the basic needs of all people. To Christians this moral challenge has deep spiritual implications. To care for the poor and the needy is part of our divine obligation. To love one’s neighbor is a Christian imperative. This includes international economic justice. To be concerned about the development of the ‘Third World’ is the most active expression of our Christian imperative for love and justice in our time (Itty 1967, p. 350).

The World Council of Churches has led the way within the ecumenical movement in discerning a concept and approach to development that is in keeping with the theological tradition of the Church (Raiser, in WCC 1996a). It
has challenged the quantitative definition; it has pointed out the nature of
development to aggravate the acquisitive and aggressive instincts of people. It
has argued that the capital intensive strategies of development and the extreme
individualism it propagates fragments societies, dehumanizes humanity and
destroys any sense of wholeness and connectedness.

It has challenged the narrow focus on economic development and the lack of
attention to non-economic factors in social transformation such as cultural and
religious divisions. It has challenged the adequacy of Gross National Product as a
sole measurement for development. It has pointed out the enormous strain on
the environment and questioned whether the ideal of development is suitable,
attainable or even desirable. It has challenged the whole project approach, which
was found to carry immense implications of power relations. It has called for a
development that is holistic and focuses on an interrelationship of material,
physical, psychological, emotional, spiritual needs of every person and for future
persons. It has seen that the core focus of development is and needs to be
relational. It is about community rather than just individualism. It is about all
countries relating in development, not just in a ‘First World’ – ‘Third World’
dichotomy but in the sense that all countries are in the process of humanization
and therefore any country can be donor or recipient or both simultaneously. It
has proposed that the answers to development cannot be found in more science
and technology but in a better understanding of social and human relationships.

Development is thus about humans whereby humanity is the source and the
purpose of all economic and social life. Thus the primary purpose of
development is to assist humanity in fulfilling its primary purpose which is to
develop all aspects of human life in such a way that the whole of humanity
becomes a hymn to the Creator. In all of this, the role that the church needs to
play has been questioned. (Bulatao 1995; Castro 1992; Chitiga 1995; Delaney
1996; De Santa Ana 1985, 1995; Dickinson 1970, 1995; Fagley 1967; Fernandes
1970; Ferris 1994; Fischer 1986; George, K.M. 1995; Goudzwaard & de Lange

103
In 1996 the WCC seminar in Bossy, Switzerland represented a continuing challenge to trace key ecumenical themes around development from a historical and contemporary perspective, to further the discussion on new approaches to development, and to look for a renewed ecumenical identity. Reverend Myra Blyth, Executive Director of Unit IV – Sharing and Service, introduced the rationale for the Seminar. She stated that in the 1970’s the WCC promoted vigorously the concepts of peoples’ participation in the search for sustainable societies. In the late 1980’s and 1990’s ecumenical discussion has stressed the importance of a holistic approach. The ecumenical debate is distinguished from the discussions of the secular organizations, she believed, in that the inspiration for WCC work lies in faith. The basic tenants of the three faiths rising from the Abrahamic traditions (Judaism, Christianity and Islam) all place active social concern within the central focus of spiritual practice.

The ecumenical discussion on alternative approaches to development is an attempt to update ourselves on the theory and praxis of development, based on the insights of the faith we share. Only through a common understanding and vision of the task we undertake, can the ecumenical movement make a distinctive contribution to the current search for human dignity and sustainable community” (Blyth, in WCC 1996a, p. 3).

The objectives of the Seminar were to:

(1) Provide an opportunity for ecumenical formation amongst agency staff, who will be mandated in turn to development and facilitate courses in their own context for this purpose.
(2) Trace key ecumenical themes around development from a historical and contemporary perspective, particularly drawing on the ecumenical debates about resource sharing and the ecumenical response to poverty.

(3) Further the current discussion on international cooperation, accountability and on new approaches to development.

(4) Look together for a renewed ecumenical identity in the context of spirituality and development.

The Seminar began with a clarification of terms – spirituality, ecumenism, holistic, culture, development, economy, sharing, and ethic. Spirituality was defined as those values and principles which enhance life. These values are rooted in the energy and guidance of the 'Creator' who unifies people and brings power to the circles of people struggling to improve their own lives, or the lives of others.

Culture was defined as:

... the way people think, act, feel and live together. It is what they do and how they do it; how they relate to everything around them. Culture is alive, and like all living things must change and develop or else die. All people have their own cultural ways of knowing, thinking, learning, praying, healing, resolving conflicts and coming to consensus. Each culture has traditional knowledge about the natural world, ways of earning a living, and principles and values for living in a good way. These cultural treasures are a critical resource for the people as they continue on the path of their own healing and development (WCC 1996, p. 5).

Development was conceptualised as the process which seek to refocus attention on increasing the opportunities for people to lead productive and fulfilling lives. However, development is not a short term project but a permanent process of improvement of spiritual and material levels. Rediscovering and connecting cultural resources to the practical tasks of improving health, economy,
governance, family and community life was seen to be a vital aspect of healing and development work.

At the Bossy seminar, Charlene Spretnak gave a keynote address on "The Spirituality of Development" (Spretnak in WCC 1996a). Spretnak provided a critique of the modern model of development, her understanding of the framing of an emerging alternative model, and the spiritual dimension of that model. To the first objective, Spretnak argues that the "deep structure of our time is modernity" (Ibid, p. 9).

Modernity is characterized by a number of core concepts, including belief in the human being as essentially economic - "homo economicus" (Ibid p.10), a "totalising faith in material wellbeing and consumption linked with a belief in the linear progression of the human condition (progressivism), objectivism - the belief that there is a rational structure to reality, independent of the perspectives of any particular cultures of persons, and rationalism - knowledge, belief and the basis for action is properly derived solely from reason, the exercise of cognitive practices, is central" (Ibid, p. 11). Life is understood within a mechanistic, scientific, reductionist, bureaucratized and hierarchical world view in opposition to all that is natural. Modern life is compartmentalized with divisions between family life, social life, and work. One of the 'compartments' is religious and spiritual life, which is devalued in modernity because modern history celebrates the escape from religion and other "superstition" via the new rationalism. To survive in the modern era, institutionalized religions have downplayed spiritual connectedness with the creation and focused instead on rationalist applications of morals and ethics. This has resulted in the 'shrinkage' of the cosmological context, the sacred whole, to the scale of humans.

The result, Spretnak concludes, is an existential uncertainty within our unconscious, modern psyche. Religion, which formerly provided cognitive structure to make people feel "at home in the universe" (Ibid, p. 12) no longer accomplishes this task. Consequently, the task of each individual's grasp at the
meaning of life is fraught with frustration and afflicted with a permanent identity crisis.

Spretnak (WCC 1996a) proposes a ‘green, community-based, post-modern’ model of development. In this model, the supposedly autonomous individual is displaced by an eco-social focus on the community grounded in its bio-region. This model is post-modern because a community-based economic development is the counterforce opposing the dynamics of the global market (increasingly characterized by globalized free-trade). Second, it reduces economics to a secondary, instead of a central, role. Economics is in service to community, and in building community bonds. Third, community-based economics has an eco-social focus. Economics are built around ecological integrity as part of the livelihood of the community.

There is a spiritual dimension to this eco-social community-based model of development. And this goes far beyond advocating more rational modes of production that would produce less pollution, to a deep appreciation of the natural world and a growing awareness of the ways that humans can be reintegrated into the sacred whole. There are three aspects to this reintegration. First, there is a recovering of a sense of living in place. The second is the belief that creation, the universe is a vast, unfolding, unified event, filled with intelligence. Third, the eco-social community-based model of development, or “unfolding” as Spretnak prefers (WCC 1996a, p.17) does away with the ‘charity relationship’ or clientism – the resentment and unwarranted shame among those people who are always on the receiving end of charity. The nature of the relationship changes dramatically as everyone comes to the realization that what is good for one is good for all, in the long run.

After this Seminar on spirituality and development, the WCC commissioned its follow-up by bringing together a number of ‘experts’ from various professional and faith backgrounds to discern a way forward for the WCC. They met on 15th
of August 1996 in Bolivia. A “Concept Paper on Development” (WCC 1996b) was produced. It stated:

Spirituality and development have never been easily brought into harmony and consequently an economic and materialistic emphasis has dominated the development work, however, spirituality is becoming increasingly important in the development debate because as some observe: “we are witnessing what is unprecedented in the history of human cultures; a radical discontinuity between humans and the rest of nature, between the mind and body, between self and the world” (WCC 1996b, p. 1).

According to this perspective, it is the modern worldview, which has created these feelings of discontinuity and resulted in a profound crisis of meaning and identity. Whatever we may espouse for this crisis (the ecological perspective is only one), there is growing consensus that the nature of the problem now experienced is essentially spiritual. Spirituality in this moment is seen by a growing number to present new options for understanding and approaching the question of human identity as central to the task of development (ibid p. 1)

The conceptual paper identified some of the key elements of the development debate, clarified the ecumenical perspective and proposed roles, strategies and actions for the WCC, its member churches and its related agencies for future collaboration within the ecumenical movement. The rationale for this process was to emphasis the importance of:

(1) The continuing and deepening crises befalling ever growing numbers of children, women and men in the world.

(2) The enormous potential for change seen in the vast and unparalleled network of people in communities that make up the ecumenical movement.

This draft was later formalised into the “Strategy for Jubilee – Phase II - A Concept Paper: An Ecumenical Approach to Development” (WCC 1996c).
(3) Integrating spirituality into the understanding of and approach to development.

One of the key ideas identified in the paper is the fact that since spirituality and development have never been easily brought into harmony, an economic and materialistic emphasis has dominated development work. However, spirituality is becoming increasingly important because “we observe that we are witnessing what is unprecedented in the history of human cultures; a radical discontinuity between humans and the rest of nature, between the mind and the body, between self and the world. According to this perspective, it is the modern worldview which has created these feelings of discontinuity and resulted in a profound crisis in meaning and identity. Spirituality in this moment is seen by a growing number to present new options for understanding and approaching the question of human identity as central to the task of development" (WCC 1996b, p. 2).

The paper further defined that the task for the ecumenical movement is to translate spirituality and social commitment and unity into diverse strategies with which to face globalization of the economy, increasing dominance of the transnational corporation, increasing economic and political exclusion of citizens, increasing poverty, inequalities and disempowerment, and the destruction of the environment. How can a movement be empowered and how can its structures and institutions be freed to become efficient and effective instruments to help diminish injustice in the world? The WCC realizes the need to place new value on human and cultural potential and the strengthening of local networks, to bring social movements - NGOs, institutions and religious communities together in the search for hope and alternatives. It seeks to help people analyze their problems, resources and needs with a view of bringing needs and resources - material and spiritual - together. The WCC affirms a plurality of development approaches that come from different regions, contexts, theologies, and religions.
so far as they express a common vision of human dignity and sustainable community.

As a result of the process of defining a concept of spirituality and development, the WCC identified four strategies that its development programmes would focus on, including:

1. Working with the marginalised and excluded for a more just sharing of resources through developing alternative models of international cooperation, and a better understanding and respect for the diversity of resources needed (economical, ecological, social, cultural and spiritual) to create sustainable communities.

2. Promoting practical actions of solidarity which reflect our commitment to a more just sharing of resources amidst growing poverty, displacement and exclusion, locally and regionally.

3. Promoting capacity building and empowerment within communities to rediscover their own potential and resources, and to preserve the dignity and right of individuals and communities to determine their own destinies. This will include:

   i. Developing, testing and sharing methodologies and techniques that can be applied to (re-) activate the ecumenical network at every level, starting from the local levels; these methodologies should aim at enhancing the capacities among communities of children, women and men to analyse their situation, their strengths and weaknesses, their resources and needs, and to devise plans to make their world a better place to live in for all God’s people.

   ii. Inviting, encouraging, facilitating and supporting meetings, exchanges and similar activities, enabling the distinctive members and parts of
the ecumenical movement at all levels to connect with each other, but again: prioritising the local (lay people’s) level.

iii. Putting mechanisms into place that pool together the strengths and weaknesses, the resources and the needs of the various actors.

4. Promoting networking and advocacy with uprooted, marginalised, conflict and disaster stricken communities, ensuring that they have access to speak for themselves at all levels; local, national and international. This will include:

i. Taking the lead in analysing global trends and issues as they relate to the pains and threats encountered by members of the movement and their neighbours at the local level.

ii. Making and keeping an inventory of all actors in the movement committed to the task of advocacy, and of all resources accessible for the effective implementation of advocacy campaigns.

iii. Initiating and co-ordinating (rather than implementing) advocacy campaigns to be entrusted to interested, committed and capable actors in the movement, an approach which will hopefully increase dramatically the movements (i.e. the WCC’s) capacity for campaigning on a wide range of issues.

iv. Supporting the marginalised and excluded by enabling them to advocate for their own rights and to have access to speak for themselves in policy making processes at all levels, right up to the international fora.

These strategies are underlain by the philosophical understanding that the WCC should refrain from assuming direct programme responsibility in areas where others are better equipped to act, thus re-orientating its role to be as enabler,
coordinator, communicator, convenor and mediator. In this context it is further proposed that:

1. The WCC continues to focus its activities on priority issues as they emerge from local, national and regional levels.

2. The WCC makes real and practical the fellowship experienced within the ecumenical movement by facilitating agreements between churches and ecumenical partners or agencies in specialised areas of work, such as emergencies.

3. The WCC, its member churches and related councils and agencies develop (or revitalise) and put into place mechanisms which will ensure:

   - The common understanding of and agreement on priority issues in the churches’ witness and service;
   - The commitment of a relevant number of partners to act on behalf of the whole fellowship – on those priorities; and
   - The mutual accountability of all actors involved with regard to the respective tasks which they have all committed themselves to.

3.3 The World Bank

The World Bank seems an unlikely source of work on spirituality and development. However, it has facilitated five separate initiatives in its search for a concept and a practice of spirituality and development. These include:

(1) Spiritual Unfoldment Society (SUS)

(2) Three workshops in the areas of spirituality, values, ethics and empowerment

(3) The Values Circle
The Spiritual Unfoldment Society

The Spiritual Unfoldment Society was formed by Richard Barrett, formerly the Assistant to the Vice Presidency of the World Bank for Environmentally Sustainable Development. Towards the end of 1992, Barrett was nearing completion of his first book, *A Guide to Liberating Your Soul* (1995). To get feedback on the book, he invited a dozen or so of his more spiritually minded colleagues in the Bank to discuss ideas and theories expressed in his book. They began a series of six brown bag lunches. A few weeks after the meetings were over, two colleagues from the discussion group approached Barrett to set up a spiritual study group. That was the start of the Spiritual Unfoldment Society. The mission of the SUS was to promote personal transformation through self-knowledge, understanding, and awakening higher consciousness. But it also was to attempt to explore the link between spiritual values and sustainable development. It initiated, in conjunction with the Environmentally Sustainable division, a series of workshops that substantively explored the juncture between spirituality and development. Since Barrett’s departure from the SUS, it no longer encompasses a policy/management mandate and is largely now a forum for personal spiritual unfoldment.

3.3.2 Series of Conferences

In an interview with Richard Barrett (Washington, 26 November 1997) I was given the background of the SUS and the rationale for, and events leading to the first World Bank sponsored workshop on spirituality and development. In 1991, the steering committee of the SUS tabled an idea for an international conference on spiritual values that would be put on by the World Bank to explore the link between spiritual values and sustainable development. Barrett presented the idea
to the Vice President for Environmentally Sustainable Development, Ismail Serageldin who, while supportive of the idea, felt that it was beyond the growing edge of the Bank. He would, however, support the SUS putting the workshop on. However, Barrett felt strongly that it had to be an event of the World Bank. Later, he presented the idea to the Vice President again, at which time it was accepted. Barrett told me that he attributed the acceptance of this second proposal to fact that a ‘new consciousness’ had begun to permeate the World Bank, allowing the Vice President to believe that the World Bank could be part of a workshop on spirituality and development.

The title of the conference was “Ethical and Spiritual Values and the Promotion of Environmentally Sustainable Development”. The conference was held 2-3 October 1995 as an associated event of the Third Annual World Bank Conference on Environmentally Sustainable Development and cosponsored by the Centre for Respect for Life and Environment, the World Bank Spiritual Unfoldment Society and the World Bank.

Since then two more conferences in the area of values, ethics, spirituality and development have been held. “The Self and the Other: Sustainability and Self-Empowerment” was a one day conference co-sponsored by the Conference of Non-Governmental Organizations and the World Bank on the 5th of October 1995 as an Associated Event of the Third Annual World Bank Conference on Environmentally Sustainable Development. Two years later, as part of the Fifth Annual Conference, a conference entitled “Ethics and Values: A Global Perspective” was held.

Publications (Serageldin & Barrett 1995; Serageldin 1995) from the first two conferences reveal the recognition of the relationship between spirituality and development. In the opening address of the first conference, entitled “Engaging the Vision”, James D. Wolfensohn, President of the World Bank, states:
In the past four months, I have been to twenty-five countries, and I have learned that development is not just a matter of constructing and helping to create a school program, or building health facilities. Development cannot be defined in terms of single projects, and measuring it is not just a matter of looking at increases in gross domestic product (GDP) per capita. I saw successful development in Africa in villages where people were pulling themselves out of deep poverty. It is visible in people, who, within the structure of their familial system or their tribal system, possess a sense of grandeur, a sense of optimism, a sense of hope; who talk with excitement in their eyes about their children’s future. These people, living on next to nothing, feel a sense of progress that is more than economic. It encompasses recognition of their roots and spiritual and cultural values, which we need to nurture and encourage. These values are what we should be developing. These visits have been extraordinarily meaningful for me. They have brought home to me that the World Bank’s central mission is to meld economic assistance with spiritual, ethical and moral development (in Serageldin & Barrett 1995 p. 1).

He concluded with the hope that people will see a transition in the Bank in terms of balancing its financial objectives, environmental objectives and its moral and ethical standards.

The conference realized five inter-related lessons (Serageldin & Barrett 1995):

(1) Values lie at the heart of our behavior and that sustainable development will occur only when we have belief systems that respect all life, assign priority to the common good, engender responsibility for the whole, promote equality, and support unconditional caring.

(2) The values that drive our industrialized and rapidly developing societies are not working in these directions.

(3) True development will only take place when it engages the hearts and minds of the local community and advances every individual’s economic, social, environmental, and spiritual wellbeing.
(4) Sustainability will be more easily attained when we commit individually and collectively to alleviating poverty, enhancing our environment, and supporting the common good. Sustainability begins with each of us - our personal values, behaviors and action.

(5) Modern society almost totally misses the spiritual connection with Mother Earth and the non-human dimension of life so often found in indigenous cultures. Our institutions, technologies, and economic principles place insufficient value on preserving or honoring those environments or actions that sustain life on the planet and bring beauty to our lives. We need to redefine what we understand as progress. We need to move from improving living standards to improving the quality of life. This will happen when development becomes fully participatory and people-centered, driven by ethical values that embrace caring and nurturing at their core.

The philosophical foundations of the second conference on the “Self and the Other: Sustainability and Self-Empowerment” was to discover a new paradigm for confronting the poverty, injustice and violence that characterizes modern society; one that is based on a creative, interdisciplinary, holistic approach rather than on unidirectional, hegemonic and limited rational thought and action. Serageldin (1995) summarises.

There is a need to liberate the potential for creativity and to discover new ways of understanding, learning and doing. The ways that we listen, learn and communicate are central to a new paradigm of development in which women and men share equal rights and responsibilities and individuals feel safe and accountable because transparency prevails at all level. The goal of the seminar was to explore the self and the other, and the bonds that make societies function. Ultimately, the essence of development is how individuals function in social groupings to improve their welfare without harming the environment, their neighbors or the opportunities for their children. Development at heart, is about how the self, more secure in its self-knowledge, can constructively relate to others to build a better tomorrow (Serageldin 1995, p.7).
The conference recognized that the understanding of the culture of a society is essential when planning development strategies. This framework includes the complex of unique spiritual, material, intellectual, and emotional features that characterize a society, not only its arts and letters, but also its way of life, fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs. “A society has a code or framework that is central to the interpretation of its cultural identity, a code that is understood throughout that society and that gets broken when the development forces take on inappropriate manifestations” (Serageldin 1995 p.10).

Serageldin (1995) describes the framework as both integrating and integrated; integrated in that its internal coherence is maintained and people feel at ease with themselves and their society, and integrating in that it is capable of incorporating new elements, constantly growing and adapting to new challenges, and creating new opportunities. If change is not internalized and integrated, the result is tension in the system and breakdown of the code. When secular society breaks down, people turn back to their religious practice, as well as their tribal and ethnic solidarity to create stability. Religion is embraced as a code of social and moral conduct that offers an alternative to the unease of secular life and the inability to promote societal change through the existing political system (Serageldin 1995).

A publication from the third conference on Ethics and Values: A Global Perspective was not available but was attended by major international figures such as Anwar Ibrahim, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Finance of Malaysia, Njongonkulu Winston Hugh Ndungame, Archbishop of the Anglican Church of Cape Town, and Dr. Mamphela Ramphele, Vice Chancellor of the University of Cape Town. The topics of discussion included “Global Ethics: Reflections on the 21st Century”, “Cultural Values, the Global Commons and Development”, “Global Survival: A Convergence of Faith and Science”, “Global
Values: Requirements for a Humane Future, Equity and Ecosystems”, and “Human Solidarity, Human Settlements and Global Ecosystems”.

3.3.3 Values Circle

A key element recognized to be central to a concept of spirituality is the idea of values. Through the initiative again of Richard Barrett, the values debate also reached the upper echelons of Bank management. Barrett, convinced of the need to have spirituality and values reflected at the highest levels of the World Bank, developed an idea of a Values Circle amongst all of the Vice Presidents to develop a set of values for use in leading the organization. Barrett was appointed Values Coordinator, Institutional Change and Strategy Department to coordinate this initiative.

As described by Dorothy Hamachi-Berry, Vice President of Human Resources (World Bank correspondence August 4 1997), the initiative was part of a broader engagement of the World Bank in change and renewal with the objective of positioning itself as the primary global development institution. The Strategic Compact envisions a flexible, cost-effective, diverse institution which works through partnerships; which has a technically excellent staff recognized as experts in their fields; and which serves as a catalyst for the entire development community. It is a vision of an institution that delivers results in reducing poverty. To realize this vision, the World Bank sought to decentralize decision-making, matrix management and accountability structures, reducing management layers, and promoting strong teamwork within and with external partners, to name just a few. In this kind of environment, Hamachi-Berry emphasizes, “we must operate through more than just rules and controls that define what we do and how we do it. Rather, we need to articulate the “core values that will guide our best work in poverty reduction and sustainable development, at both the policy-making and implementation levels” (Hamachi-Berry 1997, p.1).
Recognizing this imperative, the Vice-Presidents formed a Values Circle and produced a set of Core Values. They promised to build these values into the Bank's major initiatives. The Presidents' Executive Committee then ratified the Bank Group's Core Values.

The Bank Group's Core Values are summarized as:

1. Focus on sustainable results
2. Client orientation
3. Teamwork, collaboration and partnership
4. Openness, trust and mutual support
5. Continuous learning, creating and sharing knowledge and experience
6. Honesty, integrity, and personal accountability
7. Innovation and risk-taking
8. Respect for difference

Each of the Vice Presidencies also developed its own articulated values and actions it would take to enact these values.

3.3.4 Friday Morning Values and Ethics Group

A fourth initiative in the World Bank on spirituality and development has been the establishment of the Friday Morning Values and Ethics Group (FMG) which started over 15 years ago when a few individuals met over coffee to discuss why and how issues related to culture, values and ethics in economic development could be addressed in the World Bank (author's e-mail correspondence with FMG). It was questioned whether the Bank had to branch out from its engineering/technical emphasis to understanding culture, values, politics, and generally the social aspects of human progress.
The original intent of the FMG, unlike the SUS was not to explore individual spiritual needs, but to understand the link between values and development. Members of the FMG are not certain whether the existence of the FMG has helped push the Bank in its recent attempt to introduce new values of trust, transparency and teamwork (Values Circle initiative), but it is felt that the Bank has evolved more or less over the last 15 years to reflect much of the factors that the FMG has felt are crucial to development.

*Friday Morning Reflections at the World Bank* (1991), a publication of the FMG was contributed to by the four founders of the FMG, Ramgopal Agarwala, David Beckmann, Sven Burmester and Ismail Serageldin. The book was forwarded by the President of the World Bank at that time, Barber Conable who wrote “true development is not measured by macroeconomic statistics but by real improvements in the quality of life of individual people” (p.viii). This book, he continues is about the exploration of common values. There is no strength in diversity without the cementing of commonly held values. The FMG and this book, he said, should reassure many of the future of humanity. The FMG and the book is constituted by peoples of many different faiths, religions, nationalities, ethnic backgrounds and professional backgrounds, yet it is bound together by a common moral fibre.

David Beckmann argues that the World Bank is the world’s largest official institution for the promotion of international development (FMG 1991). Its goal is to foster economic growth and reduce poverty in developing countries. The FMG is committed to finding in the Bank’s work, the means to relate morality, ethics, and religion to the large investments and economic policy questions the World Bank faces. Beckmann cites the strength of the FMG as having the opportunity to listen to a wide variety of people’s beliefs and professional concerns. People come from every background, religious, ethnic, national, professional, “yet our various traditions have led us to a common conclusion and
that is, spiritual values have been dangerously slighted in shaping the world's development and that humanity's survival may be at stake” (Ibid, p.xi).

3.3.5 World Faiths and Development Dialogue


The main aim of the Dialogue is to broaden opportunities for common understanding and action in tackling the critical issue of global poverty. It is designed to help the Bank and the Faiths to reach a better understanding of each other’s ideas about approaches to development and possible obstacles in the way of achieving desirable development aims. The Dialogue will discuss how the criteria applied in development policies might continue to be broadened to include the notion of cultural, religious and social structures and values” (The World Bank Group Press Statement January 5 1998).

The Dialogue was co-chaired by the Archbishop of Canterbury, Dr. George Carey and the President of the World Bank Group, James D. Wolfensohn. The Faith participants included leaders from the faiths of the Baha'i; Buddhist; Christian – Orthodox, Protestant, and Roman Catholic; Hindu, Jains, Jewish, Muslim, Sikh, and Taoist communities. The Dialogue included three sessions on (1) Understanding Development; (2) Criteria for Development; and (3) Planning for the Future. Each of the three sessions discussed specific questions. For example:

Session I: Understanding Development-

What do we mean by a “developed” society/world?

What do we mean by “poverty” and “prosperity”?

Session II: Criteria for Development –

Participation:
Growing inequality, both within countries and internationally is a problem of concern. What kinds of development principles are needed to overcome this?

*In what ways can faiths work to defeat corruption?*

*How do participants view the importance of including in the development process underprivileged groups such as women and religious and ethnic minorities?*

*Sustainability:*

*Who assumes the responsibility for ensuring a sustainable future? How do we generate the necessary spiritual and material resources?*

*How might the World Bank and other development agencies build upon community organization and traditions to work towards a sustainable future?*

*What sort of relationship do we need between the expertise and the beneficiaries, in order to better protect our natural environment and sacred sites and to further the community dimensions of sustainability?*

*Voice:*

*To what extent can and should the faith establish their own structure and community development programmes based on the principles and criteria which we have discussed? What is the role of each religion in terms of the wider religious and secular community?*

*Should governments consult the different faith communities of their countries about development projects? What is the proper role of development agencies in this process?*

The Closing Statement of the Dialogue summarizes the major points of discussion, learning and conclusion:

The Dialogue has offered a precious opportunity for frank and intensive dialogue between religious leaders and development experts. Each participant is drawn together by a deep concern for the future of human well being and dignity. The suffering of so many millions of people around the world cannot be accepted.

The definition and practice of development must have regard to spiritual, ethical, environmental, cultural and social considerations if it is to be sustainable and contribute to the well being of all, especially the weakest and poorest members of society.

Well-being must imply the elimination of the suffering caused by absolute material poverty whilst recognizing the importance of
spiritual and cultural life. Understanding of poverty and development has been widened and enriched through the interaction of the diverse interpretations of what it means to lead a fully human life.

The Dialogue has deepened the religious communities' understanding of the benefits of discussion with the wide circle of people working on development issues, secular and religious. The implication is how to begin to pool resources to overcome poverty.

Consensus of the need for the World Bank and major religious communities to continue to work together has been reached. The challenge is to find possible new ways of working together in the future at many different levels.

For example, the religious communities will be invited to influence the thinking of the World Bank by participating in the studies and discussion embodied in the Bank's annual World Development Reports.

Joint working groups will be established to explore themes of concern such as: post-conflict reconstruction; community building; gender issues; hunger and food security; environmental sustainability; preservation of cultural heritage (including sacred sites); patents on life; corruption; child labor; arms expenditures; population issues; support for family values; rural development; conflict avoidance and reconciliation; and education and social service delivery.

The Bank will improve its staff's understanding of the main beliefs and contributions of the different religions of the countries in which they are working and will invite the participation of representatives from the world's faiths in Bank staff training programmes. Similarly, the religious communities will deepen their understanding of international development issues and the Bank will seek to help in this regard.

Further opportunities for collaboration and partnership both on a bilateral and multi-faith basis, in development programmes will be encouraged.

(Paraphrased from the World Bank Group Press Statement January 5 1998)
All religious faith communities, international agencies and governments worldwide are invited to support and participate in this initiative of partnership between world faiths and development agencies in defining and delivering development programmes. It is believed that this will improve the long-term well being of all the world's people and safeguard the spiritual, moral, environmental and cultural resources on which they depend.

3.4 Rationales and Problematics of Spirituality and Development

These are the rationales for exploring spirituality and development. The World Bank recognised the need to understand how values and ethics can transform the way in which the World Bank interacts with the world; how it can change its financial and environmental objectives, and how its can transform its moral and ethical standards. The Bank sought to explore how its can work with world Faiths to define these new values and ethics of development. The World Council of Churches has explored at length what role the Church can play in achieving social justice and sustainable community and how development can become an authentic reflection of these goals. The IDRC has identified the need to seek an understanding of what the vital point of connection between culture and development is.

In terms of a critical analysis of the three agencies' initiatives on spirituality and development, three main questions can be asked. First, how is the relationship between spirituality and development conceptualised? Secondly, how is culture conceptualised within each organisations' conceptions and practices of spirituality and development? How are such issues as relativism, universalism, diversity, invented tradition, and cultural hybridity addressed or not, within their constructs? Thirdly, where do each of the three organisation's notions of spirituality and development fit within the continuum of alternative and mainstream development? In comparison to each other, which is more or less radical?
The IDRC study argued that rationalist, secular, scientific quantitative thinking of the West has dismissed the cultural, moral and spiritual dimensions of human well being. Development needs to be based, not only upon what people want materially, but upon ‘ontological’ needs that are inter-linked in ‘cosmological visions’ or world views that provide people with the points of departure for making the ‘great human choices’ that really determine development. Thus for the IDRC, spirituality informs development of the need to redefine its meanings and objectives. Development is not just about maximising profits. Only in this way, can there be a meaningful goal of development. This is how the IDRC has conceptualised the relationship between spirituality and development.

At the first World Bank conference on ethics, spiritual values and sustainable development, it was stated that the meaning of progress must be redefined. Progress is not just about economic development but about the development of human values. Values must underlie economic development. The World Bank must discover a development that supports not just economic goals, but also environmental, social and spiritual well being.

The Values Circle and World Faiths Dialogue represented concrete strategies by which the World Bank explored their conceptualisations of spirituality and development. The Values Circle is intended to align World Bank policy, and the way in which it works, with values and ethics. The World Bank is, in effect, searching for a new values-based identity. The World Faiths Dialogue represented the World Bank recognition that in order for global poverty to be eradicated, it needs to broaden its partnerships with civil society.

However, some cautions must be raised in terms of the way in which the World Bank conceptualised the practical link between spirituality and development. In Wolfensohn’s opening address of the “Ethical and Spiritual Values and the Promotion of Environmentally Sustainable Development” conference, he remarked that it is the spiritual and cultural values of people living on next to nothing that we (the World Bank) should be developing. This, as though the
'First World' and the World Bank specifically again has the knowledge and expertise to foster these values. This raises the issue of Western hegemonic discourse. It would seem that the general thrust of the spirituality and development idea is to acknowledge the West’s inappropriate ordering of development and that a model of spirituality and development offers the opportunity for the 'First World' to learn from the 'Third'.

Similarly, John Hoyt² proposed that in assessing the goals and means of environmentally sustainable development, a fourth discipline, additional to the economist, ecologist and sociologist, should be added to this analysis - a theologian or ethicist. He argued, “why are ethical and spiritual values not accorded a more significant role in assessing the manner in which we are now exploiting and reshaping the created order?” (Seregeldin and Barrett 1995 p. 3).

At first glance this approach may seem feasible. Spiritual values can simply be added in to the dominant models of development policies, similar to how environmental assessments have been incorporated into development. In the current methodologies of development, in Hoyt's approach, spirituality would be equal or perhaps subordinate to the all-powerful economic model, just as sociological and ecological analyses undeniably are. There is a question of whether the values of spirituality are supposed to determine the meaning of development or just be another component of it.

Thus the World Bank, at this stage of its conceptualisation of spirituality and development, seems to want to use spirituality as a means to access the very core of various societies’ belief systems, with the intention of further elaborating the cause of economic modernisation. There is no fundamental questioning of what the meaning of development is, and how spirituality can or does change this.

² President of the Centre for Respect of Life and Environment and Chief Executive Officer of the Humane Society of the United States.
Perhaps there is a tendency to be cynical and cautious about the motivations of the World Bank in its exploration of spirituality and development simply because the World Bank is after all a bank. However, some questions should be raised as to whether these spirituality and development initiatives are in reality driven by a few committed individuals such as Richard Barrett and Ismail Serageldin or whether they form a new policy direction. Will the World Bank will truly take on a new values-based identity, and then, as the Strategic Compact envisioned, lead the broader development community in transforming the meaning and means of development? Or will spirituality and development remain a peripheral issue, a decoration that disguises the established economic 'project' of the World Bank.

The IDRC is already in the process of stretching the boundaries of development meanings. The responses in the IDRC Jesuit study demonstrated the argument that development should be defined as "change improves the condition of human well-being so that people can exercise meaningful choices for their own benefit" (Beemans in Ryan 1995, p. v). The caricatures of North and South thus dissolve, leaving behind a global community that approaches change together. Social transformation is demarcated by the idea of a global community. Development has a larger purpose, which is to create a just and harmonious world.

The IDRC's search for broader alternative approaches to development was based on a critical perspective on the global free-market model, which they perceived to be destroying local values and identities by slowly homogenising them into narrow Western market values. The respondents to the interviews Ryan conducted for the IDRC challenged the viability of the narrow market rationality which believes that human behaviour is determined by the need to maximize individual desires and needs. They indicated their belief that the modern economic paradigm must be more inclusive of the full complexity of human experience.
When the WCC embarked on its quest to discover a renewed ecumenical identity in its approach to development, it stated: “Spirituality in this moment is seen by a growing number to present new options for understanding and approaching the question of human identity as central to the task of development” (WCC 1996a, p. 3). The primary purpose of development is to assist humanity in fulfilling its primary purpose on earth, which is to develop all aspects of human life in such a way that the whole of humanity becomes a hymn to the Creator.

Thus, the WCC’s concept of development reflected the essential tenants of spirituality – belief in life as intelligent, and belief in life as purposeful. In redefining development to be about humanity, the WCC related its primary purpose to assist humanity in developing all aspects of human life in reflection of the Divine. The WCC repudiated the notion that development is solely and most importantly about material well being and economic growth. Because of the realisation that overly economic and materialist determinations of development has caused a radical discontinuity of the human mind, and humanity in relation to nature, spirituality has and will continue to be more important. It represents a search for a new identity for humanity, and this is the central task of development.

All three Northern agencies recognised the significance of culture in their notions of spirituality and development. Culture was defined by the IDRC as that which can help make decisions about development. Development, it is argued, must be based on a multiple analysis of what is important and needed in one’s life. There are more than just economic or material needs that have to be taken care of. ‘Ontological needs’ supply a ‘multiplicity of analysis’ that includes cultural values and religious beliefs. These ‘ontological needs’ are derived from a society’s cosmological vision or world view, the loss of which will lead to a loss of sense of identity and meaning in life.

Ryan’s summary of the responses from the interviews conducted in the IDRC study indicated that most believed that culture and cultural values must be seen
as a determining variable of human development. Cultural pluralism should be supported by a plurality of development paradigms. Ryan indicated that many are searching for alternative approaches to development that includes critical handling of cultural and spiritual values. It is important to note that the respondents emphasised the need for a critical handling of such values. This was in particular reference to the ambiguous role that many felt that religion has played in human development in ‘developing countries’.

Thus it can be seen that the IDRC addressed the issues of universalism versus diversity. The respondents of the Jesuit study felt that cultural plurality is the key to achieving development. Local knowledge, local experience and the values and belief systems of diverse cultures must be the basis of defining what development is and how it can be done. There is a need for a global (universal) ethic however, it must be based on diversity rather than on the imposed values and rationalism of the West.

The president of the World Bank argued that development should not be measured singularly by material gain. It is also visible in the grandeur of the lives of people who live within a structure of their familial systems or their tribal system. There is a sense of progress that is more than economic but grounded in their roots and spiritual and cultural values.

The World Bank recognised that an understanding of culture is essential when planning development strategies. It recognised that culture is a framework that includes the complex interactions of spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features of a society. It is argued that a society’s value systems, ‘traditions’ and beliefs are central to the interpretation of a society’s cultural identity. That framework or code allows people to feel at ease with the self and in relation to the other. It internalises the process of assessing changes and new elements. Development as it is now structured and defined, tends to fragment that code resulting in the breakdown of the society. When secular society breaks down,
people look back to their religious, tribal and ethnic 'traditions' and beliefs to create stability and to reorder meaning in their lives.

This recognition of the significance of culture is perhaps why the World Bank sought a dialogue with leaders of the world faiths. It recognised that religion is a central dimension of peoples' cultural framework and that for development to be more successful, the World Bank needs the moral authority that institutionalised religion embodies.

The World Faith and Development Dialogue was underlain by the motivation of concern for the future of human well being and human dignity. Dignity, as we have seen forms a core concern for anti-colonial writers as well as underlying feminism and post-colonial perspectives. The Dialogue also stressed the importance of spiritual and cultural life while working for material and economic advancement. However, a number of inconsistencies in this partnership of development and religion should be pointed out.

When prominent scientists with the support of a prominent US politician – the then Senator Al Gore hosted a “Joint Appeal by Science and Religion on the Environment”, Daly (1996) expressed a concern over the integrity of such an appeal. The rationale behind the seminar was that scientists, while having the technical knowledge of how to solve the environmental crisis, lacked the moral inspiration to act and inspire the public to accept and finance policies needed. In short, scientists appealed to religious leaders to use religious beliefs to provide the moral incentive to back scientific and technological actions. Yet Daly argued, scientists typically proclaim the cosmology of scientific materialism which considers the cosmos to be an absurd accident where life has no value in any objective sense, or purpose, save the instinctual and mechanical intent of short-term survival. For scientists to appeal to religiously bound values, values they consider unfounded, Daly argued, is at very least, hypocritical. And even more absurd, Daly argued is the assumption that religious values will lead to general concern and care for the environment when to date this has not happened. What
the scientists are appealing for is not just a moral compass but a religious reformation.

I have similar concerns about the World Bank Faiths Dialogue initiative. First is the question of whether the faiths will be used as an institutional mechanism to preach World Bank development or whether the moral values of the faiths will be involved in deciding what development is. If it is the former, there is the strong possibility that this partnership between the faiths and the World Bank may be perceived (and resisted) as a resurrection of missionary type activity. The World Bank will have found yet another way to preach the values of the 'modern project'.

However, perhaps more importantly is the concern over this partnership of spirituality and religion that the World Bank is trying to promote. Of specific concerns are the lack of distinction between spirituality and religion, and the seemingly significant role that the World Bank seems to think religion is going to play in spreading the benefits of development and 'fixing' society.

As reviewed in Chapter One, a number of prominent thinkers, such as Teilhard de Chardin (King 1989b) and the Dalai Lama (1999) believe that religion will not provide the solutions to any of the major crises of the modern world. The Dalai Lama writes that "though a majority of the earth's nearly six billion human beings may claim allegiance to one faith tradition or another, the influence of religion on people's lives is generally marginal, especially in the 'developed world'" (Ibid, p. 20). He doubts whether globally even a billion people are dedicated religious practitioners. Rather, there is a need for a new global ethic or spirituality that speaks to the increasingly secular world.

I do recognise that one of the reasons that the World Bank instigated a dialogue with religious institutions may have been a motivation to work in genuine partnership with people to effect development and to generally expand the World Bank's partnership with civil society. Certainly institutionalised religion
can be seen as a powerful means to gain entry into the cultural, social and moral code of conduct that allows people to mediate change and development. In fact the World Bank is not alone in this approach. The IDRC is in the process of exploring the perspectives of four faiths on spirituality and development before presumably attempting to formulate a cohesive concept of spirituality and development. The WCC of course bases its whole approach on the theological interpretation of development. In my own empirical research I focused on the role of the church in development in Namibia and the relationship between the church and spirituality. The very fact that religions have always mediated spiritual beliefs and practices in human history cannot be ignored. The positioning of the faiths as an investigative and practical route to spirituality and development is therefore most logical. This does not however, dismiss the potential hazards of such an approach.

Thus, it can be seen in comparison that while the World Bank seems to view culture, religion and spirituality as mere instruments of the modern paradigm of development, the IDRC is in the process of exploring the boundaries of what makes development meaningful. However, the World Council of Churches presents the most radical departure from the mainstream idea of development. For the WCC, the goal of development is to assist humanity in reaching its ultimate purpose - spiritual fulfillment. Material development is important only in so far as it supports the dignity of life. This conception of spirituality and development seems to offer a radical departure from the alternative-mainstream development continuum. Pieterse (1998) views social transformation as the goal of alternative development perspectives, approaches and practices. However, spiritual transformation provides both an idea and a goal that is much more expansive.

An emphasis, or lack of emphasis on relational ethics, specifically North-South relations is a second way of testing the placement of the three agencies' conceptions of spirituality and development in the development continuum.
In examining the merits of the project approach the WCC implicitly challenged the unequal power relations between North and South. Spretnak (1996) also discussed the ‘doing away’ of charity relationships and clientism - the resentment and shame among those people who are always on the receiving end of charity - between the North and the South. She argued that once there is the realisation that what is good for one is good for all, there can be no charity relationship.

The WCC also addressed the issue of relational ethics and North-South relations through its programmatic strategies. Its commitment to capacity building and empowerment, and networking and advocacy in particular are intended to promote real ecumenical fellowship and solidarity with partners of the South. The WCC seems to have struggled for a lengthy time on how it should structure its relationships with constituent members. The WCC has seen the need to develop and test different, new or revitalised methodologies and techniques aimed at enhancing the capacities of all people to analyse their own situation. One of the roles it must therefore take on is to support marginalised and excluded peoples to speak up for themselves right up to the international level. Thus the WCC has deemed it necessary to change its role to one of facilitator or enabler rather than implementor so that the capabilities of Southern partners becomes the driving force of development.

The IDRC believes that there is a need to listen to and trust in the indigenous knowledge, culture and experience of people in ‘developing countries’. According to the respondents, the future of the IDRC will be in collaborating in true participatory research partnerships with local institutions and people in ‘developing countries’. The respondents also argue that Western-trained experts are not the answer to development problems in ‘developing countries’ but that the future development of their countries is more so dependent on rejuvenating civil society, particularly NGO’s. At the Val Morin conference it was agreed that one of the ways forward to define the relationship between spirituality, religion
and economic development is to work with local NGOs in the South and learn how they integrate religious and spiritual values into development.

On much more esoteric grounds, the respondents argued that that harmony in relationships was the single most important condition for human development. Thus relational ethics is at the foundation of what development is.

Does the World Bank focus on relational ethics?

The first conference on “Ethical and Spiritual Values and the Promotion of Environmentally Sustainable Development” related five main lessons that defined, at this stage, the World Bank’s idea of spirituality and development. The first lesson stated the belief that responsibility for the whole, priority to the common good, and unconditional caring is be crucial to a new spiritual development. Thus there was recognition that development must be grounded in an ethic of care and responsibility. The second conference also commented on these relational ethics. Serageldin (1995) argued that ultimately the essence of development is how individuals function in social groupings to improve their welfare. Development is about how the self can constructively relate to others to build a better tomorrow.

However, there was no explicit address to the particular spatial or North-South dimension of relational ethics in the ideas of the World Bank on spirituality and development. The WCC’s notions of spirituality and development can be seen to be much more radical than the World Bank’s. The organisation has already moved into programmatic transformation so as to support the imperative of diversity and the role of cultural pluralism in defining what development is or should be. The eradication of the North-South divide is at the forefront of their conceptions of spirituality and development. Spirituality and development has an explicitly political agenda.
Because the time between idea and practice has been short, it is difficult to assess the merits of the three Northern agencies' conceptions of spirituality and development and how these will be translated into practice. A note should be made on the different nature and approaches of the agencies. The IDRC is a research organisation that is not involved in implementing development projects and thus its approach for exploring spirituality and development is very much research orientated. As yet it has not developed a policy for the organisation as a whole in terms of how the notion should orient all of its work overseas. It may be that the IDRC will never construct a policy to this effect and that it may remain an ongoing research project the findings of which will be disseminated to influence the Canadian government's development philosophies and perhaps other Western development organisations. The WCC is an implementing agency but generally in a partnership approach with constituent members around the world. Its approach in exploring the notion of spirituality and development is based on a similar partnership approach, arranging a number of workshops that included representatives of its constituent members from around the world. The organisation has already defined a strategy for translating its ideas of spirituality and development into practice. This strategy has focused on restructuring relations between the WCC and their partners to address the issue of unequal structural relations between the WCC as a Northern institution and the partners as Southern institutions. Movement to the position of advocacy from one of implementor is an example of this approach. The World Bank is of course the world's largest international development agency. Critiques on the World Bank have shown that there is a strong emphasis on visible results within the Bank (Hayter & Watsan 1985; George & Sabelli 1994). As there have been three separate conferences and many ongoing initiatives that have explored the idea of spirituality and development, there may be pressure to explore ways in which it can be translated into practice, perhaps even at the project level.

That said, two concerns regarding the three Northern agencies' conceptions of spirituality and development must be raised. First, none of the agencies seem to
be engaged with current discussions within intellectual and academic circles on the role of culture, and the debates surrounding cultural relativism, universal values and development ethics. The importance of cultural plurality and of listening to local knowledge and experience, as well as values and beliefs in underlined. However, there is no serious analysis of how to deal with such issues as ethical relativism, universal values and cultural diversity. Diversity is declared an asset, yet it is not critically examined.

Second, there was no attention paid to the distinction between spirituality and religion. All three agencies foresee an important role for religion in development, yet none simultaneously foresee the need to include an explicit differentiation between spirituality and religion in their concepts of spirituality and development. As we have seen, very prominent thinkers have described the distinction between religion and spirituality and the role that each can play in society. Eventually, the three Northern agencies will have to address this distinction and take a position on how they perceive that religion, given its association with colonialism, and its declining importance in an increasingly secular society, can take on such a significant mantle.

Undoubtedly these concerns will surface as the agencies put their conceptions of spirituality and development into practice, and as the agencies seek to influence the discourses of development, and other agencies’ ways of doing development. Without a critical position taken on cultural relativism versus universal ethics, and on the role of religion, conceptions of spirituality and development will flounder, and the radical nature of its discourse, repudiated.
Chapter 4

'Experiences of Spirituality' in Namibia

4.0 Introduction

In this chapter, I wish to describe the ‘experiences of spirituality’ in Namibia. Before colonisation, Namibians existed as cultures and societies with their own cosmology, values and ways of living. These were steadily attacked by colonialism and missionary activity. Namibians endured the forced transformation of their identities and of their spirituality.

In Chapter One, spirituality was referred to as that which defined human identity and gave life meaning. It is this ‘definition’ that I use in examining how spirituality was used in Namibia. Spirituality was manipulated to achieve the ends of colonialism and Christian conversion. However, it would be wrong to portray Namibians solely as victims. Throughout the colonial process, Namibians were redefining themselves, salvaging ‘traditional’ beliefs and values, adapting Christianity to these values, and creating new (hybrid) identities that would in time depose of those enforced by colonial oppressors.

With independence, Namibia faces a new set of challenges in terms of retaining or constructing their own identities, culture and values. The development assistance and foreign investment much needed by Namibia to address the gaping inequalities between black and white are all blatantly contingent on the choice of a Western system of governance and economic development. Yet a huge incongruity exists between the needs of the black population which still reels under the injustices of past wrong doings, as yet, not reconciled, and the workings of a liberal democracy bent on increasing economic growth with little room for social justice.

This chapter establishes the parameters for posing the question that is the subject of Chapters Five and Six. Does international development assistance play a role in the repression of Namibian emotional and spiritual health? Is
Northern inspired development having a negative impact on the spiritual well being of Namibians, and in doing, jeopardising the one objective that Northern donor agencies believe is so important - empowerment?

In order to investigate this proposition, international development must first be placed within the context of ‘experiences of spirituality’ in Namibia. Colonialism, missionary activity, the struggle for independence, and the most recent push for reconciliation and reconstruction all encompassed, and encompass a manipulation in the realms of the spiritual in order to achieve their desired ends. International development is placed within this context as an ‘experience of spirituality’.

After a brief introduction to Namibia, this chapter thus will outline four main ‘experiences of spirituality’ in Namibia; (1) pre-colonial culture; (2) colonialism and missionary activity; (3) the struggle for independence; and (4) reconciliation and reconstruction. The following chapters, five and six then explore in detail, the proposition that international development is having a negative impact on the spiritual well being and development of Namibia.

4.1 An Introduction to Namibia

Namibia has an area of approximately 824,269 square kilometres. Its population is approximately 1.6 million, of which 6% is of European descent. The population density is 1.7 inhabitants per square kilometre, one of the lowest densities in the world. The total fertility rate is 5.25 children per woman of child bearing age. Life expectancy is 58.8 years. The per capita Gross Domestic Product is US $1,300. However, this figure hides a wide gap between the poor black majority and the minority white. It is estimated that the income gap ranges from US$ 14,000 average for the white population to US $ 65 per person per year for the poorest of the black citizens (www.republicofnamibia.com)

The ethnic composition of the country encompasses eleven main groups: the Ovambo, Kavango, Damara, Herero, ‘Whites’, Nama, Coloureds, Caprivians,
San, Rehoboth Basters, and Tswana. The Ovambo comprise approximately 50% of the total population and are the dominant force in the politics of the newly independent nation. The 'Whites' are composed of three main groups, including the Afrikaaners, Germans and British and comprise 6.4% of the population but control over 70% of the country's economic enterprises (Malan 1995). Map 4.1 shows the administrative divisions of independent Namibia.

Ruled first by German colonial power and after 1915, by 75 years of South African rule, Namibia became independent on the 21st March 1990. The former leader of the South West African People's Organisation (SWAPO), Sam Nujoma was elected to the presidency. The Namibian constitution is seen to be one of the most democratic in the world (Leys & Saul 1995). However, opposition to the ruling SWAPO party is weak. Only 15 of the 72 seats in parliament are occupied by the DTA (Democratic Turnhalle Alliance), a fragile coalition of blacks and whites whose sole point of convergence is their dislike of the dominant Ovambo makeup of SWAPO. The vote in Namibia is definitively decided on the basis of racial and ethnic affiliation, with Ovambos and Kavangos voting massively for SWAPO and Herero, Baster and the majority of the whites voting for DTA. However, despite the overwhelming majority enjoyed by the SWAPO party, Namibia is regarded by the West as an example of 'good' government (Leys & Saul 1995). In public documents, human rights are respected and the independence of the judiciary is guaranteed. Freedom of the press is also assured.

The main indicators of Namibian development show that since 1990, GDP growth has been steady, although the year 1993 was marred by a severe drought resulting in a GDP decrease. The economy grew at an average rate of 4.3% over the six years, 1990-1996. Since 1990, the GDP per capita has also steadily grown, some 7.2% cumulatively, some 1.2% per annum. Despite the marked improvement in aggregate economic performance, post independence growth has been below the targeted 5% per annum deemed the minimum to permit tangible reductions in poverty (UNDP 1996 Namibia Development Cooperation Report, 1997).
The major sectors of the economy are commercial agriculture, mining and services with services comprising 55% of GDP, followed by mining at 15.1%, agriculture at 9.4% and fishing at 5.1%. Within the services sector, Government services takes up 28.4% of that 55% (Ministry of Finance Report 1996, Unpublished Information).

Map 4.1 - Administrative Divisions of Namibia

Source: Malan 1995 p. 3
The agricultural sector is characterised by unequal distribution of land. This was caused by the expropriation of land from the black majority and its transfer to a few white settlers during the German colonial period (1884-1914), coupled with apartheid policies, which denied blacks the right to buy land. Some 4,500 commercial farmers hold some 44% of the total land, mainly of medium to low productivity under freehold, almost all white. The communal areas in the north, technically have the best agricultural land, but accommodate over 60% of the total population on 41% of the total land. The agricultural sector is thus divided between a commercial, mainly white sub-sector of farming and animal husbandry and a large, black subsistence traditional sub-sector operating at a low technological level. Of the 9.4% contribution of agriculture to the GDP, only 3.3% of this were attributable to subsistence agriculture. This has its origins in low input/output technologies, lack of access to credit, training, research and extension services, and overgrazing. Environmental constraints for development of agriculture include perennial threat of drought, overgrazing, overstocking, bush encroachment, soil erosion and desertification (UNDP 1996 Namibia Development Cooperation Report, 1997).

In 1994, of the estimated 544,000 labour force, 150,000 or 27.6% were deemed either unemployed or under-employed. It does not seem likely that this problem will be solved in the near future due to an unskilled labour force, a high population growth rate of 3.1% and a slow rate of job creation. Although agriculture accounts for only approximately 10% of GDP, it employs some 35% of the Namibian workforce. Mining accounts for 12-15% of GDP but employs 40% of the workforce. Overall, the economy is highly capital intensive, with contribution to GDP hardly reflected in the number of workers employed by each sector. Taken together, the modern sectors of manufacturing, mining, electricity and construction account for 30% of GDP but only employ 16% of the workforce. Services account for 37% of the total employment of which Government contributes some 46% (UNDP 1996 Namibia Development Cooperation Report, 1997).
The main social factors in Namibia underline the challenges ahead for Namibia. At independence, the new Government placed great emphasis on increasing access to education, devoting 20-28% of its budget to education over the past six years. Much success has been achieved, however, some severe problems remain. Only 75% of pupils entering grade 1 complete up to grade 7; it takes an average of 13 years for those pupils to reach grade 7; almost 25% of primary school learners walk for more than one hour to reach school; and approximately 40% of all teachers are under-qualified, not having passed grade 12 successfully (UNDP 1996 Namibia Development Cooperation Report, 1997).

At independence health services were highly skewed in favour of a minority of the population with less than a third of children being immunised. Health expenditures have contributed to an average of 14.5% of the total budget. The under-five mortality rate has declined significantly from 171 deaths per 1000 live births in 1989 to 79 in 1993. The shift of resources has gradually transferred to the north where the need for community outreach is the greatest. AIDS/HIV is a major threat, particularly in the north. Since 1986 29,021 positive HIV tests have been reported with 78% of all reported cases occurring in 1995-1996. Of the 5,671 AIDS cases, reported nationally, 73% of these in the six northern regions. Alcohol abuse is also a severe problem, again particularly in the north (UNDP 1996 Namibia Development Cooperation Report, 1997; Shigweda 1993).

The state of women’s development is also highly skewed. A UNFPA report on Population, Development and Gender Issues in Namibia (Oppong 1994) gives evidence of the need to recognise the role that women play in the development of the country and emphasises that gender issues are simultaneously population, human resources planning and development issues. A number of reports detail the disadvantaged position of women in Namibia despite the fact that the Constitution of Namibia guarantees equal rights for men and women. Bornholdt (no date) explains the fact that discrepancies with the current legal situation exist because of numerous Acts
which applied before Namibia’s independence. Women all over Namibia also face increasing violence against them (Angula 1995). According to research conducted by the Namibia Institute for Social and Economic Research, one woman is raped every hour, every day of the year in Namibia (Ibid 1995). Wife and girlfriend abuse is also common place. According to Bience Gawanas, the practice of the law has not moved as fast as constitutional provisions and women are taking the brunt of the violence (Angula 1995).

4.1.2 The Ovambo Area

The former ‘Ovamboland’ was the area of Namibia hardest hit during the war of independence, being completely taken over by the South African Defence Forces (SADF). Weaver (1987) describes the conditions in the area during the war. Over 250,000 people in the Ovambo area were forced off the land by military pressures from both side of the conflict, mainly as the SADF clears ‘fire-clear zones’ where guerrillas could be ‘hunted’ without having to heed civilians being caught in the crossfire. They were relocated into a section

---

1 There is for example, still a legally valid marriage contract including community or property (joint state), which assigns the role of minor to the wife. She does not have a legal entity, she cannot enter into any contracts without the consent of her husband, she cannot obtain access to credits and in the case of divorce, she often loses all property, including the rights to her own children. Women are also disadvantaged due to work conditions. There is no provision made in the law for paid maternity leave. As a result, many women have to resign when they become pregnant. Regulations concerning working hours, salaries and other working conditions exclude domestic workers, farm labourers and employees of the informal sector where women are most concentrated. There is also the factor of customary laws and customs that dominate the rural areas. In the former Ovamboland, for example, a wife has no claim on common property after divorce or after the death of her husband. It is common place for the relatives of the husband to force the woman and her children out of her matrimonial household when the husband dies. According to traditional laws, the land belongs to the community, and the community divides the land. Traditionally land is allocated to the heads of families (usually men).

2 The Ombudswoman of the Republic of Namibia.
of land 30 km long and 20 km wide between the towns of Ondangwa and Oshakati.

A sprawling shanty settlement developed there. The conditions were squalid with no waterborne sewage and limited sanitation facilities. In the rainy season stagnant pools of water lay on the streets for months. Health problems were severe and health care virtually non-existent. Bubonic plague, malaria, typhoid, as well as malnutrition, diarrhoea and venereal diseases plagued the settlements.

The livelihood of the people, already susceptible to drought and low input, was interrupted, often brutally as armed forces razed fields in retaliation for the civilian shielding of PLAN guerrillas or forcible relocation of communities to areas under SADF surveillance. The psychological effect of the war was to make life cheap, where after a few drinks, shooting, murder and rape was common. It was universally accepted that detainees of SADF would be tortured and that anybody could be maltreated and beaten if they were suspected of aiding the guerrillas.

The four regions today face an intensification of the problems that Namibia as a whole face. Along with the largely immeasurable psychological damage inflicted during the war, the economic and social indicators of development indicate enormous challenges.

According to a study by the Social Sciences Division of the University of Namibia (Frayne et al 1993), the social economy of the area is characterised by low incomes, high unemployment, high inequality in income and ownership of cattle, and high dependency ratios. This dependency ratio is based on a predominance of a large young population, women and aged people. It is caused by a massive trend of out migration of young men who

---

2 Said to be caused by the influx of soldiers who are regarded as the original carriers of the diseases.
leave in search of work outside the region. This trend has origins in the policy of using Ovamboland as a labour reservoir for the German- and South African colonial economy. Five per cent of the total income is shared by 40% of households, while the richest 20% have 67% of all income. Women occupy positions of subordinacy and are poorly represented at all levels of society. Women have no rights to land ownership despite the fact that between 40% and 49% of households are headed by women. Education levels are low with the highest teacher/pupil ratio in the country (1:41 compared to national average of 1:30). The area only has 26% of the national total of health facilities. The area accounts for approximately 44% of the national population. The annual growth rate of the urban and peri-urban areas of the towns of Oshakati and Ondangwa is 13% per annum.

