A coaching approach to careers guidance: evaluation of an intervention with students in Further and Higher Education

This item was submitted to Loughborough University's Institutional Repository by the/an author.

Additional Information:

- A Master's Thesis. Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Master of Philosophy at Loughborough University.

Metadata Record: https://dspace.lboro.ac.uk/2134/34946

Publisher: © K. Harness

Rights: This work is made available according to the conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0) licence. Full details of this licence are available at: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

Please cite the published version.
A COACHING APPROACH TO CAREERS GUIDANCE: EVALUATION OF AN INTERVENTION WITH STUDENTS IN FURTHER AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Kay Harness

A Master of Philosophy Thesis
Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of
Master of Philosophy of Loughborough University

5 February 2009

© by K. Harness 2009
ABSTRACT

This thesis researched the techniques of coaching and mentoring and their application in the area of careers guidance and development with students in further and higher education over a two year period.

The Enhanced Model of careers guidance was based on coaching and mentoring techniques; through the process the students would identify skills, start to plan and make decisions about their future. They would also develop their self esteem, confidence, motivation and self image. The Enhanced Model was formulated to relate directly to the careers guidance year, taking into account critical decision points relevant to the students such as applying to further or higher education or looking for work.

A literature review into business and education coaching and mentoring was conducted considering both individuals and contexts. Quantitative and qualitative data were collected from 129 students, who were split into four groups, one of which received the Enhanced Model.

Six measures covering career decidedness, self concept clarity, occupational information, career exploration and passive decision making, career decision making self efficacy, were used before and after the intervention. All students perceived that they had improved in these respects, no matter what group they were in. The measures represent people's perceptions of their career development, not necessarily the reality.

Despite the difficulty differentiating the four groups using these measures, the students who received the Enhanced Model subsequently took different career paths in higher education and work from the other groups in the research. With a clear understanding of the role of career guidance and management there are roles for mentoring and coaching in the development of individuals.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I express my thanks to the following:

To my dearly loved parents who shared my dreams and helped them to come true, because they believed in me and though I am registered disabled, they both saw beyond the disability. They were amazing people and it was a privilege to know them as they were enterprising, innovative and creative individuals.

My special thanks to Martin for his support, honesty and faith in my abilities over the years.

There were two key people at Loughborough University, my supervisor, Professor John Arnold for his support and guidance and Jacqueline Szumko the English Language Skills Unit, who helped so much.

To all the students who took part in the research and for the staff who gave their support.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT i

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ii

LIST OF TABLES x

LIST OF DIAGRAM xiii

LIST OF CHARTS xiv

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION 1

1.1 Overview 1

1.2 Introduction 3

1.3 The process by any other name 6

1.3.1 People and their development 7

1.3.2 Career decision making 8

1.3.3 Career planning and goal setting 9

1.4. Brief account of my research 11

1.5 Outline of the content of the other chapters in order 13

CHAPTER 2 MENTORING AND COACHING 15

2.1 Introduction 15

2.2 Backcloth and Influences on Mentoring and Coaching 15

2.3 Mentoring and Coaching – origins and definitions 16

2.3.1 Definition – Mentoring 16

2.3.2 Definition – Coaching 17

2.4 Models of Mentoring and Coaching 19
CHAPTER 3  CAREER GUIDANCE, WHERE, WHEN WITH WHOM

3.1 Introduction 34

3.1.1 Definitions of career guidance 34

3.2 History of Career Guidance 35

3.2.1 Pre and post 16 provision of education and career guidance 37

3.2.2 Further Education 39

3.2.3 Higher Education provision 40

3.3 Career education and guidance today 41

3.3.1 Making choices 43

3.4 Introduction to Occupational Choices and Careers Guidance Theories and Models 46

3.4.1 Trait/Factor or Matching or Person-environment fit approach 46

3.4.2 Opportunity Structure Approach 47

3.4.3 Theories of Career choice 48

3.4.4 Models of Guidance 49

3.5 The Influences on Young People 50

3.5.1 School and teacher's expectations 54
3.5.2 The Media, TV shows, radio, newspapers, magazines, books, Internet 55
3.5.3 Careers Adviser or Personal Advisers 56
3.5.4 Students' main advisers on post-16 options 57
3.5.5 Economic awareness, the labour market and work 59
3.6 Linking career guidance to mentoring and coaching 61
3.6.1 Mentoring 62
3.6.2 Coaching 63
3.7 Summary 64

CHAPTER 4 THE ENHANCED MODEL 68

4.1 Background and development of an Enhanced Model 68
4.2 Mentoring and Coaching and the link to Career Guidance 70
4.3 Mentoring and the Mentor, Coaching and the Coach 74
4.4 An overview of the Enhanced Model and others 78
4.5 The Enhanced Model – interviews and group sessions: context and structure of content and timings 84
4.5.1 The role of interviews in the Enhanced model 87
4.5.2 The Enhanced group session model 89
4.6.1 Skills of the practitioner/researcher 89
4.7.1 The expected benefits of the Enhanced Model 90
4.8 Summary 91

CHAPTER 5 METHODS 94

5.1 Introduction 94
5.1.1 Explanation of the different groups. 95
5.2 Positioning the Research 96
5.3 Action Research 96
5.4  Introduction to research methods 98
   5.4.1  Questionnaires 98
   5.4.2  Interviewing 100
   5.4.3  Group Sessions 102

5.5  Overview of Research Design and Students taking part in the research 104
   5.5.1  The Choice of Methods 104
   5.5.2  Introduction to Questionnaires 105
   5.5.3  The Design of Questionnaires 105
   5.5.4  Layout 105
   5.5.5  Questionnaires - Different focus for each 106
   5.5.6  Established Scales 107
   5.5.7  First questionnaire 108
   5.5.8  Second questionnaire 109
   5.5.9  Third Questionnaire 110
   5.5.10 Final Questionnaire 112

5.6  Introduction to the Students taking part in the Research 112
   5.6.1  Higher National Diploma (HND) 113
   5.6.2  National Diploma programmes 114
   5.6.3  Access to Higher Education Nursing 116

5.7  Introduction to Interviews 117
   5.7.1  The Purpose of the Interviews 117
   5.7.2  Self Referred Students (Group Z) 118
   5.7.3  Selective students for the Enhanced model (Group B2) 118
   5.7.4  Format of Interviews with the Group B2 students 120
   5.7.5  Second and Third Interviews 121
   5.7.6  Follow up and Final Interviews 121
   5.7.7  Analysing the interviews 122
   5.7.8  Issues of research 123

5.8  Research procedure and respondents 123
5.9 Description of data collected from questionnaires and interviews 124
5.9.1 Profile of students taking part in the research 124
5.9.2 Over twenty four year olds 125
5.9.3 The sixteen to eighteen groups 126
5.9.4 Main job earner (Parental or partner occupation) 130
5.9.5 Awareness of Training and Development techniques 132
5.9.6 Preferred Context Learning of Students 133
5.9.7 Home Location 135
5.10 Working with Career Adviser/Personal Adviser 136
5.11 Summary 137

CHAPTER 6 FINDINGS 139

6.1 Introduction to Chapter Six 139
6.2 Introduction to the research findings 143
  6.2.1 Group B2 Students 144
  6.2.2 Group Z Students 144
  6.2.3 Group B1 Students 145
  6.2.4 Group A Students 145
  6.2.5 Group 0 Students 145
6.3 Research questions and answers from questionnaires and interviews including Case Studies 145
  RQ1 Did the Enhanced Model make a real difference to those who got it? In what ways 145
  6.3.1 Summary 155
6.4 Research questions and answers from interviews 156
  6.4.1 Group B2 answers to Question 7 in final structured interview 156
  6.4.2 Question 7 – Group Z student comments 160
  6.4.3 Group Z – Question 9 165
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4.4 Comparison of Groups B2 and Z</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.5 Summary</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.6 Group B2 Question 10 Final Structured Interview</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.7 Summary of Questions (7 and 10)</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Case Studies</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1 The Three Case Studies</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2 The Techniques used in the interviews</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.3 Summary of the Case Studies</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 RQ2 What did the students find useful and what kind of services do</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>students want the careers advisers to provide?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1 Services and Careers Advisers</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2 Careers, information advice and guidance</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>post 16 education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.3 Identified help required by students</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.4 Sources of help at the beginning of the research</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7 Important people and Decisions Making</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8 Gender – working with Careers Adviser or Personal Adviser</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9 Outcomes of groups</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10 Presentation of words</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.11 Summary</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 7</strong> DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Introduction</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Summary of Findings</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Relating Findings to the Existing Literature</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4 Limitation of this Study</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5 Implications for Career Guidance Practice</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6 Further Research</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7 Conclusions</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>REFERENCES</strong></td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDICES

1. First Questionnaire 230
2. Second Questionnaire 236
3. Third Questionnaire 242
4. Final Questionnaire 244
5. Interview 1 – Where am I now - career goals 248
6. Interview 1 - Action plan 249
7. Interview 2 – Where am I now, develop Action Plan and Summer Activities 250
8. Interview 3 – Review of Summer Activities 251
9. Interview 3 – Action Plan & Research questions 252
10. Interview 4 – Research questions (Feb 2005) 253
11. Interview 4 – Structured interview questions (Jan/Feb 2005) 254
12. Interview 5 – Exit interview incorporating Structured questions 255
13. Extracts from Reflective Diary 2004 258
14. Extracts from Reflective Diary 2005 260
15. Permission statement 264
16. Words Table 265
17. Students Strengths 266
18. Students Weaknesses 267
19. Examples of models of guidance 268
20. Professional Guidance organisations 269
21. London Business School – Career Coach image 270
22. University Of Bradford – Employability Coach image 271
LIST OF TABLES

2.1 Thematic differences between Coaching and Mentoring 31

3.1 Percentage of 16 year olds by parents' socio-economic groups in full time education: 1989 – 1996 51

3.2 Industry information 56

3.3 Students' main advisers on post-16 options 57

4.1 Job roles, their differences and similarities 71

4.2 Comparison of the role of Careers Adviser with Coach or Mentor 75

4.3 Knowledge, Skills, Qualities and Qualifications of Careers Adviser, Coach and Mentor 77

4.4 Comparison of Mainstream Models with the Enhanced Model 80

4.5 Interview Schedule and Timing of the Enhanced Model Interviews 88

4.6 Career Guidance Interviews vs. the Enhanced Model: the stages of each process 88

4.7 Timetable of group work (part of the Enhanced Model) 89

5.1 List of activities with all students taking part in the research 103

5.2 Allocation of Groups for each Programme taking part in the Research 111

5.3 Timetable of Research Questionnaires with each Programme 112

5.4 Structured interview timetable with the Group B2 120

5.5 Age of students when completing the first questionnaire 125
5.6 Ages of students in the B2 group at the beginning of research

5.7 Gender figures on all courses taking part in research

5.8 B2 groups female to male membership at the beginning and end of research

5.9 Social class and numbers on each programme taking part in the research

5.10 Number of college students with the social class of main job earner

5.11 Highest qualification before start of programme at the college in 2003

5.12 Continuing students at the college

5.13 Preferred Context Learning by Group

5.14 Preferred Context Learning by programme

5.15 Main home where students live out of term time

5.16 Group working with Careers Adviser or Personal Adviser useful

5.17 Ages working with Careers Adviser or Personal Adviser useful

5.18 Gender – working with Career Adviser or Personal Adviser useful

6.1 Summary of Charts 1 to 6 for Group B2

6.2 Group B2 answers

6.3 Group Z answers

6.4 Ranking of choices scores from B2 and Z Groups (Tables 6.2 and 6.3)

6.5 Comparison between Groups B2 and Z
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>Kind of Help Required</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Sources of Help with Careers</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>People helping you make decisions</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>Gender working with Careers Adviser or Personal Adviser</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>Comparison B2 with other groups</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF DIAGRAM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Enhanced Model</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xiii
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Chart Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Career decidedness</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Self concept clarity</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Occupational information</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Passive decision making</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Career exploration</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Career decision making self efficacy</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xiv
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Overview

This research considers whether coaching and mentoring can be used in the context of careers guidance and, if so, whether the processes of either can help the career guidance become more useful to students in post sixteen education. The literature provides evidence that some students feel that there is little or no use for career guidance. In this research a selection of students received both the normal career guidance information and they went through the process of the Enhanced Model (see outcomes on page 3). Mentoring and coaching are increasingly seen as aids, and sometimes answers, to assist in the development of a wide variety of people and groups in society. The research set out to find out whether these techniques or approaches would have any efficacy in providing career guidance in a further education college. The process involved the amalgamation of coaching techniques with traditional careers guidance models to form a new, or Enhanced Model, of interventions for the students on one and two year courses.

The Enhanced Model involved additional group sessions, interviews and activities with the students to assist them in their career planning. To reinforce this work, progress was reviewed at various times in the academic year. The Enhanced Model of interviews and group sessions with students was designed to develop their motivation, confidence and self esteem, help them make decisions and develop ideas for their future through the regular contact and interest shown in their career planning. The evaluation centred on whether the Enhanced Model would provide a measurable improvement for the students in their career decidedness, self concept clarity, occupational information, decision making, career exploration and career decision making self efficacy. These measures were selected, following the literature review, as being appropriate measures to test and evaluate the research.
In the standard model of career guidance in the college where the research took place, students normally received an introductory talk by a Careers Adviser at the beginning of term. This service was only available to those from sixteen to nineteen years old, not for those over nineteen or those students on higher education programmes. There was a presentation on higher education applications in September each year (optional attendance), drop in sessions at lunchtimes once a week and pre-arranged interviews if required via Student Services or their tutor. The students could also self refer. These (short) interviews were based around straightforward information, questions and answers, e.g. where to look for courses on animal care or equine?

In contrast, the Enhanced Model was a planned programme of interactions with reflection time built into the process over a period of time with semi-set agendas from the researcher. There were a mix of interviews and group sessions over the period of working with the researcher, but principally the Enhanced Model was delivered through interviewing the student and making them the centre of the activity. The Enhanced Model was about giving more time with the adviser with set areas to consider and develop and with reflection built into the process. All this was designed to help the individual student with their confidence building, motivation and self esteem and in making decisions about their future career plans, by showing interest and giving them the information, advice and guidance required for making the decisions through the career coaching process. The researcher acted as a personal careers adviser, using coaching and mentoring processes and techniques for the development of the student through regular meetings and activities at key stages. This allowed the young people to achieve goals before the next interaction with the researcher, based on the previous goal setting and then for the student to feed back to the career coach/researcher. The Enhanced Model was about information giving and working through this with the student, ensuring they fully understood how to use the information. The advice element focused on the needs and requirements of the student and how they would be able to use the
information, coaching them through the process of using the information and advice to move in both their thinking and doing by setting small goals to be achieved over a set time limit, with regular reviews. The guidance focused upon the now and the future career development of the student as an individual.

This presentation of information, advice and guidance was an integral part of the Enhanced Model (including the techniques of coaching and mentoring), which were used with Group B2 through the process. The approach that the researcher used was the presentation of a positive attitude, clear focus and that the student was important, their development was important and their planning for their future was to help them succeed. There were clear goals to be achieved in set timings with the support of the researcher throughout the process. Coaching is about helping the individual achieve their goals within a set time limit. Helping the individual with their confidence, motivation and self esteem, seeing the benefits in them planning and working through their ideas with the researcher formed part of the Enhanced Model.

1.2 Introduction

The main aim of the research was to explore the training and development techniques of mentoring and coaching and their application in the area of career guidance and development with post 16 students in further and higher education.

This research aimed to work with students in further and higher education who were in the process of career decision making and planning whilst they were studying. Through the techniques of training and development a model of mentoring and coaching was developed that was used with the students alongside traditional career guidance techniques. It was intended that through this process the students would be able to make better decisions and be more
aware of themselves and of the opportunities available to them and would start to plan their futures in a better way.

The subsidiary aim was to investigate how students experience career development and the careers adviser's role within that process, remembering that the researcher was also the careers adviser in this situation.

The training and development techniques of mentoring and coaching were selected as they have previously been used extensively in business and more recently in education. In the years after the end of the primary research they have become a hot topic in the career guidance field. Although both techniques have their origins primarily in the business environment this has not stopped their transition to the field of education and therefore they were contenders for this research. The different models of mentoring and coaching were considered by the researcher in designing and planning the formats and interactions with a number of students on both further and higher education courses. The researcher created an Enhanced Model born out of the other models of mentoring and coaching which was deployed within certain groups and with individuals taking part in the research. The Enhanced Model was formulated to relate directly to the career guidance year, taking into account the critical decision points relevant to the students taking part in the research, such as applying to higher education or looking for work. The Enhanced Model was designed to be used with a variety of different ages, genders and educational attainment levels.

In this research the Enhanced Model was used alongside career guidance in the development of further and higher education students and their career planning. Specifically, the Enhanced Model, based upon mentoring and coaching models, was used with some students across selected courses at the college where the research took place. The specific questions this research
sought to answer were whether the new Enhanced Model helped students make progress in the following areas:

- Starting to plan their career
- Planning their actions and reviewing the process of career planning
- Knowing where to find information on jobs or higher education opportunities
- Developing Self esteem, Confidence building, Self motivation, Self image, Identifying skills; Decision making and Developing ideas

In the standard model of career guidance in the college where the research took place, students received an introductory talk by a Careers Adviser at the beginning of term. This service was only available to those from sixteen to nineteen years old, not for those over nineteen or those students on higher education programmes. There was a presentation on higher education applications in September each year (optional attendance), drop in sessions at lunchtimes once a week and pre-arranged interviews if required via Student Services or their tutor. The students could also self refer. These (short) interviews were based around straightforward information, questions and answers e.g. where to look for courses on animal care or equine?

In contrast, the Enhanced Model was a planned programme of interactions with reflection time built into the process over a period of time with semi-set agendas from the researcher. There were a mix of interviews and group sessions over the period of working with the researcher, but principally the Enhanced Model was delivered through interviewing the student and making them the centre of the activity. The Enhanced Model was about giving more time with the adviser with set areas to consider and develop and with reflection built into the process. All this was designed to help the individual student with their confidence building, motivation and self esteem and in making decisions about their future career plans, by showing interest and giving them the information, advice and guidance required for making the decisions through the
career coaching process. The researcher acted as a personal careers adviser, using coaching and mentoring processes and techniques for the development of the student through regular meetings and activities at key stages. This allowed the young people to achieve goals before the next interaction with the researcher, based on the previous goal setting and then for the student to feed back to the career coach/researcher. The Enhanced Model was about information giving and working through this with the student, ensuring they fully understood how to use the information. The advice element focused on the needs and requirements of the student and how they would be able to use the information, coaching them through the process of using the information and advice to move in both their thinking and doing by setting small goals to be achieved over a set time limit, with regular reviews. The guidance focused upon the now and the future career development of the student as an individual.

This presentation of information, advice and guidance was an integral part of the Enhanced Model (including the techniques of coaching and mentoring) which were used with Group B2 through the process. The approach that the researcher used was the presentation of a positive attitude, clear focus and that the student was important, their development was important and their planning for their future was to help them succeed. There were clear goals to be achieved in set timings with the support of the researcher throughout the process. Coaching is about helping the individual achieve their goals within a set time limit. Helping the individual with their confidence, motivation and self esteem, seeing the benefits in them planning and working through their ideas with the researcher formed part of the Enhanced Model.

1.3 The process by any other name
The process of development enables the individual to develop their personality, vocational and academic aspirations within the present and future economic climates and ever changing work and learning environments. If through the
process of development an individual could learn and develop strategies for stepping through the maze of information and professional interactions, they may be able to achieve more.

The processes of coaching, mentoring and career guidance are considered in more detail later. The literature review turned up several job related terms, for these roles including counsellor, problem solver, teacher, adviser, instructor or even the expert, the sounding board, facilitator and the awareness raiser. All of the above terms are about individuals in the various roles of supporting, guiding and helping people throughout various stages in their lives, situations and potential opportunities. All relate to coaching, mentoring and counselling; similarly careers advisers are also regarded as careers officers, careers consultants or personal advisers.

Hirsh, Jackson & Jackson (1995:11) point out that in organisational terms "a career is most simply thought of as the sequence of work experiences which individuals have over their working lives". They go on to suggest that careers can be 'managed' by large organisations, but this is not the norm for most people e.g. semi-skilled and unskilled workers, or those who are self-employed.

1.3.1 People and their development
People may need help with development, whether this is helping an individual with the management of their career, or advising on the individual's career within an organisation. It is a complex process and one which needs to be planned for; yet some individuals do not plan their development and then wonder why they have not achieved their goals. Organisations are made up of a variety of different individuals and therefore, through the development of individuals, an organisation can develop progress and hopefully move in the direction they wish to.
There has been much written on the subject of lifelong learning and taking control of one's development. Gone are the days of joining a company at 16
and staying with it until retirement. There are organisations that encourage and invest in their employees and some run training and development activities such as mentoring and coaching to develop staff. As Clutterbuck (2004:30) suggests “every company needs some form of career development programme to produce a succession of motivated, upward-moving employees”.

1.3.2 Career decision making
Making decisions can be an uncomfortable process for people at times. Individuals might be worried about the outcomes of their decisions and worried that they made the wrong decisions. Decision making is about making choices and by knowing more about oneself and the different options available one can make better decisions. There can be varying influences and these may affect the process that people go through when deciding upon the choices and making those decisions.

As Bachkirova (2004:29) suggests, a number of authors in the coaching field (Flaherty, 1999; Pelteir, 2001; Whitmore, 1996) are quite explicit about the role of self awareness and adequate self-evaluation in coaching and mentoring processes. She goes on to discuss the various coaching and mentoring tools for assisting individuals in the development of the most realistic self view, including “360-degree feedback, The Johari Window (Luft 1970) and the learning styles test set out by Honey and Mumford (1992)”. Bachkirova (2004:29) argues, that, “the area of individual’s self concept, confidence and self esteem are very often ignored in the coaching and mentoring literature.”

Choosing what to do can be intimidating but can also be highly interesting. There is lots of information available to help people in choosing a career and in their decision making. There are also a lot of influences upon decision making. In the NICEC (1996) briefing paper it was reported that young people’s career decisions are influenced by a range of people, including parents and other relatives, friends and peer-groups, careers specialists, subject teachers,
contacts with employers and other factors and issues, including direct experiences of employment and individual interests, values and finances. My research explored these influences on the individuals and groups being coached and mentored.

A major question to be answered is whether either mentoring or coaching could be used to help individuals in the area of career decision making, "Coaching is often seen as a relatively directive way of developing skills," (Clutterbuck Associates 2004:16). Coaching at its most basic could mean telling someone what to do and this is not the way of the Careers Adviser and does not square with their role in helping an individual through the maze of information to make a rational decision for themselves. In the research the coaching technique used will form part of the career guidance process is and, therefore, not directive.

1.3.3 Career planning and goal setting
Many people go through life without ever making a real career plan. Some are successful and others are not. By planning and managing a career people can be in a better position to change and develop their own careers throughout their lives. There are a number of different models of career planning, one in particular is called the DOTS model and was developed by Law and Watts (1977). This model covers self awareness, opportunity awareness, decision making and transition skills. There are other models that have built on and superseded this, including SODT, Law (1999) and also Egan (1990), developed a goal directed helping model, which covers Where am I? Where do I want to be? How do I get there? Appendix 19.

Following on from career planning the next stage of goal setting can begin. This can be very effective in helping the individual to develop and plan their career. This is done by breaking down their long term aspirations into shorter, realistic goals which can be managed effectively.
A good idea is to use the well known SMART model, developed by Drucker (1954), for example the SMART goals would have the following attributes:

- **Specific**: Goals need to be well-defined
- **Measurable**: Need to know when the goal has been achieved
- **Attainable**: Make sure the goals are realistic
- **Relevant**: Consider how relevant the goal is within the overall plan
- **Time-specific**: Try to keep a timescale

In the processes of career planning and goal setting it is not sufficient to look just at skills and attributes. It is essential that self analysis also takes account of the individual’s motivations and their attitudes and behaviours. When people are highly motivated by their careers and find them both satisfying and challenging, then there can be a high degree of overlap between the skills and qualities they value most and those required by their occupations. If the people know about themselves and what they want to achieve then they will be more likely to achieve this.

This knowledge can be developed through working for an organisation or through the process of mentoring or coaching. Roberts (2000:145) argues that “a more knowledgeable and experienced person actuates a supportive role of overseeing and encouraging reflection and learning a less experienced and knowledgeable person, so as to facilitate that person’s career and personal development”. So this is quite a different approach to coaching from the one described by Clutterbuck.
1.4 Brief account of my research

Where
The research took place in a further education college that also offered two higher education courses during the period 2003 to 2005.

Own role in college
During the period whilst the research was being carried out in the college, the researcher worked as the Careers Adviser (part-time) for the local Careers Service Company and in the period 2003 to 2004 transferred to work as a Personal Adviser for the Connexions Services. Working in the college and a school with Year 12 and 13 pupils I covered careers and other areas including attendance and educational issues plus bullying, sexual health, self harm and housing. Though I was still working in the college there were different emphases on the role of Personal Adviser as against the previous role of Careers Adviser. This was not my personal choosing but it came from the organisation and their changes to the system.

Who
A total of 129 students took part in the research, initially made up from four two-year National Diploma courses, a one-year Access to Higher Education course and two higher education courses, totalling six groups at the start of the research.

There were some changes over the two years as one of the higher education courses only completed the first questionnaire and were removed from the research and one of the two year National Diploma courses only completed the first and last of four questionnaires. To ensure there were sufficient numbers of students taking part in the research another National Diploma group of students was brought into the research in March 2004 and remained until the research ended in June 2005, on reflection this is not critical.
How

There were two formats one, for the Access to Higher Education and the Higher National Diploma programmes, which were split into two groups (B1 and B2) and another format for the National Diploma programmes, which were split into three groups with each group receiving a different level of activities. With Group A on each course these students received the contractually obliged guidance. Group B1 received the contractually obliged guidance plus one joint group session with the B2 group. The last group was coded as B2, this group received the new Enhanced Model which included group sessions and interviews throughout the process. What was not expected was the need for a further group, Group Z. These were students who were in either Group A or Group B1 and who self referred themselves to see the researcher. Ethically, in my role as adviser to the students, I could not refuse to help them. A record of these interviews was kept including the age, gender, what was discussed at the interview and the programme of attendance of each student.

The splitting up of students into groups was mostly done by the tutors themselves because they had already split the students up into smaller tutorial groups which they saw throughout the year, both in groups and individually. When the researcher presented her research format to the students there was no compulsion for the students to take part, they were given the opportunity to choose whether or not to do so. In the presentation to the students and staff the researcher explained that some students would receive more of an input than others, but assured all students and tutors/lecturers that under the partnership agreement between the college and the Careers Service company any students wishing to see an impartial careers/personal adviser could do so and would be seen by appointment or at the drop-in sessions. This changed when the Connexions service became fully operational in mid 2004. From then on the researcher's paid work role was strictly to work with 13 to 19 year old students; therefore those over 19 years old were seen by the researcher outside the Connexions umbrella, with the agreement of the tutors.
1.5 Outline of the content of the other chapters in order

Chapter 2 – Background of mentoring and coaching models and theories,
This chapter gives a full examination of mentoring and coaching, their nature and effectiveness, and draws conclusions about what elements might be most useful in careers advisory work and the development of the Enhanced Model.

Chapter 3 – Career guidance, the background and usage with the different groups from school, post sixteen and higher education settings. Emphasis is given to how mentoring and coaching have or have not contributed to career guidance.

Chapter 4 – The Enhanced Model and statement of research questions and hypotheses
Sets out the Enhanced Model developed to be used alongside career guidance in the development of further and higher education students and their decision making and career planning.

Chapter 5 Methodology
This Chapter covers the design and methods used in the research. The study design and procedure are described and justified along with the data collection tools used. Some of the practical issues encountered in conducting the research are also discussed.

Chapter 6 – Data Analysis
An analysis of the data collected over the two year period addresses the aims of the research and presents findings.

Chapter 7 – Conclusions, future research and the limitations of the study.
This research considered whether a model developed out of mentoring and coaching models helped students in their career planning and decision making.
development, considers the limitations of the study and what has been learnt from the process.
2. MENTORING AND COACHING

2.1 Introduction
In this chapter the reader is introduced to the background and influences of mentoring and coaching, the origins, definitions and models and how mentoring and coaching are used in business and education.

2.2 Backcloth and Influences on Mentoring and Coaching
From the literature review it is very clear that various types of mentoring and coaching are taking place across the world in a variety of organisations and locations and contexts including face to face, with individuals and in groups, via the telephone and by email. These organisations can be involved in business, commerce, industry and the voluntary sectors. Both mentoring and coaching have made the journey into educational institutions including schools, further education colleges and the higher educational institutions, as well as being used in the community. There have also been developments of other types of mentoring and coaching involved with life and parent coaching and lately there seems to be a movement into the area of career coaching.

There can be different agendas for the organisations and individuals involved in coaching, all going on alongside each other and the external influences of the world economy, national and local labour markets and government policies. There are other influences that have impacts on people, including their education, level of qualifications, social class, housing, family environment and culture.

There are also internal influences that need to be taken into consideration in the process of the delivery and success of mentoring and coaching, wherever the activity takes place. This can come in the form of a person's perception of their own abilities and their understanding of themselves, whether this is in a job or as a student in education. The competency of the mentor or coach, their
role in the process and their communication of mentoring or coaching have a great influence on the whole process in terms of success and failure. The mentor or coach needs to be quite clear in their reasons for mentoring or coaching and so does the individual who is going to be mentored or coached. If not, how will anyone know if anything has been achieved?

2.3 Mentoring and Coaching – origins and definitions
The term 'mentor' is explained in Field and Field (1994) with the retelling of the Greek myth about Mentor, Odysseus and Telemachus. Mentor, left in charge of Odysseus' household while Odysseus went off to the Trojan War was essentially a surrogate father to Telemachus and so had to personify the kingly quality of wisdom. He had to be a father figure, a teacher, a role model, an approachable counsellor, a trusted advisor, a challenger and an encourager to young Telemachus. Although there seem to be number of different roles that he was taking on he was essentially involved as a "mentor". An array of qualities was needed to complete the task including leadership and wisdom, as well as skills and knowledge.

Coaching is normally associated with physical education and sport and with achieving and winning. Since the 1960s coaching has been applied to the development of life skills and has crossed into many disciplines of life, business and executive life and into personal coaching.

2.3.1 Definition - Mentoring
There are several definitions of mentoring but, as seen above, the mentor is seen traditionally as an older, more experienced person who acts as a guide, advocate or role model for a younger, less experienced person (Donaldson et al., 2000). Roberts (2000:162) argues that mentoring is, "a formalised process whereby a more knowledgeable and experienced person actuates a supportive role of overseeing and encouraging reflection and learning with a less experienced and knowledgeable person, so as to facilitate that person's career.
and personal development". It seems that Donaldson (2000) and Roberts (2000) are arguing the same case for mentoring, that it is an experienced person guiding and supporting a younger or less experienced person to help them in their career in an organisation. This seems to be the same thinking as Megginson and Clutterbuck (1995:30), who argue that mentoring is, "off-line help by one person to another in making significant transitions in knowledge, work or thinking". Mentoring is frequently proposed as a desired means to enhance various personal outcomes, especially those related to career success (Corzin et al., 1994; Aryee et al., 1996; Chao, 1997; Wallace, 2001).

As Clutterbuck (2001:1) states "In spite of the variety of definitions of mentoring (and the variety of names it is given, from coaching or counselling, to sponsorship) all the experts and communicators appear to agree that it has its origins in the concepts of apprenticeship, when an older, more experienced individual passed down his/her knowledge of how the task was done and how to operate in the commercial world".

What can be concluded from the definitions discussed earlier is that mentoring activity can help the mentee to learn, develop skills, to improve their performance and their career. This is particularly interesting from the viewpoint of the research as the above definitions are derived from those working in organisations, not from a careers guidance viewpoint.

2.3.2 Definition - Coaching
The Oxford Dictionary defines the verb to coach as to 'tutor, train, give hints to, prime with facts'. Although this is a starting point it does not help too much in the definition of the word coach in terms of working with individuals.

Whitmore (1992) suggests that coaching is as much about the way these things are done as about what is done. Coaching is primarily concerned with the type
of relationship between the coach and the person being coached and the means and style of communication used.

As seen above, coaching is an aspect of education that we usually associate with physical education and sport. In recent years there has been an explosion of interest and information on coaching in books, articles, journals, newspapers and on television. Gallwey (2003:53) says, "the result of coaching is a high level of performance, the winning of a game or the achievement of a business or life goal, it is not the coach who can win, but the individual or team being coached. The fact is that a coach’s effectiveness is measured by the success of those he or she coaches." This is an interesting viewpoint because if the individual or team does not think the same way as the coach, does this mean that the effectiveness of coaching reduces?

Parsloe (1999:8) suggests coaching is, "a process that enables learning and development to occur and thus performance to improve. To be successful a coach requires knowledge and understanding of process as well as the variety of styles, skills and techniques that are appropriate to the context in which the coaching takes place". Parsloe seems to be suggesting that the coach needs competence in the understanding of the process and the skills to coach for performance to take place.

Mitchell (2006:50) argues that "Coaching can help people to think creatively about where opportunities are and to look for projects that will help them meet their career aspirations." Buffton (2006:50), on the other hand states that, "Career coaching is about opening up conversations, building trust and getting people to feel comfortable about sharing their thoughts and aspirations".

Coaching seems to mean different things for people and whether this is about aspirations or building trust, it is about people; as Whittacker (2004:12) states, "Coaching is now a significant part of learning and development specialists' roles and we believe it is here to stay".
2.4 Models of Mentoring and Coaching

There are a number of different models and theories of mentoring and coaching, they are each considered in relation to where and with whom they worked.

The GROW model relies heavily on the use of skilful questions and a clear structure which needs to be followed. The questions focus on the GOAL that the person/student/learner wants to achieve in the immediate coaching session. The next step is to focus on the total REALITY the person is operating in and this is followed by questions on the practical OPTIONS that the person might choose to achieve the goal that they have set themselves. The final stage is the focus on the WILL to actually take specific action to implement one or more of the options previously chosen. So the GROW technique is: establish the Goal, check the Reality, consider all Options and confirm the Will to act.

In the area of coaching Whitmore (1993:7) suggests, “Coaching is not merely a technique to be wheeled out and rigidly applied in certain prescribed circumstances. It is a way of managing, a way of treating people, a way of thinking, a way of being”. The GROW sequence is used to generate prompt action and peak performance. Parsloe suggests that GROW is a powerful technique when coaching a person who already has the basic knowledge, expertise and enthusiasm for the issue involved. He goes on to say that this generally applies in a sports context but is often not the case in work situations. With inexperienced learners or coaches the GROW technique is too time consuming and sophisticated for practical day to day work-based coaching. Where the coach has the time, patience and skills the GROW technique is excellent for the ‘hands off’ coaching style, with a proven record of success.

Whittaker (2000) suggests a four stage process that helps people to systematically and consciously move around the Kolb learning cycle. In the mentoring process the skilled mentor will help the mentee to ‘roll’ around the
four stages of the Kolb Learning Cycle and therefore maximise their learning potential. Each mentoring session can be structured to ensure that the learning roll is actively used and continuously reviewed. The Kolb Learning Cycle takes the learner through a four stage process covering action, reflection, and conclusion and planning. Therefore the learner is able to recognise and reinforce behaviours and actions that worked well, identify how and why behaviours and actions failed, identify and change behaviours and take actions to prevent similar failure in the future, learn from mistakes and successes. However, most people fail to go through all the stages and instead they practice the ‘action reflection bounce’ which is a process that works during the day where something happens that makes us stop and think about an action. At some later point we ponder and reflect on the events of the day, our behaviours and actions and their impact on others. This is reflection but then we forget about it. Maybe this could be changed or challenged by a ‘reflective diary’ being kept by individuals so that certain events could be recorded and in particular how that person dealt with the situation and then what happened. This could form part of their professional development through evidence based practice and could be revisited if required in the future. One of the skills that mentors in education must gain is that of being able to articulate areas of educational knowledge such as their philosophy of education and in particular the process of reflection.

Parsloe (1992, 1999) developed the Coaching Process Model which covered the following: Stage 1 analyses for awareness; Stage 2 plans for responsibility; Stage 3 implement, using styles and techniques and skills; Stage 4 evaluate success. A similar format is followed with the OSCAR model, but using different words for headings, starting with Outcome, what would we like to achieve in the long term; Situation, what is the current state of affairs – what’s actually happening; Choices, what options are available and the consequences of each choice; Actions, what to do next, how and when to do it; Review, what
steps to take to review your progress and when to get together to review your progress. (Higginbottom (2004:45)

The Hunt and Weintraub (2002) Developmental Coaching Model goes through the following stages, Stop the action, start a coaching dialogue, coaching mirror; provide feedback, work together to understand need to change, set a goal for change follow up.

There are several other models of coaching which are not included in this chapter, but are listed in Chapter 4. Essentially they are variations on a theme, which is in general based on the GROW model: different words similar format.

2.5 The Matching process of Mentor to Mentee and Coach to Coachee

Clutterbuck, (2001:1) Visiting Professor at Sheffield Hallam University and co-founder of the European Mentoring and Coaching Council argues, “A good mentoring relationship is one where mentor and protégé have mutual respect, recognise their need for personal development and have at least some idea of where they want to go.” Parsloe (1992:3) suggests “Mentoring is always one step removed and is concerned with the longer term acquisition of skills in a developing career by a form of advising and counselling”, and, “to help and support people to manage their own learning in order to maximise their potential, develop their skills, improve their performance and become the person they want to be”. What can be concluded from these definitions is that mentoring activity can help the mentee to learn, to develop skills, to improve their performance and their career in an organisation. This is particularly interesting from the viewpoint of the research, as the above definitions are from those working in organisations, not those from a careers guidance viewpoint.

