Indigenous peoples and the press: a study of Taiwan

This item was submitted to Loughborough University's Institutional Repository by the/an author.

Additional Information:

- A Doctoral Thesis. Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy of Loughborough University.

Metadata Record: https://dspace.lboro.ac.uk/2134/7437

Publisher: © Wen-chi Kung

Please cite the published version.
This item is held in Loughborough University’s Institutional Repository (https://dspace.lboro.ac.uk/) and was harvested from the British Library’s EThOS service (http://www.ethos.bl.uk/). It is made available under the following Creative Commons Licence conditions.

For the full text of this licence, please go to: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/
Indigenous Peoples and the Press:
A Study of Taiwan

by

Wen-chi Kung

A Doctoral Thesis
Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements
for the award of
Ph.D. of Loughborough University

May 1997

© by Wen-chi Kung, 1997
I would like to dedicate this thesis to my parents whose love and encouragement have always inspired me during the long course of my past education. They have always been willing to sweat and sacrifice for my success even in their mid-70s. As with my first Chinese book *Let My People Know* (1993), which was dedicated to them, I'd like to dedicate this thesis to them again to express my deepest gratitude for their boundless and endless love.

Without my government scholarship, I could not have come to England to study in 1993. This scholarship has been crucial in sustaining my life in the UK for four years. My sponsor, the Ministry of Interior in Taiwan, inaugurated the first scholarship for Taiwan indigenous students who intended to go abroad to study. I was lucky to have passed an examination which enabled me to study abroad and I became the first recipient of that scholarship. So my deepest thanks go to the Ministry and the newly-established Yuanchumin Commission which has taken over the handling of the indigenous students' scholarship since 1997.

The writing of this work could not have been accomplished without the kind and careful guidance of my supervisor, Graham Murdock. He has guided my thinking and given me very helpful instruction. He helped me narrow down the focus of my fieldwork research and wanted me to concentrate on Taiwan, giving me useful and inspirational comments on dealing with the topic from a historical perspective. In the final year of my study, I am especially indebted to him for giving me the highest level of supervision on this thesis, particularly during his study leave in New Zealand. In addition to his invaluable academic supervision, my gratitude is unfathomable for his unceasing trust in and understanding of my research since the inception of this work in 1993.

Over the years, the colleagues of the Social Sciences Department who share the same office block with me in the Schofield Building have been my continuous support and encouragement. Because of them, the long degree-seeking journey has not been
monotonous or boring. The mutual and caring friendship between colleagues and our discussions about our work have been most encouraging.

My special thanks go to our delightful landlady Margaret Coulthard, whose care and kindness have been most impressive during the years of my family's stay in her house. She has enriched our lives enormously and has given us many wonderful and unforgettable memories of our life in the UK.

I'd like to take this opportunity to express my heartfelt gratitude to Shen Ming-te, the leader of my hometown aboriginal township office in central Taiwan, who gave me crucial material support during the critical period after my scholarship ended. Also, I want to thank my brother, Kung Wen-po, for providing me most efficiently with many important materials and pictures needed by this thesis. His help has saved me from making a trip to Taiwan to collect that material myself. I would also like to thank all the members of the Presbyterian Church in my home village for their prayerful support.

Last but not least, my most sincere indebtedness goes to my wife, Juliet, whose profound love, patience and understanding are unparalleled in the past decade of my life. She left her job and came to join me in March 1995. In the final year of my study since my baby Richard was born in 1996, she has taken on all the burden of looking after my daughter Abby and Richard and maintaining my family. Juliet's devoted commitment, Abby's cheerful smile and Richard's growth were my constant motivation to strive to complete my study. I am blessed in having their love and feel great joy in returning it.

Wen-chi Kung
Loughborough
May 1997
Abstract

Indigenous Peoples and the Press: A Study of Taiwan

The principal objective of this thesis is to explore the changing relations between indigenous peoples and the news media in contemporary Taiwan, concentrating on three main dimensions: representation, access and self-determination. This thesis looks first at mainstream media performance dimension. A thorough investigation is undertaken to explore the (mis)representation of the dominant news discourses and their hiring practices toward the indigenous minorities. It then turns to the indigenous media focusing particularly on the symbolic significance and cultural struggles of indigenous peoples.

This thesis adopts an approach of methodological triangulation to generate relevant empirical data. Firstly, it starts with an interview analysis aimed at illuminating the dynamics of indigenous news production in mainstream press organisations and the symbolic significance of indigenous journals in Taiwan. Secondly, as one of the main aims is to analyse how Taiwanese mainstream newspapers portray indigenous peoples, it undertakes a comprehensive content analysis of coverage in seven major dailies. Thirdly, to shed further light on the issue of (mis)representation, it conducts a case study of one particular aboriginal cultural event using critical discourse analysis. In addition to these quantitative and qualitative explorations of mainstream news about indigenous peoples, it also looks at the contents and management of the indigenous press and at the predicament of their counter-discourses in the contemporary ethnic politics of the Han Chinese nation-state of Taiwan.

Newspaper coverage of Taiwan's indigenous peoples is not an isolated phenomenon however. It needs to be contextualised and examined within the wider processes of political democratisation, increased cultural localism and social and economic liberalisation. A reading of Taiwan's ongoing political reform and its widespread influences on both the media and the society is therefore also offered here as a necessary step to investigating the dynamic and shifting power relations between indigenous peoples and the news media.

Keywords: counter-discourse; critical discourse analysis (CDA); Fourth World peoples; indigenous media; indigenous peoples; misrepresentation; pan-aboriginal identity; underrepresentation
Table of Contents

Indigenous Peoples and the Press: A Study of Taiwan

Thesis Abstract i
Table of Contents ii
List of Tables vii
List of Figures ix
List of Abbreviations x

Chapter One
Introduction

1.1 Defining Indigenous Peoples 1
1.2 Aims and Methodology 7
1.3 Outline of the Thesis 9

Part One
Theoretical Framework and Contextual Background

Chapter Two
Indigenous Peoples and the News Media:
Representation, Access and Self-Determination

2.1 Introduction 13
Chapter Three
Indigenous Struggles in Taiwan

3.1 Introduction: The History and Population of Taiwan 50
3.2 Aboriginal Policy in Taiwan since 1945 54
3.3 Taiwan's Indigenous Peoples Today 59
3.4 Taiwan's Ethnic Politics and Cross-Straits Relations 64
3.5 Chinese Nationalism vs. Taiwanese Nationalism 68
3.6 Aboriginal Struggles for Self-Determination and Indigenous Identity 71
3.7 Concluding Remarks 76

Chapter Four
Political Liberalisation and the Changing Structure of the Press in Taiwan

4.1 Introduction 79
4.2 Political Liberalisation and Press Freedom 80
4.3 Changing Structures of Taiwan's Press 82
4.4 Newspaper Consumption 102
4.5 Advertising Market 105
4.6 Concluding Remarks 108
Part Two
Research Methodology and Empirical Work

Chapter Five
Fieldwork and Methodology

5.1 Introduction 112
5.2 Research Methodologies 112
5.3 Data-Collection Fieldwork 117
5.4 Concluding Remarks 125

Chapter Six
Producing Indigenous News in Mainstream Newspapers: An Interview Analysis

6.1 Introduction 126
6.2 External Influences 126
6.3 Internal Influences 137
6.4 Concluding Remarks 152

Chapter Seven
Reporting Indigenous News in the Mainstream Press: A Content Analysis

7.1 Introduction 155
7.2 Samples and Procedures 156
7.3 Findings 158
7.4 Concluding Remarks 196
Chapter Eight
Representing Aboriginal Culture:
A Case Study of the Mayasvi Rite