The study (Frayne et al 1993) indicates that in the shanty communities, there is a lack of basic infrastructure with 74% of the households using communal water taps, 65% using the bush for toilets, 88% using wood for cooking, and 83% using candles for lighting. The social conditions related to health, nutrition and crime are difficult, particularly for children who are frequently sick. Malnutrition is relatively common. Petty crime is on the rise although serious crime such as murder, rape etc. has decreased since independence.

A study by the Ministry of Health and Social Services, GRN, determined that alcohol abuse has become one of the major social problems in the former Ovambo area of Namibia (Shigwedha 1993). Of the 564 households interviewed, 396 or 70% of them stated that they knew people they considered used alcohol excessively. Sixty-nine per cent knew persons who had lost their job because of alcohol abuse. Seventy-five per cent knew people who had to be treated or hospitalised due to excessive alcohol intake. Sixty-eight per cent knew households where alcohol abuse resulted in child abuse or neglect, 86% knew households where family fighting and divorce was a result, 42% knew households that were in conflict with the law and 21% knew households that a member committed or attempted to commit suicide due to alcohol abuse. The study indicated that alcohol was clearly
easily available where short distances, long hours of business and cheap prices facilitated easy access.

Although the area has potential for development, including proximity to sources of water and power, and access to a substantial domestic market, production and distribution infrastructural development is poor. The quality of the soils is generally poor being sandy with a fine texture, weak cohesion and high absorption capacity, deficient in phosphorus, often saline and low in organic matter. Rainfall is low, variable and highly seasonable although the area receives more than most of Namibia. The area has a short growing season and without irrigation is limited to one crop per year.

In short, the largely subsistence agricultural system which forms the basis of the area’s economy is nearing its limits yet there is a distinct absence of alternate means of maintaining household economic subsistence. An expanding population continues to exploit the land. Technological improvements, particularly with regard to providing water have opened up new areas for use and increased levels of stocking, but management practices have not been modified to control the impact of greater use of natural resources, with the result that many areas within the four regions are reaching levels of ecological exhaustion (Frayne et al 1993).

Thus it can be seen that the case study area is inflicted with numerous challenges on all fronts – economic, environmental, social, psychological and I might add, spiritual.

4.2 Pre-Colonial Culture/s in Namibia

4.2.1 African Culture, ‘Traditional’ Beliefs and Religion

Before embarking on a description of the pre-colonial cultures of Namibia, it is first necessary to clarify terminology and stipulate the relationship between culture, ‘traditional’ beliefs and African religion.
Mbiti (1991) uses the terms, African culture, ‘traditional’ beliefs and African religion interchangeably. He argues that African culture and African religion are synonymous and that African heritage cannot be understood without understanding African religion. “Religion has always been for Africans the normal way of looking at the world and experiencing life itself. It is integrated into all parts of life such that it is said that Africans who live according to their traditional ways are also said to be religious” (Ibid, p. 14).

The singular or plural nature of African culture/s and religion/s must also be addressed. Mbiti (1991) believes that while each African people has its own cultural heritage, and that these cultures and religions vary enormously over the continent, there are also many similarities between them. He believes that these similarities make it possible to “speak of African culture/religion in the singular, remembering, however, that there are many varieties of it” (Ibid, p. 8).

African religion refers to the belief system of African societies before colonialism and missionary conversion to Christianity. It does not refer to ancient African Christianity which is believed to have been brought to Africa by St Mark, one of the writers of the ‘Bible’ in the year 42 AD. Ancient Christianity can be still be found in Egypt and Ethiopia today. It is spoken of as Orthodox Christianity to distinguish it from Roman Catholic and Protestant forms of Christianity brought by in the colonial era. Nor does it refer to Islam which was founded in Arabia in the seventh century and which also reached Africa around that time.

Christianity then refers to the relatively more recent form of the religion brought to the African continent in the colonial era, starting in the 15th century when Spanish and Portugal brought Christianity to the coastal strips of western Africa and the mouth of the Congo river.

Thus said, in the literature there are a number of views or positions taken on the relationship between Christianity and ‘traditional’ African culture/religion/beliefs. Etherington (1996) believes that “in many colonial
circumstances, imported Christianity and 'traditional culture' do not so much constitute separate 'worlds' as poles on a continuum – a cause of continual frustration for nineteenth century European missionaries who drew sharp boundaries between believers and pagans” (Ibid, p. 206). He notes that there have been a series of studies that have charted the personal dilemmas, misunderstandings, approaches and retreats of individual Xhosa (South Africa) during the long process of Christianisation⁴.

Fast (1993) for example, documents how Christian and Xhosa concepts of divinity, sin, morality, soul, and afterlife (versus ancestors) differed radically. Fast concludes:

It is clear that the Methodist missionaries rarely took the Xhosa worldview seriously and consequently did not anticipate nor wish to enter into dialogue with the strong objections of their listeners, who variously perceived the message as curious, implausible, or simply incomprehensible. Moreover, little of this Gospel was appealing. The brand of Christianity which the Wesleyans brought was limited to their culture and system of thought, presenting Christ as the solution to Western needs. Existing African concepts of divinity were ignored and instead a personal God was presented who appeared to exhibit primarily negative characteristics, such as wrath and judgement. The pressing physical needs of this world were neglected and the emphasis placed on an unfamiliar hereafter. Spiritual needs such as fear of witchcraft were dismissed as superstitious and never addressed. It was an other-worldly, legalistic message with little relevance for the day-to-day existence of its African hearers (Fast 1993, p. 167).

However, according to Etherington (1996), one of the reasons why Christianity 'caught on' was that missionaries tried to adapt Christianity to 'traditional' African beliefs. Work by Ranger (1989) in Zimbabwe

demonstrates how anthropology was used as a tool to suggest new approaches to conversion even to the point of learning how to adapt the gospel to ‘African tradition’. Ranger (1989) details how in many places missionaries were the first ethnographers and linguists and by fixing standard dialects and languages missionaries helped create the ‘tribes’ who became the subjects of field work by later anthropologists.

The point is that conversion was not a successful venture at its outset but rather evangelists endured some three decades of indifference and even hostility with few and far conversions to their credit. However, notwithstanding this earlier failure, by 1984, according to Mbiti (1991), there were some 234 million Christians in Africa, and this number was growing by a rate of about 5% every year. He projects that by the year 2000 there will be roughly 400,000,000 Christians in Africa (Ibid, p. 182).

One way of understanding the relationship between Christianity and African religion or ‘traditional’ beliefs is to ask why despite the earlier lack of success, as well as the negative association missionary activity had with colonialism, large-scale conversion occurred on much of the African continent.

Kaplan (1986) describes a typology of this relationship based on varying levels of adaptation of African traditional beliefs. His typology covers six types of adaptation ranging (in a continuum) from ‘toleration’ which missionaries agree to accept the continued existence of certain African customs while at the same time maintaining that they were essentially incompatible with a true Christian life, through translation, assimilation, Christianisation, acculturation to incorporation. Incorporation describes the “Africanization” of Christianity where African concepts were introduced into the body of “normative” Christianity. It is not just an attempt to contextualise Christianity on the African continent, but to incorporate African elements into the church as a whole.

This is in comparison to Islam, the next ‘great’ religion in Africa. In 1984 there were an estimated 211 million Muslims in Africa with a growth rate of 2.5%.
For example, Du Toit (1984) depicts how “the nineteen century idea of self-governing, self-supporting congregation were married to anthropological concepts of ‘integral cultures’ so that when sons of missionaries in the Dutch Reformed Church became anthropologists and Broederbond members, they were able to conceptualise missiological and scientific justifications for apartheid” (Etherington 1996, p. 209). The theological foundations of apartheid, as well as use of military force to achieve the ends of conversion were central to the experience of Christianity in Namibia. This will be discussed in more detail later in this chapter. Perhaps to understand the ‘Christianisation’ of Africa, it is best to turn to an African perspective.

Mbiti’s (1991) perspective, for example, is valuable because his in-depth understanding of African religion offers an explanation of how African religion and African societies adopted Christianity on their own spiritual terms, even if they were economically, politically, militarily, and religiously dominated by European colonisers and missionaries.

Mbiti (1991) believes that Christianity was successful because African religion shares a number of parallel beliefs with Christianity, foremost of these being a belief in ‘God’. Mbiti (1991) also argues that Christianity was successful

Mbiti (1991) says that all African peoples believe in God (and believed in, before missionary activity). African people believe that the universe is created and that there is a creator in the universe who is ‘God’. They also believe in ‘God’ because they recognise their own limitations and powerlessness and that there must be someone or something which has full control over the universe, particularly the forces of nature. ‘God’ can be appealed to for help. African people look on ‘God’ in terms of a human image, as father, mother or parent. Another parallel, according to Mbiti (1991) is the Christian idea of the church and the African traditional concept of kinship and the extended family. The church is the Christian family, in which all are related to one another through faith and baptism in ‘Jesus Christ’. The church also includes those who have died and those which still live. This is similar to the African view of the family, both those still living, and those who have died, the ancestral spirits.

‘Jesus Christ’ also provides a connection. Mbiti (1991) believes that African peoples see ‘Jesus Christ’ as addressing himself to them and not only to the people of his region and time. His concern for the sick, the poor, the hungry
because it was able to adapt, or to incorporate many African concepts and rituals. "Many aspects of African religion, prayers, music, hymns, songs, festivals, and the attitude to dreams and vision, as well as organisation underwent modification in order to 'fit' the views of 'Africanised' churches" (Ibid, p. 190). He believes that much of the 'traditional' world-view has been retained in Christianity. However, this has been combined with the best of Christian beliefs - the value of human dignity and the love, which should exist among all people - and this gave Africans the courage to fight oppression and domination by foreign rulers.

Etherington (1996) also points to the work of various authors who believe that despite the fact that missionaries typically aligned themselves with their colonial government, and aimed to replace African cultures with European 'civilisation', they "transmitted a religion which Africans turned to suit their own purposes: spiritual, economic and political" (Etherington 1991, p. 209).

Thus there is a complex relationship between African culture and Christianity. Before colonisation and missionary activity, African society maintained its own belief system. As colonial forces and missionaries invaded, African society first resisted the subjugation of their beliefs, and then gradually converted Christianity to support an explicitly African agenda. The key issue is that African society maintained, despite years of brutal oppression, its 'essential spirituality'; and thus its ability to confer its own identity. This pattern can be observed throughout the continent of Africa as individual countries struggled for, and won their independence. It is repeated in Namibia.

and oppressed, touches at the heart of African concerns. African people can turn to him for help, to pray to him for assistance in their daily needs.

8 For example, Richard Gray's Black Christians and White Missionaries (1990) and Clifton Crais's White Supremacy and Black Resistance in Pre-Industrial South Africa, the Making of the Colonial Order in the Eastern Cape, 1770-1865 (1992).
4.2.2 Pre-Colonial Cultures and ‘Traditional’ Beliefs in Namibia

There are nine main ethnic groups indigenous to Namibia; the Ovambo, Kavango, Damara, Herero, Nama, Caprivians, San, Rehoboth Basters, and Tswana. However, due to the fact that the case study area chosen for the empirical research of this thesis is inhabited by the Ovambo (Awambo) ethnic group, I will focus my attention on the pre-colonial culture of this one specific group.

According to Nambala (1987) Ovambo is a collective name of eight different ‘tribes’, each of which has its own language. These include Aakwanyama, Aakwambi, Aandonga, Aangandjera, Aambalantu, Aakwaluudhi, Aakolonkadhi, and Aauanda (all of which means ‘all those who live in’, for example Kwanyama). Oshivambo is the collective name for the eight languages (which are prefixed by ‘Oshi’, for example, Oshikwanyama).

The exact origins of the Ovambo are much disputed. According to Nela-Williams (1991) most Ovambo people believe that they came from the east, more precisely, that they came from the Okavango, the north-eastern part Namibia, as well as from sites of Evale, now in southern Angola. Beyond this, studies of Bantu migration have theorised that the original homeland of all Bantu-speaking people was in Cameroon and adjacent parts of Nigeria⁹. Map 4.2 shows the routes of Bantu migration. Ovambo migrations imposed themselves on the Aakwankala people already living in the Ovambo area. These people belong to the San-Khoisan linguistic/ethnic group, the oldest inhabitants of the region and southern Africa in general.

There are also several myths that the Ovambo believe explain their genesis and origins. Nambala (1987) and Nela-Williams (1991) describe some of these. One of these tells about Mangundu and his wife, who were created after Kalunga (God) created all things. They have two sons, Kanzi and Nangombe and a girl. Kanzi got married and had a son called Mushindi, who later became the leader of the Aakwanyama. Nangombe’s descendents became Aandonga, who settled in Ondonga. Another legend tells of a man, Noni, and a woman whom Kalunga brought out of the earth. They had three sons and a daughter named Joni. One son was to take care of the cattle, another took care of the soil, while the third was responsible for the holy fire. Janoni became the ancestral mother. This story, according to Nambala (1987) reflects the matriarchal order of the Ovambos. A fourth legend tells of about the common ancestors of the
Ovambo and the Herero. Map 4.3 shows the pre-colonial settlement patterns in Namibia. Two brothers, Nangombe and Kadhu, the sons of Mangundu trekked southward from the north until they reached the 'Omumborombonga' tree somewhere in Ovambo. It was at this tree that they went their separate ways. Kadhu trekked further, first westward to the Kaokoveld and then southward to the central highlands of Namibia. Kadhu became the great ancestor of the Herero. Nangombe remained in Ovambo and became the Ovambo great ancestor.

Map 4.3 – Pre-colonial Settlement Patterns in Namibia c. 1880

Nambala (1987) outlines the social organisation of the Ovambo. The king was the ruler of the whole 'nation' which was then divided into several 'Ikandjo'. Each 'Ikandjo' is under the charge of a chief. There were usually several chiefs who served as the king's advisors or commanders of war. Each 'Oskikandjo' (singular) was further subdivided into small areas or 'Omikunda' which under the charge of a headman who in turn served as advisors to their chief. Under each headman there were several houses, usually between 30 and 100. Each house was under the head of the family, who was responsible for his/her household and individual members within the household. All conflicts were handled from the bottom up in the social hierarchy. The king was the highest authority and functions as the judge (of the 'supreme court'), priest, and chief-in-command of the 'nation's' army.

The king, Nela-Williams (1991), describes, was expected to play a role in increasing fertility, in providing rain, and above all else, serve as a symbol of life for his people. He was seen as the link between the living and the dead whose sacred duty was to carry out sacrificial rites through which he could secure blessings for his people and 'nation'. However, he was not, Nela-Williams, emphasises, identified with Kalunga (God). The king occupied a sacred position, but not a divine one.

In the king's palace a sacred fire was never allowed to die and a 'custodian of the scared fire' was appointed for this purpose. The functions of the scared fire were to bring blessing to the people, and all the animals were protected from accidents and sickness. It also protected soldiers in battle and those who undertook long journeys to collect iron ore and salt.

10 The past tense is used because the authors are referring to the 'traditions' that existed in the time before colonisation. However, it is acknowledged that in present day Ovambo culture/s, kings are still in existence even though their duties, functions and meaning in and to Ovambo culture/s have changed due to colonial influences.
Along with the political leaders already mentioned, the king appointed priests to hold his ritual power. The high-priest would then preside over all ritual ceremonies on behalf of the king.

Royal succession followed the matrilineal principle, with the king being succeeded by his younger brother or his eldest sister's son. According to Nela-Williams (1991), the "ideology of kingship was based on religion, in which the king played a crucial role in maintaining the link between the dead and the living through sacrificial ceremonies" (Ibid, p. 114).

There are a number of accounts of the religious beliefs of the Ovambo. However, Nela-Williams (1991) cautions against those of the early European travellers and missionaries. She argues that the accounts of Galton and Andersson, Martti Rautanen, August Pettinen, Albin Savola, Erkki Laurma, and Nestori Vaananen are all distorted by the lenses of their Western upbringing and "epistemological orientation" (Ibid, p. 17).

She believes that a better account of Ovambo 'traditions' would be obtained through interviews with informants in the Ovambo area, who she feels, because of their non-literate background and lack of 'Western vision', offers raw data that might give a picture of "how it really was" (Ibid, p. 6). However, while her book does provide detailed information pertaining to the social organisation of Ovambo kingdoms, there is little data on the spiritual/religious beliefs of the Ovambo people.

11 The Ovambo are matrilineal with the children belonging to the side of the mother and kingship being inherited not from father to son, but from brother to brother or sister. This is apparently one of the reasons why women whose husbands die are forced off their matrimonial land. The wife and her children do not retain any rights of inheritance from the husband.


13 All missionaries or travellers in the Ovambo area of Namibia who conducted 'ethnographic' studies of the Ovambo either formally or as observations recorded in their diaries.
Other sources, such as Nambala (1987) also provide little data on this topic. Nambala believes that “there was not a single tribe that did not believe in a Supreme Being” (p. 15). He turns to the work of Barbara Tyrrell (1976) who describes the ethical beliefs of the Ovambo.

Behaviour, manner and ethics are tribal and to sin against the interests of the tribe is sin indeed. There is no ‘absolute’ in the sense of right and wrong and, therefore, no spiritual idea to pursue. A crime, though it may even be murder, is no crime of it is in the interests of the tribe. Many a religious teacher and many a European employer has found himself confused and frustrated because he has not been aware of this fundamentally different approach to, and interpretation of, truth and goodness (Tyrrell, 1976, p. 6).

Other than the missionary accounts of Ovambo culture that NeIa-Williams (1991) so thoroughly discounts, there are a number of more recent secondary accounts of the religious beliefs of the Ovambo. Along with Barbara Tyrrell’s work there is Teddy Aarni’s book The Kalunga Concept on Ovambo Religion from 1870 Onwards (1982) which was based upon the examination of a number of primary sources of Ovambo beliefs, including his Finnish missionary parents who lived in Ovambo for four decades (1909-1946). He argues that sources like interviews and field research amongst the Ovambos is of little use in the present day because 95% of Ovambos are Christian and the few non-Christians who still exist are unwilling to disclose any knowledge of the ‘old Kalunga’ concept to an outsider.

It is thus difficult to assess whether one should use Aarni’s, Tyrrell’s or other accounts simply because of the biased nature of their work. However, with full cognisance of this potential bias, I provide a summary of the Kalunga concept and of Ovambo religion in general from Aarni’s work.

---

14 According to Aarni, the ‘new Kalunga’ is the Christianised ‘God’ who lives in Heaven. The Ovambo still refer to ‘God’ as Kalunga although the concept has changed with Christian doctrine.
According to Aarni, the word Kalunga is used by Ovambos in the form ‘Kalunga ka Nangombe’ which literally means the son of to mean ‘Kalunga, the son of Nangombe’ – the ancestral father of the Ovambo. Missionaries translated and converted it to mean ‘Kalunga, the god of Nangombe’, in the same sense as ‘the God of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob’. The king in Ovambo culture was looked on as being the social symbol of Kalunga, who was seen to be a great chief with many wives in his kingdom in the Underworld. Kalunga was thought of as the ‘Great Being’, the most powerful of all spirits. ‘He’ had a comprehensive character, thought to being in the thunder clouds as well as the ‘Underworld’, and ‘he’ was the giver of both good and evil. In general, the Ovambo religion held the concept that there was no defined limits or borders between the living and the deceased, that spirits lived all around the living and could be communicated to. Magic, divination, ormens and spirits played a major part in everyday life.

It is not within the scope of this thesis to provide a detailed overview of Ovambo religion. The key issue is how Ovambo ‘traditional’ beliefs were transformed through Christianity. What is the relationship in the present day, between Christianity and ‘traditional’ beliefs? Much work needs to be done in this regard.

Nela-Williams (1991) provides insight into the overlapping nature of this relationship. She describes how in an interview with Helvi Kandombolo she asked about the origin of Ovambo people, to which Kandombolo’s answer drew heavily from the book of Genesis. Perhaps the best indication of what the Ovambo people believe in, in the present day, is to observe the ongoing process of ‘Namibianising’ Christianity and the church. This process will

---

15 Again, the European bias must be noted. Although Aarni describes Kalunga as male, in fact Nela-Williams (1991) believes that Kalunga is neither male or female. In my own queries about Kalunga in the field research, I also received this impression from some respondents.

16 The mother of Sam Nujoma, President of Namibia. She was also interviewed for this thesis.
receive due attention after first outlining first the repression of Namibian spirituality by colonial and missionary activity, and second, the re-emergence of that spirituality in the struggle for independence.

What is important to remember is that Ovambo 'tradition' has not remained static but has undergone much change since the beginning of the 19th century. As the following section describes, the combination of the expansion of Christianity and the manipulation of the 'traditional' power structure of the Ovambo, had a powerful impact on the 'traditional' beliefs of the people, changing their religious ideas and the cultural values that formed the fundamental basis of their communities.

4.3 The Spiritual Aims of Colonialism and Missionary Activity

The history of colonialism in Namibia began with the activity of missionaries. Believing that a colonial power was necessary for the continuation of their

---

17 The first missionaries to come to Namibia via South Africa (the Cape) belonged to the London Missionary Society (L.M.S.) around 1806. The L.M.S. was an inter-denominational organisation including Episcopalians, Methodists, Presbyterians and Congregationalists (Independents). The sole mission of the L.M.S. was to spread the knowledge of Christ among the heathen and other unenlightened groups. By the 1840's a number of L.M.S. mission stations had been established in the southern Nama areas of Namibia. The Wesleyan Society has also formed missions to Namibia since around 1815. By the late 1860s however, both Societies requested the Rhennish Missionary Society (R.M.S.) to take over their missions for lack of their own missionary recruits. The R.M.S. was formed out of the Lutheran and Reformed backgrounds. In 1829 the first four missionaries of the Rhennish Mission arrived in Cape Town. In 1840 the work of the L.M.S. in Namaland, Namibia was transferred to the R.M.S. and in 1847, the R.M.S. took over the Wesleyan mission station at Warmbad. By the 1850s the Rhennish Missionary Society (R.M.S.) had spread throughout the Nama and Herero territories (southern and central parts of the country) and monopolised the mission work in Namibia. After the end of the war between the Herero and Nama (1863-80), mission work continued and by 1910, a large number of mission stations were established, including in the Ovambo area where work had begun in 1891. The R.M.S. was transferred to the Finnish Missionary Society (F.M.S.) in 1920 and from the F.M.S. the Lutheran Church was born, the Evangelical Lutheran Church in South West Africa. However, the white population objected to receiving communion
work, they petitioned the British Government to annex the territory. When the British declined, they turned to the German Government. Mbuende (1989) writes:

For the missionaries, Namibia's new status as a German colony meant the fulfilment of their long-held wish to have white Government in Namibia that would protect them from the 'wild natives' who constituted a threat to their mission work. They saw God's intervention through colonisation and they praised God, saying, "His ways are wonderful that he especially gave rise to the first German colony" (Mbuende 1989, p.31).

The boundaries of Namibia, or South West Africa as it was called by the German colonisers, were drawn up at the Berlin Conference of 1884-85 when European nations divided up the African continent between themselves. Local people found themselves living on opposite sides of a rigid border. "Within the new boundaries, a number of distinct African societies, loosely bound by ties of trade and diplomacy but politically independent, were broken up and thrown together, common prisoners of an alien colonial state" (SWAPO 1981, p. 2).

The conditions of colonialism were brutal. The German colonial administration had the goal of creating a German society in Africa and ruthlessly exploited the three economic assets of the colony - mining, farming and native labour - to do so. It adopted a land policy that was followed later by the 'banstustan' policy of the South African administration. The land policy was premised on the assumption that after the demarcation of so-called 'Native Reserves' the colonial authorities could systematically acquire by proclamation as Crown Land the remainder of the country. The policy of reserves not only constituted an effective form of political and economic control over the mobility of the indigenous population, but also served to fragment their

together with black parishioners and so the German Evangelical Lutheran Church (DELK) was also formed. (Nambala 1987)
leadership, and to undermine their political autonomy (Du Pisana 1987). Nearly all of the population, cattle and livestock from the central and southern areas of the country, were driven out or killed and nearly all the land was expropriated and parcelled out to white settlers.

Diamonds were found in the southern Namib Desert and the Administration found it benefited, if not from the direct revenue of diamond sales, then certainly with its tax revenues. These were channelled into the settlement programme to finance roads, railways, and basic services. (SWAPO 1981). The exploitation of the country’s mineral resources created a massive demand for labour. Having decimated 60% of the population in the central and southern areas, the regime imposed a strict labour code on all black people. No black person was allowed to own land or stock. This forced the black population to seek work in the white farms, commercial mines and construction projects. Even this was not enough however, and the Germans began to look north to the Ovambo area. By 1910 some 10,000 Ovambo workers were streaming south each year to work in the mines and on the railways (Ibid, p. 19).

In 1915 South African forces, allied with Britain during the First World War, seized South West Africa from the Germans. In 1920 the Union of South Africa was awarded the mandate of the territory under the League of Nations. From the outset, the supremacy of white interests was upheld in policy, both in terms of constitutional affairs and in respect to land and labour (Du Pisani 1987).

Brutal repression of the people continued under the South Africans, hand-in-hand with the capitalist exploitation of the country’s natural and human resources. A ‘clean-up’ of the central highlands was conducted, entitling white settlers, now mainly Afrikaaners, to the prime stock-farming land. After the global recession of the inter-war years, the Second World War caused the pace of economic exploitation to increase sharply, particularly for base and strategic minerals needed to fuel the industrial boom in the “Northern countries”, as well as in South Africa (SWAPO 1981).
The South African regime eventually formed their strategy of land ownership and labour control into the policy of apartheid. The bantustan or homeland system meant the containment of black settlements into ethnically based reserves. The Odentaal Plan, commissioned in 1964 outlined the apartheid masterplan. The black population (91% of the total population), received only 13% of the total area of the country. And within the bantustans, the proportion of viable farmland belied the image of the 'ideal homeland' where each ethnic group is allowed to develop and thrive independently. SWAPO (1981) argues that there was never any question that the Black population should be allowed sufficient land for their own subsistence, nor for viable peasant agriculture. Map 4.4 shows the distribution of land under South African rule. Any areas not demarcated as a bantustan or game reserve was then reserved for 'Whites'.

For example, SWAPO sources indicated that in the Ovambo bantustan only 24% of the total land area of the reserve could be considered as viable farmland. In the Kavango, only 7%, in Hereoland, only 17% and in Damaraland, only 21%. In the Ovamboland, out of the 5.6 million hectares given to the population under the Odentaal Plan, it was estimated that only 1.35 million could support a settled peasant population. Although a year-round supply of water was available, the growing population, itself a result of apartheid policies of containment and deprivation, meant the over-cultivation, and increasing desertification of once viable land (SWAPO 1981).

Driven by poverty in the homelands, the black population was forced to migrate to the 'white areas' in search of work. Thus the chief function of the reserves in the apartheid's grand scheme, to convert the peasant areas into pools of cheap labour, was fully achieved (SWAPO 1981). The migrant labour system kept the economic system working. Black labourers lived on barely subsistence wages. It was estimated in 1967 that a family of five needed R50.82 to live on per month. A survey showed, however, that only 13% of the city's black workers earned over R50 a month, while 80% earned between R20-49 (SWAPO 1981).
It is not possible to describe in detail the extent of the economic exploitation of the Namibian population here. Suffice to say that the level of exploitation forced black labourers into conditions of extreme poverty and near starvation for themselves and their families left behind in the bantustans. The conditions also denied any semblance of human dignity; violence and humiliation being a regular part of the daily experience of most of the black workers.
The design of the colony was enforced by a vast political machinery, military and legal, which enforced the system of economic exploitation. The nature of the repressive measures used has been well-documented (Konig 1983; SWAPO 1981; Leys and Saul 1995; Cleaver and Wallace 1990; Weaver 1987). South Africa’s military presence expanded rapidly in the 1970s after the strike by Namibian workers in 1972. By 1974, troop strength was 15,000; by 1976 after the invasion of Angola by South Africa, approximately 45,000 troops were stationed in Namibia and by 1981 a 60,000 strong occupation army enforced the apartheid policy of South Africa. From three bases in the early 1960s in Windhoek, Walvis Bay and the eastern Caprivi, military installations multiplied to an estimated 40 bases along the northern border with Angola and another 35 throughout the rest of the country. As a result, Namibians were increasingly forced to live under the constant surveillance of the South African military forces. The Namibian landscape became an image of fortified towns or “protected villages” where the black population was forced to crowd into for the protection of the South African forces, ostensibly from SWAPO guerrilla forces (Konig 1983; SWAPO 1981; Leys & Saul 1995).

Leys and Saul (1995) summarize:

The German policy of violent repression was continued under South African rule. ...No-one who has not read David Soggot’s account of the final phase of South African colonialism in Namibia can begin to understand what routine state violence against a civilian population really means. A political activist who fell into the hands of the police, the army or the counter-insurgency unit, Koevoet (“Crowbar”), was very likely to be beaten, if not systematically tortured, and quite likely (especially when taken by Koevoet) to be killed. To read how men, women and even children were routinely beaten, kicked, jumped on, whipped, cut, torn, burned, electrically shocked, suffocated in water, buried in the ground, hung from chains, ropes, wires.... is to be brought up short, once again, by what Hannah Arendt called ‘the banality of evil’ (Leys & Saul 1995, p. 9)

Violence against the civilian population took all these forms. In addition to the systematic use of arbitrary detention, torture, stop-and-search campaigns and destruction of crops and property by occupying troops and local
collaborators, there were also atrocities committed by individual soldiers or police, some done out of boredom or for fun. Women were even more vulnerable to police and army brutalities. Rape was a common and systematic form of abuse and torture by the South African forces (Konig 1983).

Hishongwa (1983) describes the position of women under colonial rule in Namibia. Women were the worst hit victims of the inhumane system of contract labour. When the men went to work in white areas or industries, women were left alone in rural areas in extremely impoverished conditions, facing critical problems in supplying food for their families and keeping them healthy with little or no medical support. They also suffered from male violence. Hishongwa (1983) describes how:

Men, often unable to realise their manhood under these conditions, often were driven to violence. They may be under the yoke of colonial power, but they still demanded authority over women. Thus, women’s oppression was threefold, oppressed as women, as workers and as blacks. Women were subjugated, humiliated, defeated and reduced to nothing (Hishongwa 1983, p.32).

Women in urban areas fared little better. Many women, looking for ways to keep their families alive, went in search of employment that could afford enough money to send home to their children and substitute caregivers. But for most women, uneducated and unskilled, the job prospects were grim. Domestic service, housemaids, laundrywomen, or sweepers were common jobs. Overall, white employers have no respect for their black workers. Domestic workers were extremely vulnerable, living in the privacy of individual households. They were often insulted, made to work long hours, sexually harassed and assaulted.

The South African administration legalised the oppression of women and men alike through a comprehensive and highly repressive framework of labour legislation to enforce the migrant labour system. SWAPO asserts that this legislation had a fourfold purpose: to enforce a strict code of labour discipline; to prevent workers from leaving their jobs against the wishes of
the employer; to give the state complete control over the recruitment and
distribution of black labour; and to drive all non-workers, except those with
the right to permanent residence, out to the reserves. The Native
Administration Proclamation of 1922, better known as the pass law, ordered
that 'a native found beyond the confines of a location, reserve, farm or place
of residence or employment shall exhibit on demand to the police his pass
and on neglect to produce may be arrested.' Upon arrest the labourer would
be deported to her/his native homeland, regardless if she/he had ever lived
there or had relatives there. The pass law consisted of a maze of permits
which dictated exactly where a black person could live and work and what
kind of work she/he could do. Other laws controlled the right to reside in
urban areas, in mines and in farms; each law was designed to assist the
employer to find and keep at minimal cost, the most suitable and stable
employee (SWAPO 1981).

Konig (1983) describes the immensity of what apartheid might have meant to
the Namibian people:

The pervasive military presence, the brutal behaviour of the
security forces and their deliberate assault on the deeply held
beliefs and conventions of the local population, penetrate
depth into the fabric of Namibian society (p. 6).

Namibians began to flee, first in small, isolated groups in 1959/60. The
central leadership of the SWAPO party-in-exile was formed by many of the
exiles fleeing at this time. By the late 1970's thousands had fled into exile.
Most of the refugees relocated in Zambia and Angola. However, as the
SWAPO party gained credibility in the international community, more and
more countries began to take the refugees. Over 50,000 men, women and
children from a sparsely populated country of a mere 1 million inhabitants
were soon living as refugees (SWAPO 1981).

Missionary activity was used to further the political and economic aims of
colonisation. The oppression of Namibia was not just condoned, but actively
encouraged by Christian missions. When initial, peaceful efforts to convert
local peoples did not work, mass conversion was enforced by military power (Nambala 1987). Thus the use of force was part of the missionary ‘mystique’. From the Namibian perspective, it would seem that the ‘spirituality’ of missionary activity was inherently destructive. Of course this attitude was to change as Christianity eventually replaced ‘traditional’ belief systems and then began to ‘Namibianise’. However, from the missionary perspective, conversion and the denigration of Namibian (spiritual) ‘traditions’ was good. They were in fact saving their souls for ‘Jesus’ and thus improving the spiritual life of Namibians.

In fact the missionaries believed in colonialism as the future of the world; as the path for its rightful and fruitful (sic-economic) development. Missionary involvement thus from the outset paved the way for colonial invasion. Missions also co-operated directly with the economic imperative of colonialism. The Rhennish Mission Society (RMS) encouraged German businesses to expand into the territory. Mission-Handels-AG, for example, a limited company founded in 1873, concentrated on importing weapons and ammunition into Namibia; half of its profits went to the RMS (Cleaver and Wallace 1990, p. 103). The missions were to press the colonial Government to establish the reserve system and came to depend upon the migrant labour system. (Ibid, p. 104).

The missionaries also believed in the right of the coloniser to preserve peace with violence if necessary. Any attempt to rise against the colony was thus against the wishes of the Church. Within this context there was little space for an independent Namibian church and Namibians were not allowed to undertake their own theological reflections. There could be no possibility of liberating themselves from the ‘theology of colonialism’.

The missions showed no repulsion over the use of violence to subdue their potential converts. After the Herero war, the Rhenish mission was to show no sympathy for the survivors of the extermination campaign Dr. Vedder of the Rhenish Mission is quoted as saying:
The Herero have yet to realise that there are other nationalities with rights in South West Africa beside themselves who have the right to existence. But if the Herero haughtily decline the opportunities offered them for developing and working themselves up and persist in wishing to love an isolated life, according to their own ideas, there are distinct signs that brutalization, degeneration, childlessness, rapidly increasing sexual diseases, bodily debilitation, inconsequence of spirituous native drinks, will end in their digging of their own national grave (taken from Nambala 1987 p. 192).

This typifies the attitude taken by the mission churches working in Namibia. However, to their credit, some of the missions did protest against certain colonial policies. Thus the over homogenisation of missionaries should also be avoided.

The alliance between the church and the colonial state was maintained when the South Africans took over. The Dutch Reformed Church essentially

---

18 For example, the issue of legally prohibiting marriages between blacks and German white soldiers, resulting in "illegitimate bastard children", provoked contentious argument between the missionary circles, the settler society and the German Administration (Mbuende 1989). And in 1957, the Synod of the Rhennish Mission (R.M.C) constituted the Evangelical Lutheran Church in South West Africa (ELC/SWA), a church which was intended to be racially inclusive. However on both sides of the racial divide, the white German communities, and the "coloured" communities, declined participation, opting for their own racially exclusive congregations, the Deutsche Evangelische Lutherische Kirche (DELK) and the Rhennish Congregation.

19 The Dutch Reformed Church is Calvinist in background and came to Namibia in the 1870's from the Transvaal with the so-called Boer Trekkers. Unlike the other denominations, the Dutch reformed Church did not undertake mission work. Servants of the Boer settlers learned their faith from them and were not formally preached to until 1910. The membership of the Dutch Reformed Church is still mostly white. In South Africa it is divided into 4 factions, namely the Dutch Reformed Mission Church (N.G.S.K.) for coloured, the Dutch Reformed Church in Africa (N.G.K.A.) for Africans, the Reformed Church in Africa (R.C.A.) for Indians, and the Dutch Reformed Church (D.R.C) for Whites. In Namibia, after the Mission Church was formed, non-White Dutch Reformed Mission schools and churches were formed in Kaokoveld, San, Kavango and Owambo areas. In 1975 the Evangelical Reformed Church in Africa was formed and covers the Owambos, Kavango and Kaoko areas. Its leadership is mostly white.
represented the South African Government's religious thinking on scripturally devised grounds, and supported the policies of the regime. It did in fact provide the spiritual and moral bulwark of the theory of apartheid (Boesak 1977; de Vries 1978; de Gruchy 1979; Ngcokovane 1984; Ryan 1990).\footnote{De Gruchy (1979) explains that the Dutch Reformed Church is very clear on the understanding that the apartheid principle of separate development has divine ('Scriptural') origins. The inspiration for apartheid can be found in the creation narratives and protohistory of Genesis 1-11 where two dominant themes emerge. The first is that the 'Scriptures' teach and uphold the essential unity of mankind and the primordial relatedness and fundamental equality of all peoples. The second is that ethnic diversity is in its very origin in accordance with the will of 'God'. Thus while the unity of 'mankind' is always the basic reality given in creation, there is also a given differentiation in creation. Although the diversity of peoples is relative to their underlying unity, the Dutch Reformed Church's understanding of the theme of unity and diversity leads it to declare: In specific circumstances and under specific conditions the New Testament makes provision for the regulation on the basis of separate development of the co-existence of various peoples in one country. De Gruchy explains, for the outsider this appears to be a major contradiction because apartheid and separate development are usually regarded as synonymous. However one needs to understand the distinction made by the Dutch Reformed Church. While it celebrates diversity and abhors racism, it also believes that separate development is a divinely blessed. For a more detailed examination of the theological grounds for apartheid and the positions of the Dutch Reformed Church see Allen Boesak's book A Farewell to Innocence 1977, Orbis Books, New York.}

As a whole, the various denominations supported colonial policy directly or tactically through silent diplomacy (Mbuende 1987). The German missionaries, not wanting to lose their mission field under South African rule, kept their silence over apartheid. The Finnish missionaries were of a pietistic background and believed that religion and politics were not to be mixed and thus tactically supported the status quo. The Anglican Church had not yet been established amongst the indigenous people. When it did, it became the first to act in opposition to Government policies in the 1940's.

It was only in the 1960's and 1970's, however, when the leadership of the church was handed over to the Namibians themselves, that the church began to take an active stance in opposition to the South African Government. 

\textsuperscript{20}
(Nambala 1977). Before this time, however, the complicity between the church and the state was to be gradually broken through isolated incidents of resistance from ‘traditional leaders’ who sought the assistance of church leaders. This was the case in 1946 when the Herero chiefs, Hosea Kutako and Hendrik Witbooi sent Anglican priest, Michael Scott, to present the Namibian case to the United Nations.

During the 1940’s separation from the mission churches of the Rhenish and Finnish Mission churches started to take place. In 1946 a large number of Nama people left the R.M.S due to racism and joined the African Methodist Episcopal Church (A.M.E.C.). In 1949 the first African pastors were ordained within the Rhennish Mission. In 1954 the Bible was published in Oshidonga21 and in the same year, the Evangelical Lutheran Ovambo-Kavango Church became independent from the Finnish Mission. In 1955, many Herero left the Rhennish Mission to form their own community – “Oruuano” in protest against racial discrimination. In 1957 the Rhennish Mission Church became autonomous as the Evangelical Lutheran Church of South West Africa (ELCSWA) and in 1960, the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Namibia elected its first African leader, Bishop Leonard Aula who became a member of the Lutheran World Foundation (LWF) Executive Committee (Nambala 1987).

4.4 The Struggle for Independence: The Re-Emergence of Namibian Spirituality and The Role of the Church

While dissent had been stirring since the advent of colonialism and missionary activity, the struggle for independence in a systematic way was just beginning. The role of the church in this movement was central and visionary.

In the 1950’s as churches were beginning to separate from their parent churches, political organisations were being formed to fight the apartheid

21 One of the eight Oshivambo languages.
administration (Nambala 1989). In 1957 the Ovamboland People's Congress was formed. It changed to the Ovambo People's Organization (OPO) in 1958. In 1959 it launched a national campaign against the contract labour system. At this time, the South West Africa National Union (SWANU) was organised as the first nationalist party. With OPO and the Chief's Council\textsuperscript{2}, a peaceful demonstration against the forcible removal of Africans from the "Old Location" (within Windhoek) to the new township of Katatura was organised. In the protest, thirteen demonstrators were killed, 50 seriously wounded, black political leaders arrested and detained and several leaders forced to flee into exile, including the future president of Namibia, Sam Nujoma (SWAPO 1981). Dissent against the rule of South Africa was intensifying. The church was at the forefront of this dissent.

In 1964 two black Lutheran churches wrote a memorandum against the Odentael Plan and in 1967 the leaders of the Lutheran, Catholic and Anglican churches in Ovamboland wrote to the District Commander of the South African Police Force to protest against brutal interrogation of the people by the police. Finally, on June 30 1971, Bishop Auala of ELOC (Evangelical Lutheran Ovambo-Kavango Church) and Moderator Gowaseb of the ELC/SWA (Evangelical Lutheran Church in South West Africa) issued an Open Letter to the then Prime Minister of South Africa, Mr. B.J. Vorster. The letter was supported by the Anglican and Catholic churches and from this time on, the four main churches, representing 75 per cent of the population, participated in the struggle for liberation (Steenkamp 1995).

It was also the church that began deconstructing the "theology of apartheid". Steenkamp writes: "among the people it encouraged a growing awareness of their oppression and an insistent demand for justice, while among church workers an indigenous political theology emerged which sought to reconcile spiritual commitment with political involvement" (Steenkamp 1995, p. 95). A theology of liberation, rooted in local experience, developed at church

\textsuperscript{22} Organisation of traditional leaders.
services, at meetings of churchwomen, men's and youth groups and within
the church-established professional societies of teachers and nurses.

Being part of South Africa, Namibian liberation theology was very much
affected by and indeed part of the black consciousness movement started by
Steve Biko. Balia (1989) writes that Black Consciousness provided a very
important context for black theologians to begin developing new theological
insights. It challenged them to take seriously the particularity of the black
experience and how to practically participate in the ongoing struggle for
liberation. Mogane Wally Serote (1990) writes:

Black Consciousness transformed the word 'black' and made it
synonymous with the word 'freedom'. This definition, which
imbued the followers of Black Consciousness with spiritual
power which is otherwise absent among the apathetic, while
transforming objects into initiators, inferior beings into equals
among peoples and claiming a country and a right to be in the
world, was also an effective manner of raising one of the most
crucial issues of the liberating process and freedom – the
national question...The Black Consciousness philosophy and
its slogans claimed the past for black people, a country and
the right of its people to its wealth and land (cited from

Hopkins (1995) describes the relationship between Steve Biko and the Black
Consciousness Movement. Biko, he says, was a 'theologian from and with the
masses of black people'. For him, experience of and talk about 'God' arose
from one's practical activities amongst the suffering victims of apartheid and
their movement towards liberation. In short, according to Hopkins, Biko
radically reinterpreted old Christian concepts from the perspective of Black
Consciousness. Biko felt that black churches had uncritically swallowed the
racist doctrines of white Christian missionaries. White theology, Biko argued,
prevented black Christians from comprehending the systematic and structural sin of apartheid.

The presentation of the Open Letter by Bishop Aula and Moderator Gowaseb to Prime Minister Voster in 1971 represented a watershed in the role of the church in the politics of Namibia. It forced the white community to recognise church leaders as major players in Namibian politics. A meeting was arranged between Prime Minister Vorster and delegations from ELOC and ELC in Windhoek on August 18 1971. The most important consequence of the Letter, however, was the political conscientization of the major sections of the black population.

Drawn to the frontlines of opposition and with no support available from other institutions of civil society, the churches looked to each other for support. In 1972 ELOC and ELC joined together in confederation to form the United Evangelical Lutheran Church of South West Africa (UELCSWA)24. In 1974 the Christian Centre was set up as a forum for ecumenical cooperation. It was later established as a fully-fledged ecumenical body, with connections to regional and international bodies such as the South African Council of Churches (SACC), the World Council of Churches (WCC), and the Lutheran World Federation (LWF).

On April 29-30 1986 the CCN sponsored a meeting of churches, opposition political parties, ethnic councils, and women and student's groups calling for independence. The /Ai//Gams Declaration called for Namibia's inalienable right to self-determination, the inviolability of the territorial integrity of the country and the obligations of the international community and that the UNSCR 43525 was the only peaceful and democratic way of achieving internationally recognised independence for Namibia. It called for the

24 To become the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Namibia (ELCIN) as it presently stands.
25 United Security Council Resolution435 sets forth the internationally accepted plan for an end to the war and for the independence of Namibia.
abolishment of the TGNU. The /Ai//Gam declaration illustrated how important the Church had become in the political arena in the 15 years since the Open letter. It was the only institution capable of bringing together the opposition groups/parties in a united front against the South African regime (Steenkamp 1985).

As South African repression intensified, the CCN emerged as the most powerful political force in the internal opposition. Indeed it can be suggested that the CCN was in fact the internal wing of SWAPO (Steenkamp 1995). It initiated political actions, continued to offer assistance to victims of repression, and was involved in assisting the community at large with relief and development programmes. Owing to the absence of a representative Government, the CCN was playing both the role of parallel Government and opposition party. By 1985 the CCN was organised into five departments: communications, diaconical (social welfare and legal aid), education, development, and theology. The CCN became the only channel of assistance from external, international sources via the WCC, on which it was totally dependent26 (Steenkamp 1985).

Women were also deeply involved in the deconstruction of apartheid. Even prior to the formation of the OPO/SWAPo, women were taking part in peaceful demonstrations against the apartheid Government. Nora Chase (1989) reminds Namibians that it was women who initiated the march to the Municipality to protest against the relocation of people from the "Old Location", who refused to carry passes, and that it was a woman, Mrs. Mungunda who set fire to the car of the superintendent of the "Old Location" and who was shot, wounded and eventually killed. Chase (1989) also reminds Namibians that while Jacob Marengo may be remembered as

---

26 Steenkamp (1985) documents that in 1985, of the CCN’s total budget of R2.2 million (US $ 1.7 million) only 2.2% was raised by local sources. Foreign donors provided the rest. In 1989, this increased only to 2.6% (of R8.6 million or US $4.3 million).
the first guerrilla, his wife was also there, fighting beside him and it was in fact his wife that was shot and killed first.

After SWAPO was formed and began gaining mass support across ‘tribal’, racial and religious lines, SWAPO became a constant target of harassment by the regime of South Africa. Its leaders were imprisoned without trial and many were murdered. Many fled across the border to Angola, Botswana, and Zambia and further into Tanzania. Their fleeing husbands often left women alone. They became the target of South African harassment; raped and tortured to reveal the whereabouts of their men. Women could not escape as easily abroad due to their responsibilities for their family. But a few women escaped and joined SWAPO-in-exile to fight South Africa. When SWAPO started the armed struggle, women of Namibia played an important role in supporting the freedom fighters. Although they did not at that time participate as combatants, the role was that of accommodating and feeding the fighters (Hishongwa 1983).

Women became an important channel of information about the movements of the enemy forces. They hid combatants, weapons and ammunition. From the 1970’s the participation of women in the liberation struggle increased. Women took an active and important part in organising rallies and meetings. Women more and more became direct targets of South African repression. Women took it upon themselves to mobilise and inform people of why SWAPO had engaged in armed resistance against South Africa. In 1970, the SWAPO Women’s Council was formed. The aim of creating a woman’s wing was to give women an acknowledged role and full responsibility to mobilise Namibian women for the full and active participation in the struggle for national and social liberation (Hishongwa 1983).

This important political role was mirrored in the Council of Churches of Namibia. In 1984 a women’s meeting was held at the African Methodist Episcopal (AME) church in Katatura. Out of that meeting the Namibian Women’s Voice (NWV) and the Young Women’s Christian Association (YMCA) was established. In 1985 the CCN sponsored a group of Namibian
women to attend the United Nations Decade for Women Conference in Nairobi, Kenya. These women were encouraged to take up action when they returned home. The Women’s Desk was created in 1987 for women in the CCN member churches to work hand-in-hand with one another and other women’s organisations on an ecumenical level (CCN Report of the Ecumenical Decade launch in Namibia 1988).

One of the first activities the CCN Women’s Desk became involved with was to launch, in cooperation with the Women’s Desk of the World Council of Churches, the “Ecumenical Decade 1988-1998: Churches in Solidarity With Women”.

Dr. Shejavali, General Secretary of the CCN at the time, opened the Ecumenical Decade Launch by elaborating on the oppression of women by men. He emphasised that men and women are equal before ‘God’ and that women and men alike must come together to solve the problems faced under apartheid and the transition to independence (CCN Report of the Ecumenical Decade launch in Namibia 1988).

The church and the CCN thus played a crucial role in the political emancipation of Namibia, but arguably, its most important role was in supporting Namibian people, psychologically and emotionally decimated by long years of brutal repression and deprivation, with a theology of liberation. The negative spirituality used by colonial and missionary forces had been effectively countered.

4.5 Reconciliation and Reconstruction: Spirituality Once Again Repressed?

In post-independence, Namibian people gained not just their political autonomy, but more importantly, the right to define their own identity. It will be seen that the interplay of political, economic and spiritual dimensions in this identity is highly complex. On one hand there is seemingly yet another suppression of spirituality as the new Government juxtaposes the need for
economic development with social justice. On the other there are the efforts of civil society, particularly the church, to build a new (hybrid) Namibian identity; merging the past, present and future.

Formal reconstruction began on 21 March 1990 when Namibia gained its independence and installed its first black majority government. It was a time of jubilant celebration for all those that had suffered innumerable years of brutal oppression, violent warfare and enforced and lonely exile. And yet just when a profound healing should have been expected, spirituality was suppressed. The new Government asked Namibians to forget the past and forgive without 'true' reconciliation. A brief description of the philosophies of the new and the very real economic struggles it faced at the time of independence, provides the rational for 'suppressed spirituality'.

The Draft Transitional National Development Plan 1991/92-1993/94 (TNDP) is the first documentation of the design that reconstruction in the new country would follow. The introduction of the TNDP describes the philosophy of the Government:

Namibia is in transition. Our independence from South Africa on March 21 1990 signalled the start of a bold social transition. After a century of German and then South African colonial rule, Namibian society embarked on changes whose aim was to overcome the problems caused by war, racial divisions and inequalities and create a nation where all could live together as equals in peace and prosperity. ....For all progress loving people, the changes now underway in Namibia represent an attempt to put into practice the highest ideals of humanity (TNDP p. viii).

The TNDP is underlain by the overall philosophy of change - transition from a system of oppression and exploitation of the majority to one which is aimed at eradicating inequality and poverty - transition in the sense of having to create new institutions, pass new laws, identify new spending priorities and effect new policies. The changes needed, in a country that had inherited what is considered to be the worst inequalities of opportunity and material wealth
in the world, were known to be immense. Radical economic and social transformation would be key.

Yet the Government also recognised the need for democracy - consultation with the people of Namibia so that they could be involved in the formation of national policy, and also the need to protect the segment of the population who, although they were part of the old administration, needed reassurance that their lives would not be destroyed. The Government requested that these people should not leave Namibia at independence, since their skills and wealth would be needed to forge a new country for the betterment of all. Thus the Constitution guaranteed the rights of the white population in terms of Article 141 which provided for the retention of jobs of those employed by the previous administration and Article 16 which guaranteed the right to private property and only allowed nationalisation subject to just compensation.

The Government was convinced that economic growth and efficient production could be best achieved largely by the private sector and through entrepreneurial activity by private individuals. Thus it chose a liberal democratic form of government to run the country. The contribution of the Government would be through its role as the allocator of a major portion of the country's resources and its function in creating an enabling environment conducive to economic activity and investment (TNDP p. viii). The primary objective of the new Government of Namibia became the reduction, in the medium term, of the income disparity inherited from apartheid without undue damage to the economic machinery still in the hands of white ownership. This became the policy of national reconciliation adopted by the new nation of Namibia.

National reconciliation served to promote peace but perhaps at the expense of the poor majority as in the past. The Government was criticised for preserving the peace at the cost of the betrayal of the people who fought for liberation and who ultimately voted the SWAPO party into office (Leys & Saul 1985). Thus to temper national reconciliation, the Government
instituted affirmative action or the active promotion of previously disadvantaged Namibians, especially women, in all sectors of society. The TDNP states:

National reconciliation and affirmative action are necessary preconditions to furthering the cause of nation building, creating a sense of unity among a diverse and previously divided community. The need for affirmative action for women is especially recognised. The TDNP writes that gender discrimination is one of the most important development issues in Namibia and a subject for both private and public action. ... Clearly, democracy and development will have little meaning if they do not lead to the improvement of the situation of women in Namibia (TDNP p. 3)

Reconciliation in Namibia is problematic because the political economy of Namibia is trying to mediate two distinctly opposite needs and interests. Despite substantial reforms to Namibia’s political and legal systems, its overall political economy is characterised by extreme disparities in wealth and poverty and high and permanent unemployment. Apartheid laws, upon which the exploiters – the mining corporations, fishing companies, banks and white farmers benefited during South African administration, have proven to be entrenched to the extent that they can survive even major changes in the law. Removing racial discrimination from the land purchase law, for example, makes little difference by itself to white economic power since whites already own most good farmland and only a small minority of blacks have a chance of raising the necessary capital to buy farms. It is not hard to see the potentially deep and dangerous political alienation the SWAPO Government faces in the 3000 unemployed youths, the 500 children begging on the streets, the thieves and burglars and dealing stolen goods in the townships, the unemployed ex-combatants in their so-called “Development Brigades”, the great pool of unemployed people in the communal areas, especially in the north, including most of the 50,000 who had returned from exile (Leys & Saul 1995; Simon & Moorsom 1987).

The key issue of reconciliation and reconstruction that Namibia faced at the time just after independence, and still faces, argues Leys & Saul (1995), points
to a larger concept of development and how it may be approached within the system of political economics that now dominates the world. They argue that there are contradictions between what SWAPO as a liberation force and as the new Government, whose very existence represents justice for the people of Namibia, can do. Namibia has been integrated into a political economy that simply is not built on justice, but rather economic exploitation of classes. Thus what the Government says it should do and probably wants to do, and what it can do, shows so well, the floundering concept of development that the world as a whole is faced with. Leys & Saul (1995) question whether development is even possible within this framework.

I would argue that another key issue is the hidden and much less tangible effect on the spirituality of the people and the new nation. Three years into independence, the new Government sponsored, in partnership with the CCN, a national conference on reconciliation and reconstruction in an effort to forge a new, non-racial, harmonious identity for Namibia. The Government perspective, as declared by Prime Minister Geingob, on reconciliation is that it must be based on:

... bringing together estranged communities, estranged politically, militarily or socially, into one non-antagonistic whole, all working towards a common goal of making a better Namibia. Reconciliation requires a change of heart, change of thinking, change of mentality, and change of attitudes that have been embedded in the psyche of our people over decades (Geingob 1993 p. 13).

He continues:

However, reconciliation cannot be fulfilled unless there is an accompanying economic upliftment of our people. Reconciliation is only possible through the continued assurance of investment and job creation. Reconciliation minimises areas of conflict and therefore brings about peace, and creates a climate where we learn to accept each other as equals. This climate in turn helps economic development, job creation and ultimately the pursuit of happiness for all (Ibid p.13).
To the Government, the liberal democratic model of governance is perfectly compatible with this concept of reconciliation.

However, in my interviews with CCN staff, church leaders, and development agents in the case study area, there is not a consensus on the ability of people brutally repressed, to forgive and forget easily. Many respondents pointed to the high suicidal and alcoholism rates in the north as indicative of very deep psychological and spiritual scars. Before there can be forgiveness, there is a need to reconcile the past. However, the past is what the Government is so vigorously attempting to forget, for a number of reasons.

The first has been discussed. The Government needs to maintain a stable economic environment that assures the security of its minority white population yet attempts to provide for the needs of the black majority. To do this, it needs black and whites to forget past differences in forging a new consciousness of shared goals.

Dr. Melber, Director of the Namibian Economic Research Unit at the University of Namibia claims that the Namibian way of reconciliation is mainly used a “an argumentative means to silence controversial debates. The necessary and essential discussion about values, ethics, morals and other issues in demand of an exchange of different opinion and sometimes even highly conflicting viewpoints, is blocked with the reference to the needs for reconciliation” (Melber 1993 p, 25). Melber (1993) argues that the Namibian concept of reconciliation has been:

... hijacked by those who either actively contributed to or at least passively benefited from the evils of the colonial system of oppression. National reconciliation is abused as a protective shield to resist the introduction of necessary discourses. It has become ‘racial reconciliation’ to maintain the status quo” (Ibid, p. 25).

This is exemplified by the guarantee in the constitution of the continuity of public employment. The Namibian Government was forced to inherit a public administrative system that would prove resistant to change, at best,
indifferently passive and at worst, hostile. It was considered to be generally incompetent and had loyally served the apartheid administration based in Pretoria. Melber (1993) argues that true reconciliation means not to deny history. To deny history means to deny the identity and experience of the other, with whom we have to reconcile.

The second reason the Government is trying to forget the past is deeply embedded in the detainee issue. Unlike the African National Congress of South Africa, SWAPO has remained silent on its role in the human rights abuses associated with the detainees. The detainee issue needs some explanation.

Groth's book, *Namibia - The Wall of Silence* (1995) provides this explanation. In the 1970's many Namibians fled into exile to the settlements in Zambia and Angola. These exiles were on the whole, young, and full of vigour to see the end of South African rule. They were confronted by the very poor conditions of the camps. They saw that many children, pregnant women and soldiers fighting in the bush were suffering from malnutrition. There was a shortage of food, and virtually no medicine. There was no organisation or leadership coming from the SWAPO military. They learned that the SWAPO leaders in Lusaka were living in relative comfort. There were also no weapons with which these young men and women could fight. The exiles also included members of the SWAPO Youth Leagues and their leaders. There were now two sets of leaders, the old and the new. The first stirrings of rebellion emerged.

The new leaders had high expectations both of the old leaders and of themselves. And the longer the leaders of the SWAPO Youth League spent in Angola and Zambia, the more they came face to face with the deficiencies and mismanagement of SWAPO in exile. The young were distressed at the corruption and nepotism of the 'old guard'. An opposition began to form called the "fighters against corruption". They began to call for new leadership, including a Party Congress, greater democracy and more political competence. At the request of the SWAPO leadership, the Zambian Government intervened and suppressed the movement with violent means. Over one thousand insubordinate freedom fighters were taken to a prison camp while
eleven leaders were arrested and flown to a prison in Tanzania. Survivors of the Mboroma prison camp in Zambia, told of the horror of imprisonment, the starvation and the atrocities of torture. It is still unknown how many men, women and even children and babies lost their lives in the camp. The prisoners were eventually released but they lived as exiles within an already exiled community. One prisoner described his life as over. “I am constantly in fear. My whole life is shattered. I am an outcast, without rights or protection, a SWAPO dissident, a Namibian who has been rejected by his liberation movement” (Groth 1995, p. 57). The lives of the dissidents were constantly threatened. Numerous dissidents were killed in isolated attacks as well as attacks on centres where dissidents tended to gather. The fortunate ones sought special status with UN and were transferred quickly out to sympathetic countries.

Prior to this SWAPO crisis, the church had been endeavouring to administer to the spiritual needs of the exiled settlements in Zambia, Angola, Tanzania and wherever concentrations of Namibian exiles warranted their attention. Thousands of Namibian faced separation from their home, and in many cases most or all of their families (Groth 1995). The relationship between the church and SWAPO was good. Many pastors fought alongside soldiers praying with them before each battle and believing that the presence of the white collar would protect them. But in 1976, during the SWAPO conflict, the Christian ministry in exile almost collapsed. A form of church in exile came into being which was shaped and affected by the structures of SWAPO. Total obedience was demanded of the pastors. The SWAPO leaders tried to convey a positive image of the developments in SWAPO and especially within the church in exile. Namibian church leaders were only allowed to move in Zambia under the strict supervision of the SWAPO leaders (Groth 1995). The church was well aware of the human rights abuses the SWAPO party was committing, but did nothing to help the detainees. When they were freed, the Namibian church officially distanced themselves from the dissidents. A few individual pastors aligned themselves with the group. Groth (1995) describes the fact that there was now a SWAPO church and a
dissidents’ church. Thus the church took on a complicit role in suppressing spirituality. With independence, however, the church began to acknowledge the problematics of its complicit role.