The matching of mentor and mentee is critical to the success of any scheme. The initial pairing regulates the effectiveness of the scheme and is one of the most critical stages. If the pairing does not work for any reason then both parties could question the validity of the scheme. This is an important aspect
for my MPhil research as I had little or, in most cases, no control over the students who were in the groups I worked with. There was little control over the timings in the week when the Enhanced Programme took place. If students were sent to see me during lessons that they liked, they may have resented the process. There was no matching for compatibility. In most cases it was more about tutorial groups than matching, so is it valid to label my intervention mentoring? Partly for this reason, the word “mentor" was not used when the research was described to students.

2.6 Use of mentoring and coaching – where and for what?
As seen in the above sections there have been many developments in mentoring over the years. At times it has been closely linked to coaching. In the following sections we consider where mentoring and coaching are used and for what purposes.

2.6.1 Mentoring in Business
Kram (1985) suggests that mentoring functions are those aspects of a developmental relationship that enhance both an individual's growth and advancement. Johnson, Geroy and Griego (1999) state that the mentoring relationship should be viewed as an individual tool used throughout one's lifespan. The mentoring model incorporates human development and the dimensions of mentoring that are viewed as ongoing and multidimensional. As Kram (1985) suggests, the career function of mentoring (or coaching) enhances the junior person's knowledge and understanding of how to navigate effectively in the corporate world. The term career function arises from a mentor's senior position, experience and/or organisational influence. Mentors' career functions include providing career planning, sponsorship, exposure and visibility in the workplace, protection, vision and challenge.

Business mentoring calls for a perspective that looks for future possibilities. This requires a level of trust missing from the judgemental line management
relationship where discipline has to be maintained and performance assessed (Megginson, 2000). A line manager could coach but may not have the attributes and relationship necessary to be a good mentor. Mentoring can include other forms of training and development techniques including facilitating, counselling and networking. Clutterbuck (1998) shows that developmental mentors have a complex role because they need to be reasonably competent in different roles: coach, counsellor, guardian, net worker and facilitator. With these titles in mind a coach could be someone who is directive in their approach towards individuals. This person would work with the individual to set out goals and to coach could challenge the individual's behaviour. Some may consider their role is to act as a critical friend, helping an individual who may be having difficulties. Clutterbuck (1998) goes on to say that effective mentors know when to move from one role into another.

Philip (2000) suggests that there are natural mentoring relationships for friends and the more experienced adult would provide support, advice and challenge to a younger person. He concludes that natural mentoring can take place within a wide range of relationships, which might be a reason why mentoring has taken off both in business and education and why there is often confusion about the exact meaning of the term.

2.6.2 Business mentoring in education

The term “business mentoring” refers to people from business acting as mentors to students and young people in education or outside. During the college years mentoring relationships become increasingly relevant to the personal, academic and professional development of students (Frierson et al., 1994; Gloria et al., 1999). College students can accrue numerous psychosocial and career related benefits from mentoring (Packard et al 2004). Mentoring is frequently proposed as a desired means to enhance various personal
outcomes, especially those related to career success (Corzin et al, 1994; Aryee et al., 1996; Chao, 1997; Wallace, 2001). A study in the UK in 1995 researched UK employers' views of education/business link activities and found that 13.5 per cent of a sample of 1,389 employers engaged with education were involved in mentoring programmes (Hillage, Hyndley and Pike, 1995). The research showed that larger businesses were more likely to be involved in mentoring than smaller companies, but the differences were far less marked than for other forms of links such as careers events, schools visits or teacher placements. There has been a steady increase in the use of mentoring programmes. In 1991 there were four, by 1992 there were ten and in 1998-1999 there were 700 schools involved in business mentoring schemes (DfEE 1999). The aims and objectives of student mentoring cover the following areas of development: self-esteem, personal and social skills and increased motivation in school. Business mentoring in schools seems to have similar aims and objectives as mentoring in organisations, but with an enlightened self-interest angle i.e. giving to the school, so that people will buy their products and services. Considering the benefits to companies of being involved in mentoring programmes, Miller (1998) suggests that the main benefits are staff development opportunities, fulfilling social and community responsibilities, raising educational standards in potential recruits; improving young people's knowledge and understanding of industry and commerce; influencing attitudes to these and enhancing the reputation of the company and its products. If this is the case one could question why it is that not all local companies take part in mentoring activities in educational institutions. This could be down to the cost of the time of individuals, especially in small to medium organisations, than in large to multinational organisations where resources might be more readily available.

In education there are different names for those who mentor, for example the role of the "learning mentors" in England (DfEE, 1996) is to help pupils
transferring from primary to secondary school, especially where the education system requires young people to transfer school at the end of Year 9. There are different types of mentoring used in education, where sixth formers mentor younger pupils to help settle into school. There has also been a development of university students mentoring school children in subject areas, for example science subject areas like chemistry. In 2007 Y10 and Y11 pupils at a school in Sleaford, Lincolnshire and students at Loughborough University, Department of Chemistry were brought together through an emailing mentoring service.

Mentoring in education is used across the world. There is evidence that North American mentoring programmes have had some influence on student mentoring in other countries including, as Miller (1998) suggests, here in the UK. They have also influenced the current range of mentoring programmes evolved from the businesses mentoring schemes which developed in the early 1990s. The development of local education business partnerships which linked schools and business, were, Jamieson (1985) argues, the main focus of these early programmes which centred on developing employability skills, as well as increasing motivation and achievement.

Over the years there has been a mass of mentoring programmes, often supported by local and government initiatives and funding. As seen in the employability agenda in higher education there is a need to develop 'graduate employability' and mentoring is one area where undergraduates have become involved in mentoring younger people who are at risk of leaving education; this is also intended to help to reverse social exclusion. There is little evidence to prove that undergraduates can help. As Rhodes (2001) writes, undergraduates have only four days of training, which falls very short in comparison to the current training received by professionals working with young people who are socially excluded. There is no evidence to suggest that undergraduate mentoring programmes help the mentor students to find employment after their degree course, though this may change in the future.
The literature shows that cultural differences influence our perception of mentoring. The USA is more focused on career progression and sponsorship; European studies focus more on personal development and learning. As we have seen from the literature, mentoring is a process of development for people in many organisations. The UK government has put mentoring at the heart of development in school and has seen it as a key to motivation and attainment in schools in the further and to some extent, the higher education sectors. Mentoring is widely recognised as a tool to be used in the development of individuals at every career stage. Segerman-Perk (1991:135) suggests there are personal benefits to becoming a mentor, “People gain insights into their own career future by talking to their mentees and helping them to map out the options for their future”. She goes on to say that, “As you help them to consider their present and past satisfactions and future needs and desires, you reflect on your own situation”.

Mentoring can easily be used in business and education and the literature so far has provided examples of where mentoring can help people in different transitions, for example school to work, within work and in climbing the ladder in an organisation. The mentor seems to be able to wear a number of hats at times. However, it does seem that the mentor is directing the process. Are the directions for the individual’s progress or for the benefit of organisation they work in? In the case for mentoring in schools and colleges, a mentor’s role can be linked to a person developing, but this in turn will inevitably be linked to retention levels and funding for the schools and colleges of further education.

2.6.3 Coaching in Business
As Clutterbuck (2004) presented to the Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development (CIPD) Conference, “Coaching is a way of managing, a way of engaging people, a way of thinking, a way of being”. Parsloe (1999) states that coaching is a process requiring each stage to be properly completed if the whole process is to work successfully.
Clutterbuck (2004:16) states "Coaching is primarily about performance and the development of specific skills". Clutterbuck suggest that, "coaching is a relatively directive means of helping someone develop competence. It is relatively directive because the coach is in charge of the process". He goes on to suggest that, "Counselling in the context of support and learning, as opposed to therapy, is a relatively non-directive means of helping someone cope". This sets up a neat division between coaching and counselling in the personal development field. Interestingly Clutterbuck Associates suggest that coaching is a directive means of helping people develop competence. Careers education might be considered traditionally as being quite non-directive, so using a directive technique like coaching would be quite a big change for a teacher or careers adviser and their students or clients.

This next section examines some of the literature covering, life coaching for which there is a great deal of information available, especially on the internet. For instance The Coaching Academy (2003:1) advises that, "Life Coaching begins with an awareness that every human is born with the ability to be, do or have whatever they want in life". This is an interesting viewpoint, but does not take into account natural aptitudes and difficulties, family aspects, where a person lives and the internal and external pressures that may or may not affect a young person's life. The Coaching Academy (2003) goes on to suggest that by the time we become adults, many of us have lost the ability to do whatever we want in life, but eventually we experience the feeling that our lives are drifting off course. This might be true for some people, but what evidence do companies like the Coaching Academy have to support the statement or their solutions to life's problems? There does not seem to be any academic literature to support this kind of statement and therefore the Coaching Academy could be using marketing hype to sell a product to individuals.
2.6.4 Coaching in Education
If we consider the role of coaching in education, Schon (1987:21) suggests that "Coaching through reflection on action is central to how students can and should be supported in learning by a body of professional knowledge". Therefore the role of the mentor is to act as a coach, helping in this case the student teacher to reflect on their practical teaching experience. There seems to be some interlinking of words here. Schon is suggesting that the role of the mentor is to act as a coach. If that is the case in education then maybe there are similar confusions elsewhere. Whitmore (1993) argues the coach is not a problem solver, a teacher, an adviser, an instructor or even an expert, but they are a sounding board, a facilitator, a counsellor, an awareness raiser.

2.7 Mentoring and Coaching - People and their development
The National Institute for Careers Education and Counselling (NICEC) Institute Career Guidance (ICG) briefing about disengaged young people suggested that mentors are "people who through their action and work, help others to achieve their potential," Shea (1992). This seems to be saying that the individual, for example a careers guidance person, teacher or youth worker, uses their skills and abilities to enhance the quality and effectiveness of young people by using mentoring.

Forret et al (1996) support the argument that mentoring provides access to careers advice. More than this, mentees in some cases said that the relationship had helped them to realise the importance of managing their own career in a proactive way. This could be considered a deeper insight than simply gaining advice about a potential career path. In the context of my research the process relationship between the mentor and mentee is one way in which individuals can manage their own progress and move towards managing their own career.
Greener (2005:7) suggests, "Mentoring traditionally involved a wise and experienced one who had reached a position of power and respect, which could offer that knowledge and experience to a younger aspirant. The relationship is based on the creditability of the mentor, but this definition has changed over the years. Now, those seeking professional development in the fast lane are more likely to look for a clutch of mentors to suit different development needs; perhaps someone at Board level for their political experience and a function head for the gaps in their knowledge”. This is an interesting point in terms of my research as it identifies that the relationship is about the credibility of the mentor, their knowledge, skills and expertise and what they can do for the individual, there could be more than one mentor that a person is using at one time. This could be different people for different times and situations, but Greener seems to be highlighting the need for credibility, the expertise of the individual, qualified in their profession and/or seen to be the best person to ask.

As seen above there are different forms of coaching in the business development of individuals and this encroaches into the area of individual development, whether in career coaching or into the other areas of life itself. Brown and Wilkes (2004:49) suggest that, "Coaching raises self-belief, awareness and responsibilities. Asking questions and being nice to people is not what it's about, but it may help". They go on to suggest that people are the business and that it is important to develop the people or an organisation will not survive, “Changes that previously took 10 to 20 years to happen are now tearing through previously established sectors in 12 to 18 months”. Morgan (2001) suggests that coaching is essentially a two person process of communication, problem solving and action planning, which is interestingly very similar to the process or models used within the areas of careers guidance or career counselling. Considering our careers is an important aspect of career development as we spend around one third of our lives at work. For some people their careers are an exciting part of their identity, but for others their work is purely a means to an end and they count the hours to the end of a
week, month or year. Yeung (2002:21) says that we seldom pay enough attention to thinking about our career, anyone buying a house calls in all the experts: lawyers, surveyors and estate agents. A career is only part of your life. "It's really a case of trying to encourage people to look at what they want to achieve in life".

Greco (2001) argues that organisations should realise that talent and human capital are what really distinguishes them in the marketplace. They are faced with a tight labour market that has them battling to retain and internally develop every employee they can. In the early 1990s when coaching first emerged it was because companies were identifying where people were not performing well. Today the need for coaching is primarily a positive tool in succession and leadership development; it is about proactive preparation for the future. The word "coaching" is now widely used to describe this investment in people and their performance. Optimal coaching is designed to provide people with the skills, resources and support they need to do their best work. The goal of coaching is to help people successfully achieve their performance goals and their professional/careers goals. Effective coaching moves seamlessly from assessment and goal setting (for both performance and career development) to action planning and implementation, then finally review and improvement. The coaching is essentially a two person process of communication, problem solving and action planning.

2.8 Summary
This chapter has introduced mentoring and coaching, their origins and uses; it seems that they are two techniques which overlap. They are increasingly being used in business and education in a variety of ways, some of which have been described in this chapter, with new and exciting possibilities for the future. The literature suggests that the benefits mentoring and coaching techniques seem to be projecting are about helping individuals take control of the situation, career development and management of progression, whether life, job or otherwise.
Tomlinson (1995:52) refers to the process of mentoring as a “gradual but flexible 'scaffolding': that is, support which can be provided but generally removed as the learner becomes independently capable”. Although Tomlinson is referring to the training of teachers, the terms he uses, such as ‘gradual but flexible’ are right. The needs of each person will be different and the process must be flexible enough to take this into account.

Avis (2000) argues mentoring is more about providing support and advice, whereas counselling is a hand-off approach best suited to personal issues. Counselling involves helping individuals work through their problems themselves to come to their conclusions. Sometimes when you are working with someone you can find yourself using mentoring, coaching and counselling techniques and styles of working. “As long as you are clear about the distinctions and you are both comfortable about crossing these boundaries, this can actually be very effective” (Avis, 2000:15)

Both mentoring and coaching can be applied to career planning and development as they share some tools and approaches. Coaching primarily focuses on performance within the current job and emphasises the development of skills. Mentoring is primarily focused on longer-term goals and on developing capability. In Table 2.1 it shows the differences between how the terms coaching and mentoring tend to be used in the literature.

Table 2.1 – Thematic differences between Coaching and Mentoring

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coaching</th>
<th>Mentoring</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concerned with task</td>
<td>Concerned with implications beyond the task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focuses on skills and performance</td>
<td>Focuses on capability and potential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primarily a line manager role</td>
<td>Works best off-line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agenda set by or with the coach</td>
<td>Agenda set by the learner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasises feedback to the learner</td>
<td>Emphasises feedback and reflection by the learner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typically addresses a short-term need</td>
<td>Typically a longer-term relationship, often for life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback and discussion primarily explicit</td>
<td>Feedback and discussion primarily about implicit intuitive issues and behaviours</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reproduced from Clutterbuck (2001:26)
This chapter has considered both the terms mentoring and coaching, their usage in business, education and career planning. The Literature Review has introduced several other terms including counsellor, problem solver, teacher, adviser, instructor, expert, sounding board, facilitator, awareness raiser. All of these terms refer to individuals in the various roles of supporting, guiding and helping people throughout various stages in their lives, situations and potential opportunities. As we have seen mentoring and coaching are processes, coaching is an enabling and a helping process and mentoring is a supportive process (Parsloe, 1995:37).

Coaching may be used with students in the educational environment, to change attitudes and possibly behaviour in the development of career management skills and to “develop their students’ existing knowledge and skills more effectively”. (Bentley 1995:36). Coaching is helping an individual see their full potential within the task in hand. Whether they choose to do anything about it to progress, move forward and change whatever it might be is up to them. Greener (2005:7) suggests the terms “buddying” and “mentoring” are used interchangeably, although a buddy does not have that distant perspective in relation to the individual’s career. The buddy relationship works best when status is fairly equal, the buddy having the information that can help a newcomer quickly find their way around policies, practice and people. In years gone by this might have been called ‘sitting next to Nellie’, (a training and development term). By its nature, the work of a buddy is a short-term relationship unless it develops into the original meaning of the term i.e. a friend. Greener (2005) argues that a career coach should have the tacit knowledge and short-term relationship of a buddy, the creditability of a mentor and the subject expertise of a performance coach on the specific subject of career. A mentor is for depth of work related experience. A buddy is for guiding us around the company culture. A career coach is for an objective look at professional direction. A life coach or a counsellor is for a more holistic source of support across the life-work divide.
The fact remains that mentoring and coaching are two of the fastest growing areas of personal and corporate learning and development. There is little academic literature found in the area of career coaching and therefore a possible gap in academic terms. There is however a vast amount of academic literature in the area of career guidance, which leads into the next chapter.

Mentoring and coaching are overlapping techniques that are used increasingly in business and education in a variety of ways as seen in this chapter, they are often argued and sometime shown to have benefits. Both techniques can be applied to career planning and development in organisations through encouraging a process of reflection and, as shown in this chapter they can also help to support students at stressful times such as transitions, examinations and in the process of decision making.
3. CAREER GUIDANCE, WHERE, WHEN WITH WHOM

3.1 Introduction
This chapter will consider career guidance, its history and development over the years and the relationship with careers education in schools and further and higher education. It will cover the theories and models, the influences on individuals and their choices and the benefits of career guidance to the economy.

3.1.1 Definitions of career guidance
A number of professional organisations and bodies are involved in the professional development and direction of careers guidance both in the UK and across the world. The following definition has been accepted by the Institute of Career Guidance (ICG) after it was used in international reviews conducted by the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), the European Commission and the World Bank:

"Career guidance refers to services and activities intended to assist individuals of any age and at any point throughout their lives, to make educational, training and occupational choices and to manage their careers. Such services may be found in schools, universities and colleges, in training institutions, in public employment services, in the workplace, in the voluntary or community sector and in the private sector. The activities may take place on an individual or group basis and may be face-face or at a distance (including help lines and web based services). They include career information provision (in print, ICT-based and other forms), assessment and self-assessment tools, counselling interviews, career education programmes (to help individuals develop their self awareness, opportunity awareness and career management skills), taster programmes (to sample options before choosing them), work search programme and transition services." (2003). The Qualifications and Curriculum Authority (QAA), (2001) suggests that career guidance is a "process - whether
delivered individually, in groups, or via hard copy or electronic media - which aims to help individuals to a clearer understanding of their career development needs and potential, to an appreciation of the processes of career planning and decision-making and to clarify and attain their career objectives”. There are dedicated career services, Careers Education, Information, Advice, Guidance (CEIAG) provision and dedicated CEIAG staff. Specialist services, processes and staff are provided by higher education institutions expressly for the purpose of career education, information and guidance.

There are other organisations involved in career guidance, see Appendix 20 for a list of other professional bodies involved in career guidance.

These definitions taken from professional organisations seem to have common threads and the conclusions that are drawn from them are that career guidance is for everyone, offered by professional persons, within education or employment, (whether paid or unpaid work). These professionals help individuals by offering services and activities intended to assist individuals, of any age and at any point throughout their lives, to make educational, training and occupational choices and to manage their careers.

3.2 History of Career Guidance

UK Career guidance in its earliest and most basic form was grafted onto two roots laid down in 1902 when the local education authorities and Labour Bureaux were first created. It grew stronger in 1910 as the Labour Exchange Act and Education (Choice of Employment) Act established the Juvenile Employment Service as an important part of the liberal reforms of that time. The economic climate and changes in structures of work had brought an increase in jobs that required numeracy and literacy and other basic educational skills.

Before the 1914 - 18 War it was apparent that an independent profession was required and in 1918 the Conference of Juvenile Employment Officers took
place. While concerned principally with the problems of young people finding jobs, the Conference decided that Career Guidance was distinctly educational in its nature. The Conference evolved into an association and made an attempt to set up a Diploma in Vocational Guidance in 1935. In the mid 1940s the need for proper training for careers officers was recognised; up to 1948 careers officers were known as youth employment officers.

There were a number of educational changes during the course of the 20th Century, for example the Hadow Report (1927) and the 1944 Education Act. The Youth Employment Service took over in 1948. Edward Boyle in his introduction to the Newsom Report, said that "... all children should have an equal opportunity of acquiring intelligence, and of developing their talents and abilities to the full," (Ministry of Education, 1963).

The Careers Service emerged in 1974 from the Employment and Training Act, which embodied the belief that choice of careers was essentially a developmental process in education best administered locally by education authorities, working in schools, colleges and amongst young workers. So careers education and guidance was funded and managed through the Local Education Authorities (LEA), but this changed in the late 1980s and 1990s and the Careers Service was restructured with local consortia, rather than LEAs, providing advice and guidance to young people. The term careers education covers a wide area and over the years it has developed and is still developing. In recent years it has started to developed in schools in Years 11 to 16/18, with most of the work being done with young people in Year 10, 11 and 12; since the early 1990s the Education Business Partnerships (funded by the Learning Skills Councils) have promoted education business activities with this age group and worked extensively with primary schools across England and Wales. Careers education and guidance was defined as one of five cross-curricular themes in the 1988 Education Act and subsequent Education Act 2000.
The 1997 Labour Government had a strong concern for learning and skills as part of a social and economic agenda for career guidance but in the event, strands of policy emerged giving priority to reducing social exclusion. The Connexions Services arrived in England in 2001, but it was still with left obligations to provide career guidance, education and information intact throughout the UK. From this time the Careers Services were run by private organisations in the areas of careers information, advice and guidance with students, primarily from Year 9 to 6th formers. Connexions' wider agenda covered all aspects of concern to young people in the above age groups including housing, personal concerns, sexual health, drink, drugs and so on. This was different to the narrow careers guidance concerns of young people making the transitions from compulsory to post 16 education, training or employment that were in the remit of the former Careers Service.

3.2.1 Pre and post 16 provision of education and career guidance
The 1902 Education Act helped to give access to Grammar schools to a fortunate few young people via free place scholarships; then state schools began and developed into an agent of social mobility through the process of identifying and promoting talent.

Nowadays at 16, young people have to choose between entering work and staying on in education. Most young people now take GCSE examinations at 16, which in turn helps them to choose whether to stay in education or go into training or work. If they choose education there are three types of post-16 educational provision: school sixth forms, sixth form colleges and further education colleges. There are also the options of work-based training/learning or of going straight into work at 16, with or without training. Over the years there has been considerable expansion of vocational education and training with the growth of General National Vocational Qualifications (GNVQs) and National Vocational Qualifications (NVQs) and Modern Apprenticeships which were also introduced in the 1990s for those young people who wished to combine work
experience and training with continuing education. Additionally there was the impact of the work-related curriculum which was introduced in the late 1980s to help young people to be more vocationally aware of working life and being an adult. This was an initiative which reflected the changes in the economy and also addressed some of the concerns of employers about the poor skills of young people on leaving school. Brooks (1998) suggests that the Technical and Vocational Education Initiative (TVEI) and the Compact Initiative, with their periods of work experience and the involvement of business and industrial leaders in school mentoring schemes, helped young people. There have also been nationally instigated changes to the provision of careers education and guidance in schools.

The recession at the end of the 1980s meant there were fewer jobs to attract school leavers and the withdrawal of social security benefits from most under-eighteen year olds meant that those who could not find a job had to choose between full time education and Youth Training programmes. This coincided with the introduction of the GCSE examinations, new forms of assessment in 1988 and the improvement in average grades over the following years. Gray et al., (1993) suggest that the GCSE engendered more positive attitudes towards school among young people, which consequently encouraged them to continue their education beyond the age of 16.

At this time there was also a demographic fall in the numbers in the age group and Payne, Cheng and Witherspoon (1996) suggest that the changes in the way schools and colleges were funded promoted competition between institutions to recruit students. Colleges and sixth form schools introduced new, vocational courses which proved popular with students who did not want to do 'A' levels. Many young people were undecided on their next move so they stayed in education, as long as possible. As suggested by Payne, Cheng and Witherspoon (1996) young people stay in education "because that was what most of their friends did". This seems to be a circular argument and the young
people are responding to outside pressures and their friends. As mentioned by Payne et al and reinforced by Gray, Jesson and Tranmer (1993), parental occupations had a powerful effect on the likelihood of staying on at all levels of GCSE results. This is reflected in the statistics that show that by 1993, 85% of the children of non-manual workers stayed on compared to 65% of the children of manual workers. That parents encouraged their children to stay on at school, as they did not always have the opportunity when they were young.

Over the years there has been a steady increase in vocational courses compared with A Levels and other alternatives. According to Payne, Cheng and Witherspoon (1996:109), “Young people who stayed on in full time education after 16 were more likely to take vocational rather than academic courses if they had poorer GCSE results, that female students were more likely to take vocational courses than male students, while Asian students were less likely to do so than white students. Young people whose parents were in skilled or low skilled occupations were also more likely to be found on vocational courses than the children of professional and intermediate workers”. They suggest, that “Young people were less likely to stay on in full-time education if they lived in a Local Education Authority with a high proportion of post 16 students in Further Education colleges rather than in schools or sixth form colleges. The choice between academic and vocational courses is influenced by intelligence, family background, ethnicity and gender and these are the same factors in the choice between vocational courses and leaving full time education”.

3.2.2 Further Education

The Education Act (1997) placed legal duties on colleges to work with the careers services. This Act required further education colleges to give the careers services access to the college and its students and to work with them in ensuring that students receive relevant information. The DfEE publication, “The Requirements and Guidance for Careers Services 1998,” set out requirements
for careers services providers to establish a partnership agreement with each college.

Careers education and guidance, advice and information were a central aspect of the White Paper, (1999) "Learning to Succeed", which emphasised the need to engage the disengaged and socially excluded and saw careers education and guidance as key aspects in lifelong learning. "Connexions: The best start in life for every young person 2000," set out the Connexions strategy and service. Through an inter-agency approach, the intention was to provide every young person with access to a personal adviser to help with learning and employment choices in addition to problems with friends and family.

Careers advisers became personal advisers and although the Connexions services were providing both careers and other kinds of advice, there were also services being provided by others such as social, probation and youth services, as well as the local housing agencies. Connexions Personal Advisers were employed to work with 13 -19 year olds to provide information, advice and guidance to those at school, college, in training and the unemployed.

3.3.3 Higher Education provision
Back in 1963 Lord Robbins reported on Higher Education, "We deceive ourselves if we claim that more than a small fraction of students in institutions of higher education would be where they are if there were no significance for their future careers in what they hear and read." In 1997 Lord Dearing too in his National Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education identified the need for greater links with employers, more work experience and closer links between academic departments and careers services. A number of universities in the UK offer first degrees with an integral work placement year, like Loughborough University's, Business School. There are a great number of graduates entering the employment market each year, which means that there is a greater choice for employers now; what was in the past a relatively rare and possibly valuable
resource is now no longer the case. Therefore students have to work hard to set themselves apart from the crowd.

3.3 Career education and guidance today

Careers guidance and education are two areas which go hand in hand or as a planned programme of activities to help students to know themselves better, be aware of education, training and career opportunities; make choices about their own continuing education, training and about career paths and managing transitions to new roles and situations.

Careers education is a process which gives students the tools to make informed choices about their futures, to implement their decisions and create longer term plans for progression throughout their lives. It does not mean just choosing a job. The basic components of careers education are self awareness, opportunity awareness, decision making and preparation for the next transition. The School Curriculum and Assessment Authority (1995) sets out the components of Careers Education and Guidance (CEG), “Careers education provides a means of developing individuals' knowledge, understanding and experience of opportunities in education, training and employment and the skills necessary to make informed decisions, whereas, careers guidance provides a means of helping individuals to apply relevant knowledge, understanding and skills to their own particular circumstances when choices have to be made.”

Careers education and guidance is an integral part of the preparation of pupils for the opportunities, responsibilities and experience of adult life. As The College of Guidance Studies (1998:3) suggests, “Its central concern is preparing pupils for the choices, changes and transitions affecting their future education, training and life as adult members of society. This process of personal and social development begins in the home and continues through adult life”.

41
These aims were to form part of a school’s policy in promoting personal and social development and to go some way in challenging the stereotypical attitudes towards education under the five strands in pupils’ development: Self, Roles, Work, Career and Transition. This complements the careers reforming work from the National Association of Careers and Guidance Teachers (NACGT) supported enquiry by Edwards, Macdonald and Law, (2001), who suggest that, “Careers Education and Guidance (CEG) is about who gets to do what in our society. CEG has wide ranging importance to individuals and their families as well as the economy”. This report discussed the development of Careers Education and Guidance work linking it to a wider range of curriculum activity and suggested further options for improvement to take account of global developments in the economy, the impact on the local neighbourhood, linking to the working world, where students and their families seek work and changes in their lives. The NAGCT report considered how working lives were changing and raised questions about what kind of careers work was needed and considered the kind of staff development that would best support that work. The report also discussed the causes of change and the ‘big picture’, taking into account politics, economics, changing technology and considering the people within communities, their families and individuals, all dealing with the change.

Careers education and guidance (CEG) is part of the 14 – 19 curriculum and there is a statutory requirement for a programme of careers education in years 9, 10, and 11. Since 2004 this was extended to include years 7 and 8. Each basic objective of careers education has its own distinctive contribution to make in supporting young people in times of change and transition, but they work most effectively when they form part of a coherent programme of support. Careers education and guidance (CEG) programmes can make a major contribution to preparing young people for the opportunities, responsibilities and experiences of life. They help young people develop the knowledge,
understanding and skills to make decisions and manage transitions as learners and workers.

Primarily Careers Education and Guidance has been the role of Careers Coordinators in Schools and Colleges and Careers Officers/Advisors, who initially worked for the Employment Services, Local Education Authority, private Careers Services and more recently the Connexions services; however, there has now been an emphasis on the schools and colleges taking on a greater role in Careers Education and some have appointed their own Careers Advisors to run programmes across schools or further education colleges.

3.3.1 Making choices
Careers education and guidance, as seen above, is becoming part of the curriculum, starting with children at the beginning of the secondary school. CEG and the work-related learning programmes are supposed to help young people to develop skills in career management, to encourage young people to become self-reliant and be able to make informed decisions about career and life choices.

The careers choices that young people make of whether to stay on at school or go to college, into training or employment at 16 can be affected by a number of people, including parents, friends and professionals. This research considers a different delivery of careers education and guidance by an innovative method to help students plan and make decisions about their next steps towards a career. Helping students to understand the influences may also have an effect on the students’ approaches to a possibly new way of thinking, involving planning for action and their subsequent understanding and reflection on the process, knowing about the people and the possible influences on them and their identity.
Students may come across various different ways in which careers information, advice and guidance is presented to them. The most frequently used are the individual careers interview; written information including brochures, leaflets or prospectuses; encouraging students to attend open days; careers lessons, presentations by staff from colleges, other schools and universities; talks from outside speakers about their jobs; group discussions about different jobs and what work could be like; formal introductions to the careers library and electronic information via the web/internet.

The basic objective of careers education and guidance is to give opportunities for individuals to acquire the skills, knowledge and understanding necessary to enable them to manage their career. As people go throughout life there may be stages when they work for different organisations, self employed, go through periods of training and re-training, formal education, unemployment, at home, voluntary and so on. Careers education and guidance are interlinked and interdependent activities.

Careers education is like a curriculum subject. It has its own learning aims, objectives and learning outcomes and is usually taught in groups in school, normally in Personal Health and Social Education (PHSE) or careers lessons, it is also taught in subject teaching such as English. There is a variety of teaching and learning styles used such as paired discussion, use of Information Technology, self assessment quizzes, work visits and research projects. Careers education is normally taught by teachers but there are contributions from other adults including careers advisers and local employers. Schools normally organise special events such as industry days, careers conventions and careers talks in assemblies, normally for Year 9, 10 and 11 pupils, age range from 14 to 16.

Careers guidance is about enabling the young people to make informed decisions; this is normally in one to one meetings or small group activity. The process is focused on specific questions, issues and decisions and normally centres around key transitions points for example Year 11 decisions or for
those leaving at the end of Year 12. These activities are normally provided by trained and qualified careers advisers, young people seek informal guidance from many other sources: teachers, parents, peers or others. Although careers guidance can sometimes be provided by teachers or tutors if fairly straightforward issues are to be discussed, students should be referred on to the qualified careers adviser as careers guidance is much more than just providing information. The key principle of careers guidance is that it should be free from bias, either institutional or personal, to enable the individual to make his or her own decisions.

So careers education and guidance have their own distinctive contributions to make in supporting young people in times of change and transition, but they work most effectively when they form part of a coherent programme of support. Careers education and guidance is about the next steps for the individual, considering the options available and whether the student has the knowledge, understanding and skills to take advantage of the opportunities. An easily understood 'joined up' approach is needed where young people are motivated to use what they know so that they can be effective in planning and managing their progression through learning and into work with the relevant level of guidance support.

In reality, fine words and government policy need to be aware of the real world of time constraints and motivation of schools/colleges, lack of provision of trained teachers/tutors and the diverse student population make the formulation of a careers education scheme of work difficult at the best. Careers education and guidance should be about quality. People receive informal guidance of some kind from relatives and friends, but the emphasis should be on good quality professional careers education and guidance that is available, accessible, impartial and lifelong.
3.4 Introduction to Occupational Choices and Careers Guidance
Theories and Models
In the early years of the 20th century, Frank Parsons in the USA put forward his ideas about the relationship between individuals and work opportunities. It was well into the 1950s before a variety of different approaches began to be developed, again mainly in the USA. Models of guidance are the basis for the work of guidance practitioners. A number of different theoretical approaches exist.

3.4.1 Trait/Factor or Matching or Person-environment fit approach
This theory grew directly from Parsons' work in America and can be briefly summed up by the following words: people are different from each other, jobs also differ, and it should be possible by studying both to match people with suitable jobs. This notion of matching has been adopted and developed by several others and in particular Alec Rodger's framework, the "Seven Point Plan" has played an important part in the practice of vocational guidance. Rodger (1952:316) argues that, "a reasonable prediction can be made of the sort of work into which a person might fit by paying attention to several 'points': the person's physical make-up, his attainments, his general intelligence, his special aptitudes, his interests, his disposition and his circumstances". Holland (1973:319) suggests "that most people can be categorised into one or more of six personality types realistic, investigative, artistic, social, enterprising, or conventional". His work concludes that career choices are an extension of the personality and that there is an attempt to implement personal behavioural style in the context of work. Holland's approach was that most people can be categorised and the people of the same type tend to get together and in doing so help to create an environment typical of their type. People look for environments in which they can feel comfortable and in which they can exercise their particular skills and abilities, express their attitudes and values and take on agreeable problems and roles.
Testing is seen as the best means of predicting future job success. Although not everyone would agree with this, it is one way of helping the individual gather more information about themselves and in making decisions about their next steps. In other words each individual attempts to identify their own traits in order to find a way of working and living which will enable them to use their capabilities effectively.

3.4.2 Opportunity Structure Approach

This approach concerns social class positions, the labour economy and the supporting of education and training. People do not so much choose, but are chosen for work. What is available, they take and they learn to like what they can get (Roberts, 1977). This theory seems to be concerned with inequality in educational attainment, participation in education and labour market position (Banks et al 1992). Responding in direct contrast to the developmental approach, Roberts suggested that people do not typically “choose” occupations, but simply take what is available. For most individuals choice does not exist, or is almost meaningless and the term “occupational choice” is similarly so. It might be argued that Opportunity Structure refers to the relationship between education, social class and occupation. Where you live, your parents’ backgrounds and the education that you have gone through will have an effect on the choices available to you. The very nature of this relationship, access or not to choices and qualifications could limit the aspirations and possible ambitions that are available to these clients. In other words, choice could be a reflection of the person’s awareness of themselves in their social class and education and not the search for self-actualisation. In fact there is never really absolute choice, it is about what is available in the labour market whether local, regional and national.

Careers education programmes can be dangerous in that they imply choice and thus raise unrealistic expectations. Roberts suggests that there is a need for “structural change” in society, a breaking down of the class system and that only this will improve the situation. This approach seems to be about taking
what is available, that there are not really choices, although there are opportunities they are not always what people would like. That social class and your education and training can help to widen choices. This does not seem to help those from poorer families who want to progress up the social ladder and get a better job education and training might be their only way out of their situation, however, just because someone gets educated or goes onto training in a particular vocational area does not mean they will be able to get a job, there are several other factors including getting the job, where the job is and each individual will have different criteria.

3.4.3 Theories of Career choice
In 1951 Ginzberg, Ginsberg, Axelrad and Herma put forward the idea that occupational choice is a process which takes place over time that the process of decision making is irreversible and that occupational choice involves compromise. Occupational choice is a process that takes place over six to ten years. The individual moves through three stages from fantasy, through a tentative phase, to a realistic period during which decisions are made. These ideas were taken up by Donald Super and developed over the years since the early 1950s. Fundamental to this approach are the five life stages described as follows: In the first part Growth and within this fantasy, interest and capacity. The next stage was Exploration when tentative choices are made and tried out and compared with the fantasy. This is followed by the transition and is where reality factors become important. Stage four is the Establishment Stage and the trial of jobs for their suitability. Stage five is Stabilisation, where a pattern emerges and the individual attempts to secure their position in work.

Originally, clear cut age bandings were attached to each of these stages, but Super had recognised that, with changing work patterns, things are not so easily specified. Interestingly, in the early years of his work he said little about the “Decline” stage, but as he reached this stage himself he became much more interested in the relationship between work and leisure within it. The key
Concept within Super's approach is the "self concept" and its development, his idea being that this can be helped by giving individuals the opportunity to become more self-aware. "Vocational Maturity" can be enhanced and people can be prepared for making decisions about their next steps. They make the choices based on the available information, advice and guidance. As each person is an individual their vocational maturity will and does vary and one type of programme of careers education and guidance will not always be the best for everyone, as we are all unique, but there are similarities between individuals and choices of destinations and occupational interests.