8.1 Introduction 201
8.2 Racist Discourse and Ideology in the Media 202
8.3 Aboriginal Culture and Mayasvi Rite: A Background 208
8.4 Critical Discourse Analysis of the Mayasvi Rite 224
8.5 Concluding Remarks 262

Part Three
Indigenous Press and Counter-Discourses

Chapter Nine
Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements in Taiwan:
Predicament of Counter-Discourses

9.1 Introduction 267
9.2 Indigenous Media and Movements 268
9.3 Problems of Minority Access to the Media 277
9.4 Indigenous Press in Taiwan 282
9.5 Constructing Counter-Discourses 308
9.6 Concluding Remarks 317

Chapter Ten
Conclusion

10.1 Review of General Arguments 319
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Limitations and Suggestions for Further Research</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 3</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 4</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 5</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English References</td>
<td>357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese References</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 3.1 Ethnic Groups in Taiwan Today
Table 3.2 Demographic Distribution of Aboriginal Tribes in Taiwan (1991)
Table 3.3 Percentage of Aboriginals Receiving Higher Education
Table 3.4 Occupational Distribution of Aboriginal Peoples in Taiwan (1991)
Table 3.5 Income Distribution of Aboriginal Household
Table 3.6 Representation of Aboriginal Peoples in Public Posts
Table 4.1 Advertising Revenues by *China Times* and *United Daily News* (1983 to 1986)
Table 4.2 Advertising Revenues Earned by the Seven Dailies and Their Affiliated Newspapers (1989)
Table 4.3 Ownership and Circulation of the Seven Newspapers under Study
Table 4.4 Newspaper Readership in Taiwan (1993)
Table 4.5 Per Capita Income from 1970 to 1989
Table 4.6 Purchase of Print Media Per Hundred Households in Taiwan (1970 to 1988)
Table 4.7 Growing Media Revenues in the Advertising Market of Taiwan
Table 4.8 Distribution of Advertising Turnover in the Different Media of Taiwan (1981 to 1990)
Table 5.1 Distribution of 42 Interview Subjects
Table 7.1 Frequency of Indigenous News in Taiwan, Newspaper by Month (1 January–30 June, 1994)
Table 7.2 Total Space Occupied by Indigenous Items and Average Pagination of Each Title
Table 7.3 Average Size of Indigenous Items in Each Titles by Page Basis
Table 7.4 Distribution of Indigenous News by Section and Newspaper (1 January–30 June, 1994)
Table 7.5 Main Images of Indigenous Peoples in the Sample Items
Table 7.6  'Traditional' and 'Modern' Images of Indigenous Peoples
Table 7.7  Relative Prominence of Major Subjects
Table 7.8  Distribution of Authorship by Ethnic Groups
Table 7.9  Type of Taiwan Indigenous News Written by Different Ethnic Authors
Table 7.10 Primary Actors in Headlines
Table 7.11 Distribution of Primary Quoted Speakers
Table 8.1 Cultural Construction Budget of the Council for Cultural Planning and Development, Executive Yuan (1995)
Table 8.2 Two Major Discourses in the Mayasvi Rite News
Table 8.3 Distribution of Mayasvi News Stories and Photos by the Sample Newspapers (Feb. 12th-18th, 1995)
Table 8.4 Headlines and Types of the 16 News Data (1995)
Table 8.5 Headline Discourse Patterns in Reporting the Mayasvi Rite
Table 8.6 Topical Structures and News Categories in the General News Stories about the Mayasvi Rite on Feb. 16th, 1995
Table 8.7 Quotation Pattern of the Mayasvi News
Table 9.1 Distribution of Minority Employment in White-Owned American Daily Newspapers and Commercial Broadcasting Stations, 1982 and 1992
Table 9.4 Government-Commissioned Activities Undertaken by TIVB
Table 9.6 Features of Three Indigenous Journals
Table 9.7 Readership of the Austronesian News
List of Figures

Figure 1.1  Riggins' Definition of Indigenous Peoples
Figure 3.1  Geographical Distribution of Indigenous Tribal Groups in Taiwan
Figure 4.1  Shares of Readership
Figure 4.2  What People Read in Newspapers
Figure 4.3  Ideological Positions of the Seven Newspapers in Taiwan
Figure 4.4  Distribution of Annual Growth Rate of Media Advertising Turnover
Figure 7.1  Distribution of Size of the Taiwan Indigenous News in the Sample Newspapers (1 January - 30 June, 1994)
Figure 7.2  Distribution of Items by Type (1 January–30 June, 1994)
Figure 7.3  President Lee Teng-hui Gave An Audience to Aboriginal Movement Leaders
Figure 7.4  Story of the Aboriginal Movement Leaders Meeting the President
Figure 7.5  Distribution of Attention to Major Tribal Groups in the Press Sample
Figure 7.6  Distribution of Indigenous-Authored Items in the Sample Newspapers
Figure 7.7  Major Quote Distribution of the Five Most Frequently Quoted Actors
Figure 7.8  Most Frequently Quoted Actors in the Indigenous News
Figure 8.1  Views of 'Formosan Aboriginal Culture Village' and 'Taiwan Aboriginal Culture Park'
Figure 8.2  Advance News in the United Daily News and the Central Daily News
Figure 8.3  Mayasvi News Stories in the UDN, CT and the TT on Feb. 16th, 1995
Figure 8.4  Mayasvi News in the Liberty Times on Feb. 16th, 1995
Figure 8.5  Mayasvi Photos and Captions (16 February, 1995)
Figure 9.1  Taiwan Indigenous Journals
List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIM</td>
<td>American Indian Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANPA</td>
<td>American Newspaper Publishers' Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARATS</td>
<td>Association for Relations Across the Straits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASSOC</td>
<td>Associative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATA</td>
<td>Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIA</td>
<td>Bureau of Indian Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCC</td>
<td>Broadcasting Corporation of China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Commons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAAMA</td>
<td>Central Australia Aboriginal Media Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CT</td>
<td>China Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDA</td>
<td>Critical Discourse Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDN</td>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CL</td>
<td>Classifier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLS</td>
<td>Critical Language Study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNP</td>
<td>Chinese New Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPTV</td>
<td>Chinese Public Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTS</td>
<td>Chinese Television System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTV</td>
<td>China Television Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWIS</td>
<td>Centre for World Indigenous Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPP</td>
<td>Democratic Progressive Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCR</td>
<td>Free China Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FWDP</td>
<td>Fourth World Documentation Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIO</td>
<td>Government Information Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNP</td>
<td>Gross National Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HC</td>
<td>Han Chinese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBC</td>
<td>Inside Back Cover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFC</td>
<td>Inside Front Cover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IITC</td>
<td>International Indian Treaty Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMP</td>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IP</td>
<td>Indigenous Peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPI</td>
<td>International Press Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KMT</td>
<td>Kuomintang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LT</td>
<td>Liberty Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAJSUTHE</td>
<td>Major Subject and Theme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NA</td>
<td>National Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.B.</td>
<td>Nota Bene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOM</td>
<td>Nominaliser</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>New Taiwan (Dollars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBC</td>
<td>Outside Back Cover</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACIP</td>
<td>Pacific Asia Council of Indigenous Peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRC</td>
<td>People's Republic of China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROC</td>
<td>Republic of China (Taiwan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBS</td>
<td>Special Broadcasting Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECSUTHE</td>
<td>Secondary Subject and Theme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEF</td>
<td>Straits Exchange Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIVB</td>
<td>Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPG</td>
<td>Taiwan Provincial Government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTV</td>
<td>Taiwan Television Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDN</td>
<td>United Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCIP</td>
<td>World Council of Indigenous Peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WGIP</td>
<td>Working Group on Indigenous Populations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter One

Introduction

The mainstream mass media have long been criticised by scholars and activists for their insufficient, unbalanced and inaccurate coverage of ethno-racial minorities. Studies have tended to focus on the misrepresentation of racial minorities with a number going on to link this skewed pattern of coverage to the underrepresentation of racial minorities among the key professional groups working in the major media. Many media scholars have argued that minority access to the mainstream media is fundamentally important given that minority media are mostly in a very weak position in terms of circulation, advertising and resources. They claim that increased access to mainstream media will help to counter misrepresentation and lead to more sensitive and comprehensive coverage.