The detainee issue and the broader dilemma of reconciliation have caused much friction between the once stalwart partners, the church and the state. This was due to the changing role of the church after independence. After independence, the church took a less prominent role in Namibian society as peace and the disappearance of the enemy lessened the intensity of need for assistance and support and the Government and secular organisations took over the socio-economic functions that the church had carried out. Donor funds were directed to the Government and to non-governmental organisations. Church attendance dropped dramatically, in some cases as much as 75 per cent (Steenkamp 1995).

It is questionable whether this drop in attendance is entirely attributable to the position of the church on the detainee issue or to other forces affecting the position of religion and the church in post-independent Namibian society. This possibility, and the efforts that the church is making to re-position itself will be discussed shortly.

Overall, only a small element of SWAPO PLAN members were detained in SWAPO prison camps. The demise of the enemy and the need for spiritual support to continue the struggle for independence should also seen to be a significant factor. My own interviews with CNN staff, however, indicated their belief that the detainee issue is a significant factor in the demise of the church and in the increasing tension between the church and the state. Much bitterness was caused by the ‘detainee episode’. People dedicated themselves to the SWAPO party for their own cause, but they also believed in the leadership of the party. When they were imprisoned and then shunned by the majority of their comrades, disillusionment quickly turned to bitterness. The church, except for a few individual pastors, remained in alliance with the SWAPO party, accepting the political line that South African forces were attempting to hijack the independence movement. With no support, spiritual
or otherwise, the detainees faced despair, alienation, and fear alone in a hostile and sometimes violent environment.

Groth’s (1995) book details the stories of the detainees. Following publication and the spreading of the factual details of the detainee case both nationally and internationally, the relationship between the church and the state was also to deteriorate. Elements of the church began a process of reviving its prophetic voice, owning up to its responsibility in the silence surrounding the detainee issue. At a church convention, clergymen asked that a truth commission be set up to probe the accusations. Sam Nujoma, President of Namibia, appeared on Namibian television to address the allegations. He charged that the book was a one-sided story with lies and that the pastor (Siegfried Groth) was “never a friend of SWAPO” and therefore not a champion of the liberation cause. Since the pastor was not ashamed of writing these ‘untruths’, he, the President of Namibia, was stepping in to set the record straight in order to maintain “social order” (Denford Megora, “Namibia reconciliation up against the ropes”, Mail and Guardian March 15 1996).

Nujoma also issued a statement to the effect that anyone loyal to SWAPO should not attend any conference sponsored by the CCN, causing the cancellation of a CCN sponsored conference on reconciliation (Zoe Titus, “President urged ‘heal the land, heal yourself’”, The Namibian October 20 1997).

This did not stop certain individuals in the CCN. They had already realised that its silence on the issue had alienated a substantial portion of Namibian society. Samson Ndeikwila, Director of Social Justice Cluster of the CCN became the chair of a movement called Breaking the Wall of Silence (BWS) which was started by a number of former detainees. The movement’s agenda was to resolve the issue of past human rights abuses either through the extension of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission headed by Archbishop Desmond Tutu to Namibia, or some other inquiry. It emphasised that the detainee issue would never be resolved unless SWAPO
opened a dialogue with the aggrieved members of the society (Tabby Moyo, “BSW dams Swapo stance on detainees”, The Namibian June 27 1997).

Speakers at the 1997 annual BSW general meeting, including Dr. Mampule Ramashala, a member of South Africa’s Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) emphasised that without communication, acknowledgement and forgiveness, the country could not move forward. Dr. Joseph Diescho, Namibian political analyst, told the BSW meeting, “the detainee issue weighs heavily on the psyche of the new Namibian personality because it brings back pain and suffering” (Tabby Moyo, “BSW dams Swapo stance on detainees”, The Namibian June 27 1997).

However, in an interview with the General Secretary of the CCN, Ngeno Nakamhela told me that the BSW movement was not the official stance of the CCN even though a CCN staff member was chairing it. He believed that forceful confrontation with the Government was not the best means to effect reconciliation in the country. Forgiveness would be motivated by love, not by more war (author’s interview, June 1997).

Overall, ‘suppression of memory’ has been used by the Government to forge a path of reconciliation and reconstruction for the independent Namibia. As will be seen in Chapter Six, some of the respondents, including members of the CCN, believe that this suppression has caused a spiritual demise amongst Namibians resulting in social alienation, crime, violence, and alcoholism.

For example, a study on social development issues in northern Namibia (Shigweda 1993) shows that there is a high rate of alcoholism in the north. Out of 564 households, seventy per cent stated that they knew people who used alcohol ‘excessively’ and had lost their jobs or been hospitalised, contributed to child abuse or neglect resulting in family fighting and divorce. A few of the CCN members I interviewed argued that the high rate of alcoholism in the north, and they argued, all over Namibia, is evidence that people cannot just forgive and forget. A reconstructed Namibia requires a truly reconciled one.
Yet it would be wrong to describe the ‘state of Namibian spirituality’ at this juncture in Namibian development as exclusively repressed. The very existence of the BSW movement shows the dynamics of a society dealing with complex issues that involve not just political retribution but more importantly, spiritual renewal.

This can also be seen in the efforts that the church is making to re-identify itself, to capture once again the heart and soul of the Namibian people. In 1993, a workshop and festival entitled “Worshipping God as Africans” was undertaken to “bring about renewal in our churches by respecting and incorporating African cultural elements in our Christian worship; so that authentic African expressions, based on sound spiritual and ethical foundation, could be developed for the celebration and worshipping of God” (Lombard 1995, p. 8). The workshop was intended to “seriously address the relationship between Christianity and people’s cultural heritage and identity” (Ibid, p. 8).

The workshop was grounded in the understanding that the people of Namibia had been colonised for more than one hundred years and that during these years, the authentic culture and religion of Namibia had been greatly damaged. It was also understood that most Namibian Christians are living in two worlds. On one hand they are Christians, on the other they strong supporters of their cultures and ‘traditions’. They do not know how to reconcile these two worlds. Christian churches have actually made a very shallow penetration in converting the African, with his/her historical-cultural roots, social dimensions, self-consciousness and expectations. Thus there is a need amongst Namibians, as Christians and Africans, to initiate a dialogue between Christianity and African ‘traditional’ religion to liberate and deepen worship of God as Africans.

An African theology will thus provide a way for Namibians to worship God within authentic African religious expression and experience, with freedom to pray, worship, sing, dance, chat and practice communion in ways that God has given them, through their culture and history.
However, a number of difficulties were also acknowledged. First, it was recognised that Namibia cannot go back to being 'traditional' just for 'tradition's' sake. The search for an African identity must also address the perspectives of the youth seeking a fresh and modern identity. The fear that neo-colonial influences coming in from the West, via trade, media, advertisements, and other manipulations may be too strong for Africans ideas to develop freely was also recognised. Relatedly, it was also recognised that the ever-increasing trend towards secularism and materialism might result in a casual and indifferent attitude towards both Christian and African values.

Thus the examination of the process of reconciliation and reconstruction demonstrates a complex dynamic of 'experiences of spirituality'. On one hand the new Government, once the embodiment of the Namibian spirit of liberation is now ignoring and repressing the spiritual health of its people in order to forge ahead with economic development. On the other hand Namibian people are in dire need of a 'true' spirit of reconciliation before reconstruction or Namibian identity can be achieved. The detainee issue weights heavily on the relationship between the Government and civil society. The church is seeking to heal this relationship by reconstructing its own prophetic identity. How does international development affect this complex dynamic?

4.6 Spirituality Transformed

The overview of Namibia showed that there are indications that Namibians continue to struggle with the impact of 'experiences of spirituality' perpetrated by colonialism and missionary activity. Some Namibians also face the perception of betrayal at the hands of their own leaders. Yet Namibians also must hold fierce pride in the knowledge that they fought for and gained their independence in the face of brutal oppression. They found the spiritual strength to overcome apartheid, one of the most dehumanising systems of oppression the world has seen. Through it all, the pre-colonial identity of Namibians has persevered. Certainly it does not remain unchanged. Certainly it does not remain intact. However, what is important is that many
Namibians have kept what was essential to their identity and carried it into their new post-independence identity. When colonisers imposed the migrant labour system, Namibians fled the country to form a government in exile. When missionaries forced Namibians to convert, they adapted Christianity to suit their belief in ‘Kalunga’ and ancestral spirits. In time, Namibians used the Christian ‘God’ to lend a theological doctrine to their struggle for independence. They have embarked on yet another challenge to maintain their values in the wake of increasing Western influence and development.

Thus the ‘experiences of spirituality’ in Namibia show that Namibians have endeavoured to maintain their essential identity while adapting and transforming it to pursue their survival, pride and spirituality. It is clear that there is, and always has been, a counteracting (popular) force in civil society able to oppose brutal colonial exploitation. This force continues to reconstruct Namibian identity and to ensure that this spirit is renewed.

Does then the idea that international development assistance is harming Namibia’s development, more specifically its spirituality, have any foundation? This shall be the focus of Chapters Five and Six.
Chapter 5

International Development: Suppression of Spirituality in Namibia?

5.0 Introduction

It was noted in Chapter One that development inspired by Northern agencies is grounded in a materialist perspective that leaves little room for other 'ontological' needs. Until very recently, spirituality has not been a concern for Northern development agencies. The implication is that recipient communities, without regard for 'spiritual' or other 'ontological' parameters, have had imposed upon them, a development model that is generally bereft of spirituality.

In this chapter I propose that Northern donor agencies suppress or damage the spirituality of recipient countries. Again, suppression of spirituality refers not to the dismissal of religious dogma or the right to practice 'a religion', but rather to the suppression of (the processes to define) Namibian identities, values, and the meanings and strategies of development.

This chapter will provide empirical data showing that recipients take issue with the way in which development projects structure relations between donors and recipients. It will be seen that the Namibian respondents are offended by the lack of respect accorded them by donors, and are dishonoured by the how their identity not just as Namibians but as humans is compromised by donors. It will be shown that the Namibians feel that involvement in development projects compromises their dignity, their identity and even their very 'humanness'. True development, they articulate, is premised first and foremost on people. It respects and cares for the person and the community, their identity and their feelings. Most of all development must be founded on respectful relations. Without a 'spirit of community' development is meaningless; merely a material process rather than a true process of empowerment. It will be seen the recipients do not even consider the achievement of material benefits, perhaps the major goal of
donors, to be satisfactory. In fact they find the acquisition of these material benefits, and thus the entire development project, demeaning.

Further evidence that development has a negative impact on the spirituality of recipient countries may be found in the fact that a distinct gap exists between the rhetoric of Northern development policy, and the actual practice of development projects. The literature review in Chapter One demonstrated the ubiquitous nature of the rhetoric of empowerment, participation and partnership amongst the development policies of the Western donors. The review, however, also provided evidence that despite such rhetoric, donors continue to hold much of the power and control over the way development is structured and implemented. Thus there is a distinct gap between rhetoric and reality. It is within this gap that the impetus for a new concept and practice of development, a spirituality and development, is catalysed.

The proposition that development, as it is currently structured, has a negative impact on the spirituality of Namibians will be supported in two ways in this chapter. First I examine the profile that international development assistance holds in Namibia and I demonstrate how Namibian development policy, specifically in the water sector, converges with international water policies. This convergence provides evidence of the strong influence, if not control, that international donor assistance has on Namibian development policies.

Second, I seek to show how in two external support projects in northern Namibia, project structures and processes construct unequal relations between the donor and the recipients. I provide an overview of the policy environments and delivery approaches of the Northern donor agencies supporting the two development projects in the case study area. A number of project experiences are then described and analysed in order to document concrete ways in which donor-recipient relations are constructed. The perspectives of provide substantive evidence of recipient dissatisfaction with donor-recipient relations and how external support projects are conducted.
Together, the convergence of development policy and the unequal relations in two development projects in Namibia demonstrate clearly the dominance of the donor over the recipient despite policy that states otherwise. Most importantly, the views of Namibians as to the conduct and real benefits of the development projects and provide evidence that development is having a negative impact on the spirituality of Namibia.

5.1 Donor Profile in Namibia

Since independence, there has been a major influx of donor money and external support programmes and projects to Namibia. The first Round Table Conference with Namibia's donors was held in Geneva in November 1995. The main objectives of the conference were to review Namibia's development objectives, strategies and policies for the period 1995-2000 as presented in NDP1 and to seek technical and financial assistance. The Conference expressed a clear expression of support from the donors for Namibia's development goals and strategies.

Table 5.1 shows the disbursement of donor assistance from 1990-1996.

Table 5.1 Total External Assistance to Namibia, 1990-1996 (US$ Thousands)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total External Assistance (US$ to the closest 000)</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>111,000</td>
<td>140,000</td>
<td>120,000</td>
<td>105,000</td>
<td>180,000</td>
<td>170,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 5.2 gives an indication of the macro-economic importance of external assistance to Namibia since independence.

Table 5.2 Macro-economic Importance of External Assistance to Namibia 1990-1996

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>External assistance (US$m)</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>117.1</td>
<td>130.5</td>
<td>128.6</td>
<td>118.5</td>
<td>160.5</td>
<td>166.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External assistance per capita (US$)</td>
<td>47.0</td>
<td>78.0</td>
<td>95.5</td>
<td>86.4</td>
<td>79.1</td>
<td>99.6</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External assistance as % of current government</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>16.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The disbursements by foreign donors have averaged 4.6% of GDP per annum. Since 1991, external assistance has been equivalent to some 12% of current public expenditures. Thus international development assistance has a high profile in Namibian development. Compared to other southern African countries, Namibia receives the third highest amount of aid, at US$ 78.1 per capita, following Zambia at US$ 90.8, and Botswana at US$ 79.9.

5.2 Convergence of Development Policy in the Water Sector

A strong convergence of both ideas and language is readily apparent between international and Namibian policies in the water supply and sanitation sector, not least is the emphasis placed on (using water development as a means to achieve) economic development. Since the two projects studied in the case study are water and environmental sanitation projects the following brief outline of international and Namibian water supply and sanitation policies also provides useful background material.

5.2.1 International Water Sector Policy

An overview of international water policy is provided by the DFID\textsuperscript{1} "Guidance Manual on Water Supply and Sanitation Programme" (DFID 1998). The manual provides a comprehensive overview of the set of common guiding principles in the delivery of improved WS & S\textsuperscript{2} services. These principles, the manual emphasises have been agreed to by all of the major actors in the sector and the donor community as a whole, through various inter-agency collaborative initiatives and forums such as the Water Supply and Sanitation Collaborative

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|c|c|c|c|}
\hline
Expenditure as % of GDP & 3.1 & 4.9 & 5.7 & 5.0 & 3.7 & 4.8 & 5.2 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\caption{External Assistance as % of GDP}
\end{table}

\textsuperscript{1} The Department for International Development, UK Government.
\textsuperscript{2} Water Supply and Sanitation
Council (WSSCC), the World Water Council (WWC), and the Global Water partnership (GWP) (DFID 1998). The manual outlines the four Guiding Principles of the Dublin Statement\(^3\) that serve as a common basis for policy dialogue among donors and partner governments. These include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Freshwater is a finite and vulnerable resource, essential to sustain life, development, and the environment.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Since water sustains life, effective management of water resources demands a holistic approach, linking social and economic development with protection of natural ecosystems. Effective management links land and water uses across the whole of a catchment area or aquifer.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2. Water development and management should be based on a participatory approach, involving users, planning, and policy-makers at all levels.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The participatory approach involves raising awareness of the importance of water among policy-makers and the general public. It means that decisions are taken at the lowest appropriate level, with full public consultation and involvement of the users in the planning and implementation of projects.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3. Women play a central part in the provision, management and safeguarding of water.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The pivotal role of women as providers and users of water and guardians of the living environment has seldom been reflected in institutional arrangements for the development and management of water resources. Acceptance and implementation of this principle requires positive policies to address women's specific needs and to equip and empower women to participate at all levels in water resource programmes, including decision-making and implementation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>4. Water has an economic value in all its competing uses and should be recognised as an economic good.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>With this principle, it is vital to recognise first the basic right of all human beings to have access to clean water and sanitation at an affordable price. Past failure to recognise the economic value of water has led to wasteful and environmentally damaging uses of the resource. Managing water as an economic good is an important way of achieving efficient and equitable use, and of encouraging conservation and protection of water resources.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Individual water supply and sanitation projects, regardless of geographical location are encouraged to be designed to reflect these principle and strategies.

---

\(^3\) As part of the preparations of the 1992 UN Conference on Environment and Development (The Earth Summit) in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, an International
5.2.2 Namibian Water Sector Policy

The Digest of Namibia Water Supply and Sanitation Sector Policy of the Government of Namibia (1993) outlines the Water and Sanitation Policy (WASP) ratified by the Cabinet on 21 September 1993. The Digest explicitly states its appreciation of the support received from an experienced international (Norwegian) consultant, Mr. Tore Lium. The Digest specifies that the WASP principles provide a firm set of guidelines and “principles in line with the increasing awareness being promoted internationally of the importance of all water resources, the value of water as a commodity and the necessity for any development of the sector to be undertaken in a sustainable manner” (Republic of Namibia 1993, p. 1).

The following overall long-term sector policy has been adopted:

| Essential water supply and sanitation services should become available to all Namibians and should be accessible at a cost which is affordable to the country as a whole. |
| The equitable improvement of services should be achieved by the combined efforts of the government and the beneficiaries based on community involvement, community participation and the acceptance of mutual responsibility. |
| Communities should have the right with due regard for the environmental needs and the resources available to determine which solutions and services are acceptable to them. Beneficiaries should contribute towards the cost of the services at increasing rates for standards of living exceeding the levels required for providing basic needs. |
| An environmentally sustainable development and utilisation of the water resources of the country should be pursued in addressing various needs. |

The overall sector objectives are stated as:

Conference on Water and the Environment was convened in Dublin, Ireland in January 1992.
The provision of improved water supply should:
- Contribute towards improved public health
- Reduce the burden of collecting water
- Promote community-based social development taking especially into account the role of women
- Support basic needs
- Stimulate economic development

The provision of improved sanitation should:
- Contribute towards improved health
- Ensure a hygienic environment
- Protect water sources from pollution
- Promote conservation of water
- Stimulate economic development

Thus it can be seen that Namibian water supply and sanitation policy intersects with international policy on all four fronts (as per the four guiding principles of the Dublin Statement). Namibian policy recognises water as an economic good. It recognises the need to involve communities in the management of water supplies and sanitation facilities. It recognises the important role of women in community-based water and sanitation development. And finally, it recognises the need for a holistic (accommodating various needs) environmentally sustainable approach to the development of water resources.

This convergence of Namibian development policy with the international policy is evidence of the control that Northern donor agencies have in stipulating the design of development in Namibia. With all of the challenges that Namibia faces in reconstruction and development, it is highly dependent on the international community for financial assistance. The international community, then uses this leverage to stipulate how Namibia should develop. Water sector projects for example, must follow such principles as community participation/management, payment for water, the central role of women, and appropriate technology, to name just a few.
This convergence in development policy also has the consequence that developing countries such as Namibia are usually 'forced' to rely on Northern expertise in order to implement or operationalise such development policies. This reliance on Northern expertise then opens the door to further donor control, as will be seen in the examination of development policy, delivery approaches and project experiences.

It is crucial here to assert that while the 'appropriateness' or 'goodness' of the development policies themselves can be debated (or not), this is not the argument presented in this thesis. Rather it is the gap between 'good intent' as encapsulated by 'sound development policies' and how these policies are concretely operationalised that is the focus of this chapter's analysis.

As will be seen in the following examination of the two external support projects, the policy environment and conceptual framework of the delivery approaches of the two donor agencies, as well as the conceptual framework (goals, objectives, strategies) of the individual projects, show 'good' intent. However, the ways in which the projects are operationalised, specifically the planning and analysis approach, the structure of the management systems and the community development approaches contradict the 'good' intent of the donor agencies and the projects. These project processes or methodologies largely support the control of the donor agency, despite policies emphasising empowerment and partnership. In my estimation, it is the contradiction, as well as the 'control orientation' inherent in project processes that affect the spirituality of recipients.

5.3 Donor-Recipient Relations

5.3.1 Policy Environments of GTZ and IBIS

5.3.1.1 GTZ

GTZ is an enterprise owned by the Government of the Federal Republic of Germany. It executes the development policies of the BMZ (Federal German Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development). The BMZ published its
most recent Concept for Development Policy in 1997 (The World of Words 1997). It states that the goal of German development policy is to improve the living conditions of people in the partner countries, especially those of poor sections of the population. This is geared to the aims of global sustainable development, designed to guarantee the development opportunities of today's generation without constraining those of future generations. Global sustainable development means pursuing three key objectives: (1) productive economic growth; (2) social justice; and (3) ecological sustainability.

The foci of German development cooperation are thus poverty alleviation, environmental protection and the conservation of natural resources, and education and training. Poverty alleviation measures are designed to foster the "productive capabilities and creative forces" (GTZ 1997, p.35) of the poor, and enable them through their own economic activities to create the "preconditions for their own advancement" (Ibid p.35).

A number of key principles complement these development foci, including 'minimum intervention', 'self-help-oriented poverty alleviation', gender approach, target-group orientation, participation, ownership, and empowerment. The principle of minimum intervention is based on the notion of that 'help towards self-help' is more effective when existing potentials in the partner countries are harnessed. Self-help poverty alleviation follows the measures designed to foster the productive capabilities and creative forces of the recipients.

The gender approach implies a systematic understanding of development embracing society as a whole. It draws attention to the different gender roles which society accords women and men, as reflected for example in the gender-specific task-sharing and distribution of workloads, inequality of access to and control over resources, or differences in the influence the two groups may exert on the political life of their country.

The GTZ meaning of participation is taken as the process in which various actors share and negotiate control over development initiatives, and the decisions and
resources associated with them. It claims the right of participation and benefit-sharing for previously excluded or marginalised groups. Participation is used by GTZ in two senses:

(1) At the level of objectives of technical cooperation projects, participation means supporting people in articulating and negotiating their interests at the social, institutional and political levels in the partner country.

(2) Participation as a management principle is based on the now widely acknowledged insight that processes of change are all the more successful, the more intensively the actors are appropriately involved in the design of project objectives and measures.

The World of Words (GTZ 1997) stipulates that depending on the project type and phase, different degrees of participation may be appropriate. For projects in which responsibility for processes of change or development rests with the target groups (i.e. the intended ultimate beneficiaries) themselves, it is absolutely essential that the latter participate as actively and as early on as possible in decision-making on development goals and project activities. Target group orientation means that the activities of a project are geared to the goals and needs of certain target groups and are designed to help enable those target groups to realise their wishes and objectives through their own efforts. For projects in direct contact with the ultimate beneficiaries and providing direct inputs to the beneficiaries' development processes, the best guarantee of target-group orientation is for target groups to participate as actively and as early on as possible in defining the project activities.

The term ownership is used by GTZ to designate identification with a project, along with the motivation to assume responsibility for development initiatives and processes of change. Ownership is considered by GTZ to be an important precondition for the efficiency and sustainability of development processes.

Empowerment is used by GTZ to denote the forms of collective action by marginalised and underprivileged groups which, by articulating and organising
their interests, wish to improve their position in social, economic and political decision-making processes, and exert corresponding influence on existing structures. Consequently, changes in the social, economic, legal and political institutions which embody the current relations of power play a key role in this process.

GTZ also stipulates political framework conditions that must be adhered to by recipient countries. Experiences of recent years have shown that unless there are certain political and economic framework conditions in place in the partner country, development cooperation measures will fail. Thus, the Federal German Government has determined five conditions as criteria for Germany's development cooperation. These include: (1) respect for human rights; (2) participation by the people in political decision making; (3) constitutional governance subject to the rule of law and the guarantee of legal stability; and (5) state action geared to development (GTZ 1997).

5.3.1.2 IBIS

IBIS is a Danish solidarity and development NGO that finds its funding through various sources, including DANIDA, the agency responsible for the execution of international development assistance of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Government of Denmark. IBIS has a number of well-defined objectives, which are:

(1) IBIS works in the South to promote empowerment of the poor, to strengthen their capacity for self-organization, and to increase their direct influence on their own living conditions.

(2) IBIS works to link popular organizations, professional and special interest groups in the South and in the North.

(3) IBIS works for the democratization of political power structures and wishes to promote social justice and a more even distribution of economic resources, both in cooperating countries and in a global context.
The overall aim of IBIS-supported programme activities is to improve economic or social living conditions. However, IBIS aims at a deeper dimension as well; working for the empowerment of the target groups so that their local organizations can be strengthened to be able to make decisions regarding the development of their own lives. This IBIS works for political and economic empowerment simultaneously. The ultimate success of projects is measured against the extent of empowerment of the target group, both men and women in the ability to strengthen their influence on their own living conditions.

In recognition of the limitations of the project as a sole impetus for equalization of well being between the North and the South, IBIS also focuses on creating a forum for dialogue between the North and the South about changing prevailing power structures and for devising alternative sustainable development models. IBIS work is thus underlain by four principles:

(1) Partnership is based on open discussion of values and objectives. Because IBIS support is intended to be long lasting and the ultimate aim is intended to be economic and political empowerment, IBIS determines that it is important that the partner and IBIS discuss their different goals, values and backgrounds before entering into agreements of cooperation.

(2) Collaboration begins with the joint definition of objectives, both long-term objectives and specific immediate project objectives, as well as the indicators that will be used to assess project achievement.

(3) The ongoing use of monitoring and adjustment activities, strategies and objectives, as well as the use of small-scale projects and pilot activities are emphasized before entering into larger cooperation projects.

IBIS sees that participation is the key element in all its programme activities. Participation is seen as the process whereby people have influence on the decisions, which affect their lives. In development cooperation, various actors are competing for influence, including the target group, local politicians, and northern NGO's. IBIS seeks to assure that the greater share of influence and
power will reside with the target group. The participation of the target group is seen not only as a necessary precondition for the success and sustainability of programme activity, but also an end in itself.

5.3.2 Delivery Approaches of GTZ and IBIS

GTZ and IBIS also follow a well-delineated approach in terms of ‘delivering’ development projects. For example, development projects will follow a project cycle, generally encompassing the stages of identification, preparation appraisal, negotiation and approval, implementation and evaluation. A description of the project cycle is given in Appendix 4.

To proceed through these stages, specific tools of project analysis and planning are used. Project planning and analysis tools have three main purposes. One, they initiate and maintain a flow within the project development process within a logical progression of events. Two, they provide a forum of communication, negotiation and reconciliation between all of the invited parties. Three, they provide a framework within which development projects can be elaborated on, including project goals, objectives, results, activities, and roles and responsibilities delegated. In short the project planning and analysis tools provide a logistical framework in which the projects can be managed, with all of the actors agreeing on concept, process and method.

GTZ and IBIS each have their own particular interpretation or model of delivery approach, including project cycle and project planning and analysis tools. A review of these is important to illustrate the extent of control given to the donor agency.

5.3.2.1 The GTZ Delivery Approach

The GTZ project cycle follows the basic cycle where a project idea is initiated by potential recipients, support is requested from the German Government, a preliminary offer is extended, an appraisal is undertaken, after which an appraisal report is prepared, an offer made, and a decision made on its implementation.
The project begins implementation and over a three-year period it undergoes an ongoing process of monitoring and evaluation before the final (ZOPP 5) assessment of its status and options for future implementation (another phase). Figure 5.1 shows the GTZ project cycle inclusive of its project planning and analysis method, or logistical framework analysis (LFA), called the ZOPP, or 'Objectives Oriented Project Planning'. An overview of the logistical framework analysis tool is given in Appendix 5.

Figure 5.1 GTZ Project Cycle

Methods and Instruments for Project planning and Implementation

ZOPP was introduced into the GTZ in 1983 as a compulsory planning tool for all GTZ projects. It forms the basis for project management and is used for the purpose of project preparation (ZOPP 1-3) and project implementation (ZOPP 4-5). It is a planning method that establishes at an early stage, in cooperation with the project participants, how the project is to be realized and what impacts it is intended to achieve. It is intended to promote the acceptance of the project and
can be seen as an essential prerequisite for ensuring that development processes achieve their objectives and are at the same time economically efficient and sustainable. It ensures a consistent train of thought and procedure and uniform understanding of the terms used. It thus facilitates communication and cooperation between all parties involved.

It is underlain by 3 principles:

(1) Cooperation between the project staff and the partner organizations is smoother and more productive if all involved have jointly agreed their objectives and expressed them clearly.

(2) In development cooperation it is important to solve or alleviate problems by tackling them at their roots - their causes. Therefore problems and their causes and effects must be analyzed together and feasible and expedient objectives deduced from these.

Problems and their causes do not exist in isolation, but are intimately linked with people, groups or organizations. Therefore problems can only be discussed within a comprehensive picture of and insight into the interest groups, individuals and institutions involved. The analysis attempts to extract typical perspectives of a situation that in reality is quite complex. These characteristics then become tangible and can be analyzed and worked on by the planning groups. Methods used in this analysis and planning process are simplified to make them applicable to practical project planning.

Table 5.3 details the ZOPP process within the overall project cycle. The chart reveals the form and extent of participation that all parties have in the overall process. The project idea originates within the potential recipient country, after which GTZ personnel with BMZ and KFZ resource persons explore the feasibility of the project and set out the broad parameters of the project. The appraisal stage also involves only GTZ staff and invited resource persons, usually from Germany or other GTZ project managers working in other countries. It is only at the ZOPP 3 stage of partner collaboration that the location shifts to the
Table 5.3 ZOPP Workshops

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ZOPP Workshop Steps</th>
<th>ZOPP 1 “Pre-ZOPP”</th>
<th>ZOPP 2 “Appraisal-ZOPP”</th>
<th>ZOPP 3 “Partner ZOPP”</th>
<th>ZOPP 4 “Start-ZOPP”</th>
<th>ZOPP 5 “Replanning ZOPP”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time input depending on size of the project</td>
<td>1 day</td>
<td>1-2 days</td>
<td>2-5 days</td>
<td>3-10 days</td>
<td>3-10 days</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning team (coordinator underlined)</td>
<td>Regional Department</td>
<td>Project Department</td>
<td>GTZ Head Office project liaison officer</td>
<td>Project team PS, project executing institutions, representatives of responsible ministry, head of PAS, usually, GTZ Head Office Project U Officer (PS), Head of GTZ PAS, external moderators</td>
<td>As in ZOPP 1, plus where applicable, appraisers, GTZ Head Office Project U Officer (PS), Head of GTZ PAS, external moderators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem analysis of objectives</td>
<td>As comprehensive as necessary but not too detailed, identify information gaps</td>
<td>Refer to ZOPP 1, but review gaps and mark where more information is required</td>
<td>答 open issues, evaluate the relevance of problems and objectives</td>
<td>Review the participation analysis, supplement where necessary, structure cooperation relationships if designing project, identify and assess alternatives, specify when redesigning project</td>
<td>Review in regard to the new problems encountered or modifications planned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of alternatives</td>
<td>Where sufficient information available, identify and evaluate alternative project approaches</td>
<td>Depending on contents of BMZ order</td>
<td>If overall goal and project purpose(s) cannot be achieved in appraisal result is to be possible, examine implementation alternatives at activity to a limited degree after results level</td>
<td>At activity level, if applicable, depends on the content of the implementation of order</td>
<td>Identity and assess alternatives, specify when redesigning project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Planning Matrix (PPM) summary of objective and activities</td>
<td>Overall goals, objectives, results, No activities</td>
<td>Preliminary statement of activities</td>
<td>Binding definition of overall goal, project purpose, results. State activities</td>
<td>Determine activities, plan of operation and possible detailed project-internal work planning</td>
<td>Restate again overall goal, project purpose, results and activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPM: assumptions</td>
<td>State assumptions are known</td>
<td>As in ZOPP 1</td>
<td>Clear definition of external factors, contributions and inputs by third parties, pre-conditions for project implementation.</td>
<td>Development of a plan to monitor assumptions</td>
<td>If necessary state new assumption and plan to monitor assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPM indicators and means of verification</td>
<td>Not yet applicable</td>
<td>Underline their importance, discuss examples</td>
<td>State main indicators</td>
<td>To be detailed and serve as a basis for monitoring</td>
<td>Details of new indicators and means of verification a necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPM specification of costs and inputs</td>
<td>Not yet applicable</td>
<td>Rough estimate</td>
<td>Details must be sufficient to be the basis for an offer for project implementation.</td>
<td>Detail planning, possibly for individual working areas</td>
<td>Detail planning for new approach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: GTZ ZOPP An Introduction to the Method 1988, p 3

205
partner country and representatives of the target group included can become involved in shaping the project design. By this time, the initial idea of a need has already been conceptualized broadly, a list of participant groups identified, and a preliminary outline of the objectives and activities drawn up. All this has been decided within the context of a board room in Germany and over a short period of two, one or two day workshops with the participation of only ‘First World’ experts. ZOPP 3 determines the participation in the project and reviews the analysis, goals, purpose, and results that have already been outlined.

It can be seen that it is only at the ZOPP 3 stage that representatives of the target group participate in the project planning and analysis process. This is a crucial point of analysis in regards to the differential power and control that donors have over recipients and shall be further discussed after the project experiences are examined.

5.3.2.2 The IBIS Delivery Approach

The IBIS Manuel of Methodology (1996) states explicitly its goal of trying to match development ideology, namely the overall goal of supporting political and economic empowerment, with method.

The IBIS project cycle has seven phases:

(1) Project ideas and proposals
(2) Preparatory study
(3) Appraisal and drawing up of project document
(4) Project implementation preparation and setting up of monitoring system
(5) Project implementation, reporting and monitoring
(6) Project reviews
(7) Project completion and evaluation

The IBIS project cycle starting from project implementation is given in Figure 5.2.
IBIS believes that the project cycle and LFA only provide guidelines on the overall methodology of the project. IBIS considers the LFA to be a valuable tool particularly in its ability to present project goals, objectives and activities within a logical framework matrix. However, IBIS believes that the uncritical use of the matrix may result in a bias towards blueprint thinking and dependence on quantitative goals and simplistic analyses. Also needed are a range of analysis, tools and approaches to guide specific implementation strategies and activities.

Thus IBIS combines the 'objective-oriented' project cycle approach with a
process-oriented planning approach which is based on three elements: (1) on-going monitoring and adjustment of activities, strategy and objectives; (2) use of small-scale and pilot activities before entering co-operation on larger projects; and (3) applying process objectives. Thus the process benefits from the use of a strong instrument for guiding a process involving many parties (possibly with conflicting interests) with encouragement for open debate on goals and results, while avoiding the rigidity of blueprint planning.

For this purpose, IBIS employs a complement of analysis and planning tools, including:

(1) Target group analysis sensitive to gender and social differentiation
(2) Analysis of problems, objectives, and resources
(3) Mapping and assessment of local organisations
(4) Stakeholder analysis
(5) Alternative analysis and project design
(6) Environmental analysis
(7) Gender Impact assessment
(8) Sustainability assessment
(9) Cost-effectiveness analysis

Again the implications of the delivery approach of IBIS in terms of donor-recipient relations, and the differences between the IBIS and GTZ approaches will be discussed following the examination of specific and concrete project experiences.

5.3.3 Overview of the Projects

The GTZ Sewage Water Awareness Management (SWAM) project and the IBIS Oshakati Human Settlement Improvement (OHSIP) project were both implemented in the region of Oshana of northern Namibia. Some background information on each of the projects will be offered to provide an understanding of
the projects' goals, objectives and activities. Table 5.4 offers a summary of the projects, including the (1) purpose and rationale; (2) context and problem analysis; (3) design and methodology; (4) institutional and administrative structure; (5) target population; (6) monitoring and evaluation parameters; and (7) costs and financing.

5.3.3.1 GTZ SWAM

The "Ovambo Water Supply and Sanitation" project began in June 1992 with the purpose to assist the regional and municipal administrations in the Oshana Region to work together with the residents to ensure the long-term supply of water, sanitation and waste disposal. It was later designated the name Sewage Water Awareness Management (SWAM) by the Government of Namibia. The project went into its second phase in 1995-1998 and a third phase was established for 1998-2001 (Proposal for Implementation of the Project Water Supply and Sanitation in Ovambo, Namibia 1991).

The project context focuses on the deficit of infrastructural development in the former 'homeland' areas due to the previous disregard of such areas by the colonial administrations. The South African army had installed water supply and sanitation systems for its posts in the towns of Oshakati, Ongwediva and Ondangwa, and had even provided free drinking water for the general population, however, these systems were now inadequate and even more importantly, the lack of revenue meant that no funds were available for operation and maintenance after the South African army withdrew nor were there any incentives associated with water conservation. Thus technical and social problems were associated with water supply and other basic services (Proposal for Implementation of the Project Water Supply and Sanitation in Ovambo, Namibia 1991).

The 1992 Local Authority Act decreed that local and regional administrations were to become responsible for the municipal administration of the three towns, including water and sanitation services. However, a lack of capacity within the
Table 5.4  SWAM and OHSIP Project Description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>SWAM</th>
<th>OHSIP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Project Purpose/Rationale | Assist regional/municipal authorities together with residents to ensure long-term supply of water, sanitation and waste disposal | • Improve the physical and social infrastructure in the slum areas of Oshakati on a sustainable basis.  
• Serve as a pilot project for the development and adjustment of the GRN's newly formulated National Housing Policy  
• Support the institutional development of local staff within the MRLGH and well as structures being developed for future local government bodies. |
| Context/Problem Analysis | Colonial disregard for area  
Current water supply and sanitation systems inadequate  
Lack of administrative capacity to manage water and sanitation services  
Lack of regional development may contribute to mass migration to Windhoek. | Over 50% of people living in the urban areas of Oshakati, Ongwediva and Onhavirua live in informal settlements with poor housing and little basic facilities. Opportunities for employment and income generation were low. The project sought to improve the welfare of the informal settlement population and to promote balanced regional development in Namibia. The project encompassed improved housing, provision of basic services including water, electricity, sanitation and roads, and strengthening community mobilization. Three-year pilot period started January 1993. Three inter-linked components included:  
• Implementation of slum improvement activities  
• Strengthening of local institutional structures  
• Contribution to the continued development of slum improvement policies. 
Eight major outputs of the project included:  
• Basic improvement of general infrastructure in the settlements  
• New sites and services including realignment of roads, reservation of open spaces, relocation of housing due to liability to seasonal flooding.  
• Private house upgrading  
• Organisation of community participation  
• Study on sustainable job creation  
• Institutional strengthening of local authority  
• Urban development planning  
• Contribution to the Namibian National Housing Policy. |
| Design/Methodology | 3 phases over 9 years  
Phase 1 focus on technical rehabilitation of wet services and guidance on institutional organisation, management and community involvement  
Phase 2 focus on decentralization policy to strengthen municipal administrations and initiate community involvement  
Phase 3 focus on consolidation of improved municipal management system, formulation of decentralization policy and framework, improved technical performance, and sustained participation of residents  
5 project "outcomes" including:  
- Management, organization and co-ordination of the wet services in the 3 towns improved  
- Namibian technical and administrative personnel upgraded  
- Priority infrastructure projects implemented or started  
- Facilities for operations and maintenance upgraded  
- Beneficiary population motivated to save water and use sewage system more efficiently by means of information and sensitisation. | |
### Institutional/Administrative Structure
- Executing agency: Ministry for Regional and Local Government and Housing (MRLGH)
- Support agency: GTZ
- Management Committee: composed of GTZ advisors, MRLGH, Town Clerk and Chief Lebwa
- Officer of the Directory of Community Development (DDC) of the MRLGH forms the decision-making mechanism

### Target Population
- Populations of the three towns of Oshakati, Ongwediva, and Ondangwa, in Oshana Region; and pilot communities in Omusati Region.
- Composite population of these towns - 90,000.
- Omusati Region encompasses 200,000 people.

### Monitoring and Evaluation Parameters
- Macro level impacts projected:
  - Improve regional development
  - Reduce migration to Windhoek
  - Reduce dependency of municipal administration on national budget
  - Reduce inter-settlement disparities between new towns and black settlements
  - Change social behaviour in regards to water use and environmental sanitation conditions
  - Support women's role in community
  - Water conservation would impact on overall ecological conditions in Namibia
- Micro-level project indicators are formulated to co-ordinate with specific project results and activities. These change throughout the project history as results and activities change.

### Costs and Financing
- Estimated total cost - DM 22 million
- Namibian contribution DM 11 million and two advisors
- German contribution DM 11 million

The total cost of the project was budgeted at N$ 13.53 million.


---

5 These results have changed slightly over the course of the project.
administrations was identified as a problem, in terms of technical, administrative or managerial and community liaison skills. Up to this point the Ministry of Regional and Local Government and Housing had taken full responsibility for reimbursing the Department of Water Affairs (Ministry of Water, Agriculture and Rural Development) using whatever revenue accrued from the town coupled with heavy subsidies by the Ministry. Consequently the SWAM project identified the lack of self-initiative and limited financial leeway of the towns to be problems needing intervention (Proposal for Implementation of the Project Water Supply and Sanitation in Ovambo, Namibia 1991).

It was also projected that as population expanded due to both natural growth and rural-urban migration, that the water supply and sanitation situation, if not expanded and improved, would prove grossly inadequate with its consequential health problems. If the regional situation was not improved this would also contribute to mass migration to urban centres in the southern central parts of the country, particularly Windhoek (Proposal for Implementation of the Project Water Supply and Sanitation in Ovambo, Namibia 1991).

The overall purpose of the project was thus to assist regional/municipal authorities together with residents, to ensure the long-term supply of water, sanitation and waste disposal. The specific objectives were to:

1. Improve the management, organisation and co-ordination of the wet services in the three towns;

2. Upgrade Namibian technical and administrative personnel;

3. Implement or start priority infrastructure projects;

4. Upgrade facilities for operations and maintenance; and

5. Motivate beneficiary populations to save water and use sewerage systems more efficiently by means of information and sensitisation (Ibid, p. 5).
The executing agency was designated the Ministry of Regional and Local Government and Housing (MRLGH). A Project Management Committee was formed to execute the project on a daily basis, consisting of GTZ advisors, MRLGH, Town Clerks, and the Chief Liaison Officer of the Directorate of Community Development (DCD). The Target population was recognised as the populace of the three towns of Ongwediva, Oshakati, and Ondangwa as well as pilot communities in the Omusati Region. The communities both formal and informal of the three towns of Oshakati, Ongwediva and Ongangwa of the Oshana region, with target communities specified in the Omusati Region (Proposal for Implementation of the Project Water Supply and Sanitation in Ovambo, Namibia 1991).

5.3.3.2 The OHSIP Project

The OHSIP project was formulated to improve the physical and social infrastructure in the slum areas of Oshakati on a sustainable basis. According to the 1991 National Census, some 43% of the total population of Namibia lived in the former Ovamboland area. Situated within this area is the Oshakati/Ongwediva/Ondangwa urban nexus that underwent rapid population growth during the latter years of the war for national liberation. The departure of the occupying forces caused a number of economic and social changes in the region. People were more able to migrate from the impoverished rural areas to the towns, causing a sharp increase in unemployment. A study by the University of Namibia showed that up to 90% of the population of these settlements was unemployed causing rapid out-migration to urban centres in the south and to Windhoek (Frayne et al 1993). Indications uncovered in the study showed that unless some measures were found to stimulate the economic growth and produce means of income generation, the economy of the region would regress. The general trend in unemployment would likely to lead to escalation of crime and ultimately political unrest. The study also showed that over 80% of the population live in informal settlements where housing conditions were extremely poor and basic facilities nearly non-existent. The future living conditions of the shanty areas would, to a large extent, depend on the generation of income earning
opportunities in the area (Frayne et al 1993).

The OHSIP project was also intended to serve as a pilot project for the development and adjustment of the Government’s newly formulated National Housing Policy (MRLGH/WUS Denmark of the Project Proposal Updating Mission November 1992). Additionally the project aimed to support the institutional development of local staff within the Ministry of Regional and Local Government and Housing as well as within structures being developed for future local government in the area.6

The specific objectives of the project, according to the 1992 report, were to:

1. Improve the physical and social infrastructure in the slum areas of Oshakati on a sustainable basis;
2. Serve as a pilot project for the development and adjustment of the Government of Namibia’s (GRN) newly formulated National Housing Policy; and
3. Support the institutional development of local staff within the MRLGH and those structures being developed for future local government bodies.

To achieve these objectives, the project developed a two-fold implementation strategy that encompassed:

1. The mobilisation and enablement of the residents of four informal settlements in Oshakati; and
2. The environmental upgrading of the settlements.

The project included eight main activities:

6 The OHSIP project was formulated just after Independence when a local government structure in Oshakati was not yet established. As such, no local authority development partner could be identified. The project initially established working relationships with traditional leaders and representatives of the CDCs set up by the Directorate of Community Development for the Drought Relief Programme. The appointment of a Town Clerk in November 1992 to the soon to be established Oshakati Town Council however, soon provided the necessary platform for a development partnership with the municipality.
(1) public infrastructure upgrading;
(2) private housing upgrading;
(3) site and service areas;
(4) urban development planning; and
(5) contribution to the development of the National Housing Policy.
(6) organisation of community participation;
(7) studies on sustainable job creation;
(8) institutional strengthening;

The target population encompassed the population of four informal settlements of the town of Oshakati.

The OHSIP project started its pilot project period in January 1993 and ended in December 1996 with no extension into a second phase (MRLGH/WUS Denmark of the Project Proposal Updating Mission November 1992).

5.3.4 Project Experiences

A brief chronology of my involvement in the two projects will provide the background for examining donor-recipient relations.

In June of 1994 I was asked to conduct a consultancy for the SWAM project under the context of the 'Awareness' component. The awareness component was the fifth identified 'result' of the project and was phrased as "motivate beneficiary populations to save water and use sewerage systems more efficiently by means of information and sensitisation" (GTZ Proposal for Implementation of the Project Water Supply and Sanitation in Ovambo, Namibia 1991, p. 2). The terms of reference of the consultancy were to conceptualise a strategic approach to achieving this first result.

There were, however, a number of problematic issues that needed to be considered in this conceptualisation. First there was a problem of 'utilising' the
resources of the Directorate of Community Development (DCD), who the project manager saw as "ladies just sitting in the office all day, not doing much". The DCD is the Government department mandated with community development under the Ministry of Regional and Local Government and Housing and in the SWAM project was designated as the counterpart agency mandated to implement the awareness component. Kauna Ekandjo, the Chief Liaison Officer of the Oshana and Omusati Regions, was in charge. Previously, SWAM had initiated two workshops in partnership with DCD on community participation and mobilisation, but Kauna Ekandjo had identified the need to have a more systematic approach to dealing with very difficult problems of community participation in environmental sanitation hygiene. Other agents in the three Town Councils were also expected to be involved.

The second problem identified by the project manager involved the relationship between the Oshakati Town Council and the population of the informal settlements. The OHSIP project had run into severe difficulties with the Town Council. The OHSIP project had been formed just prior to independence and had been conceptualised as a solidarity project in lieu of the fact that the South African administration was not taking care of the Namibian population's basic needs. The underlying goal of the project was to empower civil society to take care of its own needs. Institutional structures would be established to facilitate all legal, economic, political, and administrative functions. The overall thrust of the project design did not change when Namibia became independent. As was outlined, IBIS has a policy of working with communities anyway and did not probably perceive its project objectives to be threatening to the new Town Council. Beyond the politics of the project, they felt that 'giving' communities self-reliance would help the Government in the long term. However, in the short term, the Town Council did feel threatened by what they saw as the 'over-empowerment' of community development institutions established by the project. The Town Council put in an official complaint to the MRLGH who then called in DANIDA. The SWAM project manager emphasised that the strategy for the awareness component should not under any circumstances reinforce
these poor relations.

The third underlying problem that the strategy should address was the need for the project to gain a gender perspective. I was not instructed to formulate a specific gender policy or strategy for the project, but it was indicated that anything that helped the project to be more gender sensitive would be useful.

An approach that combined a training programme with a regional beautification programme (clean up campaign) and water tariff study programme was recommended. Five main areas of training needs were identified, including: (1) water and sanitation diseases and hygiene education; (2) technical aspects of wet services; (3) town planning; (4) community mobilisation and management of water supply and sanitation systems; and (5) women's leadership in community development.

To address these training needs eight training activities were identified, including: (1) Community Management of Water Supplies course in Harare, Zimbabwe; (2) Zimbabwe study tour; (3) education tours of Town wet services; (4) inter-regional community development tour; (5) education seminars in town planning; (6) gender/WID study tour to Kenya; (7) water supply and sanitation participatory development training for community development committees; and (8) hygiene education programme for schools (SWAM Awareness Campaign for the SWAM Programme Report 1994).

My participation as awareness consultant was extended to assist in the implementation of these activities. In February of 1995, I attended the ZOPP V workshop where planning for the second three year phase of the project was completed and agreed by all of the stakeholders. The ZOPP V workshop was an important experience of the SWAM project as gave me first hand experience of the ZOPP technique.

After ZOPP V a second report was completed to outline the planned activities for the awareness programme and its underlying approach (SWAM “Awareness
Activities for 1995"). Four activities became the focus for the next three months. A study tour to Kenya was organised in conjunction with DCD and Town Councils. The second activity was the formulation of a proposal for a waste management survey. The establishment of a regional waste management system for the three towns was identified by the Town Councils as being an urgent need. The third activity was the establishment of a number of community theatre groups in the three towns. This was made possible with the assistance of BRICKS Community Theatre Project, a Namibian NGO specialising in training community groups in community theatre for public education and development issues. These groups would specifically address environmental sanitation issues. The fourth activity was a women’s leadership workshop facilitated by ORAP, the organisation that had facilitated part of the Zimbabwe Study Tour.

During the implementation of these four activities, it became increasingly important to be able to demonstrate that the money spent in the awareness programme was justified. A monitoring and evaluation system was needed to assess how the programme was going. It was recognised that evaluating Result 5, because of its social orientation, would be difficult. For example, questions arose over how to measure people’s awareness levels, and at the same time, to state that increasing levels of awareness are a result of SWAM activities. Should for instance less garbage lying around be evidenced as SWAM success? How also could ‘less garbage’ be defined?

The advantages of a participatory monitoring and evaluation process as opposed to a ‘conventional’ evaluation approach were recognised. The SWAM project manager agreed that the idea of a participatory system that was designed and implemented by the ‘target recipients’ was a very attractive option. The IWSD, a participatory development NGO based in Zimbabwe indicated their success in other countries in establishing such systems. A workshop to establish a participatory M&E system was organised for February 1996.

In the meantime, a third report was written, reviewing the last year’s activities and outlining the next (SWAM 1996, “Output 5 Awareness Activities: A Planning
Guide"). The report re- emphasised the approach of the community-Town Council partnership and also outlined a newly formalised strategy for the awareness programme. This was in direct response to the change made by project management and home office of the wording of Result (or Output 5 as it was also renamed), to: “Strategy for community involvement developed and tested”. The basic idea that communities needed to assist the Town Council in maintaining hygienic surroundings remained unchanged, but the wording reflected the need for GTZ to clarify its role in the SWAM project. Specifically, this role was one of facilitation and catalyst, not implementor. Thus it could assist Town Councils and DCD to develop a strategy for awareness, but it could not implement the activities associated with this strategy.

After the participatory M&E workshop, I attended the yearly ZOPP planning and analysis workshop where the experiences and results of the participatory monitoring and evaluation workshop were outlined. At about this time, my participation in the SWAM project came to an end, and this was related to problems surrounding the participatory M&E system. This will be detailed shortly. Overall, I was involved in the SWAM project for 21 months, from June 1994 until March 1996, encompassing its extension from the last year of its first phase into the first year and a half of its second phase.

My involvement with the OHSIP project was much more limited and was based on my involvement with the SWAM project. It overlapped with the SWAM project in terms of geographical location, development focus, as well as recipients and thus indirect contact was ongoing. My analysis of the OHSIP project is therefore based much more on document review (critiqued in Chapter 2) and interviews than with the internal workings of the OHSIP project.

In order to examine the relations between the donor and recipients in these two projects, three dimensions of the projects will be analysed. First, the project planning and analysis processes will be examined to see how recipients were involved, and at what stages both in terms of place and time. In the SWAM case this involves an analysis of the ZOPP process that is used by GTZ to plan
projects, a specific example of the ZOPP V workshop, the efforts to establish monitoring and evaluation systems, including the participatory M&E system for the awareness programme, and a gender workshop that was held to train GTZ staff and official counterparts in gender analysis. According to the IBIS manual of methodology, IBIS should have used a variety of planning and analysis tools to establish the project system. I will examine whether these processes were followed, including the position held by the recipients in these processes.

Second the management systems that were established to implement the projects to see to what extent recipients were involved will be examined. Thirdly I will examine the approaches to community development that were undertaken by each of the projects to assess how communities, typically the ‘ultimate’ beneficiaries of projects, were approached by or interacted with the donors.

5.3.4.1 Project Planning and Analysis Processes

Four project planning and analysis experiences will be highlighted to examine how relations between donors and recipients are structured. These include the ZOPP V workshop of the SWAM project, the Project identification and Strategy Workshop of the OHSIP project, the SWAM participatory monitoring and evaluation workshop, and the GTZ gender workshop.

5.3.4.1.1 ZOPP V Workshop

The underlying philosophy of the ZOPP approach, and the rationale for its use by GTZ, is the belief that at the early stages, and in cooperation with the project participants, the approach allows for the clarification of how the project is to be realised and what impacts it is intended to achieve. GTZ “participation” policy also stipulates that it is absolutely essential that the intended beneficiaries participate as early on as possible in decision-making on development goals and project activities to facilitate the successful implementation of the project. According to GTZ, the ZOPP method facilitates good communication and cooperation between all parties involved. Problems that require development
intervention can only be solved if a comprehensive picture is established and insight gained into all of the interest groups, individuals, and institutions involved.

However, in practice, there seem to be some discrepancies. As has already been mentioned, the project idea is supposed to originate with the potential recipient country, after which GTZ personnel with BMZ and KfW resources persons explore the feasibility of the project and set out its broad parameters. In an interview with one GTZ 'AP' or project manager (June 1996), however, I was told that in some cases, at least in Namibia, project ideas are generated in a 'think tank' process in conjunction with in-country GTZ APs and the GTZ officer in charge of a specific country at Head Office. The idea is taken back to head office and a decision made as to its feasibility. Meanwhile the particular AP who suggested the idea will work on the target group likely to execute the project. The project is then conceptualised at GTZ head office, including the broad parameters of objectives and activities. This is certainly different from the official process whereby the idea is supposed to arise from the perceived development needs of a potential target group and then taken to GTZ as a request for development intervention and funding. Whilst I am not suggesting that all GTZ projects are formed in this way, there is room for this sort of transgression, and it is considered by GTZ to be acceptable.

Once the idea has been translated into a project, the ZOPP approach then mediates the involvement of the target groups. A spatial and temporal perspective on the process highlights some problematic issues. At the ZOPP 1 (pre-ZOPP) stage, a one-day workshop is held in Germany under the coordination of the regional department responsible for the country. Resource persons from BMZ and KfW participate. The analysis focuses on structuring the

---

BMZ is the Federal German Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development. KfW stands for Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau which is a financial institute and offers loans or grants for development projects. The GTZ has a cooperation agreement with the KfW which, as is stated in The World of Words at GTZ, forms a key component of the concept for improved
broad parameters of the project, including who the major target groups will be and what the major goals and objectives of the project will be. It then goes into the second stage of ZOPP appraisal where the project department head is in charge, and an external (objective) appraiser is brought in as a resource person, along with BMZ and KfW resource persons. The discussion of the project is based on limited (theoretical) knowledge of the problem, whom should be involved and what the possible solutions may be. However, at this stage, a list of preliminary activities is attached to the overall goals and objectives. It is only at the ZOPP 3 stage that the partner becomes involved in a planning and analysis capacity. Again it is held in Germany so their participation is dependent on GTZ funds. More country experience on the GTZ side is also brought in with the PAS officer who coordinates all GTZ projects in the country. Based on this in-country experience, both on the partner and GTZ side, intensive analysis of the target groups, goals, objectives, results, and activities is conducted.

The venue of the analysis and planning process only shifts to the partner country at the ZOPP 4, starting stage. The expatriate project team has been selected and the counterpart agencies and their representatives have been identified. The target groups have been identified and strategies suggested as to how to cooperate with them. A detailed plan of operations is drawn up along with parameters as to how to monitor and evaluate progress. The project thus begins its implementation. Every year during the project implementation, a ‘mini-ZOPP’ is held to ensure the commitment of all the stakeholders, and to review progress and confirm plans for the next year’s activities. At the end of the project, a major ZOPP 5 workshop is held to review the project and if deemed necessary, plan for a new phase. Of course the decision as to whether there should be a next phase is made far in advance, based on the money available from GTZ and commitment from the recipient Government. The first day of the workshop focuses on reviewing the current phase and assessing whether the objectives were achieved.

cooperation between the BMZ, KfW and GTZ (GTZ World of Words 1997, p. 103).
If agreement over the need to extend into another phase is given the workshop is then dedicated to analysing the orientation of that phase. It is at this stage in the whole of the ZOPP process, that the target groups have the best opportunity to have their perspectives integrated into the project design. Because I was party to the ZOPP 5 workshop for the SWAM project, I was able to gain a first hand perspective on the relations between GTZ and the Namibian recipients.

The objectives of the ZOPP 5 workshop were to: (1) review the general project strategy and the project planning matrix (pPM); (2) bring the project's objectives in line with new tasks that the Local Authorities and Regional Council had to tackle over the next three years; and (3) fine tune and agree on activities to be implemented until the end of phase 2. I attended the workshop to offer advice on the awareness component. All of the recipient stakeholders were present except for the supposed 'ultimate beneficiaries', the communities.

The GTZ claims that the ZOPP approach to project planning and analysis supports a participatory approach, involving all major stakeholders who should be equally involved in project planning and implementation. It claims that neutral moderation of the process supports this participatory approach. My experience with the ZOPP V workshop, however, showed some discrepancies. There are three major problems I identified with the 'rhetoric of ZOPP'.

First, the project planning matrix (PPM) is drafted well ahead of time by the GTZ side of the project management in co-ordination with GTZ Head Office. All that is really left to do at the ZOPP 5 workshop is to obtain consensus and to fine-tune it. This demonstrates Kabeer's (1994) analysis of the three types of power. Clearly certain decision-making powers are kept off the agenda by GTZ. Recipients are only involved in limited decision-making arenas.

Second, the claim that participation is full and equal must also be questioned. The idea behind ZOPP is that if all of the involved parties are brought together in one setting, everyone will get their chance to have their say in formulating the project ends and means. This is supported by the use of a neutral moderator. My
experience is, however, that there are many differences amongst the participants in terms of age, gender, experience, nationality, education, professional level, culture and even personality that these differences serve to undermine the participatory nature of ZOPP. The ZOPP method makes use of cards on which participants are supposed to write down their opinions and suggestions in private. These are then anonymously posted with all the other cards and discussed by the group. The idea is that the anonymous nature of the cards will facilitate equal participation. Although I agree that this method assists the participatory process, the fact that the opinions are subject to public scrutiny and that that public is comprised of different levels of experience, means that participation is not necessarily equal or full amongst all of the participants. Most frequently it is the target population perspectives that are not voiced.

Thirdly, the claim of neutral moderation must seriously be questioned. The GTZ project manager is usually in charge of structuring and organizing the workshop. This includes the selection of the moderator. The GTZ provides a pool of moderators trained specifically in the ZOPP method of facilitation. The moderator is thus typically German and associated in some way with GTZ. This person knows the GTZ system and encompasses the values of GTZ. She/he is usually included in 'after hour' discussions with the GTZ project management and GTZ head office staff about how the project and the workshop is going and her/his perspectives can be sought on what changes may be needed in project implementation. Assistance can, for example, be sought in nudging the workshop along the 'right' direction in order to facilitate the perspectives of the project management and head office.