3.4.4 Models of Guidance

A 'model of guidance' is a concept of what needs to happen when a client seeks guidance and what happens thereafter. This can relate to how the practitioner thinks the person makes decisions about career, work and learning.

Models of Guidance include the DOTS model which is based on four main learning outcomes of guidance; Decision Learning; Opportunity Awareness; Transition and Self Awareness. This model was originally developed by Law and Watts (1977). In recent years the DOTS model has morphed into the SODT model Self Awareness, Opportunity Awareness, Decision Learning, Transition Learning, (Law, 1999). There are other models such as the EGAN which is a goal directed helping model (Egan, 1990) and FIRST, a checklist for careers interviews (Bedford, 1982). Please see Appendix 19 for detailed information covering Models of Guidance.

The Egan (1994) Model of Helping is an eclectic approach to counselling, its three stage model is a practical and easy series of steps to take the client through, for example: a) Identifying and clarifying problem situations, the client tells their story; b) Developing a preferred scenario, helping the client to develop a range of possible avenues to consider; c) formulating strategies and plans, helping the client to formulate a plan to meet their needs. Nelson Jones
(1996) on the other hand puts forward the 5 stage life skills counselling model. First to develop the relationship and clarify the problem(s); Assess and restate the problems in skill terms; State goals and plan interventions; Intervene to develop life skills; Emphasise, take away, end.

There are non-directive approaches, client-centred or personal centred where the emphasis is on the importance of the quality of the relationship between adviser and client. Drawing heavily on the work of Rodgers (1952), the key features of this relationship are respect, empathy, unconditional positive regard and genuineness. The needs of the client are seen as being of extreme importance and are worked through as part of an ongoing relationship between adviser and client. The skill of the adviser is seen as drawing the client out to explore and understand their needs, to consider choices and the implications of these choices and to act upon them.

Other theories developed from this include Bozarth and Fisher (1990), who place an emphasis on promoting the client's self actualisation. Rodgers (1952) considers the wider issues of personal development. His theories provide a broader model of how to work with clients to facilitate change in their personal lives.

3.5 The Influences on Young People
There have been many studies which have highlighted a strong correlation between a student's social class and their destination on completion of compulsory schooling. As Brooks (1997) suggests, historically young people from middle-class backgrounds have been much more likely than their working class counterparts to continue in full time education after the age of 16 and less likely to enter the labour market at the age of 16. This is similar to a study by Sime et al., (1990) that found a linear relationship between the father's occupation and the three post 16 categories they used: the higher the father's social-economic group, the more likely the young person was to remain in full time education. Foskett and Hesketh (1997) suggest that this trend seems to
be changing with eighty five per cent of young people from middle class backgrounds and seventy two per cent of their peers from working class backgrounds choosing to participate in full time further education in their studies. This research is suggesting that the gap between social classes is narrowing. This could be because there are more opportunities for young people to stay in education after the age of 16 or that there are fewer available jobs at 16. If the research had been carried out in another part of the country or if there were a higher percentage of minority ethnic groups included in the research, this could have had a significant effect on the results.

There is evidence that links social class and young people’s choices at sixteen years even though as Foskett and Hesketh (1997) suggest above, and Brooks (1997:85) confirms, the gap is narrowing. Young people are brought up in the educational experiences and attitudes to education of their parents and this sets the extent to which young people from different backgrounds perceive education as relevant to their needs. There is some evidence that there might be other influences, such as the young persons peer group. However, for certain choices such as what job to do, parents' views continue to prevail.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3.1 Percentage of 16 year olds by parents' socio-economic groups in full time education: 1989 – 1996</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Managerial/professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other non-manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skilled manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi-skilled manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unskilled manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Youth Cohort Study (GB.DfEE, 1997, p.21)

The above table is showing the proportions of the different social-economic class groups of 16 year olds in full time education. In the period of seven years, there are clear increases for all groups, but especially an increase in access to full time post 16 education of those from an unskilled manual background. The above is significant as there has been encouragement from
the present government over the last ten years to get students to stay on in education and to consider going onto higher education.

As seen before in this chapter there are other adults such as relatives, family friends, youth leaders and teachers who may also have a role in the decisions taken. Good careers advice offered at school from a sympathetic teacher may be critically important and it may override the influences of others, (Banks et al 1992). Roberts (1968) Opportunity Structure Theory stresses the importance of social class, gender, race and educational attainment in determining destinations in the local labour market. Banks et al stated that while social class remained a powerful force, its immediate impact on the distribution of career opportunities operated largely through its link with educational achievements.

Many studies in the past have taken into account the background of young people, their social class, gender and ethnicity but in the last decade researchers have started to focus on the contribution of individual schools to the qualifications being studied by individuals and their subsequent next step forward, which interlinks with the wider influences of the community in which the educational establishments were situated, the economic climate and government interventions and reforms which have direct and indirect influences on the choices that young people make. Keys et al (1998) researched into the reasons why young people were staying on in full-time education after the age of 16. The research took place in school sixth forms, sixth-form colleges and colleges of further education. They found that the following factors were significant, including occupational entry not possible until eighteen plus, near to home, the students did not want to start work at sixteen and that the college was offering the type of courses the students were interested in doing. All of these affected the range of courses and institutions that students considered and also coloured their views on the careers education and guidance they had received, their present course and their expectations.
Research by Gray et al. (1993:8) argued that the formal qualifications young people obtain from the examinations they sit at the end of their period of compulsory schooling are overwhelmingly the most powerful predictors of further educational participation. In general it has been found that the relationships are linear ones. The better their qualifications the more likely a person is to stay on.

Caplow (1954:214) identifies two influences on occupational choice i.e. that of parents and formal education. The fact is that parental influence is through the family tradition, “Almost all middle class parents expect that their children will not select menial, unskilled or semi-skilled occupations and a considerable proportion pursue the conscious goal of raising their children, through education, to a status higher than their own”. This is an interesting viewpoint with regard to mature students and the influences in their occupational choice, as their parents may still have influence on their choices of occupations. Work experience in particular goes some way towards gaining entry to the further education sector and may help to gain entry into higher education institutions, so an occupational job within a social class may help the mature person gain entry onto a particular course because of their life experiences. Work and life experiences can help an individual gain access to education. This is particularly relevant as part of the life long learning and widening participation agendas designed to encourage more people to experience higher education and for the government to reach their target of 50% of people to experience higher education. If the target is 50% then upper, middle and working class young people will have access to higher education; whether this leads to middle class jobs is another point, as there is evidence to suggest that there are graduates taking up jobs that normally are filled by those with lesser qualifications such as A levels or GCSEs. If this is the case, why experience higher education and get into debt to do a job where that the entry level is GCSEs or less? There was study jointly lead by Elias and Purcell entitled, “the Class of 1999”, the key findings, four years after graduation were that nearly
85% of employed leavers were in graduates level jobs. Two thirds of graduates were in jobs relating to their long term career plans and 2 to 3% of graduates were unemployed. http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/ier/research/class99

If we compare this with figures from the Higher Education Statistics Agency (2004) that collected first destinations, six months after graduation, "just under two thirds of graduates (64.8%) entering work went straight into a job requiring degree level qualifications". However, as the Telegraph newspaper reported on 24/07/2006, a third of university graduates were in jobs that did not require a degree and that one third of 2005 university leavers were working as bar staff, kitchen assistants, secretaries, farm labourers, factory workers, postal staff, etc.

3.5.1 School and teacher's expectations

Schools can influence the post 16 destinations of their students through the career education and guidance they provide (Brooke, 1998). The transition from school to post 16 can be a difficult area if not handled in an appropriate manner and this is where the role of careers education and guidance in school can help to prepare the ground. The scope of careers education and guidance is wide and as Edwards and Barnes (1991:9) suggest, "School defines and values 'careers' and 'work' and will shape teachers' perceptions of careers education and guidance". The school, and in particular the careers coordinator and the teachers can be a great influence on young people and their decision making about jobs and where they might consider studying, training and so on.

They go on to say that, "Staff may give priority to preparing young people for paid employment", but of course there are other types of work (unpaid and voluntary) which can be equally important to young people in gaining work experience and can be invaluable when considering higher education and their application through the Universities Central Admissions System (UCAS) form, showing how they can work in teams and gain relevant work experience.

Edwards and Barnes (1997) suggest that as options in education, training and work increase, careers education and guidance becomes even more
necessary. Far from being a peripheral activity, careers work should be at the core of the curriculum.

3.5.2 The Media, TV shows, radio, newspapers, magazines, books, Internet

A young person receives lots of information from those around them. There is information coming in from the media via television, newspapers, magazines, internet, advertising in public places, plus the environment in which they live. These inform them about economic changes, new technology and the changes in business culture, the fact that labour is getting older, demographic trends and changes in education and employer patterns. All this goes along with the issues of gender, ethnicity, social class and entry into employment that affect individuals whilst they make decisions about their futures. No wonder young people are confused at times and seek help and guidance. It is also amazing to see the number of people wanting to take up a particular occupation after watching a popular TV programme. There has been a shift from agriculture and horticulture courses toward attracting students to failing colleges of further education and certain types of Higher Education Institutions (HEI's) who have jumped onto the more popular land based, environmental and animal management programmes.

While there is nothing wrong in this, the British agricultural industry is unable to find sufficient workers with agriculture or horticulture qualifications or work experience, as Lantra the Sector Skills Council for the environmental and land-based sector represents 17 industries across the whole of the United Kingdom. As explained on their web site www.lantra.co.uk/businesses/agricultural-crops/industry-information
### Table 3.2 Industry Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business</th>
<th>No. of Businesses</th>
<th>Employing</th>
<th>Under 35</th>
<th>Over 65</th>
<th>Industry contributes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural crops</td>
<td>23,000</td>
<td>129,000</td>
<td>8.4%</td>
<td>19.8%</td>
<td>£3.63 billion to the UK’s Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural Livestock</td>
<td>75,000</td>
<td>305,000</td>
<td>8.6%</td>
<td>19.6%</td>
<td>£8.48 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production Horticulture</td>
<td>9,600</td>
<td>95,000</td>
<td>No numbers given</td>
<td>No numbers given</td>
<td>£1.9 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal care</td>
<td>13,000</td>
<td>47,500</td>
<td>No numbers given</td>
<td>No numbers given</td>
<td>£1 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal technology</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>3,400</td>
<td>No numbers given</td>
<td>No numbers given</td>
<td>No information given</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 3.5.3 Careers Adviser or Personal Advisers

As seen above there are other influences and providers of career advice for young people, including family and friends. Witherspoon’s (1995) study indicated that more young people received advice from informal sources than from careers advisers and careers teachers. The report goes on to say that young people considered family advice and support to be more important than that provided by careers professionals. This could be due to a number of factors including that careers advisers are not all the same, the training of advisers does vary, some have professional qualifications, degrees and lots of work experience and specialise in certain areas, for example higher education, employment or training opportunities. If a parent has had a bad experience or the advice has been wrong then this would clearly have an effect on the individual and a parent would most likely not encourage the son or daughter to see a Careers Adviser based on the above. It might also be a result of the bad press that Connexions and Personal Advisers have received as the perception of Connexions is that it is just for those students who are having problems and nothing to do with careers. Whatever the reasons, family advice is not bad if it
is there to help a family member achieve their goal. However, it may be impractical and may not be give alternatives to a career or give different avenues to achieve the same goals.

The NFER report considered the factors affecting the take up of post 16 options and the table below shows that the three most relevant advisers for the students were their parent/guardian, followed by careers teacher and careers adviser; which shows that careers teachers and advisers did quite well. The report did a follow up with students to find out which sources of information and guidance had been the most useful. Most students cited one source of information only, so careers advisers came out rather well overall from this study.

Table 3.3 Students' main advisers on post-16 options

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Advice given by:</th>
<th>Further Education college</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parent(s)/guardian(s)</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers teacher</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers adviser (from outside school)</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject teacher</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friend</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other teacher</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other person</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No response</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of students</td>
<td>867</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Adapted from NFER report by Keys, Maychell, Evans, Brooks, Lee and Pathak (1998))

According to Payne, Cheng and Witherspoon (1996:118), "seven out of ten said their family had helped them to decide what to do and a third found their family more helpful than anyone else. Just under two fifths said that they had been helped by the Careers Office and slightly fewer by a careers teacher, one in seven young people listed no source of help.

3.5.4 Students' main advisers on post-16 options

Foskett and Hesketh (1997:311) in their study found that students trusted the advice of careers teachers and other teachers more than that of their parents and they suggested that this was evidence of a growing consumerist approach
amongst young people in which 'formal' advice was valued more highly than 'informal.' Hagell and Shaw (1996) suggested that Bangladeshis were less likely to rely on informal careers advice from friends and family than young people from other ethnic groups, while Siann and Knox (1992) found that the Muslim girls in their study were more likely than their non-Muslim peers to involve their parents in their decision making and to consider their view important.

There seem to be cultural and ethnic factors that influence how different post 16 options are perceived. Lightbody et al. (1997) investigated the factors which influenced young Asians' choices of careers. They found that the social position of a job was much more important to the Asians than to the whites in their sample, whereas the opportunities for personal growth that a job offered were more important to whites. In Foskett and Hesketh (1996), careers interviews were found to be more important for young people from working class background than for their middle-class peers, who relied to a greater extent on informal sources. This could have been because of bad experiences of careers advisers in the past or that the parents thought they knew the best way of finding out information for their children.

Careers advisers/officers or Personal Adviser, those undertaking the role are called different names in different educational establishments, schools and further education colleges; pupils/students can also see them in Careers Offices, though in the past few years the name has changed to Personal Advisers working for the Connexions Services. Within the school environment pupils can also get advice from careers teachers. The literature shows that young people are given help in their decision making about whether or not to stay on at school or full time education and this is coming from the family, school teachers and careers advisers.

However, students do not always see the relevance of careers guidance or the benefit of planning earlier in their education for what they will do post 16. In the
past most young people in post 16 schools or in further education would have received little or no formal careers education and guidance. However, with the Education Act 2000, the majority of students of 16 and over have been involved with some kind of careers education programme, which covers the guidance process, whilst they were in school.

Schools are part of the community in which young people and their parents/guardians live. The work community is also part of the wider community and is affected by the social, technological, economic and political environments. All these influences on the labour market have not always been on the positive side and the developmental changes within organisations have had a major impact on careers for 16 to 19 year olds and the changes in education and training, in turn, are having an impact on post 19 year olds. Consideration of the worlds of education, work and career is often included through work experience programmes in schools as part of the careers education and guidance programme and within the Foundation, First and National Diploma courses in further education colleges. The methods of delivering Careers Education Guidance are slowly changing. There are more emphases placed on subjects and assessment procedures. But there are still issues around limited staff availability to teach the large classes. There has always been a time issue and tutors and colleges have placed restrictions on careers education and guidance and that is why the government produced a White paper on careers education and guidance in colleges and defined their part in the development of these subjects.

3.5.5 Economic awareness, the labour market and work

We live in a global market place whether we live in the middle of a city or the countryside miles away from other people. Young people may well be considering a career but people might also consider the terms work and occupation. If that is the case maybe we need to consider what each means. As Aster (1996:1) suggests “work is the set of activities associated with
performing one's paid occupations*. An example of this would be the provision of goods and services to be purchased. For individuals to purchase the goods and services they require money. As Aster (1996:1) suggests “work can be producing or repairing a machine, creating a work of art, or providing services such as education, tax advice or police protection”. An occupation as Aster (1996:1) suggests “is the position one holds or occupies, such as a doctor or clerk. In an organisation, an individual’s job title often reveals the occupation. If someone tells you that she is a nurse, you can determine where that occupation places her in the societal hierarchy as well as in the hierarchy of her employing organisation, the hospital”. The occupation is much more than just a classification; an individual’s occupation shapes nearly every aspect of life. Occupational position has a greater impact on social class than any other variable. Social class is one of the strongest predictors of many other aspects of life. For this research I will look at choosing an occupation, how people make occupational choices and the influences on their choices. As Aster (1996:49) suggests “each of us have a variety of factors which help to narrow the range of realistic options, these include such individual factors as talent and motivation and such social factors as gender, race, social class and possibly the level of technological and economic development of the society in which we live. The individual and social factors work together to ease entry into some occupations and increase the difficulty of entering others” As Aster (1996:57) goes on to suggest, one of the most limiting influences on occupational choices is social class. So those in a higher social class may find their aspirations and their actual occupational choices well matched if they have the intelligence or talent for their dream job or occupation and goes on to suggest that “children of the higher social classes are more likely to have parents, teachers and peers unanimously supporting their efforts in school”.

As Payne, Cheng and Witherspoon (1996:73/83) suggest, “Young people, aged 16 tend to go into particular occupational groups, notably clerical and secretarial, craft, personal and protective services and selling occupations”,

60
whereas some 18 to 19 year old young people have no GCE A Levels and/or a BTEC National Diploma qualification(s) and join the labour market in the areas of associate professional, managerial and technical occupations, clerical and related occupations, in the security, protective and personnel services, some in manual and selling occupations.

In the 1990s the increasing availability of part time work had an impact on staying on rates. As Unwin (1997:87) suggests, the possibility of combining part-time work with full time study may have helped young people to, "ignore the temptations of the labour market and put into practice a dual system of post sixteen experiences".

3.6 Linking career guidance to mentoring and coaching
As seen at the beginning of this chapter, the definition accepted by the Institute of Career Guidance refers to career guidance as services and activities intended to assist individuals, of any age and at any point throughout their lives, to make educational, training and occupational choices and to manage their careers. This does not refer to the mentoring and coaching of individuals; this is not surprising as it is the Institute of Career Guidance and their title should give a clue to their emphasis. Career guidance services can cover all ages, abilities, gender etc. They are about individuals understanding themselves and developing their capabilities, helping them investigate careers and opportunities and developing their career plans. Career Guidance can include job seeking skills, CV writing, interview and presentation techniques and using research skills to take advantage of opportunities and work experience. There are particular skills, knowledge, experience and qualifications that are needed to do the job of a careers adviser, or for someone working within the careers field; even if there is confusion about the role and what the person is called. As Spurling (1995:19) explains, "Guidance is the professional activity that helps individuals to understand themselves at the age and stage they have reached and to know what it is they want, find out what options are open to them, learn
how to go about taking a decision and making plans and take the full breadth of their life and commitments into account and to work out how to put their plans into effect”.

3.6.1 Mentoring
There is confusion about mentoring and coaching and what each does. As Clutterbuck (2001:26) suggests, “coaching and mentoring share some tools and approaches. Mentoring is primarily focused on longer-term goals and on developing capability”.

Most of the research written on mentoring comes from the business viewpoint covering several areas, including staff development, retention of employees, promotion, performance and the management of people and so forth, (as explained earlier in Chapter Two). With regard to mentoring in organisations, there seem to be benefits to both the employee and employer in terms of the organisation and, at times, the career advancement of the employee within the organisation. This seems to be one of the differences between mentoring and careers advice, in that much mentoring is organisationally focused and not impartial, it is directed to develop the individual within the organisation, for use within the organisation, for the organisation’s goals.

Mentoring could be valuable but the people who do it are not impartial enough in some contexts. Career mentoring used by career guidance professionals could be use with students in both post 16 provision and in higher education, especially in the opening up of opportunities for someone to gain experience in an occupational area. Mentoring can help graduates in the transition from higher education the world of work and the training and development in organisations. As Clutterbuck suggests (2001:39), “... explore their own potential, the mentor enables them to gain the self-knowledge necessary for well-founded self confidence”. Thus helping an individual to gain experience and help in the career decision making process. Careers guidance workers are client centred and have the skills to listen, motivate and encourage individuals;
these are mentoring skills. Careers advisers have detailed and expert knowledge of local labour markets, they can be a source of ideas and at times will act as a sounding board to help individuals to explore ideas. When taking this into account the skills of mentoring are closely linked to some of the skills that a careers adviser uses in their everyday interactions with individuals and groups.

3.6.2 Coaching
The role of coaching is to provide support; Starr (2003:6) explains “a coach will focus solely on an individual’s situation”. Many organisations are now seeing some benefits to coaching to improve performance and motivation of people working for their organisation. There are other types of coaching such as personal and life/lifestyle and career coaching for developing individuals and their careers in an organisation. Parsloe (1995) suggests that in the workplace, “direct line managers, are normally the coach”.

There are real differences between career guidance and coaching and this could be due to how long they have been around and what each is involved in doing. Coaching, like mentoring, is a process; but where coaching is an enabling and helping process, mentoring is essentially a supportive process. This is important, if coaching is a process then, if the above can be believed, the mentor can help to support the process of coaching. However, career guidance is different. In most cases there it is a shorter period of time spent with the individual and the agenda is the process of career guidance, of an individual finding out who they are and what their next steps will be career-wise. Though there may be other issues surrounding this area, career guidance is about guiding the individual, their development, their understanding of the options available to them and the possible ways toward a job, a job with training, further of higher education, gap year, unemployment; that is the remit. In contrast coaching is about improving performance and motivation of people working for their organisation. The technique of coaching could be part of the
process, perhaps in an area where there is a perceived difficulty for the student(s). Coaching seems to be gathering pace as a possible technique to be used outside business organisations, whether it can be on a level footing with careers guidance would be doubtful; however, there are elements within coaching that may be adapted to be used alongside careers guidance.

In this context, the main concentration of coaching practice has been used to help individuals having difficulties in finding a job; especially those who had been unemployed for over six months, coaching could help them through the process of getting a job. In the area of employability in higher education, students either tend to know just where they want to be, or are at the opposite end of the scale. This is where the coaching process could help to focus the individual on their goals, as this seems to be the role of coaching. It is central point, task and goal orientated, which should be no surprise as coaching has evolved from sport coaching and that is surely about doing the very best an individual can and winning. Coaching techniques might be more effective than “traditional” careers guidance in focusing on goals and getting students to plan their careers.

3.7 Summary
Chapter Three has considered the origins and definitions of career guidance, its link to careers education and its development. Different theories and models of career guidance have been introduced and the influence of parents, social class, education, peer pressure and media coverage on individuals and how this may impact on their choices, where they look for advice and guidance about their future and who offers this service have been discussed.

As mentioned in previous pages, mentoring is often about helping an individual in their career in an organisation. The same techniques and tools have sometimes transferred this to education, working with student teachers or Newly Qualified Teachers (NQTs) in the first teaching roles, but they can also
be used in the retention of students and the improvement of General Certificate in Secondary Education (GCSE's) or BTEC grades. This is very similar to the retention of staff in an organisation and helping them to achieve either locally recognised or professional qualifications. The principles can be the same, mentoring is a useful tool and if used well will help organisations achieve their goals of good retention levels and improved examination results; however, this is done through the process of mentoring pupils and students in schools and colleges.

There is clearly a history to career guidance, both in its relationship to education and the schools, further and higher education and the economy. There is evidence that different individuals give advice or influence careers, including those who have little or no experience of guidance but in fact have a great deal of influence on young people and their choices of occupations, careers and further education. The professionals involved in the process of career guidance do have influence but overall the largest single influence is the family, or that is what the literature so far is indicating. But the literature has shown that young people and in fact some parents require, need and want input from careers guidance professionals and there may be a need for a new approach that might start people thinking about planning their career earlier and seeking out professional information, advice and guidance.

When considering mentoring and coaching techniques, what they can add to the experience of career guidance is an interesting question. However, there does seem to be a case for their use alongside the ethical and professional focus, producing impartiality of the information, advice and guidance offered to individuals. Careers advisers normally hold postgraduate diplomas in careers guidance and belong to professional organisations and have strict codes of conduct. However, there are no clear regulations covering the work of coaches or mentors. This is not to say that their work with individuals is any less than a careers adviser, but clearly there is a difference in training, professional level of
qualification and their roles are not the same. There are similar skills which can be used in career guidance, counselling, mentoring, coaching, teaching and so forth. These including listening, presentation of information and, as seen in Chapter Two, coaching is designed to assist personal development. As the popularity of coaching seems to be increasing there might well soon be more literature on the relationship between coaching and career guidance.

It is important to know what each can contribute to individuals and organisations, by knowing this there are different roles to be played out, but as a professional aware of the impact one can have in the short term and more importantly the longer term on people's career, life and those around them.

In this chapter there has been a consideration of where and what careers guidance previously was and presently is, about the process of making choices and those theories and models of careers guidance in relation to the influences in terms of parents, friends, social backgrounds, education. The role of television and the Internet and the part played by careers teachers and advisers the process of decision making have also been discussed.

The focus of this thesis is mentoring and coaching and the possible development of collaboration with careers guidance in the development of young people and adults and their process of development. It is vital that in using either mentoring or coaching skills and techniques in the area of careers guidance that the practitioner understands that one can not simply transfer a technique or skill directly from one situation to another without adaptation, but there are potential pitfalls facing anyone with inadequate careers guidance experience as the information, advice and guidance they offer may not be suitable for use with the individuals, clients or students. The advice or guidance needs to fit in with the needs of the individuals, not all mentoring and coaching will easily transfer to careers guidance, but as this chapter has began to show there are possible considerations and opportunities that may be useful.
in the area of career development with both young people and adults in further and higher education. In Chapter Four there will be the introduction of the Enhanced Model and the usage in the research.
4. THE ENHANCED MODEL

The purpose of this chapter is to introduce the Enhanced Model which was used in the research and to look at the reasoning behind the development of the model and the main influences on the structure, the context and the timing of the group work and interviews associated with the model. The Enhanced Model was devised and adopted by the researcher to provide information, advice and guidance throughout the research period.

4.1 Background and development of an Enhanced Model

As seen in the early chapters, the development of mentoring and coaching in business and education is beginning to catch a pace and they are being used in a variety of different ways with a vast array of individuals and teams in public and private organisations across the world. These two techniques from the training and development stable come in many forms: from the career development of individuals in organisations to the mentoring of young people in schools, colleges and those in higher education, the coaching of individuals and teams to improve their performance and help organisations to reach their goals, the coaching of individuals in a particular task, help in the attainment of a job, or the recent development of academic coaches and school mentors to help the underachievers in schools. But surely it makes more sense to support and enhance the potential of all people.

The literature review has provided a great deal of information about the benefits of both mentoring and coaching in helping individuals and teams achieve their goals. This, as seen in previous chapters, has primarily been in the areas of business and education. Little has emerged in the area of career guidance, though this seems to be changing, particularly in higher education career coaching in recent years. This is where the research is lacking and provides an opportunity to see if mentoring and coaching, or a mix of both, could be used in providing career guidance to young and mature people in further and higher education, supporting them in the process of career planning and helping
individuals to become more self aware and confident in their own abilities to make decisions.

There were a number of concerns about the models and methods of mentoring and coaching elsewhere and whether these models and methods could be adapted and used in the area of career guidance. Although there are common threads running through mentoring and coaching, as seen in Chapters 2 and 3, this does not mean they can easily be transferred to the area of career guidance.

As Linley (2006:4) argues "Coaching is fundamentally a human change process.

Career guidance can cover different areas such as information, advice and guidance, all relating to careers but with several threads including further study, higher education, training, employment, alternative employment, full or part time options and gap year. Career guidance is about transitions, moving on in thinking and a possible change of direction. It can be used with those in school, colleges and higher education institutions, employment and so on. There are direct links in terms of benefits between career guidance and the economic wellbeing of individuals, communities and country. As Mayston (2002:9) suggests 'possibility that high quality career guidance may help to reduce the degree of mismatch in the labour market between the demands for particular skills in particular parts of the country and the available labour supply'.

In the next section of this chapter the reader will see that neither mentoring nor coaching is career guidance, although both are increasingly being used in organisations to improve performance of individuals and teams. This is especially true of coaching. Career guidance is rarely used in organisations, unless redundancy is happening and then it is administered by an outside agency or organisation to help employees look for work.
4.2 Mentoring and Coaching and the link to Career Guidance

The mentoring and coaching literature gives clear indications as to where and when both have been used and to some degree the level of change brought about in people and their performance, both in business and education. There is little evidence directly to link either mentoring or coaching to career guidance. As seen in Chapter 2 mentoring and coaching are primarily techniques that are used to help individuals and teams to improve performance and there is evidence to prove that mentoring can help individuals in organisations to achieve promotion. Garvey & Galloway (2002:271) suggests 'mentoring is increasingly employed in many occupational settings in relation to induction, career development and change'. There is some evidence of the growing use of career coaching in higher education institutions, see Appendix for University of Bradford, Employability Coach (2007) and London Business School, Career Coach (2007).

Table 4.1 Skills, qualities and knowledge gives a list of the skills and knowledge that are used in mentoring, coaching and careers guidance and gives an overview of where and in what situations each can be used and with whom. Putting both together can help to describe why mentoring and coaching were considered to be useful in the development of the Enhanced Model, whether career guidance is career counselling and whether individuals are mentoring or coaching, or just taking an interest. Sometimes words are very powerful and the way in which the words are used can help individuals change their life.

Table 4.1 highlights where careers guidance, coaching and mentoring take place, the different job titles that are presently used and that the job titles do not always show clearly what individuals might be doing as a job. The table shows the different groups of people that careers advisers, coaches and mentors work with and what help might be available. The table also includes the 'person in the street'; to show that especially in the area of career guidance these people are often a source of information.
Table 4.1 Job roles, their differences and similarities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Where</th>
<th>Careers Adviser</th>
<th>Coach</th>
<th>Mentor</th>
<th>Person in street</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education: Schools, FE Colleges, HEI, Outreach centres</td>
<td>Business, education</td>
<td>Business organisations, schools, colleges</td>
<td>Anywhere, street, pub, gym, at home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job titles</td>
<td>Careers Adviser, Personal Adviser, Careers Consultant, Careers Officer, Career Coach</td>
<td>Coach Mentor Manager</td>
<td>Mentor Coach Manager</td>
<td>Person the in street, Parents, carer, sisters, brothers, friends, partner, New friend in bar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With Whom</td>
<td>Young people, any gender, any nationalities, mature students, internationals, further and higher education students, unemployed, those in part and full time work. Young people and adults who have disabilities</td>
<td>Students, graduates Workers, managers Business coach</td>
<td>HE students mentoring young people Older person into schools FE college mentor Business mentor</td>
<td>Everyone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with what?</td>
<td>Transitions Career, employment, training and further study</td>
<td>Coach in performance</td>
<td>Retention levels Improve exams results Promotion</td>
<td>Listening Offering an option</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>HEI’s, FE colleges, Schools, ISCO, Careers Services, Connexions, Voluntary groups, private companies</td>
<td>Business, education, self employed</td>
<td>Business, education, self employed</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.1 clearly shows there are similarities and overlaps in job roles. The fact remains that the process is only part of what goes on and the importance of presentation and the attitude of the person in charge of the process can be at times of equal importance, as too is the training and development of the individual who is helping the student to work through the process. It is vital that this person not only has the background knowledge and skills in mentoring and coaching, but is also aware and up to date within the area of career information, advice and guidance. That is not to say that career information, advice and guidance is not given by non-professionals, it happens all the time. Parents and teachers/lecturers as seen in Chapter 3 are two of the main...
influences on students. This is not necessarily a bad thing but are they always
the best people to ask about careers? There are also other influences
including friends, media and other relatives; whereas, professional careers
advisers are not always seen as the first port of call when researching and
finding out about a career.

There is some evidence that can link mentoring, coaching and career guidance.
This is displayed in terms of job titles such as Career Coach and Employability
Coach contained in advertisements on the web site www.jobs.ac.uk dated
05/08/2007. The Career Coach was based in the Careers Services working in
the London Business School and the Employability Coach was to work at the
School of Management at the University of Bradford, but was to be part of the
Career Development Services. Please see advertisements in the appendix 21, 22.
The focus of the Employability Coach seems to be on helping students
develop confidence and the capability to achieve higher professional
employment. The Career Coach covers the areas of marketing students to
recruiters and coaching students through all stages of their job search
development. Both of these posts were based in Career Services in
universities and seem to be using technical terms from both guidance and
coaching for use with undergraduate and postgraduate students in higher
education. Later in this chapter there is a (Table 4.2) which indicates the type
of activities, skills and knowledge that career guidance workers need to have
alongside those of the mentor and coach. The two jobs described above could
be considered to be adding to the list of jobs or they could be thought of as a
cross between several different roles and it is not about the job title, but more
about the outcomes brought about by the organisation that the individual is
working for.

So far the emphasis has been on the coach, now we will consider the role of
the mentor in career guidance. As previously seen in Chapter 2 mentoring is
used in education and business, but at present let us considers the education
focus. Mentoring as used in education can be spilt into two areas, with staff or
with students. For example mentoring used with staff is to help trainee teachers in their placements whilst in the school. A mentor, the mentor teacher is there to support the trainee teacher to get the most out of their placement. Mentoring is also used when a Newly Qualified Teacher (NQT) arrives in a school. Again the mentor will be there to help them settle in and give support throughout the initial process. As Miller (2002:180) suggests, ‘key to effective mentoring is to utilise them teachers in ways that will support the learning needs’. When considering the role of the mentor with students the research so far has revealed that mentoring is used in the areas of improving grades and retention levels and with socially excluded students who, for whatever reason, are not in school. Connexions strategy (DfEE, 2000) claimed that they would ‘create a new profession of Learning Mentors (for young people in school) and Personal Advisers (PAs) (for those in post transition).

The possible link to career guidance is somewhat limited with regard to the above. If the role of the mentor is to encourage students to improve their grades this must be somewhat difficult especially where there is a high unemployment rate or where students live in deprived areas of the country. The role of the mentor in keeping students at school or in college, so ensuring the organisation gets payment for the students being on roll in education, is nowhere near to the role of the Careers Adviser in school or college, but may be near to the role of some Connexions Personal Advisers with their role in supporting young people in education. Personal Advisers and Mentors help to support socially excluded young people with a variety of issues e.g. non attendance, behavioural issues, housing, abuse to name but a few.

These two forms of mentoring used in school in supporting staff and students seem to have different emphases. The first, with staff, is closely related to the mentoring used in business with the wiser, possibly older person helping, guiding, and supporting a new, possibly younger person in an organisation. The difference in school or college seems to come when mentoring is used with
students to improve grades and retention levels and is clearly linked to financial gain for the educational establishment as they are paid on the number of students in the school or college and could also be linked to the grades that students achieve. One might think this is fulfilling a similar role to the Connexions Personal Adviser (PA) or Careers Adviser (CA), but it is not always as a particular PA or CA will have different roles in schools and colleges than that of mentors in those institutions.

4.3 Mentoring and the Mentor, Coaching and the Coach
Let us consider the roles of mentoring and coaching in terms of context, content, process and presentation. As mentioned earlier in the chapter, there are a number of areas where they are used. The context of mentoring and coaching is that they are used in organisations to help individuals achieve their best and in education to help young people improve their examination results. The content is very specific to the individual and/or organisation. The process of mentoring and coaching will also vary depending upon the training of the mentor or coach. For example the table 4.2 below is showing by the headings of career guidance, mentoring and coaching the different aspects each may go through.
Table 4.2 Comparison of the role of career adviser, coach and mentor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject areas</th>
<th>Careers Guidance (CAREERS ADVISER)</th>
<th>Mentoring (MENTOR)</th>
<th>Coaching (COACH)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Content</td>
<td>Careers information, advice and guidance</td>
<td>Very specific to the individual and/or organisation</td>
<td>Very specific to the individual and/or organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context</td>
<td>Pre and post 16 students in school, FE and HE, unemployed and those considering alternative career. Employers if redundancies is an issue for Adults.</td>
<td>Business and education Organisations Help individuals achieve Promotion Students improve retention levels, grades</td>
<td>Business and education Organisation Focus on skills and performance Coaching graduates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process</td>
<td>Interviewing, group work, presentations, email, telephone work</td>
<td>Discussion, email, telephone</td>
<td>Discussion, email, telephone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>Impartial information, advice and guidance</td>
<td>Depends on training, links to the role of the Mentor</td>
<td>Depends on training, links to the role of the Coaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To be achieved</td>
<td>Individual to move on in their thinking To achieve their goal</td>
<td>Focus on longer term goals and on developing capability</td>
<td>Performance related in the current job with the emphasises on developing skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roles</td>
<td>Career Adviser, Personal Adviser, Career Consultant, Career Counsellor</td>
<td>Mentor</td>
<td>Coach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other roles</td>
<td>Planner, Negotiator, Trainer, Advocacy worker</td>
<td>Confusion with coaching</td>
<td>Confusion with mentoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work with others</td>
<td>Parents/guardians, Employers, Work in schools and colleges, Universities</td>
<td>Managers in organisations with employees Students pre and post 16, Socially excluded</td>
<td>Managers in organisations with employees Individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who benefits</td>
<td>Individuals, Families, The economy</td>
<td>Organisations, individuals, teams achieve better results Schools/colleges, individuals</td>
<td>Organisations, individuals and teams achieve better results</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.2 clearly shows that there are those who could benefit from mentoring and coaching and that there are clear links between each. The difficulty comes when trying to make the link between mentoring and coaching and career guidance, as career guidance is about impartial advice, about the individual and what they want. It is not about the organisation and its goals, nor is it
about getting better grades, results or better retention rates for a school or further education college. It might be about getting better jobs or better outcomes six months after leaving the college.

Coaching on the other hand is all over the place in education and business and there is life and parent coaching to name but two. This surge of interest is in using coaching to help in your life, education, training, business and parenting. It seems to be marketed as the solver of all the problems around us today. Maybe it is the society we live and work in that thinks that we require the support of another person as we live in a dysfunctional world. Where once we would stay local in our respective communities, now we seek to move with the jobs. Going onto further and higher education is now the norm, whereas fifteen years ago we were more likely to solve our own issues or not within the family and its links to the community.