At the same time, there has been a general lack of academic interest in the burgeoning development of indigenous media since the 1970s. The formation of these media, despite all the difficulties they often experience in operations and management, is significant because they open up spaces for the development of counter-discourses which mobilise indigenous own definition of their situations, welfare and struggles. This thesis, therefore, sets out to explore all three of these aspects of the power relations between indigenous peoples and the news media; misrepresentation, access, and counter-discourses.

1.1 Defining Indigenous Peoples

At this point, it is important to define the term 'indigenous peoples' more carefully, together with some of the other key terms which will be used in this thesis. As a first step, we need to separate indigenous people from the broader category of 'ethno-racial minorities'. In the newly-published *Electronic Media and Indigenous*
Peoples: A Voice of Our Own?, Browne (1996:5) argued that there are differences between indigenous peoples and other minorities. The most readily apparent difference, he argued, is that indigenous peoples inhabited a particular region centuries or even millennia before someone else did. Because they were there first, they were on hand to assist and/or resist succeeding settlers, and these assistance or resistance have become a part of a nation's history. The other difference is that indigenous peoples were at one time sovereign in their lands, but they lost their lands through warfare, negotiation, treason, intermarriage and a host of other causes and acts. Therefore, this has triggered a tremendous debate on whether indigenous peoples can have a special claim on the resources of the lands that once were theirs. Browne goes on to say that recent court decisions in Australia (the Mabo case)\(^1\), New Zealand (various Maori land rights cases), Canada (cases establishing Native American rights to self-government), and the United States (cases involving fishing and hunting rights for Native Americans) would indicate that there is a special claim (Ibid.).

Fleras (1994: 287) argues that aboriginal peoples most emphatically refuse to see themselves as another minority group, and that much of the current politics redefining aboriginal-state relations is based on distancing aboriginal ‘nations’ from immigrants and their descendants. In the same vein, Knight (1988) argues that there is a historical foundation for indigenous peoples calling themselves ‘peoples’ and ‘nations’, noting that: ‘Indigenous people are insistent that they are neither “ethnics” nor “minorities” but “peoples” and, as such, are to be regarded as “nations” (p. 123).’

At the same time, we should bear in mind Banton’s cautionary note on the term ‘Native peoples’: ‘Since the international law recognises that “All peoples have the

---

\(^1\) The Mabo case is a historical milestone for Australian aborigines in their continuous struggles for the land rights. In Australia, the land was regarded as terra nullius until January 1992 when, in an historic judgement in the case of Mabo v. Queensland, the High Court held that native title had survived the Crown’s annexation, and that, under closely specified conditions, persons of indigenous origin could enjoy rights deriving from it (see Ellis Cashmore (ed.) (1996) Dictionary of Race and Ethnic Relations. p. 257).
right of self-determination," many governments are reluctant to regard indigenous groups as "peoples" and prefer to speak of "indigenous people". ²

After making the basic conceptual distinction between the 'indigenous peoples' and the all-encompassing term 'ethno-racial minorities', we shall now turn to the definition of 'indigenous peoples'. Dyck not only points out the differences between indigenous peoples and other ethnic minorities but offers a very vivid and concise description of indigenous people's struggles:

The political problems of minority indigenous peoples encompassed within modern nation-states have received increasing national and international attention in recent years. North and South American Indians, Australian Aborigines, Saami in Scandinavia, and aboriginal populations in other parts of the world are struggling variously to retain traditional lands, to cope with government administration of their affairs and to survive as culturally distinct peoples within nation-states. These peoples are, by and large, politically weak, economically marginal and culturally stigmatised members of the national societies that have overtaken them and their lands. Together, they comprise what has, in the past decade, come to be known as the 'Fourth World'. Unlike other ethnic minorities, Fourth World peoples are not immigrants but the original inhabitants of lands that today form the territories of nation states. And unlike the peoples of the Third World who can at least hope to take control of their countries one day through strength of numbers, the tiny internal colonies that make up the Fourth World are fated always to be minority populations in their own lands. In the present, as in the past, aboriginal peoples are being subjected to government policies that, from one country to another, range from genocide to forced assimilation, from segregation to cultural pluralism (Dyck, 1985: 1, emphasis mine).

In the extract above, indigenous peoples are also called 'Fourth World Peoples'. This is a term derived from George Manuel and Michael Posluns' book entitled The Fourth World (1974). They explain the idea of 'Fourth World' in this way:

Indigenous peoples descended from a country's aboriginal population and who today are completely or partly deprived of the right to their own territories and its riches (1974: 40).

The Fourth World is not, after all, a final solution. It is not even a destination. It is the right to travel freely, not only on our road but in our own vehicles (Ibid.: 217).

Chapter 1

Introduction

More recently, Griggs (1992) has attempted to invest this concept with greater rigour, noting some definitions are too broad and go so far as to designate all the poorest and most underdeveloped states of the world as well as any oppressed or underprivileged victim of a state as members of a ‘Fourth World’. He argues that the following definition is more concise and less geographically limiting: ‘Nations forcefully incorporated into states which maintain a distinct political culture but are internationally unrecognised....In all cases the Fourth World nation is engaged in a struggle to maintain or gain some degree of sovereignty over their national homeland.’

On this definition most ‘aboriginal’ and ‘indigenous’ peoples belong to the ‘Fourth World’ group.

Julian Burger, a consultant with the United Nations’ Centre for Human Rights who has been involved in the UN Working Group on Indigenous Populations (WGIP) since it began, sketches the situation of indigenous peoples in this way:

Indigenous peoples are strikingly diverse in their culture, religion and social and economic organisation. Yet, today as in the past they are prey to stereotyping by the outside world. By some they are idealised as the embodiment of spiritual values; by others they are denigrated as an obstacle impeding economic progress. But they are neither: they are people who cherish their own distinct cultures, are the victims of past and present-day colonialism, and are determined to survive (Burger, 1990: 15).

Beckett (1988: 6) vividly describes the current status of Australian Aborigines as ‘outside the nation, inside the state’, which implies that they have been consistently excluded from the ‘nation-forming’ process of Australia.

Stephen H. Riggins, a Canadian sociologist, offers a more systematic definition in *Ethnic Minority Media—An International Perspective*:

One way of comparing ethnic minority populations is on the basis of their values and geographical origins. This would be the question of whether their values are traditional or modern and their origins indigenous or foreign. *Traditional* refers to the values of

---

3 Richard Griggs’ paper on ‘The Meaning of “Nation” and “State” in the Fourth World’ is provided by the Center for World Indigenous Studies (CWIS), which can be downloaded from URL: ftp.halcyon.com/pub/FWDP/CWIS/cwis-cat.txt

4 Ibid.
hunters and gatherers or pastoralists that are difficult to reconcile with industrialism and capitalism. *Modern* is understood here as values consistent with capitalism or industrialism and the bureaucratic structures both require. *Modern* and *traditional* should not be equated with *progress* and *backwardness* (Riggins, 1992: 4-5, italics original).