Thus the relations structured by the ZOPP approach are not necessarily equal. In fact it can be said that the ZOPP approach very much assists in keeping the donor in control.

5.3.4.1.2 Project Identification and Strategy Workshop

The IBIS approach to project planning and analysis is in theory even more
flexible and ‘participatory’ than the GTZ ZOPP approach. It uses the same project cycle system but believes that the logical framework analysis tool may be too rigid and result in simplistic analyses. A complement of no less than nine analysis and planning tools are therefore recommended to ensure that the project design takes into account as many factors as possible. However, in practice, although IBIS policy is to initiate projects with a Problem Identification and Strategy Workshop, the OSHIP project did not.

The Project Support Team in its first progress report (IBIS Progress Report 1 1993) felt that it was too early to conduct the workshop, choosing instead to further community mobilisation activities. The Team stated their confidence that they had developed a high level of mutual cooperation with the communities. An external consultant to the project, however, in reviewing the project process report, disagreed with the Project Support Team’s appraisal and argued that a workshop was needed for seven reasons. He wrote in his report to the OHSIP Project Support team (Wakely 1993) that the workshop is intended to ensure that open discussion on the value systems of both the external support agency and the target groups, including the communities, and the development priorities they might include, is fostered thus ensuring consensus on the project strategy. It is intended to ensure, first, from the beginning, the community recognises that the programme is their own, and that it responds to the demands set by the community, not to those of the Government or the OHSIP Support Team. Second, it is intended to start the process of understanding that the community is responsible for the development of its own environment and that things will not be achieved unless this responsibility is exercised. Third, the process is designed to ensure that the project management is set in the context of democratic decision making. Fourth it is intended to start the process of developing

---

*A note should be made here that there is a gap in time frame between when the OHSIP project was conceptualised and when the IBIS Manual of Methodology was adopted by IBIS. The manual only came out in 1996, well after the project was underway. However, in an interview with IBIS representative in Windhoek (June 1996), I was told that even at that time, OHSIP project was required to conduct a Problem and Identification and Strategy Workshop even though other tools had not yet been adopted.*
collective self-confidence and attitudes towards individual responsibility within the community. Fifth, it is designed to show that the community has rights and how these rights can be accessed. Finally, it is intended to show the communities that there are limitations as to what can be expected from external assistance, including OSHIP. However, there was no mention by the appraiser of the need to remedy the lack of the workshop.

The lack of a Problem Identification and Strategy Workshop is, I feel, a serious oversight and may have contributed to the difficulties that the OHSIP project experienced in terms of relations between the Town Council and the communities and between IBIS as the donor agency and the recipients in general. Without a forum for airing the inevitable heterogeneous nature of the communities and Government targeted by the project, there is simply no possibility that every, or at very least, as many factors as possible can be encompassed within the project design. These difficulties will be highlighted in further analyses of the OHSIP project.

5.3.4.1.3 Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation Workshop

The participatory monitoring and evaluation workshop (PM&E) was organised to fulfil an identified need to develop a monitoring and evaluation system in a participatory manner that would adequately measure and assess changes and impacts of result/output 5 of the GTZ SWAM project. It was recognised that while it is easier to monitor quantitative aspects of a project, it is difficult to monitor qualitative changes in social behaviour that are often not visible to outsiders. The objectives of the workshop were to:

1. Develop and test a strategy for the development of a participatory M&E system for output 5 of the SWAM project.

2. Develop a PM&E system for output 5.

3. Build the capacity of communities, local authorities and the Directorate of
Community Development to develop and implement a PM&E system.

(4) Test the PM&E system development by evaluating two activities of the awareness programme - the BRICKS Community Theatre awareness campaign and the Okangwena Community Management of Water Supplies training activities.

The participants of the workshop included community members from Okangwena informal settlement, the Directorate of Community Development, including Kauna Ekandjo, the Chief Liaison Officer, and members of the Town Council. The workshop provided the participants with an overview of the SWAM project in the context of GTZ requirements for monitoring and evaluation, theoretical background on evaluation techniques, and an overview of the objectives and strategy approach of the awareness programme before embarking on the practical work to develop a PM&E system for specific awareness objectives and activities.

Some background on the participatory evaluation approach would be useful to provide the context for analysing relations between GTZ SWAM and its recipients.

As a management tool to assist in reaching stated objectives, a monitoring and evaluation system is a systematic way of learning from experience and drawing on lessons to correct and improve ongoing and future activities. Conventional methods of M&E have traditionally depended on a ‘blueprint’ approach where midterm and final evaluations are conducted by external ‘experts’ to measure the achievement of production goals, quality and quantity of construction undertaken, and unit costs. Narayan (1993) argued that there has been many difficulties with this approach in terms of finding appropriate indicators and ways of measuring the accurately. Community-based indicators of programme problems, progress and success can be, she argued, by-passed or ignored within this approach. PM&E seeks to turn the M&E process ‘upside-down’ so that communities, users and ‘target groups’ understand their own progress, problems
and successes within the development process. They can then use this information to facilitate the involvement of external support agencies, NGOs and government authorities in their own development processes.

Table 5.5 illustrates the differences between conventional and participatory M&E approaches.

Table 5.5 Monitoring and Evaluation Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Conventional</th>
<th>Participatory</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WHO</td>
<td>External experts</td>
<td>Community members, project staff, facilitators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAT</td>
<td>Predetermined indicators of success</td>
<td>People identify their own indicators of success</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOW</td>
<td>Focus on &quot;scientific objectivity&quot;; distancing of evaluators from other participants; complex methods, delayed analysis and access to results</td>
<td>Self-evaluation, simple methods to local culture, immediate sharing of results through local involvement in M&amp;E process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHEN</td>
<td>Usually at mid-term and completion events; tend to be large-scale</td>
<td>Merging of monitoring and evaluation; frequent and small events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHY</td>
<td>Accountability; usually to determine if funding continues</td>
<td>To empower local people to initiate, control and take corrective action</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Narayan 1993 p. 12)

It can be seen that the conventional method of evaluation encompasses the characteristics of ‘control-orientation’ that Porter et al (1991) outlined. Earlier in this chapter it was also shown how evaluation is part of the logistical framework analysis approach and encompasses a complex process involving objectively verifiable indicators (OVIs) and means of verification (MOVs). The PM&E approach is an attempt to simplify the technical complexities of the evaluation process. As Crew & Harrison (1998) argued, techniques such as the LFA, project cycle and the variety of impact assessment tools strongly facilitate the need for ‘expert’ knowledge.

The most important principle of PM&E, according to Narayan (1993) is the concept of when the stakeholder is involved in the process, the likelihood increases that they will use the information to take corrective (development) action. She noted that participatory evaluation does not preclude the involvement of external ‘experts’, however, the ‘expert’ plays a facilitating role in partnership
with the communities and programme staff, rather than being the “expert supreme” who decides, in relative isolation, how the evaluation will be conducted.

However, despite a philosophical commitment to the participatory approach, the workshop participants endured a lengthy and complex process of developing and testing a PM&E system for Output 5. The mere fact that they were given the parameters of the awareness programme’s overall objectives and strategies, as well as the specific activities and then asked to develop a participatory method of evaluation belies the contradictory nature of the workshop. The PM&E system had to match the overall structure of the GTZ evaluation approach, including the use of OVI*s and MOV*s. Notwithstanding this contradictory process, the workshop did manage in part to develop and test a PM&E system for the awareness programme. For each of the objectives of the programme, the participants developed a evaluation table which summarised: (1) the key words which described what the objective was about; (2) activities that could conceivably be implemented to achieve the objective; (3) specified the target groups for each activity; (4) the types of information needed to measure whether these activities had been completed and what level of success was achieved; and (5) the sources from which this information could be derived. From this evaluation table, participants then developed indicators that would provide the means to measure whether the objective was being achieved.

For two activities - Bricks community theatre and Okangwena community management- the participants then further elaborated the evaluation table by selecting methods that could be used to collect data (MOV*s). In the classroom they developed the tools, including materials needed to apply them, and practised them. The workshop then moved out into the field to collect data, after which the participants compiled and analysed the data, including their recommendations for changes or improvements on the activity as well as the activity’s objectives, and presented them to the large group.

Thus the workshop was of mixed success. Truthfully, the workshop represented
an intensive instruction in donor management techniques to recipients who were captivated by virtue of their need for the material benefits of the project.

The workshop did not succeed in establishing a PM&E system for the overall objective for output 5 – a strategy for community involvement developed and tested. Rather the workshop was only able to develop an evaluation framework for the individual awareness objectives and activities. However, it was shown that there was enormous potential for empowerment, the kind that donors so vehemently subscribe to. The participants understood the rationale behind activities and had begun to form their own opinions on what improvements could be made, and whether the activities were actually achieving their objectives. The next step would be to assess the merits of the objectives themselves. In the evaluation of the workshop, participants expressed the view that they appreciated learning how projects actually worked and what the GTZ project cycle was. It gave them an understanding of where they as recipients fit into the process. They expressed the opinion that the workshop had facilitated communication and understanding between the communities and the Town Councils due to the joint effort to define objectives and evaluation indicators and means of verification. Community members indicated their plan to use the methods learned at the workshop to change or improve on how their community development committee worked on development problems. They indicated that their knowledge of how to form objectives and how to measure if these objectives are being reached could assist in this endeavour. On the other hand, others indicated that the workshop was too long and too complex; that the group work was too difficult and that they needed another workshop to be able to understand all that was given in this workshop (SWAM 1996 Participatory Monitoring and Evaluation System for Output 5”).

Ultimately, the PM&E approach was rejected by the SWAM project manager. He indicated that the approach did not match GTZ requirements for evaluation. He explained that the GTZ approach was based on the evaluation of the overall objective of the output. He believed that the workshop had evaluated individual activities rather this overall objective. I agreed that the workshop
had fallen short of this objective. I hoped that the participatory approach used at the workshop could be used further in developing an evaluation system for the output. However, the project manager refused and the opportunity to explore the potential of the approach was lost.

5.3.4.1.4 GTZ Gender Workshop

The GTZ Gender Workshop was organised to fulfil an identified need to enhance the integration of gender issues into the overall goals and objectives of the GTZ-supported projects in Namibia. The Workshop was intended to provide a forum for the exchanges of experiences in regards to gender approaches used by the projects, the problems and constraints they faced in trying to integrate gender, and to share possible solutions for ways to overcome these constraints and thus enhance gender integration. The specific objectives of the Workshop were to:

(1) Sensitise participants in gender development issues and gender analysis tools;

(2) Provide an opportunity for GTZ-supported projects to exchange experiences in terms of gender integration;

(3) Identify issues and problems in terms of gender integration;

(4) Identify potential solutions to improve and enhance gender integration; and

(5) Provide information to GTZ-supported projects in regards to how projects may be supported in this endeavour at an individual project level or at a national (in-country) level.

To achieve these objectives the Workshop progressed through a process of sensitisation and analysis, starting with a basic understanding of the concept of gender, and why projects needed to be 'gender aware', moving on to instruction in specific gender analysis tools, and finally to theoretical case study gender analysis. An overview of the context of gender issues in Namibia was provided by
the Department of Women’s Affairs of the Office of the President, and the NGO Prepcom Committee. The Workshop represented the first systematic approach to ensure that gender issues would be integrated into all GTZ-supported projects in Namibia. The Workshop was attended by all GTZ APs (project managers) and national counterparts.

For the purposes of showing how donor control mitigated against gender development from being systematically integrated into GTZ-supported projects in Namibia, some background on why and how the workshop was established. In the “Welcome and Introduction” of the report of the workshop (SWAM GTZ Gender Workshop 1995), it was written:

Dr. Thomas Schild, the GTZ advisor to the SWAM project, came forward to give the background of the workshop. He explained that Dr. McPherson and himself observed how involved women are in all levels of their projects and felt that it would be a good idea to come up with a more systematic approach to gender awareness. They wanted a comprehensive approach to include gender elements and felt that there would be an interest throughout the GTZ projects in Namibia on this issue. Coincidentally, Ms. Liao, a consultant with the SWAM project had been at GTZ Head Office where in discussions with the GTZ specialist in Group 42 – Quality Assurance, Ms. Julianne Osterhaus, it was discovered that Head Office would very much support the idea of a national gender workshop (GTZ Gender Workshop Report 1995, p. 2).

In reality the idea for the gender workshop was identified by the GTZ gender specialist, Ms. Osterhaus, at Head Office. In the process of discussing gender issues in general with me she had introduced the idea and elaborated on why her unit, Quality Assurance wanted to see such workshops conducted, not just in Namibia but wherever GTZ was operating. She indicated that Quality Assurance did not have the kinds of funds needed to sponsor these kinds of workshops. Only individual projects had access to this kind of money. However, she asked if

---

9 Preparatory committee for Beijing UN Conference on Women.
10 AP or project manager of the Communal Areas Water Supply project (CAWS) and co-sponsor with the SWAM project, of the Gender Workshop.

232
I, in my capacity as consultant with the SWAM project could introduce the idea to the SWAM project manager and other GTZ-supported projects in Namibia. If all the projects could agree to sponsor a workshop, Head Office would pay for her participation as gender specialist.

Ms. Osterhaus specified the agenda of her involvement. In the Philippines a gender workshop had been held which elicited the support of all the GTZ-supported projects in establishing (and funding) a national gender specialist who worked closely with the projects in-country to enhance gender strategies. The position, Ms. Osterhaus, indicated was so far very successful and Quality Assurance wanted to duplicate this position wherever possible.

The idea of a workshop as well as the idea of a gender specialist position was immediately introduced to the SWAM project manager who, after consultation with the GTZ CAWS project manager, very enthusiastically agreed to co-sponsor the workshop. As was shown earlier in this chapter, GTZ policy recognises the need to integrate a gender approach in all of its projects. The SWAM and CAWS project managers saw the workshop as an opportunity to obtain gender sensitivity and analysis training and to show Head Office that they were seriously attempting the address the gender issue. Cynically, it was also the case that by co-sponsoring the workshop (and by not allowing other GTZ-supported projects to co-sponsor the workshop), the two projects gained primary recognition from Head Office in this endeavour.

After progressing through an overview of GTZ gender policy, gender awareness and gender analysis training, as well as the case study analyses, the final activity of the workshop was to provide recommendations for further action and discussion on strategies for gender integration in all GTZ-supported projects in Namibia. The projects were asked to provide first the recommendation or activity, allocate responsibility to the activity, allocate resources (human/financial/material), give a time frame for when the activity should be started and completed, and specify enabling and constraining factors for each recommendation.

233
It was here that Ms. Osterhaus hoped that the projects would support the idea of an in-country gender specialist. However, this was not to be the case. As the workshop progressed the tensions that exist between Head Office and ‘field staff’ in general (i.e. not limited to just gender issues) surfaced. At the time the decentralisation of certain GTZ Head Office functions was being considered in GTZ. In the decentralised system, projects would gain more control over their budgets and administrative functions although quality control would still be a function of Head Office. The establishment of an in-country gender specialist position seemed to be a contradictory step. Additionally, the GTZ project managers did not want to contribute money from their own, already (perceived to be) limited budgets. Although Ms. Osterhaus was disappointed that a gender specialist position was not an outcome of the workshop, she was hopeful that the many other recommendations/activities suggested at the workshop would be implemented as projects indicated they would be. However, ten months after the workshop, I visited Ms. Osterhaus at Head Office where it was noted that none of the recommendations had been initiated.

The outcome of the gender workshop showed how donor politics can effectively truncate well-intended development policies. Ultimately it is the ‘target groups’, the women and children particularly, who do not benefit as much as they could from a well thought out gender approach to development. I would also suggest that it is not a matter of limited budgets that inhibits the establishment of practical and strategic gender development work, but rather the perception of most (male) project managers that gender is a peripheral issue to be addressed only after the main objectives of the project are addressed.

5.3.4.2 Project Management Systems

Both projects set up a management committee to manage the project, inclusive of target population representatives. In theory, the committee was to make all decisions about the project with full partnership between expatriate and counterpart personnel. In reality, however, the decision making process was controlled by the expatriate project management team. It must be remembered
that the expatriate staff were hired specifically to make sure project funds, derived from taxes paid in their home country, were administered 'properly', and to offer their technical and management expertise for appropriate project planning and implementation. They did not have any other work to do than to manage the project while Namibian counterparts had to divide their time between their own work plus the SWAM and/or IBIS project and probably other externally supported projects as well. In practice, decisions about the project were discussed first amongst expatriate management, and decisions were made before counterparts were informed. Counterparts were then expected to give their rubber stamp approval and generally this occurred.

However, there are incidents when the counterpart or recipient vocalised their disapproval of projects and when this happens donor agencies did take it seriously. For instance in the OHSIP project, the Town Council was displeased with the use of project funds. It felt that no visible improvements were being made in the informal settlements but that the IBIS expatriate personnel were benefiting from new housing and offices. Equally, it argued that funds were being given directly to community development committees (CDCs) and this undermined the authority of the Town Council. The mayor wrote a letter to the Ministry of Regional and Local Government and Housing (MRLGH) with these complaints and IBIS head office was called in. Eventually IBIS pledged to work towards building a better relationship with the Town Council and supported this with a $N 2 million grant payable directly in budgetary support to the Town Council. The project also immediately went to work constructing water points and latrines, bypassing much of the community development process it had been attempting to strengthen for the last two years. More evidence of the impact this incident had on the community participation and empowerment dimension of the project will be given shortly. However, this incident illustrates that while for the most part donor agencies retain control of the project processes, there is space for recipients to vocalise dissatisfaction and to have donor agencies pay immediate attention. Thus while the relations are inherently unequal, donors are not in absolute control and recipients do have 'spaces of power'.
However, there was little in the way of ‘spaces of power’ for communities. There was no community representation on the Project Management Committee of the SWAM project and on either of the Joint Steering Committee and Project Coordinating Committee of the OSHIP project. In both projects the group identified as being the target population and ultimate beneficiary was the community. Yet neither project deemed it necessary to include them on the decision-making bodies. The process used to conceptualise the awareness programme and the Zimbabwe Study Tour exemplifies how communities are marginalised but then find spaces to make their perspectives known. More will be said of this in the analysis of community development approaches.

5.3.4.3 Community Development Approaches

Both of the projects claimed that their method of working with the communities was participatory. However, in both projects, this participatory nature was problematic. For example, in both projects, the communities were not involved in the location of the water points.

In the SWAM project a meeting was held with community leaders to discuss the plan for the new water system, including the location of the water points. The community leaders were shown on a map where the water points would be located and were walked through the layout of the system. However, later discussions with the community (Okangwena, May 1996)\(^{11}\) indicated that they were not happy with the arrangements. Many socio-economic needs were not satisfied. Soak-a-ways were directed towards plots that could not use the excess water while families trying to develop gardens for income generation did not have access to this kind of free water. Certain families did not want to use the same water point as certain other families. Two water points were located far out

---

\(^{11}\) I conducted interviews with members of the Okangwena informal settlement which had received a new water supply system as part of the SWAM project in May 1996. However, I was also involved in numerous meetings with the settlement in my capacity as awareness consultant. These meetings provided me with a perspective on the community concerns.
of the settlement causing families assigned to these water points to use closer water points. The community also indicated that the community leaders present at the meeting with SWAM were not recognised by the community as their leaders. All of this caused strife within the community. Discussions with the GTZ technical advisor (Oshakati, February 1995) revealed that in fact the community had not been involved with the location of water points, or in any part of the design of the water system. It was all carried out by a Windhoek based consulting engineering company. The community, however, was expected to pay a tariff to the Town Council. One component of the awareness programme was to assist DCD in working with the community to set up a tariff system. It was then that the community grievances emerged. It was difficult to ask the community to pay for a service that was inadequate to their needs.

Interviews with community members indicated that the OSHIP project (Oshakati, May 1996) also did not use a participatory approach with communities to locate water points. Arguments within the community over who could use what water point were being experienced. In addition water points were being vandalised and left dripping, raising the question of ownership. Water tariffs were also a problem. When the project ended, none of the communities was paying for water. IBIS was attempting to continue a small programme in the communities aimed specifically at establishing a water tariff system. The OSHIP project also constructed latrines in the communities. As mentioned before, the toilets were quickly built after Town Council complaints about the project. This is certainly a factor explaining why community involvement was bypassed.

However, it does not explain why the OHSIP Support Team decided to construct a latrine model imported from South Africa that was expensive and difficult to build. In an interview with the Health Inspector of the Oshakati Town Council (May 1996), Theopolina Kakalolo, it was learned that the toilets were not even built adequately. The toilets, she argued, have too small a capacity. No study was conducted to assess what kinds of materials are used in sanitary behaviour and so some of the toilets were already filling up. The toilets were also not built up high enough to avoid seepage into the water table and the
Town Council, she stated, feared that water supplies might become contaminated. She also noted that the project had told the communities that they could bathe in the toilets but the water drainage design had been shown to be inadequate and there was an increased standing water problem, heightening the risk of malaria.

Interviews with some community members (May 1996) also revealed their dissatisfaction with the toilets, and the process that the project followed in constructing them. They complained that some toilets were left half finished and that other community members wanted their own toilets, but that they did not know how to finish or build them. They complained that the toilets were too expensive to finance on their own. The community members told me that the communities were involved in latrine building but only in making the bricks and that these people were now out of work when the project left and there was no more need for bricks.

The lack of community 'ownership' of the project was taken up as an issue by Wakely, an external appraiser who wrote in his report to the OHSIP Project Support team:

I have the impression that you still regard what you are doing as the OHSIP Team's project in which there is strong community participation, rather than the community's programme, in which there is OHSIP participation through the provision of support. All that is on the ground now....and the relationships that have been established...have been in process of development for a long time. We have only just joined the process and we will be gone in 3 years, We cannot and should not try to replace the process, but we are in the business of improving it (Wakely 1993, p. 1).

In the SWAM project, community participation was also problematic. Initially there was no systematic consultation with communities in formulating the awareness programme for the SWAM project, even though the communities were the ultimate target of the programme. In the original process of conceptualising the awareness programme, I was asked to consult with the Town
Councils and other organisations involved in awareness type activities. This did not include communities. After two weeks a strategy was formed based on an approach which encouraged sensitisation and training. It was agreed that communities needed to recognise the need for safe surroundings and they had a civic duty to create and maintain these conditions in their locale, and in public places. They needed to be exposed to other locations where communities had been involved in this type of 'responsible' action. They needed to become aware of the roles and responsibilities of the Town Council and to understand the limitations that the Town Council faced due to inadequate resources and failing infrastructure. Equally, the Directorate of Community Development (DCD), the Government agency directly involved with communities, needed to be exposed and trained in better community mobilisation techniques. Once this level of awareness was achieved, a concrete 'beautification programme' could be launched, effecting a clean up of the three towns and hopefully, long-term behavioural change. In other words, environmental sanitation problems were attributed to the communities' lack of awareness of proper hygienic conditions, and the solution was greater awareness to motivate them.

An examination of the first activity of the newly conceptualised 'awareness programme', the study tour to Zimbabwe, illustrates the general SWAM approach to community development and the way it changed as a result of community input. The tour participants included community members of informal settlements, DCD staff, and Town Council staff. In addition, the OHSIP project requested the participation of five OHSIP community liaison and technical staff. The study tour went to three groups/organizations\(^\text{12}\) and focused on institutional arrangements and strategies of community development, appropriate technology for water supply systems and sanitation facilities, and the role of women in development.

\(^{12}\) ORAP – Organisation of Rural Associations for Progress based in Bulawayo.
AWG – Association of Women’s Clubs of Zimbabwe based in Zvishavane.

239
Before the study tour the participants were asked what their expectations were of the tour and after the tour, they were asked if their expectations were met, what they learned on the tour, and how this might affect their work either as professional development agents or as community members. This process produced instructive results.

The approach of the awareness programme had been ‘top-down’ in the sense that communities, the ultimate beneficiaries were excluded from the formulation of the approach and the activities of the awareness programme. Town Councils and DCD were seen to be in charge of the communities, catalysing community development and teaching communities about proper hygiene and environmental sanitation conditions. However, community members on the tour took a different stance. They did not see themselves as ignorant and unmotivated squatters who preferred to live in dirty surroundings. Rather, they were very aware of the need to clean their surroundings and recognised that they had some responsibility in achieving this. However, they were constrained by a lack of coordination between Town Council and themselves and what the proper roles of the Town Council should be. They were also aware of the need for more technical information about appropriate water and sanitation technologies as well as a system for waste management. The study tour had given them good ideas about how other communities (in Zimbabwe) were solving environmental sanitation problems and were eager to improve their communities. However they wanted to clarify how the relationship between the communities and the Town Council should be structured in terms of finances and service responsibilities.

From this point there was a need to change the approach of the awareness programme. The community members who participated on the study tour agreed that they should go back to their informal settlements, communicate information about the tour, and then come up with a number of needs that they felt should be fulfilled to support their community development efforts. They identified four training needs, which included the construction of latrines, women's leadership, participatory development techniques, and the roles and responsibilities of Town Councils. It could be seen that the relationship between Town
Council and the community development committees (CDCs) needed to be strengthened and that a partnership approach should underlie any further awareness activities.

After the Zimbabwe Study Tour all of the awareness activities were structured to reflect this partnership approach. It was carefully worded, however, to avoid the mistakes of the OHSIP project in developing poor relationships between the project, the Town Council and the communities. In the SWAM "Awareness Activities for 1995" (1995) for example it was stated:

…it is recognised that without the full participation of communities to recognise and identify environmental sanitation problems and issues, and plan and implement solutions to improve conditions, hygiene messages simply fall to the wayside, politely listened to, but neither internalised nor acted on. Communities must become partners in achieving clean surroundings, vis-a-vis the Town Councils (SWAM 1995, p. 3).

A series of workshops were given on participatory development techniques, facilitated by the Institute of Water and Sanitation Development (IWSD) from Zimbabwe and ACORD, a Namibian participation NGO. The original idea had been to train DCD and Town Council staff in participatory techniques to assist them in educating, sensitising communities as to proper water hygiene, sanitation and waste management techniques, as well as to facilitate the establishment of community organisation to manage water, sanitation and waste management facilities.

After the Zimbabwe Study Tour, members of the communities participated in the workshops because they vocalised their desire to know how to sensitise, educate and train themselves and their fellow community members. They wanted to learn how to organise themselves and facilitate their own development.
The empowerment agenda of the OHSIP project in particular also merits examination. Unlike the SWAM project\textsuperscript{13}, it was one of the main objectives of the OSHIP project. Different perspectives on the success of the project in this regard were revealed in interviews with community members, Town Council and the OHSIP Support Team (May 1996). A member of the Support Team felt that the project succeeded in ‘empowering’ the communities. The communities, he argued, moved from being passive, non-focused and diffuse, to being politically active and strident in their demands for assistance. They developed professional skills in terms of administration and leadership. They organised and managed their own election. They even wrote their own constitution. He noted that when OHSIP first arrived, there were many political problems vis-à-vis SWAPO and DTA war-time\textsuperscript{14} affiliations. But with the new elections, a much broader based representation could be seen in the CDC’s. Communities were working together.

\textsuperscript{13} Although one of the main principles of GTZ technical cooperation is to work for empowerment of the ultimate beneficiaries (The World of Words at GTZ, 1997).

\textsuperscript{14} SWAPO and DTA are the two major political parties in Namibia. SWAPO is the party of the current Government with DTA as the official opposition. SWAPO accounts for over 60% of the total votes in the country, most of their votes coming from the Ovambo and Kavango ethnic areas. The DTA or Democratic Turnhalle Alliance originates from the Turnhalle Conference of September 1975. In September 1974 the National Party of South West Africa issued a statement in which it stated that the time “was opportune for the whites in the Territory (of South Africa) to take positive action to hold talks with members of other popular groups with a view to reaching an agreement as to the political future”. South Africa’s strategy for maintaining white supremacy while appearing to negotiate the future of Namibia with its black population was to enshrine ethnicity for future politics. Constitutionally, the Turnhalle Declaration of Intent proposed a three-tier Government structure, rising from Government via ethnic representation authorities (the second tier) to a central Government. The second strategy was to complement constitutional reforms with a package of reforms designed to expand and incorporate the black petty-bourgeoisie. The Pass Laws were modified and the Immorality Proclamation and Prohibition of Mixed Marriages law was revoked. Africans gained the right for the first time to own freehold property in ethnic sub-divisions within black urban areas. The view of the DTA from the SWAPO perspective was that it sought to co-opt nationalist and socialist populist impulses. During the war, the South African administration countered SWAPO PLAN (the military wing of SWAPO) insurgency, not only with their own police and military forces (SADF) but also with South West African (meaning black Namibian) personnel. Captured PLAN guerrillas were ‘turned’ to work in security forces and black soldiers were dressed in PLAN uniforms to entrap guerrilla units. In short there was much bitterness left over from the war which was not easily abandoned (Werner 1987; Brown 1995).
The Health Inspector of Oshakati Town Council felt that although the project claimed that there was now a spirit of community, evidence revealed otherwise. She pointed out that water points were being vandalised. Communities refused to pay for water. No one wanted to contribute to new development activities. She surmised that the OHSIP project tried to do things for the communities instead of raising awareness, giving options and helping communities to develop strategies.

External appraisals of the project seemed to support this perspective. Nevertheless, they remained positive of the project's ability to effect community empowerment. Wakely (1993) wrote that:

... there seems to be a high degree of dependence on the CDCs as representative of the communities by the OHSIP Support Team. The position of the CDC's vis-à-vis the communities are weaker than anticipated. People still do not know about the CDCs and what their tasks are. The CDCs perceive the project to be their main source of access to development assistance rather than facilitating their own involvement and contribution. Overall, the CDCs have a positive attitude towards the project, but there is a common complaint that although they are being adequately consulted and informed, they are not involved in the decision making process, particularly in terms of budget allocation (Wakely 1993, p. 4).

However, this was not seen as a big problem but rather as a "stage along a process of political empowerment that the project is ultimately trying to support" (Wakely 1993, p.6). The focus of the project, he emphasised, should be in helping the CDCs secure the participation of the whole community.

To be fair, however, it can be seen that recipients did have avenues of power open to them, particularly at the community level. At the project planning and analysis level, recipients held little decision-making power and their agency was spatially and temporally confined and controlled by the donor. At the project level the power of the recipients was increased, albeit within the overall confines of donor control. Project management committees facilitated the participation of recipients in the implementation of the project. Even though the recipients for
the most part 'rubber stamped' the decisions made by the donor, the evidence from the OHSIP project showed that recipients can wield a significant amount of power in holding the donor accountable to the needs and priorities of the recipients.

However, it is at the community level that the relations of power between the donor and recipients seemed to be most flexible. The Zimbabwe Study Tour demonstrated how communities could bring their views to the attention of the donor. At this community level there are more opportunities for flexibility in the relations between the donor and the recipients and there is, after all, an inherent emphasis on the agency of the recipients in supporting project objectives. However, as the participatory monitoring and evaluation process showed, the agency and the power of the recipients is only encouraged to a certain point. When the relations shifted into the realm of project management, the powers of the donor are quickly reasserted. Regardless of the level of interaction, Kabeer's (1994) analysis of power was evident. Donors have the power to construct the rules of the game and then disguise this power under the illusion of consensus. Donors demarcate what is 'decisionable' and what is 'non-decisionable' and no amount of participatory or partnership rhetoric can disguise the fact that recipients are excluded from the real decision making process.

The gender dimension should also be examined in relation to community empowerment. Both agencies and projects proclaimed the importance of the need to consider gender issues but both projects had not developed a specific gender strategy and activities related to gender were scant. External appraisers of the OHSIP project felt that, because there was a high representation of women on the CDCs, the OHSIP Support Team had guaranteed the incorporation of a gender aware approach (Wakely 1993). He argued that this was not the case. However it was not specified what should be done. Community members indicated that the project had emphasised its intent to help women within a gender approach, but said that nothing concrete had been done. Women complained that training was focused on brick making and work that men did more than women. An OHSIP community mobiliser said that the
project had trained the mobilisers in gender sensitivity but that nothing further was done (author’s interview, May 1996).

The SWAM project also recognised the need to incorporate a gender approach and also made progress towards this objective. The project first supported a workshop to train GTZ advisors and national counterparts in gender development. It then commissioned a report to study how the project should next proceed and further agreed to conduct a gender case study of the SWAM project in conjunction with GTZ Head Office. As part of the awareness programme it also held a gender study tour to Kenya to examine how women and women’s groups in Kenya facilitated development, and a women’s leadership workshop facilitated by ORAP, a prominent community development NGO from Zimbabwe.

Both projects, however, did not develop a specific gender strategy. Yet both donor agencies recognised that gender development was an important issue. If women were not empowered, it cannot be said that the community was empowered. Equally, if women did not participate equally in development projects, sustainable development could not be achieved.

5.4 The Incongruities of Intent and Reality

This chapter has sought to show that Northern donor agencies possess a high degree of power and control over recipient ‘developing countries. The policies of development that ‘developing countries’ such as Namibia generally advocate as their own are essentially defined by international (Western) norms. This is readily apparent in the convergence of international and Namibian water sector policies. The examination of project experiences then demonstrates that Western/Northern/donor control is reproduced at every level of the development project despite policy rhetoric that stresses empowerment, partnership and ownership as well as the theory of delivery approaches that alleges equal participation in project planning and analysis.
It is important to stress that it is not the intent of Northern development agencies or development in general that is being argued here. It is difficult to argue with policies that reflect concern for women, the community, and the environment, and which advocate such objectives as self-sufficiency, empowerment, poverty-alleviation, increasing capacity for self-organisation, democratisation of power structures, and social justice. Of course these are also up for debate as the discussion of cultural relativism versus universal values and development ethics has shown. The 'goodness' of such concepts, as well as the hegemonic tendencies of the West in standardising development norms are very definite points of critique. However, notwithstanding this very important debate, what is being argued here is that this 'good intent' of development and individual Northern donor agencies is not, as a whole, mirrored in project experiences.

'Good intent' is readily apparent in the policy environment of both GTZ and IBIS. GTZ has an overall goal of German development is to assist in the improvement of living conditions in its 'partner' countries (my emphasis) and three complementary objectives, productive economic growth, social justice and ecological sustainability. It is emphasised that the role of GTZ is only to support the creative capacities of 'partners' to foster self-advancement. Participation is considered to be a key means of facilitating this process. It is stipulated that target groups participate as early as possible in order that ownership and real partnership is achieved. The overall aim of IBIS development is also to improve economic and social living conditions. IBIS policy also emphasises empowerment, partnership and participation (collaboration). Both GTZ and IBIS policies stressed the understanding that participation, ownership and empowerment were all critical pre-conditions for the long-term sustainability of development initiatives.

The theory behind the delivery approaches of both GTZ and IBIS also reflect 'good intent'. The ZOPP approach for example is underlain by the rationale that a project will not gain acceptance and therefore long term sustainability unless all interest groups, both individuals and institutions are involved, at the earliest stage possible, in the planning and analysis of the project. ZOPP is
intended to facilitate equal and joint participation between all involved parties. The IBIS approach is arguably pledged even more strongly towards 'good intent'. Along with the LFA approach, it advocates the use of no less than eight different tools of planning and analysis. These are intended to facilitate the full participation of target groups as well as to provide as many alternative designs as possible so that the needs of all the target groups, as well as the overall environment, can be integrated into the project design.

There are of course slight differences between IBIS and GTZ policies and delivery approaches. For example, there is a more explicit alignment of GTZ policy with the economic goals of development. GTZ regards the goals of poverty alleviation and 'social justice', as well as environmental management, to be compatible with economic growth. Importantly, GTZ also stipulates political framework conditions that needed to be in place before effective development could be achieved. In this way, GTZ emphasises its power over recipient countries even though in its definition of empowerment GTZ recognised that changes in the institutions that embody the current relations of power are needed. IBIS policy by contrast, recognises that a central problem with development is the existence of unequal power relations between the North and the South. There is much more of a 'solidarity' orientation in IBIS policy than in GTZ policy.

The delivery approaches of GTZ and IBIS are also slightly different, although overall, the idea of participation forms the main principle of both approaches. IBIS believes that project planning and analysis processes should be flexible and most importantly, that the participation of the 'target groups' is not only crucial as a means of achieving development goals, but is an end (goal) in itself. IBIS underlines the need to place not just the objectives of both donor and recipient on the negotiation table, but also the values and 'background' of both. It is unclear as to the meaning of 'background'. It might perhaps refer to the cultural background of the donor and recipients. Thus IBIS believes that project planning and analysis needs to be based on the participation of the stakeholders and that it must also be flexible and not engraved in stone in a project planning
matrix that is the result of a logistical framework analysis approach.

The examination of project experiences, however, provides a very different portrayal of GTZ and IBIS intentions. For example, GTZ policy underlines the importance of participation in achieving the objectives of any given project. It regards the ZOPP approach to be capable of facilitating the equal participation of all the stakeholders of the project. However, as the project experiences have shown, there is a rather large discrepancy between theory and practice. The spatial and temporal analysis of the ZOPP approach demonstrates that the idea of earliest possible participation (of target groups) is subject to GTZ interpretation. Meanwhile, GTZ and its chosen cadre of ‘experts’ proceed with defining the goals, objectives, strategies, and evaluative criteria of the project, away from the geographical context and realities of the recipient country and target groups.

The specific experience of the SWAM ZOPP 5 workshop demonstrates a number of concrete ways that GTZ control over the process is reinforced. First GTZ drew up the participation list and the agenda for the ZOPP workshop, as well as select the moderator to facilitate it. Technically this is the responsibility of the Project Management Committee with the GTZ project manager acting on behalf of the Committee. Examination of the ways in which the Project Management Committee functioned, however, shows that equal decision-making power is not a reality. Second, GTZ did not even attempt to conceal the fact that it had elaborated the structure of the second phase of the SWAM project in conjunction with GTZ head office well ahead of the workshop. Third, the participation within the workshop was not, as ZOPP rhetoric promised, a process of equal participation. There can be little doubt that notions of the ‘expert’ and ‘normal professionalism’ affect the way in which recipients participate.

The examination of the ZOPP approach shows how GTZ is generally in full control of project planning and analysis processes by controlling the ‘spaces of power’ of recipient participation, both in terms of place and time. There is no
possibility of recipients gaining control over the process. As Kabeer (1995) argues, GTZ has full control because of their “ability to construct the rules of the game that disguise the operations of this power and construct the illusion of consensus and complementarity” (Kabeer 1995, p. 229). In fact the control of GTZ is reminiscent of the missionaries’ denial of Namibian participation in pastoral leadership to prevent the emergence of a Namibian theology of liberation. It can also be compared to the efforts of the Government of Namibia to deny the inclusion of ‘truth’ as part of the reconciliation process in order to prevent official public debate of its position on the detainee issue. As long as the ‘dialogue’ can be controlled, there is less chance of rebellion.

The OHSIP project, despite IBIS policy which stresses that the complementary use of the LFA technique and more descriptive or qualitative project planning and analysis tools, did not start with a problem identification and strategy workshop. No less than six reasons why the identification and strategy workshop is so important are underlined. The workshop is intended not only to facilitate communication, but is also intended to start the process of ownership and in enhancing the self-confidence of target groups to effect their own development. However, the OHSIP Support team did not consider it necessary to remedy the lack of such a workshop, choosing to believe that they, as Northern ‘experts’ held enough knowledge of the target groups’ needs to design the project themselves.

This examination of donor control and gap between rhetoric and reality however, must avoid being too one-sided. The participatory monitoring and evaluation workshop, and the various attempts to integrate gender concerns, particularly within the SWAM project demonstrates that the donor agencies did make genuine efforts to address specific policy concerns. For example, the overall rationale and goal of the PM&E initiative was to enhance the participation of target groups in a very key area of project planning and analysis. There was potential for ‘true’ participation, with target groups not just defining indicators, but actually forming opinions about what is ‘good’ or appropriate development (for them), being able to express them, and seeing them integrated into the project design. The gender initiatives also demonstrated the intent of
donor agencies to address policy concerns. However, the results of these initiatives were mixed. They were not sustained by the agencies were not ‘taken over’ by the target groups. This perhaps reflective of the fact that even with the best intentions, agencies did not know how to enhance participation or specifically, to ‘do gender’.  

However, in my opinion, these mixed results demonstrate the typical contradictions that plague development projects and development in general. Development policy is established within an environment that, (and by people who), genuinely desire ‘developing countries’ to break out of patterns of poverty. It is then believed that the structure of projects, the specific mechanisms by which projects are delivered reflect and complement the policy goals of development. However, in reality the way in which development projects are structured, and the delivery approaches of development contradict the ‘good’ intentions of the development goals, the specific policies of the donor agencies, and the goals and objectives of individual projects.

It seems to me that Northern agencies cannot possibly be unaware of the large gap between rhetoric and practice, policy and delivery. Thus it becomes questionable whether Northern donor agencies really know what they are doing, or whether in fact policies of ‘good’ intent are actually just intended to disguise the ultimate agenda of development assistance. The way development is structured and delivered it would seem that this ultimate agenda might be to foster the continual dependence of ‘developing countries’ on the benign rule of ‘developed countries’.

It is the impact of donor control that is the central concern here. The perspectives of the Namibian respondents provides the best measure of the impact of donor control. For example, in the OHSIP project, the Support Team believed that they had established a high level of mutual cooperation. However,

15 To be fair, however, it should also be noted that there were many conflicting agendas involved in the GTZ gender workshop and their existence certainly did not enhance the achievement of the ‘pure’ gender objective.

250
the target groups commonly expressed their opinion that the OHSIP Support team did not genuinely work with target groups. They felt that they were being superficially consulted and informed but were not involved in the decision making process.

The SWAM recipients also expressed dissatisfaction that they were not adequately consulted in the design of the water supply systems constructed in their settlement. They felt that this lack of proper participation had resulted in strife within the community; 'bad' feelings which were still being resolved. The OHSIP recipients were even more adamant that they had been mistreated by the project despite the fact that they had benefited from a new community centre, latrines for most of the households, a new water supply system, roads and electricity. Their concern lay not with the material benefits, although there were also some issues with the way these were handled, but rather in the way in which they were treated by the project. They felt that although the OHSIP Support Team talked about community empowerment, in reality the Support Team made the decisions as to what needed to be done in the project, and then informed the communities what their role should be. They felt insulted by this lack of respect and one respondent even voiced his view that all the material benefits of the project meant nothing because of the way they were treated. In effect he was saying that dignity was more important than material well being. The means were just as important as the ends.

In effect, what some of the target group respondents were saying was that involvement in the development projects compromised their essential humanness. This was not ‘true’ development. ‘True’ development takes care of the person. The means are just as important as the ends. Material well being means nothing if it is at the cost of the soul. Their experience of development was thus negative because it impinged upon their spirituality.

The donors, however, held a different view on the achievements of their projects with respect to community participation and empowerment. One of the OHSIP Support Team felt that the communities had moved from being passive, non-
focused and diffuse to being politically active and strident in their demands for assistance. Granted, there was significant effort made in this direction. In both projects, community development committees were established, and these organisations benefited from training programmes – leadership, technical, administrative and participatory development skills – as well as being exposed to ideas and experiences of communities in other countries. Thus it cannot be said that projects were entirely negative in their outcomes. The problem was rather, according to the recipients, the way they were treated in development projects.

It is this indictment of donor agencies and development projects that links directly with the proposition that development negatively impacts upon the spirituality of Namibians. According to the target groups, it was their dignity that was insulted by the way they were treated in the projects. Their identity as Namibians and more profoundly, as humans, was compromised by the ways in which ‘participation’ was implemented in practice. Donors feel that the methodologies incorporated into projects to facilitate participation are authentic. In reality there is a ‘glass ceiling’ limiting the extent of recipient participation. Women and ‘visible minorities’ the world-over are familiar with this experience. Despite all the policies enacted to protect minority right and encourage affirmative action, such parties are still confronted by a limit to their empowerment.

This is no small matter. It is well documented how racism and sexism impact upon the psyche (I would add spirituality) of women and ‘visible minorities’. It is perhaps the intangible discriminations that are real yet cannot be adequately described that cuts the deepest. Additionally, when one’s equality is enshrined within a constitution, it is difficult to make the claim that one is still not equal.

---

16 See for example: Rivers Have Sources, Trees Have Roots: Speaking of Racism by Brand, D & Sri Bhagiyadatta 1986; Women’s Realities, Women’s Choices, Hunter’s College, Women’s Studies Collective 1983; Feminist Theory: from margin to center by bell hook 1987; This Bridge Called My Back: Writings by radical Women of Color, edited by C. Moraga and G. Anzaldua, 1981; The State of Black Britain by Dr. A. Haynes, 1983; as well as Sister Outside by Audre Lorde, 1984; and Returning the Gaze: Essays on Racism, Feminism and Politics, edited by H. Bannerji, 1993, to name just a few.
Anti-colonial and post-colonial perspectives have underlined the importance of culture as a framework that mediates people’s understanding of who they are, why they exist, how they should act and relate, what is ‘good’ and ‘bad’. In short it gives people a sense of their identity and affords them the dignity of all that being human means; the ability of thinking and making rational decisions. According to GTZ and IBIS, and most assuredly all other Western donor policies, this is one of the main goals of development. Donors pride themselves on policies and methodologies that support the empowerment of recipients. In reality, development projects preach false words.
Chapter 6

Namibian Discourses of Development

6.0 Introduction

The intention of Chapters Five and Six is to ground the examination of the three thesis objectives in the practical experiences of a case study in Namibia, and to specifically address the question whether development is having negative impact on the spiritual well being of Namibians. In Chapter Five, a number of Namibians involved in the two external support projects spoke of the insult they felt at the hands of donor agencies. They asserted that ‘true’ development would not compromise their dignity for the benefit of material well being. Is this a valid allegation? Do other Namibians share this feeling? What then would Namibians feel is a ‘better’ or ‘true’ development?

In order to obtain these Namibian perspectives on development, I interviewed a broad range of Namibians in the case study area. I speculated that there might be major differences between their conceptualisations of development and those of mainstream development. I speculated that some of these differences might be attributed to pre-colonial beliefs and values that survived colonialism and Christianity.

This chapter first describes the process that was followed in seeking the views of people in the case study area. It outlines the people who were interviewed, the type of information sought and why.

Secondly the responses of the respondents are given. Their views of external support projects are narrated and analysed. Their conceptualisations of development are then given. It will be seen that these conceptualisations of development encompass notions of spirituality, religion and the role of the church.
A final commentary is offered summarising the complex responses to the primary question. Is development having a negative impact on the spirituality of Namibians and Namibia? It is noted whether certain variables such as age, sex, ethnic group, profession or geographical location have any effect on the responses.

6.1 Rational and Information Sought

For each of the nine respondent groups, the types of information sought and the reasons why each group was selected are given.

6.1.1 Elders

It was speculated that in particular, elders would have memories of pre-colonial ‘traditional’ beliefs and values. I felt that it was important to examine how these values and beliefs related to modern day ones that accompanied new national identities and donor development approaches.

The elders were asked first: What did they know about stories of the old times? What were the beliefs about nature and how humans were to interact with the forces of nature? Did elements of the environment contain spirits that formed taboos of what humans could or could not do with nature’s resources? What were the beliefs about the roles of women, men, and children? What mechanisms were in place to guide community and social life? What taboos existed to protect each member of society and to promote harmonious communal life?

After accessing this type of information, the questions sought to make a link with a concept of development by asking what was good or bad about the old ways. What has been lost and what is still there? Have any of these losses affected the quality of life today? What is good and bad about the present day? What do you like about life today? What do you not like? How were these bad things kept away in the old days? How do you think life can be improved? It was felt that people’s evaluations of life in the past and the present might give an indication of what they felt was important in terms of development.
6.1.2 Traditional leaders

Kings were targeted because of the desire to use a ‘traditional’ approach in structuring the interviews in the case study area. However, traditional leaders were also questioned about their views of spirituality and development, and if they perceived a relationship between the two.

*A* Are you aware of traditional beliefs in Namibia? How did these beliefs affect everyday life in terms of influencing or protecting the environment or society? What is spirituality? What is development? What do you think should be the role of spirituality-religion-traditional beliefs in development?

6.1.3 Church leaders

The church played an important role in the struggle against colonialism and apartheid. It not only performed its spiritual tasks but also took a lead in political activities against the apartheid regime. In addition it provided the only avenue of socio-economic development for communities struggling to maintain a semblance of livelihood. Since independence the church has been forming its new mission, acquiring new spiritual direction and maintaining its voice in influencing the reconstruction and development of Namibia. I felt that above any other organisation in the country, the church and its leaders would be able to tie together concepts of spirituality and development.

Interviews with church leaders on all levels and from all denominations were sought. The majority of the interviews were conducted in the case study area where the Lutheran denomination is dominant; thus the majority of the interviewees were Lutheran pastors. Interviews with other denominations were also sought to see whether denominational differences existed with regard to concepts of development. Interviews with church leaders of various levels

---

1 Denominational differences, however, was not a pressing concern. Due to the history of Church opposition to the previous Government, the various denominations had had to form a unified political front, above and beyond any theological differences. To this day, the denominations form a generally unified body although this will undoubtedly diminish with time and the
were sought as it was thought that the head of the church (Bishops or Archbishops) for instance, would have a more national and international perspective than church leaders at a local level.

The questions progressed through querying their views on external support projects, their concepts of development, and the role of spirituality and religion in development.

As the dominant institution of Namibian religious life, I then wanted to examine what tensions existed in the church today. The relationship between traditional beliefs and Christianity was sought with a view to examining whether a continuum existed between the 'old' ways and the 'new'; whether Christianity allowed traditional beliefs to be encompassed and what the tensions were between the 'old' and the 'new'. What stresses existed in people's belief patterns and did this affect the strength of the church and Christianity in Namibia? If so, would this affect the role it played in rebuilding Namibian society? Would it weaken its influence on the people and vis-à-vis the Government? Would this in turn reflect on the strength of the link between spirituality and development, if one existed?

I also sought to uncover whether tensions existed between atheist beliefs acquired during the period of exile in Communist/Marxist countries and Christian beliefs. What are the present strengths/problems with the church/Christianity in Namibia given the modernisation trends and in view of the past role of Marxist/Communism in SWAPO and the exile population? Is reconstruction and development possible without reconciliation? Can the church ignore its responsibility to seek justice on behalf of those who believe they were wronged? What then of its prophetic voice? And what then is the role of the church vis-à-vis governance? How can it regain its prophetic voice and seek to influence the reconstruction and development of Namibia without the strong relationship it previously held with the SWAPO party?

Complexities of governance multiply, forcing individual denominations to take stands based more on their own theological positions and those of their home Church.

257
The detainee issue, as described in Chapter 4, was a topic that, if it had not been avoided, would have harmed the interviews with the church leaders. It was, and still is, a highly politicised issue upon which the churches of Namibia and the CCN have just begun to take a stance. Relations vis-à-vis the SWAPO Government is strained over the issue and individual parish leaders were reluctant to reveal their position. I therefore did not ask specific questions pertaining to it. It soon became apparent as I began to write the thesis that the issue represented a critical amplification of the tensions existing in a society trying to rebuild itself. I later conducted research into the issue. The detainee issue was contextualised within the broader issue of what the role of the Church should be for the future. How would it regain its position in the hearts of the Namibian community? How would it influence the reconstruction and development of Namibia?

6.1.4 CCN staff

The Council of Churches of Namibia was targeted because of its position as a unifying ecumenical organisation of the majority of the churches in Namibia and because of its prominent role in socio-economic development and political activities prior to, as well as after, independence. It acts on behalf of, and with the express permission of, its member churches but it also forms an agenda of its own. It can seek to urge the member churches to take a stance on issues or it can urge them to maintain the status quo. After independence it faced massive restructuring as the new Government increasingly took over its functions in development work. Since then it has been struggling to form its new mission. Whatever it may be, the CCN will undoubtedly continue to play a major role in shaping Namibian society, in its religious and spiritual capacities if not its old political and socio-economic ones.

Originally, the questions posed to CCN staff were specific only to the CCN; its organisational structure, its philosophy of development, and the role of the CCN in rebuilding Namibian society. However, it was felt during the interviews that the type of questions asked of church leaders might also be relevant. Thus questions were asked about traditional beliefs, concepts of religion,
spirituality and development, how spirituality and religious beliefs may interact with
development, what are the strengths and problems with Christianity and the church in
Namibia today, what is the role of the church in the process of reconciliation, reconstruction
and development, what are your views on international development philosophies and
approaches, and what are your views on the role of the church, religions, spirituality in
environmental management and the global ecological crisis. There was originally also no
reference made to the detainee issue, however, if the interviewee had no
objection to talking about it this was encouraged. As indicated above,
additional interviews were conducted with CCN staff. The interviews focused
on the role of the CCN in the future and what their new voice and new
mission in the rebuilding of Namibian society might be.

6.1.5 Community leaders

Community leaders were targeted due to the belief that their more prominent
role in the development of Namibian communities gives them a particular
perspective on development. An attempt was made to ascertain whether they
had a perspective on traditional beliefs, spiritual or religious values and whether
this perspective would have any connection with their understanding of
development. The following types of questions were asked: Are you aware of
'traditional' beliefs in Namibia? How did these beliefs affect everyday life in terms of
influencing or protecting the environment or society? What is the role of the church-religion-
Christianity in rebuilding Namibia? What is spirituality? What is development? What do
you think should be the role of spirituality-religion-traditional beliefs in development?

6.1.6 Namibian development agents

Namibian development agents included personnel from the Directorate of
Community Development (DCD), community officers associated with GTZ
environmental projects, OHSIP community officers, and rural water extension
officers (RWEO) of the Department of Water Affairs. Again, it was felt that
agents involved in development, as a profession would have a particular

2 This encompasses pretty much all the government development personnel
involved in the water sector.
knowledge of development and the issues surrounding it. Whether or not they would have a perspective on the existence of links between development and spirituality-religion—"traditional" beliefs was unknown and this was queried by the questions: What is development? What is spirituality? What do you feel is or can be the role of spirituality/religion in development? What are your views on the role of the church in the development of Namibia? What are your views on externally supported projects?

6.1.7 Informal settlement community members

The methodology for the informal settlement focus group discussions was modified from inception to implementation. It was originally thought that images of 'traditional' belief obtained through discussions with elders could be abstracted, drawn and shown to the focus group participants. From these images, they would be asked to write or tell a story about what each image (or selected images) meant. From their stories it would be ascertained whether or not they had knowledge of traditional beliefs. The story presentation would also lead to a discussion of whether they felt these 'old' ways were important, what their function was in society; for example, to protect the environment or to harmonise communal living. The participants would then be asked: What elements of life told in these stories had been lost from the past to the present, why have they been lost and whether or not it meant a loss in terms of the quality of life. What is 'good' and 'bad' about present day? What do you like about life today? What do you not like? How were these 'bad' things kept away in the 'old' days? How do you think life can be improved?

It was felt that if people's interpretations of what was 'good' and 'bad' about life in the past and the present might give an indication of what they felt was important in terms of development. The participants were divided into age and gender groups so that differences in each of their perspectives could be obtained and discussed as part of the process. However, this methodology was modified to account for the lack of images that could be distilled from the interviews with the elders. Rather than present pictures, words/terms were presented to the participants. They were asked to define these terms. The terms included:
Church  Ancestral spirits  God
Religion  Community  Spirituality
King/Queen  Donor agencies  Specific ancestors
Customary law  Traditional healer  (Mangundu, Kantene, Mungandjera)
Black bull  Household  Government
Prophet

Figure 6.1 shows a photograph of the methodology used in the informal settlements.

Figure 6.1 Informal Settlement Methodology

![Methodology setup with signs and labels]

The participants were divided into age and gender differentiated groups: elder men and elder women (+50), women and men (30-50), younger women and men (15-29), and youth (<15) depending on the makeup of the participants in each informal settlement. Each of the groups presented their definitions to the large group and were then asked to define a concept of development by
indicating which of the words/terms they thought were the most important to development. Group discussion followed commenting on each group's choice of words/terms and their concept of development.

6.1.8 Churchwomen's groups

Christian belief and the church form an important part of the everyday life of the majority of Namibian people, particularly in the rural areas. Women in particular form the backbone of congregations. Magdelena Shamena³ wrote in a proposal to the GTZ CAWS project⁴:

The Council of Churches has noticed the importance of women within the church members and the activities of women in congregations, especially during the struggle for independence of Namibia. Women during that time had a difficult time, calling upon God for help. They hadn't trusted anyone but God. They had prayed for their children, husbands and all who were in exile so that God could protect them and could bring about peace in Namibia. ….Therefore the CCN has given a desk to the women so that they could organise themselves, having a chance to be trained and gain new and different skills. During this Ecumenical Decade we are challenging our Churches to recommit themselves to affirming women's initiatives and enabling them to actively participate at all levels in Church and society. Now is the time to recognise women's experiences, gifts and potentials when it comes to leadership and to take measures to support and enable women's leadership. In order to do this successfully we have to tackle the training of women in different subjects in order to develop skills such as how to deal with our environment (GTZ CAWS 1995, p. 2).

³ Former CCN National Co-ordinator of Women's Desk.

⁴ The GTZ Communal Areas Water Project is a GTZ-supported project partnered with the Department of Water Affairs, Directorate of Rural Water Supply. The project was interested in developing a strategy using churchwomen's groups in the facilitation of rural water supply projects. The project funded a number of “Church Women's Leadership and Capacity Building Needs Assessment” workshops. While the project was probably not interested in the more esoteric questions of spirituality and development, the workshops it funded provided a forum for my research to query the link.
Shamena felt that because of the high level of involvement in Christianity and the church by rural people, the existence of church based groups in the communities, and the respected position of pastors, deacons and other church leaders (elders) as community leaders, that encouraging churchwomen’s groups to facilitate water supply projects may be an effective strategy in mobilising communities for this purpose. Targeting churchwomen’s groups was meant to test their views on development, and if they accorded any place for religious or spiritual values in development.

Could development projects such as CAWS utilise the position of churchwomen’s groups in communities to facilitate socio-economic development processes? Do church based groups, because they are formed within the whole realm of people’s religious and spiritual values represent an entry point into a community’s heart and soul? Will the use of such an entry point strengthen the process of development because a community’s motivation is based on their values and beliefs and not just on economic wellbeing?

Thus the churchwomen’s groups were invited to participate in workshops on women’s leadership and capacity building needs assessment\(^5\) as a first step in building a strategy around them. A number of reports of the workshops have been compiled by the facilitators (Kathindi 1996; Musabayane & Mudege 1996). The workshops had two major objectives: (1) to support church women to gain leaderships skill, particularly with regard to the management of their water supplies; and (2) to assess, in a participatory manner, the capacity building that the women would need in order to facilitate community management of rural water supplies in their communities. It was planned that further training workshops orientated to the specific skills needed by the women and identified during these first workshops, would be organised.

It was thought that as part of the case study research I would follow the progress of the whole process, from the initial workshop to the follow-up training workshops to assess the impact of the strategy on actual water supply

\(^5\) Capacity building needs assessment here refers to the need to identify with the Church women, training needs in women’s leadership skills, water-related technical information and communication and facilitation skills.
systems in the communities. Can churchwomen's groups successfully facilitate a process of water supply management? Can such groups access the cooperation of the community, and by implication, better than other groups or committees? Does this approach have any impact on the sustainability of water supply systems? However, it was my experience that while the initial workshops were initiated quickly, the follow-up workshops did not take place.

I attended the first workshop held at Omahene on April 17-18 1996 for the purpose of gaining an idea of what issues of development might emerge from the churchwomen's perspectives and whether religious values might have some connection to development. Based on these observations, I formatted a questionnaire to be given to participants of the second churchwomen's workshop (Oshakati 1-5 May 1996). The questions were first related to the workshop itself; what did you derive from the workshop? Have you been in workshops on women's issues before and how did this one differ? What did you learn at this workshop? How will this help you in working in the communities? This was an attempt to assess how useful this workshop had been and whether this approach of linking church women and community management of water supplies would be possible. The second set of questions then related to their knowledge of 'traditional' beliefs, and their understanding of concepts of religion, spirituality and development. I was seeking a link between spirituality and development from their perspective.