Career guidance is about the individual and their agenda, widening their choices and offering professional help and guidance. Careers guidance is about signposting for the individual, but not doing it for them. A career adviser helps with college applications, options, choices, decision making and transitions from education to a number of different destinations that may require that person to be in education and training for many years to achieve their goals. Careers work is quite varied and involves a variety of other work which is directly related to the careers information, advice and guidance that the Careers Adviser works with to enable them to provide a service to individuals. Therefore mentoring and coaching are not the answer to all careers work but they have potential to be useful with certain aspects of careers guidance.

Table 4.3 helped the researcher when analysing the models to try to ensure the right breadth and rigour in developing the Enhanced Model to run alongside the career guidance process.
Table 4.3  Knowledge, Skills, Qualities and Qualifications of Careers Adviser, Coach and Mentor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge</th>
<th>Careers Adviser</th>
<th>Coach*</th>
<th>Mentor*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Trained in careers guidance</td>
<td>Understanding of the term coaching and their particular role</td>
<td>Business or professional role in an organisation or educational institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Up to date knowledge HE sector and employability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Career education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Labour Market Intelligence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills</td>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>Flexible and adaptable</td>
<td>Active listening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negotiating</td>
<td>Sense humour</td>
<td>Flexible and adaptable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interviewing skills</td>
<td>Creatively</td>
<td>Creatively</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Presentation skills</td>
<td>Active listening</td>
<td>Sense humour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Group work skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Design and delivery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IT literacy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Time management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualities</td>
<td>Self awareness</td>
<td>Physical appearance and clothes</td>
<td>Self awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Flexible and adaptable</td>
<td>Body language and physical gestures</td>
<td>Good humour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Creatively</td>
<td>Qualities of voice</td>
<td>Empathy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sense humour</td>
<td>Language and words used</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Physical appearance and clothes</td>
<td>Beliefs and values</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Body language and physical gestures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Qualities of voice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Language and words used</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beliefs and values</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualifications</td>
<td>Post Graduate (PG) Diploma in Careers Guidance</td>
<td>No formal qualifications required</td>
<td>No formal qualifications required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PG Diploma in Careers Education and Guidance in Higher Education</td>
<td>Though people may or may not have other types of qualifications there are no set qualifications</td>
<td>Though people may or may not have other types of qualifications there are no set qualifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>National Vocational Qualification (NVQ) in Advice and Guidance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Qualification in Career Guidance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Jarvis (2006:53), argues that "If individuals do not have the qualifications or industry knowledge, they may not fit the bill", Table 4.3 shows that the Careers Adviser is trained in a number of areas including labour market information, interviewing and groups work teaching, their training can be full-time and at
postgraduate level it is geared up to career guidance. Where mentoring and coaching is used in education and other organisations there are some cross-over in qualities and skills such as listening skills, flexibility and adaptability to situation; knowing something of life and the skills, knowledge and understanding of organisations and how they may work which can be transferable to other areas such as teaching and counselling. The other important point to highlight is that the use (range) of skills seems to be more intensive for those working in careers guidance work than in mentoring and coaching, which makes one think that a careers adviser could consider being a mentor or a coach as they seem to have the skills, knowledge and qualities required to do the role successfully.

4.4 An overview of the Enhanced Model and others

Table 4.4 shows not only the Enhanced Model, but also competing models and the different stages of each, what is covered in each and allows the comparison of the similarities and differences inherent in each model.

The models considered are listed in the table. Particular attention is given to the GROW model, Downey (2003) and its application and usage in both mentoring and coaching situations and environments. Three leaders in mentoring and coaching are also listed in the table Parsloe, Clutterbuck and Megginson have all developed models for consideration. There are many common threads running through these models. Although the models are called different names they are very similar in stages and language. It is really up to the individual organisation or presenter to choose the best model for their purpose and in the case of the research carried out, the model used needed to be multifaceted as it was to be used in career guidance with widely different students.

Three of the models consider at the beginning what goal is to be achieved: Whitmore (1992), Downey (2003), CIPD (2004) are about the outcome, or goal,
by any other name. Parsloe (1992) on the other hand considers it is best to analyse and assess the present situation. Megginson and Clutterbuck (1995) look at establishing rapport. Each of these models helped with the different starting points, stages and language and was used in the development of the Enhanced Model.

What is vitally important is the beginning to the model and the ending of the model and that is where the models listed below have helped. For example Parsloe (1992) and CIPD (2004) models have the five stages that the Enhanced model has, whereas the other models have only four. When the researcher was considering the development of her model, various stages were chosen which may be the most suitable to work with students on further and higher education programmes.

There were key techniques that were adapted from coaching and mentoring in the development of the Enhanced Model at the initial stage of the process, setting out firm goals or outcomes. This technique is used in mentoring and coaching and is about achieving tasks which, as seen in this chapter, are about the performance of the individual and therefore can mostly be seen to be achieved quite quickly. The next point which was adopted into the fourth stage of the Enhanced model was instilling the will to do the task in hand. One might call this commitment to do the task. Whereas career guidance is a more formal process this does not have to be the case with mentoring and coaching, which can be more informal and this aspect was incorporated. Careers guidance is not always about focusing on goals. It is about the person first and their transition, though goals may come into this.
Table 4.4 Comparison of Mainstream Models with the Enhanced Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Exploration</th>
<th>Development</th>
<th>Reality</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Progress</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Review</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Develop</td>
<td>Career Action Plan</td>
<td>2. Direction setting (getting established)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reflect</td>
<td>Summer time activities, reviewing short and long term plans. Who would help them achieve their goals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Monitor</td>
<td>Will: What is to be done</td>
<td>4. Moving on (finalising, maintenance)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Review</td>
<td>Structured session, reviewing the progress of interviews with the researcher, their plans for the future and who has helped them through the process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Enhanced model was used alongside careers guidance in the development of further and higher education students and their career.
planning. The Enhanced Model, based upon mentoring and coaching models, was used with some students across selected programmes at the college. The specific questions this research sought to answer were whether the new Enhanced model helped students make progress in the following areas:

- Start to plan their career
- Understand the importance of the ‘dreams’ and ‘reality’ parts of their career
- Plan their actions and review the process
- Understand the importance of developing new skills
- Know where to find information on jobs or higher education
- Consider possible options, which might well be quite different from their normal thinking

Making progress in the following areas

- Self esteem
- Confidence building
- Self motivation
- Self image
- Identified skills
- Decision making
- Developing ideas

This Enhanced Model was a process which worked within the content of the conversation and subject areas of careers, as well as the context of careers guidance, helping people to make realistic decisions about their next steps. The main differences in the Enhanced Model was the process in terms of critical points in the calendar year for post 16 students, but more importantly the process of the career coaching methods used with students.

There are various methods used to collect information on people and a few methods which can be used to help people develop ideas and themselves.
Career coaching is one method, but it is important to know about both the theory and practice of careers guidance and of both mentoring and coaching.

The Enhanced Model, in a nutshell, was a series of planned interventions with students over a set period of time. The process had five stages, covering the key aspects of Exploration, Develop, Review and Reflection, Monitor and Review. Within this process the student would develop their own Action Plan and define key activities they would undertake and the goals/targets they wished to achieve or research. The Career Coach would facilitate the process within the context of an academic year and also cover the key areas of higher education options, looking for work, or considering self-employment. There were time periods set aside for the meetings to take place between the students and the Career Coach and activities to complete, such as encouraging them to reflect on why had they decided to study for the course they were on. Students were encouraged to write their own action plans and then review them several weeks later. This was the introduction to career planning and by using their own action plan they were being introduced to the reflective element of the process. That is where the process of coaching and mentoring could help the individual to work on the next stage of planning and developing their career path. The coaching techniques focused on the individual and their agendas for their future and their own development through working with the researcher. It was intended to help develop their confidence, motivation, self-esteem, self-clarity and career decision-making. This in turn would help them to focus upon the information, advice and guidance they required.

This is very different to the other approaches to career guidance in post 16 contexts, where there is no set provision for each student to be seen over a period of time. The career guidance provision in post 16 schools and colleges is normally managed between the school/college and the local Connexions services. The Connexions services role is to ensure that young people over 16 are in education, training or employment. The organisations have targets to
reach and therefore there is little provision for those students who are mainstream, for example those with four to five GCSE’s grade C or above. The normal time period of an interview could be 10 to 30 minutes, which covered the area of information for students sixteen to nineteen years old, nothing else. The Enhanced Model could be used with students of any age; as it was in the research, where participants were 16 to 45 plus.

The main difficulty with the standard model of career guidance is that there is often seen to be little value in career guidance. This could be because there is a vast array of individuals with varying degrees of qualifications, or none whatsoever, engaged in career guidance. The emphasis of the Connexions Services has been on the NEET (Not in Education, Employment or Training), to ensure that young people are doing something and that is recorded as there are targets that need to be reached by Connexions Services and if not they could have their funds reduced or contracts removed. Targets do not help the guidance process. If it is all about targets and young people doing something, what about the all important career guidance and them reaching their full potential? People are not the same and their rates of development can often be different. For many people it is dependent upon so many factors including family, opportunities available, education and qualifications, the confidence and motivation of the individual. The provision of post 16 career guidance is patchy, particularly in further education colleges and students give it low priority in the curriculum. Only the lower achievers receive particular help as they are supposedly the potential NEETs of the future. The emphasis is to ensure students stay at college and achieve something as funding is attached to qualifications that students achieve and the length of time they stay in education.

The Enhanced Model is a set of interventions over the period of study, with particular activities included throughout the period of working with the researcher. It is designed to focus on career development and the
management of the process, for the students to 'buy in' to the process of regular contact, to fully cover their careers development and to help them through the planning of their career management. This takes longer than is usually available and hopefully more progress is made than the one off interview of thirty minutes or less that is the focus of the standard model.

The Enhanced Model in practice was a series of interventions at set timings in the academic year. It covers the important dates for those considering higher education options and applying through UCAS or looking for work. The five stages of the Enhanced Model are spread throughout two years. The five stages are Stage 1 which is the Exploration and writing the Action Plan, Stage 2 is about the Career Action Plan and the students developing short and longer term targets/goals or plans and activities for review. Stage 3 is the Review and Reflect stage for the students to review their own targets/goals or plans and activities and reflect on who can help them achieve their goals. Stage 4 is about the monitoring process, checking progress, especially for those who are considering higher education options or planning their entry into work. The final Stage is 5, which is about the Review of the whole process, what has happened and what can be improved upon. The timings of the interventions are set out in this Chapter on pages 88 and 89.

4.5 The Enhanced Model – interviews and group sessions: context and structure of content and timings

The Enhanced Model was devised to be used alongside traditional career guidance with further and higher education students. There is an informal calendar which is used with post 16 students and this needed to be incorporated into the overall content of the programme used with the students. The Enhanced model had two parts the Enhanced interview model and the Enhanced group sessions.
As seen earlier in this chapter on careers guidance, the context is transitions for people, whether from school to further or higher education, to work or training. There are always other people around to ask questions, get opinions; there is also the context of the organisation, whether school, college, university or work, these contexts will always have their agendas as well as those of the individual. There are various different transitions that individuals may go through within a life span, therefore knowing about this context in relation to the Enhanced model makes for a better understanding of the process individuals on further and higher education programmes may be going through over the period of the research.

Another area for consideration is the structure and content of the group sessions and interviews which took place and the reasoning behind the content, why include certain subject areas and not others. The structure linked together the group sessions and interviews to ensure there was continuity in the structure and process of the Enhanced Model.

The timing of the group sessions and the individual interviews, in an ideal world this would have been different but the research took place in a working further education college and the times of the interventions were dictated by the timetable and the short lead times available to see the students in college. The planning stage decided what needed to be covered in each subject area and what the best time for this would be there was then negotiation with the tutors in college.
Diagram 1  Enhanced Model

The Enhanced Model is a presentation of information, advice and guidance in a format to present possible human change in thinking, doing and planning process.

Some of the influences on students: family, friends at college and elsewhere, tutors, work placement providers/employers, TV programmes, newspapers, books, magazines, Internet, former teachers/tutors, advertising, careers events

Professional career guidance available

Impact of the researcher
4.5.1 The role of interviews in the Enhanced model

The design model was formulated in terms of the following three areas,
(a) content of subject areas;
(b) frequency of sessions and group work, interviews: including the provision of information and collection of data;
(c) methods used by the researcher in the interviews.

There were critical decision points, relevant to the students taking part in the research, which needed to be incorporated.

The techniques and tools used in the interviews were primarily based on the development of coaching within the career guidance sector. Although the Enhanced Model was used with a variety of students of different ages, genders and educational attainment levels, there were strict ethical and equal opportunities standards adhered to throughout the research. At each stage of the Enhanced Model there was a meeting between the student and the researcher which was recorded by tape recording or writing or both. At all times the students could hear or see the notes being taken and contribute if desired.

The interview programme formed a large part of the Enhanced model process and the table below gives the reader details of the timings and content of the subject areas discussed in the interviews which took place. The students were interviewed at least four times throughout the two year period, (if on one year course then twice). The following areas were covered by the process.

Introduction to Career Planning: understanding themselves (values and attitudes influencing them), Thinking about Career Decision: Where am I now, what’s available, Launching an employment/education campaign, Written and interpersonal communications in Job Hunting and Action planning with each person
The table below is an overview of the differences between the careers guidance interview and the Enhanced Model process including the stages

Table 4.6 Career Guidance Interviews vs. the Enhanced Model: the stages of process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stages</th>
<th>Career Guidance Interview</th>
<th>Enhanced Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Setting out the ground rules of the interview, the confidential nature, reason for the interview, an agenda</td>
<td><strong>Open Ended Exploration</strong> Introduction, find out about careers in the college, Career Action Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Formulate a list of items to discuss, and agree in order with client</td>
<td><strong>Develop Career Action Plan</strong> with students, develop their Summer Time activities and long term goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Discuss each item, summaries and challenge where necessary</td>
<td><strong>Review and Reflect</strong> Summer time activities, reviewing short and long term plans. Who would help them achieve their goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Agree time scales and who is doing what, may write an action plan</td>
<td><strong>Monitor</strong> with the student achieving their goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Agree next interview if required, Summary of the interview and what been discussed, ensure that all points the client wanted to cover have been</td>
<td><strong>Review</strong> Structured session, reviewing the progress of interviews with the researcher, their plans for the future and who has helped them through the process</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.5.2 The Enhanced group session model

Table 4.6 shows the list of subject areas covered in the timetable of events for those students taking part in the Enhanced Model.

Table 4.7 Timetable of group work (part of the Enhanced Model)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time of year</th>
<th>Subject area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jan/Feb 2004</td>
<td>Skills identification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May/June</td>
<td>Prepare for Higher Education, UCAS Application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sept 2004</td>
<td>and Personal Statement update</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan 2005</td>
<td>Job Seeking with a Twist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2005</td>
<td>Review Individual Career Plans in group work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April/May 2005</td>
<td>Review process</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table was part of the Enhanced Model and only students taking part in the programme attended.

4.6.1 Skills of the practitioner/researcher

The career guidance was delivered by the researcher who is a fully qualified careers adviser, with extensive experience of working with clients in further and higher education institutions. I have teaching and training and development qualifications, including mentoring and coaching qualifications and have taught in further and higher education colleges and universities across England.

The Enhanced Model was developed through the researcher’s work in the areas of careers guidance, mentoring, coaching and marketing. Over the years the researcher had worked in all four of these areas; through this experience and her own Continuous Professional Development (CPD) there was an opportunity to develop both a programme and process to help individuals to manage their careers.
4.7.1 The expected benefits of the Enhanced Model

The Enhanced Model was designed to help individuals in the development of their own career, to help them realise their full potential and to enable them to research into areas outside their normal thinking, to check through details and start to plan their career. It encouraged them to ask for information and help, to increase their self belief, motivation, confidence and potential career opportunities. It was also designed to clarify career and life goals and help individuals develop a greater understanding of themselves. All this was to be brought about through the process of bringing the knowledge and skills of career guidance and a mix of the techniques and tools of mentoring and coaching to the process and structure of the group sessions and, in particular, the interviews.

The expected results were that the students would find the process of working with the researcher more useful than the basic interventions. The Enhanced Model of five stages would help them realise their full potential and that they would be more confident in their own abilities, self esteem and motivation and that they would be able to plan their career, knowing about their own skills.

Because social sciences are by their nature "soft" sciences, dealing with human thoughts, behaviours and perceptions, it can be difficult to directly measure a variable like happiness or gauge how useful students found a particular intervention. Essentially there are two methods of testing whether an intervention has been successful. The first method is by direct observation of student behaviour and the success they achieve in later life, looking at measures like final salary, time spent as unemployed, membership of professional institutions, speed of promotion etc. Unfortunately this research could not take the time to look at long term measures, like these. However, follow ups were made two/three months after the end of courses to see where members of the different groups went. The second set of methods is more
immediate. While in some areas of psychology and behaviour sciences it is possible to directly measure bodily responses to stimuli, with measurable increases in heart rate, pupil dilation, brain activity levels etc, we were left in this research with the time-honoured process of asking the students in different ways to rate their perception of the experience they had gone through. This involved drawing up questionnaires that would ask questions of the students and get them to rate particular aspects of the research in order to compare the answers from different groups. Some measures were chosen because they could be rated on a scale from very good to very bad and had been validated in previous research. Additional measures were developed, for instance selecting words from a list of positive and negative features. While this second approach is more subtle it can make analysis much more difficult. The most straightforward measures were the established scales which covered Career decidedness, Self concept clarity, Occupational information, Passive decision making, Career exploration, Career decision making self efficacy.

The measures chosen were the students' perceptions of their own abilities or performance. Because this was not a long term study we could not find out whether the students' perceptions of themselves were real or illusory. Operationalisation is the process of turning feelings or concepts into variables that may be measured. The focus of the research was whether the Enhanced Model provided a better outcome for the students than the traditional approach. Operationalisation was achieved through a series of questionnaires that asked questions of the students and which tried to measure how useful they had found the inputs.

4.8 Summary
This chapter has been about drawing together aspects of mentoring, coaching and career guidance and considering the Enhanced Model used in this research, to help individuals in the development and management of their careers. In this changing world we live in there seems to be a greater
emphasis on the individual to take control of their own wellbeing, work life balance, life long learning and so on. As Hirsh and Jackson (1996:5) state “Career development is an important issue for organisations, by attracting, retaining and developing its workforce an organisation achieves the resilience that is required to survive in an increasingly turbulent business environment.” This seems to encapsulate that organisations want to attract the best individuals to work for them but also to retain them and develop them, but this is about the organisation’s goals not about the individual and what they may want to achieve. Megginson and Pedler (1992) explain clearly “that the world of work is changing so rapidly with people routinely being called upon to change roles, develop serial careers and swap outdated skills for new ones, that it is not possible for organisations to plan the development for them”. This is more in line with the individual and them taking control of where they want to be. The important point here is that if as an individual no one has really helped you to understand who you are and what you may be capable of then how can you start to change, update skills and plan where you want to be. The Enhanced Model was an opportunity for a random sample of students from a selection of further and higher education programmes to take part in their development. They could start to plan their career based on fact not fiction. Bridges (1994; 79) predicts that in years to come, jobs as we know them will cease to exist. He supports this argument by highlighting some of the many technological and economic shifts which are making fixed jobs, with clear job descriptions, obsolete. He contends that this situation is already under way and that in a ‘de-jobbed’ society, individuals will need to be responsible for managing their own career: “You had better be not only taking care of your own future, but also looking at yourself as if you were self-employed”. When the researcher decided to develop the Enhanced Model she was considering the above. If people are more aware of who they are and what skills, knowledge and abilities they have, they are more likely to be able to change and adapt. The Enhanced Model was not only about the content of subject, the process and structure of sessions and interviews with individual
students, but through the process they would learn to find out more about themselves and what they could do with their lives, so they managed their careers in and out of organisations.
5. METHODS

5.1 Introduction

This chapter covers the methods and analysis of data collected for the research into the effectiveness of mentoring and coaching in the career development of students. These techniques were used alongside careers information, advice and guidance with a number of students on one and two year programmes at a college in the Midlands during the period 2003 to 2005. The techniques of mentoring and coaching were selected as they have previously been used extensively in business and more recently education. Although both techniques have their origins primarily in the business environment this has not stopped the transition to the field of education.

The main aim of the research was to explore the training and development techniques of mentoring and coaching and their application in the area of careers guidance and development with post 16 students in further and higher education.

The subsidiary aim was to investigate how students experience careers development and the careers adviser's role within that process, remembering that the researcher was also their careers adviser.

The alternative approach considered was devised from strategies that had previously been used within the training and development role in different sectors of business and industry, education and the voluntary sector. This approach took the form of mentoring and coaching models and techniques which were considered by the researcher in designing and planning formats and interactions with a number of pre-selected students on both further and higher education programmes. There are different schools of thought within mentoring and coaching, so a great deal of literature was reviewed to find out which elements of a model or approach may be the most suitable to be used
alongside career guidance with young and mature students on the various programmes. A model was formulated from existing models already being used in business and education and was used within group sessions and interviews with the students over the period of their programme, whether one or two years.

5.1.1 Explanation of the different groups
The research was designed i.e. longitudinally with some students getting the enhanced model and others not
Group 0
These students were offered the contractually obliged guidance but did not take it up; their only contact with the research was the first and last questionnaires which they completed with the others. Group 0 are exclusively from the National Diploma Acting programme, the reason they received no input was because their tutor was ill and the group was not actively involved in the research. They form an interesting control group.
Group A
These students received the contractually obliged guidance. Therefore they could receive more careers guidance input than Group 0.
Group B1
Received the contractually obliged guidance and one joint group session with the B2 group
Group B2
This group received the new Enhanced Model, which included group sessions and four interviews throughout the process at designated times
Group Z
These were students in either Groups A or B1 who self referred themselves to see the researcher; a record of these interviews was kept in the Reflective Diary, including the age of each student, the date and time taken and the content of the interview and any outcomes.
5.2 Positioning the Research
In the research the students on the National Diploma, Higher National Diploma and Access to Higher Education Programmes all received different levels of input. The researcher monitored the process and the interactions with the students. The research crossed into a number of different research areas, including action research, field experimental research and evaluation research.

5.3 Action Research
Action Research is primarily about a problem or situation being diagnosed, remedial action planned and implemented and then monitored, all in a spirit of collaboration between the researcher and those in the setting being researched. For example 'Action' and 'research' are brought together not only into the one process but also into the one person the inquiring practitioner”, (Atweh, Kemmis, Weeks (1998:40)

Elliot (1981:40) suggests that Action Research is the study of a social situation with a view to improving the quality of action within it. Action research is not a method of data analysis; it is about research whilst doing it and being involved in it. The person who is doing the research is directly involved and so there are issues for them as a person and how they are perceived by all those who are directly involved. Put another way, the research practice is being lived whilst research is going on which is why the tools of reflection are so important for the researcher and the research being carried out.

The researcher kept a full reflective diary whilst the field research was taking place and each interaction with students in the research was recorded and reflected upon. This helped the researcher considerably when reflecting again, later on, in the analysis stage and acted as an aide memoir for the different types of interactions that took place. This reflective diary was successful in recording interactions with students and for the sanity of the researcher, who was in a dual role within the college. This diary proved an asset in terms of
recording the timetable of events, with dates and gave the researcher an understanding of those students seen and the issues raised up to that point. It was vital for the researcher, who was directly involved in the process of research. The diary can help to focus on activities and through the reflection process the researcher can keep on track. Action research can be messy and even if the process is handled in a professional and business like manner, action research is not straightforward as the researcher in directly involved in the process and in fact may change the outcome by being there, but on the other hand would there be an outcome if they were not there?

The process of the researcher being involved in the process is called action research and there are many who have used different definitions to help to understand the process, for example Schon, (1991:21) suggested that action research was the ability to develop 'local knowledge', the ability to perform reflection-in-action. Whereas Altrichter (in Schratz 1993:40) suggests that action research is "neither characterised by specific methods, but rather by integrating various methods in a methodologically consistent strategy. This strategy aims to help those people directly concerned with a situation under research (and that is in educational settings, teachers and students in the first place) to articulate, validate and develop their views and to design action in order to improve the situation they live in". Though the researcher would have liked this to happen, in reality the researcher was supported by individual college tutors, but not the whole of the college staff.

Cohen and Manion (1994: 92) suggest that the mechanisms of action research can help with feedback and then modifications, adjustments, directional changes and redefinitions can be used where necessary. Action research is a process which needs constant monitoring over the research period. There were various mechanisms used, including questionnaires, reflective dairy, structured and semi-structured interviews which were beneficial to the ongoing research, especially because the researcher is taking part in the action.
However, there were also issues concerning whether this research would stand up to scrutiny and whether the attributes of validity and reliability could be assured within the principal paradigm used in this research. This paradigm has these properties providing that the researcher is committed to obtaining a faithful description of others' understandings and perceptions, gaining full access to the knowledge and meanings of all those who took part in the questionnaires and the interviews, both structured and semi-structured.

There is an element of field experimental research in what I did as well as the above. Rosenthal and Jacobson (1968) conducted research into the question of whether teachers’ expectations of their students’ abilities in fact influenced the school performance of the latter. The findings showed that such differences did in fact exist, but that the differences between one group and the other tended to be concentrated in the first two or three years of schooling. As Bryman (2004:34) suggests “Field experiments happen in real life settings, such as classrooms and organisations as a result of the implementation of reforms or new policies”.

5.4 Introduction to research methods
There were various methods which were considered for the data collection and, over the next few pages, a detailed outline of the methods and their potential advantages and disadvantages will be described.

5.4.1 Questionnaires
Throughout the process of the research the questionnaires provided a great deal of information linked back to the aims of the research i.e. to test the development of career thoughts, feelings and actions amongst all students.

Questionnaires were chosen as a research tool, primarily because they could be given out in class and the researcher could stay with the group until all the questionnaires were completed, to try to ensure that if there were any enquiries about a question, or the questionnaires then she was at hand answers the
questions thus reducing the low response rates usually associated with this form of data collection. This process was handled in a careful way as the researcher was also their Careers Adviser and this may have posed a threat to the validity of the research, all interaction with students were recorded in the reflective diary, see appendix 13, 14 for an extract from the diary. The researcher had a very clear understanding of her role as the researcher and as the careers person working in the college and was fully aware that it might not be the same for the students she was working with in all the different groups. She also felt there might be issues for the staff of the college and that is why she completed the reflective diary. Firstly, to ensure she recorded all interactions with students taking part in the research and, secondly, to evaluate the services and interactions with students, see Appendix 13, 14 for details of the layout of the reflective diary and an extract from the diary.

There were issues around the fact that the research took place primarily on the non contractual days of work for the local Careers organisation, but this did not stop any student from asking for help, as they saw the researcher as the careers person. Every time I interacted with the students I would mention at the beginning of the process that it was not my normal day of work and that I was in the college doing my research, this seemed to have no or little effect and that is why the reflective diary was so useful.

Given the research techniques available, the reason for choosing this method was down to the fact of time and money and availability of students to get the results needed and maintain the rigour and breadth of information required for the research to be valid. The questionnaires had structured questions, mostly with five choices of answers. The questionnaires allowed the collection of data in a standard form, which helped the researcher in comparing groups
Advantages
Low cost
Not too time consuming for researcher
Control over timing and response to questions by checking questionnaires when they come in
Ease of analysis

Disadvantages
Lack of probing
Misunderstood questions
Not all the questions answered

5.4.2 Interviewing
One to one interviewing was considered to be another method of collecting more in-depth data from a smaller number of students over a given period of time. Although this required a great deal of organisational skills, time and money the advantages far out weight the disadvantages.

There are some major advantages to interviewing, the primary one being the adaptability of the process. A skilful interviewer can follow up ideas and help the process by probing the responses of the student and investigating the student's feelings and possible motivations for their responses. The interviewer can gauge the tone of voice and the facial expressions of the interviewee, their hesitations and any reluctance to answer. The skilful interviewer makes judgements and acts on them to help the process of gathering information, whereas the questionnaire responses have to be taken at face value.

Responses in an interview situation are very different, through the process mentioned earlier there can be clarification of information and a greater understanding of the person being interviewed and their point of view on the subject of both the interview process and the content of the interview.

Generally it is possible to gain more information from the interviewee through the skilful use of the techniques of the interviewer. That is not to say that there are not problems. The time taken to interview students is vast and transcribing the interviews afterwards is equally time consuming. Though as Wellington
(2000:74) suggests "that there is no deviation from the wording and the interviewer keeps to the set of questions which provides a high degree of data quality and consistency"

The advantages of this method were the control over the timing of when and where to interview, being able to book a suitable room for the interview, the planning and design allowed structured questions and the ability to probe into new ideas and areas and to clarify issues of special relevance and interest from the researcher's point of view. Plus, this interviewing method gave access to new information which could be used in the next set of structured questions for the interview process. One to one interviews give the chance to get in-depth results. It is about the process of career development and how the various interventions with the groups of students who were selected to get the new enhanced model within each programme had developed and also how each individual was responding to the added attention.

The main disadvantages were undoubtedly the cost and time-consuming nature of the interviews that took place over the one and two year programmes. Interpretation of the students' answers to the questions was problematic in the earlier interviews, with some students either not understanding the questions or not wanting to understand or cooperate in the interviews; though all students did agree at the beginning of the research and knew that a number within each programme would receive different levels of interactions throughout the two year period. Because some students were disruptive in their manner in answering the questions it was difficult to analyse the information and present the data which had been gathered during the interviews. The use of a tape machine does not always help a student to feel comfortable and some preferred that the research did not use this form of recording.
Advantages | Disadvantages
--- | ---
Structure | Time consuming
Control | Costly
Ability to probe new areas | Difficulty arranging interviews
Direct contact | Indifference to the interview
Generates enthusiasm in respondent | Can be difficult to record and is expensive

From a research viewpoint the interviews were the most suitable, because they allowed detailed questioning; however, this had important cost and analysis implications for the researcher.

5.4.3 Group Sessions
Small groups could be seen as a way around the problems associated with group discussions, but this method was discounted because of the cost in time and the likelihood that the quieter students would still not be taking an active part and may have been persuaded to say, write or act in manner different to what they were thinking, just to keep in with the crowd.

Advantages | Disadvantages
--- | ---
Structure | Time consuming
Feelings can be exposed | Difficulty with timing
Generates consensus | Quiet students do not talk
Group dynamics | Finding the optimum size of group
Posturing

5.5 Overview of Research Design and Students taking part in the research
As seen in the research methods section of this chapter the decision was made to use questionnaires and interviews to collect data from students over the research period. The table below lists the timetable of activities which took
place with each of the groups taking part in the research and what each group got in terms of service from the researcher.

Table 5.1  List of activities with all students taking part in the research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Group 0</th>
<th>Group A</th>
<th>Group B1</th>
<th>Group B2</th>
<th>Group Z</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Email all students about drop-in clinics</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertise the HE session</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other group sessions</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes, One group session in the first jointly with the students from the B2 group</td>
<td>Yes, One group session jointly with the students from the B1 group</td>
<td>Yes (only if in Group B1) at the beginning of the research. No if in Group A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviews as part of the Enhanced model</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes Interviews with researcher including Action Plans, Summer Activities Plan and review of plans throughout the research</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questionnaires to be completed</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All interactions with students recorded in the reflective diary</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table gives an overall picture of the design of the research, listing what each group received in terms of the activities carried out over their one and two year programmes. As the table shows there were clear differences between the groups 0, A, B1 and B2. The B2 group received the Enhanced Model based upon the mentoring and coaching techniques.

When deciding on the methods to be used in the collection of data from the students it was vital to ensure that there was a distinction made between the collection of data and the interactions covering the new "enhanced " model with
students as well as the careers guidance on offer. With such a variety of different groups there were a number of points which needed to be considered. Because some of the programmes were quite large and had quite busy timetables it was important that too much time was not taken from students' studies to ensure that the tutors would cooperate with the researcher and enable the researcher to gather as much relevant information, as quickly as possible. The timings for the questionnaires and interviews at college with students were planned to take place in tutorial slots throughout the year or, by arrangement with the tutor in charge of the programme, to take up part of their lesson, this was done on very few occasions because of the students' timetable and work commitments.

5.5.1 The Choice of Methods
There were four questionnaires which all groups completed during the research period 2003 to 2005. The interviews were only with small selective groups of students forming the B2 groups from across all the programmes taking part in the research. The interviews formed part of the 'Enhanced' Model.

5.5.2 Introduction to Questionnaires
Through the literature search it was apparent that there was certain information that it was vital to collect and in this section of the chapter a full explanation will be given as to what that was and how it affected the design of the questionnaires. The were four questionnaires used in this research over the two year research period, at the beginnings and ends of the first and second years of the programmes. Each questionnaire was given a name: first, second, third (autumn) and fourth (final) to make them easier to recognise and track. There were some established scales, which will be explained in more detail in this section of the chapter, that appeared on the first, second and fourth questionnaires.
5.5.3 The Design of Questionnaires

Questionnaire design was important in terms of the language, format and the total number of questions on each questionnaire as it set the stage for the rest of the research. The language used had to be kept simple as the students ranged from 16 to 40 years plus and educational levels ranging from no qualifications to 4 GCSEs grade Cs and above to people with a first degree in science.

5.5.4 Layout

The layout of the questions was important and clear instructions were provided on how to complete the questionnaire. Spaces were left between each question so as not to confuse students about where one question ended and the next question began. Bold typeface, underlining, tables and boxes were used to try to help the students to complete each answer fully before moving on to the next question.

5.5.5 Questionnaires - Different focus for each

Each questionnaire had a different focus i.e. the First Questionnaire covered the introduction of career planning, skills and the requirements of the students; whereas the Second Questionnaire was trying to find out where students sought help in education and job related information and introduced the students to assessment through a word association exercise. The function of the Third Questionnaire was to try to find out about the socio-economic background of students, whether the students had a part-time job and what that might be i.e. the occupational area. The Third Questionnaire covered where students were from, their career planning and whether the students knew their own strengths and weaknesses. The fourth questionnaire considered the students’ qualifications and where they hoped to be, or where they were actually going, at the end of the programme.
5.5.6 Established Scales
There were certain established scales which featured in the questionnaire design and these questions appeared on the first, second and fourth questionnaires and covered the following the areas; in the same format each time:

- Career decidedness (questions 8-10)
- Self concept clarity (questions 11 -13)
- Occupational information (questions 14 -16)
- Passive decision making (questions 17 -18)
- Career exploration (questions 19 -26)
- Career decision making self efficacy (questions 27 – 37)

Decidedness
Decidedness was measured by the Decidedness Scale of Career Decision Profile which is defined as how decided one is about his or her career or occupational choice. The Career Decision Profile (CDP) (Jones, 1998, 1989) is an instrument for both career research and counselling. It is based on a three-dimensional model of career decision statuses covering decidedness, self clarity, knowledge about occupations and information and decisiveness.

Self Clarity
Self clarity was measured by the three item Self clarity Scale of Career Decision Profile (CDP; Jones, 1998), in which Jones (1998) defined self clarity as how clearly a person understands his or her interests, personality and abilities, as well as how these characteristics fit into different occupations.

Career Decision Making Self Efficacy
Career decision making self efficacy (CDMSE) is measured by the Short Form of Career Decision Making Scale (Betz, Klein & Taylor, 1996). Career decision making self efficacy (Taylor & Betz, 1983; Betz, Klein & Taylor, 1996) is a construct to do with how far one believes that he or she is able to complete
successfully the tasks necessary for career decision making, including the five competence areas of career maturity (Crites, 1978):

- accurate self appraisal
- gathering occupational information
- goal selection
- making plans for the future
- problem solving

First developed by Taylor and Betz (1983), the Career Decision Making Scale has 50 items.

The questionnaire and interviewing methods complemented one another allowing a consistent question format throughout, though the questionnaires reached larger numbers of students they were backed up with in-depth interviewing with the selective groups who went through the Enhanced Model. The main reason for this choice was the opportunity to see students in class, normally with the tutor present, either as part of the lesson or in tutorial time and therefore to have more control when students were completing questionnaires. There was always another person in the room, so if the students had any questions both the researcher and the tutor could help the students complete the questionnaires. However, there are issues around large groups completing questionnaires as some students complete quicker than others and at times the noise level went up as time went on and this could have made it more difficult for the remaining students to concentrate on completing the forms, so they may have rushed through the questions and just ticked any box to finish and leave the room or get on with the lecture, there was evidence of this from the interviews with the some students from the NDAM, B2 group.

5.5.7 First questionnaire
This questionnaire focused on what students were doing before they started their programme. This questionnaire helped to gauge what type of skills they might be bringing to their present studies, also whether they had seen either
the Careers or Personal Advisor before and whether this experience had been viewed as useful. This information helped us (me) to understand the students’ perceptions of the process and whether they saw the Careers or Personal Adviser as a person they would go and see for help with career planning and job opportunities.

Planning their career was considered by five questions in the first questionnaire. There was an introduction to the terms of coaching, mentoring and counselling to see how many of the students might know the terms. Learning style was an important area and the question covering this tried to find out the students’ best ways of learning, which linked straight back to the research. The other areas covered in this first questionnaire were planning and reviewing their actions, where to find help if required and looking at different options for each individual student.

5.5.8 Second questionnaire

This questionnaire covered the main influences on the students and what were their information sources. As for the established scales which appeared in this questionnaire, they formed part of the anchor for the research into the students’ decision making, the influences on their decision making and their awareness of opportunities available to them. This information helped gauge whether the inputs from the researcher with the all ‘selected’ groups of students made them more self and career aware than the other groups taking part in the research.