If we take Riggins' argument and use 'value' as longitude and 'geographical origin' as latitude, we arrive at the classification shown in Figure 1.1. According to Riggins, in the first quadrant of Figure 1.1 are non-immigrant groups who hold traditional values, such as the American and Canadian Indians, Inuits, Australian Aborigines and Hawaiian Polynesians. Those in the third quadrant are also regarded by Riggins as indigenous, but they hold modern values and include the Welsh, the Irish, the Kabyles in Algeria and the Basques in France. The groups in the fourth quadrant are called voluntary minorities, who choose to move usually for economic or political reasons, such as the Hispanics in the United States and Eastern-European Jews in Israel. These people belong to large linguistic communities whose survival is not threatened, and as voluntary immigrants they are perceived in the host country as having few rights to demand cultural protection. Finally, in the second quadrant are also the immigrant groups who hold traditional values, but these groups are relatively rare and are not discussed in the Riggins' book (Riggins, 1992: 5).

Whilst this distinction seems serviceable at first sight, it is a little too simplistic. In a number of places, members of indigenous groups have migrated from their traditional hometowns to major cities in search of work. As a result, their values are likely to be a complex combination of traditional and modern. The indigenous peoples of Taiwan, who inhabited the island long before the Han Chinese settlers, for example, should fit the first quadrant of Riggins' framework above. However, they do not necessarily hold traditional values as argued by Riggins, because many aborigines have migrated to the cities stimulated by the rapid development of Taiwan's economy since the 1960s.  

---

5 A brief history of indigenous peoples in Taiwan will be given in Chapter 3.
6 The migration of Taiwan aborigines to cities and their employment in the job market will be discussed in Chapter 3.
Chapter 1

Introduction

Figure 1.1

Riggins’ Definition of Indigenous Peoples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Traditional values</th>
<th>Modern values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous origin</td>
<td>(Non-immigrants)</td>
<td>(Immigrants)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign origin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The definitions I have illustrated above are mainly based upon individual scholars’ research. I shall conclude this section with two more definitions from the World Council of Indigenous Peoples (WCIP) and the United Nations. At the founding conference held in Port Alberni, British Columbia in 1975, the following definition of indigenous peoples was incorporated into the Council’s Charter:

Indigenous peoples shall be people living in countries which have a population composed of different ethnic or racial groups who are descendants of the earliest populations which survive in the area, and who do not, as a group, control the national government of the countries within which they live (Cited from Dyck, 1985: 25).

On the other hand, the definition of ‘indigenous peoples’ developed by the United Nations Sub-Commission on the Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities is stated as follows:

Indigenous communities, peoples and nations are those which, having a historical continuity with pre-invasion and pre-colonial societies that developed on their territories,
consider themselves distinct from other sectors of the societies now prevailing in those territories, or parts of them. They form at present non-dominant sectors of society and are determined to preserve, develop and transmit to future generations their ancestral territories, and their ethnic identity, as the basis of their continued existence as peoples, in accordance with their own cultural patterns, social institutions and legal systems (Cited from Laenui, 1994: 1).

It is evidently seen that all the extracts illustrated above use the term indigenous ‘peoples’ instead of its singular form. This is partly due to their particular history and political status in a nation-state and partly due to a recognition of them not as an homogeneous cultural group, but rather comprising a great variety of different cultures and languages. Drawing upon the discussion above, this thesis will address ‘indigenous peoples’ as ‘aboriginal peoples’, ‘native peoples’, ‘fourth world peoples’ or in the context of contemporaneous Taiwan, Yuanchumin.

1.2 Aims and Methodology

Before proceeding to detail the aims and methodology of this thesis, one further basic note of definition of ‘indigenous’ and ‘mainstream’ media needs to be added. The term ‘indigenous media’ will be used to refer to those media that are owned and operated by indigenous peoples, whilst the ‘mainstream media’ will refer to media that are run by majority groups. As both aboriginal and ethnoracial minorities occupy a structurally similar disadvantageous position in society, it can be argued that their problematic relations with the mainstream media have a number of features in common. Consequently, in this thesis, current media-minority research is widely used as a point of departure as well as a useful reference source to aid in developing a fruitful discussion of media-indigenous relations.

The thesis focuses particularly on the print media, in this case, the mainstream Han Chinese-owned newspapers and the indigenous-owned journals in Taiwan. The

---

Yuanchumin is the Chinese term for the ‘original inhabitants’ of Taiwan. The indigenous struggles to be renamed Yuanchumin in Taiwan in recent years will be discussed in Chapter 3.
reasons for not including electronic media in this research are two-fold. Firstly, given that in Taiwan today the involvement of indigenous peoples with the media is still confined to the press industry in terms of management and ownership, any account that wishes to include a study of indigenous news media in Taiwan has to take newspapers as its primary focus. Secondly, although the study of electronic media and indigenous peoples constitutes an important topic for media studies which merits sustained investigation, it was beyond the scope and resources of the present thesis.

The thesis aims to investigate three dimensions of the relationships between indigenous peoples and the press in Taiwan:

1. To examine how the Taiwanese mainstream newspapers represent indigenous peoples. The research employs quantitative content analysis to establish the general patterns of coverage and goes on to conduct a qualitative case study of mainstream newspapers' coverage of one aboriginal cultural event in Taiwan drawing on recent work on critical discourse analysis.  

2. To investigate the structural factors operating inside and outside the press industry that may play a significant role in shaping the process of news production about aboriginal affairs in mainstream news organisations. Personal interviews with Han Chinese and indigenous journalists and scholars were conducted during fieldwork in Taiwan for this purpose.

3. To explore the roles played by indigenous media in the contemporary cultural struggles of indigenous peoples in Taiwan. What are the meanings behind the emergence of indigenous press in Taiwan and what predicaments and problems does it currently face? Most importantly, what are the counter-discourses presented by the indigenous press and how are they constructed? Again, this exploration is based on a combination of qualitative textual interpretation and interviews.

---

8 For a more detailed discussion of research methodology, see Chapter 5.
1.3 Outline of the Thesis

This thesis is composed of ten chapters which are divided into three parts:

1. Part 1—'Theoretical Framework and Contextual Background' (Chapters 2-4)
2. Part 2—'Research Methodology and Empirical Work' (Chapters 5-8)
3. Part 3—'Indigenous Press and Counter-Discourses' (Chapters 9-10)

Chapter two attempts to provide a basic theoretical framework for the study of the news media and indigenous struggles. It starts with a brief summarisation of current media-minority research, followed by a more detailed exploration of the problematic relations between news media and indigenous peoples. As well as the need to examine the top-down representation of indigenous peoples in the mainstream media, this chapter argues that we also need to take account of the bottom-up struggles for self-determination by indigenous media in the course of drawing up a theoretical framework for the media-indigenous relations. Also, in this chapter five 'crucial elements' are proposed as the building blocks for mapping out the theoretical framework.

Chapter three introduces the case that forms the main focus of the thesis by presenting a brief history of the indigenous peoples of Taiwan and of the aboriginal policy of the Republic of China on Taiwan since 1945. In the context of the ongoing debate on nationalism in Taiwan and the continuing cultural hegemony perpetrated by sinocentrism, it then goes on to chart the current struggles for indigenous self-determination, arguing that asserting indigenous identity is one of the ways to express and achieve indigenous self-determination within the identity-centered politics of Taiwan.

Chapter four turns to the newspaper industry, outlining the tremendous impact of Taiwan's recent political reforms on press freedom and on the structure of the press. This chapter introduces the politico-economic environment of Taiwan's press industry in the 1990s, with a particular focus on the circulation, advertising, ownership,
diversification and commercialisation of the seven mainstream newspapers selected for intensive study in this thesis. The newspapers' strategies and content characteristics as well as their dynamic interactions with the state and the market are also examined in this chapter, followed by a brief summary of newspaper readership and of the advertising market of Taiwan.

Chapter five offers a detailed description of the fieldwork and methodological approaches employed in this study. The process of data-collection and the purpose of collecting different sets of materials, together with the sampling procedures used are outlined and explained. The rationale behind the choice of the three research strategies employed in this thesis—interviews, content analysis, and critical discourse analysis—are also elaborated in this chapter.