The GTZ project was pleased with the preliminary results of the first workshops. The facilitators (IWSD, Zimbabwe and CCN Women's Desk) assessed the approach as having potential for accessing rural communities which central Government community development staff (RWEO and DCD) could not regularly attend (Musabayane & Mudege 1996). The majority of Namibians, particularly in the case study area, are Christian. The church is an important institution and it represents a powerful force that can motivate development activities. The GTZ project expressed its desire to explore the full potential of this approach. There was for example the potential to explore how theological ('Bible') study could help in environmental protection. At the
second workshop (2-5 May 1996) ‘Bible’ Reverend Nangula Kathindi facilitated study on the ‘integrity of creation’. The story of Jesus and the Samaritan at Jacob’s well was used to stimulate discussion on the importance of water as life. Passages from Exodus, Isaiah and the Psalms were also used to show how ‘God’ created the world and entrusted humanity with its care. ‘Bible’ study was also directed to community management through the story (Book) of Nehemia and to women’s leadership. Women figures in the ‘Bible’ were highlighted to show women in strong positions of leadership (Kathindi 1996).

My research however, was not able to move beyond the initial phases in analysing whether churchwomen’s groups could successfully facilitate water supply management. This was due to the fact that the churchwomen’s groups required a lengthy period of capacity building covering such diverse fields as management, administrative, leadership skills, and training in technical aspects of water supply. The churchwomen’s groups themselves in the first workshop identified these training needs.

The significance of this initiative relating to the participation of churchwomen’s groups is that it was believed by myself and others that because the church represented religious beliefs and values that were central to the lives of Namibian communities, church groups would provide a powerful force in facilitating development. This was also the rationale taken by the World Bank. Whether this will prove correct, and what problematic issues emerge in this approach provides the basis for further research.

6.1.9 Traditional healers

I targeted traditional healers because not only did they seem to remember ‘traditional’ beliefs but they also used them in their work as healers. They generally believed that illnesses could be attributed to the invasion of bad spirits into a person’s body. These spirits were not necessarily assumed to be bad; it was also possible that a person had done something ‘bad’ and ancestral

---

6 Nangula Kathindi was elected the new General Secretary of the CCN at the March 1999 General Assembly of the Council of Churches of Namibia.
spirits had invaded the body to warn the person of their wrongdoings. Spiritual healers used a combination of spiritual cleansing, herbal medicine and counselling to cure their patients. I felt that this perspective would offer much to my search to understand 'traditional' beliefs and spirituality in the Namibian context.

I asked them questions relating to their work first of all to understand how they used spirits to heal. I then asked what they thought spirituality is, and how it might relate to development.

6.2 Responses

I first present a composite quotation of the responses, which I feel give a representative view of the respondents and which highlight the most insightful of their responses. These are contained in the text boxes. The list of respondents is given in Appendix 1. The interview questions are given in Appendix 2 and the full transcripts of the interview results are given in Appendix 3. Following the narratives of the respondents, I offer a summary highlighting the main emphases of the respondents' views of external support projects and their conceptualisations of development and spirituality.

6.2.1 Views on External Support Projects

These are the narratives of the respondents in regards to their view of external support projects.

Church Leaders:

International development agencies are not really interested in the development of Africa or of any particular community. They choose to give rations to countries to foster dependence and carry out their own motives and get good appraisals rather than to pay attention to the long-term future of Namibia. Africa is in further debt than before and the debt payments have drained Africa of its resources. Development as it now stands is totally unacceptable. The biblical understanding of development is of that communities have the strength to develop themselves. Spirituality forms the community's strength. It cannot be taken out and replaced with someone's spirituality. The Government needs to take a role in development by working with communities to identify their basic needs and how to solve these problems before going out to donors for money. This makes a regional planning process a necessity where all civil and political representation is involved.
Development, water resources, roads, buildings, schools, preserving nature; all this was led by the church before independence. We do appreciate external support but the problem is that these agencies dictate where and how to use the resources that they give. We know our needs but we do not always know how to define them and thus ESAs do not listen to us. But they should listen to us and our advice. External agencies say “we are the experts” but there is no way that they can be the experts in Namibia. We Namibians are the experts in our own country. The way development is set up now, the majority does not benefit. Only the elite are pocketing the money. Western countries are hand-in-hand with this. So the role of the church needs to be prophetic; to challenge the political and economic injustices.

I have seen donor projects and Government projects that people end up leading who do not have very good spirit. They take what is intended for everyone for himself or herself. They do not love but care only for themselves.

Overall, external support agencies were seen in a negative light. They were seen to perpetuate the dependency of their supposed beneficiary countries. The church leaders believed that external projects are mostly concerned with themselves and their reputation rather than the long-term future of Namibia. The notion of the ‘expert’ was challenged. It was argued that external development agents are perceived to be the ‘experts’ but they did not even listen to the advice or suggestions of the people. It was also felt that international development in fact allows or perhaps conspires with the national elite to pocket money at the expense of the people in real need.

CCN Staff:

Some ESA programmes are useful, some are not. Some programmes just try and do things for the communities but they don’t know anything about them. If a programme does not have respect for the participants and does not care for their feelings, then they do not empower the people and this is not development. I ask, do the programmes care about people’s experiences? Do they respect and care for traditional belief and ensure that their activities do not push them down? Will they learn about them?

ESA programmes need to integrate the religious/spiritual aspect of people’s lives more. But they say they are here just to give money and pretend that humanity and development has no feelings. There is a need for concerned people to make ESAs more aware of the need for spirituality in development. When foreign Governments want to give aid, they go to our Government and they decide together the context of development. The church is not involved. But maybe the church should be involved to judge the criteria of the development agreement.

The overall perspective on external support development projects was again negative. The CCN staff felt that external projects show little respect, not just for people’s knowledge and experience, but also, importantly, their feelings, values and beliefs. Projects need to respect the ‘traditional’ beliefs, religious
values and spiritual dimensions of the people. Without this respect, the CCN staff felt that projects are just supplying basic needs by the most economically efficient means possible but in a dehumanising and humiliating way. Thus there was resentment expressed against external support development projects and their approaches to dealing with local communities.

Community Leaders:

The ESA projects I know have been very helpful in terms of promoting reconciliation. They (OHSIP and SWAM) applied their programmes to everyone, without regard for political or religious affiliation. They asked people to come together as a community to work together as a team for the benefit of all society and not just for one particular group. The church can also play an important role in this, to help unite people in communities from the grassroots.

The missionaries tended to push us down, those of us who had wisdom. They used to say that such and such was not educated and not help her. For example, I was smart in school so they got me to teach others and blocked my way to get further education. So I realised that missionaries did not want people to be advanced. But external support programmes have come with grants and a good spirit. ESA programmes are good in that they don’t mind sending uneducated people out for training. I have been sent for training and this has really helped me teach others how to keep money and do traditional projects.

Church-based development is different from that of Government or external support agencies. Church leaders are closer to the people and have meetings with the people often. The Government should use spiritual leaders to spread messages out. Spiritual leaders are not there just to preach but to contribute to improving living conditions of the community. Spiritual leaders work closely with traditional leaders. If you have an external support agency project, they will eventually have to work with church leaders anyway. Because the Governor has to be to the Headman, who then has to go to the church leaders.

The Government defines development at a very high level; for investment rather than at the grassroots level. But this is not the fault of the Government; they are also dictated to by other Governments and the donors. They cannot act the way they want. The church as well as the communities needs to help the Government to work with donors and to bring development (and the donor agencies) more in line with what is really needed. It is an issue of accountability.

Community leaders drew attention to the distinction between international development and past missionary and colonial activity. In comparison to those past forms of ‘development’, international development is seen in a positive light. External support projects have assisted Namibians with the task of reconciliation. The benefits derived from the projects transcend all religious and political divisions. This has promoted a ‘good spirit’ in Namibia. Thus,

7 The political alliances to SWAPO and DTA was described in Chapter 4.
Unlike the CCN staff and church leaders, community leaders felt that external support agency projects were having a positive impact on Namibia's development.

However, it was also felt, in comparison to church-based development, international development is lacking in terms of its closeness to people. Closeness seems to refer to an institutional rather than a spiritual relationship. Church leaders are close because they are right in the villages with the people and have a regular mechanism for meeting with people (the parish).

**Development Agents:**

I don't think ESA's are part of Namibia. I know the process of ESA development programmes. I am introduced to all the officials. They say they need DCD to help organise and mobilise the communities so I am familiar with these ESA aims and objectives. We are here and know how to operate but these ESA programmes lack in knowing or caring what people believe or not. The only reason these programmes are not rejected is because people benefit materially from them. But it is not good enough. I can see that one problem with ESA programmes is that the expatriates are very different from us, personality wise. They do not seem to have spirituality. It is as if religion is not important for them and they don't even recognise this. Why? Perhaps because they don't know the culture and are not willing to be a part of it. There is no way a programme can be successful this way. Relatedly, these programmes do not respect community views. The people want and expect to be respected. It is not good that expatriates are always seen as being the expert in total. It should not always be the way that expatriates give the instructions to the community, along with their values, and they do it through DCD. They should go to the communities themselves and understand the communities and their values. They need to learn to work with the communities instead of for the communities.

Again, external support projects were seen in a very negative light primarily because of the lack of regard and willingness to learn about Namibian culture; its beliefs and values. Development agents also challenged the notion of the 'expert' and argued that these 'experts' are not in fact objective, but carry their own values; values that seem to be generally bereft of a religious or spiritual dimension.

---

8 The Directorate of Community Development, Ministry of Regional and Local Government and Housing, mandated to initiate and promote community development programmes in all regions. The Directorate usually establishes CDCs or community development committees in communities to facilitate these efforts.
Overall, perspectives on external support development projects revealed that there are serious questions being asked of the Northern donor agency approach to development. Development agents, CCN staff and church leaders argued that Northern donor agencies showed a great disrespect for the culture, values and beliefs of local communities. Respondents challenged the notion that the 'expert' is an objective agent, free of her/his own cultural values. Rather they argued, donor values are wholly embedded in a Western idolatry of materialism. These values are being imposed on local cultures through development projects. They believed that 'experts' should take the time to get to know the cultures of the local people; their values and beliefs as well as knowledge and experiences. Church leaders were particularly disturbed by the arrogant attitude that 'experts' projected. They also felt that 'experts' and external projects in general, were more concerned with their own reputation and “getting good appraisals” than with the long term future of Namibia. The CCN staff and church leaders also felt that external support projects, by focusing on efficiency and other economic parameters, have forgotten the human dimension of development.

Yet the other positive position that community leaders revealed can also not be forgotten. In fact community leaders felt that external support projects, because they were not involved in the war, presented a clean slate upon which to imagine development. Political affiliation was no longer an issue in how one lived and if one was able to realise ambitions or goals. Thus external support agencies were liberating identities, and helping to create a new Namibia.

Namibian perspectives on external support projects are thus multi-dimensional, neither wholly positive nor negative. However, the dissatisfaction expressed by many of the respondents obliges some examination of what suggestions they might have to make development 'better', or in the words of some respondents, 'true'. These conceptualisations of development follow.

6.2.2 Concepts of Development

The respondents' concepts of development were:
Development needs to be done through traditional ways. In the old days, people used to come together in families and communities to do projects like dig wells. This was called "aiho" which means eye - "calling people together to see what people have done". Everybody shares labour. People won’t do this anymore. They want money for their labour.

People used to have discipline in the old days. But now people are getting educated and only believe in what the books say. We are losing all our traditional ways. Children used to learn from the elders how to behave and communicate with adults. Now both the elders and the young are sitting at kuka shops. There are not very good spirits anymore. Adults are no longer teaching the young values. Between women and men things have changed too. They used to sit together and solve problems. Now they go and get drunk and fight. We also have to go and buy things now instead of making them. This makes the nation poor.

Development is the Government and things changing, like from changing from being pagan to Christian.

Development is to work hard and go forward.

In the old days people were much more spiritual. They were strong believers, not like us Christians today. Back then people had more respect for things and there was more order. Today we take all our knowledge from books. We do not learn the wisdom of the elders anymore. There is a saying "okwa shungila" which means this person has been sitting around the fire. This person is wise.

Today women can have their own house. Before they had to go back to their parent’s place. Women can also drive cars. Women are given a chance now. Before they were pushed back without a voice. Now they are liberated and free, especially in regards to inheritance law where the husband’s family used to be able to come and take everything. Now she can keep what she worked for. I don’t believe this will cause women to leave or colonise men.

Development is when a person is moving and changing his mind and thoughts to become better.

Development is how the world has changed. In the old days people were afraid to do certain things because of beliefs. But now people have no fear, no discipline and no respect for the elders.

Development is when a person has advanced, come to a new level in her ideas and thoughts. Society has advanced today because we want to bring back our traditional values and these shall be written down as our customary laws. The young generation will always know them.

In the old days there were rules to protect the environment, trees especially. But with colonisation, the powers of the old ways were reduced and the environment became destroyed. Now with independence, our customary laws are coming back and hopefully this will help the environment.

Development is when a nation has clear, healthy water and food and can take care of itself. It is also when people are thinking about the future of their community. Development is when the community has jobs and where there is peace and good relations between people, including love. Development is when there is freedom of speech and when people have the freedom to create development projects that will create jobs.
The elders indicated that there are both negative and positive dimensions associated with contemporary society. The most important negative aspect was the loss of an ethic of sharing and responsibility to the community, as well as to the environment. For the elders, the disintegration of moral values had resulted in a loss of dignity. The elders talked about the loss of spirit; that in the 'old' days there was better spirit in the community because there was respect between people. The breakdown of community had led to abuse of alcohol, which further decimated the community and promoted 'bad spirits'.

However, the changes had not all been negative. In fact change was seen to be generally good, as long as it meant that life was improving or going forward. The fact that women, for example, were freer from 'traditional' values that limited their ability to participate in society was seen as a positive development. It is interesting to note that it was the male respondents who vocalised this concern for women and not the women themselves. Regardless, their responses highlighted the importance of not idealising the past and its 'traditions' without a critical examination of the context of memories. Equally, the elders implied that it was important not to idealise modern development as a panacea for contemporary society. Development was thus 'good' if it combined the best of the 'old' and the 'new' and created 'better' community (spirit).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Church Leaders:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Development must be holistic. It cannot be for short-term relief, which in the end helps the giver more than the receiver. It must be value oriented where the whole person is uplifted. Development must have a foundation and a destination i.e. to enable a person to do things for him/herself but it must not be something given to a person to make them dependent and to look up to someone who is better than you and to give them power over you. The end product of development is to enable a community to assist another community to realise their own potential.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development is moving forward in whatever you are involved in; to learn better ways and to grow in ideas. For example, when the missionaries first came, only foreigners were allowed to be pastors, but now we have even our own bishops.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development is to wake up and have a better understanding.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

272
Development means that we won’t stay but will move forward in our life, work, economy and in our education.

Echoes of liberation theology can be heard in the church leaders’ concepts of development. Development is not just about better living conditions but about the uplifting of the soul; that within a person which empowers. The church leaders felt that the most important goal of development must be to support people to realise their own potential. Thus development cannot be conducted in a manner which leaves people dependent, or in a manner which dismisses or hinders people’s own abilities and power. The goal of development is to help people achieve self-sufficiency, not in the economic sense, but in the ability to choose direction, to move towards it and to receive help when needed, on their own terms, with pride.

Reference to the ‘Namibianisation’ of the church highlighted this belief. As we have seen, the missionaries did not allow Namibians to take on pastoral positions in the missions. This was a deliberate attempt to prevent a Namibian theology of liberation from developing. The role of the church in the struggle for independence illustrated how critical it was to develop a Namibian consciousness in the establishment of a popular organised movement of liberation.

CCN Staff:

In the context of the church, if the church can train its own people, and it has the capacity to improve the life of the church i.e. through its own fundraising, and not depend on foreign aid, then it is developed. The church is also developed if it is Africanised rather than being more Westernised than the West. Development in the church is also when spirituality is connected to everyday life with bottom up participation. There needs to be more people-led Bible stories in service. There also needs to be more equal interaction between the pastor and the people. The church is losing lots of people because of the “holy position” of the pastors. In general, development is when something happens to people’s lives, when they start thinking of different ways and they move from place to place. People realise their needs, prepare themselves and organise and work for improvement. Development needs to be an ongoing and spontaneous process. Development is about improvement, Development is about being proud of one’s place and one’s own material level, no matter how poor. It is also about giving support and taking responsibility for others. It is about dignity.

Development is the improvement of people’s quality of life, making it better. But the way development is imparted- made into a commodity that some have and some do not have so that it can be given to the other for a price, that is not development. It is only material. Development is about a blessed giving and sharing with one who is less
blessed. The "giver" should be humble with no opinion of how it should be used because we have to receive in humility. There have been lots of resources wasted because there has not been this partnership. If we could sit down together and listen to the needs of each other this would be better. If the heart of the giver is just to improve their image, there is something missing in this gesture. Development is also about learning to enjoy the simple life. A simple lifestyle can bring much pleasure. We are free to seek the needs and successes of others and thus hold happiness in our hearts. Development cannot continue to mean more consumption, more commodities. What is the wisdom of so much accumulated wealth when there are so many unsolved problems? In Namibia we have enough resources to support our population. Why do we always look for more?

Development is a way of improving humanity in all spheres, not just materially but also spiritually.

The CCN staff brought up two important concepts of development. First, self-sufficiency was recognised as being crucial to 'being developed'. Second, it was recognised that identity is critical. There is dignity and pride in that identity which should not be compromised for material well being. Development is in fact a 'state of being' that cannot be measured by (possession or pursuit of) commodity. Development is the sharing of resources and taking responsibility for others less fortunate.

Reference was made to the 'heart of the giver', in other words, the CCN staff challenges the motivation of donors. Are they in development for their own good, or really for the purpose of helping others? The attitude of the donor was also challenged. Help needs to be given with humility not arrogance. The relationship must be one of partnership, of equal power afforded by an ethic of sharing and service, rather than charity.

The overall goal of development must also be challenged. Perpetual consumption and pursuit of wealth is detrimental to the pursuit of spiritual happiness.

Community Leaders:

Development is an ongoing process to promote the production of consumable goods and in a quantity that brings the benefits to the majority of the community or society. It is where education is promoted; health; welfare services, and literature, arts and crafts are also promoted. It is about maintenance and running an administrative system to maintain existing infrastructure and institutions.

Development is about moving forward, planning and having a Government structure and planning process.
Development is helping the community to go forward. It is something that will change you and help you take up an advanced stage.

Development is about the horizontal relationship between people and the earth. It is concerned with upliftment and empowerment. There are three stages of development and societal evolution. In the first stage the church is always the highest building in a village or city. It indicated the central role that the church and religion plays in people’s lives. In the second stage, there is a constant emphasis on education. In the third stage, the emphasis is on economic wealth. It does not matter how educated or religious you are. To get ahead you only need to be rich. The tallest buildings are now bank buildings. There is currently no system in dialogue with the economic system. In Namibia, the Government priority is to get as much investment as possible. This unfortunately goes against what the people need. For example, the free trade zone in Walvis Bay. The investors do not want to deal with the trade unions.

Development comes out of a society that is humane. In the apartheid state, humanity for the blacks was denied. It practised a concept of some having bigger humanity than others. So long as humanity is not practised, there can be no development. If we have development projects within a society where some people’s humanity is recognised to be bigger than others do, then development is simply based on a concept of making life better for certain groups at the expense of others. In the African culture there is a deep sense of respect. It was hierarchical but it carried the idea of respect as part of African humanity. Christianity endangered this concept of humanity by segregating against the blacks.

Development should empower people and equip them towards their own selfhood and independence. It should not make them dependent and unable to take care of their own actions. It seems now a day’s people are so dependent on this issue of development. They are losing interest in their own humanity. For example, in the food distribution scheme; the distributors were suddenly big bosses. They shouted at people and made them wait for hours and hours. The people were deeply insulted and only came back because of a deep need. This is not development. In hospitals people also have to wait for hours and hours. The process of seeing a doctor is so dehumanising and frustrating that there is no development. Development is about self-confidence.

Two complementary objectives of development were recognised. Development is about the production of material benefits such as education and health. In order to attain such objectives, it is important to have a system of governance, supported by an efficient administrative structure.

However, development cannot also then mean the pursuit of economic growth at the expense of human dignity. Human values, what it means to be human must govern economics and development. If the essential humanity of people is compromised, that is not development.

Development should thus empower people and equip them towards their own ‘selfhood’. It should not make people dependent. However, some development
schemes are doing exactly that and compromising once again the dignity of
people, dehumanising them so that it can no longer be called development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development Agents:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I have seen the shift between economic to human resources development. But development is deeper. It is about the human centre. People are the key in bringing about change i.e. in living conditions. I don't believe development will happen unless there is the awareness of the need to improve. I do not like imposed concepts of development. People have their old ways and these are not bad. I prefer that if development happens that it is a kind that people are comfortable with. People develop at their own pace. Development should mean capacity building, not in the sense that is used by external donors but in the sense that people should have the ability to reason and choose their own way. The benefits have to be positive and satisfaction brought about by the main actors in our own development. Human development is the key and this means having the capacity to choose improvement. There are many traditional beliefs that could foster development, especially in the protection of the environment. But in Namibia there are no groups that support traditional beliefs. No women's groups or any NGOs and in DCD there is no institution either. It is up to the individual activator to understand traditional beliefs as an entry point to development.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This is the strongest vocalisation yet of the perspective that development is not just about material well being. Three distinct yet inter-related concerns about development were articulated. First, there must be awareness within people that motivates them to change or effect development. This awareness cannot be imposed by development projects seeking to motivate communities to participate in a process that is not their own.

Second, at the heart of development is the ability of people to rationalise their own decisions about change. The development agents considered, however, that the capacity building approach used by external support agents was inappropriate and not truly indicative of development. In my interviews with the development agents, they elaborated. They argued that external support projects tend to use capacity building in the sense of training local communities to be able to do what the projects have assigned as tasks for them. This, they argued was too superficial. Capacity building should be about helping the communities see all of the options available to them, assessing the variables involved in the options, and then identifying ways in which communities can acquire what is needed to complete or progress along their chosen approach or specific activity. This, they argued, is what human development is. Anything
other than the full building of people’s capacities is paternalistic. Thus again, the ethics of relations is seen to be an important issue for development.

Third, the development agents identified the need to examine traditional values, beliefs and ways of doing things and what relevance they might have for development. They argued that there are some traditional ways that would motivate communities, for example, to protect the environment. They also identified the need for some sort of institution that would specifically examine the relevance of traditional beliefs for development.

A different approach to defining development was used with the informal settlement community members. A list of words was presented to the community members. They were asked them to choose the words that they felt were the most important words in relation to development. The words that were connected frequently to development are shown in Table 6.1.

Table 6.1 What is the most important to development?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORD</th>
<th>NUMBER OF TIMES CONNECTED WITH DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Church</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King/queen</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donor agency</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prophet</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>healer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customary laws</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each group was asked to present their results to the larger group and these were discussed. These are their responses.

Okangwena community

Elder men

Development is through the Government. We have gained a lot of knowledge.

Young women

The most important words to explain development are Government, church, king/queen, household, traditional healer and prophet. We get our strength through the church until we got our new Government. The Government is now leading us
well, for example, building new houses, schools and hospitals. We have electricity and water, some even in our houses.

Elderly women

The church is the one that has brought us spirituality and through spirituality we have gotten religious beliefs. The church has also brought us schools where we learn to read and write. Through the teachings of the church we have become more aware and have learned about the Government and our elected leaders.

Amunkambya community

Elderly men

The church has played an important role in development. It taught us how to read and write. Through that we have been able to have leaders like pastors, teachers and doctors. Prophets played an important role in development by prophesising war, rain and now independence. The community also plays a large part because they have cooperated to get infrastructure like roads and electricity. The Government has also brought in donor agencies. Development has also brought in bad things like rape and stealing though.

Youth

The church has brought on development by teaching people to read and write and have the know-how and to be aware of what is going on in the world. The church brought about religion and what it is to know God. The kings brought unity and to love one another because people need to have a good relationship and work together as children of one mother. Donor agencies have brought in hygiene to the communities and good relations between people. The household has brought about an increase of people due to reproduction. It has also brought about so that a woman can be governed by a man. The household also brings about good neighbourly relations.

Elderly women

When the church came, we developed because in the old days we believed in ancestral spirits and Kalunga and black bulls to get rain. These have been put down when development came and religion spread. Now we have donor agencies, which bring employment to communities, build houses and development people so that they can do this themselves. They also help the Government learn how to do these things. Some customary laws are also going because of development.

Young men

A lot of people now believe in Christianity and we have advanced. In the old days we had kings and life was difficult with them. The church is the most important element of development. It is Christianity that made us understand what is good and bad.

Young women

We are now baptised and believing in God. We can read the bible ourselves. We have hospitals and doctors. We are now united from all different tribes. We now have water and airplanes and better housing and sugars and sweets and we are now attending school. It is the church, which is the most important element of development because they began by educating us.

The community groups raised a number of issues. First, it was felt that the church was the most important element of development. Their reasons included the fact the church led development efforts before independence. The
church was the first to educate people in how to read and write. They felt that being able to read the bible and thus mediate their own beliefs was a major achievement in their development. They felt that Christianity gave them the ability to differentiate between 'good' and 'bad'. The church was also involved in raising awareness especially about the Government and elected leaders and thus played a role in building civil society.

The Government was important because it was introducing such development as new houses, schools, and hospitals, electricity and water. It was also important because it was bringing in donor agencies. But development was also introducing negative effects like stealing and rape. I am not sure why rape was brought up, particularly as the SSD study (1993) indicated that serious crimes such as rape and murder had declined since independence. The reference to stealing may be attributed to greater material wealth in the communities as a result of development.

The household and community were thought to be important because while the household was the source of people and good neighbourly relations, the community as a whole worked together to have development take place.

Donors were considered 'good' because they helped to bridge relations between people in the communities who, during the war, were divided by their political affiliations (DTA and SWAPO). After the war ended, much bitterness remained, impinging on the ability of communities to work for development. Because donors were not aware of these tensions in the community, or did not allow them to impact on the implementation of project goals and activities, communities were forced together and even if past differences were not entirely laid aside, projects and development activities took place regardless.

Thus the promotion of relational ethics were considered as an important measure of development.

In contrast to the development agents, the community members were critical of 'traditions'. They were grateful that first the church and then development
and donors brought an end to some customary laws. This comment was related to the fact that donor projects constructed new water supplies for the community and thus ended a dependence on their traditional way of getting water⁹ (black bulls). In fact, the communities did not obtain their water supplies in this fashion immediately prior to the construction of new water systems. However, this indicated that people recognised that some ‘traditional’ ways impeded development.

Overall, development is interpreted in a much more abstract way than the typical material emphasis that underpins much contemporary Western development theory. There can be no doubt that the acquisition of basic needs is a necessary project of development, however, all the respondents felt that the way in which development was implemented was equally, if not more important. They indicated a belief that development is centrally about being in ‘good’ relation and about working with others in ‘good’ relation for the benefit of all. The development process should, it was agreed, be governed by values such as care, love, responsibility, equality, humility, sharing, and service. Above all development should be about human dignity and the empowerment of the force within people that, in turn, motivates them to work for improvement of the self as well as the community. This is ‘good’ development. Development was therefore considered to be about the power within, rather than power over.

According to the respondents, the goal of development should be to support individuals, in relation to community, to have control over their own lives. However, for the development agents, control did not refer to just political and economic autonomy. It referred to the ability of individuals (in relation) to rationalise decisions about change and development. For any given situation, it was believed that people should be able to see what options are available, assess all of the variables involved, identify the resources needed, and finally

⁹ There is a ‘traditional’ belief that in order to bring rain, a black bull and a young girl must be taken to the source of the rain (an area in present day Angola) and sacrificed.

280
make a decision based on this critical examination. Development, the development agents argued, if imposed from the outside, can harm this process. If people are told what they need to do in order to obtain basic needs, they lose the ability to think for themselves, and lose their dignity.

The elders in particular discussed the importance of ‘traditional’ values and the ‘old’ ways in guiding the meaning of development. Some respondents were more critical than others in the sense of acknowledging the need to examine ‘traditions’ within the contemporary context in order to assess what ‘traditions’ might be appropriate and useful. For example, some male elders acknowledged that women had in fact benefited when customary laws were abandoned. They gained more freedom in their communities, they were able to drive a car, and with the recent change in marriage laws, they saw that women would gain equal rights to land ownership. There was therefore an awareness of the need not to idealise the past or memories of the past. However, at the same time, it was also agreed that modern development should not be seen as a panacea for all of Namibia’s problems. It was recognised that development had imposed a materialist consciousness and that this is destroying cultural values that were ‘good’ such as ‘aiho’ which in the past, brought families and communities together to build common facilities such as water wells. Whereas in the past, everyone shared labour freely, now-a-days people will not do anything unless they receive money. Thus as Escobar (1995) argued (Chapter One) there is evidence of ‘hybridity’ or ‘hyphenated condition’ in the responses of the Namibians.

According to these perspectives on development, the relationship between spirituality and development is thus implicit. For respondents in the study area, spirituality appears to govern development. Spirituality gives meaning to development. It imbibes development with the values of care and responsibility so that development becomes centrally about being in ‘good’ relation and working for the common ‘good’.

It is recognised therefore that there is a link between spirituality and development; a role for spirituality to play in determining what ‘good’
development is. To further understand this link, Namibian concepts of spirituality are first given.

6.2.2.1 Concepts of Spirituality

These are the definitions given to spirituality. A differentiation between spirituality and religion is encompassed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elders:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Religion is faith and trust in God, creator of the world, and in Jesus Christ. Spirituality means belief in Kalunga and having faith.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion is faith in God because religion came through God. Spirituality is in different types. It can be people working together in peace and love. Or it can mean bad spirits which divide people. The spirit is that which brings relationship between people. Religion and spirituality are not the same but have a close relationship. You cannot have religion without spirituality but you can have spirituality without religion. Spirituality is something inside.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion is when you have faith in God, believe that God is alive and will give you everlasting life and save you from your sins. Spirituality is the Holy Spirit sent by Jesus Christ to his disciples.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion is faith in God and Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit as one. Spirituality is coming through faith. Spirituality is inside you. It comes when you have faith and start working the work of religion. You recognise that a person is good and has a good spirit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spirituality is your feelings inside. It gives you strength and power to help others.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The elders made a clear distinction between spirituality and religion, although as the Dalai Lama and others emphasised (Chapter One), they can also be one in the same. Religion was seen to be the faith is a ‘God’ figure, either the Christian ‘God’ or in the ‘traditional’ Kalunga. It implies belief in and practice of religious doctrines such as the ‘Holy Trinity’. Spirituality is the feeling inside that can come through religious practice or through ‘good’ relations with people and work for others.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Church Leaders:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Religion is a system of beliefs that is adapted to our own lives, experiences and capabilities. Spirituality is how I live out my responsibilities and make sense of my responsibilities to oneself, my family and the community. Spirituality is the satisfaction I derive from this. This can be done within the construct of traditional beliefs or Christianity. Spirituality can be enriched by socio-economic, moral and interpersonal situations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Spirituality and religion are one in the same. Spirituality is about knowing God, having beliefs, whether traditional or Christian and following the rules and norms of God as a set of taboos on what not to do. Spirituality is the worship of God or Kalunga not just within a church service, but in terms of a concept of doing what is right, and of repentance. Christianity is about how to worship God through the church but traditional beliefs worshipped God too.

Spirituality is to be in the spirit of God, being ruled by the laws of God and by being united with God through Jesus Christ and fellow humans.

Spirituality is a spirit deep within you, which means that you believe in God.

Spirituality is brought under the church but the church does not know what spirituality is. It means to really know what the word of God is, to love each other, to commit to each other and to be united. Churches have so many rules about what to do and not to do. People cannot be free with all these rules and there is more fear than love. Spirituality is about loving.

There is no difference. Christianity is what you believe and this belief is spirituality. There is only one spirit which guides your belief to do well – this is Christianity.

Religion is belief in God and that His Word is Truth. It is faith. Spirituality means to believe in God and that He will take care of us.

As should be expected, for the most part, church leaders did not make as clear a distinction between spirituality and religion. Faith in ‘God’ and spirituality are one in the same. One cannot be spiritual if one is not also Christian. However some dissatisfaction about the feeling that the church is so ‘rule oriented’ (read doctrinal) that people cannot worship ‘God’ freely and thus experience their spirituality was expressed.

CCN Staff:

Religion is a practice which people follow with rituals and procedures. Spirituality is what comes up inside when you go to church and do these rituals. It is what you feel when you pray and so devotion. It is the practice of my religion. Spirituality is connectedness to people and nature. With nature it is connectedness of yourself to nature. With people, it is seeing the beauty within people.

Religion is a set of things done like a routine, but spirituality is what holds the power, the excitement, full of life. In all religions, people are spiritual. There are many religions but few are spiritual.

Religion is a belief, a social concept in which you believe that power holds one’s existence. Spirituality is linked. Religion guides your spirituality, your morality, your power and commitment and maintains your existence.

CCN staff believed that spirituality and religion are linked, closely related. However, they are also distinct. Religion is the ‘practice of spirituality’; the rituals and procedures established to express spirituality. Spirituality is the force of life and power within that exists before, within but also without religion.
Community Leaders:
Religion is to adhere to ethical values of one’s belief in supernatural beings. It is to benefit spiritually.
Namibia is a very religious country where 95% of the people are Christian. Spirituality is having good morals.
Religion is faith and believing in God. Spirituality is having a good spirit and good will and keeping what you believe inside.

Spirituality leads to the dimension of practical relationship manifested in a community. It forms reflections on God and what that relationship between people and God can be. Religion is the work of God, a Way of Life. It is also not just an institution but a whole way of life, especially in the rural areas. It is the total expression of humanity for God. Religion contains spirituality. When I think of spirituality I think of the way men are transported in the back of big trucks like cattle. If their humanity were respected, they would be in a bus.

Again, it is believed that spirituality is the force within, which can be expressed through religion. Spirituality is that which compels humans to seek an expression of ‘God’. Spirituality is also about human dignity and respect for humanity.

Development Agents:
Religion is the practice people follow; the rituals and the procedures people follow. It teaches us faith and gives us rules and regulations to follow. Spirituality is a way of life. It is an abstract feeling of what you feel within yourself. It is emotional. It enhances the continuity of human life and for living harmoniously for instance with nature. When you see beautiful nature you feel connected, you feel your spirit and you know that God exists. Spirituality and religion are interconnected but the church does not promote this relationship.

The development agents were particularly expressive of the belief that spirituality is an abstract feeling within a person that mediates life and connects one to others and nature. They also felt that spirituality and religion should be one in the same, but they were critical of the church in not promoting this relationship.

Informal Settlement Members
Okangwena community
Elder men
Spirituality is something which you receive from God that can guide you. Through spirituality and churches we can develop our minds. Religion is believing in God. But we have not forgotten Kalunga who we call when we have problems.
Young women
Spirituality is the Holy Spirit which is the heart. Religion is Christianity and means God, the Father and the Trinity as the true God.

Elderly women

Spirituality is the spirit of God. But our spirit is going backwards now. People do not attend church services anymore. Religion is Christianity and a belief in God who will solve our problems.

Amunkambya Community

Elderly men

Spirituality is peace and treating diseases that hospitals cannot treat. Religion is when people believe in Jesus Christ and when you are a member of a congregation.

Youth

Spirituality is a person who has manners and discipline. Religion is faith in God.

Elderly women

Spirituality is when people are Christian and those who have a good spirit and do not do bad things. She is peaceful. Religion is to believe in one God and have faith in Him to answer and devote your will to Him.

Young men

Spirituality is faith in God. Religion is for those who do not believe in God but are now Christian.

Young women

Spirituality is pastors and deacons. Religion is people who are baptised and confirmed through religion.

Community members offered a dynamic mix of understandings of spirituality and religion; a fusion of the 'old' and new'. Spirituality was defined as belief in 'God', the 'Holy Spirit' which is heart, the spirit of 'God, as that which traditional healers use to heal diseases that modern medicine cannot treat, as peace, as a person with 'good' spirit (manners and discipline), as those that offer service to 'God', and as the spirit within people (that is going bad because of poor church attendance). The distinction between spirituality and religion was not as clear as that made by CCN staff and church leaders.

Churchwomen's Groups:

Religion is what I have in my heart, my faith in God and my relationship and love to my fellow human beings. Spirituality is when I pray to God for what I need.

Spirituality means those who have studied theology like pastors, bishops, nuns, priests and deacons.

Spirituality is to pray for my fellow people.
Christianity means faith, attending church services, listening to the word of God with happiness, and obeying it with all your strength and faith. Spirituality is to have feelings within your heart, which shows you what is good and bad.

Christianity is a way that opens the door of the Kingdom of God, by working for God and by praising Him. Spirituality is the strength for faith.

Christianity is to work for God, to praise Him and pray for Him. Spirituality is to work as a pastor, girl guide or deacon.

Christianity is my faith, my life, and my relationship among people. It is everlasting love. Spirituality is to call the Holy Spirit to help me when I am in need.

Christianity is a strong faith in Jesus Christ. Spirituality is the appearance that you find in a person whether he is a deacon or girl guide, which show that the person has spiritual beliefs.

Christianity is to work for God by praising Him and singing for Him. Spirituality is a person who has studied theology.

Christianity means faith when you are baptised or confirmed and by keeping the word of God in the Bible so that you must not ignore His words and trust Him. Spirituality is a prayer to God by asking what you need and God gives it to you.

Christianity is to help the community with peace like the way you love yourself. Spirituality is the person who loves his community and believes in God.

Christianity is the door through which we pass when we go to Heaven. Spirituality is the strengthening by doing holy work like studying theology as a pastor, bishop or deacon.

Christianity means I am a Christian being baptised and confirmed. Spirituality means to love my fellow human being the way I love myself. Then I know I have spirituality.

Christianity is faith. Spirituality means to pray to God and ask what is needed.

Christianity is Faith and being baptised and given a new relationship with God. It is believing in His work and trusting in Him. Spirituality is the idea of praying so that Jesus Christ can take away our sins and help us with what we need.

There were differences between how church women distinguished between spirituality and religion. For some, spirituality revolved around Christian rituals and dogma such as prayer and the ‘Holy Spirit’, as well as “those who have studied theology”, or ‘emissaries’ of Christianity. Thus spirituality and Christianity were considered to be ‘one in the same’. For others spirituality was defined as the strength, presumably within, that allows faith (in ‘God’). Thus spirituality exists ‘first’ and serves to guide one towards religion and ‘God’. One can be a deacon or a girl guide and possess spirituality if one loves others and helps the community ‘in peace’.

As a whole, the responses seemed to indicate a belief that spirituality is inherent in every person, that it exists ‘before’ religion with its forms of ritual
practice, and that it can be described best as 'that feeling inside which guides one towards 'goodness' and faith in 'God'". The distinction between spirituality and religion was not always clear. A distinction was more clearly stated amongst church leaders, development agents, community leaders and CCN staff than elders, informal settlement community members and women's church groups. For the latter spirituality and religion seemed to be almost 'one in the same' where one does not exist without the other. For the former groups spirituality was very definitely different from religion. Spirituality can exist without a formal religious theology or practice. However, ideally religion (the church) should bring out the spirituality of its followers.

6.2.2.2 Concepts of Spirituality and Development

The link between spirituality and development is then given as:

**Elders:**

Religion and development are the same. The church leaders are involved in development programmes just like the Government. Spirituality is always involved in development. A person has spirituality thus wants things to develop and move forward.

As you are in development, you are in the hands of God. When you have spirituality then God is guiding you to be better.

Those people who are doing religious and spiritual work are helping people to help themselves. That is development.

The elders believed that spirituality, that feeling within a person, motivates a person to 'do good'; to help the community help itself. It has been seen that elders tend to not distinguish clearly between spirituality and religion. Thus religion, and the church are brought into their conceptualisations of spirituality and development. According to the elders, the church represents religion, which represents spirituality. Because the church is involved in development projects, spirituality is related to development.

**Church Leaders:**

If religion is what you believe and your faith in Christianity and God and development is a physical need, then Christianity and development are together because evangelism and development are one in the same – helping people in need and preaching love and the fulfilment of needs. This helps people to understand love and thus to help themselves.
When development came, people began to move away from the church and from God. They are just looking to material things now especially the youth who are pushing away those who have the word of God. Kids get education from universities that do not teach religion at all. So the church is working in difficulty now because of development. Development should be done with the word of God. The church needs to keep preaching the word of God. Right now people are going off all over the place. There is no unity. The way to look at religion and development is through Jesus Christ who brings people together. Jesus is the only one who has the power to give fruit – to turn water into wine.

The church needs to go to the people and sit and listen and talk and pray to help people understand the word of God and to learn love. The people will be truly free and independent.

God gives us faith to see what we are doing is good and to trust in ourselves.

Spirituality is embedded within religion that is in turn embedded with traditional beliefs. Religion should play a positive role in development but it should not hamper development.

The merging of spirituality and religion was also found in the church leaders' concepts of spirituality and development. Religion is seen to encompass both spirituality and 'traditional' beliefs. The role of spirituality/religion in development is to ensure that development is done 'with the word of God'. Development is focusing too much on material well being at the expense of religious values.

The church was again seen to be representative of spirituality. The church leaders indicated their belief that the material emphasis of contemporary development is hurting people. They believed that development should be done in conjunction with religion and the church so that the values of love, care and responsibility govern development.

CCN Staff:

The church needs to teach people about the simple life again and to find happiness in our hearts, not just in material development. It is just madness. We need something different, something at the centre to change. This is the role of religion and spirituality in development, in both developing and developed countries. We need to go back to sharing and learning to take care of each other.

According to the CCN staff, development should not just be about material well being. In effect development has lost its soul and is helping people to lose their souls. Spirituality and religion need to help redefine the meaning of development.
Community Leaders:
There is no doubt that spirituality is going together with development. The start of the National Assembly and Regional Council always starts with a prayer. Before independence, the church was the head of development. Even now though the church has an important role. For example, each church was asked to have a member in the National Assembly.

If you do not have spirituality then you will not have development or that development may be done in a bad way or spirit. Religion and development are one in the same. If you have fear in God this helps you to advance and if you have faith it keeps you away from sinning.

Community leaders believed that spirituality guides the way in which development must be conducted. Religion is again representative of spirituality. The church, as representative of religion thus should play a role in determining how development is carried out.

It would seem thus, that spirituality is seen to be a force that can help define what is 'good' development. For some, spirituality and development are 'one in the same'. Development should be about doing 'good'. Spirituality provides the motivation to do development. For some religion and spirituality are the same. For others there is a close relationship. Regardless, religion, as the embodiment of spirituality, and the church as representative of religion, should play a role in development. In the following passages, the respondents specify the role that the church should play in development.

6.2.2.3 The Role of the Church in Development

Church Leaders:
The church needs to help build the dignity of the people of Namibia and to keep tabs on the move towards privatising basic needs such as water. The church needs to speak out on behalf of the people to ensure that social benefits are not taken away from people who are too poor to say anything about it. The church also needs to be a watchdog in the political field, to refer to the Bible to see the truth because the opposition party is so weak. The CCN needs to take on a theological role; not just an administrative one so that there is good moral leadership on all issues pertaining to the development of Namibia.

Before independence, many people relied on the church as a place of refuge, a place to gather strength in times of trouble and in its role in addressing issues of violence and repression. The church still maintains its positions – people give us credit for the role it played in the war. However, the church does not seem to be getting stronger. Many people thought that after the war, it was left behind. The role of the church as a prophetic church was silenced. The church was no longer vigilant on issues of human rights and injustice, i.e. the detainee issue. Violation of human rights is the same
whether perpetuated by apartheid forces or our own. Some church leaders seem to be afraid to change their role and that will mean separation from the Government and consequent lack of support. But the church is changing its role. On the detainee issue, the church is pushing it to the forefront for the purpose of reconciliation, against the wishes of the Government. So it is hopeful the church will regain its old position – the trust of the people.

Four main roles of the church in rebuilding Namibian society were described:

The church needs to be a watchdog in the political, social and economic arenas. It needs to be able to speak out on the behalf of people who are too poor or voiceless to be heard. Second, the church needs to provide theological leadership to ensure that the morals of Namibian society are uplifted. Third, the church needs to regain its prophetic voice and be vigilant on issues of human rights and injustice. It must regain the trust of the people. Fourthly, the church needs to build the dignity of the people.

Thus the church can influence the development of Namibian society by providing moral leadership. It is recognised, however, that the church is facing its own ‘internal’ struggles to regain its prophetic voice and that this has to be addressed before the church can regain the respect and hearts of Namibian people. Only in this way can it hope to provide the kind of moral leadership that is needed to guide development.

CCN Staff:

After apartheid, the people relaxed and there was no longer an urgent reason to pray to God. The CCN has to look for a vision of keeping society together for reconstruction. The church needs to become transparent and regain the confidence of the people. The detainee issue is a crisis for the church and the CCN. The church needs to stand up to SWAPO. We also need to stand up and be watchful on poverty and other issues like Government salaries. The church has not become prophetic perhaps because in post-apartheid times, the situation is peaceful and everything is comfortable, the leaders of the church are not poor themselves, there is too close a relationship with the Government, the church and Namibians in general do not have a culture of speaking out, there is a fear of SWAPO which used to kill people who opposed them, and there is a feeling that people should repress their feelings and old issues to work for reconciliation. This ignores that people need to hear the truth before they can deal with their pain. There are a lot of suicides up north because consciences are not clear. Thus there is a loss of faith in the church.

During the struggle, the church gave people hope and taught people that in spite of the suffering there will be a light at the end of the day. The poor especially had faith in the church. The exiles, however, did not have the same faith. They left as youth and were indoctrinated into many ideologies like Marxism. This may have weakened their
faith. Reconciliation and reconstruction is just a slogan in Namibia, not like in South Africa. There is no truth commission. Reconciliation is actually a biblical term meaning to return to harmonious relationships. It means we have to go back and look back to see what was before, before we move forward. It means having to know what happened and to be apologetic and to have openness. If we don’t, reconciliation is not durable. In Namibia something has happened so that people can be brutally individualistic. We kill, rape, and drive recklessly. We are not humane as we used to be. We need to start reconstruction with peace within ourselves and to have more compassion. Therein lies the role of the church in development. The CCN in particular has this role in the national development of Namibia, and to catalyse the churches to take on this role.

The CCN has been pushing for a Truth Commission to make reconciliation real in Namibia but the Government has issued a statement that no followers of SWAPO are allowed to participate in any CCN sponsored conference about this or the detainee issue. As far as reconciliation is concerned to the white population, it means don’t touch anything, leave things the way they are. But the church needs to look at the economic sphere. Politically there may be reconciliation but there is so much economic injustice in Namibia still. You can’t have reconciliation unless this sphere is taken care of. The first step will be for the church to separate from the Government. Before independence, SWAPO just had to ask the church to do something and the church would do it. But the church is now learning the mind of the politician and not liking it. They can be dishonest and want only luxury and are not reliable. The Government is not happy that the church is moving away.

The church has its own schools to provide education. It also has clinics and collects donations of clothing to give to the poor. The social welfare services of the church play a supporting role to the Government as well as to the private sector.

Before independence the position of the church was clear. It opposed whatever the apartheid Government was doing and it spoke with a prophetic voice. But with independence, our leading theologians became part of the Government and there is no longer a prophetic voice. This is a bad situation.

The Government cannot possibly provide all development for society. In education or health for example, the Government cannot provide schools throughout the country so the church should be able to help out. But the problem is that the Government wants to do all things. It funds church hospitals and schools so that these cannot go against Government policies. The church and the Government should not be subservient, neither one to the other. Neither should they be concerned with being in each other’s good books. The church needs to be able to speak out on issues in line with the teaching of the gospels and to fight against nepotism and human rights violations and corruption.

Again, it is recognised that the church must regain its own prophetic voice before it can provide the kind of moral leadership Namibia needs. The church must develop a separate stance from the Government and speak out against the Government in the detainee issue and other issues such as Government corruption. The church needs to make reconciliation more than just a Government slogan; a real process of seeking the ‘truth’ and of asking forgiveness for past wrong doings. Without this kind of reconciliation, CCN
staff believe that Namibian society cannot ‘truly’ development. An unhealthy society cannot move forward.

Community Leaders:

Churches need to be involved in development as they were in the period of colonization. Of course the church cannot be a formal part of the Government but this unfortunately means that the church is so far away that is has no say in what is acceptable for the people vis-à-vis the Government. The church needs a good working relationship with the Government so that it can act as a watchdog and speak on behalf of those that may be harmed by Government policies. A lot of exiles, including the present leaders do not know that the people who remained behind depended on the church on a daily basis. They depended on the church for development. The role of the church, the importance it can play in the development of Namibia should not be ignored now that we have independence.

Independence came too quickly. Between 1986-89 the church was really bringing out freedom but when independence came, people looked to material things and grew individualistic. The Government fostered development by trying to do so much for the people. People are not free, they are too materialistic and ignore the church now because the big churches are too rigid and do not allow people to speak their feelings.

Community leaders also believed that the church must play a role in rebuilding Namibia. The role that the church takes in post-independence must be as a watchdog of society, ensuring that state policies do not hurt those who cannot speak for themselves. They believed that the church needs to maintain a position in society whereby its views will be respected and be listened to so that it can work effectively for change and development. They believed that the church needs to influence society’s concept of development away from materialism and individualist values. They challenged the approach of the Government which they argue, is trying to do everything for the people. They argued that this approach fosters dependency rather than self-reliance.

Overall, the respondents believed that the church has a crucial role to play in development. The rationale was simply, if spirituality is the consciousness that governs development, and religion embodies spirituality, the church as representative of religion has an important moral role to play in development.

The church is seen to embody the values of care, respect, dignity, social justice and love and these, according to the respondents, are central to development. Thus the church can not but have a role to play in development. Of course, the fact that Namibia is a strongly religious country with over 90% of the
population following Christianity, cannot be overlooked as a factor in the emphasis placed on the role of the church in development. In addition, the fact that the church played a crucial role in the struggle for independence is a critical factor. The people had not forgotten the support received from the church, both spiritually and in terms of development. It appeared to be engraved on their, and the Namibian identity.

The importance of the church for Namibian people, was reflected in the fact that, despite the tarnished image of the church in relation to the detainee issue, all of the respondents believe that the church must also play a political role in the development of Namibia. The respondents, in particular the CCN staff, church leaders, development workers and the community leaders believed that the church must act as a watchdog in political, social, and economic arenas to speak out on behalf of the poor and the voiceless. In effect, the church must be vigilant on human rights and social justice.

6.3 Development: Negative Impact or Positive?

Two main questions need to be addressed in this commentary. First, did the respondents feel that external support projects are having a negative impact on their spiritual health? Secondly, what were their conceptualisations of development? Did these concepts encompass a perspective on spirituality and development?

In interpreting the information received from the respondent groups, I queried whether any variables such as age, sex, profession, ethnic group or geographical location influenced their responses. In particular I focused on whether those factors influenced the respondents’ knowledge of ‘traditional beliefs’.

For example, it might be speculated that only elders would cling to ‘old’ beliefs and values while the youth would find modern development to be more promising. Or it might be expected that respondents in professions requiring a high degree of education might view external support projects in a negative

10 In theological terms, this would be referred to a ‘prophetic’. 293
light while those with lower levels of education might be less critical. Perhaps those in professional occupations had developed a critical awareness of anti- or post-colonial literature. It might also be speculated that women would find (modern) development to be more beneficial than men because of the new rights and freedoms that accompanied development, such as land tenure.

Geographical location, as mentioned in Chapter Two might also provide some means of differentiation between respondents. It was found that knowledge of ‘old’ ways and ‘traditional’ beliefs was differentiated according to spatial and temporal patterns of missionary activity. Thus the age of the respondent in combination with their geographical location needed to be considered as a factor in how their view of external support projects and in the conceptualisations of development.

For example, the further away from the main north west missionary access route, the more the respondents knew more about the ‘traditional’ beliefs. As mentioned in Chapter Two, this was attributed to the fact that missionaries colonised the areas along the main access route first and in a more intensive manner, usurping traditional life much more effectively. Although all areas of Ovambo were eventually converted, there was a definite difference in the strength of Christianity vis-à-vis traditional beliefs based on this pattern.

Age, as associated with geographical location was thus a primary factor of differentiation between the respondents. Elders possessed more concrete knowledge of ‘traditional beliefs’. Younger groups for the most part did not and thus their convictions on the importance of infusing development with ‘traditional beliefs’ should be carefully considered in the context of ‘manipulated memories’ (Webner 1998).

That said however, overall, both the elders and younger generations felt that the ‘old’ days held values and ways of living that were better than those of the present day. Good relations between people were disintegrating; respect for people and for nature disappearing. Responsibility towards others was being submerged under the rubrics of modern society. The return of customary laws
was seen as a very important step forward. The 'traditional' values they encapsulated were seen to be a promoter of 'better' development, a return to 'old' values which protected the environment and with the exception of constraints on women, governed society better than modern laws and legal systems.

Differentiation between men and women was also apparent. Women and men alike felt that the reclamation of old values would guide society in a better direction. However, a number of men, but curiously, no women, expressed their feelings that new laws such as those pertaining to land tenure would benefit women and society overall. Thus the men felt that modern development was 'good', better than 'traditional' or customary ways.

Overall, despite differentiation in knowledge of 'traditional beliefs', it was found that all of the respondents seemed to believe that the injection of some 'traditional' values would have a beneficial impact on development. Certainly however, and again, this would require further research, it was apparent that those with greater knowledge and actual experience with 'traditional beliefs' spoke with more clarity and confidence on why and how 'traditional beliefs' would improve development and society. However, it is a crucial point that all of the respondents were in some way dissatisfied with 'modern' development and felt that the injection of 'old' values might improve it.

Having said that however, there were two distinct and even opposing views held on the 'conduct' of external support projects. Development agents, CCN staff, and church leaders expressed dissatisfaction with external support projects. They were dissatisfied for two main reasons. First they disputed the materialistic emphasis of development. They argued that the perpetual pursuit of wealth and consumption is detrimental to spiritual well being. Their challenges were in fact, similar to the World Council of Churches' and the TDRC's challenges to the meaning of development. Should development only be about physical and material well being, should it serve a deeper, more fundamental purpose of humanity?
Second, the respondents expressed dissatisfaction over the 'conduct of development'. They felt that involvement in external support projects compromised their dignity and was dehumanising because of donor disregard of their capabilities, experiences and knowledge, and their values and beliefs; in fact of their whole 'cultural self'. Expatriate staff, they argued need to spend time learning the cultures of the communities they work with.

My interpretation of 'learning to know the cultures of the communities' is that expatriates need to learn not just about Namibian culture in general – history, ethnic groups, 'customs', etc, - but they need to learn about the identity, the ethics, the values, the meta-physical beliefs. In short, expatriates need to understand the spirituality of the communities. What do they believe in? What they do consider to be their role in life? What is life all about? Only then can development be contextualized to fit the needs, priorities and 'ways of doing and being' of specific communities. It is not then just a matter of injecting some ethics into the way development is done. The transformations needed are much more fundamental. It is not just an attitudinal change that is required, but a much more substantial philosophical and perhaps meta-physical change.

By contrast, community leaders, and some of the community members of the informal settlements felt that external support projects had assisted in the process of reconciliation and helped Namibians to overcome the 'bad' spirits of the war. This is no small matter. The war of independence was not a one-dimensional fight pitting white against black. The South African administration recruited Ovambo and other Namibian black ethnic groups into the South African Defence Force (SADC) through mandatory conscription. The factor of betrayal was much worse with this 'black against black' (divide and conquer) tactic. External support projects did not differentiate between people and their past or present political alliances. Northern donor agencies simply wanted to support the development processes of all Namibians within their 'target area'. This approach, the community leaders felt, had helped Namibians to pull together as communities and to learn a new way of relating to each other despite political differences.
Community leaders also expressed satisfaction that external support projects did not differentiate in terms of religious alliances. Missionary development was of course based solely on conversion into a particular faith. Only those converted to that faith could receive the benefits of schooling or training or other socio-economic development such as water systems or vegetable gardens.

In terms of the respondents' conceptualisations of development, however, there was an overwhelming feeling that the meaning of development must change. The current concept of development delineates that communities all over the world need to be integrated into the modern world economy. Pursuit of self-sufficiency will allow communities to achieve and maintain a satisfactory material well being. The eradication of poverty will bestow dignity upon them, and furnish them with the ability to pursue a meaningful life.

However, the respondents challenged the notion of a meaningful life and who has the right to decide for whom what that meaningful life is. Overwhelmingly, the respondents suggested that life was meaningful only in the context of harmonious community. The elders emphasised that life was ‘bad’ now because the ‘old’ sense of spirit within communities had died. People no longer respected each other. Society had broken down and one of the results was pervasive alcoholism. It is also critical to note that the elders were, however, aware of the danger of idealising the past. As mentioned, men in particular were aware that ‘new’ developments had increased the welfare of women. Thus there was an awareness of the need for critical analysis of the ‘old’ and the ‘new’ in terms of defining what is ‘good’ development.

Church leaders, CCN staff, community leaders, and development agents all challenged the current economic orientation of development. While the acquisition of basic material needs was considered a necessary project of development, these respondent groups believed that the process of development was more, or equally important than the material goals. Development must engender human dignity. It cannot be formed around a
relationship of 'clientism' but must be governed by such relational ethics as humility, respect, care, and love.

Community leaders believed that spirituality imbues development with these ethics and values. Spirituality guides the way in which development must be conducted. For the CCN staff, spirituality and development meant that development could be about helping people find their (lost) souls. Ultimately development is about becoming more human, not about becoming richer.

That is why the majority of the respondents envisioned such an important role of the church in development, despite the fact that the church had participated in human right abuses, and that it had subsequently, and for other reasons lost its prophetic voice. The church must embody the values of Namibian culture and spirituality. The church went through a process of Africanisation during colonial rule and arguably only this enabled Namibians to develop an identity and a spirituality that gave them the strength to sustain a long and bloody fight for independence. It is again processing its African identity to provide a suitable spiritual foundation for the new Namibia. It is reaching back yet moving forward to regain that which is essentially Namibian. It is seeking to counsel Namibian society on what identity it wishes to take on. Does Namibian culture wish to emulate Western secular culture or do Namibians wish to forge an identity on the basis of their own values and beliefs? These values and beliefs after all, belong to a much longer history of civilisation than that of the West.

Thus there is no simple answer to the question underlying Chapters Four, Five and Six - does development have a negative impact on Namibia's spirituality? Yes, development, the way it is being done, is compromising, in the Namibians own words, their dignity. It loudy contradicts the rhetoric of empowerment and partnership. However, development is also having a positive impact on Namibian spirituality. External support agencies have proposed a clean slate and given Namibians an opportunity and a method for moving past 'old' ('bad') relationships. Development has brought Namibians together as
communities to work for complementary goals, regardless of past or present political affiliations.

The key issue is that development must be meaningful to the people it is intended to help. Thus, the respondents were critical of the modern conception of development. They criticised materialistic focus of development. Development was interpreted not as just the achievement of a better standard of living. It was rather about the process within (any given individual, community or society) to construct a vision of a state of being or living and to move towards that vision. If and when help was required to achieve that goal, it was important that help was received in a relationship of equality and dignity rather than one characterised by charity and power. Thus the means of development were equally, if not more important than the ends of development. The means in fact define what development is.

This conceptualisation of development became even more apparent when the respondents characterised the relationship between spirituality and development. Spirituality was the feeling within a person, a community or a society that gives life its meaning. It defined what it is that individuals, communities or societies should move towards as their goals or visions. It motivates people to move towards that 'better' goal or vision. Religion embodies the spirituality of a people and the church, as the institutional representative of Christianity thus must play a central role in determining what development is and how it should be done. Although it was recognised that the separation of the church and the state is 'good', it was also felt that a watchdog or consultative role for the church would be beneficial.