The first page elicited gender and age, then question three covered how much time the student had spent with the Careers/Personal Adviser during the period from 2003 till summer 2004. The next page of this second questionnaire focused on the main influences on the students, for example this could be parent(s), friends, tutors and others within the college. If this was the case then there could be issues relating to impartiality of advice and guidance and possible recruitment issues. If the advice was coming from elsewhere, from whom and what did it consist of in terms of subject areas? The outside
influences could be varied and the literature search suggested that they could have a major influence on student thinking, especially with regard to information, advice and guidance coming from Careers Services companies or Connexions.

The second questionnaire covered the sources of help, advice or support students had sought in a number of areas, including the following: CV writing and applications forms for jobs and programmes, how students could present themselves at an interview and the identification of further and higher education programmes and careers that may suit them.

5.5.9 Third Questionnaire
The Third Questionnaire was completed in the autumn term of the second year with the higher education students and with all the National Diploma programmes except for the ND Acting (who completed part of this questionnaire covering main wage earner and part-time working with the fourth questionnaire at the end of the research) and the Access programme which was a one year only programme, ending in summer 2004. The focus of this questionnaire was to analyse the socio-economic groups the students were from, based on who was the main earner and what their job title was.

This questionnaire was also designed to establish whether the student worked, (if so how many hours a week and what they were doing as a part-time job) and whether there were students who were not working. The other questions covered where the students lived, not their addresses but whether they lived in a village; town or city. One area was missing and that was the countryside, though some students did mention this whilst completing the questionnaire and that is why it is included in the results.

There were a number of other questions covering what students were considering doing at the end of the programme they were on. The final two questions were about what strengths and weaknesses they thought they had.
A great deal of information was gathered from these two questions and to make it easier to understand the information was placed into categories from Peter Hawkins (1999) book The Art of Building Windmills, and from Lee Harvey et al (1997) Graduates Work, grouped under the headings of People Skills, Self-Reliance Skills, Generalist Skills and Specialist skills.

5.5.10 Fourth Questionnaire
The Fourth Questionnaire was completed by the higher education students in April 2005; the other National Diploma students completed this questionnaire in May 2005. This Final Questionnaire needed to ensure that data were collected on how long the students had been studying at the college, as mentioned earlier in this chapter some students could have started on the Foundation programme and proceeded to the one year First Diploma before starting on the National Diploma (a two year programme). They could also stay at the college to do a higher education programme, with yet another two years at the same further education college; five years in total. It was a norm that a percentage of students from the National Diploma in Animal Management (two year programme) would go on to the HND in that subject so that would mean that the student could have been at the college between four to six years.

The established scales were the same as before and in the same format, which made then easier to code and analyse. The fourth questionnaire proved extremely useful, especially with regard to the National Diploma Acting group who had only been seen twice by the researcher, once at the beginning and again for the fourth questionnaire.

Table 5.2 shows that two programmes, HND and Access to HE were split into only two groups, ND Acting remained in one group, whilst the remaining ND programmes were all split into three groups.
### Table 5.2  Allocation of Groups for each Programme taking part in the Research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group 0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group B1</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group B2</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>√</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of Groups</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The National Diplomas programmes were spilt into 3 groups and given the title of A, B1 and B2 (except for the ND Acting), see Table 5.3 below which clearly shows that there were some retention issues for the college as over the period of the four questionnaires a number of students left the programme and a small number were absence for the collection of data via the questionnaire timetable.
### Table 5.3 Timetable of Research Questionnaires with each Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Courses taking part in research</th>
<th>1st Questionnaire Completed see dates below</th>
<th>2nd Questionnaire Completed see dates below</th>
<th>3rd Questionnaire Completed see dates below</th>
<th>4th Questionnaire Completed see dates below</th>
<th>Retention Rate on the research*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HND Animal Science</td>
<td>Oct 03 (16)</td>
<td>Oct 04 (10)</td>
<td>Dec 04 (14)</td>
<td>Apr 05 (13)</td>
<td>81%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ND Animal Management</td>
<td>*Mar 04 (38)</td>
<td>May 04 (31)</td>
<td>Sept 04 (33)</td>
<td>May 05 (33)</td>
<td>85% (*65%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ND Fish Management</td>
<td>Sept 03 (20)</td>
<td>May 04 (13)</td>
<td>Sept 04 (11)</td>
<td>May 05 (13)</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ND Horse Management</td>
<td>Sept 03 (22)</td>
<td>May 04 (16)</td>
<td>Sept 04 (13)</td>
<td>May 05 (14)</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ND Acting-</td>
<td>Nov 03 (17)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>May 05 (14)</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to HE Nursing</td>
<td>Oct 03 (6)</td>
<td>May 04 (7)#</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>123 (119)</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>87 (82)</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*defined as the percentage of students participating in the first stage research who also participated in all subsequent stages of the research

**Key**
- This group completed part of the second questionnaire when they completed the fourth questionnaire in 2005.
- Numbers in bold = numbers on the programme at that time
- Numbers in the brackets = the number of students completing questionnaires
- *Indicates a larger group in September 2003 of 51 students, but by the time the research started with this group there were only 38 students remaining in March 2004.
- # indicates a part-time student who completed the programme over two years instead of the normal one year.

#### 5.6 Introduction to the Students taking part in the Research

A total of 129 students took part in the research, initially made up from three, two year National Diploma programmes, a one year access programme and two higher education programmes, totalling six groups at the start of the research. There were some changes over the period of the two years as one of the higher education programmes only completed the initial (first) questionnaire.
and than there was no further contact with them, though the researcher did try. The decision to delete all data collected from the first questionnaire completed with this programme was taken as they had ceased to participate further in the research.

There was a similar development on one of the two year National Diploma programmes where students only completed the first and last questionnaire and had no other contact during the period of the research. To ensure there were sufficient numbers of students taking part in the research another two year National Diploma programme was brought into the research in March 2004 and remained until the research ended in June 2005.

The remaining students taking part were one higher education programme, an Access to Higher Education programme and four National Diploma programmes. As explained above one National Diploma programme did not enter the research until early March 2004, six months after the other programmes had started.

5.6.1 Higher National Diploma (HND)
The Higher National Diploma (HND) Animal Science programme was the only higher education programme run at the semi-rural campus of the college. The HND normally attracts a high proportion of students from the college's National Diploma (ND) in Animal Management (AM) and one or two students from the ND Horse Management (HM) programme, though some of these students had started on the one year First Diploma in Horse Care. Following this path the students can be at the college for up to five years. There were ten students who decided at the end of the National Diploma in Animal Management to carry on studying for the HND. There were students from the county and a handful from the rest of the Midlands.
At the beginning of the Higher National Diploma programme there were sixteen students, made up of two males and the rest females. At the end there were still two males and ten females (81% retention).

5.6.2 National Diploma programmes

The National Diploma programmes of study are two years in length and full time. The programmes taking part in the research were Acting, Animal Management, Fish Management and Horse Management. The National Diploma is equivalent to two/three A levels. Each programme is module based and each module can be awarded at pass, merit or distinction level. These programmes attract students from the county, East Midlands and across the United Kingdom and occasionally from abroad.

The majority of the students attracted to these programmes are between the ages of sixteen and eighteen. The entry requirements for the National Diploma are very similar to those for A levels. Students are required to have four GCSE grades A to C including English Language and either Maths or Science. The other type of entry would be via a First Diploma or National Certificate in a related area; however, some students who took part in research also had A/S awards in two to three subjects as well as the required GCSEs. The requirements for mature students can be varied. All potential students are interviewed by the tutors (Land-based or Performing Arts subjects) at the college. The National Diploma in Acting selection process includes both an application form and an audition.

National Diploma Acting

There have been a number of problems surrounding the involvement of this group of students. An approach to work with these students was made to their tutor. After the initial questionnaire was completed the tutor in charge was away from work for several weeks, this lead to difficulties and the decision was made that this group would not be seen again until the end of the research.
National Diploma Animal Management (NDAM)
This group of students came into the research in March 2004, which was later than the other National Diploma programmes. This was due to the problems with the National Diploma in Acting programme and to ensure there were sufficient numbers in the research. The researcher also acted as their Careers/Personal Adviser and initially saw the above students early in September 2003 to introduce the students to the services on offer from the Connexions Services.

A number of issues were created by the tutors in charge of programmes and the above group have had their fair share of change in the period 2003 to 2005. The NDAM students changed their tutor each year which is unusual. Their first year tutor left in the summer of 2004 and a new tutor started in September 2004, but he in turn left within the academic year. (The second year tutor also taught on the HND in Animal Management). The above programme started with fifty one students and finished with thirty three. This shows a high recruitment rate and that retention is quite poor (65%). The group was made up of mostly young females, barring one young male and two mature students.

National Diploma Fish Management (NDFM)
There were twenty three students who completed the first questionnaire in September 2003. By the beginning of the second year the figure was down to thirteen and they remained until the end of the programme. The NDFM Group had the same problems as the NDAM programme, with a highly experienced tutor leaving in early September 2004, though he had seen the students through the first year of their Diploma programme.

There are normally only a handful of First Diploma fish management students that reach the required standard to go on to study for the programme at National Diploma level, but the vast majority of students do not. The majority of students on the programme were male, except for two females, both in their late teens. The ages of students varied considerably with a few sixteen year
olds; several young people aged seventeen to nineteen and some in their twenties. There was also the occasional thirty year old and one forty six year old mature student, retention was very low (48%).

**National Diploma Horse Management (NDHM)**
The NDHM programme normally attracts students from around the Midlands. The students vary in age but primarily this programme attracts sixteen to eighteen year olds, however in the research group there were a handful of students over eighteen. The students vary in academic ability, skills and knowledge of horses.

The NDHM students become very confident on a professional level. The theory is that they are working with a large animal and they need to be confident in their ability to get the best results from the animal they are working with. This, however, does not always reflect their knowledge and ability in the rest of college life. The majority of the students on the programme are female and there were only two males on the cohort 2003-2005. There were twenty four students who started in September 2003 but one student did not want to take part in the research. By the beginning of the second year there were thirteen students and the number remained the same till the end of the programme. There were six students who left in October 2003 and the rest left in the following October (54% retention).

**5.6.3 Access to Higher Education Nursing**
The one year full time (or two year part time) Access to Higher Education Nursing programme, is designed to prepare students to progress to a diploma or degree level programme in Nursing and related health and social care or social work areas. The programme is designed for those individuals who are over the age of twenty one, though amongst the students on the programme taking part in the research there were people as young as nineteen, whilst the
oldest was in her mid forties. On this one year access programme the students completed just two questionnaires.

5.7 Introduction to Interviews

In planning and conducting interviews with a wide range of students there are some very important principles to be decided beforehand so that detailed planning can take place. The interviews normally took place in tutorial times, within the Careers and Information Room at the college or within a classroom near to where the tutorials were taking place so that the students were in familiar surroundings wherever possible. All the programmes taking part in the research were taught differently and therefore needed to be co-ordinated by the researcher to ensure that the timings for interviews with students from different programmes happened at around about the same time; this did not always happen but in most cases it did.

5.7.1 The Purpose of the Interviews

The purpose of this type of interaction in the interview was two-fold. First it was the collection of data by a number of methods including using a tape recorder, written notes by the researcher and in the last interaction the students completed a form whilst the researcher read out the questions. This process of interviewing largely formed the coaching process used with the 'selective' group. The same format was used with all the 'selective' groups and the analysis of data will be presented later in this chapter via the use of case studies as part of the overall results of the research. The wording of questionnaires and interviews can be seen as subjective by the respondents and their misunderstandings can lead to great problems with subconscious bias. Analysing responses can also present many problems; Moser and Kalton (1971:271) describe the survey interview as "a conversation between interviewer and respondent with the purpose of eliciting certain information from the respondent". They go on to say that this "might appear a straightforward matter, but the attainment of a successful interview is much more complex than
this statement might suggest”. Wiseman and Aron (1972) liken the process of interviewing to fishing.

All of the students in the ‘selective’ group (Group B2) had seen the researcher when the format of the research was presented to the students and when they completed the First Questionnaire in September 2003, October 2003 or March 2004. The format was four interviews with each student in the B2 groups, except for the higher education group which took part in five interviews.

5.7.2 Self Referred Students (Group Z)
There were a number of students who had self referred themselves to be interviewed by the researcher. These students did not receive the Enhanced Model of interviewing and career coaching. They received a traditional careers interview model, the researcher’s model is a cross between a client centred and an opportunity structured models. The model is used where a student requests an interview to see the Personal Adviser (Careers Adviser) to discuss areas that are careers related i.e. job opportunities, higher education. There are a number of differences between the model of guidance that the Group Z received and the Enhanced model. For those students who requested and booked an interview to cover the above subject areas, it would be a careers guidance interview not a careers coaching interview. The students in Group Z had to request/book time with the Adviser whereas the career coaching was at set times throughout the process and a full agenda of context and subject material was covered.

5.7.3 Selective students for the Enhanced model (Group B2)
These interviews laid out the Enhanced Model. There were four to five interviews over a two year period of the research which covered the areas of career planning, action plan, review and follow up and review/final interview. The overview of the Enhanced model used with the Group B2 has to be seen in context of the interview, the set questions and the process of asking the
questions. For an overview of where the career coaching techniques came into the process of questions and the context of feedback and review with the students, see table 5.5.

The B2s all took part in interviews based on the following format:

(A) = Introduction of student to interview

(B) = Develop Action Plan with students, assess their short and long terms goals and developing with them their summer time activities

(C) = Review and reflection of the summer time activities, reviewing the short and long term plans e.g. Who would help the participants achieve their goals

(D) = Follow up session, reviewing and monitoring with the student their goals

(E) = Structured session, reviewing the process of interviews with the researcher and the student to plan for the future and to find out who has helped the student through the process

The interviews followed this format with the B2s. The above format of interviews and the underlying structured process formed part of the coaching element of the intervention and in turn the process. The coaching techniques provided the soft skills and techniques to enable students to start to plan and develop themselves.
Table 5.4 Structured interview timetable with the Group B2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject areas</th>
<th>HND Animal Science</th>
<th>ND Animal Man.</th>
<th>ND Fish Man</th>
<th>ND Horse Man</th>
<th>Access to HE Nursing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(B) Develop Career Action Plan Summer-time List Activities</td>
<td>Apr/May 2004</td>
<td>May 2004</td>
<td>May/May 2004</td>
<td>Mar/ Apr 2004</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>(D)</em> Follow up - Job hunting and higher education Action Plan</td>
<td>Jan 2005</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The National Diploma (ND) programme did not receive this input as they were on their work placements which formed part of their programme of study.

5.7.4 Format of Interviews with the Group B2 students

The first interview with all students who had been pre-selected for this Group happened within the period February to April 2004. As explained earlier these interviews either took place in the Careers and Information Room at the college or within a classroom nearby to where the tutorials were taking place. The students taking part included the selected students for the Group B2 students.

The first interview covered careers and setting out action plans for the length of their respective programmes. There were two forms which the researcher went through with each student, asking the questions and then writing down their answers. The first interview form listed the following questions:

What do you think of the careers input so far?
What are your career goals?
How are you going to achieve them?
What is your father's or partner's occupation, or were the students self funding?
Did they live locally to the college, did they travel some distance or live in?

(See Appendix 5 and 6).
5.7.5 Second and Third Interviews
Throughout the interview process there was a secondary flow of information that took place with the Group B2 within each of the programmes research. The interviews with the Group B2 were of a dual nature, firstly notes were taken as part of the action plan and the review and reflection which were part of the model being researched into, and the other part of the interviews was the collection of data. Throughout the process the students were allowed to ask questions. The students did ask questions about a selection of other subjects including entry to higher education, what could they do with their qualifications, deferring entry to higher education, finding a job, curriculum vitae writing, application forms and so on. Through the process of these meetings, interviews, talking and discussion subjects the students went through the process of career guidance coaching; this approach was used throughout the research, whether to satisfy the students' agenda or the researcher's objectives. Usually it was both.

5.7.6 Follow-up and Final Interviews (fourth or fifth)
The follow-up interviews were only used with the Group B2s studying for the HND, which means they were interviewed five times whereas the ND B2s were interviewed four times.

A structured interview was used in the final stages of the research. In the structured interview the students wrote down their answers after the researcher read out the questions. The researcher tried to ensure that each student understood the meaning of the questions which were made up of a combination of closed questions, eliciting factual information about the respondent, and open questions, usually to elicit attitudinal information. Most students also read the questions for themselves. Though this method took slightly longer, the answers were in the students' own style. This was used as an alternative method and there are some new advantages and disadvantages, which are set out below:
Advantages
Some control
Collect more information
Students in control

Disadvantages
No opportunity to explore
Students may have problems with spelling or expressing what they want to say
Students may prefer that the interviewer wrote down their answers

The principal reasoning that lay behind trying out this method was that the researcher had a theory that if the students completed the form in their own style they might give more information than could be generated by the researcher taping the interview. In previous interviews some students had objected to the use of the tape recording machine.

The questions in the final interview covered the area of decision making and who they felt had been most helpful in assisting them to make decisions about their future. Other areas which were covered were their choices of job/career and the intermediate future and covered how the person thought they had developed over the two year period. Page 3 of the interview asked the students to comment on their experience of the regular contact and working with the researcher, this question formed part of the main thrust of the research.

5.7.7 Analysing the interviews
Analysis of the interview transcripts was an intensive process. The interviews were recorded by a tape recorder or by hand written notes, however it was found that the majority of students did not like the thought of the tape recorder and preferred the researcher to write down their answers. Although this process took longer, the students preferred it so it was adopted with most students.
5.7.8 Issues of research

It seemed at times that the students were indifferent to the interview process and the researcher. The most suitable method for gaining the required information was the one-to-one structured interview, to find out from each student about their perception of the careers related input and their action plans for achieving their goals, whatever they might be. The researcher would ask the students questions about areas of their programme and try to engage with them. Although this worked many times, if the student was unwilling then the interview was stopped and no further interviews were conducted, though questionnaire data were still gathered.

5.8 Research procedure and respondents

At the beginning of the research there was a detailed meeting with each tutor/lecturer to explain the process of the research and what would be covered with each programme of students and in particular with each of the groups within each programme.

The splitting up of programmes into groups was mostly done by the tutors because they had already split the students up into smaller tutorial groups which they saw throughout the year, both in groups and individually. When the researcher presented her research format to the students there was no compulsion for the students to take part, they were given the opportunity to choose whether or not to do so. In the presentation to the students and staff the researcher explained that some students would receive more of an input than others, but assured all students and tutors/lecturers that under the partnership agreement between the college and the Careers Service company that any students wishing to see an impartial careers/personal adviser could do so and would be seen by appointment or at the drop-in sessions. This changed when the Connexions service became fully operational in mid 2004. From then on, the researcher’s paid work role was strictly to work with 13 to 19 year old students, therefore those over 19 years old were seen by the researcher outside the Connexions umbrella, with the agreement of with the tutors.
The students taking part in the B2 groups were not self-selected as explained earlier in this chapter; therefore there were some implications for the students, the researcher and the research. We are all aware that if we freely take part in an activity then we are more likely to be interested in it and consider that it might help us, and then we may well be more positive towards those who we consider are helping us to achieve our goals. However, if we are told we have been selected to take part then perhaps we tend not to be so cooperative. This may mean that the latter approach may not have been the most suitable to be used with the programmes taking part in the research. However, a self selected group of enthusiastic participants would have skewed the results, therefore the random selection was the most appropriate approach to take to get statistically meaningful results. Although it was clearly explained at the beginning of the research that students did not have to take part if they did not want to, selecting the groups may have lead to resentment or poor cooperation. However, if the new approach was ever rolled out to students like these then it is likely that they would not be given a choice either so the lack of choice probably reflected a real world situation. If self selected students had gone through the process of the Enhanced Model then they may have been more predisposed to like and respond more to the Enhanced Model, thus making it look more effective than it really was.

5.9 Description of data collected from questionnaires and interviews.
5.9.1 Profile of students taking part in the research
This section presents information on the students who participated in the research including: gender and age, see the Tables below which shows the age of students when completing the first questionnaire and how many students on each programme. It should be noted that there were no questions on any of the questionnaires about disability or ethnicity.
Table 5.5 Age of students when completing the first questionnaire
(First Questionnaire, question 39)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
<th>19</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>21</th>
<th>22</th>
<th>23</th>
<th>Over 23</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HND</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total %</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>21.8%</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>21.8%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*NDAM</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Although the students on the NDA course did not complete all the questionnaires these students did complete the first and fourth ones and their results have remained in. As the above table indicates, the highest proportion of students were aged between sixteen to eighteen years, the next largest age groups were the over twenty three year olds and the nineteen year olds.

*NDAM completed their first questionnaire in March 2004, whereas the other programmes completed the first questionnaire in September or October 2003.

5.9.2 Over twenty four year olds

With regard to the over twenty-four year olds, they proved to be interesting as most of these students were on the NDFM and were male, the highest proportion of this type of student at the beginning of the research. This could be for a number of reasons, first the NDFM had an excellent reputation for quality teaching and resultant job offers over the years and the course was based on the reputation of the two principal tutors. There are only a handful of fish management courses in the UK, the College's main rivals being in the South of England, where one of the principal tutors went to work in September 2004. The tutors wrote a number of articles in the leading fishery magazines, which can attract attention to new ideas and the activities of the college and the different programmes. The college is also well placed in terms of rail and road.
links across the country, as the majority of the over twenty four year olds were not from the immediate area; in fact this programme had attracted students from all over the country.

It was inevitable that the Access to Higher Education programme would have a number of students over the age of twenty four years old, most of whom came from the local market town and were females with children, they were considering going on to training at the local university in the county city. The other programme which is worth considering is the NDAM, with three students over the age of twenty years old; they all lived local to the college and were female.

5.9.3 The sixteen to eighteen groups
It is important to understand the 16 to 18 year old age group students in Further Education and their retention on rates in education and for providing funding to Further Education colleges. These students probably have already experienced one transition at fourteen as the schooling system requires them to move schools in year 10 and another transition when they decided to leave school and go to college at sixteen. This might be one of the reasons why students at the college start off studying the First Diploma, then study for the National Diploma and want to stay at the college to complete the HND, they simply do not want to move again as they are happy with the environment.

Another factor is decision making in the numbers of students taking a sequence of courses is their sources of advice. There are some very important choices to be made by potential students entering further education and those who are already in college in terms of finding out the most suitable support, information, advice and guidance in which pathway would be best for them. A Careers Adviser working for an independent organisation is required by professional bodies to provide a quality advice service whereas a careers adviser in a
college is paid by the college so the more students attending the college the more their funding increases.

**Table 5.6** Ages of students in the B2 group at the beginning of research (First Questionnaire, question 39)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Progs</th>
<th>16</th>
<th>17</th>
<th>18</th>
<th>19</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>21</th>
<th>22</th>
<th>23</th>
<th>24 &amp; Over</th>
<th>Not known</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HND</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Combining the age group 19 – 23 together and comparing the age range in the B2 group and those in the rest of the research the $X^2$ test shows that the two samples are the same with no significant differences in the age distribution of each group. ($X^2_{\text{actual}} = 1.84$, $X^2_{005.5} = 11.07$). This suggests that the tutors did in deed select the students in the B2 groups randomly.

The NDAM programme that came into the research in March 2004, whilst the other programmes, B2 groups came into the research in Sept/Oct 2003.

**Table 5.7 Gender figures on all courses taking part in research**
(First questionnaire, question 38)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Female nos. begin</th>
<th>Female nos. at end</th>
<th>Male nos. at begin</th>
<th>Male nos. at end</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Retention rate 79.8%  
Retention rate 66.7%

127
Table 5.8 clearly shows that there were a high proportion of females on the majority of the programmes involved in the research, in fact the only two programmes that were different were the NDFM where there was only two female at the beginning of the research and the rest were males. The NDA was a little more evenly proportioned in terms of female to male, but this might be down to the selection by the tutor, or those students who applied and got the necessary exam results to gain entry onto the programme in question. What the above table shows is that the students who were the minority group on their programme did seem to have the staying power to stay on the programme until the end.

Table 5.8  B2 groups female to male membership at the beginning and end of research (First questionnaire, question 38)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Female nos begin</th>
<th>Female nos at end</th>
<th>Male nos at begin</th>
<th>Male nos at end</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Retention rate 70.8% Retention rate 60.0%

There is a significant difference between the male/female ratio in the Group B2 and in the other groups ($X^2_{calc}=4.47, X^2_{0.05,1} = 3.84$). Therefore there was a high proportion of females selected for Group B2 (83%) than there were in the other Groups (72%). The selection was done by the tutors and was not controlled by the researcher.
### Table 5.9  Social class and numbers on each programme taking part in the research (Third questionnaire, questions 3a, 3b)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social class</th>
<th>HND</th>
<th>NDAM</th>
<th>NDFM</th>
<th>NDHM</th>
<th>NDA</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Higher professional</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Lower professional</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Intermediate occupations</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Small employers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Lower supervisory technical</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Semi routine</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Routine occupation</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>32.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Unemployed</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key**

1. = Higher managerial and professional occupations
2. = Lower managerial and professional occupations
3. = Intermediate occupations
4. = Small employers and own account workers
5. = Lower supervisory technical
6. = Semi routine occupations
7. = Routine occupations
8. = Never worked and long-term unemployed

This research attempted to see if there was any correlation between social classes and where people lived and whether this had any effect on the students’ immediate choices of job, education or training after leaving college in 2005; a survey to find out what previous students were doing, or hoping to do, took place in late September 2005.
5.10 Number of college students with the social class of main job earner
(Third questionnaire, questions 3a, 3b)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social class reference number</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>College students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main job earner</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continued at the college</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>32.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New student to the college</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>65.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Returners to college</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(previously attended)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: This information was collected at time 3 at the beginning of the second year of the National Diploma and HND programmes and therefore a number of students had already left the course they were on.

Key: Taken from The National Statistics Socio-economic Classification Analytic Classes (2005)
1. = Higher professional
2. = Lower professional
3. = Intermediate occupations
4. = Small employers
5. = Lower supervisory technical
6. = Semi routine
7. = Routine occupation
8. = Unemployed

5.9.4 Main job earner (Parental or partner occupation)
The Table 5.11 above considers the main job earner in the family where the student normally lived, their social class and the relative proportions staying on at the college or coming in new. The most common social classes were 3, 4, and 7, intermediate occupations, small employers and those in routine occupations.

A third of the students taking part in the research at the time of the collection of data in September/October 2004 were students who had continued with their education at the same college as their previous programme, which could have been either a one year course or possibly a two years plus course and some students had already been at the college between four and five years.

Though this does seem a long time to be at one place to study, the question which might be worth considering is whether the social class of the main earner
in the family has any bearing on students staying on at college. The table above goes some way to explaining the correlation between the main earner, their social class and whether students continue with their education at the same establishment.

There has been quite a lot of research into staying on rates in education and parental occupations; Payne, Cheng and Witherspoon (1996) suggest that in the 1990s there was variation between the regions of England, with the highest staying on rates in Greater London and the lowest staying on rates in the North. They were also suggested that there was a link between parental occupations and GCSE results and students staying on in education post GCSEs.

Table 5.11 Highest qualification before start of programme at the college in 2003 (Final questionnaire, question 2)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualifications</th>
<th>Level</th>
<th>HND</th>
<th>NDAM</th>
<th>NDFM</th>
<th>NDHM</th>
<th>NDA</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Diploma</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>19.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 GCSEs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 GCSEs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 5 GCSEs</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>28.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Diploma</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 A levels</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NVQ Level 3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other qualifications</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above table has shown some surprising entry results and some predictable results. Some students seem to have started at the college on the one First Diploma course which dovetails into the National Diploma two year course, some even staying at the college to do the Higher National Diploma two year course. The table 5.12 shows the most common entry level qualifications were students with 4 or more GCSEs (47.3%) and those with a first diploma (19%). It is interesting the numbers of students with other types of qualifications (21%).
Table 5.12 Continuing students at the college
(Final questionnaire, question 1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>Previously at the college on First Diploma before entry to ND</th>
<th>Previously ND Animal Management before entry to HNDAS</th>
<th>Previous ND Horse Management before entry to HNDAS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ND Acting</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>9 (1 left)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>8 (4 left)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HND AS</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9 (2 left)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>26 (5 left)</td>
<td>9 (2 left)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals on course</td>
<td>52 (5 left)</td>
<td>18 (2 left)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are a number of students who stayed on at the college to go onto the next level of study. The numbers in the brackets represent those who then left the course before the completion date. One interesting point is the NDHM programme where fifty per cent of the students from the First Diploma course decided to leave or were asked to leave the course. The recruitment from the ND Animal Management and ND Horse Management courses to go onto study for the HND is quite high, as there were only sixteen students on the course and ten were previous college students. From all groups in the research, there were a number that felt they had made the wrong decision and on reflection should have left the college after the end of their National Diploma, rather than move on to the HND.

5.9.5 Awareness of Training and Development techniques

Question 5 in the first questionnaire covered the students’ awareness of the training and development techniques which would be used in the research. It asked whether or not they had ever come across the terms “mentoring”, “coaching” or “counselling”; the students were asked to tick yes, no or not sure. The results were that counselling (100), coaching (79) and mentoring (72). So counselling was better known than the other two, but both coaching and
mentoring had a similar number of students who had come across these training and development techniques. There could be a number of reasons for this finding, particularly in the case of mentoring as there were a number of mentoring programmes taking place in schools across the country, for example there are several different types of mentoring in schools and colleges where business people go into the schools to help students to improve their grades and improve the retention levels of the schools. These types of activities are normally arranged via the school or the local education business companies. There are also links within universities to local schools forming part of work experience programmes for undergraduate across the country. With particular regard to coaching this might have been through sports coaching.

5.9.6 Preferred Context Learning of Students

The Preferred Context Learning Style of students appeared on the First Questionnaire as Question 6 and was particularly relevant as the research progressed to examine whether learning style influenced the outcomes of the Enhanced Model which were used with the Group B students. The question asked the students to think about how they learnt best in school or college. This question gave them a number of styles to choose from as seen below. The students were given the choice to list as many of the learning styles which they thought applied to them as individuals, therefore some students ticked more than one box. The learning styles of students could have an input into the Enhanced Model used with the Group B2, as primarily the sessions involved practical seminar activities and one to one interventions with students, therefore those students in Group B2 whose learning style fell into these learning styles could be expected to benefit the most from the experience.
Table 5.13  Preferred Context Learning by Group
(First questionnaire, question 6)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Group 0</th>
<th>Group A</th>
<th>Group B1</th>
<th>Group B2</th>
<th>Group Z</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Practical activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(by doing)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(21.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By observing others</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(16.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(12.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(14.7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group work, seminars</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(17.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One to one</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(16.5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The students were allowed to tick as many boxes which were relevant to their particular learning style identified by themselves.

The $X^2$ test shows the learning styles are consistent across all the Groups, confirming a random sample was taken. $X^2_{calc} = 5.74$, $X^2_{(0.05,30)} = 31.41$.

The above Table 5.13 shows that the most popular is practical activities by doing, followed by group work seminars and a close third and fourth are by observing others and one to one working. The other areas of reading and writing was not listed as highly but are very relevant for education and learning. This might have been one of the reasons why the above programmes are popular with the students as there are more vocational elements in the National Diploma courses than say the traditional post 16 courses like ‘A’ levels. The other courses i.e. Access to Higher Education and the HND modules were different as they attracted students who were looking at higher education and were already mature students. The HND was already a higher education course. However the overall differences are not significant. The table below gives the reader of the students’ preference of learning styles on particular programmes taking part in the research 2003 to 2005.
Table 5.14 – Preferred Context Learning by Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practical activities (by doing)</th>
<th>HND</th>
<th>NDAM</th>
<th>NDFM</th>
<th>NDHM</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>NDA</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| By observing others           | 14  | 37   | 18   | 21   | 6      | 13  | 109    
  |                               |     |      |      |      | (21.9%)|     |        |
| Reading                       | 11  | 21   | 11   | 11   | 5      | 4   | 63     
  |                               |     |      |      |      | (16.7%)|     |        |
| Writing                       | 12  | 30   | 9    | 12   | 6      | 4   | 73     
  |                               |     |      |      |      | (12.7%)|     |        |
| Group work, seminars          | 9   | 32   | 14   | 18   | 5      | 9   | 87     
  |                               |     |      |      |      | (14.7%)|     |        |
| One to one                    | 10  | 28   | 15   | 14   | 5      | 10  | 82     
  |                               |     |      |      |      | (16.5%)|     |        |
| Totals                        | 66  | 176  | 80   | 93   | 32     | 50  | 497    |

5.9.7 Home location

The table below shows that the majority of students lived in a village (this includes students who may have lived in college or rented accommodation whilst studying for their qualification). This information came from the third questionnaire, which the students completed in the autumn term 2004 after returning from their summer break. There were a number of students who had either dropped out of their respective courses by then or were not present (a total of 38% drop out rate).

Table: 5.15 Main home where students lives out of term time
(Third questionnaire, questions 5a, 5b)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programmes</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Town</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Countryside</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HNDAS</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The various programmes that took part in the research at the College mainly seemed to attract people from the local area, though there were a handful from the wider East Midlands. The majority of the students came from the local region and the main city. There were a small number of students from...
elsewhere. The figures may vary due to the time of year when the collection of data happened via the questionnaires, i.e. students on holidays, students may have left a course. However it is clear that the majority (78.8%) lived within the county.

5.10 Working with Careers Adviser/Personal Adviser
Comparing the useful and non useful responses from those that had worked with a CA 66.7% had found it useful. The differences between the groups are not significant ($X^{2}_{(CALC)}=6.79$, $X^{2}_{(3,0.05)}=7.81$)

Table 5.16 Groups - Working with CA or PA useful
(First questionnaire, questions 2, 3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Useful</th>
<th>Not useful</th>
<th>Does not apply</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>42.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>38.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>38.9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19</td>
<td>52.8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>34.3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>45.7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>40.7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>44.4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>17.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>52</td>
<td>46.4</td>
<td>112</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.22 considers if there are any differences between age groups and their perception of working with the CA. Although the over eighteens were more likely to have found the interaction useful, the differences are not significant ($X^{2}_{(CALC)}=3.03$, $X^{2}_{(1,0.05)}=3.84$). There are only 111 students in this data set, rather than the 112 in the above tables because one student failed to give their age.
Table 5.17 Ages - Working with CA or PA useful
(First questionnaire, questions 2, 3 and 39)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ages</th>
<th>Working with CA or PA useful</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Useful</td>
<td>Not useful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 plus</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.18 Gender – Working with CA or PA useful

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Working with CA or PA useful</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Useful</td>
<td>Not useful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comparing whether the genders had or had not seen a CA or PA the females were much more likely to have consulted a CA or PA than the males, this is significant $X^2_{(\text{calc})} = 4.79$ $X^2_{(0.05,1)} = 3.84$

For those that had worked with a CA or PA before there was not a significant difference between the females and males on to whether they found it useful $X^2_{(\text{calc})} = 1.50$ $X^2_{(0.05,1)} = 3.84$

5.11 Summary

This Methods Chapter considered the various methods which could be used in the collection of data with all the students taking part in the research whether or not they were part of the Group B2 who were subject to the Enhanced Model of career coaching. These methods consisted of questionnaires and interviews, as they were the most suitable for the task. Alongside these methods was the reflective diary which the researcher kept throughout the data collection phase and which proved useful in tracking down information at the 'write up' of the research and also for tracking of individuals and groups and to clarify points at a latter stage.

The chapter covers the design and delivery of the questionnaires and interviews and the importance of the context and content of the process which
forms a vital part of the process of the research. The chapter looks at the
different focuses of each questionnaire, how this linked into the collection of
data and how this would be used in the next chapter covering the analysis of
the data.

The chapter covers the process of the interviews and the profile of the students
and the issues surrounding them such as the job opportunities, higher
education and where they decided to seek help could reflect the society in
which we live. Whether it does or does not, the next chapter will hopefully be
able to answer these questions and answer whether the two aims of this
research were successful i.e. using the technique of coaching in the area of
careers guidance and development and investigating how students experience
career development and the role of the careers adviser's within the process.
6. FINDINGS

6.1 Introduction to Chapter Six
The research findings are based on all groups, but with a particular focus on the B2 groups on all programmes taking part in the research.

The main aim of the research was to explore the training and development techniques of mentoring and coaching and their application in the area of careers guidance and development with post 16 students in further and higher education.

This research aimed to work with students in further and higher education who were in the process of career decision making and planning whilst they were studying. A model of mentoring and coaching was developed that was used with the students alongside traditional career guidance techniques (see chapter three). It was intended that through this process the students would be able to make better decisions and be more aware of themselves and of the opportunities available to them and would start to plan their futures in a better way.

The subsidiary aim was to investigate how students experience careers development and the careers adviser's role within that process, remembering that the researcher was also the careers adviser and the personal adviser in this situation.

The evaluation was carried out at a number of levels. Firstly base line information was gathered to characterise the students on the various courses, their backgrounds and abilities and preferences, for example looking at class, education background, preferred learning styles etc. The students on the various courses taking part were randomly divided up into a series of groups A, B1, B2 and 0. A further group Z, created itself when students from groups A or
B1 self-referred for additional career guidance input, which ethically could not be refused. Each group would receive a different input from the researcher as set out in Chapter 5, Table 5.1 page 101. Evaluation, mainly using $X^2$ (chi squared) tests, was carried out to establish that the groups were equivalent in terms of sex, age, learning styles, course etc. This was indeed true.

Having carried out the interventions, in particular the Enhanced Model, it was necessary to try to establish whether the different interventions had produced significantly different outcomes for the students in the different Groups.

The main analysis centred on the established scales and using F tests as part of the general linear model analysis on SPSS to establish whether these attributes had changed over time and whether there were differences in the outcomes by Group at a statistically significant level.

This analysis was reinforced by looking at the career outcomes of the students on leaving their course, in terms of going into higher education, further education, training and employment etc and whether the patterns shown by those receiving the Enhanced Model were significantly different from the other Groups. Having established that the Groups were randomly selected, a significantly different set of outcomes for those on the Enhanced Model may be a measure of its success.