Chapter six explores the way indigenous news is produced in the mainstream newspapers of Taiwan, focusing on the factors that may either facilitate or constrain the process. They include the external influences exerted by the state, advertising and the audience, as well as internal influences, such as newspaper owners' interests and policy, the organisation of news gathering, and the role of editors and reporters in producing indigenous news.

Chapter seven examines how the Taiwan's mainstream newspapers represent indigenous peoples through the quantitative content analysis. The mainstream titles selected for study include: 1. the China Times; 2. the United Daily News; 3. the Central Daily News; 4. the Independent Morning Post; 5. the Taiwan Times; 6. the Commons; and 7. the Liberty Times. It deals with four dimensions of news portrayals: 1. prominence and attention; 2. themes and content; 3. quotation and representation; and 4. newspaper variability.

Chapter eight looks in detail at the mainstream newspapers' coverage of one particular aboriginal cultural event—the Mayasvi rite of the Tsou tribe in central Taiwan. Representations of this event, which was held on Feb. 15, 1995, are approached qualitatively, drawing on recent work in critical discourse analysis. This chapter analyses three major dimensions of coverage: 1. the headlines; 2. the news texts; and 3. the photos. It is an attempt to complement the findings of the content
analysis through an exploration of the implicit racist ideology underpinning dominant news discourses in the mainstream newspapers of Taiwan.

Chapter nine moves from the mainstream to the indigenous press and addresses indigenous self-representation from a bottom-up perspective, as a counter-discourse to the dominant news discourse. The following questions are examined: how have the indigenous news media developed and what is the background to their emergence? What are the counter-discourses they mobilise? And what problems do they face in sustaining their operations? In order to shed more light on their current difficulties a modest analysis of the contents, advertising, circulation and distribution of Taiwan's indigenous journals today is provided, with a view to illustrating what I term the 'predicament of counter-discourses'.

Chapter ten concludes the thesis by presenting a comprehensive review of the general arguments and offering some suggestions for future communication research in the emerging field of indigenous peoples and the news media.
Part One

Theoretical Framework and Contextual Background
Chapter Two

Indigenous Peoples and the News Media: Representation, Access and Self-Determination

2.1 Introduction

This chapter sets out to provide a theoretical framework for studying the dynamic relations and the cultural politics between indigenous peoples and the news media. As cultural politics is integrally related with the power, access to the cultural institutions, such as the mass media, which govern the publication, display, distribution and transmission of cultural products and practices, is considered as fundamentally important, particularly for minority and indigenous peoples.

This chapter consists of two major dimensions—the mainstream media and indigenous media; the former works along representation and the latter revolves around the access and self-determination of the indigenous peoples for the access to the media. It is therefore necessary to look not only at how indigenous minorities are portrayed by mainstream media (representation), but also at the employment and role of professionals from these groups within these organisations (access) and the meaning of indigenous struggles for media's ownership (self-determination).

In addition, this chapter proposes 'five crucial elements', which I argue need to be considered as a starting point in formulating a theoretical framework for investigating relations between indigenous peoples and the news media. I then discuss recent arguments about indigenous media and their constructions of indigenous identities and their implications. However before proceeding to explore these issues further, we need to start with a brief contextual overview of the media-minority research.
2.2 Reviewing Media-Minority Research

In the United States, communication research on media and minorities largely began from the early 1970s in the aftermath of the Civil Rights Movement. It was mainly because riots and disturbances in the inner cities in the 1960s aroused the interest of both the government and American scholars that they began systematic work on the media's role in covering the situation. The Kerner Commission, which was set up to investigate the causes of these 'civil disorders', raised the curtain on American media research on minorities by conducting a substantial and pioneering study of press reporting.

After conducting many interviews and undertaking a large scale content analyses, the Commission delivered the following criticism of media performance:

The white-dominated media have not communicated to the majority of their audience—which is white—a sense of the degradation, misery and hopelessness of ghetto existence....They have not communicated to whites a feeling for the difficulties of being a Negro in the United States. They have not shown understanding or appreciation of—a sense of Negro culture, thought or history....It is the responsibility of the news media to tell the story of race relations in America, and, with notable exceptions, the media have not turned to the task with the wisdom, sensitivity and expertise it demands (Cited from Murphy & Murphy, 1981: 15).

---

1 In July 1967, the Detroit riot resulted in a catastrophic tragedy causing 7,200 arrests and 43 deaths. President Johnson issued an order on 29 July, 1967 (two days after the riot was finally quelled) appointing Kerner, the then Governor of Illinois, to head the 'National Advisory Commission on Civil Disorder.' The Commission was asked to conduct a thorough study of the riot and to study the performance of the press, following repeated accusations that media coverage of the black community in general, and of the urban disorders in particular, was itself part of the problem. For the discussion of this Commission, see Report of the National Advisory Commission on Civil Disorder (1968); and Van Dijk (1991: 11-12).

2 The other early studies in the USA are mainly journalistic accounts of the role of the media in covering the 'racial crisis'. See Van Dijk, 1991: 12. Also, Hartmann and Husband (1974: 149-150) note that there was a conference on 'Racial Crisis and the News Media' organised by American newsmen in 1965, which was held before the Kerner Commission.
Despite this seminal judgement, Van Dijk (1991: 11) has argued that although we now have hundreds of informal and anecdotal studies of the portrayal of minorities in the press, there are still relatively few detailed and systematic content analyses of the broad ‘ethnic’ coverage of the national press in specific countries. After summarising some of the more prominent results of work in North America and western Europe, and giving an assessment of the changes in ethnic affairs coverage in recent decades, he concludes:

Experiences and analyses by minority groups as well as other scholarly evidence have repeatedly shown that the dominant media in various degrees have always perpetuated stereotypes and prejudice about minority groups. The main conclusions of more than two decades of research on the relations between the Press and ethnic minority groups or immigrants are hardly ambiguous or contradictory. Most blatantly in the past and usually more subtly today, the Press has indeed been a main ‘foe’ of black and other minorities. As a representative of the white power structure, it has consistently limited the access, both as to hiring, promotion, or points of view, of ethnic groups. Until today, its dominant definition of ethnic affairs has consistently been a negative and stereotypical one: minorities or immigrants are seen as a problem or a conflict, unacceptable cultural differences, or other forms of deviance. While paying extensive attention to these racialised or ethnicised forms of problems or conflict, it failed to pay attention to the deeper social, political, or economic causes and backgrounds of these conflicts. From the point of view of a ‘white man’s world’, minorities and other Third World peoples are generally categorised as ‘them’, and opposed to ‘us’ and, especially in western Europe, as not belonging, if not as an aberration, in white society. Similarly, events in the ethnic communities are defined by the white authorities, such as the police and the politicians, and minority voices are effectively excluded (Van Dijk, 1991: 10-21).

This evaluation is very similar to Kemer’s conclusions and suggests that there has been little positive change in the intervening period. However, it would be misleading to conclude that racial minorities’ problems with the media are homogeneous, because the historical position and the social and politico-economic power of minorities vary widely across different nation-states. Because some ethnoracial minorities have won growing power and influence in recent years, mainstream media have ameliorated their problematic coverage of them to some degree. Therefore, their communicative position needs to be re-examined and re-assessed against the background of altering political contexts. Weston, for example, has provided an updating review of the changing media treatment of Native Americans.
By the late 20th century, stories of Native Americans were finding prominent places in mainstream news publications. The image those articles presented in the news seemed more varied than in the past. While the old, stereotypical images were easily found in the press, new ones were also there. Significantly, Native American journalists and others talked back to the media, taking news organisations to task for flawed coverage. Their views also found their way into some mainstream publications, where they could resonate among journalists and the public alike. Whether it was due to the vigilance of Native Americans or the greater economic power of a few tribes or journalism's attention to multicultural issues or expanding definitions of news or some combination of these, the images of Native Americans in the 1990s press multiplied. Stereotyping did not end, but it was mitigated by a variety of other portrayals (Weston, 1996: 163).