The conceptualisation of development is thus complicated. It was clear from the interviews that the meaning of development needed to reflect the values of Namibian society. However, Namibian society has not had the time to develop its own post-independence identity/s, to distil the values that it wants to declare as part of those identities and to present these to the world. Northern development agencies have 'good' intent. However, the current construction of development enforces extremely unequal relations between the donor and the
recipient, and facilitates the imposition of Western values, meanings and methods of development on 'developing countries'. The Namibian respondents emphasised their belief that this conceptualisation of development was not 'true' development. They offered a concept of development that they considered 'better'. Spirituality formed an integral part of this conceptualisation.
Chapter 7

Conclusions: The Realities of Spirituality and Development

7.0 Introduction

The three main questions of the thesis are: What is spirituality and development? What are the problematic issues that arise as the ideas of spirituality and development are translated into practice? How does it fit within the broader discourses of alternative-mainstream development? This chapter will seek to address these three questions, benefiting from the sum of empirical evidence gathered from the literature review, the examination of the three Northern donor agency spirituality and development initiatives, and from the discourses of development derived from the case study.

The concepts of spirituality and development of the three Northern donor agencies shall be compared to the conceptualisations of spirituality and development that emerged from the interviews of case study respondents. What similarities or differences are there? Can a theoretical construct of spirituality and development be drawn from a combination of these conceptualisations?

This critique of spirituality and development then leads to an analysis of the issues that arise from the translation of spirituality and development into practice. The three Northern donor initiatives provide some examples of problematic issues in their attempts to put spirituality and development into practice. The discourses of Namibians provide additional issues that need to be addressed if spirituality and development is to gain practical acceptance as an approach, methodology or even paradigm of development.

This chapter will then examine the relationship between spirituality and development and the broader discourses of development. Does it represent a
radical departure from other alternative development critiques, and if so, in what way/s? Or is it just another slightly reworded version of preceding critiques?

The main contributions of this thesis to knowledge deserve final attention.

7.1 What is Spirituality and Development?

In Chapter One a framework of analysis for spirituality and development was constructed from an array of spiritual, ecumenical, post-colonial, anti-colonial, feminist, feminist eco-spirituality, geographical, and aid ethnographic critiques of development. It was proposed that each perspective introduced to development discourses ideas that together can be seen to have contributed to the emergence of the idea of spirituality and development.

The convergence of postmodern consciousness and alternative critiques of development proposes a conceptualisation of spirituality and development that encompasses three main dimensions. A concept of spirituality and development is grounded in a fundamental belief that the role of development is to assist humanity to fulfill its spiritual destiny. It recognises that there are absolute morals which it must assist humanity to realise. It also recognises that culture must be construed in its broadest sense, not just as a peripheral concern or interest, but as a meta-physical construct that determines values, ethics, and the meanings and goals of life.

The three Northern development agencies offer conceptualisations of spirituality and development that have much in common with this theoretical description.

For example, the World Council of Churches believes that the current meaning of, and approach to, development fosters the spirit of individualism, acquisition and aggressiveness. Development dehumanises humanity, fractures society and cultivates unequal relations between the rich and the poor, the ‘First World’ and the ‘Third. According to the WCC, development
needs to be transformed so that it supports the task of learning to be a 'better' human community. Spirituality is defined as being those values and principles that enhance humanity. Thus there is a clear relationship between spirituality and development.

The IDRC's conceptualisation of spirituality and development also centres on the significance of culture to development and the need to broaden the definition of culture. Culture is seen to represent the cosmological vision or world view of a people and society. This construct gives meaning to people's lives and influences their 'ontological needs', the basis on which decisions about development are made.

The World Bank also recognises the importance of culture in development. Culture is defined again in its broadest sense, as a framework that helps people to make sense of their lives. It encompasses the values, beliefs and ethics, which influence how people live and determine their identities.

The World Bank does not seem to touch on the idea of spiritual destiny as being the main task of development. Not surprisingly, none of the three agencies focus on the existence or need for absolute morals to govern development. Certainly the idea of absolute morals presents a tricky issue. Questions such as: What is the source of such absolutes? and: Whose interpretation of these absolutes gains precedence? would provide much debate.

As was shown in Chapter One, the debate over cultural relativism and universal values is a crucial issue in regards to development ethics. In my opinion, it is a critical oversight that all three Northern donor agencies stress the importance of culture to development yet do not then address the problematic issue of how to reconcile cultural particularity with universal development ethics.

Chapter Six provided the case study respondents' conceptualisations of spirituality and development. It can be seen that overall, the respondents also conceptualise development as the 'upliftment of the soul'. Development must
be intended to support people in realising their human potential, not just in achieving a better material standard of living. Spirituality was defined as a force within an individual and community that guides people to 'do good'; to work for the 'good' of the community. The goal of development is to help people to achieve 'self-hood', to raise self-esteem, and thus to sustain the dignity of life. The overall goal of development is not material well being but spiritual happiness. Certainly the need for material benefits of development was also raised as an important goal of development. However, it was emphasised that this goal should be considered only as being complementary to the main spiritual goal.

The respondents, without using the specific language of cultural significance, absolute morals, and new meta-physics, addressed all of these dimensions of spirituality and development. They recognised the role of culture by differentiating between what was 'good' and 'bad' of the 'old' days and transferred this understanding to the meanings of development. The respondents emphasised that development was not ('good') development unless it fostered 'good' relations between people. Development must be governed by such relational ethics as humility, love, respect, responsibility and care. For the respondents there appeared to be moral values that were 'absolute'. They also challenged the Western materialistic development paradigm, and redefined development to be about the upliftment of people's souls.

By no means can an absolutely definitive concept of spirituality and development be determined from the theoretical and empirical research conducted for this thesis. The idea and the 'movement' of spirituality and development are much more extensive than this thesis can address. However, from this thesis, it can be conjectured that a fundamental descriptor, definition or dimension of a concept of spirituality and development is that spirituality and development is part of the journey that humanity needs to, and has begun to take in order to regain its essential identity. In other words, what it means to be human. The lack of spiritual guidance has caused
development to be defined by an empty and meaningless quest for material wealth. Humanity, faced by a radical discontinuity between the self and the world, the mind and the body, and between human creation and nature, has seriously begun the task of searching for that essential identity. Humanity is learning once again what it means to be human. This crisis of identity, this search for meaning is leading us to rediscover spiritual values. Humanity is recognising that spirituality must guide all of our actions and accomplishments. Development must be connected to this quintessential spiritual journey.

Thus the idea of spirituality and development impels a concept of development that is not just about the transfer of financial, technical and human resources from 'First World' to the 'Third'. Rather, development is a journey that all of humanity is immersed in, whether rich or poor. It is about the process of becoming 'better' humans; to be in 'good' relation and to take responsibility and care of others. Once humanity rediscover this essential human task, development, the meaning of development, and the goal of development will be grounded in our spiritual values, and be of service to them.

This concept of spirituality and development is undeniably esoteric. However, the initiatives of the three Northern agencies have demonstrated that the concept can also be translated into concrete terms and practices which may reflect the essential message and intent of the theoretical construct in varying degrees of 'faithfulness'. A number of problematic issues in this translation have also emerged. At the forefront of these issues is the emphasis placed on the role of the church and the ambiguity of religion because of its past 'experiences of spirituality'.

It can be seen that in the literature, a clear distinction is made between religion and spirituality. Spirituality is that which is concerned with the qualities of the human spirit. It is that which resides within the heart of human existence that links our imagination to the meaning and purpose of
life. Religion represents a specific cultural interpretation of that spiritual or metaphysical reality. It is just that, an interpretation that may or may not be 'true' to the essence of spirituality.

The case study respondents also in varying degrees, made the distinction between religion and spirituality. Spirituality was defined as the feeling within that motivated people to work for the common 'good'. The respondents also stressed that religion and the representative church must play a central role in defining the meaning and means of development.

However, although the Northern agencies all similarly envisioned a role for religion or the Faiths in development, they did not address the problematic issue of the ambiguous position of religion in society nor did they clarify their understanding of the distinction between spirituality and religion.

In my opinion, this is a crucial oversight that any agency seeking to further the idea and cause of spirituality and development must address. This issue, and others that have emerged as the ideas of spirituality and development are translated into practice, shall now be examined.

7.2 From Idea to Practice

Four problematic issues will be highlighted. The first concerns the role of religion and the church in spirituality and development. The second relates to cultural relativism and the problems associated with the significance of culture. Thirdly, the positionality of the donor agency in examining ideas and practices of spirituality and development deserves comment. This leads, fourthly, into a discussion of the problem of incorporation and how Northern donor agencies can subvert potentially transformative ideas and integrate them into the mainstream models of development.
7.2.1 Institutionalising Spirituality and Development

In Chapter One Ursula King's (1998) argument was highlighted that religion no longer offers the wisdom that a post-modern society seeks in its search for meaning and integration, greater coherence and new identity. This, she argued, was particularly true in the context of feminism as nearly all world religions held women in contempt. In Chapter Three, Spretnak (WCC 1996a) argued that religion, which formerly provided a cognitive structure to make people feel 'at home in the universe' no longer accomplishes this task, resulting in a deep existential uncertainty and a permanent identity crisis.

However, virtually all of the respondents for the IDRC-Jesuit study on spirituality and development felt that religion and religious values had played and still play a significant role in the process of human development, yet they felt that the ambiguous position of the church needed some attention. Ryan (1995) commented that the respondents were looking not just for an ethical base rooted in narrow individualistic premises but for a transcendent reference of religion and faith on which to base their committed action. The Val Morin (1995) conference participants saw that one of the ways the IDRC should move towards a better understanding of how religious and spiritual values could be deepened was through the provision of 'fora' in which religious leaders and development specialists could engage in open dialogue.

The WCC is of course a religiously based organization. Thus the fundamental motivation of the WCC's investigation of spirituality and development is to clarify the role of the church and itself as an ecumenical organisation, in development. Moreover, at the Bossy seminar, Blyth (WCC 1996a) stated that the ecumenical debate is distinguished from the discussions of the secular development organisations in that the inspiration for WCC work lies in faith.

The World Bank too believes that religion has an important role to play in development. At the second World Bank conference it was argued that when secular society breaks down people turn to their religious practices for
guidance and stability. The World Faith dialogue was a straightforward attempt to explore the role of religion in development and to broaden the global resources available to eradicate global poverty.

Based on the responses from the case study area, the centrality of religion also resonates for local people in Namibia. All of the Namibian respondents believed that religion and the church should play a central role in development.

Thus it can be seen that in much of the discourses on spirituality and development, religion was considered to have a central role. However, upon close examination, a number of problems can be seen to emerge in this partnership of religion and development.

For example, there is a concern that the World Bank is intending the Faiths to simply be incorporated into the dominant economic development paradigm of the World Bank and as such, become an instrument of that paradigm. The main aim of the Dialogue was to broaden opportunities for common understanding and action in tackling the critical issue of global poverty and to help the World Bank and the Faiths to reach a better understanding of each other's ideas and approaches to development. As seen by the WCC's work, the church has had a history of repudiating the centrality of materialist concerns in development and broadening the concept of development to include cultural, religious and social structures and values. However this did not seem to be in evidence as a substantive issue to be debated in the Dialogue.

One question that can be asked of this World Bank initiative, and of the overall World Bank initiative on spirituality and development, is whether the World Bank's belief that economic growth is the key factor in alleviating poverty is even in question. Certainly GTZ policy is based on the notion of economic growth as being the engine for development and as Chapter Four has shown, it is also the principle followed by the Government of Namibia to
facilitate reconciliation and reconstruction. The answer was not evident in the closing statement of the Dialogue where the concern was centered on how the partnership between the Faiths and the World Bank would be structured.

The problematic issue surrounding the role of religion and the church in development revolves around the idea of religious reformation. Daly (1996) argued that scientists were hypocritical when they appealed to religious leaders in America to give moral inspiration and leadership to the movement to solve the environmental crisis. Daly argued that scientists themselves did not believe in the religiously bound values that they were calling on religious leaders to infuse into the public consciousness. In addition, he argued, religion has not particularly been interested or involved in giving environmental protection a theological dimension. This prompted his belief that the scientists were asking not just for a moral compass but a religious reformation.

However, there is an environmental ethic encompassed within Christian theology. The doctrine of the "integrity of creation" reflects the Christian faith in the divine creation of the world and humanity's responsibility to care for it1. This is perhaps the kind of moral compass that the American scientists were appealing for. Based on this approach, the facilitators of the GTZ sponsored Churchwomen's Leadership Workshops used 'Bible' study to instill a theological rationale into water development and environmental management in general. Overall, however, the link between the church and environmental protection and management is not very strong in Namibia. The respondents of the case study research did not specify the role of the church in protecting the environment at all. Rather, some respondents, particularly the elders, did believe that 'traditional' values mediated environmental protection. They argued that in the 'old' days there were rules

---

1 See the article by Andre Dumas, "The Ecological Crisis and the Doctrine of Creation" in *The Ecumenical Review* Volume XXVII No 1 January 1975.
to protect the environment, especially trees. But when colonisation (and presumably missionaries) came, the powers of the 'old' ways were reduced and the environment was destroyed. They hoped that the return of customary laws would help the environment.

Notwithstanding the lack of attention to environmental issues by the church in Namibia, in general, both the people and the church believe that the church must take on a role of moral leadership in the country and that it must apply this role to development. The church is certainly struggling to regain its prophetic voice in the wake of the detainee issue as well as the increasing secularisation of society with independence.

As the analysis on the various uses of spirituality demonstrated, there are problematic issues associated with the role of the church in development. The key problem with the role of the church in development is that because it operates within the realm of the spiritual and the moral it has the power of 'divine' authority. If the 'development' on which the church bestows its divine authority is deemed to be 'inappropriate' or even destructive, the damage could be much more significant. There is a vast body of literature dealing specifically with the role of the church or religious organisations in social change and development in African countries. It is not within the scope of this thesis to encompass the many issues raised by these literatures. However, Gifford's (1998) description of the power of religion is significant.

A religion provides definitions, principles of judgement and criteria of perception. It offers a reading of the world, of history, of society, of time, of space, of power, of authority, of justice and of ultimate truth. Religion limits or increases the conceptual tools available, restricts or enlarges emotional

---

2 To name just a few - Abidi 1991; Aboagye-mensah 1994; Aseimeng 1989; Etherington 1996; Gifford 1998; and Hayes 1996.
responses, or channels them and withdraws certain issues from inquiry. It inculcates a particular way of perceiving, experiencing and responding to reality. Religion can legitimise new aspirations, new forms of organisation, new relations and a new social order (Gifford 1998, p. 26).

The history of Namibia demonstrated how European missionaries, religion and churches cooperated fully, in fact provided the bulwark of moral support for the theology of apartheid. It also shows how a ‘Namibianised’ church, armed with a new black consciousness and liberation theology raised a people and a nation to overcome brutal oppression. Either way, the power of the church should not be underestimated.

7.2.2 Cultural Significance

In Chapter One common ground was found between the spiritual idea of a cosmological construct and alternative development critiques. Both highlight the significance of culture. It was argued that culture forms an intricate frame of reference for people to understand the meaning and purpose of life and their role within it. It provides guidelines to mediate right action and relation so that a harmonious and just society could be achieved. Culture, it was argued, reflects a society’s consciousness and is the most important measure of a nation’s independence and its people’s humanity.

In Chapter Three it was shown that the need to broaden the definition of culture, and the need to deepen its role in development, was recognised by all three of the Northern donor agencies. The IDRC defined culture as an expression of the ‘cosmological visions’ people and society use to explain reality and rationalise change. The World Bank recognised that the understanding of the culture of a society is essential when planning development strategies. A cultural framework encompassed the complex interactions of spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional that mediate a society’s way of life, value systems, traditions and beliefs. The World Bank recognised that when development takes on inappropriate manifestations, that cultural framework can be broken.
However, in Chapter One, it was also shown that the notion of culture is problematic. It was shown that culture has often been invented and manipulated; remembered in idealistic terms, and selectively screened by some members of society to dominate, or to maintain trusteeship over others. To counter this argument, it was also contended that cultures have the ability to negotiate their own identities without resorting to romanticism. The hybridisation of cultures entails a cultural (re)creation of the familiar, the new, the local and the global, modifying, appropriating and re-appropriating without falling into the trap of imitation.

Herein lies the crux of issue of culture. As the Dalai Lama so aptly stated, humanity must discover a global ethic which “avoids the extremes of crude absolutism on the one hand, and trivial relativism on the other” (Dalai Lama 1999, p. 28). There seems to be a growing consensus that universal values exist; that these values enrich human identity rather than detract away from it, and that there is an urgent need to arrive at a global ethic to solve the social and environmental crises humanity now faces.

The case study demonstrated clearly that Namibian people have always been, and still are, engaged in a process of critically defining and redefining their identities, values and meanings of life. They recognised that some ‘traditions’ from the past are appropriate for contemporary society while others are not. They applied the same critical eye to modern ‘traditions’. Thus they truly support the notion of ‘cultural hybridity’ or ‘hyphenated condition’.

The IDRC as well as the WCC argued for a plurality of development approaches to accommodate the diversity of cultures across the world. They recognised that local cultures, values, spiritual and religious beliefs, and ‘ontological’ needs must be central to these approaches of development. Only then can development be meaningful to any particular individual, community and society.
Thus culture is an extremely complex problematic. The fact that culture can be idealised and manipulated to achieve a political end casts doubt on the notion of culture as being an unproblematic base on which to ground development interventions. Yet, the fact that many perspectives view culture as being important as contexts through which development must be mediated cannot be ignored.

The emphasis on relational ethics in discourses of spirituality and development may offer a resolution to this impasse. It has already been noted that all of the Namibian respondents emphasised their belief that development was not development unless it was governed by such relational ethics as care, love, respect, humility, responsibility, sharing and dignity. They believed that the means to development was just as, or even more important than the (material) ends. At the heart of this emphasis on relational ethics is the idea that each and every person has a subjective identity that first, should and must be recognised, and second, treated with respect and dignity. Dominant development discourses, as demonstrated by control-orientation techniques such as the GTZ ZOPP, and the overall attitude of professionalism and belief in the notion of the 'expert', have the strong tendency to universalise and homogenise project recipients and to disregard subjective identities. This has resulted in, the respondents argued, the subjugation of recipients to a dehumanising process of development. The analysis of the GTZ ZOPP process showed that many of the decisions about development projects are made in Germany. Recipient countries only become involved in the project planning and analysis processes at a late stage and even then, it is not the communities who are involved in determining the design of the project but rather the (government) representatives of the communities. The OHSIP project showed that notions of the expert were strong enough to allow the Project Support Team to ignore IBIS policy and not conduct a cooperative process of identifying problems and strategies. There is thus a tendency to universalise development approaches as though the context of place does not matter.
The adoption of the idea that relational ethics are central to development imposes on Northern donor agencies, the importance of 'good' relations with recipients in order to achieve 'good' development. The context of culture thus becomes important. It becomes important for the donor agency to understand how specific cultural contexts mediate change and development. It becomes important for the donor agency to develop relationships with the recipients. It becomes important for the processes of project planning and analysis to be grounded in the context of place. It necessitates a broader participation of recipients at the earliest stages of those planning and analysis processes. Once there is this broadly based approach to project planning the values, objectives, experiences and knowledge of all parties can be placed on the negotiation table. In short, acknowledgement of the critical role of relational ethics in development forces donor development agencies to respect the cultural context of the recipients.

7.2.3 Donor Positionality

The third problematic issue raised in relation to the translation of spirituality and development into practice relates to the positionality of the donor agency.

In Chapter Two it was shown that the reflexive positionality of the researcher, specifically with respect to the North-South axis, was inextricably linked with politics and power. It was shown, with reference to the work of Sidaway (1992) and others, that it is incorrect to assume that the problems of research by 'First World' academics in the 'Third World' contexts can be reduced to those experienced by the researcher. Any and all research projects conducted in the South, by a Northern agent must be placed within the contemporary power relations between the North and the South. It was shown that feminist methodologies emphasize the connectedness of theory, method and practice in all research methodologies. It is through this combined epistemological critique that feminist analysis has the potential to transform understandings of power relations simultaneously with the power
relations themselves (Staeheli & Lawson 1995). Feminist research has an explicit political commitment to transform (gendered) power relations. Praxis must reflect this political goal.

I would like to utilize this argument by placing the three Northern donor agencies, the IDRC, the World Bank and the WCC profiled in this thesis into the position of 'First World' researcher. There are many implications then for their positionality and the approach that these agencies have taken in researching the idea and practice of spirituality and development. I seek to examine the methodology used by the three Northern donor agencies in researching the idea and practice of spirituality and development and how they measure up to this political goal of transforming power relations.

The methodology used by the IDRC showed a mixture of inclusive and exclusive techniques. The first IDRC-Jesuit study was based on a desire to know more about the meanings of development from a Southern perspective. The IDRC had already recognised that different meanings of development existed and that these perspectives would offer insight into how development should be reconstructed. The IDRC recognised that the main goal of reconstructing development was to dissolve the categories of North and South. Thus its research goal was explicitly political.

One might argue however, that the IDRC research methodology did not go 'local enough'. Participation in the process was limited to a certain class, profession, and gender. It can then be countered that this first process was a preliminary exploration of the need to examine in more detail, the intersection between spirituality, culture and development. Indeed this was how the IDRC viewed this first stage of the process.

However, further examination of the IDRC's methodology reveals a dependency on the notion of the expert. Rather than further opening up the dialogue, an exclusionary approach was taken. Four experts in science, development and a variety of faiths were invited to specify the relationship
between spirituality, culture and development. Their perspectives would then form the basis for widespread dissemination to the development practitioners and researchers, bilateral and multilateral policymakers, academics and religious leaders and institutions whom the IDRC hoped to influence with the idea of spirituality and development. Seemingly, the findings of the prior dialogue with the South were displaced and remained as discreet perspectives unrelated to the main (expert) findings of the second phase. Cynically, it can be viewed that the Southern perspectives only served to legitimise the IDRC's agenda, albeit an agenda intended to dissolve the caricatures of North and South. In relation to the feminist methodological goal to merge theory and method it can be seen that the 'political' goal that the IDRC aspired to was not merged with the method of their research. The South maintained a marginal position. At least in the process of research, the dissolution of categories was not achieved.

The WCC has been engaged with the idea of spirituality and development for a much longer time than the IDRC. In the 1960's the WCC was already refuting the materialist orientation of development. In the 1970's it was debating the problematic issues of the project approach and the implications of donor-recipient relations with an explicit recognition of the underlying unequal power relations. It had developed an understanding that development must reflect a holistic integration of material, physical, psychological, emotional, and spiritual needs and that the focus of development needs to be relational. It had defined the primary purpose of development to be to assist humanity in its spiritual destiny.

The Bossy seminar (1996) marked the beginning of a formal initiative to delineate a concept of spirituality and development and to integrate it into WCC programmes. The seminar included participants from around the world with representatives from the South and North sharing the roles of presenters and resource persons. The WCC was seemingly very cognizant of the need to structure the equal participation of both North and South to
reflect its philosophical understanding of the interconnectedness of humanity.

However, according to the evaluations of the seminar, which were divided into three groupings – the Southern participants, the agencies staff and the WCC staff, the Southern participants felt that the WCC had imposed some ideas on the seminar without adequate debate. The Southern participants considered the idea of a post-modern agenda was an agenda that they liked very much. However, they felt that it was something that the WCC had already arrived at a consensus over and were just sharing the information with them without adequate debate. In the next phase of the elaboration of the concept of spirituality and development the WCC narrowed participation to four ‘experts’ who formed the draft Concept Paper on Development in La Paz, Bolivia in August 1996. The Strategy for Jubilee – Phase II Concept Paper, which documented the formal ecumenical approach to development was based on this draft paper as well as the Bossy seminar report.

The process that the WCC followed in researching the concept of spirituality and development is thus difficult to assess in terms of measuring up to the political goal of transformation of power relations. The WCC certainly was cognizant of the need to have equal representation of the South in its deliberations on the concept of spirituality and development. However, it too fell into the exclusionary ‘trap of the expert’. Yet its goal of political transformation is clear in the approach and strategies that the WCC is committed to following in its approaches to development as outlined by the Jubilee Concept Paper. As with the IDRC, the WCC is after all a Northern based agency and ultimately it must take control of the elaboration of its own agenda, approach and strategies. In terms of research methodologies, it must be asked to what extent Northern agencies can connect theory, method and practice. Is it not enough, as Sidaway (1992) and Rose (1997) argue, to ensure that the goal of the research is explicitly linked to the critical politics of power/knowledge production?
The World Bank research approach shares common ground with the IDRC and WCC. Participation at the series of conferences was indicative of the World Bank's recognition that an international perspective was needed on spirituality and development. This was particularly apparent at the third conference on "Ethics and Values: A Global Perspective". However, there was no attempt to carry the dialogue out to the 'local' in a cooperative approach. Again, dependence on the 'expert' was an integral part of the World Bank discourses. Indeed, the World Bank seemed to take the view that they could become the experts in spirituality and development. Discourses on spirituality and development simply added another challenge to the World Bank's mission. Not only did the World Bank have to promote economic development it now was also tasked with the responsibility to develop the cultural and spiritual values of local communities. As such there was no political goal of erasing dichotomous positions and transforming power relations.

In all three approaches, despite rhetoric describing the importance of culture, it is not given a position of significance. None of the donors included in their methodologies the need to go out to local communities to examine what discourses local communities might have on spirituality and development. The overwhelming tendency was for Northern donors to develop an idea and after a limited consultation with the South apply the idea to as many places as possible, unmindful of place and people. This is precisely what the Namibian respondents felt was most wrong with development; the fact that it was disrespectful of their identity and humanity.

From this analysis of the three Northern donor agencies' approaches to spirituality and development it can be seen that there has not been a systematic attempt to merge method with theory. Although the IDRC and WCC in particular understood the implicit and explicit political goal of their research, their methods of research did not work towards the transformation of underlying power relations. Rather, their approaches reinforced these power relations. However, to be realistic, and as Rose (1997) recognises, there

318
is an inevitable messiness of reflexive position in any research project. What is more important is the crucial goal of working towards a critical politics of power/knowledge production. The intent of all of the Northern donor initiatives on spirituality and development was to work for a critical understanding of alternative ideas of development and to examine how these ideas could inform and transform their work as development agents. As Williams (1997) writes:

Given the real threats to mankind as a result of urban misery, large-scale poverty even within the advanced societies of the world, the deepening marginalisation of the periphery and the real possibility of extinction of the human species as a result of eco-disaster, the demands for such narratives, rather than being historically superannuated, have in fact become more pressing (Williams 1997, p. 822).

Overall there is a tendency of Northern donor agencies, in keeping with the modernist 'tradition', to impose its beliefs, values and ideas on the South, believing in the totality and universalism of their discourses. Post-modern, feminist and alternative/anti-development discourses have contributed to the slow deconstruction of this tradition. Development practice is not immune to this deconstruction. The approaches of the Northern donor agencies in their exploration of spirituality and development shows that despite the central recognition of the need to respect the values and humanity of Southern cultures, there is still a tendency to believe that the North knows all, or at least more.

7.2.4 Incorporation of Spirituality and Development

In Chapter One it was shown how the gender development movement was depoliticised and bureaucratised to the point where the focus of WID was translated from gender sensitive practice to what development could get from women. It was also shown how ideas of empowerment, participation, and partnership litter the policy environment of Northern donor agencies. However, equally, the notions of control-orientation, the expert and the attitude of professionalism serve to counter and make empty rhetoric of these
ideals. The examination of the ZOPP approach in Chapter 5 showed that participation was limited in both time and place by the donor agency, resulting in what Porter et al (1991) called ‘bounded’ participation.

An examination of ZOPP as a facilitation method also posed questions as to its ability to facilitate the kind of participation its theory suggests is possible. Clearly the ZOPP approach facilitated donor control rather than equal participation. In terms of Kabeer’s (1994) analysis of the various types of power, recipients were only able to exercise the “power to”. GTZ control over temporal and spatial participation patterns effectively excluded recipients from critical sections of the development planning process. In general, donors have the power to construct the rules of the game and disguise the operation of this power through the illusion of consensus and complementarity. Empowerment, despite the rhetoric of donor policy, is simply not possible within this construct of development.

The OHSIP Project Support Team did not, although it was stipulated in IBIS policy, conduct a Project Identification and Strategy workshop. The Team believed that a workshop was not needed as they had developed a close and highly cooperative relationship with the recipients. However interviews with the recipients showed that the recipients held a different view on this relationship. They felt that the project approach had been too top-down and consultative rather than based on a sharing of decision-making power. Because the Support Team did not conduct a Problem Identification and Strategy workshop, there was no formal forum available to the recipients to express their views and to be part of the process of identifying needs and objectives and of planning strategies to address those objectives. It should also be remembered that communities everywhere are always heterogenous encompassing competing interests and needs and different perspectives on how things should be solved. Without a formal and broadly based forum that encouraged the input of all these perspectives, the OHSIP Support Team could not possibly have known the full complexities of the communities which they were seeking to develop. Thus control-orientation of project
processes played a central role in facilitating the power of donors over recipients.

There is another dimension to the power of donors that should be highlighted in relation to the attitude of professionalism and the notion of the 'expert'. In order to illustrate this dimension, I need to ask the question: "What did the OHSIP Support Team feel when they decided there was no need to conduct a Problem Identification and Strategy workshop?" Why did they feel that they had the ability to structure the project on the basis of informal contact with the recipients? Did they feel that they had the experience, and the 'expertise' to plan the project without the benefit of a formal process that was after all stipulated by their home agency and which was backed by considerable theory detailing why such a workshop was needed? I pose these statements as questions because only the Project Support Team knows what their feelings were at the time can only be speculated on. As Chambers (1994a/b) has argued, power is not only encompassed in the methods used by projects to facilitate donor control. Power is also and perhaps more importantly, located in the attitudes of the professional and the 'expert'.

This point is important, because if I were asked to envision the kind of project processes or tools that would have the potential to facilitate the inclusion of recipient perspectives, I would find myself listing a similar list of tools that IBIS had included in its Manual of Methodology (1996). Target groups analysis (sensitive to gender and social differentiation), analysis of problems, objectives, and resources, mapping and assessment of local organisation, stakeholder analysis, alternative analysis and project design, environmental analysis, gender impact assessment, and sustainability assessment, seem to represent a fairly well-rounded list of tools to facilitate recipient participation. A key issue, as was shown by the OHSIP experience,

3 It is important to note, however, that this approach does not guarantee the equal participation of recipients but merely facilitates their perspectives being
is that the attempt to 'equalise' relations between donor and recipient depends not just on the existence of the techniques, but the attitude of the individual development agents involved. If agents believe that they know best, then the best intent of all the participation and empowerment policies and methodologies can be for naught.

A similar analysis of the GTZ approach can be made. The specific philosophies or principles of the ZOPP approach stipulate a belief in the ability of ZOPP to facilitate strong, if not equal, participation of the recipients. I thus ask a similar question of GTZ agents: "How can GTZ agents say that the ZOPP tool facilitates the strong participation of all the stakeholders of a project in the decision-making process when it so obviously favors the control of the donor over the recipients?" The point is that there is an underlying attitude of power inherent in the donor's position that is equally if not more important in keeping donors firmly in control of development. With this kind of attitude there is a strong tendency, despite theory and even practical tools that state otherwise, to continue to impose 'totalising discourses' of development.

The World Bank's ideas of how to practice spirituality and development illustrates the danger of incorporation into these totalising discourses of development. As discussed in Chapter Three, one of the suggestions made as to how spirituality and development could be brought into the fold of development was simply to add the discipline of the theologian or ethicist to the three other disciplines that make up the 'development team', namely, economist, ecologist and sociologist. I argued that care must be taken to assess whether spiritual values are supposed to determine or, at the very least guide, the meanings of development, or whether they are merely to be heard by the donors. For equal relations to be achieved, wholesale transformation, not least in the realm of the global macroeconomic structures, would have to be effected.
another component of the all-powerful economic model. Spiritual values could end up just like gender or the environment, as special considerations to be ticked off and excluded from the main thrust of development activities.

How then can spirituality and development be implemented practically without being incorporated? Feminists and environmental economists have sought to bring women and the environment in by placing monetary value on women's work and the environment. For example Marilyn Waring (1988) has undertaken extensive research to challenge the economic system which undervalues both women's work and natural resources. Her critique is aimed at the United Nations Systems of Accounting (UNSNA) which serves as a set of standards for economic measurements and is used as a tool for the appraisal of economic performances at global and country levels. It is used extensively by the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund, the United Nations agencies, and national governments to make policies and plan programmes for development intervention. Waring has sought to remedy the system of national accounting by including women's work, environmental accounting, the distinction between destructive and creative production, and the introduction of economic welfare measurements.

As repugnant as this may seem, placing monetary value on 'externalities' is the current method of internalizing factors of production that have previously been ignored. Can this also apply to spirituality in development? This approach may seem even more repugnant than placing monetary value on the aesthetic beauty of nature. How can one place a price on values? Can spirituality be deconstructed to show for example that 'good' relations facilitate more productivity and thus more efficient development?

Work by Richard Barrett, who led the spirituality and development initiatives at the World Bank before establishing his own consulting company, demonstrates through his new work, one example of how (spiritual) values can be incorporated into the world of business. Barrett believes that there is a new consciousness (similar to the post-modern consciousness identified by
Spretnak WCC 1996a and Ursula King 1998) maturing in the minds of people around the world – “a quiet revolution, more significant than the reformation, a revolution that will challenge the whole basis of Western civilization, and a revolution that will mitigate the power of the rich elites in the world of business and politics” (Barrett 1996, p. 47). He believes that the last bastion of autocratic control and greed is the business world but that this revolution will transform corporate values to reflect this new consciousness.

He argues that:

...in a short space of time society will begin to experience a new way of looking at the world. We will see that we are totally interconnected and that the planet is our precious life support system. We will begin to embrace respect for others, equality, responsibility for the whole, and unconditional caring. The global issues we are facing demand that we move from self-interest to the common good (Barrett 1996, p. 52).

Corporations will increasingly recognise and embody these values of responsibility for the whole, the importance of the common good, equality, respect for all life, and unconditional caring. To support this revolutionary process, Barrett has developed an approach to support leaders in building visionary organisations. He has developed a number of ‘Corporate Transformation Tools’ including the ‘Corporate Values Audit Instrument’, the ‘Individual Values Audit Instrument’ and the ‘Leadership Assessment Instrument’. These tools are based on Abraham Maslow’s hierarchy of needs. ‘Corporate Transformation Tools’ are intended to give business corporations the instruments they need to develop, implement and monitor a

---

4 See Maslow’s two books: The Farther Reaches of Human Nature (1976) and Towards a Psychology of Being (1968). Maslow describes the hierarchy of needs as progressing from safety and survival, to belonging, to self-esteem, and finally to self-actualization. Each of these needs represents a state of consciousness with self-actualization being “a state in which a person becomes more ego-transcending and more independent of the lower (material and psychological) needs. Maslow believed that the spiritual is the highest part of our life.
values-based corporate culture. Barrett claims that they are designed to support leaders in building visionary organizations that release human potential, strengthen financial performance and promote sustainable development. They catalyse change by operating at the level of beliefs and values.

Barrett uses this values approach to support companies in the assessment of their own level of consciousness and to identify the steps needed to move the organisation towards a higher corporate consciousness. The ultimate goal of his work is to support leaders in building visionary organisations in order to create a sustainable future for humanity and the planet. Of course there may be problematic issues involved with Barrett's work and the details of his approach needs to be examined just as the approaches of the three donor agencies were in this thesis. However, his work, and many other 'spirituality in the workplace' initiatives are becoming increasingly common. The Values Circle initiative of the World Bank also serves to show how this postmodern, (spiritual) consciousness is seeping into the value systems of the corporate world.

7.3 Spirituality and Development: Another 'MAD' Discourse?

Both the potentials and the dangers of spirituality and development have been highlighted in the above examination of its problematic issues. A further objective of this thesis was to contextualise spirituality and development within the broader discourses of alternative development critiques. Does spirituality and development represent a radical departure from the many critiques of development preceding it or is it just another 'mainstream alternative development' or MAD discourse?

For example, Pieterse argues that there is an increasing convergence in approaches to development between mainstream and alternative development. "Mainstream development is not what it used to be and it may be argued that the key question is rather whether growth and production are
considered within or outside the people-centred development approach and whether this can rhyme with the structural adjustment programmes followed by international financial institutions" (Ibid, p. 343). He argues that alternative development only provides a profile of alternative positions regarding development agency, methodology and epistemology, not an alternate paradigm, because “alternative development partakes of the momentum of modernity and the everlasting hope that the future will redeem the present” (Pieterse 1998, p. 349).

Is spirituality and development just another alternative developmentalism which, albeit, has challenged and sought to improve development agency, methods and objectives or values, but ultimately converges with the mainstream? Or does it represent something much more revolutionary and radical?

Two stances can be taken on this question. Spirituality and development can be viewed as being a reformulation of the many concerns of development that have already been identified by post-colonial, feminist and environmentalist critiques and it could be argued it offers nothing different.

As was seen in Chapter One, there is much common ground between post-colonial, anti-colonial, feminist, environmental, radical economists, and ecumenical critiques of development and the analyses that emerged from 'spiritual perspectives'. Spirituality and development discourses echo anthropological, geographical and ecumenical critiques on the unequal power relations between the North and South, the donor and the recipient. The idea of a cosmological construct parallels the anti-colonial emphasis placed on cultural frameworks and the need to integrate local or indigenous knowledge and experience and encompasses post-colonial demands for self-identity and self-representation. The need for a new meta-physics, a new life story that believes in the value and intelligence of all life speaks to the radical economist and eco-feminist challenge of Western materialism and economic growth as the overriding goals of development.

326
It can be seen in fact that many 'features' of alternative development perspectives outlined in Pieterse's table of Development Models (See Chapter 1 page 30) are addressed by spirituality and development discourses. For example, the IDRC and the WCC, as well as the Namibian respondents articulated a non-scientific epistemological foundation for development. Spiritual values were considered to be crucial in mediating the meanings of development. Spirituality and development discourses encompasses all of the alternative development calls for 'human capacitation', human agency, 'modernisation of tradition', participation and partnership and a broadening of the indicators used to measure development.

Indeed spirituality and development seems to follow closely the concerns that alternative development theories have raised. However, as Pieterse (1998) observes, mainstream development approaches have adopted and perhaps co-opted so many alternative development concerns that a mainstream alternative development position can increasingly be identified.

What prevents spirituality and development from being part of this 'MAD' position? It cannot be conclusively shown that spirituality and development is not another 'MAD', nor that it occupies a position radically apart from alternative development (AD) or 'MAD' positions. The whole discourse of spirituality and development is after all in its very preliminary stages of investigation. Perhaps it is, as some people suggest, a part of this revolutionary postmodern consciousness, this new global spirituality that some believe will solve the current urgent crises of humanity.

The spiritual belief that all life is interconnected certainly infuses spirituality and development discourses with a much stronger emphasis on relational ethics. Geographic, anti-colonial, post-colonial, feminist, ethnographic and ecumenical analyses have all focused on the power relations between North and South, the donor and the recipient and called for changes in the international structures of inequality and power differentials. However, spirituality and development discourses consider relational ethics to be much
more central to development. To be in 'good relation' is seen to be the central meaning and purpose of development. Relational ethics such as dignity, humility, love, respect, care, sharing, responsibility must govern development. Above all, development must be about human dignity and the power within to work for improvement. Development must embody the values of love, care, respect, social justice, humility, and so on.

Spirituality and development is underlain by a belief that humanity has a purpose in life that is spiritual and that the role of development is to support humanity's journey towards spiritual fulfillment. It is this idea of spiritual purpose, it can be argued, that is most significantly different from the many other critiques of development. Spirituality inculcates in development, the need for a new consciousness that goes beyond the cognitive recognition that development should not be just about material gain, to an understanding that development is part of a spiritual journey of humanity to better itself in reflection of 'divine' creation.

Certainly with this emphasis on the metaphysical meaning, not only of development, but life itself, and what purpose development is supposed to serve, spirituality and development offers a radical redefinition of development. Yet as many critiques of alternative, anti-development and post-development have so strongly raised, spirituality and development, at least at this point, offers no real construction of concrete ways to do development.

Perhaps spirituality and development should be seen as an approach rather than as a paradigm or as a theory in itself. As seen in Chapter One, Manzo (1991) cautioned that PAR or Participatory Action Research should be regarded as an approach to generating knowledge than as a set of propositions and testable hypotheses or it may become just another paradigm, reducible to a single expression and fixated on as a panacea for all development theory's problems (p. 29). Perhaps spirituality and development should also be seen in this light. Perhaps spirituality and development should
be regarded as a ‘consciousness’ rather than a theory or paradigm of development. In this way spirituality and development can never be corrupted or appropriated and can always remain potentially revolutionary simply because it urges development practitioners and theorists to question their expertise and to always remain accountable to real people rather than imagined representations.

7.4 Contribution to Knowledge

This thesis has described a conceptualisation of spirituality and development based on a review of a wide array of literature, and perspectives gained from empirical investigation of three Northern donor agency spirituality and development initiatives and from respondents in Namibia. It has identified a number of problematic issues that emerge as the idea of spirituality and development is translated into practice, and it has engaged spirituality and development with the broader discourses of alternative development.

The most important contribution this thesis makes is the idea that development might well be having a negative impact on the spiritual well being of recipients. This is not to say that it is the actual intent of Northern donors is to subvert the spirit of recipients. However, it is difficult to believe that donors are unaware of the gaping inconsistencies between rhetoric and reality. Even though the theory of project delivery upholds such policy ideals as participation, partnership and empowerment, certainly the concrete experiences of project delivery are blatant evidence of the unequal power and control between the donor and the recipient. As Kabeer (1994) so aptly describes, donors have the power to construct the rules of the game, disguise the operations of this power and construct the illusion of consensus and complementarity.

As the literature review in Chapter One has shown, unequal power relations have been the focus of many alternative critiques of development. However, what this thesis introduces is the idea that this unequal construct is
detrimental to the whole 'project of development'. Development has, as one of its foremost objectives, to support the empowerment of people in 'developing countries' so that they can achieve a sufficient and self-sustaining quality of life. It is believed that this development will then accord people with dignity.

However, the case study respondents spoke of the dehumanising effects of participation in development projects. They spoke of the loss of dignity that was imposed by the demands of external support agencies. They were deeply aware that the structures of external support projects compromised their pride and ultimately their conceptualisation of 'self'. Although they might not have been aware of the inconsistencies hidden behind the rhetoric of 'good' intent and reality at a technical level, they certainly communicated an intuitive understanding of the emotional consequences of the gap between rhetoric and reality.

They felt that in pursuing the material goals of development, they compromised their soul. This is not to say that the case study respondents did not desire the material benefits of development. It would be crass romanticism to paint a picture of smiling people completely oblivious to the benefits of an improved material standard of living. Rather, the respondents were saying that the feeling between people, between donor and recipient, and within the recipient communities were just, or even more important than such material goals. In essence they were saying that the soul was more important than any external manifestations of life. One can live in utter poverty and still have dignity, but without a soul life did not hold meaning.

Thus if development, and its cadre of Northern development agencies, are really intent on the empowerment of recipient communities, they must take a hard look at the way in which they conduct business. If spirituality and development is to become a new 'model' or even paradigm of development, it must encompass a central focus on relational ethics. It must also think hard
about the meaning of development. Too many perspectives have challenged the purely material goals of the current concept of development.

The case study showed that there are perspectives on the meaning of development that are very different from those of mainstream development and perhaps even those of alternative development. Reading between the lines, it is apparent that Namibians are participating in a development that is not only essentially meaningless, and more significantly, dehumanising. They are participating in a development that is simply not development.

The three initiatives on spirituality and development show that Northern donors are rethinking the meaning of development. The WCC has, almost since the formal decades of development began, challenged the material emphasis of mainstream development. Their concept of spirituality and development is embedded in the belief that humanity has a higher spiritual purpose and that development has a crucial role to play in following this destiny. Development is the most active expression of the Christian imperative for love and justice in our time (Ity 1967, p. 350).

The IDRC believes that development must be more holistic, integrating all physical and spiritual dimensions of humanity. Development must not just respect culture, but understand that culture is an expression of the cosmological vision of a people. This cosmological vision encompasses the entirety of beliefs, values, morals, ethics of action and relation, concepts of work and play, expressions of art, beauty, and joy, sense of identity, love of place, sense of belonging, beliefs in origin of life, the unseen and supernatural, and understandings of life and death. Sections of the World Bank also appeared to understand the significance of culture to development, and the negative impact that development can have if it ruptures the cultural code of a society.

Perhaps this deeper understanding of culture offers a resolution to the dilemma of a global ethic. Perhaps one of the main hindrances to evolving a
global ethic can be found in the lack of regard, and an incomplete understanding of what culture is and represents to people around the world. The Western world in particular tends to dismiss culture as peripheral to the main aspirations of life. The rest of the world is forced to divest of their 'cultural background' when they come to the negotiation table. Only secular, rational interpretations of life are credited. However as the case study has show a global ethic negotiated with this kind of compromise would be false. What is needed is a deep enough understanding of, and regard for culture so that the pitfalls both of trivial relativism and crude absolutism can be avoided.

If spirituality and development is revolutionary, it is not because it offers a radical paradigm to displace all other theories of development preceding it. Above all, spirituality and development is about the love of what it means to be human. Certainly no single paradigm can encompass the multitude of human expressions that abound in this world.

In his Millennium address (source), the Dalai Lama spoke of the excitement that people seem to be feeling for the new millennium. He says, however, that the new millennium in itself will be nothing special, not anymore happier, more peaceful and more harmonious for humankind, unless we make the effort to make it so. If we are going to make the right kind of efforts to make the future of the world better, the Dalai Lama believes that while engaging in material progress and taking care of physical well-being we need to pay equal attention to developing peace of mind and thus taking care of the internal aspect of our being (www.tibet.com/NewsRoom/millenium-message.html).

This I believe is the real revolutionary message of spirituality and development.
Bibliography

Books and Journals


Allen, Paula Gunn 1986 *The Sacred Hoop: Recovering the feminine in American Indian traditions*, Beacon Press Boston.


333


Boff, L. and Boff, C 1987 Introducing Liberation Theology Burns & Oates, United Kingdom.


Chase, Nora 1989 “Women must be part of the decision-making process”, Bricks Collective December 1989.


Daly, Herman E. 1996 *Beyond Growth: The economics of sustainable development*, Beacon Press, Boston.
Daly, Mary 1973 Beyond God the Father: Toward a philosophy of women's liberation, Beacon Press, Boston.


Fanon, F. 1963 The Wretched of the Earth, Grove Weidenfeld, New York.


Hishongwa, Ndutala Selma 1983 Women of Namibia VVT-Grafiska, Vimmerby.


hooks, bell 1984 Feminist Theory: from margin to centre, South End Press, Boston, Ma.

hooks, bell 1990 Yearning: Race, gender and cultural politics, Between the Lines, Toronto, Ontario, Canada.


Jensen, Derrick 1995 Listening to the Land: Conversations about nature, culture, and eros, Sierra Club Books, San Francisco.


Knappert, Jan 1981 Namibia Land and Peoples Myths and Fables, E.J. Brill, Leiden.

Kotahari, R. “NGOs, the State and World Capitalism”, in *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol 21, No. 50 13 December 1988, p.2177.


Kukathas, Chandran 1992 “Are There Any Cultural Rights?” *Political Theory, Vol 20 No 1, February 1992, p. 105-139*


Macy, Joanna. 1997 *Dharma and Development*, UMI Books on Demand, Ann Arbor, Michigan, USA.


Mills, W.G. “Missionaries, Xhosa Clergy and the Suppression of Traditional Customs”, paper delivered to 1992 conference: People, Power and
Culture: The History of Christianity in South Africa, 1792-1992, University of Western Cape.


Minh-ha, Trinh T. 1989 Woman, Native, Other: Writing Postcoloniality and feminism, Indiana University Press, Bloomington and Indianapolis.


Pront, Jan P. “Development in the ‘70s: Seven proposals”, in *The Ecumenical Review Volume XXVII, Number 1, January 1975*, p. 16-23.


346


Sidaway, James D. “In Other World: On the politics of research by ‘first world’ geographers in the ‘third world’”, *Area* 24, p. 403-408.


Sparks, Allister 1990 The Mind of South Africa: The story of the rise and fall of apartheid, Mandarin, South Africa.


SWAPO 1981 To Be Born a Nation: The Liberation Struggle for Namibia, Department of information and Publicity, SWAPO of Namibia, Zed Press, London.


Wa Thiong'o, Ngugi 1993 Moving the Centre: The struggle for cultural freedoms, James Curry, London.


Council of Churches of Namibia Reports


Weaver, Tony 1987 "The War in Namibia: Social consequences", in Namibia in Perspective G. Totemeyer, V. Kandetu, and W. Werner (eds.) Council of Churches in Namibia, Windhoek, p. 239-255.


Donor Development Documents


IDRC "Science, Religion and Development Project Description".
IDRC "Conference on Spirituality, Culture, and Economic Development" paper, 16-18 Val Morin, Quebec.


GTZ and IBIS documents


GTZ 1996 "Project Cycle Management (PCM) and Objectives-Oriented project Planning (ZOPP) Guidelines".

GTZ 1992 "Guidelines for project Progress Review".

GTZ 1991 "Methods and Instruments for Project Planning and Implementation (Outlines)".

352


GTZ 1995 “Guidelines for Appraisers Working on Project Preparations”, Unit 04 Strategic Corporate Development.

GTZ 1988 “ZOPP: An Introduction to the Method”.


IBIS/MRLGH OHSIP Progress Report No. 3 September 1994.


IBIS 1996 “Manual of Methodology”.


Musabayane, N. and Mudege, N.R. 1996 “Capacity Building Needs Assessment of the Department of Community Development (DCD) and the Church Women”, GTZ CAWS Project and Department of Water Affairs, Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Rural Development.


Osterhaus, J and Salzer, W. 1995 “Gender Differentiation throughout the Project Cycle”, Unit 04 Strategic Corporate Development, GTZ.

SWAM Orientation to and Integration of Poverty Alleviation and Gender Project Status Report November 1996.


Namibian Development Reports


Government of Namibia, Department of Women's Affairs 1998 "National Gender Policy and National Plan of Action on Gender".


Koep, Monica "Perspectives on the Role of Women in National Reconciliation and Nation-Building in Namibia", Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung.


Preston, Rosemary 1993 "The Integration of Returned Exiles, Former Combatants and Other War-Affected Namibians”, Namibian Institute for Social and Economic Research (NISR), University of Namibia, Windhoek.

Shigweda, Thaavi 1993 “Survey to Determine the Magnitude of Alcohol Abuse in the North West Health’s Region of Namibia, Ministry of Health and Social Services, Government of Namibia.


Namibian newspapers

General references:

Mail and Guardian

The Namibian

Namibia News

New Era

Specific References:

Megora, Denford “Namibia reconciliation up against the ropes”, Mail and Guardian March 15 1996.


Titus, Zoe “President urged ‘heal the land, heal yourself’”, The Namibia, October 20 1997.

Websites

www.ucalgary.ca/international/did/did.html

www.republicofnamibia.com

World Council of Church Documents


De Santa Ana, J. 1995 “Development and Civil Society”, in “Development Assessed: Ecumenical reflections and actions on development” Unit

356


Appendix 1

List of Interviewees

1. Church leaders

(1) Sister Samana Social Development Arm, Namibia Development Commission, Roman Catholic, Windhoek
(2) Reverend Hendrik Garaseb Pastor, African Episcopal Windhoek
(3) Reverend Aune Shilongo Pastor, ELCIN, Oniipa
(4) Reverend Mathews Tshipaka Kapola, Pastor and Secretary ELCIN Christian Education, ELCIN, Ongwediva.
(5) Reverend Titus Ngula, Pastor, ELCIN, Oshakati
(6) Reverend Jason Haufiku, Pastor, ELCIN, Oshakati
(7) Emily Kandume Church leader, Baptist Church, Oshakati
(8) Reverend Efraim Angula Pastor, ELCIN, Oshakati

2. Development Agents

(1) Kauna Ekandjo Chief Liaison Officer, Directorate of Community Development Oshana/Omusait Region Ministry of Regional and Local Government and Housing.
(2) Nghitila Teolifus NAPCOD (Namibia Programme to Combat Desertification)
(3) Kahepako Haniu-Kakujaua NAPCOD

3. CCN Staff

(1) Ngeno Nakamela General Secretary
(2) Nangula Kathindi North Women's Desk Coordinator and Priest, Anglican Church
(3) Samson Ndwekili Director Social Justice and Faith Cluster
(4) Miriam Nepembe Director Social Welfare Division

4. Elders and Traditional Healers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Location Of Interview</th>
<th>Birth Area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jason Amakutuwa</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>retired pastor</td>
<td>Elam</td>
<td>Oshika, Ukwambi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kilian Shehama</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Kalimba</td>
<td>Otanwa, Ukwambi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oswald Mukola</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>Chief Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basius Nangola</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gideon Shaningwa</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Iipumba</td>
<td>Ukwambi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Micheal Kansik</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ukwambi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosana Isidor</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ortiele Shatumba</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josephine Amvama</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Francine Ndemooogela</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ester Kashiopoku</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Headman</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
<td>Ombalantu</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Community and Government leaders

(1) Julia Nepembe SWAPO Women’s Council Oshana Region
(2) D.V. Kashikola Regional Executive Officer, Oshana Region
(3) Slyvanus Vatuva, Governor Oshana Region
(4) Hans Daniel Namhuja author
(5) Dr. Paul Issac Professor of Theology, University of Namibia, Windhoek

6. Churchwomen’s groups

Group 1

(1) Ausika Asteria RC
(2) Phillipus Regina ELCIN
(3) Phillipus Selma ELCIN
(4) Amwaama Albertina ELCIN
(5) Shatilwe Monica ELCIN
(6) Hinamwaami Ndapewa ELCIN
(7) Kamati Herodia ELCIN
(8) Tuyeni Helena RC
(9) Ipinge Tea RC
(10) Shileka Laina ELCIN
(11) Mheresia Nashapi ELCIN
(12) Hilongwa Linda ELCIN

Group 2

(1) Ausika Asteria RC
(2) Mule Sylvia ELCIN
(3) Shileka Laina Nd ELCIN
(4) Hilongwa Linda ELCIN
(5) Kamati Herodia ELCIN
(6) Nashapi Theresa RC
(7) Shilume Sophia RC
(8) Phillipus Regina ELCIN
(9) Kashiimba Veronica RC
(10) Mukwendje Wilhemia ELCIN
(11) Shatilue Minica ELCIN
(12) Shikingo Hilja ELCIN
(13) Nlienge Foibe ELCIN
(14) Phillipus Selma ELCIN
(15) Amwama Albertina ELCIN
(16) Itana Fenni ELCIN
(17) Amwaana Legina ELCIN
(18) Shongola Mariam ELCIN
(19) Hinamwaami Ndwapewa ELCIN
(20) Tuyeni Helena ELCIN

7. Informal Settlements

(1) Okangwena, Ondangwa SWAM project
(2) Amunkambja Oshakati OHSIP project
(3) Oneshila, Oshakati OHSIP project (not interviewed)
Appendix 2

Interview and Questionnaire Content

(1) Interviews with Church leaders:

1. In the Church, and for you personally, define concepts of religion and spirituality. Do they differ? How?

2. What is/has been the role of mysticism in religion or spirituality or traditional beliefs in Namibia?

3. Are you aware of traditional beliefs in Namibia?

4. What is the relationship between traditional beliefs and Christianity and the Church? Are traditional beliefs reflected in Church?

5. What is the present strength/problems with Christianity/Church in Namibia given the modernization trends occurring and in view of past role of Marxist/Communist in SWAPO and exile population.

6. What is the current role of CCN and Church in rebuilding society in Namibia and in the process of reconstruction and reconciliation?

7. What are your views on international development philosophies, policies, approaches and strategies as well as attitude in terms of usefulness and appropriateness to Namibian development process?

8. What kinds of questions would you ask development agencies about the role of religion/spirituality in development programmes?

9. What are your views on the role of Church - religion - spirituality in the global ecological crisis?

(2) Interview with Namibian development agents:

1. What is your concept of development?

2. What are your concepts of religion and spirituality?

3. What do you feel is or can be the role of spirituality / religion in development?
4. What has been your experiences with international development agencies, SWAM and OHSIP in particular in terms of role of spirituality and religion?

5. How would you suggest ESA’s can integrate this role of spirituality and religion in their programme approaches and strategies?

6. What are your views on the role of the Church in development in Namibia? and globally?

(3) Interviews with CCN officials:

1. What is your concept of development?

2. What are your concepts of religion and spirituality?

3. What do you feel is or can be the role of spirituality / religion in development?

4. What has been your experiences with international development agencies, SWAM and OHSIP in particular in terms of role of spirituality and religion?

5. How would you suggest ESA’s can integrate this role of spirituality and religion in their programme approaches and strategies?

6. What are your views on the role of the Church in development in Namibia? and globally?

7. What is the philosophy of CCN in development?

8. What is the present situation in terms of CCN programmes in development? funding? membership?

9. Can you explain what is the concept of Christian Base communities and Regional Council of Churches?

10. What is the current role of CCN and Church in rebuilding society in Namibia and in the process of reconstruction and reconciliation?

(4a) Interviews with Elders

1. Can you tell me the stories of your grandmothers and grandfathers about how life was back then?
2. What were the beliefs about water, land, trees, rain, animals, women, men, children, leaders, community, and society?

3. What were the beliefs about the dead? Do you believe they may protect you?

4. Do you have holy places, trees that cannot be cut, places where no one can go or play in?

5. What are the benefits of the old ways?

6. How much of the old ways has been lost and what is still existing?

7. When did they start being lost? Why?

8. How do you think this loss has affected the quality of life for women, men, children, community, society, nature, and animals?

9. Now that they have been lost and modern development has started, what do you see as being the problems and good points of this? I.e. what do you like about life today? What do you not like about life today? How were these bad things kept away in the old days?

10. How do you think life can be improved?

11. How do you think the old ways relates to the new religion and Church?

(4b) Interviews with traditional healers

1. Can you tell me the stories of your grandmothers and grandfathers about how life was back then?

2. What were the beliefs about water, land, trees, rain, animals, women, men, children, leaders, community, and society?

3. What were the beliefs about the dead? Do you believe they may protect you?

4. Do you have holy places, trees that cannot be cut, places where no one can go or play in?

5. What are the benefits of the old ways?

6. How much of the old ways has been lost and what is still existing?

7. When did they start being lost? Why?
8. How do you think this loss has affected the quality of life for women, men, children, community, society, nature, and animals...

9. Now that they have been lost and modern development has started, what do you see as being the problems and good points of this? I.e. what do you like about life today? What do you not like about life today? How were these bad things kept away in the old days?

10. How do you think life can be improved?

11. How do you think the old ways relates to the new religion and Church?

12. What types of healing do you offer?

13. When did you become a healer?

14. Did someone train you?

15. How long did it take you to become a healer?

16. Do you have a spirit helper?

17. Do you use the Bible and prayers to heal people?

18. How many patients do you heal?

19. Who are your patients?

20. Do you send some patients to doctors?

21. Does the Church oppose her work?

(5) Interviews with Community leaders:

1. For you personally, can you define what is religion and what is spirituality? Do they differ? How?

2. Are you aware of traditional beliefs in Namibia (northern)?

3. How did these traditional beliefs affect everyday life in terms of influencing or protecting the environment - water, trees, animals, women, men, children, community, society?

4. What is the relationship between these traditional beliefs and religion-Church? Was it ever different in the past?
5. What is the role of the Church-religion-Christianity in rebuilding Namibia? Has it changed over time? How?

6. What is your experience with international and government development programmes? Have they benefited Namibia in terms of human and societal development? In what ways?

7. Would you suggest different ways of doing development?

8. What do you think should be the role of spirituality-religion-traditional beliefs in development?

(6) Questionnaire with Churchwomen's group

1. What strengths did you derive from this workshop?

2. Have you been in workshops on women's issues before? How did it differ from this one?

3. What did you learn in this workshop?

4. How will this help you in working in the communities?

5. Do you feel ready to work in the communities?

6. Why did you want to work in the communities?

7. What is religion to you? What is spirituality to you?

8. Do you know of the old traditional beliefs in the communities? Can you tell me any? What is their relationship to religion-Christianity and spirituality?