As well as quantitative data of this sort, additional data were gathered, mainly asking the students to choose from a series of words or concepts those that best fitted their perception of their experience of the Enhanced Model and the research. The words in the list were selected by brainstorming. It was decided that getting into an analysis of semantics, trying to establish whether a particular word was more or less favourable than another, was essentially a needless over complication. Therefore simple counts were made of the numbers of positive and negative selections and comparisons made between
Groups. The responses of the different Groups were analysed using chi-squared tests for significance. There were also a number of questions asking the students about their age, social background, whether they had previously seen a Careers or Personal Adviser and if they had any work experience, paid or otherwise. These data gave a background to the students and where they lived, their education and qualification levels, their age, gender and importantly whether the interactions with Careers and/or Personal Adviser had been useful to the students in the past as this in particular could have an impact on the research being carried out via the Enhanced Model. For example if a student(s) had a bad experience of careers/personal adviser then they might be less likely to work or to find the process of the Enhanced Model useful.

With regard to the interviews with the Group B2 students, again these students had not made the choice to work with the researcher, they had been chosen by their tutor. Although they could decide not to, the majority of the students did work with the researcher and clearly explained their thoughts to her throughout the process. Though they could have stopped at any point and not attended the interviews, they did not.
Qualitative data

The qualitative data gathered from the research were originally quite extensive but unfortunately the equipment used for the storage of information from the interviews was not compatible with the computer and much of it was lost. During the period of the Enhanced Model there were five interview sessions with members of Group B2 which formed the core of the model. The purpose of each of the interviews and their timings are set out in Chapter Four. During each interview notes were made of what happened, what the researcher did and why, what the outcome of the interview was, what the researcher had learned from the intervention (information about the student and about the researcher's own practice and performance) and what actions were required as a result of the session. These notes became a reflective diary. Students recorded action plans that remained personal to them and copies were not kept. This was an integral part of the Enhanced Model, the regular meetings creating a form of mentoring and coaching that would allow the student to develop over the set of interviews. The notes would allow the researcher to be consistent and to pick up at the next interview from where we had reached at the end of the previous one. These notes are essentially process papers.

Alongside the pre-planned interviews with those in Group B2, other students asked for various inputs from the researcher, which often led to an interview situation. These students became Group Z. Again the results of the interviews were recorded in a reflective diary. The reflective diary runs to 55 records. A random sample of the diary entries for students in Groups B2 and Z are provided in Appendices 13 and 14. A sample of three students was randomly selected to form case studies and these studies are set out in Chapter Six.

The purpose of the Enhanced Model was to improve the provision of careers information and skills for the students. Although these records of interviews show where the student had reached in their development, the process must be non-directional, with the students taking their own paths to develop their
careers in the future in whatever way they want. There were no examinations, tests or levels to achieve, therefore no attempt was made to analyse the sessions to find out what proportion of the students in Group B2 had reached an arbitrary level of performance or development.

The qualitative data was not systematically analysed as it could not show directly whether the Enhanced Model worked or not and there was no control to compare it against as those in Group Z received totally different inputs and different interviews from those in Group B2. In the absence of long term follow ups with students to examine their career performances, the efficacy of the Enhanced Model could only by judged using the quantitative techniques that have already been set out.

The research questions were as follows:

RQ1. Did the Enhanced model make a real difference to those who got it and in what ways?

RQ2. What did the students find useful and what kind of services do students want the careers advisers/personal advisers to provide?

6.2 Introduction to the research findings

This section consist of a short introduction to the groups taking part in the research B2 who received the Enhanced Model, group Z who were the students who self referred to see the researcher and were from the groups A and B1 and Group 0. Followed by the presentation of the research findings, based on the research questions and the data directly related to answering the research questions, followed by a summary. The information is provided in tables, graphs and written information covering the data collected by the questionnaires and interviews. The research consists of the following
6.2.1 B2 Students
The B2 students from all the National Diplomas, HND (these were two years) and Access to Higher Education (this was a one year) programmes, were interviewed throughout the process. The students were asked a number of questions and over the period were asked to reflect on their answers and plan of how they were going to succeed in attaining the goals they had set for themselves. These interviews also identified the people the students thought may help them through the process to achieving their goals.

This group received the new Enhanced Model, which included group sessions and three to five interviews throughout the process at designated times. This group forms the centre of the research and their results will be compared with all the other groups to see whether the Enhanced Model produced better outcomes.

6.2.2 Group Z Students
These were students in either Groups A or B1 who self referred themselves to see the researcher; a record of these interviews was kept in the Reflective Diary, including the age of each student, the date and time taken and the content of the interview and any outcomes. This was especially true for the Group B1 as they received one workshop session with the Group B2 and to gauge whether less is more in terms that if the workshop session is relevant to the needs of the students then may be the impact is greater.

This group was made up of 14 students, who were seen three or more times during the research period. Nine members of the group were from the HND programme and were B1 students three of these students were new to the college and the rest had previously studied for the NDAM in the period from 2001 to 2003 at the same college. All the five remaining students, two were from NDFM; two from NDAM, previously seen when they were studying for the First Diploma in Animal Care; and one student from the NDHM who was new to
the college. There were no students from the Access of Higher Education one year programme.

6.2.3 Group B1
Received the contractually obliged guidance and one joint group session with the B2 group on general career planning. This group received additional input over the Group A students.

6.2.4 Group A
These students received the contractually obliged guidance. Therefore they could receive more careers guidance input than Group 0.

6.2.5 Group 0
These students were offered the contractually obliged guidance but did not take it up; their only contact with the research was the first and fourth questionnaires which they completed.

6.3 Research questions and answers from questionnaires and interviews including Case Studies

RQ1. Did the Enhanced model make a real difference to those who got it? In what ways?
Established scales covering the areas of career decidedness, self concept clarity, occupational information, passive decision making, career exploration and career decision making self efficacy were used to assess students' progress as a group. Though the students completed questionnaires at Time 1, Time 2 and Time 4, it was clear early on in the data analysis that the two most important and appropriate Times to consider for this research would be Time 1 and Time 4. This is because of the beginning and end of both the research and the students' studies and the beginning of the next stage in their
lives, the next transition and for many into adulthood. For each measure of
development the minimum score that could be recorded would be 1 and the
maximum score of 5 along the left hand side of the chart below.

The charts include all the groups 0, A, B1, B2 and Z (the self referral students)
Career decidedness (questions 8-10)

Career decidedness is a measure of how sure the students were about what their chosen career would be. The higher the score on the scale 1 to 5 the more confident they were that they had the right information and had decided on the career they wanted.

The mean level of career decidedness for Group 0 was identical at each test timing with a mean level of 4.08. All the other Groups showed an increase in their levels of career decidedness. Analysis of variance using group as the between subjects factor and time as the within subjects factor showed a significant difference between the decidedness of the Groups at the beginning and at the end of the research ($F = 6.416; \text{df} 1,67; p = 0.014$). However there is
no evidence of a significant interaction between the Groups taking part and the time the test was done (F = 0.68 df = 4.67; p = 0.609). The Group effect for career decidedness was not significant (F = 1.753 df = 4.67 p = 0.149). Therefore while the Groups collectively increased their levels of career decidedness, no one intervention did significantly better than another.

Chart 2  Self concept clarity (questions 11 -13)

Self concept clarity is how clearly a person understands his or her interests, personality and abilities, as well as how these characteristics fit into different occupations. The higher the score on the scale 1 to 5 the better their self concept clarity.

The chart above shows movement in self clarity of interests, personality and abilities for understanding whether people fit to certain occupations or not. Self concept clarity increased in all the groups.
Analysis of variance using group as the between subjects factor and time as the within subjects factor showed a significant difference between the decidedness of the Groups at the beginning and at the end of the research (F = 7.850; df = 1,69; p = 0.007). However there is no evidence of a significant interaction between the Groups talking part and the time the test was done (F = 0.86 ; df = 4,69 ; p = 0.492). The Group effect for self concept clarity was not significant (F = 0.952; df = 4,69; p = 0.440).

Therefore while all the Groups increased their levels of self concept clarity, no one intervention did significantly better than the others.
Chart 3  Occupational information (questions 14 -16)
This is a measure of the students' perception of their knowledge of potential careers and desire for more information. The higher the score on the scale 1 to 5 the more confident they were that they had the right information.

Analysis of variance using group as the between subjects factor and time as the within subjects factor showed a significant difference between the decidedness of the Groups at the beginning and at the end of the research (F = 10.069; df = 1,70; p = 0.002). However there is no evidence of a significant interaction between the Groups talking part and the time the test was done (F = 0.764; df = 4,70; p = 0.552 ). The Group effect for occupational information was not significant (F = 0.509; df = 4.70; p = 0.729).
Therefore while all the Groups increased their levels of confidence in the occupational information they had, no one intervention did significantly better than the others.

**Chart 4** Passive decision making (questions 17 -18)
Passive decision-makers want others or circumstances to make the decision about careers for them. This is scored on a scale 1 to 5, the higher the score the more passive the students were about their decision making.

Groups Z and B1 increased in their passive decision making while the other groups all became less passive. Analysis of variance using group as the between subjects factor and time as the within subjects factor did not show a significant difference between the
passive decision making of the Groups at the beginning and at the end of the research \( (F = 0.000; \text{df} = 1,70; p = 0.989) \). Also there is no evidence of a significant interaction between the Groups taking part and the time the test was done \( (F = 0.534; \text{df} = 4,70; p = 0.712) \). This is surprising as some groups become more passive and others less so. The Group effect for passive decision making was not significant \( (F = 0.336; \text{df} = 4.70; p = 0.853) \). Therefore while there were changes in the level of passiveness the differences are not significant.
Chart 5  Career exploration (questions 19 -26)

Career exploration is about looking at and exploring career opportunities. Scored at a scale 1 to 5, a high score indicates students had done more career exploration

Analysis of variance using group as the between subjects factor and time as the within subjects factor showed a significant difference between the career exploration of the Groups at the beginning and at the end of the research with all groups improving as time went on (F = 15.93; df = 1,67; p = 0.000). However there is no evidence of a significant interaction between the Groups taking part and the time the test was done (F = 0.67; df = 4, 67; p = 0.314). The Group effect for career exploration was not significant (F = 0.483; df = 4,67; p = 0.748).
Therefore all groups increased their level of exploration but no one intervention was significant better than the others.

Chart 6 - Career decision making self efficacy (CDMSE) (questions 27 – 37)

CDMSE is a construct to do with how far one believes that he or she is able to complete successfully the tasks necessary for career decision making, including the five competence areas of career maturity (Crites, 1978): accurate self appraisal, gathering occupational information, goal selection, making plans for the future, problem solving. The higher the score on the scale 1 to 5 the more confident they were that they had the right information.

Estimated Marginal Means of MEASURE_1
Again all the groups increased their belief in their own decision making. Analysis of variance using group as the between subjects factor and time as the within subjects factor showed a significant difference between the decidedness of the Groups at the beginning and at the end of the research ($F = 19.873; df = 1.64; p = 0.000$). However there is no evidence of a significant interaction between the Groups taking part and the time the test was done ($F = 0.091; df = 4.64; p = 0.182$). The Group effect for Career decision making self efficacy was not significant ($F = 0.255; df = 4.64; p = 0.906$).

Table 6.1 Summary of charts 1 to 6 for Group B2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Time 1</th>
<th>Time 4</th>
<th>+</th>
<th>-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Career Decidedness</td>
<td>3.3816</td>
<td>3.8026</td>
<td>0.4210</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Concept Clarity</td>
<td>3.1316</td>
<td>3.3421</td>
<td>0.2105</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational Information</td>
<td>2.8772</td>
<td>3.2281</td>
<td>0.3509</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive Decision Making</td>
<td>2.4737</td>
<td>2.4474</td>
<td>-0.0263</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Exploration</td>
<td>2.3681</td>
<td>3.2153</td>
<td>0.8472</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career Decision Making</td>
<td>3.2888</td>
<td>3.8342</td>
<td>0.5454</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.1 summarises the results for Group B2. The largest change they experienced was an increase of 0.85 in Career Exploration. The only negative score was -0.03 in Passive Decision Making; actually a decrease in score on this measure is a good thing, suggesting they became more active in their decision making.

6.3.1 Summary
The above established scales have revealed that all groups moved small amounts with CDMSE moving the most. One group of particular interest was Group 0. These students received nothing from the researcher and these
National Diploma Acting students from the evidence gathered were confident in their own abilities, knew what they wanted to do. This was also seemed to be the case with the Group A and B1 at times which begs the question why have Careers Advisers at all? Or another way of considering the matter would be to consider what would the above groups do if they had received the Enhanced Model, how much more confident would these students have been? Because allocation of students to group was (more or less) random, there is no reason to think they would have been any different.

All of the charts 1 to 6 did reveal that the scale scores were not significantly different, there was little difference between the interventions in terms of the outcomes generated i.e. variability within groups outweighed the differences between the groups. In particular, the group B2 students, who received the Enhanced Model, did not show greater improvement over time in their career development than the other groups.

6.4 Research questions and answers from interviews
RQ1. Did the Enhanced model make a real difference to those who got it? In what ways?

6.4.1 Group B2 answers to Question 7 in final structured interview
Question 7 in the last interview asked: What new skills have you developed whilst being involved in this process of meeting with the researcher and discussing your career?

As part of the Enhanced Model there were regular scheduled meetings with the students with a clear purpose for that meeting from the point of view of the researcher, which was explained at the beginning of each interview. Whether the students could relate the meetings to learning of new skills would be ascertained from this question. There was a mixed response in terms of the answers from students, some positive and not so positive. The illustrative
quotes below start with the HND higher education students, and then go on to the further education students on the National Diploma programmes.

HND students in the B2 group
'Just this session able to speak through career choice rather than explain why I want it'. HND female student

'Focus on my own career and abilities' (HND female student)

'I've learnt about what I want to do with my future that I didn’t think I could do'. (HND female student)

I think I have become more decisive and have realised I can achieve my goals'. (HND female student)

The above students are indicating that they have learnt new skills, expressing their thoughts into words, becoming more decisive and gaining the realisation that they could achieve their goals. This seems to follow through with the National Diploma B2 students, as seen below. Development included planning and research skills and others thinking about starting their own businesses.

National Diploma students in the all B2 groups (across Fish, Horse and Animal Management), made the following comments.

'Talking to someone about my next options for the future'
(ND female student)

'Useful to talk and gain advice' (ND male student)

'Plan my future better' (ND male student)
'Have spoken about careers with research but have never developed skills' (NDAM female student)

'Understanding direction' (NDAM female student)

The above comments are positive, the students talk about goals, direction and talking to someone, though there is no mention of skills in a direct manner they did mention planning and research which are skills.

'Wanted to know more, a little under confident to start with, unaware of options available' (ND student)

One of the males who took part in the research quoted as saying

'Useful, it is a good scheme from my point of view, as it has helped me to explain what I want to do with someone who can guide me, and hopefully help me achieve my goals' (ND student)

Another National Diploma student commented

'More mature about learning, taking responsibility for my education. Generally much more knowledgeable and skillful at tasks and a happier person knowing I am doing all I can to achieve my goals'.

The above is about planning and realising goals, but not about new skills. The students have not directly learnt a new skill. However, indirectly the students had learnt about being decisive, achieving goals and planning. Most of the above words can be grouped together into themes like "speak through", "I've learnt", "that I didn't think I could do", "more decisive", "realised I can achieve
my goals”, “useful to talk and gain advice”, “plan”. These students were talking and starting to think and plan. This is more about people developing these soft skills, than the hard skill of learning a new language for example.

So a possible definition of hard skills could be ‘teachable abilities that may be required in a given context, tend to be specific to a certain type of task or activity’. Soft skills on the other hand, ‘are personal attributes that enhance an individual’s interactions, job performance and career prospects. It is often said that hard skills will get you an interview, but you need soft skills to get (and keep) the job’. (http://searchcio.techtarget.com)

Soft skills can be broken down into personal attributes and interpersonal abilities. Personal attributes include optimism, responsibility, and sense of humour, integrity, time management and motivation. The interpersonal abilities such as empathy, leadership, communication, good manners also come under the soft skills banner. The hard skills could include typing skills, proficiency with software applications, operating machinery, speaking a foreign language.

There were also some not so positive comments from Question 7 on the last structured interview with students too:

‘not really’ (from three ND students)

‘have spoken about career with researcher but have never developed skills’ (ND student)

‘None’ (from four ND students in same group)

Summarising the findings reported in this section the eighteen students made a range of comments on the process, varying from positive, neutral to negative. What these students found most useful was help in achieving their goals, being decisive and planning skills.
The comments to the questions in at the final interviews with B2 students were split in three ways. Two thirds (ten students) were positive about the experience and the skills they had developed. These students seemed to want to take part in the research and found the process overall useful for their needs. The remaining students (eight students) spilt into two groups, one group (five students) which gave short or one word answers of either Yes, No or did not answer the question, this might because there was nothing for them to comment on so they said nothing. The remaining three students were negative, all from the same National Diploma and females. The negative comments came from the students who entered the research later than the other students, however, there were positive comments from other students in the same groups as these, so maybe they did not want to take part in the research and had nothing to do with coming into the research late.

6.4.2 Group Z students comments – Question 7 (from final structured interview)
These were the self selecting students from Groups A or B1, across the HND and National Diploma programmes. All of the comments below relate to the soft skills the students felt they had developed through the process of working with the researcher, there were no negative comments.

‘More confident’ (by two NDAM student)

‘Speaking skills’ (NDAM student)

‘I found all the information useful and encouraging, I really enjoy talking to the researcher’ (NDAM student)

‘Made me think better about my dyslexia’ (ND student)

‘Last couple of weeks I have seen researcher it has been helpful
yet I should have asked for help earlier as I would have a clearer idea to think things through’ (ND student)

‘Helped my self esteem and confidence, make me think of jobs I had not thought I was as capable’ (ND student)

‘Increase confidence know where I am going, a clearer understanding of what I need to do in the future to provide me with challenges and interest I need’ (HND student)

‘looking thoroughly at what available, not taking first option in courses. Learned about the wide variety of topics etc, that are available to me, I had no knowledge previously’ (HND student)

‘A fun and helpful learning time, where not only I got information but also some direction’ (HND student)

‘Very helpful and enjoyable. I have achieved many new ideas for the future and the researcher has opened door to alternative careers’ (HND student)

‘Helped me realise how many job opportunities involve animal work that I did not know before’ (HND student)

‘Good to have the opportunity to talk to someone involving my career choice’. (HND student)

"Went well I found out how to enter a particular career path (HND student)"
It is instructive to compare the responses of the B2s who received the Enhanced Model and Group Z students who self referred themselves to see the researcher. The most notable trend from the data is that there is an overwhelmingly positive reply from the Group Z with no one being negative about the experience and service they received from the researcher; they did not receive the Enhanced Model. They saw a careers adviser at their own request and received any of the following information, advice and guidance.

Amongst the B2 students, some students did not achieve as much as the researcher would have liked to have seen. Throughout this research the Group Z were the students who had made the effort to see the researcher, so most likely they would say reasonably pleasant to positive remarks about the process they had gone through with the researcher. As explained before the Group B2s did have a choice of whether or not to take part in the research and at any time they could decide not to take part. However, they were assigned to the group rather than choosing to be in it, so they may not have perceived that they had much choice this group of students varied in their remarks about the process they had gone through with the researcher. Then comparing the answers from the students in the Groups B2 and Z there were some clear lines that had developed. Group Z comments were around the speaking skills, increased confidence, being helpful, enjoyable and a clearer understanding, learning, wide variety, information and direction. Let’s compare these to the comments from Group B2 “speak through”, “learnt”, “that I didn’t think I could do”, “more decisive”, “realised I can achieve my goals”, “useful to talk and gain advice”, “plan”. The main impression that Group Z were more likely refer to fun/enjoyable and increased self-confidence, whilst B2s are more to do with planning and goal setting.

Perhaps the main difference is that there were no negative comments from the self referral students in Group Z but there were negative comments from the students who received the Enhanced Model (the B2s). What might be
concluded from this is that some students did not want to take part in the research and the self referral students wanted to know more. The Group Z were willing, and a possible implication for the future would be only to work with those who wanted to take part and not with a random sample of individuals.
Table 6.2 Group B2s answers - (structured question 9, 2005)
The information in the table below shows the answers from the B2 group of students who were interviewed in the final stages of the research in 2005. The results have been summed together by adding the first two positive comment columns entitled “A great deal” and “A little”, and ranked with the preference given to the column titled A great deal and then comparing these sums with the No and N/A columns to produce these results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A great deal or A lot</th>
<th>Some or A little</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
a) Helped with knowledge about jobs, higher education courses | 8 | 4 | 5 | 1 |
b) Made you think about possible options, you had not considered | 7 | 4 | 6 | 1 |
c) Good to talk through ideas with someone who was not connected with the college or home | 9 | 4 | 4 | 1 |
d) Have our meetings helped you with other areas such as: |

| Decision making | 7 | 7 | 4 | 0 |
| Possible opportunities after college | 5 | 8 | 4 | 1 |
| Career planning | 6 | 5 | 6 | 1 |
| Issues surrounding your learning at college | 5 | 6 | 7 | 0 |
| Self esteem | 4 | 7 | 7 | 0 |
| Confidence building | 4 | 6 | 8 | 0 |
| Ideas about areas never thought of before | 4 | 6 | 8 | 0 |
| Knowing more about your skills | 3 | 6 | 8 | 1 |
| Self motivation | 2 | 7 | 8 | 1 |
| Self image | 1 | 3 | 13 | 1 |

The above table reveals that there are a proportion of B2 students who found the process of working with the researcher a benefit to them in a number of different ways listed above. Items a), b) and c) scored most favourably. These areas included knowledge of jobs and higher education, widening the options available to students and the opportunity to talk through ideas with someone. This should be no surprise as they are career guidance related. The categories
within item d) scored less well. However, most of the items scored positively, only self motivation and self image scored overwhelmingly negatively.

The researcher considered there was some mileage in adding the figures in the two left columns together and considering these against the column featuring the answer No. This revealed more about whether the students were positive or negative, especially in the area of soft skills. Only for self image did the number of “Nos” exceed the number who said “A little” or more. This may indicate that the students were not looking for this type of development or that the presentation of the information was not in a format that the students were comfortable with and understood, as this was not an aim to change self image, as it may come through the increase in self esteem and confidence. This was not explored further as it was at the end of the research and there was no opportunity to follow up. The other “soft skills” of self motivation, self esteem and confidence building did fair a little better than the above.

“Knowing more about your skills”, only scored one point more that the “No” column. This could be down to the fact that the students taking part in the research were studying for vocational courses (skills related), so perhaps they thought that they could easily obtain jobs in the area they were training in. The majority of the students were aged eighteen to twenty one at the end of their studies and they probably still thought they could easily get a job in animal related occupations and therefore they were not open to other ideas or help.

As seen above the career guidance related areas of helping with knowledge of jobs, higher education and other options did score well together with decision making and “good to talk through ideas with an independent person”.

The table shows the reader what the students felt had been provided through the Enhanced Model.
6.4.3 Group Z - (structured question 9, 2005). There were fifteen students in the Group Z, but the decision was taken only to conduct the final interview with those students who were seen three times or more, which equated to eight students being interviewed.

The Group Z student profiles were as follows: four HND, two NDAM, one NDFM and one NDHM, four of whom were new to the college and all were over the age of eighteen at the beginning of the research.

Table 6.3 Group Z answers (structured question 9, Fourth Interview 2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A great deal or a lot</th>
<th>Some or a little</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Helped with knowledge about jobs, higher education courses</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Made you think about possible options, you had not considered</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Good to talk through ideas with someone who was not connected with the college or home</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Have our meetings helped you with other areas such as:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possible opportunities after college</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision making</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career planning</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowing more about your skills</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideas about areas never thought of before</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self esteem</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence building</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self motivation</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues surrounding your learning at college</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self image</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.3 covers Group Z these students did not receive the Enhanced Model of mentoring and coaching but received careers guidance support, which they requested. The only time the researcher made an approach to see the student was at the end of her research to complete the same structured interview as she had done with the B2 Group. The above table makes interesting reading.
from the point of view that all the categories, in particular the first three questions, scored well. The “possible options” in the career guidance section of the table and “Possible opportunities after college”, in the soft skills area of the table scored 8, which are good scores. In the rest of the table covering soft skills it is a similar story of positive scores for self esteem, motivation and confidence building, which all link into decision making and career planning. This Group Z seemed very positive with the career information, advice and guidance they had received from the researcher.

6.4.4 Comparison of Groups B2 and Z
The table below shows the results from Tables 6.2 and 6.3, it is clear the results are significantly different. It is clear that the Group Z students were more likely than the B2s to say positive things about the process as they were setting the agenda for the interaction instead of the researcher and her agenda. Nevertheless this is not entirely true as some students found the process of the Enhanced Model to their benefit and that it fitted well their own thinking.
Table 6.4 Ranking of choices scores from B2 and Z groups (Tables 6.2 and 6.3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choice</th>
<th>Group B2</th>
<th>Group Z</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Helped with knowledge about jobs, higher education courses</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Made you think about possible options, you had not considered</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Good to talk through ideas with someone who was not connected with the college or home</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Have our meetings helped you with other areas such as:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possible opportunities after college</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision making</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career planning</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideas about areas never thought of before</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowing more about your skills</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self esteem</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence building</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self motivation</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues surrounding your learning at college</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self image</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Spearman's rank correlation co-efficient for the above table = Rs = 0.93. This suggests that the Groups B2 and Z ranked the different categories in the same way.

Table 6.5 Comparison between Group B2 and Z

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Choice</th>
<th>A great deal and A lot</th>
<th>Some and A little</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>N/A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group B2 (interviews with 18)</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Z (interviews with 8)</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the $X^2_{(Calc)} = 32.62$, $X^2_{(0.05)} = 7.81$ therefore Group Z and B2 are significantly different. The probability of this happening by chance is (0.0000388%).
6.4.5 Summary
The reports from of the Enhanced Model and the career guidance received by the Group B2 and Z respectively gives an indication of their positive and negative interpretation of the activities, including work group sessions and interviews with students, throughout the process of the research. The above table shows that the Group B2 were much more negative about the process of the Enhanced Model, with the large number of ‘nos’ given in relationship to the Group Z. However, some of the B2 students reported benefits from their contact with the researcher. Also, the rank-order of perceived benefits was similar for the two groups. Identifying post-college opportunities with someone relatively independent of the college setting was the main perceived value of the process. This could be seen as a very “traditional career guidance” kind of benefit.

6.4.6 Group B2 - Question 10 (final structured interview)
A number of the Group B2 did not answer all the questions and the above question was one with a low response rate. There were only ten students who answered this question. Nevertheless, there were some interesting answers from the eighteen B2 students interviewed from the ND and HND programmes. The answers are listed in order of the positive and the negative comments, though a number of the ND student’s answers were one-word answers of Yes or No.

‘was very useful, ‘enjoyable’. (ND students)

‘Made me think about my options, supportive in all my decisions and thoughts. Helped me out big time! Only person that I talk to about all this, who sits there and listens, with great advice! (HND student)

‘Very little up until now. It was able to make me think more, made me think about my options, supportive in all my
decisions and thoughts’ (ND student)

‘It’s been ok, it helped me become more aware of what’s out there but it’s not helped me greatly (NDAM student)

‘has not really affected me or changed views in any way. If I had wanted to talk about possible careers etc. I would have arranged interview, though has helped me with specialist project study’. (NDAM student)

‘Lovely lady but not helped my individual case’ (NDAM student)

“Enjoyed, funny”. (ND student)

Negative comments from National Diploma Animal Management students

‘It hasn’t benefited me at all, I have just filled a lot of questionnaires and answered questions’ (NDAM student)

‘It hasn’t helped me at all’ (NDAM student)

Waste of time that could have used on assignments’ (NDAM student)

The above responses did vary, the process helped some and not others in the B2 Group, with the National Diploma students’ commenting least positively. It would be interesting to see if they made the same comments in a recession when jobs are harder to get. Also, if these students had been brought into the research at the same time as the other students, would they have still been of the same thinking. They did vary from positive remarks about the process and the interaction with the researcher and how the students felt about the process, that it was interesting in terms of being enjoyable and funny.
The above clearly shows that there are three students who are entirely positive about the help with their career; two who say nice things about the researcher but not about the career benefits; one student who thinks it was a bit helpful and four who say it has not helped. This data is consistent with the other interview data from this research.

6.4.7 Summary of questions (7 and 10)

The responses from the eighteen students in Group B2 varied in content across the two questions that related directly back to the Enhanced Model. Both questions appeared on the final structured interview form as questions seven and ten. These questions covered skill(s) developed and the students' perceptions of the process of working with the researcher. There were quite positive remarks about help with 'career choice', 'plan future', 'focus on my own career and abilities' and 'become more decisive and have realised I can achieve my goals'. These comments are career related and are about planning, achieving, choice and decisiveness, which is to some degree what the Enhanced Model was trying to achieve through the process of the interactions between the student and the researcher to encourage the individuals to considering and develop their choices of careers through the Action Plan, to review and reflect on their plans and become more confident in themselves and to plan for their futures. This is what careers guidance is about, but what the Enhanced Model was also developed to do was help the individual sustain this, to coach the individual and mentor them through the process whilst in education. The Enhanced Model was about enabling the individual to clarify their goals, identify the barriers, explore options and develop the knowledge, skills and attitudes to be an effective individual and enhanced their performance and development.
6.5 Case Studies

RQ1. Did the Enhanced model make a real difference to those who got it? In what ways?

These Case Studies were chosen from the students in the B2 Group. There are various criteria which could have been used to select students to present as part of the Case Studies. However, to ensure that the student could not be easily recognised the following was not used as part of the selection criteria:

- Female or male student primarily on a course which attracted the opposite gender

The following factors were used as part of the selection criteria:

- New or continuing college student
- Thinking of higher education at the beginning of research
- Not sure what they wanted to do

All the students had been given a coded number to ensure they are not recognisable in any way. Please note their answers are recorded as presented to the researcher in interviews which were either recorded via a tape machine or written out via the researcher or the students themselves. Please see Appendix , for the outline of the questions asked in the various interviews.

The case studies were chosen from the B2 students on the National Diploma and the Higher National Diploma programmes. Although there were 20 students to choose from, the decision was made easier through the fact that one group of students from the NDAM did not complete all the interviews and the Access to HE (Nursing) students left after one year, having completed their course. Therefore the choice of case studies was reduced
The format of the interviews:

- First Interview
  - Careers input, including career goals
  - Career Action Plan for the individual, as per the students conversation with the researcher 2004 and 2005

- Second Interview
  - Develop Career Action Plan
  - Summer Activities list, including action points which the student was thinking about before the summer, towards the end of the first year of their course at college

- Third Interview
  - Review of activities throughout the summer period away from college and reflection on the process. Considering possible plans for the coming months and their final year of their course

- Fourth Interview* (not all students were seen as most of the National Diploma students were out on placement as part of their course and linked to their final results)
  - Follow up: Job hunting and higher education options (with HND – Group B2 students)

- Final Interview
  - Final Structured questions, plans for the future
  - Review progress
  - Plans for the future

6.5.1 The Three Case Studies
There were a number of questions asked at each interview and the format of these are listed in Appendices 5, 7, 8, 10, 11 and 12. The three case studies below are from the selective answers which illustrate the Enhanced Model.
which all students in the B2 groups received across the five programmes taking part in the research.

At the beginning of the search there were a number of students who were selected as case studies from the continuing and new students to the college. Unfortunately a number of the students previously at the college left in the first year and the remaining either did not turn up for interviews or only gave short or one word answers at each interview. The students who were new to the college did however give longer answers to questions and therefore the three case studies below are students new to the college.

6.5.2 The techniques used in the interviews
The career coaching process can help with important life and career issues. The combined range of tools and skills including contracting; active listening; paraphrasing and questioning, reflecting; summarising and challenging were used with the students in the Group B2. This process also included the element of job search skills, a self development exercise, skills analysis and values were touched upon in the process of the Enhanced Model, as well as helping the client through their personal development and assessment and working towards their own decision making.

Case Study 1 (CS1) – Code number 040 - Background information
Location: East Midlands, did not live-in at the college
Entry qualifications: 5 GCSEs grade Cs and above and two A/S level awards no information given on grades
Age at last interview: 19
Programme of study and gender: National Diploma level and male
Number of interviews/interactions with researcher: 4
This student was new to the college

Ambition: Be happy, nice car and house
Last interview, Question 7. What new skills have you developed whilst being involved in this process of meeting myself (Kay Harness) and discussing your career?
Answer: Useful to talk and gain advice

Last interview: Question 10. What is your perception of the process over the last couple of years of you and the researcher working together?
Answer: Useful! Is a good scheme from my point of view, as it has helped me to explain what I want to do with someone who can guide me and hopefully help me achieve my goals

Last interview, last question covering Words: that best describe how you feel about the smaller group sessions and interviews with Kay Harness
Revealing, realistic, practical, theoretical, useful, enjoyable, valuable, inspiring, thought-provoking

Researcher viewpoint:
At the beginning seemed a little under confident, through discussion found out that others member of the family were at university, but he did not think he would be able to go because of the grades required.

Seemed interested in taking part in the research, always attended the interviews, asked questions and completed their research and gave feedback. Well mannered client who was working hard to achieve results, travelled quite a distance to the college from his home.

Quotes from the student 040
‘Wanted to know more, a little under confident to start with, unaware of options available’.
'More mature about learning, taking responsibility for my education. Generally much more knowledgeable and skilful at tasks and a happier person knowing I am doing all I can to achieve my goals'.

Case Study 2 (CS2) – Code number: 026
Location: East Midlands
Entry qualifications: A Levels
Age at last interview: 20
Programme of study and gender: HND and female
Number of interviews/interactions with researcher: 4
New to college
Ambition: To finish degree, get a job

Last interview, Question 7. What new skills have you developed whilst being involved in this process of meeting myself (Kay Harness) and discussing your career?
Answer: I think I have become more decisive and have realised I can achieve my goals

Last interview: Question 10. What is your perception of the process over the last couple of years of you and the researcher working together?
Answer: No answer given

Last interview, last question covering Words: that best describe how you feel about the smaller group sessions and interviews with Kay Harness
Interesting, challenging, revealing, entertaining, inspiring, thorough

Researcher viewpoint: This person was new to the college, first time away from home, a little under confident, and certain issues around disability which was not addressed by the college. To some extent might have been better doing the university experience than a further education college offering a HND
Case Study 3 (CS3) - Code number: 005
Location: Leicestershire
Entry qualifications: GCSEs
Age at last interview: 18
Programme of study and gender: Diploma level and female
Number of interviews/interactions with researcher: 4
Ambition: Re-train race horses to do other things

Last interview, Question 7. What new skills have you developed whilst being involved in this process of meeting myself (Kay Harness) and discussing your career?
Answer: Talking to someone about my next options for the future

Last interview: Question 10. What is your perception of the process over the last couple of years of you and the researcher working together?
Answer: Very useful

Last interview, last question covering Words: that best describe how you feel about the smaller group sessions and interviews with Kay Harness Interesting, revealing, fascinating, clear, realistic, practical, useful, enjoyable, valuable, thorough

Researcher viewpoint: Cheerful young person, wanted to do well, had found a subject area they were interested in. Seemed to be willing to work, found out about some part time courses, had not explored in great depth, but was working at it.
Quotes from student 005
'I think I have come out of my shell'.
'Talking to someone about my next options for the future'.

6.5.3 Summary of the Case Studies
These three Case Studies were quite positive about the Enhanced Model in terms of the usefulness of the process they went through and that the students had developed. The usefulness was in terms of being able to talk through ideas and find out about different careers they had not thought about to research and plan their careers, being able to follow up on their ideas.

However, the Enhanced Model gave the opportunity to work with a variety of students from across a range of ages and genders and it gave the students the opportunity to talk through their ideas and the time to explore them. One could say this is the focus of careers guidance, but the difference between straightforward careers guidance and the Enhanced Model was the process of the group sessions and the individual interactions that were an integral part of the process of the Enhanced Model. This included the career coaching, the time spent on that individual achieving their goals, being more confident of their own abilities and wanting to know more and exploring the opportunities with a career mentor. It was designed to help the individual develop their own decision making skills and planning and improving the management of their own career. Whether the Enhanced Model achieved this is questionable from the data gathered at the time, what should have been built into the research was the follow up procedure in one and three years. Perhaps after the completion of their first degree or being in work for a length of time the outcomes could have been quite revealing, especially in terms of whether individuals had achieved the goals they had originally set out for themselves and whether the Enhanced Model and the process of working with the researcher produced any long term effects on their career and lives.
These students did seem to find that the process of the Enhanced Model worked for them. They attended all the sessions, asked questions and wanted to know more. The main words that seem to sum up the Enhanced Model are “useful”, “help me to achieve my goals”

6.6 RQ2. What did the students find useful and what kind of services do students want the careers advisers to provide?

6.6.1 Services and Careers Advisers
These questions were tried to find out what kind of services the students wanted and what they found useful from the Careers Adviser in their transition from either one course to another or from another college or school to the College where the research took place. These questions were about the students’ perceptions of careers education, information, advice and guidance and in particular, their interactions with Careers/Personal Advisors before starting college in 2003. There were some students who had seen the researcher before 2003 in her role as the Careers Advisor to the college; however, on the initial questionnaire the questions clearly stated the following: “Have you seen either a Careers/Personal Advisor in the six months before you came to the College”. If the process of seeing either a CA/PA was positive in the eyes of the students then this might help the process of working with the researcher, however, if the students either had a bad experience or had not seen a CA/PA this might have a different outcome of not wanting help or having little or nothing to do with the research.