There may be a wide range of Native American images in the major media apart from the old-fashioned stereotypes, but this does not necessarily signal the end of problems of misrepresentation, so at this point we need to discuss the 'native image' in the media.

2.3 Representation of Others

2.3.1 Native Image in the Media

Many scholars have argued that the negative portrayals of indigenous others as 'noble savages' or 'irrational and aggressive savages' have been one of the recurrent images in the white media (Fleras, 1994; Grenier, 1992; Meadows, 1992; Murphy and Murphy, 1981; Trahant, 1995).

In The White Man's Indian, for example, Berkhofer (1978: 72) writes: 'For most of the past five centuries, the Indian of the imagination and ideology has been as real, perhaps more real, than the Native American of actual existence and contact.' Moreover, he said: 'The idea and the image of the Indian must be a White conception. Native Americans were and are real, but the Indian was a White invention' (Ibid.: 3). This argument is also taken up in The Imaginary Indian, where Francis (1992: 4-5) argues that 'The Indian began as a White man's mistake, and became a White man's fantasy.' Therefore, both authors argue that native image in the media is a white construction and their imaginary inventions.
In line with these arguments, Mark Trahant, an American Indian journalist (Shoshone tribe) has criticised the role of the media in constructing the false image of the indigenous peoples, arguing: 'As media consumers, Indian people are in a particularly harmful position. We consume the thoughts of others about ourselves and the world. The media has, for its own purpose, created a false image of the Native American. Too many of us have patterned ourselves after that image. It is time now we project our own image and stop being what we never really were' (1995: 18). Giago (1991), an American Indian writer, also illustrates the problem of 'false image' in the news reports by non-Indian journalists, who are blamed for not knowing Indian history and cultures and for not being accurate when reporting.

In their Let My People Know: American Indian Journalism, 1828-1978, James and Sharon Murphy (1981: 3) summarised: 'The mass media of the United States have historically followed a policy of not-so-benign neglect of this country's native peoples. Media coverage is also marked by a fair amount of cynicism about Indians, a prime manifestation of which has been the portrayal of Indians as stereotypes.' Moreover, Sharon Murphy (1982: 51) has argued further that the familiar image of the 'savage Indians' of the Old West is not limited to films of the 20th century, noting: 'Long before film, print media did its job to encourage, or at least condone, savage treatment of Indians.'

In the Representing Others: White Views of Indigenous Peoples, Gidley (1992: 2) argues that the original inhabitants were profoundly Others and that through a diverse representations of indigenous Others in the works of novelists, sculptors diarists, photographers, ethnographers, travel writers, and filmmakers, the colonising culture asserted its dominance.

The sense of 'otherness' that Western discourse imposes on non-Western peoples and cultures is seen as the source of the modern ideas of race. Through the representation of an absolute difference between the West and its Others, the idea of difference took on a racial form. Malik (1996:221) argues that this idea of 'Other' has proved very attractive in the study of race and that most contemporary studies define racial difference in terms of the Other.
However, the 'Other' is not only limited to the racial difference, its meanings being inflected to include all the cultural difference. Pieterse argues that cultural difference is a major part of otherness, and that the single most important feature of representations of otherness is the role they play in establishing and maintaining social inequality (1992: 234; 1996: 262-263).

According to the Robert Nfiles, at the heart of racism is a process of representing or making sense of the 'other', which is a set of processes through which communities are constructed and various forms of 'us' and 'them' are created. Representations of others can either lead to, and legitimate, acts of violence, discrimination and denigration, or produce a situation where there is no recognised 'race' problem (Wetherell, 1996: 181). In Miles' views, as ideologies, racism are discourses representing human beings in distorted and misleading ways, and one of the representational characteristics is definition of 'self' through the construction of 'otherness' (Gabriel, 1994: 20-21).

Solomos and Back (1996: 46-47) argue that images of the 'other' played a key role in colonial discourses, and such images were closely related to racial stereotypes. However, they emphasise that these images are related to all aspects of the relationship between the colonised and colonisers. For example, the linkage of colonised peoples with images of the 'primitive' was the product of complex historical processes and it took different forms in specific colonial situations. Therefore, they argue that it would be a mistake to see such racial images in isolation from wider set of social relations.

The native image in the media discussed above has clearly pointed to the issue of the misrepresentation in news reports about the American Indians. We can also see that 'Native Indians' are often represented as primitive and exotic Others and it is an imaginary construction and a fantasy that have been manipulated by the mass media.

At this point, it is necessary to tease out current media research on ethnoracial minorities in order to gain further insight into the representational problems of minority groups in the media.
2.3.2 Misrepresentation

Up until now news coverage of racial minorities by the mainstream media has been the principal target of scholars and minorities' criticisms. Apart from the problem of *de-representation* which renders minorities relatively 'invisible' caused by the *symbolic annihilation* of media neglect, racial minorities, when they are presented, often fall victim to *misrepresentation*. This, in my view, operates along these basic dimensions: problematisation; denial of positive contribution; and decontextualisation.

Portrayals of racial minorities as a 'problem' or a 'threat' is still the major dimension of *misrepresentation*. As a number of scholars have pointed out, they are often labelled as connected with violence and conflict, or as the 'others' rather than as 'belonging to society' (Bennett, 1989; Braham, 1986; Entman, 1994; Feagin and Vera, 1995; Fleras, 1994; Greenberg, 1986; Grenier, 1992; Hartmann and Husband, 1974; Husband, 1975; Jackson, 1989; Riggins, 1992; Van Dijk, 1991).

Jackson (1989) argues that the association of black people with social problems became almost automatic and he cites Salman Rushdie as saying that: 'The worst, most insidious stereotype...is the characterisation of black people as a Problem (sic.)' (p.142).

Some scholars have pursued this point, arguing that the concentration on negative news also has the effect of underrepresenting the positive contributions made by minorities to the society, contributions for which there is ample evidence. This structure of attention in turn, it is argued, has reinforced the prejudices and stereotypes of majority audiences toward racial minorities (Entman, 1994; Husband, 1975). However, Entman (1994) has drawn attention to what he calls 'the normative conundrum', whereby he argues:

> Actions taken to ameliorate one misimpression could heighten another. For example, reducing images of black crime and victimisation could instill among whites an unwarranted sense of black progress.... Conveying the positive diversity of the black

---

3 Fleras (1994: 272-6) argues that the racism in media-minority relations comprises 'minorities as invisible', 'minorities as stereotypes', 'minorities as social problems', and 'minorities as adornment'.

19
community could simultaneously feed the complacency of whites who insist racial discrimination has ceased (p. 518).

In addition, critics of media coverage also contend that there has been undue concentration on manifestations of tension at the expense of such topics as housing, education and employment which are vital concerns to minority groups (Braham, 1986; Hartmann and Husband, 1974; Van Dijk, 1991). This is part of a wider problem of ‘decontextualisation’. Braham (1986: 274), for example, argues: ‘News values tend to neglect background material. Events are likely to appear as sudden and unexplained or as having only direct and immediate causes. The underlying state of affairs, which social scientists would say helps explain or gives rise to a particular event, tends to be absent or to be taken for granted in the news reports.’

2.4 Access and Underrepresentation

Many media critics and scholars have also been keenly aware of minority group members’ lack of access to media organisations (underrepresentation), which they consider to be one of the major causes of negative portrayals. Husband notes that:

A study of the representation of ethnic minorities by the media often reveals more about the product than the process that produced it. It is now essential that research energies should be applied to examining the situation of ethnic minorities as active agents in media production; for it is clear that ethnic minorities are marginalised not only through media images but through their exclusion from full and equitable participation in media industries’ (1994: 14).