9. Do you think Church leaders or traditional leaders are more important? Why?

10. What do you feel about government or external (donor) development projects? What is the relationship between the traditional, spiritual and religious beliefs of the community? Any problems? Why? What do you feel would be more appropriate approaches?

(7) Informal Settlements:

In two informal settlements, focus group discussions were conducted to find their concepts of development and spirituality. The community groups were divided into subgroups of: elder men and women (> 50), women and men (30-50 years old), younger men and
women (15-29 years old), and youth (<15). Each group was give the same list of terms and asked to define each. Each group then presented their work to the larger group after everyone had finished. The list of terms included:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Oshvanbo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Church</td>
<td>Ongerki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>Eitaalo Iyopaukalunga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King-Queen</td>
<td>Omukwailwa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customary law</td>
<td>Oompango dhopashigwana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black bull</td>
<td>Ondumetano onduudhe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prophet</td>
<td>Omuhungneki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ancestral spirits</td>
<td>Oombepo dhaakwampungu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>Oshigwana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donor agencies</td>
<td>Ehangano Iyomakwathelo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional healer</td>
<td>Ongana yopamithigululwakalo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household</td>
<td>Egumbo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>E panglo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>God</td>
<td>Kalunga-Kanangombe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spirituality</td>
<td>Uukwambepo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific ancestors</td>
<td>Mangundu, Kantene, Mungandjera</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each group was then asked to provide a concept of development by assessing which of these words that they feel were the most important to development.
Appendix 3

Interview and Questionnaire Results

1. Church Leaders:

(1) Sister Samana: Roman Catholic Church

Concept of religion and spirituality - There is no difference. Christianity is what you believe in and this belief is spirituality. There is only one spirit which guides your beliefs to do good - this is Christianity.

Traditional beliefs - Before Christianity, people had traditional beliefs. We do need to integrate these beliefs into Christianity. The way to integrate these beliefs is through the priest who is Namibian and who knows the traditions of the culture, which has the respect of the community and can listen to the community and they to him.

Strengths and weaknesses of the Church and Christianity in Namibia -

Strengths:

• The Roman Catholic Church and the Church in general has brought education, health and money into the country (through support from overseas).

• In the colonial and apartheid days, the Catholic schools were much better than the “Bantu schools” and built the dignity of the people.

• Roman Catholic Church is involved in the Justice and Peace Commission.

Weaknesses:

• The RC Church used to be a strong member of the Council of Churches of Namibia but it is now not very cooperative within the Council. There seems to be a lot of political in fighting amongst the member Churches.

• The RC Church was associated too closely with SWAPO in the past. The fear is that this won’t change. The Church needs to have the courage to stand alone. The RC Church has opposed the Wall of Silence/ detainee issue, taking the side of the Government.

The Role of the Church - As a member of the CCN, the RC Church is taking part in the effort to restructure the Church structure. The CCN needs to be a facilitator while the member Churches are the implementers.

The Church also needs to help build the dignity of the people of Namibia and to keep tabs on the move towards privatizing basic needs such as water. The Church needs to speak out on behalf of the people to ensure that social benefits are not taken away from people who are too poor to say anything about it.

The Church also needs to be a watchdog in the political field - to refer to the Bible to see the truth - because the opposition party is so weak.

The CCN should also take on a theological role, not just an administrative one to provide good moral leadership on all issues in the development of Namibia.
Relationship with secular donor agencies - The Roman Catholic Church has no real relationship with any such agencies but feels there should be to facilitate development in Namibia.

(2) Reverend Hendrik Garaseb, African Methodist Episcopal Church

Concept of religion and spirituality - Religion is a system of beliefs that goes in line with our own experiences and capabilities. It is a system of life that is adapted to our own lives. A pastor has three responsibilities - to creation, to oneself so that one can interact with your center, and to others, family and community.

Spirituality is how I live out my responsibilities and how I make sense of those relationships. Spirituality is the satisfaction I derive from this. It can be within traditional beliefs or Christianity. Things that contribute to it such as socio-economic, moral and interpersonal situations enrich spirituality.

Traditional beliefs - when Christianity came to Africa it made a mistake to not value traditional life and the beliefs of the people. It damaged the traditional values of the people and their spirituality. Christianity and traditional are interdependent. Christianity would have been much richer if it respected traditional values.

Strengths and weaknesses of the Church and Christianity -

Strengths:

- The Church has an ecumenical emphasis, bringing together all the Churches to look at the relevancy of their faith in the context of social life. This also helps in pooling together to share resources for joint efforts to development communities.

- Christianity contributes and gives satisfaction to individual needs for spiritual upliftment and gives hope to people in our theology.

Weaknesses:

- The Church in Namibia has been too strongly influenced by Western ways

- The Church makes people look at their souls and for salvation but it ignores the person's physical and intellectual needs. This leads to a separated soul. Religion needs to be a 3 dimensional experience of the soul, mind and body.

The Role of the Church - Before Independence, many people relied on the Church as a place of refuge, a place to gather strength in times of trouble and in its role in addressing issues of violence and repression. The Church still maintains its position; people give it credit for its role during the war. However, the Church does not seem to be getting stronger. Many people thought that after the war, it was left behind. The role of the Church as a prophetic Church was silenced. The Church was no longer vigilant on issues of injustice and human rights i.e. the detainee issue. Violation of human rights is the same whether perpetrated by apartheid forces or our own. Some Church leaders seem to be afraid to change their role and that change will mean separation from the government and consequent lack of support. But the Church is changing its role. On the detainee issue the Church is pushing it to the forefront for the purpose of reconciliation, against the wishes of the government. So it is hopeful that the Church will regain its old position; the trust of the people.
Concept of development - Development must be holistic, it cannot be for short-
term relief which in the end helps the giver more than the receiver. It must be value
oriented where the whole person is uplifted. Development must have a foundation
and a destination i.e. to enable someone to do things for her/himself but it must not
be something given to make a person dependent and to look up to someone who is
better than you and to give them power over you. The end product of development
is to enable a community to assist another community to realize their own potential.

Relationship to international development agencies - International agencies are not
really interested in development of Africa or of a particular community. They
choose to give rations to countries to foster dependence and carry out their own
motives and get good appraisals rather than to pay attention to the long future of
Namibia. Africa is in further debt than before and the debt payments have drained
Africa of resources. Development as it now stands is totally unacceptable. The
biblical term for development focuses on those the strength of the communities
who are to be development. It's spirituality forms it's strength. It cannot be taken
out and replaced with someone else's spirituality. The Government needs to take a
role in development by working with communities to identify their basic needs and
how to solve problems before going out to donors for money. This makes a regional
planning process a necessity where all civil and political representation is involved.
Churches need to be involved in development, locally and regionally as they were in
the period of colonialism. The political system and constitution in Namibia is of
course heavily influenced by western ideals. In this system, the Churches cannot be a
formal part of the government. This is necessary of course, but unfortunately it can
also mean that the Church is so far away that it has no say in what is acceptable for
the people vis-a-vis the government. The Church needs a good working relationship
with the government so that it can act as a watchdog and speak on behalf of those
that may be harmed by government policies, etc. In Namibia, a lot of the exiles,
including present leaders do not know that the people that remained behind
depended on the Church on a daily basis, they depended on the Church for
development. The role of the Church, the importance it can play in the development
of Namibia should not be ignored now that we have Independence.

(3) Reverend Aune Shilongo

Concept of religion and spirituality - Religion is what people believe. Spirituality is
the belief in Christianity and the Trinity of God.

Traditional beliefs - Before Christianity, people believed in Kalunga (God). People
believed that when you died, you just went to the other world. It took 13 years for
the first conversion to Christianity.

Strengths and weaknesses of the Church and Christianity -

Strength: The Church can freely preach the gospel, the people in Namibia love the
Church. The message of the Church never becomes old. The message of salvation
always gives people hope.

Weakness: People understand democracy in different ways and are perhaps not
disciplined. The Church is trying to follow people wherever they are but there are
also not enough pastors.

Concept of Development - Development is to help those in need. For example with
the alcohol issue. Development means to help them by discussing their needs,
having retreats and workshops and providing good works such as gardening for
them.
Role of spirituality and religion in development - If religion is what you believe and your faith in Christianity and God and development is a physical need, then Christianity and development are together because evangelism and development are one in the same - helping people in need and preaching love and the fulfillment of needs. This helps people to understand love and to thus help themselves.

(4) Reverend Mathews Tshapaka Kapola

Concept of religion and spirituality - they are the same. Before the Missionaries came to Namibia, the people had traditional beliefs about the rules and norms of God and a set of taboos on what not to do. They lived as spiritual people, knowing God. God was known as Kalunga a God who has no beginning and no ending, a God that created himself. Spirituality was how to worship Kalunga, not in the sense of having a Church and a Sunday mass, but in terms of a concept of doing right, and of repentance. For example, if there was a drought or other catastrophe, people believed that they had done something wrong and that they needed to repent (from sin). Western missionaries didn't introduce Namibians to God. They only brought a new form of worship, i.e. how to worship God through the Church. So religion and spirituality are the same, not separate. The best way to explain this is to show that in Africa, if a baby is born, it is automatically a part or a member of belief (religion). If this wasn't so, then it was to deny Kalunga and thus to deny society itself. That is why Christianity is so strong in Namibia.

Role of mysticism - I believe that people are bestowed by God to be spiritual leaders, to act in this capacity. These people choose to become spiritual leaders, in the old days, as headmen associated with the kings, today as pastors or Church leaders. A pastor is someone who is trained and takes the place of the traditional spiritual leaders. They are trained to preach the message of God and to pass on this message to the youth.

Awareness of traditional beliefs - There are traditional healers still but no more spiritual leaders. But there is no discontinuity between the old and the new; as is there is no discontinuity between culture and religion. Traditional beliefs and Christianity are becoming integrated, for example, before Namibian names were not acceptable as baptismal names but now they are. Missionaries did not understand the full concept of African spirituality and feared that traditional beliefs would taint their religion so they used many mechanisms to stop integration. But missionaries cannot bring the authentic presence of God, or an understanding of the Church to a foreign culture, they need to first understand that culture. The fact that they didn't prevented good theological interpretation into the Church.

Marxist influence during the war - This was not really a problem although it probably weakened some people's faith in Christianity as the youth especially would have heard messages that God does not exist. But I think once people return they can regain their belief.

Views on External Support Agencies and international development projects - Development, water resources, roads, buildings, schools, preserving nature, all this was led by the Church before apartheid and before Independence. We do appreciate external support but the problem is that these agencies dictate where and how to use the resources that they give. We know our needs but we do not know how to define them and thus ESA's do not listen to us. But they should listen to us and to our advice; we shouldn't have to listen to their advice. External agencies say, "we are the experts", but there is no way that they can be the experts in Namibians. Namibians are the experts in our own country. External support only has the resources. The way development is set up now; the majority does not benefit. Only the elite are
pocketing the money. Western countries are hand-in-hand with this though as they support African governments for their own agendas. So the Church needs to be prophetic; to challenge the political and economic injustices.

The Role of the Church in the ecological crisis- the Church is doing very little in this area. The issue is the problematic relationship between basic needs/ poverty and the need to protect the environment. Churches here in Namibia are involved in treeplanting however. The Church needs to explain to our members what is ecology and about environmental problems. Pastors need to know about this first though. The colonial government was very guilty of poor environmental practices while they supposedly developed the country. The Churches recognize they need to be aware of the ecological problem but it is not really a priority issue. Donors should use the Church to teach people awareness of the environment. The Church gets bypassed in the bilateral aid approach.

(5) Reverend Titus Ngula

Traditional beliefs - His mother was a traditional healer and did not become Christian until she married. He remembers some of the traditional beliefs. For example:

- Ovambos believed in God, called Kalunga who was not a Holy Person in the sky but a being that brought good luck, rain, helped people in times of need, etc.
- We believed that a dead person didn’t just vanish but went somewhere where they could follow people still alive. They could be prayed to for help and they could also harm you.
- People prayed for good luck when they were going somewhere, for rain etc.
- We used to smear the blood of animals on sick people and even drink the blood to be cured.

Relationship between Christianity and traditional beliefs – There is no relationship between them. We have inherited the word of Kalunga but otherwise have thrown away much of the traditional beliefs. One difference is that before if a person did something wrong to the community, they were afraid of people but not of Kalunga. Now if people do something wrong, they are afraid of God. Also before we believed in Kalunga as a creator but we did not know his love. The Christian God loves us. We have adapted traditional beliefs theologically also though. For example, the belief in smearing blood on the sick to be cured we relate to how the blood of Jesus Christ who died on the cross to save us all.

Problems in the Church – Some people do not want to believe in the Church and say that there is no God, especially those that were exiled in communist countries. Other people say that God exists but do not want to follow Him because they have spirits from Satan and these people want to go back to traditional ways.

Role of the Church – In rebuilding Namibia, the Church needs to bring people back to the Church.

Concept of religion, spirituality and development – Religion is trust in God. Spirituality is to be in the spirit of God, being ruled by the laws of God and by being united with God through Jesus Christ an also being united with fellow mankind. Development is moving forward in whatever you are involved in; to learn better
ways and to grow in our ideas. For example, when the missionaries came, only foreigners were allowed to be pastors, but now we have our own Namibian bishops.

Role of religion and spirituality in development – When development came, people began to move away from the Church and from God. They are just looking to material things now especially the youth who are pushing away those who have the word of God. Also kids are having education especially at university where religion is not involved. So the Church is now working with difficulty because of development. People say they have to right to believe in what they want, not God. Children are growing up without hearing the word of God.

Development should be done with the word of God. The Church needs to keep preaching the word of God. Right now people are going off all over the place. There is no unity. The way to link religion and development is through Jesus Christ who will bring people together. Jesus is the only one who has the power to give fruit; to turn water into wine.

The Role of the Church and religion in environmental protection— When you are talking about the Church, you are talking about the people. They are the ones who have to take responsibility. The Church should work with the government to protect the environment. The Church can use Psalm 8, which says that humans are given the authority to protect and care for all creation. If people want to destroy creation, it has already been given to people from God to protect and use so it will not hurt God, only people. So it us up to people to take responsibility.

(6) Reverend Jason Haufiku

Relationship between Christianity and traditional beliefs – There is no relationship because the Church does not follow traditional practices. For example, in the old days when someone became sick, it was thought that it was because there were bad ancestral spirits in them and that you had to kill an animal to cure them. But in Christianity we know that Jesus Christ died to save us. But there are also similarities between Christianity and traditional beliefs. For example, it was believed in the past that if a person from one clan killed a person from another clan, he had to pay 5 cows to that clan and slaughter one in order that a good relationship is restored between the clans. In Christianity Moses had to kill cows and sheep to wash away sins. But we cannot sacrifice animals anymore because God gave up his only son to save us. The Kalunga that our elders believed in is the same as the Christian God. It is only that the missionaries revealed God’s will to us. But a person cannot be Christian and believe in traditional ways.

Strengths and weakness of the Church in Namibia –

Strengths:

• It is still preaching the gospel

• It is still continuing with the 10 commandments and ensuring that people do not do bad things.

• It is also still praying to God to give strength to doctors to help the HIV disease to go away.

• It is helping poor people and elders and orphans.

• The Church is now on its own. In the old days it was led by Missionaries but now we have Namibian leaders.

373
The Church is still moving forward and recruiting new members.

Many of the traditional practices were not good. For example, when a girl became pregnant before being married, she was burned and exiled and the child was killed. But now the Church does not allow this. The problem with this though is that now there is no fear, more girls are getting pregnant.

Weakness:

- The Church has lost a lot of members due to alcohol and other reasons.
- In regards to so many girls getting pregnant, the Church sees this but is not doing anything about it.
- Non-one confesses their sins anymore.

The role of the Church in rebuilding Namibia – The Church puts up dates for prayers to have reconciliation. The Church is mobilizing and getting more members and building up the Churches around the country.

The role of the Church in environmental protection – The Church works alongside the government in protecting the environment. Pastors preach to the congregation how to protect the environment and also hold special meetings on this subject. Pastors use theology i.e. bible passages especially Genesis, Exodus, Leviticus.

Concepts of religion, spirituality and development – religion is everlasting life through Jesus Christ. Spirituality – a spirit is deep within you (pointing to his chest) which means that you believe in God, you can’t see Him with your own eyes but you can see deep into yourself.

Development is to wake up and have a better understanding.

The Role of religion and spirituality in development – When religion came, the people changed from old ways to new ways and brought upon a better understanding of people and then they developed. For example, the passage from Jeremiah says that the Holy Spirit will come and fill up the hearts of people and then they won’t be afraid of what they have to do because they have the Holy Spirit leading them and this is how they develop through the Holy Spirit. Children learn good moral behavior through their parent’s belief and development. You have development through spirituality and development.

(7) Emily Kandume

The Baptist Church is a new one in Namibia. It is more charismatic and spiritual with loud music. The young people like this the most. The main message of the Church is to love and to pray and to preach to others.

Spirituality is brought under the Church but the Church doesn’t really know what spirituality is. It means to really understand what the word of God is. It means to love each other, to commit to each other and to be united. Other Churches try but they have so many rules, too much tradition in their interpretation of the Bible. So there is more fear than love.

The role of the Church and religion in development – The Church needs to go to people, to sit, listen, talk and pray and to help people to understand the word of God and to learn to love. Then people will be free and be truly independent.
Independence came too quickly. Between 1986-89, the Church was really bringing out freedom, but when Independence came, people looked to material things and grew individualistic. The government has fostered dependence by trying to do so much for the people. People are not free, they are too materialistic and they ignore the Church now because the big Churches are too rigid and do not allow people to speak their feelings.

(8) Reverend Efraim Angula

Relationship between the Church and traditional ways – They are far from each other. In the old days, Missionaries wanted people to confess and leave their old ways, but people did not want to leave their old ways. People used to believe in ancestral spirits and traditional healers. These were their Kalunga. People feared ancestral spirits and did not want to sin against or the spirits would be angry. Evangelists freed the people from this fear. Christ is better than Kalunga because Christianity brought peace and freed the people from fearing spirits. Christianity has beliefs that stop fighting and wars. The old ways did not have any beliefs that prevented people from fighting. But Kalunga and the Christian God are the same. There is only one God. You cannot believe in Kalunga and ancestral spirits and also be Christian. Those ancestral spirits are there but they are Satan, which fights Christianity.

Kalunga created the world but only the Christian God brought the idea of love. He takes care of us and takes away our sins through Jesus Christ. But some traditional ways can be integrated into Christianity. For example, we should use our own language to preach in and we should use songs in our services. Singing is a part of the Namibian culture. We should also use dancing and the beating of drums and traditional houses and baskets.

Strengths and weaknesses of the Church and religion –

Strengths:

• The Church is preaching the word of God and through preaching the gospel to have peace amongst people.

• The Church is still saving those who are not Christian and continuing with their missions.

• The Church is encouraging reconciliation and urging the government to continue with this.

Weaknesses:

• The Church is becoming weaker because the pastors do not have the strength of the old pastors. They don’t have the courage to preach like in the old days. This is because the Church is not paying pastors very well and so pastors have to also have other jobs to get money. They are also leaving the Church to join the government.

• There are fewer people coming to services because there is no outreach. Pastors are not going out to the communities to spread the word of God. Also during the war people came to the Church to pray to God to help them and to bring people back from exile but with peace, there is no need.

• There is no real problem with the exiles. We feared that many would return not Christians because they had been exposed to other religions and ideas. But most
actually returned strong Christians because they had faced so many problems. Only a few say that God does not exist.

The role of the Church and religion in rebuilding Namibia – The Church has been responsible for developing the nation especially in terms of schools, hospitals, taking care of the poor. The Church not only preached but also helped people to help themselves. With independence, the Church’s role is not as strong vis-à-vis the government but this is good. The government should do it.

Concept of religion, spirituality and development – Religion is believing that God can do everything and believing in the Truth which is His word and that God will do what he said in His word; i.e. faith. Spirituality means that we believe that God is there and is the one who will take care of us and we trust in the spirit of God which will lead us to the next world. It is to believe his Truth will fight Satan and He will win. It is also that person who has trust in God and who will guard and lead us wherever we are going. Development means that we won’t stay but will move forward in our life, work, economy and in our education. We want Namibia to go forward.

The role of spirituality and religion in development – God gives us the faith to see that what we are doing is good and to trust in ourselves, to have the strength through Jesus Christ who is going to help us.

I have seen with government projects and donor projects that the people who end up leading them are often not with good spirit. They take what is intended for everyone for himself or herself. They do not love but care only for themselves.

The Church needs to take a role in environmental protection but the problem is that the awareness has come too late and all the trees are cut down and there is not enough water to plant trees.

(3) Development Agents:

(1) Kauna Ekandjo Chief Community Liaison Directorate of Community Development Oshana/Omusati Region

Concept of development – I have seen a great shift from economic to human resources development. But development is deeper. It is about the human center. People are the key actors in bringing about change i.e. living conditions. I don’t believe development will happen unless there is the awareness of the creation to improve. I do not like imposed concepts of development. People have old ways but do not agree with saying that they are bad. I prefer that if development happens it is a kind that people are comfortable with. People develop at their own pace. Development should mean capacity building, not in the sense that it is used by external donors but in the sense that people should have the ability to reason and choose their own way. The benefits have to be positive and satisfaction brought about by the main actors in our own development. Human development is the key and this means having the capacity to choose improvement. There are many traditional beliefs that could foster development, especially in the protection of the environment. But in Namibia there are no groups that support traditional beliefs. No women’s groups any NGO’s and in DCD there is no institution either. It is up to the individual activator to understand traditional beliefs as an entry point to development.

Concept of spirituality and religion – Religion is the practice people follow the rituals and the procedures that people follow. It is a process that has the purpose of teaching people to follow faith and to have rules and regulations for that. Spirituality
is a way of life. It is abstract something that you feel within yourself. It is emotional. It enhances the continuity of human life, for living harmoniously, for example, with nature. When you see beautiful nature, your spirit is touched, you feel connected and "you know that God exists". It is an awe and wonder of the world. Nature is a part of spirituality. It is creation. Spirituality and religion are interconnected but the Church does not promote this relationship.

Role of spirituality and religion in development – Spirituality is embedded in religion that is embedded with traditional beliefs. Religion should play a positive role in development but it should not hamper development. In environmental protection the Church so far is taking little role in helping. There is very little outreach. The Church does not address traditional beliefs and are even against them so it discourages people from keeping traditional beliefs, some of which are useful in protecting the environment.

Experiences with external support programmes – I don’t think that ESA’s are part of Namibia. I know the process of ESA development programmes. I am introduced to all the officials. They say they need DCD help to organize and mobilize communities so I am familiar with ESA aims and objectives. We are here and know how to operate but these ESA programmes lack in knowing or caring what people believe in or not. The only reason these programmes are not rejected is because people benefit materially from them. But this is not good enough. I can see that one problem with ESA programmes is that the expatriates are very different from us, personality wise. There is no spirituality. It is as if religion is not important for them and they don’t even recognize it. Why? Perhaps because they don’t know the culture and are not willing to be a part of it. There is no way a programme can be successful this way. Relatedly, these programmes do not respect community views. The people want and expect to be respected. It is not good that expatriates are always seen to be the expert in total. It should not always be that they give instructions to the communities, along with their values, through DCD. They should go to the communities themselves and understand communities and values. They need to learn to work with the communities instead of for the communities.

How to integrate – If for example, I was to go to China, I would have to:
1. Have a good background on history and the culture of the area.
2. Collect baseline information in cultural practices and taboos so that I know how to respect their culture and live with the community.

But the SWAM programme for example, is partnered with the Town Councils and the Ministry but not with the communities. At least the UNICEF project has field workers who have to live on the ground. Unfortunately, there is poor contact usually between the expatriate managers and the Namibian field workers. They don’t listen to the Namibians.

The OHIP programme was better. It went through DCD who attached a community liaison officer to OHSIP. They followed a good approach and approached existing Community Development Committees (CDC’s) These CDC’s were able to talk directly to OHSIP. The only problem was a political one where the existing CDC’s were elected on political grounds. This led to a lot of in fighting and finally it was decided that the CDC’s had to be re-elected. OHSIP trained the community in toilet construction and in brick making ad the money made went straight back to the communities. CDC’s were in charge of the money. The attitude of the OHSIP managers was easy going and outgoing, not like in SWAM. But there were also problems with OHSIP. One was the transparency of funds between OHSIP and Oshakati Town Council. The Town Council accused OHSIP of not using project funds properly. It was also felt that OHSIP was dictating to CDC’s on
what the priorities should be in terms of infrastructural work. But I feel OHSIP succeeded because of their good community mobilization approach. OHSIP did not have any religious or traditional beliefs integrated into their methodology either. The problem with SWAM is that the real decisions were always made at the top. In general ESA's don't address the most important aspects of development, which is the people's feelings and their religious and spiritual outlook. Maybe if the programme managers were less technical, maybe sociologists or anthropologists, they would be more sensitive to these aspects of development.

(2) Nghitila Teofilus researcher, NAPCOD (Namibia Programme to Combat Desertification)

(3) Kahepako Hariua-Kakujaua Outreach Coordinator NAPCOD

Traditional beliefs – In the old days people were not caught unawares. They knew when there would be drought, what the harvest would be like. They knew this through their own natural sciences in their surroundings. For example, in trees, if a certain type had certain types of leaves or a certain amount of fruit, then they would know whether there would be higher or lower amounts of rainfall. People knew what was happening and what to expect. There was a practice that if no rain was coming, you should take two black oxen to the East and slaughter. The east is for the Herero who saw that the rain in Hereroland came from the east; the clouds formed there.

(5) CNN Staff:

(1) Nangula Kathindi Women's Desk Coordinator North. Priest, Anglican Church

Concept of development – If the Church cannot consider itself within its context, then it is not developed. When the Church is able to train her own people, then it is developed and it can improve the life if the Church in terms of capacity building i.e. fund raise for its own programmes and not depend on foreign aid. Development is also when the Church becomes Africanized rather than being more Western than the West. Development in the Church is also when spirituality is connected is connected to everyday lives with bottom up participation. There needs to be more people led Bible stories in services. There also needs to be more equal interaction between the pastor and the people. The pastors need to come down from their pedestal. The Church is losing lots of people due to the “holy” position of the clergy. Development is when something is happening to people’s lives, when they start thinking of different ways and they move from place to place. People realize their needs, prepare themselves, organize and work for improvement. Development needs to be ongoing and spontaneous. Development is about improvement. Development is being proud of one’s place and one’s own material level, no matter how poor. It is also about giving support and taking responsibility for others. It is about dignity.

Concept of spirituality and religion – Religion is a practice which people follow which has rituals and procedures. Spirituality is what comes up when you go to Church and do rituals. It is what you feel when you pray and do devotion. It is the practice of my religion. Spirituality is connectedness to people and to nature. In nature it is connectedness with yourself and nature. With people, it is connectedness with the beauty in people, like connecting with God. Spirituality is the key that takes
me to my center. God says that we are made in his image and we are responsible for creation. So I have the power and control. Belief in God is strength in self.

Relationship between Church and traditional beliefs – There is confusion in this relationship because of the past. Missionaries made sure that people denounced traditional ways like their attire and even beer. Our Christianity is from the West but I also believe that our ways have influenced Christianity. Traditional ways are integrated into Church ceremonies. There is dancing and especially in the marriage ceremony, after a wedding in the Church there is a 24 hour celebration. Everyone goes to the woman’s house and the man cannot sleep at her house. They only get together the next day at his house. Even though the Church forbids traditional healers, people still go to them. Some healers will say that the Holy Spirit is another ancestral spirit. The Church needs to do a lot more. It needs to find out what is good and bad about African beliefs and Christianity and then work to combine. The Church cannot survive in Africa without doing this.

The role of the Church in development in Namibia – after apartheid people relaxed and there was no longer such an urgent reason to pray to God. The CCN has had to look for a vision of keeping society together for reconstruction. The Church needs to also become transparent and regain the confidence of the people. The ex-detainee issue is a crisis of the Church and CCN. The Church needs to stand up to SWAPO. We also need to stand up and be watchful on poverty and on other issues like government salaries. Perhaps the Church has not yet stood up and become prophetic is because:

- In post-apartheid times, the situation is peaceful and everything is comfortable
- The leaders of the Church are not poor themselves
- There is too close a relationship with the government
- The Church and Namibians in general do not have a culture of speaking out
- There is a fear of SWAPO, which used to kill people who opposed.
- There is a feeling that people should repress their feelings; the old issues to work for reconciliation. This ignores though that people need to hear the truth (a truth commission like in South Africa) before they can deal with their pain. There are a lot of suicides up north because consciences are not clear.

Thus there is a loss in faith in the Church. The Church leaders can see this but they are torn between following SWAPO as before or taking an independent stance.

Experience with ESA programmes – Some are useful, some are not. Some programmes just try and do things for the communities but they don’t know anything about them. If a programme does not have respect for the participants and care for their feelings, then they do not empower people and this is not development. I ask; do the programmes care about people’s experiences? Do they respect and care for traditional beliefs and ensure that their activities do not push them down? Will they learn about them?

(2) Samson Ndwekili CCN Director Social Justice and Faith Cluster

Concept of religion and spirituality – Religion is a set of things done like a routine, but spirituality is what holds the power, the excitement, full of life. In all religions, people are spiritual. There are very many religions but very few are spiritual.

379
Concept of development – Development is the improvement of people’s quality of life, making it better. But the way development has been imparted – made into a commodity which some have and some don’t’ so that it can be given to the other for a price, this is not development. And it is only material. Development is about a blessed giving and sharing with one who is less blessed. The “giver” should be humble with no opinion of how it should be used. Because we have to receive in humility. There have been a lot of resources wasted because there has not been this partnership. If we could sit down together and listen to the needs of each other this would be better. If the heart of the giver is just to improve their image, there is something missing in this gesture.

Development is also about learning to enjoy simple life. A simple lifestyle can bring much pleasure. WE are free to seeks the needs and successes of others and thus hold happiness in our hearts. Development cannot continue to mean more consumption, more commodities. What is the wisdom of accumulation of wealth if there are so many problems unsolved? In Namibia we have enough resources to support our population. Why do we always look for more?

Relationship of traditional beliefs to the Church – The Missionaries undermined traditional beliefs, which is a tragedy because then there was no foundation to build Christianity on so now it is weak and superficial. If a foundation would have been left, this would have enriched our Christianity. For example, our traditions taught us how to be respectful to our elders. This would have deepened the Christian commandment.

Kalunga is a being to which all of us submits and who is merciful to his children. If there is a problem, we got to the ancestors to intercede for us. The Bible God is a picture of harshness and unkindness at times. Kalunga is more gracious. There is a gap between Kalunga and God that cannot be removed easily. Kalunga is closer to me than God. Christianity is strange to me at times. There will be a problem to reconcile traditional beliefs and Christianity. The children of the new generation are not on firm ground with just Christianity. Christianity is western and divorced from our culture. The way of the west is failing so why should be follow it? In the north the gap is even more apparent. People still go to traditional healers; they still have polygamy even though they are Christian. These are indications that there is a split personality. They are in the Church, but not rooted in it. If Christianity had understood our culture, there would not be this split, no confrontation but a dialogue.

Role of the Church in development in Namibia – During the struggle, the Church gave people hope and taught people that in spite of the suffering there will be a day of light. The poor especially have faith in the Church. The exiles, however, did not have the same faith. They left as youth and were often indoctrinated into many ideologies like Marxism. They couldn’t always combat this and so this weakened their faith. However, I feel that Marxism was imposed on them and so it can be rejected easily, except for the highest level of government who look down on the Church. But I don’t blame them, the Church has not given them a real message. The Church does not know their needs, only the grassroots. The Church does not give answers for their problems.

Reconciliation and reconstruction is more of a slogan in Namibia, unlike in South Africa. There is no truth commission. Reconciliation is actually a biblical term, which means a return to harmonious relationships. It means that we have to look back to see what was before moving forward. It means having to know what happened and to be apologetic and to have openness. If we don’t reconciliation is not durable. In Namibia something has happened so that people can be brutally
individualistic. We kill, rape, and drive recklessly. We are not humane as we used to be. We need to start reconstruction with peace within ourselves, more compassion.

Therein lies the role of the Church. The CCN in particular has a role in this at the national level; the catalyze the Churches into promoting this role.

The Church needs to teach people about the simple life again and to find happiness in our hearts, not just in material development. It is just madness. We need something different, something at the center to change. This is the role of religion and spirituality in development in both developing and developed countries. We need to go back to sharing and learning to take care of each other.

This will lead to taking care of the environment. Once we relate to each other and to ourselves in a caring way, then we will see the relationship to all creation. Right now we are estranged from everything.

CCN philosophy of development – Desks was established for particular needs. A community would elect a delegate and the Pastor to get a CCN to discuss their needs. From 1894 to 1990, the CCN was very strong in development at this grassroots level. After 1990 the level of assistance was scaled down. The CCN became more of a facilitator of funds and organizationally while the member Churches implemented projects. Since 1996, CCN in development has almost been phased out and the whole of CCN is being restructured (and cutback).

Experiences with external support agencies – They know their own wealth, and they push it on other people. We need to have our teaching come from developing countries and massive projects need to be scaled down.

Before Independence, the CCN was used by many donors secular and Church-based as a conduit for development funds. But with Independence secular donors went elsewhere. They started their own agencies here.

The mushrooming of projects now by external donors without coordination has led to a lot of competition and disruption in the communities.

I think the CCN has to rebuild capacity to become a partner in the development process again. There needs to be more coordination between all the agencies, the government and the Church. Regional planning would be good, but I am not sure of the abilities right now of the regional government vis-à-vis central government. It may be an alternative that a NGO could take on a particular region to help development.

CCN has been pushing for a Truth Commission to make reconciliation real in Namibia but the government has issued a statement that no followers of SWAPO are allowed to participate in any CCN sponsored conference about this or the detainee issue. As far as reconciliation is concerned with the white population, it has meant don’t touch anything, leave things as they are. The whites are happy about this. But the Church needs to look at the economic sphere. Politically there may be reconciliation but in Namibia there is so much economic injustice still. You can’t have reconciliation unless this sphere is taken care of. The first step will be for the Church to separate from the government. Before Independence SWAPO just had to ask the Church anything and the Church would do it. But the Church is now learning the mind of politicians and not liking it. They can be dishonest and want only luxury and are not reliable. The government is not happy with the Church moving away.

(3) Miriam Nepembe Director Social Welfare Division
Concept of religion and spirituality – Religion is a belief, a social concept in believing that power that holds one’s existence. Spirituality is linked. Religion guides your spirituality, your morality, your commitment and power and maintains your existence.

Traditional beliefs – These are also associated with religion even though Westerners thought they were barbaric. People had their God, their power and this would have evolved and developed in its own way.

Concept of development – Development is a way of improving humanity in all spheres, not just materially but also spiritually.

Experiences with ESA programmes – They need to integrate the religious/spiritual aspect of people’s lives more. But they say that they are just here to give money and pretend that humanity and development has no feelings. There is a need doe concerned people to make ESA’s aware of the need for spirituality in development. Perhaps the Church should be involved more. When foreign governments want to give aid, they go to our government and they decide together on the context of development. The Church is not involved. But maybe the Church should be involved to judge the criteria of that development agreement.

(6a) Elders:

(1) Jason Amakutuwa (retired pastor) born 1917, Othika, Ukwambi Lutheran

Traditional beliefs – People believed in God-Kalunga as the creator of all creation. When people were in difficulty they called Kalunga Pamba or Mbangu which means “priest”. People believed that once you name that name your problems will be solved.

There was a belief that some trees were special and were used by traditional healers to work under or near by. There was a belief about some animals like jackals or foxes; that if you heard one cry that some problems would then come. There was also a belief that if an owl flew across your house that that meant bad luck also.

Beliefs about the dead – Traditional healers believe that it is the spirits of ancestors, which make a person sick or have bad luck. To cure that person, you need to sacrifice a castrated bull so that the spirits can drink the blood.

Holy places – There is a place, the place of Nuyoma who died 1875. People cannot go there because Nuyoma was a traditional healer and one who called the rain. All the other kings used to have to go to Evale (now in Angola) to call the rain, but Nuyoma had the power to bring the rain.

Benefits of old ways - We have lost many of the old ways but we are still following some, for example the way we build our houses, how we till the land and how to dig wells.

Benefits of new ways – The biggest benefit have been the liberation of women. In the old days, women were not supposed to answer men. Now they are freer and Christianity has caused this. We have also received more education.

Problems with new ways – In the old days, children were taken care of very well. But now parents are very irresponsible and lazy. Who will take care of children who have no manners?

The environment is also getting bad. In 1870 when the missionaries came, there had been bad drought years. This has not changed, but now the trees are all cut and there is more dust.

382
Concepts of religion and spirituality - Religion are faith. Faith is the substance of things hoped for and the evidence of things not seen. Do not know what spirituality is.

(2) Kilian Shehama born 1917 Onawa Headman Roman Catholic

Traditional beliefs - Traditional healers cure people by getting rid of spirits which make them sick. Rain was called by sacrificing cows. People believed in Kalunga Kanangombe Nambalishita – someone who has created himself.

Beliefs about the dead – In Ukwambi when someone died, they used to throw away the body and let the birds eat it. They were not buried. In Ukwanyama bodies were buried. Women were buried at the place of cooking in the home. Men were buried in the kraal where the cattle were kept. Boys were buried in the kraal and girls were buried in the place where millet was pounding.

(3) Chief Oswald Mukola, born 1930, Oshimbodi Omabalantu. Senior Headman Omabalantu

(4) Basius Nangola born 1920 Oshondo, Omabalantu. Headman Okayile

(5) Gideon Shaningwa born 1922, Omakuku, Omabalantu. Headman Omakuku

Traditional beliefs – Before the Church, people believed in spirits and God called Kalunga-Kanongombe who was prayed to for help. People believed that rain would come if a black, castrated bull was sacrificed. The colour black was important because black meant the rain would come in peace and the land would turn green (green and black being shades of the same color). The bull had to be castrated because the soil could then produce more fertility. A bull when it is castrated is fat and strong. The animal had to be male because traditional beliefs believed that female animals were not strong. Also when rain came with thunderstorms it was called a female rain. This is not a good rain because it comes with lightning, which can kill people and burn down houses and damage fields.

In the old days, kings had religious powers.

Beliefs about the dead – Spirits of ancestors can come into a person. Then a healer is needed to chase spirits away. People do not believe in this anymore, but it works. Even now, if you are sick and you go to a place where the ancestors are buried and eat the dirt there you will get better. This works for mental and physical problems.

Now everyone is buried in the same cemetery, which mixes all the spirits together. So there is no healing power anymore. The children today learn only of the cemetery and do not have time to learn where the ancestors are buried. We will forget where they are buried soon. The old beliefs of ancestors and spirits were more powerful (than the Church) but now all the beliefs are mixed together and the power is diluted.

People believed that if a pregnant woman died she could not be buried until the baby had been taken out of her stomach. If this were not done, a lot of people would die.
When people die, their spirits do not go to Kalunga-God. They go to their family ancestors who are between people and God. That is why when someone falls ill, it is said that the ancestors are angry and they are trying to take you to the dead.

Benefits of old ways - The old beliefs protected society and made it improve and develop. The old ways made you feel strong and when you feel strong you will be able to do more things to improve yourself and life.

Benefits of new ways - Today we have to pray to God and the Christians tell us that Kalunga and God are not the same. But we feel they are the same. But we need to Africanize the Church so it is better. We need to strengthen faith in the Church but we should not leave our traditional beliefs. When the Church came they took way all of our things that were spiritual. They not only took away our practices but also the artifacts themselves and exported them to Windhoek or other countries to put in museums. If these can be returned we could get our power back and then we can work for better development.

Concept of development – Development needs to be done through traditional ways. In the old days, people used to come together in families and communities to do projects like dig wells. This was called Aiho, which means eye – “calling people together to see what people have done”. Everybody shared labor. Nowadays people won’t do this anymore. They want money for their work.

(6) Micheal Kamali born 1917 Iipumba, Uukwaambi
(7) Rosana Isidor born 1920 Okatana, Uukwambi
(8) Otillie Shatumba born 1927 Elayambala, Uukwambi

Traditional beliefs – People believed in Kalunga, some did, some didn’t. People only believed when things were going badly when they needed help. God sends rain to people and when someone is sick, God helped them to become healthy again. There were no churches so people just looked to the sky to ask for help from God. There were spiritual leaders, prophets who communicated to Kalunga and lead the people. These were called sahumnganeki – those who can see into the future. But most have died. When we were young, the prophets told us if the rains would come and if they would be good or bad. They were not taught but they just knew, a gift from God. There are none now but we don’t know why. Perhaps it is because maybe that who was sending prophets are not sending them anymore. This change came when the Missionaries started coming. The prophets are the same as the prophets in the Old Testament and the New Testament. We don’t need prophets anymore.

Pastors are not the same thing as the prophets were. Pastors need training and they are not in communication with God. Pastors are spreading the gospel and are praying to God just like us. But they are not in communication with God.

In the old days to get rain, the kings sent a person with a castrated black bull to the north (where the rains came from) to look for rain, to a place called Evale. Our grandmothers and grandfathers say that this worked but we cannot say since we do not do this anymore.

Benefits/problems of new ways – People used to have discipline in the old days. But now people are getting educated and cling to what that tells them, They have no discipline. So the traditions are all dying out. We are seeing lots of people coming from other countries now and we are losing our traditional skills and ways of doing
things. We can see that the country is now poor. We need to bring things back to improve society.

How will it improve society to bring traditional ways back? Now that we have back our kings and chiefs, the kings could call a meeting of the elders and chief to advise on how to bring the old ways back. The nation is poor because we need to buy so many things now instead of making things like before. Also children used to learn from elders how to behave and how to communicate with adults. They were taught around the fire. Now this is not done and there is not very good spirits. The young and the elders are now sitting at the kuka shops. Adults are no longer teaching children values. This started to change when the modern world came. The young were attracted to the changes. Between women and men things have changed too. In the old days, only men drove cars, but now women can drive too. This is good if someone is sick.

The changes are good and bad. Now days, women can be more educated than men can. Girls can go out and work. This is good if the kids come back and help you out, but if they don’t then you have no help, especially if the girls leave. In the old days, between women and men things have changed too. Women have grown aggressive now and are fighting. But today women can have her own house. In the old days, women could not and had to go back to her parent’s place. Children are not respectful now days. The Christian education shows how to read but not to respect. In the old days, cattle were many; there was lots of food. But there are too many people now and killing too many cattle. But we have electricity, water taps, and the Church brings good teaching about God. It brings God down to the level of the people.

(9) Josephine Amwaama Oshitambi, Ondongo

Traditional beliefs - You go to a traditional healer if you were sick, slaughter a cow to get rid of ancestral spirits. There were places we were not allowed to go because they were the dwelling places of spirits. When the rains were bad, the king would send a woman with a black bull to go in search of rain in the north. If the rains still did not come, another cow was sent with a woman with a small baby.

Improvement/Problems with new ways - If a person is sick they can only go to the hospital. The doctors can’t take away the bad spirits and so you die. In the old days, women and men got along better. Women have grown aggressive now and are fighting. But today women can have her own house. In the old days, women could not and had to go back to her parent’s place. Children are not respectful now days. The Christian education shows how to read but not to respect. In the old days, cattle were many; there was lots of food. But there are too many people now and killing too many cattle. But we have electricity, water taps, and the Church brings good teaching about God. It brings God down to the level of the people.

(10) Francina Ndemooggela Okanghudhi, Ukaanyama

(11) Ester Kashipuko Nande Omukumbwayimbe, Kwanyama

Traditional beliefs - people believed in Kalunga. There were certain places where no one was allowed to go because ancestral spirits lived there. When the Church first came, people were afraid of it because they were looking for coverts and once you were baptized you could no longer have traditional weddings and polygamy. But once she went, she found the Church to be good.

Concepts of religion, spirituality and development - Religion is faith and trust in God, creator of the world, and also faith in Jesus Christ. Spirituality means Kalunga and faith. Development is the government and things changing, like from changing from pagan to being Christian.

There is no relationship between religion and spirituality and development

(12) Eric Richter born 1904 Outjo (father was a German hunter - mother went to work in a Missionary complex in Outjo and came back to Ovambo after his birth at the palace of King Kambonde and then King Kadhikwa as slaves)
Traditional beliefs—People believed strongly in traditional healers (onganga) and witch doctors (ompuWe) and prophets (omuhanganek). Kings were supreme rulers and could kill for punishment. He went on hunts with the king who brought his witch doctor along. The witch doctor would throw a poison onto the fire which made it “come out” and the witch doctor said he could see a man catching a lion with his bare hands. There were no beliefs about nature and how to protect it. There were no orders from the king about it. People did what they wanted, but back then there was abundance and so there were no problems. The headman had the right to choose any number of wives. They were his property and had to work on his land. But the children belonged to the woman and her parents. They were not the husband’s responsibility.

Beliefs about the dead—The dead were buried: the man in the kraal. The dead person had to be buried in a sitting position. People believed that people died because they were bewitched.

Good and bad points about the old days—In the old days, there were problems with traditional beliefs. People could be killed with no consequence. But in the old days too there was more love between people and more discipline. People followed the leaders more.

Good and bad points about the present days—We have peace and the government is encouraging people to work together and to cooperate. The government has now recognized traditional healers. But there are also many thieves and it is increasing and in the government there is corruption.

(13) King Shikongo born 1935 Omathima

(14) Zacharia Iipinge born 1917 Ukandgenga, Uukwaluudhi

Traditional beliefs—People believed in Kalunga and the king; that the kings were guided by Kalunga and that we had to do what he said. People believed in ancestors, that when someone was sick they needed a traditional healer who says there is a spirit inside and needs to be chased away. Some people had powers for water. They knew where to find it and if it was sweet or not. It was a gift given to them by God. There were also elders who could see into the future — prophets. Now these do not exist because traditional powers have been waved away by the Church and the elders have died out.

There were no stories that told the traditions. Children learned by asking questions. Around the fire, elders would talk with children.

Each tribe had their own laws — customary laws. These are being resurrected by the traditional leaders and will be used to enforce law in Ovambo to support the government. There will be a Traditional Council in Parliament and a traditional Magistrate Court in each region using the mother tongue.

Beliefs about the dead—Kids were not allowed to see the dead because it was believed that the spirit of the dead will enter the children and even pregnant women and women with babies were not allowed to see the corpse. If a pregnant woman died, the baby had to be cut out to see if it was a girl or boy and then both were buried in the same grave. People were buried in a sitting position so that they could be resurrected.

Relationship between traditional beliefs and Christianity—In the old days, especially when the Missionaries first came there was no relationship. If you became Christian you had to throw away the old beliefs. But now there is a relationship starting because the Church is recognizing that traditional things are okay in the Church. People first started to come to the Church because they “became aware of
development” i.e. promises of things like, buildings, learning to read and write, hospitals and clinics, schools, and treatment of malaria and TB. They did not know that the Church would transform them though. When the Finnish came they went to the king and told him that they wanted to teach new things. It was thought to be good. It was only later that it was realized that people would then be forced to throw away traditional ways.

Now you can wear traditional clothes in Church and this is not said to be against God. In the old days, the first harvest used to be given to the king. Now it is given to the Church so the Church has borrowed old ways. Even at Church weddings, a cow is slaughtered and the ribs are given to the pastor. A person can believe in Kalunga and God at the same time because they are the same God. But you cannot believe in ancestral spirits and God at the same time. If you feel you have to have some spirits taken away then you need to go to a traditional healer not to a pastor.

Concepts of religion, spirituality and development - Religion is faith in God because religion came through God. When you go to Church it is because you believe in God (first). Spirituality – there are different kinds of spirituality. It can be people working together in peace and love. Or, it can also mean bad spirits which divide people. The spirit is that which brings relationship between people. Religion and spirituality are not the same but they have a close relationship. You can't have religion without spirituality but you can have spirituality without religion. Spirituality is something inside (gesturing to his chest). Look at the Himba people. They do not go to Church but they have their own spirituality and beliefs.

Development is to work hard and to go forward.

Good and bad points about the old ways – People were healthier back then. They only used herbs to get better. Now we use all these chemicals and we are weaker. And spiritually we are also weaker. The old people were believers, strong, not like us Christians. They had respect for things and there was more order. Today we do not. Today we take all our knowledge from books. We do not have knowledge that comes from ourselves, our own thoughts. Our thoughts are a gift from God, comes to us from birth. We do not learn the wisdom of elders anymore. There is a saying “Okwa Shungila” which means that this person has been sitting around the fire. He is wise.

Relationship between religion and spirituality and development – Religion and development are the same. The Church leaders are involved in development programmes together with the government. Spirituality is always involved in development. A person has spirituality and thus wants things to develop and go forward.

Good and bad points about present day – Women are given a chance now. Before they were pushed back with no voice. Now they are liberated and free. Especially in regards to inheritance law where her husband’s family can take everything away. Now she can keep what she worked for. The Equality Bill is also good to help women. It will not cause women to leave me or to “colonize” men.

Donor projects – They are good. The UNICEF project has really developed people, given toilets, weighed children, taught women how to make bricks, and how to build schools.

These projects do not touch on the religious side of the community but it came with good spirit and good relationships with people. The spirituality of the women especially has changed with the project because the women know how to do things for themselves.
Helvi Kandombolo Oshuungu, Uukwambi

Traditional beliefs – People believed in Kalunga-Nagombe the creator of humans. It wasn’t female or male, just God. There are no stories of how Kalunga made people and the earth though or of how he came about. People believed the environment was protected by Kalunga. There were no stories from God how to protect the environment, people just knew.

There is no relationship between traditional beliefs and the Church-religion. There is only one God. You cannot believe in traditional beliefs and be a Christian.

She became a Christian because she confessed to Jesus Christ for everlasting life. Christianity is better because Jesus Christ will save all people. People cannot sin if they want everlasting life. In traditional beliefs people still did bad things.

Concepts of religion, spirituality and development – Religion is when a person has faith in God, believe God is alive and will give you everlasting life and save you from your sins. Spirituality is the Holy Spirit sent by Jesus Christ to his disciples. Development is when a person is moving and changing his mind and thought to become better.

Role of spirituality and religion in development – As you are in development, you are in the hands of God. When you have religion and spirituality then God is guiding you to be better.

Good and bad points of old days – Good: people were in the hands of God and believing in God. Bad: Tribes ruid bad relationships and tribal wars all the time.

Good and bad points of present day – Good: People are living in peace.

Nicanor Amukwaya born 1910 Olukuma, Ukwaluudhi

Beate Iileke Shivute born 1909 Ogandgera, Uukwarnatsi

Traditional beliefs – People believed in Kalunga-Nanongombe-Yamangundu (people gathered together). Didn’t know if it was a woman or man. Whenever you were in difficulty you just called him. When you became a Christian you realized that Yamangundu was like Jesus Christ. There was a belief about fire, that you should keep one burning all the time to keep cattle alive and close and also to protect children. The fire enlightened and guided people.

Beliefs about the dead – Children should be chased away from the corpse because they may have a dream about that dead person and have the dead spirit come inside. Only the family was allowed to touch the corpse. There were some stories about some oshanas, which you were not allowed to pass because spirits of ancestors lived there and if you entered there you would die.

There were no beliefs about water, only that some people knew where to find sweet water, were thatching grew. These people got this knowledge from the ancestors and ultimately from Kalunga.

Kalunga and God are the same but the young people don’t realize they are the same.

Concept of spirituality, religion and development – Religion is faith and trust in God. Spirituality is when people are working together and caring for each other. It is what they have inside and how they care for others. Spirituality is based upon a person, herself or himself. Development is how the world had changed. In the old days people were afraid to do certain things due to belief but now people have no fear, no discipline and no respect for elders. Spirituality is the difference between a person with good spirits and one with bad spirits. Development is when a person has advanced, come to a new level in her ideas and thoughts.
Good and bad points of the old days – Good: people were trusting in God. If cattle were lost, you prayed to Kalunga. But now people believe they have been stolen. Bad: we have lost many of our old beliefs.

Good and bad points of present day – Good: tribal wars are gone and even the Boer war is gone so we have peace. Bad: the young generation does not have respect or discipline for their elders and they do not know about traditional things.

Has society advanced? Yes, people want to bring back our traditional values now and those will be written down (customary laws) so that the younger generation will always know them. Even though the old ways have died, people will still know about them.

(18) Abraham Ipimbui born 1931 Onashiku, Uukwambi Headman Otthika
(19) Absalom Kuwa born 1925 Eenkundi, Uukwambi Headman Eenkundi
(20) Elias Johannes born 1949 Ombuga, Uukwambi Headman Ombuga
(21) Dominicus Nujoma born 1934 Oshimbibi, Ukwanyama Parish leader (elder) Roman Catholic Church
(22) Rauhaufina Nandjigwa born 1945 Ihanduti, Uukwambi Women’s Representative of Traditional Court (near) Elim, Uukwambi.
(23) Uunona Amwaalwa born 1932 Onenongo, Uukwambi Headman Onenongo
(24) Petrus Iiyagaya born 1918 Oshwa, Uukwambi Headman Upuwo, Ukwambi

Traditional beliefs – There was a belief in Kalunga who came to help whenever there were difficulties. People believed in ancestral spirits. When religion came these beliefs started disappearing but people still believe in some things. For example, there is the royal palace of Elim where the king died that no-one wants to go near. It was believed that if a girl got pregnant before her traditional marriage, she would be burned.

Beliefs about the dead – in the old days, people were not buried, but were thrown away (in some areas). Children were chased away. In other places the dead were buried. The corpses were bent in a sitting position, not lying down because it was believed that a lying down position would spread death everywhere. The sitting position also minimized the work. Only family could be involved in the burial and the digging was hard. People were afraid to touch the corpse of not from the family. If you wanted people to touch it you had to pay them a cow.

Beliefs about the environment – The kings protected nature, of cutting trees etc. The king was surrounded by his advisors. People were created from Kalunga and so had the knowledge How to protect the environment. There were rules set down by the king for instance, for oshanas with fish in it, no-one was allowed to catch the fish until a certain time or use the water. Elders were responsible for taking care of the oshana and when they saw it was ready they would tell the king. There were also beliefs about certain forests, places with thick bushes where you could not collect firewood from. If you did it was believed your family would die. This was to protect that forest. It was believed that there were some streams that you could not pass without telling it you wanted to cross. There was also a belief that if you had stolen some things you could go and sit in certain oshanas (Oweye Amuugali and Onandjeke Ohupwbu) and you would be protected even from the king. People did not believe that places, water, trees had special powers but that they were occupied by ancestral spirit which had the power. There is still a place called Olutanda where there is good land but no-one will build there because they believe it is special. There is a story of a Roman Catholic priest who killed a bird at Omeeya Amuugali
and the bird came back alive and pecked him to death. But the majority of people do not believe in these stories. They are Christian now.

Good and bad points about the old days and present day - In the old days, the environment was better protected. You could not see firewood and so people did not cut down trees for money and destroy all the bushes. In the old days there were rules to protect the environment, but with colonization their power was weakened and thus the environment became destroyed. Now with Independence, the customary laws are coming back so hopefully this will help the environment.

The colonial powers weakened traditional powers of enforcement but now traditional councils have full powers again. These laws are related ultimately to Kalunga and spirit ancestors. The old ways were powerful. The young today will only follow rules if they are written down. In the old days it was all known by heart.

Relationship between Christianity and traditional beliefs - There is a close relationship. Customary ways and the Church can work together to form stronger rules for society, to protect the environment and people. The Church will help to enforce customary laws by preaching through services and outreach.

Concepts of religion and spirituality and development - Religion is faith in God and Jesus Christ and the Holy Spirit as one. Spirituality is coming through the faith. When you have faith, you start choosing which work of religion to do i.e. spiritual work. Spirituality is inside you. You recognize whether a person is good, a good spirit. Development is when a nation is healthy, has clear water and food and can take care of themselves and also when people are thinking of the future of their community. Development is when the community has jobs and when there are peace and good relationships between people, including love. Development is when there is freedom of speech and when people have the freedom to create development projects something that will create jobs.

Role of spirituality and religion in development - Those people who are doing religious and spiritual work are helping people help themselves to do things like building toilets and to keep the environment clean so that diseases are kept away.

Church based development is different from that of the government or external support agencies. Church leaders are closer to the people and have meetings with the people often. The government should use spiritual leaders to spread messages out. Spiritual leaders are not here just to preach but to contribute to improving living conditions of the community. Spiritual leaders work closely with traditional leaders.

If you have an external support agency project, they will eventually have to work with Church leaders anyway. Because the Governor has to go to the Headman who has to go to the Church leaders.

We have Independence because of our spirituality and through our spirituality. Our spiritual leaders have also explained to us the concept of peace and reconciliation. It is through spirituality and religion that people have recognized what is good and bad.

There were prophets – Kimbamba – who was in communication with Kalunga-Kanongombe and who could see the future.

4b Traditional Healers:
(1) Johanna Johannes

Traditional beliefs – When her mother passed away, her father told her the old stories of the reign of King Negombo Kandenge. There is a big tree in Ombalanru where in tribal war, people used to hide. She was baptized as a child.

She is a massager to heal people who are paralyzed. She started at 45 years old, replacing her father. She has worked as a healer more than 10 years. She doesn’t have a spirit helper but believes that when a person gets better it is because they believe in God. She is a Christian in the Lutheran Church and it gives its blessing for her work. Her patients are mostly Ovambos with some Ovahimbas. The ones with high blood pressure she sends to the hospital. The oil she uses is made from squashes that she grows herself. The massage hurts at first but softens and straightens the veins.

(2) Maria Johannes

She heals epilepsy, madness, TB and skin diseases. She also helps HIV/AIDS patients.

She is not a prophet but has inherited her work from her grandmother.

She is Lutheran.

She started learning to be a healer at 6 years old with her grandmother but she could not heal others until she had given birth herself.

She uses herbs to heal, which she searches for, in the forests.

She has help from spirits (ancestors). They come to show her where the bad spirits are hiding. She has the spirit of her grandmother with her.

Spirits and God help each other.

She uses the Bible also to help the spirits come out by putting it on a person’s chest.

She treats 2-6 people per month.

People pay her in cash or kind.

She sends some people to other healers, those with problems of the skin and flesh but she has not sent any to the hospital or the doctor. She feels she has herbs, which the doctors could use. Medical doctors have never sent anyone to her but a couple have come to her to ask questions.

Traditional beliefs – People believed in ancestral spirits and Kalunga. People believed in witchcraft and people wore jewels and belts with beads to protect themselves from bad spirits. There are places where ancestral spirits live and you can’t go past them without speaking to the spirits.

Benefits and bad points of old ways – There was always a fire burning for us to guide us. But now the fire is dead. The fire used to hold our traditional way together. We lost a lot of traditional ways, clothing, ways of working together, of how to take care of children. The cattle used to be rounded up early in the afternoon and put into kraals. Now people are too lazy and the cattle are running everywhere wrecking the grass. The Church has robbed a lot of what we should have inherited from out ancestors.

She is a Christian but some fellow Christians do not like her to practice and try to force her to stop so she can receive Holy Communion. She cannot go to Church every week but she was baptized and married in the Church.
Now the government has formally recognized traditional healers and asked them to form an association. So she does not have to practice in secret anymore. There are other good things about the present day. The Social Services is good for women and children who are abused. Also the land issue; women can inherit land now and can't be chased away. Also the government is doing its best with schools, clinic, water projects and electricity.

Concept of religion, spirituality and development – Spirituality (ukwambeb) is your feelings inside you there (chest). It gives strength and power (to help others).

Role of spirituality in development – Spirituality plays the role of helping communities to be healthy, by treating the spirits in people to get rid of problems. If a doctor was healing but did not pray to God to heal, then not really healing.