The format of questions in terms of the layout and wording was therefore important and although there was a lot of information to be gathered, this initial sheet was laid out so that the students did not feel too overwhelmed by the questions:
• Had the students seen a Careers Adviser or Personal Adviser in the six months before they came to the college?
• Did they find working with either the Careers Advisor or Personal Adviser useful?

The information gathered from the first questionnaires helped to set the stage and gave an understanding of how students perceived their careers or personal advisor, the organisation they represented and the help given to the individual. These perceptions formed the basis of the future interactions with the researcher and the research.

6.6.2 Careers, information, advice and guidance post 16 education

The careers advice available before the age of sixteen is through formal sources of information available to them at school, via teachers and through guidance classes and personal interviews with advisers from the Careers Services, or latterly, the Connexions Services. The local guidance services have undergone change in the past few years. As Payne, Cheng and Witherspoon (1996) suggest, Careers Teachers and Careers Officers were not the only people whom young people of school-leaving age consulted about what to do next. They found that the most important source of help was the family; seven out of ten said their family were more helpful than anyone else. In contrast, just less than two fifths said that they had been helped by the Careers Officer and slightly fewer by a careers teacher. With this in mind the research was trying to find out if the students felt they required any help from the careers service.
6.6.3 Identified help required by students

The research Question seven on the first questionnaire asked about the kinds of help that students may have already identified they wanted from the Careers Service operating in the college.

Table 6.6 Kind of Help Required

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kind of Help with:</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Missing</th>
<th>% wanting this help</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Travel/gap year</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Employment</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not sure</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further Education</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>40.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding work</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>40.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Choices were categorised into the following areas where the students felt they would like to receive help from the Careers Service Department person. The two highest ranking were finding work and other.

This choice of Other was not explained fully by students and therefore could have been almost anything. This raises the question of whether the design of the questionnaire was at fault and there was a missed opportunity to gain more information from students. With regard to the presentation of questionnaires and structured interviews, this was done by the researcher with the relevant teacher being present throughout the completion of the questionnaire.

Possibly one way around this situation, on reflection, would have been to have gone through the questionnaire and read out all the questions to the students, but this may also have been very time consuming and maybe students would have got bored with the process, but this method might have helped with the
understanding of the questions being asked and everyone would have completed the questionnaires together.

6.6.4 Sources of Help at the beginning of the research
Questionnaire 2, question 4. Have you received help, advice or support from any of the following between Sept 2003 and May 2004? Table 6.7 shows the kind of information that students would like and where they would seek help. The answers below cover answers from all students in Groups A, B1 and B2s. The students were asked to give one point for each person who they would seek help from with a list of named areas under careers. The columns totals with the lowest scores are on the left hand side of the table with the highest on the right hand of the table. (for students to tick boxes, each tick worth one point).
Table 6.7 Sources of Help with Careers

Second Questionnaire, page two (covering received help, advice or support from any of the listed in table between Sept. 2003 and May 2004). All the remaining students completed this form at the end of year one of their studies (except the NDA who completed at the end of their studies).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject areas</th>
<th>Tutor</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Friends</th>
<th>Link Personal Adviser</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Student Services</th>
<th>Student Services Manager</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Help with CV writing</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How to present self</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying FE and HE</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying Careers</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding employment opportunities</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other areas</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
<td><strong>16</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td><strong>22</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td><strong>31</strong></td>
<td><strong>37</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>% of scores</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.1%</strong></td>
<td><strong>9.8%</strong></td>
<td><strong>10.4%</strong></td>
<td><strong>13.5%</strong></td>
<td><strong>18.4%</strong></td>
<td><strong>19%</strong></td>
<td><strong>22.7%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Scoring key: to tick, each tick worth one point)

Students were asked to tick on the questionnaire their sources of help.

Other = Grandparent, previous teacher

This is where the Link Personal Adviser could have scored a lot higher than above. The surprising result was that family and friends did not score higher than they did but, they were still pretty high. One of the main areas that the Link Personal Adviser and the Student Services Manager were involved with was the UCAS application for students considering higher education. These presentations took place with specific and general student groups and covered higher education and the process of applying.

The tutors are employed and operate within the occupational area that the students may be applying to. Because they are employed and working for a
living they will have a feel for the issues involved, but how much knowledge
they have on up to date recruitment procedures may vary with each tutor. The
other influence on the students came from their friends. These could be fellow
students on their course or friends outside college. The distinction was not
explored in the questionnaire and could be an area for future research.
As explained in the introduction to the table, this data were gathered at the
beginning of the first term and therefore if the question had been asked at the
end of the research, maybe the figures might have been different about where
students seek help and what type of information they require. The same old
favourites might have been around like help with CV writing, application forms
and letters and finding employment and training opportunities. The students
would have experienced the college and have an idea of whom they felt would
be most suitable in answering questions about their futures.

6.7 Important People and Decision Making
Table 6.8 below is a listing of the answers to Question 2 at the final structured
interview with B2 students. This question was trying to find out if the Enhanced
Model process that each student had gone through with the researcher had
helped them to make decisions about their future. This question also links to
Question 9 at the final structured interview with students.
Table 6.8  People helping you make decisions

This was only completed by B2 students at the final structured interview.

Question 2: Who do you think are the most important people helping you to make decisions about your future

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive (Excellent, Very Helpful or Helpful)</th>
<th>Negative (Not very helpful or Waste of time)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers adviser</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends at college</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher KH</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tutor at college</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends elsewhere</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Adviser</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husband, wife, partner</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boy/girl friend</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Services Manager</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above Table 6.8 shows that the parents were the most important to them, followed by friends and their tutor at college, their careers adviser and the researcher, were where students went to ask for help in making their decisions. As the students were aware that the careers adviser, personal adviser and the researcher were the same person one might be considering the collection of all the points for these three job titles would give score of twenty one. However, the researcher in her design of the structured interview questions felt it was important that the choice of titles stayed separate as maybe not all students understood that the researcher was also the careers and personal adviser.

The lowest score in the positive section and the highest score in the negative section was that of the student services manager. This contrasts with Table 6.7, Sources of Help, which suggested that at the beginning of the research in 2005 the Student Services Manager, scored the highest and was the most important/popular, so over time change has happened and students have been through the process of the Enhanced Model it is; worth mentioning
that this did not include all the students left at the end of the research, just the B2 students.

In the positive column the highest score, which should be no surprise, is their parents, followed by friends at college and the Careers Adviser and only one point behind these were the Researcher and the Tutor at college. This table reflects to some degree the national research into young people and who they think are the most important when making decisions. However, one surprise is the Careers Adviser and the Researcher, which both scored highly (perhaps not so surprising given that these people were getting more than most others). Though they were the same person, it is whether the students saw the person or the job title and as this was not researched into at the time we will never know.

The above results are a relatively good result for the researcher and the Enhanced Model. The students have shown themselves to be honest with the researcher and if they did not like something they would let her know. Whether the student wanted the Enhanced Model or not they received it and there were significant input to receive positive marks from a degree of the students overall.

6.8 Gender - Working with CA or PA

The data for this table were gathered from the first questionnaire with all students. It clearly had implications for the researcher that 52 people (nearly half) had not seen a careers or personal adviser before starting their programme of study at the college. With this in mind no wonder some student in the B2 Groups did not want to work with the researcher. They saw no need for her help and had not requested it.
Table 6.9  Gender - Working with CA or PA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Seen a Careers Adviser or Personal Adviser at some point</th>
<th>Never seen Careers Adviser or Personal Adviser</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are significant differences between genders when you analyse whether they have seen a Careers Adviser/Personal Adviser or not. It would seem that females are significantly more likely to see a Careers Adviser than their male counterparts. \( \chi^2_{(\text{CALC})}=3.91, \chi^2_{(1,0.05)}=3.84 \). This could have been down to age as well as the gender of the students as there were quite a few males over the age of 20 years and they considered that they did not require the services of the Careers Adviser as they knew what they wanted to do and got on with it.

6.9 Outcomes of groups

Table 6.8 presents the information covering the outcomes after the end of the programmes of study. As explained earlier there was no clear procedure for a follow up of students and therefore the results in Table 6.8 do not give a detailed picture of the all the outcomes of the students. However, it does give a snap shot of some students and what they were doing.

There was some follow up of students to find out their destination after completing their programme of study. This was done by asking the tutors and, as the researcher worked as the Personal Adviser, part of her job was a follow up of young people to ensure they were in education, training or employment and if required to help them in finding suitable employment, training or education. This was only completed with young people up to the age of twenty and did not include mature or higher education students, or those returning to other parts of the UK. The researcher had kept in touch with a number of the Groups and trends over time, but these differences are not statistically significant. Therefore we cannot say that one intervention, for example the Enhanced Model, was any more effective than the others.
The researcher had kept in touch with a number of mature ex-students. There are significant differences between the B2s and the other students, significant at the 0.012% level. A much higher proportion of the B2s went into occupations related to their field of study than in the other group. \( X^2_{(\text{CALC})} = 20.77 \). \( X^2_{(2,0.05)} = 7.81 \). The researcher cannot find a systematic reason or flaw that would explain this difference as the follow-up for B2s and others was an identical process, we can only conclude that the B2s reached a different conclusion from the others about their destination on completion of the programme. As we have seen earlier, the B2s were a random sample. Larger numbers in the groups would have allowed us to be more confident about this result. This is acknowledged as a significant factor and means that the conclusion is tentative, because we do not know the destination of nearly half of “Others”, despite my best efforts.

### 6.10 Presentation of Words

The presentation of words covers part of the continuing evaluation built into the research and used twice by the researcher. This was a list of words for all students to select from (up to four words could be either ticked or circled) at the end of the first year of the research. This questionnaire was completed by all Groups A, B1 and B2.

The researcher asked all students to rate the process of working with her at the end of the first year (this formed part of the inbuilt evaluation process). Given a list of words the top three words selected were “Useful”, “Just OK”, “Practical”,

---

### Table 6.10 Comparison outcomes of B2s with other groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>After end of course</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Related occupation to subject studied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>at college</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stay at college</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course elsewhere including HE and FE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not sure unknowns</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>Others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

188
this exercise was repeated again at the end of the research but just with the Groups B2 and Z at the end of the final interview. The top three choices for the Group B2 were "Interesting", "Thought-provoking" and "Useful". For Group Z their top three words were "Interesting", "Useful" and "Valuable", (for the rest of the results see Appendix 16). Although this exercise may not be rigorous it did provide the researcher with an insight into the choices of words that most portrayed what the students felt of the process they had gone through with the researcher. As seen above there were two words that both sets of students ranked highly "interesting" and "useful", but the other words of "Thought-provoking" and "Valuable" were much more revealing of the process these students felt depicted their own experience of working with the researcher, there was also negative comments (see Appendix 16).

6.11 Summary
This chapter has not shown that the Enhanced Model was a total success with all students and in its present form it could not be used successfully with either further or higher education students. However, there are pockets of success as shown in the analyses. In this summary of the highs and lows of the research consideration will be given to the established scales, comments from students and the case studies which will then lead into Chapter Seven and the conclusions and implications of this research and possible future research into the use of coaching and mentoring, working alongside career guidance.

What this chapter does show is that with some students there are some definite pluses in taking part in the research and others for whom there were none shown in the period of the research. There is evidence shown in the Established Scales, Charts One to Six of this chapter that everyone increased in their ability to use careers skills and techniques between the start and end of their studies, across the range of areas of careers decidedness, self concept clarity, occupational information, career exploration and career decision making self efficacy. Passive decision making was the one where not everyone
improved. Although there were differences in the Groups and trends over time, these differences are not statistically significant. Therefore we cannot say that one intervention, for example the Enhanced Model, was any more effective than the others.

The Case Studies give some insight into the background of students and, overall their comments were quite positive about the interaction with the process and the researcher. The interviews with the B2 students who received the Enhanced Model were that they were positive about the process.

This research covered two questions. One looking at whether the Enhanced model made a real difference to those who received it and in what ways and the other about what students found useful and the kind of services students wanted careers advisers/personal advisers to provide. The kind of services that individuals from this research wanted to be provided was the traditional careers information, advice and guidance. There was evidence that primarily males were less likely to ask for help from a CA/PA. Though the males who were part of the Enhanced model seemed to take an activity part throughout, this was a very small number compared to the females taking part in the research. Overall, students wanted information advice and guidance in finding work, where to look and different types of work and location, help with choices of higher education, the procedures on line, different types of courses and subject areas and what they could possibility do afterwards with their qualifications.

The findings did reveal that Group Z overall found the process they went through more successful than the students in Group B2 receiving the Enhanced Model. The Group B2 were not self referrals but students picked at random either by tutor group or by the tutors at the beginning of the research.

So, the findings of this chapter are that the Enhanced Model did not produce higher scores over time, but at least some of the students seemed to find it
valuable. In contrast Group Z was self referrals. It is pleasing to me that they clearly felt I was helpful, but of the self selection could had has a lot to do with this. It is notable that although Group Z students reported more benefits than the B2s, the rank order of perceived benefits was similar for each group. This further suggests that the Enhanced Model may not have been delivering different outcomes from traditional careers guidance. However, what did show through was that the presentation words at the end of the research from both Group B2 and Z revealed that 50% of the Group B2 and 100% Group Z found the process of working with the researcher interesting. The others words of “Useful”, “Enjoyable”, “Valuable”, “Thought-provoking”, all scored well. The other words which a third of the Group B2 used to describe the process was “Inspiring” which is a positive end to the research.

This is not the say that the Enhanced Model did not work in some parts, for some students, but overall it did not make a really significant difference in the time allocated in college. However if there had been a built in follow up procedure after three years this may have revealed more positive findings.
7 Discussion and Conclusions

7.1 Introduction

This study was designed to investigate whether the training and development techniques of mentoring and coaching could be used successfully in the context of careers guidance. The researcher created an Enhanced Model, born out of a number of other models of mentoring and coaching, which was deployed with certain individuals (Group B2s) on five different Higher/Further education programmes taking part in the research. There were three National Diploma (two year) programmes, all of which had three groups in each (Groups A, Group B1 and B2). The Access to Higher Education (one year) and Higher National Diploma (two year) programmes were only split into two groups B1 and B2. There was another National Diploma programme involved in the research but they only took part in the questionnaires at the beginning and end of the research and none of the students saw the researcher individually; these students were called Group 0 as they received nothing from either the researcher or from the Personal Adviser (same person). The other groups received the following inputs: Group A, these students received the contractually obliged guidance; therefore they could receive more careers guidance input than Group 0. Group B1 received the contractually obliged guidance and one joint group session with the Group B2.

Within the research there was also another group (Group Z) made up of self referral students from the other two groups (A and B1). These students wanted to see the researcher and made approaches to seek further help and support at various times throughout the two year period whilst the research was taking place, but they did not receive the Enhanced Model.

It should be noted that students taking part in this research were mainly on further education programmes and were primarily aged between sixteen and nineteen years old. There were some students over the age of nineteen,
especially those on the one higher education programme taking part and a handful of mature students over the age of twenty one.

The research took place at a Midlands based Further Education College between Sept 2003 and May 2005.

7.2 Summary of findings
The charts in the preceding Chapter (Charts 1 to 6), used established measures to judge the careers abilities of students in the different Groups (A, B1, B2, Z and 0) at the beginning and at the end of the research. All measures (except passive decision making where some groups did not improve) showed a statistically significant improvement during the research. Unfortunately the variability within the groups outweighed the variations between one group and the next, therefore the variations between groups were not significant. While all groups improved, it is not possible to show that any one intervention caused a better outcome for the students.

For five of the six measures covering career decidedness, self concept clarity, occupational information, passive decision making, career exploration and career decision making self efficacy, the students perceived that they had improved. However, this seems to be irrespective of the input they had received in terms of career guidance and is probably a function of reaching the end of their course and having to think about their next steps.

The above findings did not address whether the perceptions of the students were actually well founded. Therefore the researcher tried to find out where people actually ended up, which sounds easy but is not so in the real world. Despite the difficulty differentiating the established measures by group, the Group B2s who were followed up took a different pattern of career paths (land-based course related and otherwise) in higher education and work than the other groups in the research.
The B2s were more likely to be in work related to their course than the other groups. This suggests the Enhanced Model may have had an impact after all.

The learning styles of students could have had an affect on of the Enhanced Model used with Group B2, as primarily the sessions involved one to one interactions, group work seminars and writing with students, therefore those students in Group B2 whose learning style fell into the above learning may benefit the most from the experience and others would have not.

Before starting the course the students had found their previous experiences of working with the Career Adviser or Personal Adviser useful. The statistics showed that age was not important in their finding it useful and that gender was a factor in their seeking help but not a factor in whether they found the experience useful. Females were more likely to have had contact with an adviser, but age and gender did not affect the proportion of students that found the experience useful.

In the interviews with students in the Group B2 there is the suggestion of movement in soft skills like confidence, self esteem and realisation of goals. There is also the indication that some students found the process of the Enhanced Model enjoyable and helpful. Although each student can be seen as an individual they would always have common areas for development. This was shown early on by the question asked in the first questionnaire about whether the students wanted help with career related matters such as CV writing, identifying further, higher education and careers opportunities and finding employment: which they did. At no point did they list that they wanted help with coaching or mentoring, or developing skills in confidence or self esteem. At the end of the research some of the students in Group B2 said that the above areas had been covered and that they felt their confidence and self esteem had improved.
Where this becomes even more interesting are the self referral students in Group Z. They were much more positive than the B2s about the process of working with the researcher, possibly because they had made the decision to approach the researcher for her help, whereas the Group B2 students had not. The Group Z answers to the structured questions at the final interview (Table 6.3) clearly showed that they were really positive about the relationship with the researcher and how helpful this person had been in providing careers information and answering advice and guidance questions (a to c and some of d) and also how the researcher had helped them in the soft skills areas, primarily covered in section d. (See Table 6.3)

The overall impression is that the self referral students in Group Z seemed to be more impressed, happier and found the process of working with the researcher more helpful, than the Group B2 who received the Enhanced Model. However, it is not as clear-cut as that. A proportion of students in the Group B2 were equally happy with the process and presentation of information by the researcher as was explained in Chapter 6, Table 6.1, but their satisfaction was balanced by more negative comments.

As seen above from Questionnaire One, at the beginning of the research students wanted help with careers related subjects, options post the end of their course and with finding work. They did not say they wanted help in confidence building, knowing their skills, career planning or self esteem. So if that was not their focus, it could explain some of the more negative comments from the students in Group B2. They were being given something they had not asked for. Whereas the Group Z students asked for help with finding work and higher education options and received this, the knock on effect was that they became more confident.

Table 6.2 in Chapter Six shows that the B2s did find the process useful, however the Group Z (Table 6.3) found the process even more to their liking.
Both Groups ordered the different factors relating to what they had taken from the process and both Groups ordered the activities in a similar way, i.e. Students looked mainly to the adviser for information/help on finding work and higher education.

The students had changed their sources of careers information as their courses developed. By the end they were mainly looking to parents, the careers adviser, friends and tutors for information. This is similar to the NFER report by Keys, Maychell, Evans, Brooks, Lee and Pathak (1998), where 867 students took part and listed their top three sources of advice as coming from parents, careers teacher and then the careers adviser. In the Keys et al survey friends did not score highly. Theirs was a much larger sample of people than this research and though parents featured at the top of both lists, there are differences. In this research there were a smaller number of students, on vocational further and higher education courses, where friends featured higher on the list of people to help students obtain information/help on finding work or going onto higher education. The differences could also be about the different times of the mid/late 1990's and that this research took place in 2003 to 2005, a different time frame where friendships can be maintained by keeping in contact by emailing, texting and telephoning mobiles.

The Case Studies of the three students were positive overall about their interaction with the researcher. It was hoped there would have been further information generated by this process but unfortunately the tape machine for taping the interviews did not work properly, with the voice actuation proving deficient and some of the data were lost.

There is some indication that the Enhanced Model did work for some students taking part in the research in Group B2. This could have been for a number of reasons, including that normally if you volunteer to take part then you are more likely to attend the sessions and want to find out as much as possible. The
Group B2s did have a choice of whether they took part in the research but once the students had made the choice to take part and committed they had no choice of which group they were in as this had been made by the tutors.

The researcher decided to ask the tutors to select groups of students. Therefore as far as the researcher is aware, a fact confirmed by the statistics, a random sample of students from each programme were selected for each group. This made the research ethical and fair, but could have made it harder work than if students chose the group they wanted to be in.

There was a great deal of information gathered over the two year period of the research. This covered the following areas which supplemented the main research: age, gender and social economic background of students and in particular the Group B2s across the programmes taking part.

These factors may have had an effect on the research and their possible involvement in the process. As seen in Chapter Six, males were less likely to see a Careers Adviser. The majority of the students taking part in the research were aged 16 to 18 years old and they were more likely to want to complete their studies than take part in the research. What students wanted the careers/personal adviser to provide and what was available may have not been the same, therefore students would look elsewhere for information. Students do talk to each other and maybe one student came to see the research/CA for information and then cascaded the information to the other students on their course. They were on vocational courses and most students would have liked to work in the same area that they were studying in (this was the impression from the answers to Question four, in the First Questionnaire covering why students had chosen to study the course), making the need for careers guidance less important.
There is also the issue of student's social class. A third of the students taking part came from Routine occupations, followed by Intermediate occupations and, when adding up the socio-economic classification of semi routine, Routine and Unemployed, the figure is that over 41% of the students came from the above. As Foskett & Hesketh (1997) suggests, "student decision making and the post 16 market place found considerable differences in the types of courses chosen by working and middle class students at 16, with the former more likely to opt for vocational courses and the latter for academic courses". This may have had an effect on how students perceived the role of the Careers/Personal Adviser (unintentionally being seen as intimidating by being smartly dressed, confident, knowledgeable and perceived as a middle-class individual) in college. It may also explain why their friends scored as high as they did as sources of information and help in this research. If previously students had not received help either Career/Personal Advisers then they would not have seen the researcher as a resource. This could be why when the students were asked to rank who were the most useful, their friends came out highly on their list of people they would contact or speak to.

The preferred learning styles of students and their highest qualification before the start of their studies gave the researcher an insight into the different types of qualifications students already had achieved and through this an understanding of the learning styles that students preferred, or were more used to. In the third questionnaire there was a question for the students to identify their strengths and weaknesses. The highest scores under strengths were self awareness and confidence and under the heading of weaknesses the highest score was oral and written communications (see Appendix for further details). The learning styles of students and the presentation of information by the researcher could have been at odds as the Enhanced Model was presented partly through group sessions, but the main bulk was through one to one activities with the students taking an active part in the process through discussion, reflection and writing. Therefore if these students’ preferred
learning style was through observation or practical activities this could mean that the students in the Group B2 were less likely to find the process addressed their needs and perceived requirements.

7.3 Relating Findings to the Existing Literature
At the beginning of this research there was little evidence of the use of coaching and mentoring in career guidance (documented evidence information in academic books and journals), but a growing amount of research in both business and education. So here was an opportunity to contribution to the knowledge of the use of coaching and mentoring in career guidance. However, as time has gone by there has been an increasing pace of coaching and mentoring in education and careers guidance, for example in the advertising of positions at London Business School and University of Bradford (2007) and in the Bimrose (2005) paper on "The Changing Context of Career Practice: Guidance, Counselling or Coaching". Whether this is a changing of name, context or a mix of roles, skills or development it looks like in particular coaching is here to stay. But on the basis of my findings coaching is not a 'magic pill'; so it should not be assumed that these career coaching roles will suit everyone.

Mentoring is frequently proposed as a desired means to enhance various personal outcomes, especially those related to career success (Corzin et al, 1994; Aryee et al., 1996; Chao, 1997; Wallace, 2001). To some degree the Enhanced Model achieve some of the above as coaching is very similar to mentoring. Students can not achieve their goals in their career unless they enhance various personal outcomes. The Enhanced Model helped students make progress in the following: developing ideas, planning their career, the actions required and reviewing the progress with the students. These students needed to find out information covering jobs or higher education opportunities. The results suggested they did and as this was covered by the Enhanced Model this is a positive outcome for the Enhanced Model.
Through the Enhanced Model it was expected that the students would be able to make decisions and be more aware of themselves and of the opportunities available to them and would start to plan their futures, by being more confident in themselves, to be motivated and have the self esteem to carry forward their plans whether that was in the short or longer term. Some students in the Group B2 did express that their confidence and self esteem had increased. These are areas which are very often ignored in the coaching and mentoring literature i.e. the individual’s self concept, confidence and self esteem (Bachkirova 2004).

However, these soft skills are vital for the success of both individuals and their development and in the development of their careers, which in turn helps the individual, and so it goes on. As Bachkirova (2004) suggests there are various coaching and mentoring tools that can assist individuals in the development of the self view, these include “360-degree feedback,” which is completed in some organisations and the learning styles test by Honey and Mumford (1992); this tool was adapted and used in the first questionnaire to find out the preferred learning styles of students on further and higher education courses. As explained in Chapter Six, these styles helped us to understand to some degree why some students could have been more active and positive about their experience of the Enhanced Model than others but did not directly answer the research questions set for this research. They provided a backcloth suggesting why certain individuals taking part in the research were more likely to get involved than others.

It was intended that through the process of the Enhanced Model students would be able to make better decisions and be more aware of themselves and of the opportunities available to them and would start to plan their futures in a better way. As seen in Chapter 6 their comments on the process varied. Some students found the most useful areas were achieving their goals, making decisions and improving their planning skills. These were not quite the same types of skills that the researcher hoped the students would achieve by going through the Enhanced Model, but were creditable and of importance in helping
students make better decisions and planning their futures through being more confident. For the Enhanced Model to work there needed to be an element of trust between the students taking part and the researcher. This confidence in the application and process was vital for the success as Buffton (2006:50), states that, "Career coaching is about opening up conversations, building trust and getting people to feel comfortable about sharing their thoughts and aspirations". For some of the B2 students this was what happened, as shown by the comments from the Case Studies and to questions seven and ten of the final structured interview. What Buffton (2006) did not mention was whether these conversations were formal or informal, how much time would be spent on building up trust for people to feel comfortable and to want to share their thoughts and aspirations. Buffton (2006) did not consider the ages of the individuals and whether younger students would require more input. Some people want to talk and discuss their inner thoughts and others do not and this is where the work begins. As Clutterbuck & Associates (2004) argue "Coaching is often seen as a relatively directive way of developing skills". If we consider the origins of coaching it is about performance, developing skills and doing your best. Therefore the translation to career coaching from sports coaching and developing those skills in career development does not 'sit well' with professionally trained Careers Guidance Practitioners. We do not tell people what to do, but provide them with the Information Advice and Guidance (IAG) to assist in their decision making about their next step, therefore guidance is not directive. So where a directive process meets a non directive one there is a tension.

As Roberts (2000:145) suggests, "a more knowledgeable and experienced person actuates a supportive role of overseeing and encouraging reflection and learning within a less experienced and knowledgeable person, so as to facilitate that person's career and personal development". There is some agreement between Roberts (2000) and what the Enhanced Model was trying to achieve with the Group B2s. To help the less experienced and
knowledgeable person (the student) facilitate their career and personal development so that they could make decisions about their future. However, as seen in the results, this did not happen for everyone in the Group B2, but there were some successes. Perhaps for some people "overseeing and encouraging reflection" was what they wanted, but for others it was not. Roberts was describing mentoring process, these research findings suggest that the emphasis on encouraging reflection is appropriate but not for everyone.

It is believed that all students are unique. The mistake that many people make is choosing a model of guidance or process of working with individuals that is the same for everyone. Instead, consideration should be given to adapting the programme of interventions with people to the individual. As seen in the collection of data on learning styles in Chapter Five, there are certain styles that are more favourable than others, but maybe they need to be adapted to work in the areas of teaching and providing the information required by students from the Careers/Personal Adviser (as explained in Chapter Six). The common threads of finding work and help with higher education applications is what students required. This was provided to all the Group B2 students if required, but the Enhanced Model was a one size fits all approach.

The negative perceptions may have developed because the process was too long. All students received the same techniques in the B2 process, but each person is different and their interests and concerns are unique to them, though there where similarities around finding work, considering further and higher education courses and gap year opportunities the approach needed to be tailored to each student. Students want similar things but coaching and mentoring will not work with everyone. Maybe all that was required was the careers information, advice and guidance. As Clutterbuck (2001, 2004), suggests, the importance of matching the mentor to the mentee and the coach to coachee is important, so he is arguing the case that random selection may not work. This shows that the mentee or coachee needs to understand the
reasons for working together and have the commitment to the process to make it work.

Greener (2005) argues that a career coach should have the tacit knowledge and short-term relationship of a buddy, the creditability of a mentor and the subject expertise of a performance coach on the specific subject of career. To some degree these techniques were adopted, except for being the buddy. These roles were taken by the career adviser and gave the students her knowledge of the regional and national labour markets and trends and the up to date information on higher education.

This research was conducted to try to improve students' decision making and career planning. The literature suggested that coaching can be about performance and the development of specific skills helping the person develop competence in a particular area. If this could be said about students on vocational programmes of study, why not in their career planning. Coaching seems to mean different things for different people, whether this is about aspirations or building trust, it is about people achieving their full potential.

The process that the students went through had a beginning and an end, for some students the process was useful and for others it was not so. For some students taking part in the Enhanced Model they could see the benefits and were starting to achieve their goals through working with the researcher. As Clutterbuck, (2001:1) says: "a good mentoring relationship is one where mentor and protégé have mutual respect, recognise their need for personal development and have at least some idea of where they want to go." The students in the Case Studies and the answers in the final interview provided evidence that some students felt that there was a good relationship between themselves and the researcher. However, there were a small minority where this did not seem to be true and this could be more about their personality than the Enhanced Model. This was manifested in negative comments.
Whitmore (1992) suggests that coaching is as much about the way things are done as about what is done. The Enhanced Model was about the timing and presentation of information to students through the process of interviews and group sessions. As seen in this thesis these interviews were allowed dual purpose and acted as both a follow up session and review and the collection of information, thus reducing students’ time away from their studies. This process is similar to what Whitmore (1992) is suggesting and makes the best use of time with students, building that relationship with the student so that the coaching process can be a success for both parties. However, success does not always portray itself as being successful as the coaching process is not about being nice and friendly towards students, just having a talk or chat. As Parsloe (1998) suggests, coaching is “a process that enables learning and development to occur and thus performance to improve”. If we take this at face value then the Enhanced Model did not succeed for some students taking part as their performance did not develop anymore than those who were un-coached and un-mentored overall, (see Charts in Chapter Six). However, coaching is not merely a technique to be wheeled out and rigidly applied in certain circumstances, as Whitmore (1993) suggests, “it is about the management of people and a way of thinking”, that ‘fits’ in nicely to the professional trained Careers Adviser and what they would like to achieve for those individuals that we work with, but remembering the focus on directive and non-directive presentation of information and actions.

The area of matching the coach to the coachee was not really covered in this research and yet as Clutterbuck (2001) suggests “A good relationship is one where there is mutual respect, recognising the need for personal development and to have at least some idea of where they want to go”, This clearly did not always happen in the Enhanced Model. Maybe this is the reason why the success was not higher.
With the Enhanced Model there were clear objectives for the meetings with the students and opportunities for them to contribute at any point. What is clear now is that some students did not see the need for the meetings and there was no personal development for them, but that was not the case for all the students and some did develop. However, as will be discussed in the limitations section later in this chapter the matching of the researcher to the students did not happen, and indeed could not happen, in this research because if it did then you might only get the students that liked the researcher and not a random number of individuals.

Philip (2000) argued that there are natural mentoring relationships and these can be between friends. This is correct. A friend can be a mentor, even if not a very good one. This is very interesting in terms of some of the results in the research, about where students where getting their advice and guidance from. In Chapter Six parents were at the top of the students' list with friends also rating highly. This may be because of what Philip (2000) is saying about natural mentoring taking place within a wide range of relationships and that is why mentoring has taken off both in business and education. Whereas, Clutterbuck (1998) shows that the developmental mentors have a complex role to play because they have to be competent in different roles, including being a coach, counsellor, guardian, networker and facilitator and they have to know when to move from one into another. The example given by Philip (2000) is not the same as Clutterbuck (1998). The Enhanced Model and what it was trying to achieve corresponds to Clutterbuck's argument and has nothing to do with friendship. As Clutterbuck (2004) presented at the CIPD Conference on Coaching, "Coaching is a way of managing, a way of engaging people, a way of thinking and a way of being", which may be one of the best ways of presenting the way of thinking of the researcher. The Enhanced Model was about management of the process. It was about engaging students in thinking about their futures, planning this through and developing the soft skills to become competent, confident and self motivated with the self esteem to enable
them to move forward in making those all important decisions about their future based on fact not fiction. All this is set against the background of their lives, their difficulties, family issues and the internal and external pressures of everyday life. So it seems at times the role of the researcher was too small in the students' lives to count as anything resembling a source of developmental careers mentoring or coaching.

7.4 Limitations of this Study
In terms of the research design, I selected quantitative and qualitative approaches that were most appropriate to test the specific research questions I had set.

Throughout this research the characteristics and limitations of the sample and data collection were acknowledged. The sample in this study was drawn from further and higher education students and included those who were interested in participating in this research and those who were not. This provided a real world example of how mentoring and coaching would be used in practice. Although it was an indirect limitation the only robust methodology was to use random samples, if the findings were to have any meaning in the real world.

This research happened in the real world, a working college, the researcher was the only person running this research whilst she worked full time. There was data collection as well as the Enhanced Model being run with the Group B2 s and the recording of all interventions with the Group Z and all the other students and staff in college that related to either the research being carried out or the students taking part in the research. These data were recorded in the reflective diary over the two year period. The results might be more a product of the researcher than the techniques in use.

There might have been confusion between the role of the researcher and Careers Adviser/ Personal Adviser for some students. Maybe a clarification
every time the researcher met with students did not work as well as she had hoped for. Perhaps the students knew exactly who I was and did not need the different labels I was seeking to apply.

As seen above, matching the researcher to students could have increased the success of the Enhanced Model. If the research only attracted the students who liked or wanted to work with the researcher then this would be unethical and unprofessional. As a Careers/Personal Adviser I work with many students over an academic year, how does one know who likes you or not, only after a period of time working with the individual. However, the careers guidance interview can take from twenty minutes to one hour in total and then there might be a follow up interview or you never seeing the student again. That is quite different from the process of the Enhanced Model over a one to two year period, with a number of interventions included in this process.

There was a late entry to the research by another National Diploma programme to help to make up the numbers of students taking part, including the Group B2s. This was important as a number of students had left the college between September 2003 and March 2004, plus one programme had dropped out completely and therefore there needed to be more students taking part in the research or the research might have to have been stopped altogether. This was not ideal and the late entry to the research may have affected the results. The majority of the negative comments came from the NO Group 82s who came into the research late. The students had already seen the Careers/Personal Adviser at the beginning of their studies. To come into the research after the other programmes had started they might have felt they had missed something by being late. There was a shorter time period to get through the information and in the initial stages of completing the first questionnaire and seeing the students selected to be in the Group B2, these students may have developed a lack of commitment to the research. It may be just that the students selected to be in the Group B2 just did not want to be
there. This could have been easily very different with another group of students.

With regard to the questionnaires of which there were four, on reflection the research had too many questionnaires and it would have been better to be more streamlined. The main bulk of questions should have been at the beginning of the research with the evaluation questions in the first and fourth questionnaires. This would have cut out the second questionnaire completely and may be even the third questionnaire too. However, the third questionnaire could have been included if there were other types of information required as the research developed. This is a useful learning point for any future research, whether work-based or personal/career development. Therefore retaining at least one questionnaire between start and finish would help the researcher to investigate emerging issues that had not been anticipated at the start of the research.

On reflection there were too many groups (A, B1, B2, 0 and Z); it was only possible to keep track of all the students and which group they were in through a detailed Gantt chart and Reflective Diary and being a very well organised person/researcher and Careers Adviser. The whole process could have become overwhelming, but being well planned and seeing the number of categories as positive instead of negative did help. A great deal was learnt through the process, in particular not to over-complicate the research. Two groups would have been enough, one getting the Enhanced Model and the other the normal careers input, there might still have been a Group Z but then there would be three groups instead of five. This could have prevented the need for the late entry of another National Diploma group as there would have been adequate numbers in each group.

The overall plan for the research did not expect that there would be any students who self referred themselves to see the researcher. Therefore,
although not expected, it was dealt with in a planned way and detailed records kept of all interactions with these students throughout the two year period. Their impact turned out to be an asset to the research, in terms of the final structured interviews with all eight students and how they had perceived the services they had received from the researcher verses the Group B2s; the comparison between these two groups of students was interesting.

The students who became the self referral Group Z wanted certain things, they asked to see the researcher, they received information via signposting and they rated the service in a very positive way. The conclusion that can be drawn from this is that they sought a service and rated it as appropriate to their needs and requirements. This is encouraging for me as a Personal Adviser, but it does suggest that the Enhanced Model was not an essential component of effective careers guidance.

Coaching and mentoring is about help and support empowering the individual to take control of their career for themselves and learning to solve their own problems when they arise. The Enhanced Model tried to do both to these through the process of group interventions, but in particular the interviews with the students in Group B2 across the programmes over the two year period.

With regard to the number of interventions/interviews with students, maybe one consideration could have been fewer interviews with students and fewer interventions to collect data from students. This may have made a difference, or as before that some students in the Group B2 received less interactions or more depending on their own needs and requirements. However less interventions may have diluted the coaching and mentoring part of the Model.