Because stereotypical and negative news coverage about minorities by the mainstream media persists despite the attention paid to the issue, questions of minority access to media have become more salient. Wilson II and Gutierrez (1985, 1995) argue that access has these major dimensions:
1. Minority’s employment in mainstream media organisations;
2. Minority’s ownership and control of their own media;
3. and Minority’s establishment of effective means of resistance against the majority media’s forms of news production and consumption.

Husband (1975: 216) notes: ‘In the current racial climate there are issues which black journalists are better equipped to report. And in a different sense there is a definite need for journalists with black consciousness to provide a non-white interpretation.’ So access to the mainstream media is fundamentally important to minority people, not only to counter the misrepresentation of minority issues but to ‘occupy a cultural space from which the right to speak is asserted’ (Molnar, 1995: 173).

Concluding his study of the Press coverage of ethnic affairs in the USA, Van Dijk notes that hiring practices are far from ideal, arguing that: ‘Although hiring of minorities by newspapers had improved since the 1960s, there are still many newspapers without minority journalists, whereas the other newspapers effectively limit access of qualified minority journalists to higher editorial or managerial positions’ (1991: 15-16).

St Leger (1979: 69) argues that the underrepresentation of black minority in the US media indicates that ‘not only is the political control or ownership of mass media outlets likely to be in majority hands but their personnel, especially professional or key personnel is likely to be recruited disproportionately from the majority groups.’

If we turn from questions of general minority employment to Native employment in the media, we find that Native people, for example, the Australian aborigines, are also subject to the discriminatory hiring practices of majority-owned media. Molnar (1995: 181) notes that at present, there are very few Aborigines and Islanders working in broadcasting media. Moreover, they have to adhere to dominant media forms, lacking the freedom to determine their own programmes. Meadows (1992c: 93) goes on to suggest that there is a pressing need to have more Aborigines working in the media and to establish better liaison with reporters. He also points to the need for
better researched stories and a need for journalists to speak to Aboriginal people about Aboriginal issues.

In the United States too, scholars point to the urgent need for Native employment, in both the white and indigenous media. Reviewing the history of Native journalism in the US from the early 19th century, Trahant (1995: 18) argues that it is essential for American Indians and Alaskan Natives to work in the media, both tribal and mainstream, with a view to restoring the heritage of Indian journalism. However, Poka Laenui, who is the president of the Pacific Asia Council of Indigenous People (PACIP) from Hawaii, has added a note of caution, pointing out that: 'They [the indigenous people] are generally not hired by the media, and if hired, certainly not to report on or to indigenous people' (1994: 4-5).

Wilson II and Gutierrez (1985:161-167; 1995: 204-205) have provided detailed statistical data about minorities' employment in the US media. They found that in 1982 daily newspapers had by far the lowest minority employment rate of any mass media industry, with the television leading ahead of radio. Compared with the 1980 U.S. Census data placing minorities at about 17 percent of the total population, they show that none of the news media industries achieved statistical parity in minority hiring. However, it is also important to note that minority group members are particularly scarce in the decision-making positions in news departments. In terms of the differential rates of representation of different ethnic groups, Blacks found news media employment in greater numbers than Latino, Asian, or Native American journalists. Native Americans traditionally have been the least represented of the four groups, except in radio where they have slightly outnumbered Asians. 4

However, against the grain of the generally optimistic advocates of greater minority hiring, Grenier (1992) notes that increased employment of minority people in the news room, at all levels of activity and decision-making, will not necessarily guarantee better coverage of minority news, since the news agenda is also shaped by a range of other factors and pressures. We shall return to this point in the context of the

---

4 For more detailed discussion on the access and underrepresentation of indigenous journalists, also see Chapter 9 of this thesis.
Taiwanese mainstream press in chapter 6. In the context of the present contextual discussion, however, we need to move now from the specific critiques of mainstream media performance towards a more general conceptual framework for analysing the overall relations between indigenous peoples and the news media.

2.5 Five Crucial Elements

Fleras (1994: 276) critically observes that 'the absence of a theoretical framework for understanding media-minority relations is regrettable,' lamenting that research on media and minorities 'tends to be highly descriptive and ad hoc, with little or no attention to theory-building, model construction or practical application' (Ibid.:284-285). However, some scholars have tried to formulate possible models for examining media-minority relations (e.g., Browne, 1996; Husband, 1986; Jakubowicz et al., 1994; Riggins, 1992; and Van Dijk, 1991).

Browne has discussed relevant theories about indigenous media in his book *Electronic Media and Indigenous Peoples: A Voice of Our Own?.* He argued (1996:8-12) the framework he proposed is not theoretically based but 'theoretically informed'. He noted:

The theories that have been most helpful to me in my studies of indigenous media are not among the classics in the field of communication research. Most have been around for 20 or fewer years, and the studies that serve as their underpinnings and purportedly validate them often seem to me to lack rigor, both methodologically and with respect to quality of data. Still, they do serve a useful suggestive role, and it is in that spirit that I offer them here (Browne, 1996: 8, emphasis original).

The theories he offered for indigenous media are: political economy, hegemony, cultural imperialism and cultural dependency. Among them, he feels that cultural dependency theory comes closest to helping him to understand the evolution and practices of indigenous electronic media. He said that there are two aspects that he is particularly interested in this theory: one is whether indigenous media personnel absorb and follow majority culture media staff 'models' of 'professional' production practices;
the other is whether indigenous media follow 'models' furnished by majority culture programming and borrow the majority culture portrayals of themes, values and depictions of society (Ibid.: 229-230).

Although Browne has made it clear that the theories he proposed are theoretically-informed suggestions, they are useful because his focus is on the indigenous electronic media. Browne's major theoretical points will be mentioned in the following discussion in due course.

Rather than engaging in an attempt to construct a theoretical 'master narrative', which is impossible, I would like to propose a 'multiperspectival approach' adapted to the specific tasks at hand. In my view, there are five 'crucial' elements that need to be considered in formulating a framework for investigating the dynamic relations between indigenous peoples and the news media. They are:

- The role of the state in fostering indigenous media.
- The political economy of media production.
- The construction of cultural hegemony.
- The orientation of racism and ethnicity in the media.
- The relations between indigenous news media and their movements and resistance.

2.5.1 The State and Indigenous Media

It can be argued here that more emphasis should be placed on the role of the state in implementing policies concerning aboriginal affairs and in fostering the development of indigenous media among Fourth World peoples. This is especially relevant where the state has played a key role in exerting a tremendous impact on the structure and performance of the media industry,\(^5\) and where administrative measures, laws and aboriginal administration agencies are central to implementing aboriginal policies. It is therefore scarcely surprising that to the indigenous peoples of Taiwan and other Fourth

---

\(^5\) This will be discussed in Chapter 4.
Chapter 2 Indigenous Peoples and the News Media

World peoples, the state appears as a ‘total institution’\(^6\), or in the American context, a ‘terminator’.\(^7\)

Jakubowicz et al. (1994: 35) argue that for two centuries Aboriginal Australians have had to resist or adjust to the settler society in the context of policies that have ranged from extermination to assimilation, separate development to integration and cultural pluralism. They observe: ‘Under the assimilationist perspectives which had marked the first quarter-century of post-war immigration, and the best part of a half-century of policy in relation to Aborigines, the discourses legitimated by the state and carried in the media sought to expunge difference for the sake of ‘the new Australian’ and to save a dying race’ (Ibid.: 45).