5. Community leaders

(1) Executive Officer, Oshana Region

Concept of religion, spirituality and development – Religion is to adhere to ethical value of one's belief in supernatural beings and to adhere because we will benefit spirituality and if you die, go to heaven. Development is an ongoing process to promote the production of consumable goods and in a quantity which benefits the majority of a community or society. It is where education is promoted, health, welfare services and literature, arts and crafts. It is also about maintenance and running an administrative system to maintain existing infrastructure and institutions.

Role of religion in development – Some religious organizations help the government to promote development. They offer literacy for example.

Role of the Church – The Church has their own schools so they provide education. They also have clinics, collect donations of clothing and give to the poor. The social welfare services of the Churches plays a supporting role to the Government as well as to the private sector.

Experience with external agency projects – The relationship between the SWAM and OHSIP projects and the town councils have been good.

(3) Vatuva Governor, Oshana Region

Concepts of religion and spirituality and development – Namibia is a very religious country. 95% of the people are Christian. Any movement is towards religion. Spirituality is good morals for the inhabitants of the country. Development is moving forward, planning and having a government structure and planning process.

Role of religion and spirituality in development – There is no doubt that spirituality is going together with development. The start of National Assembly and Regional Council always starts with a prayer. Before Independence, the Church was the head of development. Each Church was also asked to have a member in the National Assembly. Even with Independence the role of the Church in development is strong.

Experience with external support agency programmes – ESA projects have really helped in terms of promoting reconciliation. They (OHSIP and SWAM) applied their programmes to everyone, without regard for political or religious affiliation. They asked people to come together as a community to work together as a team for the benefit of all society and not just one particular group. The Church can also play an important role in this, to help unite people in communities from the grassroots.

Role of the Church in development – Development in Namibia started with the Church. Missionaries started to show people how to keep health, water, and food
and also taught writing and reading and foreign languages. The government has only just taken over.

(3) Julia Nepembe SWAPO Women's Council, Oshana Region

Traditional beliefs – The elders believed in Kalunga-Nnongombe who was responsible for helping in whatever problems were facing them. They also believed in ancestral spirits, which would also come and help people. Food was taken from the first harvest and a chicken and cow were cooked in special oil and taken to a certain place where the ancestral spirits were living. The youth respected elders because it was believed that if you did not obey them, you would die. People did not believe in heaven or hell, just that the ancestral spirits were there, guiding them. Each year, all the girls who had their first menstruation period would go through a traditional wedding and after the ceremonies, those who had husbands would pay a cow to the husband and go with him. In the old days, the richer men and the headmen had more than 10 wives and much bigger houses and fields. Each wife was given her own plot of land.

Relationship between traditional beliefs and Christianity – When religion came with the Missionaries, the people were made to understand the pagan ways were from Satan. It has taken until now for us to believe that we are not of Satan and that our old ways were okay. We are trying to get some of the traditional ways back now.

Concept of religion, spirituality and development – Religion is faith and believing in God. Spirituality is having a good spirit and good will and keeping what you believe inside. Development is helping the community to go forward. It is something which will change you and to help you take up an advanced stage.

Relationship between religion and spirituality and development – There is one because if you do not have spirituality then you will not have development or development is done in a bad manner or spirit. Religion and development are the same. If you have fear in God this helps you to advance and if you have faith it keeps you away from sinning.

Experience with external support programmes – The Missionaries used to put us down, those that had wisdom. They used to say that she is not well educated etc etc. For example, herself, she was smart in school so they got her to teach others but really blocked her way and did not send her for further education. So she realized that Missionaries did not want people to be advanced. External support programmes come with grants and a good spirit. External support programmes are good in that they don't mind sending uneducated people out for training. She finds she can really teach people now, although before Independence she had worked with women to teach them how to keep money and do traditional projects.

(4) Hans Daniel Namhuja author

Traditional beliefs – People believed in Kalunga Pambaishita – one who makes himself, protects us and gives us rain and all things. In the old days, the king was a supreme ruler with councilors to help him and the spirits of ancestors to guide him. In every clan there was an elder who knew the traditions and who was called upon at every celebration – death, birth, marriage etc – to tell people what to do. Women were also royal advisors as elders. There were stories for all parts of society and community, for example, for taking care of nature, for human society. The elders still know it now but the youth are no longer interested in learning these. There is no way of getting these beliefs back but we could combine the new and the old.
Beliefs about death – People believed that the dead were not dead forever. There was a rule that you should walk very slowly over the grave so that you would not disturb the spirit.

(5) Dr Paul Issac Professor of Theology, University of Namibia

Concept of spirituality, religion and development – Spirituality and development are both 2 aspects of religion. Both spirituality and development merge out of a particular community conviction and should always be linked. Spirituality leads to the dimension of practical relationship manifested in a community. It forms reflections on God and what that relationship between people and God can be. Development is about the horizontal relationship between people and the earth. It is concerned with upliftment, empowerment etc. Religion is the Work of God, a Way of Life. But religion is also, especially in rural life, not just an institution but is linked to a whole life. It is the total expression of humanity for God. Religion contains the two aspects of spirituality and development. When I think of spirituality, I also think of the way men especially are transported to and from work in big trucks, standing up like cattle. If their humanity were respected, they would get a bus.

There are three stages it seems that we have gone through in terms of societal evolution; three stages of development. In the first, the church building is the tallest building in a village or city. It indicates the central role the Church played in people’s lives. In this second stage, there is a constant emphasis on education. If one had an education, the doors would open. In the third stage, the emphasis is solely on economic wealth. It does not matter how educated or religious you are. To get ahead you only need to be rich. The tallest buildings are now bank buildings. There is no system now in dialogue with the economic system. This needs to be watched. Only liberation theology has, through Marxist analysis, touched on this relationship between religion and economics.

In Namibia to address economics means a possibility of falling out with the government. The government priority right now is to get as much investment as possible. This unfortunately usually goes against what the people need. For example, the free trade zone in Walvis Bay. The investors don’t want to deal with the trade unions.

Role of the Church in development – Before Independence, the position of the Church was clear. It opposed whatever the apartheid government was doing and it spoke with a prophetic voice. But in Independence, our leading theologians are part of the government and there is no more prophetic voice. This is a bad situation.

The government cannot possibly provide all development for society. In education or health for example, the government cannot provide schools throughout the country so the church should be able to help out. But even Church hospitals are given government funding and thus cannot go against government policies. The Church and the government should not be subservient, neither one to the other. Neither should they be in each other’s good books. They should be able to speak out on issues to be in line with the teaching of the gospels and to fight against nepotism and human rights violations and corruption.

The Churches need to stand together in order to let reconciliation happen. Once the Church becomes divided, it becomes very difficult to work for a solution. The government would try and exploit the split as a weakness.

Development comes out of a society, which is humane. In the apartheid state, humanity for the blacks was denied. It practiced a concept of some having bigger humanity than others. As long as humanity is not practiced, there can be no development. Again I think of the trucks used to transport men to work. If their
work recognized their humanity, there would be buses for them. If we have
development projects within a society where some people's humanity is recognized
to be bigger than others do, then development is simply based on a concept of
making life better for certain groups at the expense of others. In the African culture
there is a deep sense of respect. It was hierarchical but it carried the idea of respect
as part of African humanity. Christianity endangered this concept of humanity by
segregating against blacks.

Development should empower people and equip them towards their own selfhood
and independence. It should not make them dependent and unable to take care of
their own actions. It seems now a days that people are so dependent on this issue of
development. They are losing interest or denying their own humanity. For example,
in the food distribution scheme, the distributors were suddenly big bosses. They
shouted at people, made them wait for hours and hours. The people were deeply
insulted and only came back because of their deep need. This is not development.
In hospitals, people also have to wait hours and hours. The process of seeing the
doctor is so frustrating and dehumanizing that there is no development.
Development is about self-confidence.

The government defines development at a very high level; for investment rather that
at the grassroots level. But this is not always the fault of the government. They are
also dictated to by the donors and so that cannot act the way they want to. The
Church as well as the communities needs to help the government to work with the
donors and to bring development (and the donor agencies) more in line with what is
really needed. It is an issue of accountability.

6. Churchwomen:

Result # 1-

1. In this workshop we have obtained more on water issues and development in
   the community.

2. Yes the women workshops, which I have attended, have been discussing
   spirituality and this one also discussed on the issue of spirituality.

3. I have learned the fellowship among Christian women.

4. First, I will invite Headmen through the church or parish so that they can invite
   the community, so that we can make a meeting with them.

5. I have to work in community so that they can develop.

6. Faith means understanding a person.

7. Christianity means to work for God, praise Him and thank him every Sunday in
   the churches.

8. It means to a person who is qualified by working with God theologically or who
   knows feminist theology.

9. There is the belief of rain, that a certain clan has to donate a black cow so that
   rain can come. There is also a belief that in some houses, you must not greet but
   start coughing whenever entering as a sign of greeting.

10. Christianity cannot be linked wit traditional beliefs because a Christian cannot
    receive Holy Communion if you have sinned and haven't reconciled.
11. Church leaders are more important because they are responsible for Church services. Traditional leaders are also important because they always solve our problems i.e. putting up projects.

12. I have experience on pottery and making baskets.

Result # 2 –

1. I as a Christian woman in this workshop have obtained good ideas, i.e. I learned things which I had no knowledge or didn't know before like on how to mobilize and organize the community through Christianity.

2. Because in this workshop we learnt how to mobilize and organize the community through Christianity, faith and spirituality and also how to take care of children.

3. Taking care of creation.
   
   Christianity
   Spirituality

4. I know that it will help me because I know the ways to go about it.

5. So that I can teach them ideas, which they need to understand or work through they, are supposed to do, whether it is through Faith.

6. Trust, help in which you can trust whenever you have problems. Trust in God and your fellow community.

7. Christianity is that which I have in my heart, faith in God and my relationship and love to my fellow community.

8. Spirituality means when I pray to God to give me what I need.

9. Yes, it is said that as a woman when cooking you are not supposed to cook while standing. Some people say you are not allowed to throw water away in the evenings. To light a fire in your bedroom or in the lounge is good luck and also luck for your cattle.

10. I have a relationship wit Faith, because you have to believe in what you are told.

11. Yes, because Church leaders are important by mobilizing the community through Christianity and by helping and by teaching them Baptist's school, confirmation school and by preaching the Gospel of God. Traditional leaders are important because they help the community to solve their problems, i.e. drought relief, water, building of schools, hospital clinics at places where it doesn't exist.

12. Donor agencies have to meet the community first so that they can start a project. You have to seek for a place where it will be established, collect money to buy the needs, to be near the water so that you can water your plants and build a fence around it.

13. Yes, problems will be there because everything you need in the project and you will have to buy it with money and you don't know where to get it from. And the guard who you will select needs to be paid.

14. I have to seek information from people who are already involved in Government funded projects so that they can show me on how to solve my problems whenever I need help.
15. Yes, how to train people in dressmaking, how to cook, how to plant trees and how to take care of them and how to lay water pipes so that they can bring water.

Result # 3-

1. The knowledge I derived is how to lead the community through Christianity and traditionally it is how to lift up women throughout the world, how to start groups, how to maintain them through the relationship with the united Churches.

2. Yes it differs from the other workshops because from it I obtained the knowledge as a Christian and at the community level and how to develop in connection with water and the traditions of the community.

3. I learned how to lead the community by praising the united Churches where we find the executive Committee, which represents different places, villages and all parts in our area.

4. It is when I have a relationship with the Headmen and hold a meeting with the community, where the community will elect a Committee, which will represent the problems of the community, and then it will help how to work easily.

5. I want to work in the community so that I can develop the existence of water, and to uplift women in our country by starting projects in our community with everything. Which is connected to Christianity and traditionally.

6. Faith is the understanding in a person through Christianity, traditionally or the voice inside a person.

7. It is to work for God. To praise and to say for God. By working for God and helping the Creator of God.

8. Spirituality means those people who have studied theology like Pastors, Bishops, nuns, priests and Deacons.

9. Yes like putting fire in your bedroom as a prayer. Also that you are not supposed to pass a person who has given birth to twins with your legs otherwise you will swell up.

10. The relationship through Faith is for example, traditional drums that are being used in the Churches, fire in the Churches and in houses and in the community. Traditional herbs in the Churches. Pastors, priests and bishops are smeared with traditional oil; kings are also smeared with this oil as a sign of blessing. Also in the community traditional oil are important as a praise and blessing of a person.

11. They are important because Church leaders are to help us spiritually and traditional leaders are there to solve our problems.

12. Government projects are being paid by the Government monthly while Donor funded projects are just working on their own, until something appeared they develop up to the stage where they will be able to pay themselves.

13. They haven't developed problems but have brought strength in, faith and traditional beliefs for our community. It also uplifts the education of our kids.

14. These problems may be solved, when people come together and discuss their problems, which is the obstacles of development.

15. In Government projects people get work in the government while those of donor agencies developed the community by planting trees, dressmaking, pottery and cooking etc.
1. I have gained more knowledge on community management and development and how it can plan projects and implement it.

2. This workshop is differing from other workshops that I have attended because it has broadened my knowledge on how to develop and to lead the community.

3. I have learned how to take care of my fellow human beings and how to lead them and how to solve their problems.

4. I will call meetings with the community and inform them on how to take care of water.

5. Because I want the community to be aware or get an understanding on community management.

6. Faith is a steady trust by trusting what you expect coming your way. And to abide to those invisible things.

7. As a Christian woman I have to pray for my fellow people, those who are far and those who are near and also those organizations which are supporting and also teaching us.

8. Spirituality is to pray for our fellow human beings, those with whom we are sharing ideas.

9. I know some, because I know of some traditional healers who are treating people and also those who are responsible for the performance of traditional weddings.

10. It depends on those who are traditional healers (by saying that I have to believe in what is being done to me and have to believe in it)

11. As a Christian woman I think both leaders are important because they do what the community expects from them.

12. Because from the government or donor development projects, I gain more knowledge which I transfer to the community.

Result # 5 –

1. I have gained more knowledge on how to work with the community. I also gained on how to keep the word of God and also how to take care of creation so that it can look good.

2. It differs because I as a Christian woman I have never attended a workshop like this one, discussing issues which can be used in future in the community.

3. I have learned how to help the community and to make them aware of what should be done by the future generation and also to bring up an example on how to bring water in the community.

4. It will help me by working in the community and in my village i.e. if there is a place where there are no trees, then I will tell them how to do it and use the knowledge I gained here. How to plant trees and how to take care of them (keeping animals away).

5. Because I want the community to develop and know how to take care of plants

6. Faith is a steady trust by trusting what you expect coming your way and to abide to those invisible things.
7. Christianity means Faith, attending church services, listen to the word of God, listen to it with happiness, obey it with all your strength and faith.

8. Spirituality is to have feelings in your heart, which show you what is good and bad.

9. To perform traditional weddings, to make traditional role plays and by electing people traditionally.

10. It is related with traditional beliefs because you are allowed to play traditional drums in the churches.

11. Both are important because they are leading us by following a way that shows them how to lead.

12. It is to plan and make your own projects.

13. Blank,

14. We have to come together and discuss that problem. After the discussions we go to the Headman and tell him about our ideas so that he can give us permission to implement it.

Result #6 –

1. I have obtained this goodness, because I received information on what to do by thinking how to bring water in the villages.

2. Yes. It differs from others. I learnt how to lead and develop my fellow community members, hygienic and how to take care of water and how to maintain creation.

3. I learnt how to lead the community, how to meet and discuss with Church women groups, how to plan and implement water projects.

4. It will help me to conduct and connect myself with the headmen, Church leaders and other existing committees.

5. I want to work in the community, because I love my community as a Christian and have the will so that the community can develop and come to the level where other nations in the world are.

6. Faith is the understanding of a person, by knowing in what she believes in.

7. Christianity is a way that opens door of the Kingdom of God, by working for God and by praising Him.

8. Spirituality is the strength for Faith.

9. We have traditional weddings. A fire is burned in the bedrooms (especially for women) and a fire is burned at the lounge everyday, which is a sign of prayer.

10. In churches there are Christian weddings. When we go in Churches to attend Congregation, there are candles.

11. Church leaders are important because they have the responsibility for all people to become Christians, and by bringing up their children through Christianity as Christians, and by uniting people, and also by helping people who were in exile. Traditional leaders are important because they try to keep our traditions and also leading the community with wisdom and strength.
12. I have the knowledge that government funded projects are paying their employees, which donor funded projects are training people so that they can go and work for themselves without being paid.

13. Yes, it brought in something connected with our traditions, because they teach us how to make clay pots.

14. Trying to make people understand through peaceful means and by bringing things that they don't know and have never come across can only solve problems.

15. They have to work at places where they see that the project that they are working on will exist; they have also to work depending on the will of the people.

Result # 7 –

1. I obtained the knowledge on how to make the community understand: community management, community leadership, and how to give them power, how to motivate them so that they can work with courage without going backwards.

2. Yes, this workshop on women's issues differs from the other workshops. We were working together, the leaders and participants were also coming to a conclusion without difficulty and there was also faith or belief in solving problems facing the community especially the Churches.

3. A way of how to be treated by the community or how to treat the community. It is how to take care of and respect creation. Faith and spirituality amongst the community.

4. Cleverness, good advice, management and a good relationship with the community.

5. To give advice to the people, to give them strength or power so that they can be responsible people. To make them understand what Christianity is so that they may have spiritual beliefs.

6. Faith is the Holy Spirit, which can make a person Christian.

7. Blank

8. Blank

9. Yes. Water is not thrown away in the house in the evening, because it might cause some problems. People are not allowed to run in their homes late at night. It is said that they are prophesizing that war will come and destroy the house.

10. Blank

11. Yes, because they can give authority to the community, faith advises. Good ideas and power because they are the head of the community. They can make the community to understand to become Christians.

12. Blank

13. Blank

14. We have to elect a committee, which have to go to the headman and church leaders. And then the leaders pass the message on to the community, then the community comes together and discusses the problems which can be solved in that way.
15. Blank

Result # 8:

1. We obtained ideas concerning water affairs and the development of the community.

2. The workshops on women’s issues which I have attended discussed matters on spirituality. They differ from this one because they only discussed concerning development and how to take care and management of water.

3. I learnt from it how Christians should come together, how to listen on what we were taught how to listen on what we were taught, hygiene and management of water in the community.

4. First I invite the headman, parish, so that they must invite the people so that we can build a meeting in the community.

5. I have to work in the community to help bring up ideas and work and develop.

6. Faith is the understanding of a person himself.

7. Christianity is to work for God, to praise and to pray for him.

8. Spirituality is to work as pastor, girlguide or deacon.

9. A clan which has to go and seek for rain with a blackbull or person entering a certain house supposed not to greet but have to start coughing.

10. Christianity must not be mixed with traditional belief because a Christian is not allowed to receive Holy Communion if you have sinned or if you have not apologized.

11. Church leaders are more important because they preach the word of God. They also explain to us what their meaning is. Traditional leaders are important because they solve our problems by giving us land and fields to work on.

12. In donor development projects I derived the ideas on how to make clay pots and how to make baskets.

13. Blank

14. Blank

15. Blank

Result # 9.

1. I obtained the words of Christianity, strength to work with my fellow female partners, to work with the Bible, which is the key in solving all our problems. I learned how to develop our community. It empowered me so that I can work for my lord while I am still alive.

2. Yes, this workshop has a relationship with God. We did also work with happiness. It has brought new spirit deep inside my heart.

3. To fear God before everything else. To bring awareness or help and management of the community and developing it. Faith and peace amongst the people.

4. By mobilizing the community. By showing them the tight direction. By working for God. By giving the strength and discussions between people and because they are like God.
5. Because I have the objective of bringing their future and the community are my fellow Christians.

6. Faith is trust, help which you can trust when facing problems, by everyone who trust in God in good or bad days.

7. Yes Christianity is my faith, my life, relationship between people. It is also everlasting love. It is also the spirit of Christ amongst Church members.

8. I ask God what I need and the e will help me, that's why I am calling the Holy Spirit.

9. “Nambula yaMukatha” a queen of the Mukwaludhi tribe whenever her country was invaded, she usually see it before and informed the people to retreat towards the borders. Traditional weddings, girls go to get married when the parents see that the girl is grown up and needs to go through the wedding process.

10. With or through faith.

11. It is for the churches, because they are giving us the word that relates us with God. Because they have the Faith, love and Christianity. If they were not there, ten we shouldn't have parishes, which are developing and advancing rapidly. They help us in keeping broken marriages, which means they are builders of our homes through strength from God.

12. I trust that donor development projects it is a difficult thing because you will have the responsibility of everything. Implements are scarce and money to buy seeds. Because the people, who are going to start it, have to face problems, water might be scarce.

13. No and Yes. Because everything you need for the implementation of the project have to be bought with money and there could be a break-up.

14. I have to search for information from projects already existing, which are working in close relationship with the Government. Because I might also need assistance so that I can develop my project. What do I need to do because I need to get assistance from the Government.

15. Yes, because you can train people in dressmaking, cooking and to make huts and to guard the project itself.

Result # 10 –

1. I derived knowledge on how to work in the community on health issues and development. I am empowered on how to speak to the community in the village so that we can solve the problem of water.

2. Yes, I have been attending workshops on women's issues. This workshop differs from the others because it gives information concerning Christianity, community management, including water.

3. I learnt to work in the community whether on development or on Christianity.

4. It will help me when I go through headmen, church leaders ad water committees so that I can mobilize the community on how to bring up water in the community.

5. I want to work in the community so that I can make them understand how to maintain water, to guard it and to keep it hygienic.

6. Faith is feelings in your heart, where you discover that you love Jesus Christ.
7. Christianity to me is strong faith in Jesus Christ.
8. Spirituality is the appearance that you find in a person whether he is a deacon or girl guide, which shows that the person has spiritual beliefs.
9. Yes I know them. To put a fire in the bedroom or lounge, which is a traditional prayer. In the old days, when the rain didn't come, there is a certain clan, which had the responsibility of going to get it from Evale with a black bull.
10. Sunday in the Church candles will be lighted and smoke of a certain herb is also added.
11. Yes they are very important because I have to go through them so that I can mobilize the community on the subject matter that I want to bring forward in the villages.
12. There is a big difference. Government funded projects, people are paid. But donor funded projects people are not paid because the products are their own.
13. Projects have opened up doors in the community; it has brought some awareness in the community. Pottery, dressmaking. They have added more ideas in the community. Together with Christians, they have Christian beliefs.
14. When there are problems, people come together and discuss on how they are going to solve those problems.
15. Donor funded projects teach people how to cook, hygiene, health and tailoring.

Result # 11 –
1. I am strengthened because in this workshop I obtained a lot of good things. How to mobilize the community and how to lead them.
2. I have never attended workshops on women's issues but I hope they are not like this one because this one is concerning development and how to plant trees.
3. I gained the idea on how to work on something, which I can do whether to mobilize the community, to pant trees and to plan projects.
4. First I have to invite headmen and Church leaders so that they have to invite the community to have a meeting.
5. I have to work in the community to develop it.
6. Faith is the understanding of a person of him/herself.
7. Christianity is to work for God by praising Him and singing for Him.
8. Spirituality is a person who has studied theology or a deacon.
9. Traditional beliefs are traditional weddings and beating of drums.
10. Christian beliefs will be mixed with traditional beliefs because a Christian is not allowed to receive Holy Communion when sinned and not apologized.
11. Church leaders are important they preach the gospel and inform us on what is happening in the world. Traditional leaders are important because they solve our problems in the community like distributing land and fields to work on.
12. My experience with donor development projects is that I have gained how to make clay pots and how to make baskets.
13. They brought in Faith/Religion because spirituality is a person who worked for God through theology and as a deacon.
14. When there is a problem, you bring people together so that you can discuss it and solve it.

15. Government projects and donor development projects have brought in how to make dresses, bags, cooking and poultry.

Result # 12

1. I obtained knowledge of how to develop the community and the way that I have to follow when approaching the headman, church leaders and committee so that we can invite the community to inform them what is to be done.

2. Yes, it differs because it adds more to my spiritual belief. It also taught me how to develop the community in health issues and water affairs.

3. I learnt Christianity and the way in which I have to follow by mobilizing the community concerning development in water affairs and Christianity.

4. I have to go through headmen, church leaders, existing water committees, so that I can make the community understand concerning development in water and spirituality.

5. So that I can mobilize and make the community aware of development in water affairs and health.


7. Christianity means Faith when you are baptized or confirmed and by keeping the word of God in the Bible so that you must not ignore his words but you must trust.

8. Spirituality is a prayer to God by asking what you need and God gives it to you.

9. Yes, fire being brought in the bedroom or in the lounge which was a prayer of the old people. Also when a person has given birth to twins you are not allowed to cross their legs when their legs are spread when sitting on the ground or floor, your legs will be swollen. There is a belief that a person is not supposed to wear one shoe as if you don't have a father those who wear no shoe are those without a father. We also have traditional weddings.

10. Every Sunday in the Church they light candles. We have Christian weddings in the community.

11. Yes, they are more important because I have to go through them so that I can mobilize the community development of water and Christianity.

12. Government funded projects pay their people. Donor funded projects don't pay their people because it is their own project.

13. It brought something of our traditions because we are more developed and don't know how to make clay pots and we know now how to make clay pots and it was brought upon by the project.

14. We have not forced yet our problems because we just started our project. We have gotten ideas now on how to start our project so that they can't face any problems.

15. Government funded projects help the community by finding jobs and on the development side. Donor funded projects help the community to develop in health, water, and by giving them power though Christianity and women to get advancement like other nations who have developed themselves.

Result # 13
1. Because it helps the community to develop the water hygienically, and also to keep nature and our country healthy.

2. It differs because it talks about nature.

3. I learnt how to use water, how to plant trees, how to mobiles the community and how to keep creation clean.

4. It will help me so that I will know how to take care of my children, health, and development so that I can get work and a clear certificate.

5. So that the community can develop by being healthy, keeping creation as it was in the village or our country in Namibia.

6. Faith in God, being baptized and confirmed

7. Christianity is to help the community wit peace, like the way you love yourselves.

8. The person who loves your community and believe in God.

9. Traditional dances, traditional weddings, drums.

10. Blank

11. Because they help the community with all their problems.

12. Donor funded projects is the community itself who have to take action in keeping or implementing their projects. They invite each other and collect money and buy the needs, like oros and other food and planting trees.

13. Yes, they have brought in some traditional beliefs because it is uplifting the community so that the community can have their traditional beliefs in the future.

14. I will meet and discuss with the community so that we can solve these problems, headmen, and all existing committees in the community.

15. Government projects and donor-funded projects can work for the community.

Result # 14

1. I derived information on how to mobilize and organize the community in the churches or villages.

2. Yes, it differs because this workshop gives you knowledge or ideas that you can use. It also gives you power in your work so that you can do it easily because it is taught in how to use our knowledge on our own, we know how to make our people understand easily.

3. I learnt from it how women can be mobilized and organized. And how you can solve the water problems of the villages and the community.

4. It will help me because it has given me good ideas.

5. Because our communities are behind especially women, and I want to make them understand, I also want my communities to come to the stage where other communities are.

6. Faith is the way and everlasting life. To go in Heaven.

7. Christianity is the door through which we pass when we go to Heaven.

8. Spirituality is the strengthening, by doing holy work like studying theology as a pastor, Bishop or deacon.
9. Traditional beliefs in the community are for example, putting fire in your bedroom or lounge, performing traditional dances with drums, smearing traditional herbs.

10. Relationship like churches where candles are used, herbs are used and drums are used when people are singing.

11. Yes, they are very important because they are leaders of the community. By caring the problems of the community and for representing them.

12. I have experience in women’s projects at Omahanene that was started by women, helped by a donor agency, which has tried to make pots. But these pots are made with iron. E are not paid but government projects pay their employees.

13. Those projects not being paid are brought in by spiritual beliefs.

14. Problems are solved by the understanding of the community.

15. They must work depending on the understanding of the community. They have to put up projects on which the community have knowledge in.

Result # 15

1. I obtained the knowledge on how to lead the community and also the power to go ad work in our village.

2. Yes, I have attended workshops on women’s issues before. This workshop differs because you have first to go and mobilize the community before making contact with different organizations.

3. I learnt how water can be found and how to maintain it.

4. It helps because once I found water, it means I worked with an understanding community.

5. Because I have Faith love and a good relationship with the community.

6. Faith is a steadfast trust in Jesus Christ.

7. Christianity means I am Christian being baptized confirmed and believe in Christianity.

8. Spirituality means to love my fellow human being the way I love myself, I know I have spirituality.

9. Traditional beliefs are like traditional weddings.

10. Because traditional dances are needed in religion.

11. They are important because they bring people in the right direction. And those who are outside the Congregation they bring back.

12. I have the knowledge that in donor development projects, people try themselves to bring those projects into existence without any help. People who can make dresses with their own machines, by selling they keep money for themselves.


14. To bring up government projects so that people can get jobs and progress rapidly.

Result #16
1. I have been empowered and given strength by seeing you my fellow women at the stage where you are. I am very happy by hearing women who are related to the Church staring our work as leaders in the community.

2. I have attended one on projects, but this one is the best in comparison with the other project. The best part of it is that it is based on development and community management done by women.

3. I learnt a good thing on how to maintain and keep our country and the creation as it is. How to educate women on how to work in the community so that we can solve some of the problems.

4. What I get through the church and people understanding me clearly because we have a good relationship.

5. Because we as women have been in the background I will work/teach my fellow women, how the country has been freed and how we women are free.

6. I believe in Christianity because it is where I have to go through so that I can fulfil my obligation.

7. Jesus went to the Samaritan woman and told her that, the one whom he will give water will never get thirsty. And the one who is reborn/born again will not enter the kingdom of God.

8. Blank.

9. Yes, like the cutting of women at their private parts, when a child is sick the child might die if the mother believes in it.

10. They have a relationship with Christianity and Faith. It has a relationship because I have seen more people praying for the sick and people become healthy and the one who is praying is a Christian.

11. They are important because we have elected them. If we don’t have leaders we will not understand each other. The disciples of Jesus were to follow Him because He was their leader.

12. I have experience with the WISH project. The donor agency helps women in sewing machines and food. We come out of the project with new ideas.

13. It has brought in some of our traditions because we grew up without knowing how to make clay pots but now we know how, which we derived from that project.

14. We haven’t seen any problems yet because we just started it. If it goes well we won’t get any problems and because water, place and time are there.

15. The government is helping the community by solving their problems through projects. Most of the donor agencies responsible for projects are helping women.

Result # 17

1. I derived many ideas i.e. planting trees at places where there are no trees or how to mobilize the community in our village when we want to bring up water. I know which way to follow.

2. I have been attending many workshops but I have never come across this workshop. Because this one teaches us and makes us aware where we are at the moment and that women have full rights in the community whether she is as
pastor of a priest. She has the right to preach not like in the old days when women were deprived of this opportunity.

3. I learnt how to be with people, with people and to work in on spirits as sisters. To be open and to ask what you need for the community like water, clinics. I know whom to contact first and in which manner to handle it.

4. It will help me because I have learnt which steps I must follow. I learnt how to fear God so that everything that I will go and do will go smoothly.

5. I want to work in the community to add more ideas like the ideas I have obtained.

6. Christianity is faith, because a person has been baptized and received a new name, you have to praise the word of God and not to distort them but let them praise forever.

7. Christianity to me is when I fear God and his words and by praising them because they are the ones which have brought me on Earth so that I can stay on it. When I am not a Christian and don’t fear god, when I am going to do something it won’t mean anything because it is not sticking to Christianity. But if I am a Christian, everything will be all right.

8. Spirituality to means to pray to God and to ask what I need or want. He will do it for me.

9. In the old days when a man wants a woman he had to go to the parents of the women to get permission from them. But now it is changed because when a man proposed to a woman they can just start living together. But it hasn’t totally died out. We still work for our parents because we don’t want to destroy our traditions.

10. I will say there is a relationship between traditional beliefs, spirituality and Christianity because in the old days when a girl became pregnant before marriage they will beat a stick in the stomach so that the baby inside will die. But now they are all the same with those married ones.

11. Yes, they are more important because when we need something we always go to the Church leaders and the traditional ones so that they can give us permission to do whatever is to be done.

12. Concerning government projects, when we want to dig a well we will need to be paid. But donor development projects we work for ourselves. But it is not always the same. We need equality in the community but not to ask for money to use our own power because what we are doing is for ourselves.

13. Yes it is right because we are working for GTZ they have helped us in connection with our traditions, our church and our spirituality.

14. Yes because they are solving our problems in our villages by requesting when there are some needs so that we can receive help. They are the ones, who have discovered that our traditions are dying out, although they are the ones we have to follow so that we can live better.

15. I have thought that the government or donor agencies should measure water for certain people who are far from water points and to tell the people to dig deep wells. When they are finished, the community has to inform that specific agency to build that well so that water can keep longer.

Result #17
1. I have derived more ideas in my brain on how to lead the community. I also gained more about Christianity meaning if you don’t have faith in the word of God you will not do anything on what you were supposed to do. You first have to believe in God so that he can help you like people who want water in their village water won’t come from our own power but from the will of God.

2. This workshop differs from other workshops although its content is on women’s issues, because its objectives are not the same as those of workshops I have attended. This one is about water in the villages, health and how I must lead the community.

3. I learnt how to get information, so that I can go and inform the community in my village how to get water, which is scarce in our village. I learnt that water is life and it must not be wasted. If a certain agency or organization brings up water pump we have to plant trees or if they are already existing we must take care of them.

4. It will help me if the people are concerned and understand what I tell them and follow it, because it is a help to the community.

5. I want to go and do what I have learnt from this women’s workshop. How to plant trees and how water can come into existence in the village.

6. Faith means help, and to listen carefully to the word of God which is preached and by believing that they are true and it was done by the God our creator.

7. Christianity means Faith and by being baptized and given a new relationship with god’s words. We have to fear of, and trust Him and not to spoil Him or not to trust in Him, but believe in His work.

8. Spirituality is the ideas of praying, so that the Lord Jesus Christ can take away our sins or God help us on what we need.

Result # 18

1. I have obtained goodness of development in water affairs. I also obtained more ideas on Christianity.

2. Yes it differs from the others because I gained ideas on community development.

3. From the workshop I learnt about community development, Christianity and other things related to traditions.

4. It will help me on working together so that we can develop ourselves and by solving problems in the community.

5. I want to develop the community and by developing them to conserve creation and by bringing up water in the community and by uplifting women in our country. By creating projects in the community and all other things connected to Christianity and traditional beliefs.

6. Faith is the understanding of a person through Christianity, traditionally or the voice inside a human being.

7. Christianity means working for God by praying praising Him in the Church service or any service related to God by all creation of God.

8. Spirituality means people who have studied theology i.e. pastor, bishop, deacons, etc.
9. Yes, like the fire in the bedrooms and don’t cross somebody’s legs that has
given birth to twins.

10. Fire in the bedroom, fire in the churches, and traditional drums in the churches.

11. Church leaders are important by developing the community through
Christianity. By teaching the people the Word of God, Traditional leaders are
important because they solve the community’s problems.

12. Government projects are being paid for by the government while donor
projects work on their own until they gain something and develop themselves.

13. They brought in something in our traditions because our generation has
progressed and don’t know how to make clay pots. Now we make pots from
our project.

14. Problems will only be solved once people have come together and discuss their
problems which is making them not t develop.

15. Government projects help the people to get jobs on the government. While
donor projects help the community to develop, like planting trees, dressmaking
and cooking.

Result # 19

1. In the workshop we obtained more ideas concerning development and water
affairs in the community.

2. Yes, the workshop on women’s issues, which I have attended, differs from this
one. Because it discusses spirituality. This one is about water management and
development.

3. I learnt how to come together and meet as Christians. I also learnt how to listen
when I was trained on health issues and management of water in the
community.

4. I have first to invite headmen and church leaders who have to invite the
community so that we can hold a meeting with the community.

5. I have to work in the community for it to develop.

6. Faith is the understanding and feelings of a person in her/himself.

7. Christianity means to work for God, praise Him and to pray to Him.

8. Spirituality is to study theology as a pastor, girlguide or deacon.

9. There is a story that a certain clan had to go and search for water with a black
bull. Like people cleaning a house not to greet by cough.

10. Christianity can’t be united with traditional beliefs because a Christina can’t go
and receive Holy Communion when you have sinned.

11. Church leaders are more important because they preach the gospel. Traditional
leaders are more important because they listen to our problems for example,
projects.

12. In donor development projects I have gained experience on how to make clay
pots and to make palm baskets.

13. Blank

14. Blank

15. Blank
7. **Informal Settlements**

**Okangwena, Ondangwa**

**Elder Men:**

Household - is built by two people for husband, wife and children. Everything inside the house is the household.

Government - constitutes a nation with good relations. If there are no good relations then there is not a government. The government gives permission for people to get jobs and has brought in many donors to help get money and projects.

Community - is part of the government. It is the foundation of the government, the root. The community has advanced and created new jobs and activities.

Donor agencies - are organizations which work on close relationship with communities. Through donor agencies we have a relationship with external countries.

Spirituality - is something you receive from God that can guide you. Through spirituality and Churches we have developed our minds.

Traditional healer - It was a practice before the government came in, before the new medical practices and before hospitals. It still exists and now has the permission from the new government to practice under their control.

Church - is the relationship between people and God and where people came together who have religious beliefs. Churches have brought schools and hospitals.

King/Queen - is from birth, not elected and part of the royal family. These are traditional leaders who bring fear in people so that people can’t steal. Now are working in close relationship with the government.

Customary laws - to solve problems of a certain community. We have advanced in these because they are now put down on paper.

Black bull - was used to go in search of rain at Evale. They were also used to solve problems in the community but this practice is becoming dead.

Religion - means that we believe in God and know that he is existing. We have not forgotten Kalunga though. We still call him in when we have problems.

Prophet - is somebody who is seeing what is in the future through dreams. There is still one prophet here who holds meetings in the community and tells them what will happen in the future.

Mangundu, Kantene, Mungandjera - are the creators of people, the offspring of where the Ovambos originated.

Ancestral spirits - are spirits that visit people in dreams in the house of clan.

Spirituality - plays an important role because it is through spirituality that we have development.

Development - through the government we have gained a lot of knowledge. Through Churches, our leaders, our courts, we have gained a lot.

**Young Women:**

Community - is the people?
Donor agencies – agencies that help is whenever we are facing problems. They help us and train us.

Spirituality – is the Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit is the heart.

Traditional healers – are those doctors who are healing with herbs and are treating the people very well.

Household – consists of 2 people because it is built by the husband and wife.

Government – is the people themselves. The government is people and is moving forward in a good manner.

Church – where people who believe in God come together. It is where we are baptized, confirmed and a lot of feasts and things go on in the Church.

Religion – means Christianity. God the Father and the Trinity is the true God.

King/Queen – is somebody who is a leader of a certain nation.

Customary laws – are laws put down by the King/Queen.

Black bull – used to go and get rain from Evale.

Kalunga-Kanongombe – is the belief of the old old people.

Prophet – is somebody who is foreseeing the future.

Ancestral spirits – are spirits from dead people.

Development Summary:

The most important word to explain development are – government, church, king/queen, household, traditional healer, prophet. We get our strength through the Church until we come to get our own government. The government is leading us well, for example, building new houses, schools and hospitals and getting us medical doctors. We have electricity and water, some even in our houses. The king is also leading us well. We are developed because we are flying airplanes. E are thanking God for our government.

Elderly women:

Community – is at peace with Independence.

Donor agencies – are those people helping us whenever we have problems.

Spirituality – is that spirit of God. Our spirit is going backwards. People are not attending Church services due to economic activities. People do not gather as before.

Traditional healer – those doctors who treat us before hospitals came and are now given permission to continue treating people.

Household – is a place where there are members of a family. There are a lot of people now who want to build traditional houses.

Government – is people, the community. We have advanced in many things like schools, hospitals, etc.

Church – is the House of God where people with Christianity and good spirit come together. The Church also developed many things, brought hospitals and education.

Religion – is Christianity. People believe in God who helps us solve our problems.

Customary laws – are being put down by kings to keep away crime. It is working for justice.
Black bull - was used in old days to search for rain. People do believe in God and no longer believe in black bulls.

Kalunga Kanongombe - being used by old people. At present we use the Trinity God but we haven't thrown away Kalunga. We still use him in times of difficulty.

Prophet - is someone who tells what is happening in the future.

Mangundu, Kantene, Mungandjera - Mangundu is the king of Ovambo in the old old days, He was an old leader.

Ancestral spirits - spirits of the old people who are dead people. No longer believe in these.

King/Queen - is someone from the royal family. You see who is responsible and then he will be elected. The king has put down customary laws that are good, better than before.

Development Summary:

The Church is the one that has brought upon spirituality and through spirituality we have gotten religious beliefs. The Church has also brought schools where we learn to read and write. Through the teachings of the Church people have become aware and have learned about the government and elected our leaders. We thank our government leaders for getting donor agencies to come and help us. GTZ has brought water and also hygiene. We also thank traditional leaders for accepting missionaries for it was they that brought us Christianity. We also thank our traditional leaders for the customary laws, which are keeping away crimes like rape, murder and stealing.

The most important word for development is the Church because it is bringing good spirits to people so they can take part in development.

Amunkambja, Oshakati

Elderly men:

Church - is faith in God and religious practices. The Church is there to unite people so people can love each other.

Religion - where people believe in Jesus Christ and when you are a member of a congregation.

King/Queen - needs to be from a royal family and when a person has wisdom, he can be elected as king.

Customary law - when a community comes together to discuss and comes up with laws to govern them. Also there to help people get right and also for good relations - reconciliation, payment, etc.

Black bull - signifies the search for rain in the old days. The cow was burned as a sacrifice to God/Kalunga.

Prophet - is someone who is dreaming what will become in the future.

Mangundu - don not know.

Ancestral spirits - the spirits of dead people who died a long time ago. These spirits can enter a child so then you take the child to a traditional healer who will sacrifice a dog to chase the spirits away.
Community – is people, also part of the government because the community is the one electing the leaders and she/he is elected from the community.

Donor agencies – are organizations giving food where communities are hungry. Some donor agencies also are there to have projects to give employment.

Spirituality – is peace. It is also treating diseases hospitals can’t treat.

Traditional healers – heal people using traditional herbs.

Household – consists of a woman and her husband and children. It is when the members are living together in peace. If they are fighting, this is not a true household.

Government – is put down by communities themselves. It is not the leader but the people themselves. When there are no people. There is no government. Government is there when people in that country are having a good relationship.

Development Summary:
The Church played an important role in development. It taught us to write and read. That is why we have leaders – teachers, pastors, and doctors. Customary laws are there to combat crime and have brought Independence. Prophets play and important role in development by prophesizing war, rain and now Independence. Community also played a part because they have infrastructures because communities have cooperated with development. Development has also brought bad things like rape and stealing things. When the government came in they also brought development by bringing in schools, clinics, electricity etc. The government also brought in donor agencies.

But the Church also brought in bad things. When the Church first came, it got people to respond by promising tobacco. The Missionaries bribed people to come to the Church.

Youth group:
Church – is a place where you hear the Word of God.
Religion – is faith in God.
King/Queen – is a person ruling the community of his tribe.
Customary law – those laws governing and building the nation or a certain community.
Black bull – when it is not raining they were used to go and get rain from the north.
Prophet – somebody who prophesizes things will happen on earth.
Ancestral spirits – spirits of people who died long ago and are existing in people now alive.
Community – those people living in a certain country.
Donor agencies – those organizations which help poor people.
Spirituality – a person who has got manners and discipline.
Traditional healer – someone who is treating people using the old ways.
Household – a place where people are living with their belongings.
Government – people who have elected their leaders or certain government.
Development summary:

The Church has brought on development by teaching people to read and write and have the know-how and to be aware of what is going on in the world. The Church brought about religion and to know what is God. The kings have brought unity and to love each other because people need to have a good relationship and work together as children of one mother. Donor agencies have brought hygiene in communities and good relations between people. Household brought about an increase of people through reproduction. It also brought about so women can be governed by a man. The household also brought about good neighborly relations.

The Church is the most important agent in development because God created all things and us.

Elderly women:

Church – is a place where Christians unite and can stay there to come cross and meet God with other Christians. It is a place where they can present their problems and have relations with God.

Religion – have to believe in one God and faith is to answer and devote will to God.

King/Queen – is someone being born a king, coming out or a royal family. The king is from birth.

Customary laws – are laws put down by a certain community to govern that community, where people are being taken care of.

Black bull – used to go and search for rain with a girl.

Kalunga – a god which was prayed to by our ancestors and our old old people.

Prophet – somebody who is a dreamer and who sees it will become true and can tell people this will happen.

Mangundu - our great great great grandfathers related to Ovambos.

Community – people who are living together for example, we are living closely even though we are from different tribes.

Donor agencies – to hire these donor agencies is when the country comes together and puts money together to get an account and then someone comes and asks for it i.e. the poor people.

Spirituality – it is when people are Christian and those people who have good spirit and do not like bad things. She is peaceful.

Traditional healers – are those who in the old days treated people traditionally.

Household – at a certain place there is a house being built and people living where there is also cattle, poultry, etc.

Government – is when a certain person has adopted a constitution with other people. The government is the people.

Development Summary:

When the Church came, we developed because in the old days, people were using certain places they called Churches to come together and pray. But now all our old beliefs have been buried and they are looking at this as though they were unimportant. For example, traditional weddings. They used to think that if a person went through this they were very important. But now it is not longer practiced.
Ancestral spirits and Kalunga, all of these have been killed by the Church. When it came to these old things like black bulls and ancestral spirits, when development came and religion spread, everything was put down. People have hospitals now and Christianity and the Church. Donor agencies have come to provide employment to communities, build houses and develop them to help the government do things it can't do and also to help the communities. Development also brought forward communities that do not have kings, where people are starting to be educated. Some customary laws are being thrown away also by the government.

Young Men:
Church – is an organization for people who believe in god.
Religion – is for those who did not believe in god but are now Christian.
King/Queen – are traditional leaders.
Customary laws – laws, which govern the countries, put down by the communities themselves.
Black bull – used to go and search for water with a naked person.
Kalunga – people believed in him in the old days.
Prophet – someone who talked to God in dreams and presented these to the community.
Mangundu – was a leader to our great-great grandparents.
Ancestral spirits – spirits living in the country or world.
Donor agencies – that which help people who need help or training in certain things.
Spirituality – is faith in God.
Traditional healers – people who are treating people traditionally.
Household – a place where people are staying and sleeping, a family unit.
Government – are people elected to do certain things for them.

Development Summary:
In the old days there were no churches but now we have churches. A lot of people have become believers and have advanced. Religion has increased and we see there is a change because we have become Christian. In the old days we had kings and it was difficult. Without kings life is much easier. We do not believe in Kalunga anymore and black bulls but we believe in the Trinity of God. Prophets are now working in close relationship with the Church and our leaders are governing the Church in close relations with the communities.
The Church is the most important element if development. It is Christianity that made us understand what is good and what is bad. It is the Church, which brought about development.

Young Women:
Church – where people come together and sing praises to God and receive Holy Communion.
Religion – people are baptized and confirmed through religion.
King/Queen – responsible for giving and presenting laws to his people.
Customary laws – community wear traditional dresses and go through weddings.
Black bull – used to make clothes for women and to search for rain.
Kalunga – our people were praying to him.
Prophet – somebody who predicts things.
Mangundu – don’t know.
Ancestral spirits – believed it came from dead people and then enter a living person who then acts mad-crazy and asks for weird things. They then need to eat blood from a chicken and wear beads.
Community – when people come together and discuss things they want to be done by/with a leader.
Donor agencies – like OHSIP who help us and give us ideas of how to uplift ourselves.
Spirituality – are pastors and deacons.
Traditional healers – are people who are treating people with herbs and help people to vomit if taken poison.
Household – where people live, including our economy.
Government – where people can go and ask for assistance whenever they are poor, like to build houses or food to eat.
Development Summary:
People in the old days always met under the trees and pray to God but now we come together in buildings of brick and iron sheets. People are now baptized and can read the Bible themselves. We are now governed by our President. We are getting ID cards and birth certificates. People don’t believe in prophets and we now pray to the Trinity of God. We have hospitals and doctors. We are now united all of us from different tribes. We now have water pipes, airplanes. We also have better housing and are living better with sugars, sweets. We are also now attending school.
It is the Church that is the most important element in development because they began educating us.
Appendix 2

Interview and Questionnaire Content

(1) Interviews with Church leaders:

1. In the Church, and for you personally, define concepts of religion and spirituality. Do they differ? How?

2. What is/has been the role of mysticism in religion or spirituality or traditional beliefs in Namibia?

3. Are you aware of traditional beliefs in Namibia?

4. What is the relationship between traditional beliefs and Christianity and the Church? Are traditional beliefs reflected in Church?

5. What is the present strength/problems with Christianity/Church in Namibia given the modernization trends occurring and in view of past role of Marxist/Communist in SWAPO and exile population?

6. What is the current role of CCN and Church in rebuilding society in Namibia and in the process of reconstruction and reconciliation?

7. What are your views on international development philosophies, policies, approaches and strategies as well as attitude in terms of usefulness and appropriateness to Namibian development process?

8. What kinds of questions would you ask development agencies about the role of religion/spirituality in development programmes?

9. What are your views on the role of Church - religion - spirituality in the global ecological crisis?

(2) Interview with Namibian development agents:

1. What is your concept of development?

2. What are your concepts of religion and spirituality?

3. What do you feel is or can be the role of spirituality / religion in development?
4. What has been your experiences with international development agencies, SWAM and OHSIP in particular in terms of role of spirituality and religion?

5. How would you suggest ESA's can integrate this role of spirituality and religion in their programme approaches and strategies?

6. What are your views on the role of the Church in development in Namibia? and globally?

(3) Interviews with CCN officials:

1. What is your concept of development?

2. What are your concepts of religion and spirituality?

3. What do you feel is or can be the role of spirituality / religion in development?

4. What has been your experiences with international development agencies, SWAM and OHSIP in particular in terms of role of spirituality and religion?

5. How would you suggest ESA's can integrate this role of spirituality and religion in their programme approaches and strategies?

6. What are your views on the role of the Church in development in Namibia? and globally?

7. What is the philosophy of CCN in development?

8. What is the present situation in terms of CCN programmes in development? funding? membership?

9. Can you explain what is the concept of Christian Base communities and Regional Council of Churches?

10. What is the current role of CCN and Church in rebuilding society in Namibia and in the process of reconstruction and reconciliation?

(4a) Interviews with Elders

1. Can you tell me the stories of your grandmothers and grandfathers about how life was back then?
2. What were the beliefs about water, land, trees, rain, animals, women, men, children, leaders, community, and society?

3. What were the beliefs about the dead? Do you believe they may protect you?

4. Do you have holy places, trees that cannot be cut, places where no one can go or play in?

5. What are the benefits of the old ways?

6. How much of the old ways has been lost and what is still existing?

7. When did they start being lost? Why?

8. How do you think this loss has affected the quality of life for women, men, children, community, society, nature, and animals?

9. Now that they have been lost and modern development has started, what do you see as being the problems and good points of this? I.e. what do you like about life today? What do you not like about life today? How were these bad things kept away in the old days?

10. How do you think life can be improved?

11. How do you think the old ways relates to the new religion and Church?

(4b) Interviews with traditional healers

1. Can you tell me the stories of your grandmothers and grandfathers about how life was back then?

2. What were the beliefs about water, land, trees, rain, animals, women, men, children, leaders, community, and society?

3. What were the beliefs about the dead? Do you believe they may protect you?

4. Do you have holy places, trees that cannot be cut, places where no one can go or play in?

5. What are the benefits of the old ways?

6. How much of the old ways has been lost and what is still existing?

7. When did they start being lost? Why?

364
8. How do you think this loss has affected the quality of life for women, men, children, community, society, nature, and animals?

9. Now that they have been lost and modern development has started, what do you see as being the problems and good points of this? I.e. what do you like about life today? What do you not like about life today? How were these bad things kept away in the old days?

10. How do you think life can be improved?

11. How do you think the old ways relates to the new religion and Church?

12. What types of healing do you offer?

13. When did you become a healer?

14. Did someone train you?

15. How long did it take you to become a healer?

16. Do you have a spirit helper?

17. Do you use the Bible and prayers to heal people?

18. How many patients do you heal?

19. Who are your patients?

20. Do you send some patients to doctors?

21. Does the Church oppose her work?

(5) Interviews with Community leaders:

1. For you personally, can you define what is religion and what is spirituality? Do they differ? How?

2. Are you aware of traditional beliefs in Namibia (northern)?

3. How did these traditional beliefs affect everyday life in terms of influencing or protecting the environment - water, trees, animals, women, men, children, community, society?

4. What is the relationship between these traditional beliefs and religion-Church? Was it ever different in the past?
5. What is the role of the Church-religion-Christianity in rebuilding Namibia? Has it changed over time? How?

6. What is your experience with international and government development programmes? Have they benefited Namibia in terms of human and societal development? In what ways?

7. Would you suggest different ways of doing development?

8. What do you think should be the role of spirituality-religion-traditional beliefs in development?

(6) Questionnaire with Churchwomen’s group

1. What strengths did you drive from this workshop?

2. Have you been in workshops on women’s issues before? How did it differ from this one?

3. What did you learn in this workshop?

4. How will this help you in working in the communities?

5. Do you feel ready to work in the communities?

6. Why did you want to work in the communities?

7. What is religion to you? What is spirituality to you?

8. Do you know of the old traditional beliefs in the communities? Can you tell me any? What is their relationship to religion-Christianity and spirituality?

9. Do you think Church leaders or traditional leaders are more important? Why?

10. What do you feel about government or external (donor) development projects? What is the relationship between the traditional, spiritual and religious beliefs of the community? Any problems? Why? What do you feel would be more appropriate approaches?

(7) Informal Settlements:

In two informal settlements, focus group discussions were conducted to find their concepts of development and spirituality. The community groups were divided into subgroups of: elder men and women (> 50), women and men (30-50 years old), younger men and...
women (15-29 years old), and youth (<15). Each group was given the same list of terms and asked to define each. Each group then presented their work to the larger group after everyone had finished. The list of terms included:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>English</th>
<th>Oshvambo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Church</td>
<td>Ongerki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>Eitaalo Iyopaukalunga</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>King-Queen</td>
<td>Omukwaillwa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customary law</td>
<td>Oompaongo dhopashigwana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black bull</td>
<td>Ondumetano onduudhe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prophet</td>
<td>Omuhungneki</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ancestral spirits</td>
<td>Oombepo dhaakwampungu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>Oshigwana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donor agencies</td>
<td>Ehangano Iyomakwathelo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional healer</td>
<td>Ongana yopamithigululwakalo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household</td>
<td>Egumbo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>Epanglo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>God</td>
<td>Kalunga-Kanangombe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spirituality</td>
<td>Uukwambepo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific ancestors</td>
<td>Mangandu, Kantene, Mungandjera</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each group was then asked to provide a concept of development by assessing which of these words that they feel were the most important to development.
Appendix 4

Background Information on Project Cycle

Baum (1982) described the project cycle. The first phase of the project cycle is concerned with identifying projects that have a high priority, projects that are in keeping with the kinds of work that the home agency is interested in supporting, or in other words, the kind of work that is in keeping with the values of that development agency. Sector analyses are needed to determine the viability of the identified project idea in relation to sectoral objectives and to the country's development strategy overall. Economic analyses are needed to determine if technical and institutional solutions are likely to be found at costs commensurate with expected benefits. National governments and agencies may not share similar views on development objectives or sector priorities, or the agency may identify the need for prior policy or institutional reform. The second stage is project preparation, usually a one or two year period of extensive collaboration between the agency and the cooperating partner. Formal responsibility for project preparation lies with the partner, however, agencies do become involved actively to ensure that the partner understands the agency's requirements and standards, and, in some cases, to assist in financing and technical assistance necessary for preparatory work, and even to fill in gaps in projects that have been incompletely or inadequately prepared. Sometimes, the agency can even handle the preparatory work itself. Project preparation must cover the full range of technical, institutional, economic, and financial conditions necessary to achieve the project's objectives. Preparation requires feasibility studies that identify and prepare preliminary designs of technical and institutional alternatives, compare their respective costs and benefits and investigate in more detail, the more promising alternatives until the most satisfactory solution is finally worked out. Appraisal provides a comprehensive review of all aspects of the project and lays the foundation for implementing the project and evaluating it when it is completed. Appraisal is usually the sole responsibility of the agency. Appraisal covers four main aspects of the project.
technical, institutional, economic and financial. The appraisal mission sets forth its findings and recommends terms and conditions for the project. Negotiation is the stage at which the agency and the partner agree on the measures necessary to assure the success of the project. These agreements are then converted into legal obligations. The negotiation process ensures that the agency and the partner are in agreement, not only over the broad objectives of the project, but also on the specific actions necessary to achieve them and the detailed schedules for project implementation. Project implementation then commences and is the responsibility of the partner, with whatever assistance has been agreed upon in terms of expatriate managers, training of staff, and/or consultants. The agency's role is to supervise the project and to ensure that the project is being properly executed. The agency's supervisory role also facilitates the feedback of accumulated experiences of the project into its implementation strategies, into future project designs and into the improvement of policies and procedures. Monitoring and evaluation is a key feature of the implementation and supervision stage. When the project is nearing the end of its implementation, the project undergoes a complete evaluation. The evaluation is multi-faceted, comprising self-evaluation reports of the partner and the supporting expatriate personnel and external audits conducted by the agency.
Appendix 5

Background Information on Logistical Framework Analysis (LFA)

The LFA is a way of organizing information and activities so that a number of different viewpoints can be brought to bear simultaneously, and complementary to rather than opposing each other. The LFA breaks a project down into four separate and distinct levels of objectives. At the lowest level are the Project Inputs. These are the activities to be undertaken that will in turn result in the second level of objectives called Outputs. Outputs are the results that are directly accomplished by the management of Inputs. The Outputs are, however, not valuable for their own sake and are not the justification for the project. The higher objective, the Purpose of the project is the result expected from having achieved the Outputs. In other words, the Outputs are a set of interrelated objectives that combined, aim at achieving the higher Project Purpose. The fourth level in the Logical Framework is a higher objective called the Goal. The project is one of the necessary conditions for achieving this goal, but will not be sufficient in itself to achieve the goal.

Within the LFA, the relationship between the levels of objectives is not accidental but causal. When a purpose is identified, and the outputs needed to achieve this purpose defined, a hypothesis is formed, namely "If these outputs can be produced, then the purpose should be achieved" (MSI Briefing Sheet, p. 2). A hypothesis is, however, a predictive statement that involves uncertainty. Many factors can affect if the outputs can be produced and if the purpose can be achieved. Thus the LFA is based on a series of hypotheses with pre-assumed uncertainties. Figures 1 and 2 describe these linked hypotheses.

The nature of the uncertainty must then be clarified so that a project design that has the best probability of success can be selected. Factors that are
necessary for achieving success but are beyond the project's control are included in the LFA. These factors are called assumptions. By identifying assumptions, the original hypothesis statements are expanded to include the specific nature of the more important uncertainties that could affect the hypotheses. If each of the assumptions in the project design is subjected to scrutiny during the design phase and the project improved accordingly, the project manager should have a realistic idea of what the probabilities are of project success and also be able to anticipate the kinds of difficulties that might arise during the course of the project. Assumptions are not only useful in the design of projects, but also in their monitoring and evaluation. Their examination can provide insight as to why the project has or has not succeeded in achieving its objectives.

Figure AP5-1 Logical Framework Analysis
It is not sufficient to define the general intent of the project just in terms of linked hypotheses and relevant assumptions for each project objective level. The statements of Goal, Purpose, Outputs and Inputs can be misunderstood or are open to different interpretations. Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVIs) are needed to specify exactly what is considered to reflect the success of the project, to sharpen the project objectives and have confidence that all actors involved in the project share a common understanding.

The indicators selected to measure project success must then be subjected to clarification. In other words, how can these indicators be measured? How can these indicators be proven? Evidence must be available to support these indicators. The value of an indicator is limited by the means available to verify the indicator. The means of verification (MOVs) must be available and reliable. Additionally, the costs of verifying the indicator must be incorporated into the project design. If the means of verification is difficult, another means of verification must be explored, or if it is impossible, a question should be raised as to whether the indicator is realistic or whether another indicator may be used.