7.5 Implications for Career Guidance Practice
There should be further research into the tools and techniques of coaching and mentoring and their uses in careers guidance and career management training,
in particular with further and higher education students. It is also felt that there are many other openings for coaching and mentoring. There are a number of pitfalls that could arise through not planning the activities and the lack of suitable and appropriate training of staff in the important role of the coach or mentor. Training is vital for the support and supervision of staff in the field, so that they known the purpose of the intervention with individuals and the details of the intervention to be recorded.

It may be damaging that coaching and mentoring are perceived to offer everything, for everyone. It is important to know when, where and more importantly with whom to use these tools and techniques. Knowing the differences can supply the process and enhance the benefits. However, the person who is to go through the process of mentoring or coaching must be ready for the activity, a willing individual. There must be a beginning and end to the activity. Whoever is the coach or mentor should be trained in either coaching or mentoring and in the areas they are going to mentor or coach and fully understand the process or activity. An example of this would be use by a trained Careers Adviser or Psychologist so that they have their own expertise and that they are also a trained coach or mentor, thus enabling them to draw on the skills and knowledge that will be required. As Jarvis (2006:53), argues that "If individuals do not have the qualifications or industry knowledge, they may not fit the bill".

Over the years careers guidance has undergone fundamental and rapid change. This is shown by the way the training of career guidance professionals has developed into the Personal Advisers of today. There is now an array of different entry points into Careers Service companies, Connexions Services to schools colleges and universities having their own careers advisers. There are issues around professional postgraduate diplomas and the National Vocational Qualifications (NVQs) in Guidance and Advice and what these qualifications are training people for. This is a similar story as regard the training of mentors.
and coaches. Often there is very little training in mentoring of coaching and this could be the reason why both processes do not always deliver the results that individuals and organisations require. For example, if a professionally trained Careers Adviser with a mentoring or coaching qualification starts to work with students considering higher education or employment he/she will hopefully have a better understanding of the labour markets' trends and higher education application processes than someone who is not a careers adviser or a trained coach/mentor, just an individual who is trying to help. Having the most qualified and trained individuals working alongside each other can help individuals to achieve their goals.

The Connexions Diploma for Personal Advisers training emphasises an approach to working with young people that requires counselling skills and a holistic approach. What students in this research were primarily looking for help with was finding work and further and higher education opportunities. This does not necessarily require counselling skills. Instead a good practical knowledge of the regional labour market trends and HE opportunities is more important.

Education is ever changing in the pre and post sixteen arena with the emphasis on widening participation so that everyone should have the opportunity to have experienced higher education (not get the qualification, but experience it). All this is going on whilst the labour market is changing with the shift away from industry to an information society, with flatter structures in organisations and the global economy. This has brought about the change in career patterns and arguably fewer people have a job for life. The important part of the role of Careers or Personal Adviser is knowing about the local and regional labour markets. One area where there is potential development is linking practice to the labour market, finding out what is happening and working with the various stakeholders, including where possible employers, education, training providers
and the voluntary sector. It is vital that the Connexions and the Youth Services combine their resources and work closely together.

As career guidance moves into its next phase of development in the challenging times ahead let us hope the tools and techniques of mentoring and coaching are used for the benefits of clients and organisations. The researcher believes they have their role to play in developing individuals, teams and organisations. As long as this is done in a managed, quality and effective way there will be progress. Though the findings in this thesis differ slightly to the comment above there is evidence in the literature that individuals in organisations can improve their performance through individual and team coaching on a particularly activity. The role of mentoring to help individuals starting their career in an organisation is proved in the literature. The process of training and managing the mentors and coaches is properly completed. With clear matching of the needs of the individuals against the needs of the organisations, with clear monitoring, reviewing and the all important evaluation at the end of the process there should be success and if not we should know the reasons why not. From my reflections recorded in my reflective diary, and observation of the operation of the Enhanced Model, I conclude it is vital that:

a) Both parties want to be involved in the process and see the need for the coaching and mentoring to take place;

b) Both parties understand the roles and responsibilities, what they are doing and what they are not. Coaching or mentoring have limitations and by knowing these the process can progress more smoothly by knowing what is viable and what is not;

c) There is a time limit to avoid dependence. It should be clearly pointed out at the beginning that there is an end to the process and the student cannot expect everlasting support;

d) There is an agreed agenda, reflecting what the mentor/coach and mentee/coachee want from working together and achievable targets that are written down and reviewed and evaluated;
e) The agenda may change throughout the process, unavoidable 'life' happens and the agenda may need to change or be revised in light of circumstances;

f) Agreed contract of behaviour, the process is a professional one and agreed times of meetings and language to be used. The confidential nature of the process for both parties is important;

g) Keep it simple, do not over complicate the process, set an agenda, review the agenda and possible targets to be reached within a time limit.

7.6 Further Research

In future studies especially at PhD level there should a built in follow up in the longer term to see if the Enhanced Model really worked. This should have been planned as part of the evaluation of the Enhanced Model and this research.

Further research would be useful in understanding what uses of coaching and mentoring can have with different individuals. Examples of this would be coaching or mentoring of individuals going back to work after a period away through having children or illness. The use of coaching in job hunting, writing applications, mock interviews and reviewing skills of clients, this could be done through group work sessions and interviews.

The developmental areas of confidence building and self esteem are important for individuals. This could be used with a range of individuals, including the unemployed and graduates who are having trouble getting a job or who are academically able but lack social confidence or are unsure of the opportunities available to them outside the academic environment.

There should be research into whether coaching and mentoring can help an individual to improve their outlook on life and rebalance the positive and negative, "is the glass half empty or help full". Through the process individuals
may become more positive and therefore again the potential to be more successful.

7.7 Conclusions

In this study, I started with the consideration that coaching and mentoring tools and techniques could be transferred to be used alongside careers guidance with students studying further and higher education programmes. This research set out the Enhanced Model using elements of coaching and mentoring to be used alongside the process of careers guidance, to help students of whatever age, gender or qualification level, taking them through the process of development. By using the techniques of coaching and mentoring it was designed to encourage students to think about planning for their employability. With the potential to develop new skills and gain the confidence to plan their career. The role of careers guidance is to help individuals in their transitions from school to further education, employment or training. As there are various transitions that each of us makes throughout our lives it is importance that we understand the importance of planning and development.

It is interesting that instead of answering the above it has also posed other questions which could be used to formulate further research in the future. Should coaching and mentoring be included in the training of Careers Advisers in Universities across the country? This already can be taken as an optional module of Training and Coaching for the Post Graduate Diploma in Careers Information, Advice and Guidance in Higher Education at the University of Reading, a course run for Careers Advisers working in higher education careers advisory work.

In this study coaching and mentoring did not generate quantifiable benefits for the students. However this does not mean that these techniques are without merit. It is believed that both coaching and mentoring do have a part to play in careers related work. These areas would include research skills, looking into
the opportunities available and the job search skills of writing applications and the preparation for interviews. This is where coaching could play a role in developing an individual's performance. Both coaching and mentoring could be used as part of the process of developing the skills of confidence, self esteem, motivation and those all important skill of planning and evaluation of actions.
REFERENCES


Avis (2000) 15 Title unknown


CIPD (2003). *The Business Case for Coaching and Mentoring*, 18-37. [www.cipd.co.uk/training](http://www.cipd.co.uk/training)


London SCAA

Department for Education and Employment (DfEE) (1997). 'Higher Education in


and Guidance for Careers Services.

Department for Education and Employment (DfEE) (1999). 'The Development

"Learning to Succeed".

Donaldson et al., (2000) ('Will that be one mentor or two?). Packard, B. W.,
71.

examination of mentoring relationships on organisational commitment and

Downey M., (2003). Effective Coaching, Lessons form the coaches’ coach,


Elias Purcell Class of 1999.  
http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/fac/soc/ier/research/class99


Garvey, B, & Galloway, K., (2002). Mentoring at the Halifax – a small beginning in a large organisation, Career Development International, 271


Higginbottom, K., (2004). OSCAR Winners, People Management 11 November 2004 CIPD In-Company Solutions @the OSCAR Model, 45.


Lantra the Sector Skills Council for the environmental and land-based sector. 
www.lantra.co.uk/businesses/agricultural-crops/industry-information


Parsloe E., (1999). *The manager as coach and mentor*, IPD.


Whittacker CIPD (2004). Chartered Institute of Personal and Development
People Management September 2004, 12.

Wiseman, Aron (1972) (Planning and Conducting Interviews) in Bell, J., (2005)
Doing you Research Project, Open University Press.

Experience of Young People ED Research Series Youth Cohort Report No.33
Sheffield Employment Department.

Appendix 1 - First Questionnaire

First Questionnaire

Please be assured that any information given will remain confidential and will only be used by Kay Harness and NOT be given to anyone else in the future.

Name: __________________________ __

Course: ____________________________ Year 2003

Please indicate which applies to you by circling the corresponding letter.

1. Before you came to Brooksby Melton College to study for a course, what were you doing: (please ring each letter that applies)
   a. At school
   b. At another college in Leicestershire
   c. At a college outside Leicestershire
   d. At work
   e. On a training course
   f. Unemployed
   g. Other, please list

2. Have you seen either a Careers Advisor or Personal Advisor in the 6 months before you came to Brooksby Melton College?
   a. Careers Advisor in school or college
   b. Personal Advisor in school or college
   c. Careers Advisor elsewhere, please list
   d. Not seen either a Careers or Personal Advisor (go to Question 4)

3. Did you find working with either the Careers Advisor or Personal Advisor Useful Not Useful

4. Why have you chosen to study the course you have just started?
   a. Interest
   b. Want to work in this type of work
   c. Want to go to Higher Education
   d. Other please list
5. Have you ever come across the terms mentoring, coaching or counselling? If yes, please tick. Please note this is not a test just a way of finding out how you see things

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Mentoring</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Coaching</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Counselling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Thinking about how you learn best, which of the following do you find useful ways of learning in your school or college work?

Please tick

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Practical activities (by doing)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By observing others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group work, seminars</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One to one</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All of the above</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. What kinds of help would you like to receive from the Careers Service Department at the college? Please list up to 5 kinds of help that seem important to you right now

a.

b.

c.

d.

e.

Having listed the help you would like to receive which are the two most important items, please rank them, 1 = most important 2 = second most important

For all the remaining questions, please tick one box for each question.
For questions 8 – 18, indicate the extent you agree with the statement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>I have an occupational field in mind that I want to work in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>I have decided on the occupation I want to enter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>I feel at ease and comfortable with the task of deciding on a future career.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>I know which occupation best fits my personality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>I need to have a clearer idea of what my interests are</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>I need to have a clearer idea of my abilities, my major strengths and weaknesses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>I need information about educational courses I want to enter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>I do not feel I know enough about the occupations that I am considering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>I know what my Interests and abilities are, but I am Unsure how to find occupations that match them</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>I feel relieved if someone else makes a decision for me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>I am an indecisive person: I delay deciding and have difficulty making up my mind</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For questions 19 - 26, please indicate the extent you have behaved in the following ways in the past three months.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>A Little Extent</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E Great Extent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Experimented with different career related activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Sought opportunities to develop your (work) skills.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Tried specific work roles just to see if you like them.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Investigated career possibilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Obtained information on specific jobs or employing organisations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Initiated conversations with knowledgeable individuals in your career area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Obtained information on the labour market and general job opportunities in your career area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Sought information on specific areas of career interest.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For questions 27 to 37, please read carefully and indicate how much confidence you have that you could accomplish each of these tasks. Note: The questions ask about your confidence. It does not matter whether you have actually completed the tasks or not.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Confidence Levels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27. Find information about occupations you are interested in.</td>
<td>no confidence at all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Make a plan of your goals for the next five years.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. Identify the steps to take if you are having academic difficulty with an aspect of your chosen course.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Accurately assess your abilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. Select one occupation from a list of potential occupations you are considering.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. Choose a career that will fit your preferred lifestyle.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Decide what you value most in an occupation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Figure out what you are and are not ready to sacrifice to achieve your career goals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Talk with a person already employed in the field you are interested in.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Define the type of lifestyle you would like to live.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Identify some reasonable career alternatives if you are unable to get your first choice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Demographic information

38. Gender
   A = Male          B = Female

39. Age.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>G</th>
<th>H</th>
<th>I</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thank you for completing this questionnaire, if you have any questions please ask.

Kay Harness
Appendix 2: Second Questionnaire

Second Questionnaire

Please be assured that any information given will remain confidential and will only be used by Kay Harness and NOT be given to anyone else in the future.

Name: ________________________________

Course you are on now: _________________________

Demographic information

Please circle

1. Gender Male Female

2. Age.

   16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 over 23

3. Have you seen the Careers/Personal Advisor in the since Year 2003 – 2004?

   Please circle

   In Groups: No Once Twice Three times Four times

   On a 1 to 1 basis: No Once Twice Three times Four times
Have you received help, advice or support from any of the following between Sept 2003 and April/May 2005:

Please tick

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CV writing, or how to complete application forms for courses/jobs</th>
<th>How to present myself at an interview</th>
<th>Identifying Further and Higher Education course</th>
<th>Identifying careers that might suit me</th>
<th>Finding employment</th>
<th>Other Please list</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutor at Brooksby Melton College</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Link Personal Advisor</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Services Manager</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family/Guardian</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends or other students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others please list</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For questions 8 – 18, indicate the extent you agree with the statement. Please tick

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>I have an occupational field in mind that I want to work in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>I have decided on the occupation I want to enter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>I feel at ease and comfortable with the task of deciding on a future career</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>I know which occupation best fits my personality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>I need to have a clearer idea of what my interests are</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>I need to have a clearer idea of my abilities, my major strengths and weaknesses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>I need information about educational courses I want to enter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>I do not feel I know enough about the occupations that I am considering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>I know what my interests and abilities are, but I am unsure how to find occupations that match them</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>I feel relieved if someone else makes a decision for me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>I am an indecisive person: I delay deciding and have difficulty making up my mind</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For questions 19 - 26, please indicate the extent you have behaved in the following ways in the past three months. Please tick

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>A (Little Extent)</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E (Great Extent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Experimented with different career related activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Sought opportunities to develop your (work) skills.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Tried specific work roles just to see if you like them.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Investigated career possibilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Obtained information on specific jobs or employing organisations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Initiated conversations with knowledgeable individuals in your career area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Obtained information on the labour market and general job opportunities in your career area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Sought information on specific areas of career interest.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For questions 27 to 37, please read carefully and indicate how much confidence you have that you could accomplish each of these tasks. Note: The questions ask about your confidence. It does not matter whether you have actually completed the tasks or not.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Question</th>
<th>No confidence at all</th>
<th>Very little confidence</th>
<th>Moderate confidence</th>
<th>Much confidence</th>
<th>Complete confidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Find information about occupations you are interested in.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Make a plan of your goals for the next five years.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Identify the steps to take if you are having academic difficulty with an aspect of your chosen course.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Accurately assess your abilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Select one occupation from a list of potential occupations you are considering.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Choose a career that will fit your preferred lifestyle.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Decide what you value most in an occupation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Figure out what you are and are not ready to sacrifice to achieve your career goals.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Talk with a person already employed in the field you are interested in.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Define the type of lifestyle you would like to live.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Identify some reasonable career alternatives if you are unable to get your first choice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Please be honest in answering the question below, your input is greatly appreciated and will help to shape the type of programme I run in the future.

Please circle up to four words below that best sum up your overall opinion of your experience/interaction with Kay Harness, whilst on your present course at college.

interesting  challenging  exciting  revealing  fascinating

entertaining  boring  confusing  difficult  clear

realistic  practical  theoretical  irrelevant  useful  new

enjoyable  valuable  inspiring  thought-provoking

waste of time  exhausting  nothing new  thorough

changed my life  rushed  easy  just OK

Thank you for completing this questionnaire
Appendix 3: Third Questionnaire

2nd Year Third Questionnaire

1. Gender  Male  Female
   please circle

2. Age  17  18  19  20  22  over 23
   please circle

3a. Who is the main earner where you are living at present?

3b. What is there job title?

4a. Do you work? If so, please list the job title and how many hours a week you work:

4b. Hours per week (on average)

4c. Did you receive any training for the job?

5a. Where do you live, Countryside  Village  Town  City
   please circle

5b. Leicestershire  Lincolnshire  Nottinghamshire  Derbyshire
   please circle
6. Over the summer period were you doing any of the following: please circle
   voluntary work paid employment no work

7a. Do you know what you want to do at the end of the present course you are studying? If so, please indicate below

7b. If you do not know what you would like to do, what will be your next steps? Please list, if not sure write N/A

8a. Please list what you see as your strengths below

8b. Please list what you see as your weaknesses below
Appendix 4: Questionnaire Four/Final

Final questionnaire – Part One

Please complete all questions and be assured that any information given will remain confidential.

Your name: __________________________  Course: __________________________

Please circle

1. How long have you been studying at the Brooksby Melton college?
   
   2 years  3 years  4 years  More than 4 years

2. Please indicate how many of the following qualifications applies to you before starting on your present course:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualifications</th>
<th>Please tick</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Diploma</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 GCSE's grades A to C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 GCSE's Grades A to C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 5 GCSE's Grades A to C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Award</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Diploma</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 A Levels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NVQ Level 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other qualifications, please list:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work experience, please list:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. What are you going on to do after completing present course?
   
   a) Job, please list job title:
   
   b) Going to study a course at Brooksby Melton College, please list

   c) Going to study a course elsewhere, please list level and subject area

   d) Not sure
For questions 8 – 18, indicate the extent you agree with the statement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>I have an occupational field in mind that I want to work in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>I have decided on the occupation I want to enter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>I feel at ease and comfortable with the task of deciding on a future career.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>I know which occupation best fits my personality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>I need to have a clearer idea of what my interests are</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>I need to have a clearer idea of my abilities, my major strengths and weaknesses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>I need information about educational courses I want to enter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>I do not feel I know enough about the occupations that I am considering</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>I know what my Interests and abilities are, but I am unsure how to find occupations that match them</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>I feel relieved if someone else makes a decision for me</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>I am an indecisive person: I delay deciding and have difficulty making up my mind</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For questions 19 - 26, please indicate the extent you have behaved in the following ways in the past three months.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>A Little Extent</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E Great Extent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>Experimented with different career related activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Sought opportunities to develop your (work) skills.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Tried specific work roles just to see if you like them.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>Investigated career possibilities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>Obtained information on specific jobs or employing organisations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>Initiated conversations with knowledgeable individuals in your career area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>Obtained information on the labour market and general job opportunities in your career area.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>Sought information on specific areas of career interest.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For questions 27 to 37, please read carefully and indicate how much confidence you have that you could accomplish each of these tasks. Note: The questions ask about your confidence. It does not matter whether you have actually completed the tasks or not.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>no confidence at all</th>
<th>very little confidence</th>
<th>moderate confidence</th>
<th>much confidence</th>
<th>complete confidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>Find information about occupations you are interested in.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>Make a plan of your goals for the next five years.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>Identify the steps to take if you are having academic difficulty with an aspect of your chosen course.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>Accurately assess your abilities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>Select one occupation from a list of potential occupations you are considering.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>Choose a career that will fit your preferred lifestyle.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>Decide what you value most in an occupation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>Figure out what you are and are not ready to sacrifice to achieve your career goals.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>Talk with a person already employed in the field you are interested in.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>Define the type of lifestyle you would like to live.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>Identify some reasonable career alternatives if you are unable to get your first choice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 5: Interview 1 Questions

What do you think of the careers input so far?

What are your career goals?

How are you going to achieve them?
Appendix 6: Interview 1 Action Plan

Action Plan

1. What do you want to achieve if anything by June 2004

2. What do you want to achieve if anything by June 2005

3. If, so do you have a plan?

4. Who will help you?

5. What do you see as your strengths?

6. What do you see as your weaknesses?
Appendix 7: Interview 2  Summer Activities List

1. Are you going on work experience in the summer? If so where and what are you doing?

2. Any thoughts on what you might be doing after your present course? If so what?

3. What activities do you think you might consider doing over the summer period to help you achieve your goal(s)?

4. If thinking about HE, have you decided upon a career if so what?

5. Would it be useful to split up the list of activities and review the situation when you return in September/October 2004?
Appendix 8 – Interview 3 - Review of Summer Activities and Action Plan 2004

Review of Summer Activities list in September/October 2004 and action Plan for the next 6 months review in Feb/March 2005

1. Did you have a good summer, achieve what you wanted to do in terms of career related and/or work experience

2. Have you decided on what you would like to do after the Nat Dip or HND?

3. If going on to HE, did you attend the session in June? Have you completed your UCAS form (online or paper based)?

4. How satisfied are you with the course you are currently doing?
Appendix 9 - Action Plan (as part of the Review of Summer activities)

1. From the previous Action Plan Do you still want to achieve the same item(s) by June 2005?

2. Has anyone helped you so far in your decision making

3. Supporting you in the process

4. No one has helped you

5. Have there been any obstacles to learning?

6. Are you receiving any support from the College i.e?

   Tutor   Student Mentor   Student Services   Personal Adviser

   Another person
Appendix 10 - Interview 4 – Research questions
Research Questions early in 2005 (Feb) Please circle your answers

1. Have you changed your mind about your career plan since our last meeting? Yes No Not Sure

2. If yes what have you decided to do? Higher Education Further study, if so what? Work

3. If higher education what type of course: HNC/HND Foundation Degree First Degree Entry to second year of degree Top-up Degree

4. If you decide to go onto to higher education, will you be the first person in your family to do so? Yes No, if no who else in the family have gone onto higher education, please list person, their course if known and university or college please

5. Have you received help in your decision making about your future and from whom? Yes No from parents parent sister/brothers other family members college friends college tutor Personal adviser other, please list...

6. Do you think the meetings with Kay Harness have helped you to make any decisions? Yes No Not sure

7. What type of help would you have liked to have received from the interaction with Kay Harness? Please list in your own words, please the most important would be a 1, ...

If you could wish for one thing, what would it be?

.................................................................
Appendix 11: Interview 4 - Structured questions Jan/Feb 2005

Structured questions Jan/Feb 2005

1. How is the course going?
2. Have you started to plan for what you would like to do after completion of present course?
3. What are you hoping to do?
4. Are you receiving any help from the college in terms of assignments, financial funding?
5. Who is the main person who is giving the help to you at college?
6. Is your course what you expected it would be? If different please list?
7. Do you use the careers information room?
8. Do you use the internet to find out information on careers or courses?
9. What do you think the Connexions services?
10. Have I helped you in any way, if so list if not what would you have liked to see/receive?
Appendix 12: Interview 5 - Structured questions April/May 2005

Name: .............................................................................

1. Tell me about what decisions you have made about your future?

2. Who do you think are the most important people helping you make decisions about your future? Please tick and rank (1 is the highest) in order of importance, up to five

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Person</th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Very helpful</th>
<th>Helpful</th>
<th>Not very helpful</th>
<th>Waste of time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends at college</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends elsewhere</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boy/girl friend</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husband/wife/partner</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tutor at college</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Adviser</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Careers adviser</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Services Manager</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kay Harness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. If you had your time over again, would you still have studied for the Nat Dip/HND at this college? If not please list what you think you would have done
4. What are you intending to do next, after the end of the Nat Dip or HND?

5. In what ways, if any, do you think you have developed as a person? 2003 -2005

6. Have you developed your ideas about your career?

7. What new skill have you developed whilst being involved in this process of meeting myself (Kay Harness) and discussing your career?

8. Where do you see yourself in 3 years time?
9. Has the regular contact with myself (KH) helped you with any of the following, please rate by ticking the box that sums up your experience best

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>No</th>
<th>A little</th>
<th>Some</th>
<th>A lot</th>
<th>A great deal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Helped with knowledge about jobs, higher education courses</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Made you think about possible options, you had not considered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Good to talk through ideas with someone who was not connected with the college or home</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Have our meetings helped you with other areas such as:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self esteem</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence building</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self motivation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self image</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career planning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowing more about your skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues surrounding your learning at college</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision making</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possible opportunities after college</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideas about areas never thought of before</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. What is your perception of the process over the last couple of years of you and I (Kay Harness) working together?
Appendix 13: Extracts from Reflective Diary 2004

**Date: 17 Sept 2004**

*What happened:* Completed interviews with Nat Dip Animal Management Y2 B2s and delivered information to 011 and 040 and 041

*What I did:* Completed interviews with Nat Dip Animal Management Y2 B2s and delivered information to 01, 040 and 041

*Why I did it:* 040 and 041 are part of the B2s

*What was the outcome?* Students have the information they asked for

*What could I have done differently?* No 040 and 041 are part of the B2s

*Actions that I need to undertake:* Maybe a follow up of students

**Date: 16 Nov 2004**

*What happened:* App to see 050, mature student

*What I did:* He has an idea of a possible area he would like to work in, though he has a place at a College in the South West he is not too sure he will take up the offer

*Why I did it:* Though 050 is not a B2 group member he is still part of the research group

*What was the outcome?* 050 to keep his options open and do his ground work

*What could I have done differently?* 050's idea is very narrow, but that does not mean he could not succeed. Try to ensure he looked and researched into at least two other areas of work for after the Nat Dip ending in June 2004.

*Actions that I need to undertake:* None, if 050 requires help he will come and see me.

**Date: 23 Nov 2004**

*What happened:* Cancelled appointments made for the 18 Nov. rearranged for 23 Nov.

*What I did:* Interviewed two students from Nat Dip Animal Management students, 054. The 2 HND students did not turn up 024, (B2) and 029, this is the third time this student has made an appointment and then not turn up
Why I did it: Interviewed those students who did bother to turn up

What was the outcome? Follow up students in B2's groups in Jan 2005 just before their placements in Feb to April 2005.

What could I have done differently? Email HND students to remind them of their appointments with me

Actions that I need to undertake: To email 024 and try to see her before Christmas if possible or early Jan 2005
Appendix 14: Extract from Reflective Diary

Date: 13 Jan 2005
What happened: Saw HND students 031, 026, (B2), 028.

What I did: Interviewed each student,

Why I did it: 031 might be moving, after her exams, suggested she consider finding all the colleges in the area and the surrounding areas for a job in teaching or training, also follow up where to train part-time
026 was telling me about her boyfriend who is nearly 17 years old, that she is hoping to go onto teach in secondary school, looking at Lincoln HEI, will have to check out about the GCSEs Maths, English and Science grade Cs
028, told me her friend died before xmas, she wants to train as a Physio at Nottingham university though is considering other places, her personal statement was not that good, all she kept going on about was her work with animals

What was the outcome? a list of activities, 026 seeing again as part of interviews for MPhil on 26 Jan, 028 her personal statement changed a little as her deadline is tomorrow

What could I have done differently? Told 031 and 028 I could not see them and for them to see their tutor or the DMU, Leicester Careers Service Advisers instead.

Actions that I need to undertake Write down what happened follow up 026 and the enquiry about teaching and the up to date information on entry for next week, when I am back in college

Date: 2 Feb 2005
What happened: father of 026 rang about the lack of provision to help 026 who is dyslexic

What I did: Saw 026 as part of my research, which were set questions which were taped, also asked about the provision of help with work for the assignments, it seems 026 is taking quite a long time to complete her work and then does not have enough time to hand in the work to be checked by the support skills tutor. I also, asked 026 about financial situation, it seems that has an overdraft and student loans are high.

Why I did it: Went through the basic rules of managing money and suggested she contact the student services department about the hardship fund. Also I asked 026 to email the skills tutor to ask for help and support both in assignments and extra time in exams, told to send copy to me so we can keep a check on the situation
What was the outcome? Not known at present

What could I have done differently? Nothing

Actions that I need to undertake: See the skills tutor and point 026 in the direction of organizations that might be willing to employ after HND

Date: 2 Feb 2005
What happened: Saw 031 went through CV format with and chatted to 027 reference applications for the 2 year degree in teaching which does not attract funding like the 3 or 4 year teaching degrees or the PGCE which do attract funding. Has already completed UCAS form and sent it.

What I did: I suggested looks at the Top up degrees and then do the PGCE course

Why I did it: If wants to teach what else

What was the outcome? 027 are resourceful and will come and tell me what the outcome is either ways

What could I have done differently? Asked the question what if?

Actions that I need to undertake Nothing for either 027 or 031 has they are not in the focus group = B2s

Date: 2 Feb 2005
What happened: NDAM students had to be chased up, saw 3 today, should have seen 11 the rest I hope to see today and 8 Feb that will be my final times as they go out on placement from 14 Feb to 11 April

The NDFM Y2 students did not turn up, emailed their tutor to try to re-arrange another date but they too are going out on placement

What I did: Interviewed 3 students, one of the girls is pregnant, 23 weeks which means that this was the last time I will see her.

Why I did it: Follow up interviews

What was the outcome? Emailed student, chased around to arrange appointment time

What could I have done differently? Not sure, try to follow up students but it is their choice to attend or not
Actions that I need to undertake  Ensure information is on the computer

What happened: Interviewed 065, 067, 066, 068 NDAM Year 2 students and 024.

What I did: Conducted interviews only took about 10 to 18 minutes

Why I did it: Part of the follow up

What was the outcome? Interesting information

What could I have done differently? Need to complete this

Actions that I need to undertake  Write up

What happened: At College in the Careers room, 031, came to see me about CV, format, I suggested a while back that she considered a one page CV and a 2 page CV, has been emailing me different content and I have been making suggestions this was the possible final stage.

026 and 027 came into the Careers room to up date me and to ‘talk’
026 (HND B2) told me had decide to go to Lincoln; had rang the University lecturer and was putting in the UCAS application soon for the final year entry.
027, is going for an interview at SHU teaching course 2 years, gets the £6,000 so seems happy

What I did: Made suggestions about CV and asked about life, is really busy, dissertation, exams in May, looking for a job.
Listened and asked questions: 026 and 027 about their decision making and the places they had decided to go to

Why I did it: By talking and listening carefully to what both 026, 027 and 031 were saying and not saying I was able to get a clearer picture of their decision making

What was the outcome? I will follow them up in mid March and again in mid April

What could I have done differently? Though 031 and 027 are not in the B2 group they have seen me a number of times and make up part of the Z group as per last panel meeting, I believe a lot has been learnt from this experience of groups and selection of members

Actions that I need to undertake  Remember to follow up students

262
Date: 25 Feb 2005
What happened: Interview with 025

What I did: Record the process

Why I did it: Easier to ask questions and listen if not writing down the answers

What was the outcome? Good interview

What could I have done differently? Nothing

Actions that I need to undertake Follow up in Mid March and again in mid April

Date: 21-25 Feb 2005

What happened: Email from 059, NDAM Y2 B2
Followed my instructions to see the Work Experience Co-coordinator at College, who suggested she saw me after placement

What I did: Emailed 059 and said I would help her with a CV format

Why I did it: Part of the role of PA and part of the research

What was the outcome? Still out on placement till after Easter will follow up

What could I have done differently? Have encourage e-guidance

Actions that I need to undertake Follow up
Appendix 15 - Permission Statement

I understand that Kay Harness is carrying out research for an MPhil/PhD on the subject of career development and that this research involves interviews with students and others at the College. I give my permission for the data gather from questionnaires, interviews and action plan to be used in the research and subsequent reports, on the understanding that the data will anonymous and that the original material will be destroyed after 7 years.

Name of Student:

Signature of student:

Date:

Printed name of researcher: KAY HARNES

Signature of researcher:

Date:
Appendix 16
Word chart for students in the B2 and group Z in the research (Final structured interview April/May 2005)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Words</th>
<th>Group B2 (18 students)</th>
<th>Group Z (8 students)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenging</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exciting</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revealing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fascinating</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertaining</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boring</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confusing</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clear</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realistic</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practical</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irrelevant</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Useful</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyable</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valuable</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspiring</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thought-provoking</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste of time</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhausting</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nothing new</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thorough</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changed my life</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rushed</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just OK</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix 17

#### Students Strengths 1 – People skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Courses</th>
<th>T W</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>IS</th>
<th>CO</th>
<th>O W C</th>
<th>Left Blank</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HNDAS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key:**
- **T W** = Team working
- **L** = Leadership
- **IS** = Interpersonal skills
- **CO** = Customer Orientation
- **OWC** = Oral and written communications

#### Strengths 2 - Self-Reliance Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>SAC</th>
<th>SPS</th>
<th>ISM</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>WTL</th>
<th>AP</th>
<th>O</th>
<th>Left Blank</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HNDAS</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key:**
- **SAC** = Self aware confidence
- **ISM** = Initiative self motivation
- **NS** = Networking skills
- **WTL** = Willingness to learn
- **AP** = Action Planning
- **O** = Organised
- **SPS** = Self promotion skills
- **Left Blank**

266
Appendix 18

Weaknesses 1 – People Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>TW</th>
<th>IS</th>
<th>OWC</th>
<th>Left Blank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HNDAS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: TW = Team working  IS = Interpersonal skills  OWC = Oral and written communications

Weaknesses 2 - Self-Reliance Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>SAC</th>
<th>ISM</th>
<th>WTL</th>
<th>AP</th>
<th>O</th>
<th>Left Blank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HNDAS</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: SAC = Self aware confidence  ISM = Initiative self motivation  WTL = Willingness to learn  AP = Action Planning  O = Organised

Weaknesses 3 – Generalist skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Courses</th>
<th>PSS</th>
<th>IT</th>
<th>FA</th>
<th>NS</th>
<th>BA</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>Left Blank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HNDAS</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDAM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDFM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDHM</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDA</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: PSS = Problem Solving skills  IT = IT Literacy  FA = Flexibility, adaptability  NS = Numeracy skills  BA = Business acumen  C = Commitment
Appendix 19  

Examples of models of guidance

DOTS
Decision learning, Opportunity Awareness, Transition Learning, Self Awareness

SODT
Self Awareness, Opportunity Awareness, Decision Learning, Transition Learning

EGAN
Where am I am? Where do I want to be? How do I get there?

FIRST
Focus, Information, Realism, Scope and Tactics

CIP
Circumspection, Pre-emption, Control

CASVE
Communication, Analysis, Synthesis, Valuing, Execution
Appendix 20

ICG - Institute of Career Guidance

ACEG - The Association for Careers Education and Guidance (ACEG) is the professional association for teachers involved in careers education and guidance, principally in England and Wales

NLRG - National Library Resources for Guidance.

AGCAS - Association of Graduate Careers Advisory Services is the professional association for higher education careers services

Guidance Council - An independent body for career guidance in the UK

CRAC - Careers Research Advisory is a national body it aims to advance the education of the public, and young persons in particular in lifelong career related learning for all

HECSU - News and information about research and development in career related learning and career guidance in Higher Education

FEDPAG - Federation of Guidance Practitioners influence the advances in quality assurance in the arena of guidance linked to lifelong learning and work.

NAEGA - UK association for adult guidance practitioners

IAEVG - International Association for Educational and Vocational Guidance

NICEC - The National Institute for Career Education and Counselling
London Business School: Career Coach

London experience. World impact

Career Coach
Career Services

Closing Date: 25 September 2007

Salary up to £40,000 dependent on skills and knowledge

London Business School's Vision is to be the pre-eminent global business school, nurturing talent and advancing knowledge in a multi-national, multi-cultural learning environment. It is a world-class supplier of international talent through its MBA, Masters in Finance, Executive MBA, Executive MBA·Global and Sloan Fellowship programmes. The role of Career Services is to facilitate access to this talent for companies seeking to recruit graduates through marketing students to recruiters, developing students' career skills and attractiveness to recruiters and connecting students and recruiters.

You will be responsible for coaching MBA and MiF students through all stages of their job search development, including but not limited to: self-assessment, networking, identifying suitable positions, approaching the market and negotiating suitable jobs commensurate with their experience, aspirations and abilities.

Duties will include:
• Providing one-to-one coaching and assistance to MBA and MiF students on all aspects of their job search process
• Interpreting and advising on the output of self-assessment tools used within the School
• Developing, facilitating and measuring success of career workshops on various topics
• Co-ordinating the annual CV book review and production process (NOTE: leave off classes since as we start with new system – this may be expanded beyond MBA and MiF)
• Supporting students on issues surrounding the career search process
• Analysing and revising skills development information provided to students to share and develop best practice
• Assisting line manager on operational issues

You should be a self-sufficient independent contributor and will have considerable freedom to develop your own coaching programme and style to achieve the above objectives. You should have the knowledge and experience to judge how best to address the wide variety of individual student situations and needs in an ever changing market situation.

You will have significant experience of coaching, ideally within an academic, Business School environment or masters level recruitment. You will be able to use your own initiative and be confident liaising with people at all levels. With strong interpersonal, organisational, oral and written communication skills, you will have experience within a multicultural environment.

To Apply:
Please review the full job description on our website www.london.edu. Then submit your CV, diversity monitoring form and a covering letter addressing the essential job.

http://www.jobs.ac.uk/jobs/QK404/Career_Coach/  31/08/07

270
Employability Coach
Career Development Services
REF: RZZ1702

0.5 fte 2.5 days per week
Fixed term for 3 years

Grade 8 - £29,139 - £32,796 per annum pro rata

Career Development Services have an immediate vacancy for an Employability Coach to work at the School of Management. This is a new post and is focused on helping students develop confidence and capability to achieve higher level professional employment outcomes on graduation. You will have the ability to establish effective networks and build productive relationships and have direct experience of employment roles relevant to graduates of business related degrees.

Informal enquiries prior to application may be made to Ann Berry on 01274 234993 or to e-mail address a.berry@bradford.ac.uk.

Closing Date: 31st August 2007

Further Details

Advert Information

More Jobs from this Employer

Send me jobs like this
Email Job to a friend

Date of input: Thursday, 2nd August 2007
Date of expiry: Friday, 31st August 2007

If you apply for this position please say you saw it on jobs.ac.uk

URL of this page:
www.jobs.ac.uk/jobfiles/P1981.html

http://www.jobs.ac.uk/jobfiles/P1981.html

05/08/2007

271