Many communication scholars have documented the importance of the state in fostering the development of indigenous media in Canada (Demay, 1993; Valaskakis, 1992), USA (Daley and James, 1992) and Australia (Ginsburg, 1995; Meadows, 1992a, 1992b; Molnar, 1995) since the 1970s. Most of the instances referred to in these studies select electronic media for their research, including notable experiments using satellite systems, such as the Inuit Broadcasting Corporation established in Canada in 1981 and Imparja Television launched in 1988 in Australia.

---

\(^6\) According to Satzewich and Wotherspoon (1993:35), in Canada, ‘The Indian Act and the apparatus established to administer the act, the Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, have been described as a total institution: a set of practices and arrangements that control all aspects of Indian peoples’ lives.’ This notion of ‘total institution’ is also shared by Beckett (1988: 3), noting that in Australia ‘the state looms particularly large in the history of the Australian Aborigines over the last two hundred years.’ He points out that the relationship between the state and Australian Aborigines is a sort of ‘welfare colonialism’.

\(^7\) The ‘termination policy’ was implemented by the federal government of the United States after World War II. The term ‘terminator’ is useful for understanding the role of the state in relation to indigenous peoples. The ‘termination policy’ was designed to ‘terminate’ the ‘ward’ status of Indian people and withdraw federal government’s support and responsibilities for Indian tribes. The move toward termination came to a halt with the passage in 1975 of the Indian Self-Determination and Education Assistance Act. For more discussion of the termination policy, see Schaefer (1988: 185-189) and Weston (1996: 99-102).
According to Meadows (1992a: 30), Imparja was the first Aboriginal-owned television station. It started broadcasting by satellite on January 15, 1988 with the federal government intervening at the last moment with grant money. It is owned by the Central Australian Aboriginal Media Association (CAAMA) in Alice Springs. The federal government in Australia spent about $750 million on broadcasting and production in 1988-89 (Ibid.: 48).

Langton (1993: 18) points out that Imparja is fraught with funding problems, particularly paying for expensive satellite facilities in a small advertising market. Ginsburg (1992: 365) noted: 'Imparja, like the other Australian satellite downlinks, struggles to meet the $4.5 million rental fees via advertising revenues which will never rise significantly because the population number (and therefore potential consumers) are low. Aboriginal programming is particularly not lucrative because there is a dropoff in European viewers, and advertisers—who are mostly local business people—don’t view Aborigines as consumers.'

Whatever the technologies, the basic underlying problem is that most indigenous media are heavily dependent on government funds. Molnar illustrates the situation in Australia in this way:

In a broadcasting era that favours deregulation and privatisation, the reality is that only some of the larger indigenous media associations can generate a reasonable level of revenue. But this amount is nowhere near enough to allow them to operate independently of government. Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander media associations therefore require clear guidelines and assurances from government about the level and type of funding they can receive. To date, however, this has not happened (Molnar, 1995:174-175).

Despite the problems and limitations of state initiatives in these countries, however, it cannot be denied that the state plays a central role in fostering, subsidising and providing technological support for indigenous media. Riggins underlines the importance of the state in the development of ethnic minority media, arguing that:

Media organisations are not socially autonomous entities but are integrated in larger socio-economic systems. They are affected most obviously by the state through policies of subsidisation, regulation, and legislation. The state makes possible the technological and economic transfers that permit minorities to assume the means of media.
production, even though success may ultimately depend most on actions undertaken by minority communities themselves (1992: 8-11).

As minority journalism carries with it the permanent threat of promoting national disintegration, the state’s policies are often inconsistent and widely varied in different countries. In an attempt to summarise the range of strategies adopted in dealing with ethnic minority media, Riggins proposes five models:

- the integration model;
- the economic model;
- the divisive model;
- the preemptive model;
- the proselytism model (Ibid.: 8-11).

He explains that these models are not meant to define rigid categories of policies, but rather to outline some significant features of the political and economic motivations that constrain the emergence of ethnic minority media (Ibid.: 11).

2.5.2 Anchoring Analysis in Political Economy

In pursuing the dynamic relations between indigenous peoples and the news media, however, we also need to mobilise a political economy perspective in order to shed more light on the process of production. Jakubowicz et al. (1994: 17) concur with Dennis McQuail in arguing that such an approach not only allows a focus on the integration of media industries into the global economic environment, but also offers an explanation of the systematic exclusion of lesser voices in structural terms, presenting the media as an arena in which only those who are powerful enough to participate can exert influence.

As noted earlier, Browne (1996) includes political economy as one of the theories for indigenous media. He explains the reason for his inclusion:
Chapter 2 Indigenous Peoples and the News Media

Political economy has always struck me as more a perspective than a theory, but it certainly could be applied to indigenous media, particularly if a comparative examination of indigenous media in different countries were to reveal the presence of certain economically based political policies in some countries, but not in others, and a strong correlation between the presence or absence of those policies and the relative strength or weakness of the indigenous media (p. 9).

There are two aspects of a political economy approach that are particularly significant. First, as media organisations are basically business enterprises, consequently, a political economy perspective can offer revealing insights into the forces shaping the coverage of ethnoracial minorities by the mainstream media. Second, because indigenous media are almost always constrained by the dire need for survival in the market, a political economy perspective can also uncover the dynamics underpinning their operations.

As mentioned earlier the state’s role in fostering the emergence of minority media is often inconsistent and subject to constant change. Therefore, it is not surprising to see that ethnic minority media are often in a precarious situation. This is well illustrated by the predicament of the Native press in Canada following the federal government’s cancellation of the Native Communications Programme in 1990. What I want to suggest here is that when the state terminates or curtails funding for indigenous media, they are forced to engage even more fully with a competitive market-driven economy. Since minorities are relatively poor and unattractive targets for consumer goods and companies, the advertising support essential for effective, mass-circulation minority newspapers is missing. Therefore, as Demay (1993) has put it, in the Canadian context, the efforts to maintain indigenous press have been accompanied by continual ‘death chants’.

Fleras (1994: 280) argues ‘media dynamics cannot be divorced from the political and economic context that creates, sustains, and modifies media-minority relations.’ As indigenous peoples constitute minorities in demographic terms and are generally the most powerless and least integrated into socio-economic developments, many scholars have pointed out that indigenous press are mostly shoestring operations, short-lived, infrequent in publication, minimal in staff and resources and anything but profitable.
ventures. In the light of this, there is a need to examine more closely the economic factors that have reproduced these features.

On the other hand, the political economy perspective can also prove fruitful in unravelling the factors sustaining mainstream media coverage of ethnic minority affairs. Grenier (1992, 1994) examined representations of native peoples by the Montreal Gazette in Canada and suggested four theses- the audience thesis, the activity thesis, the organisational thesis, and the power structure thesis- in an attempt to explain the newspaper's negative coverage pattern. He proposes that the latter two possess particular force, arguing that the unfavourable portrayal of Native Canadian people in the news has to be understood in the context of the structured economic relations of the market and of newspaper organisations as business enterprise.

Consequently, the political economy approach to indigenous and mainstream media is useful because it is able to throw light on the forces shaping the survival of indigenous media and to illuminate the dynamics of (mis)representation by mainstream media.

2.5.3 Constructing Cultural Hegemony

Because the relations between indigenous peoples and the news media involve indigenous struggles, it is 'heuristically valuable to invoke Gramsci's concept of hegemony in which domination by any one group is not to be taken as a de facto accomplished reality from which an ideological supremacy is imposed upon a subjugated population' (Husband, 1986: 3).

Toland (1993: 10-11) argues that cultural hegemony, given its massive scale, "is bound to be uneven in the degree of legitimacy it commands and thereby leaves some room for "antagonistic" cultural expressions to develop. It is useful here to understand antagonistic as also meaning "alternative", "spontaneous", or "folkloric" cultural systems of values and beliefs developed by subordinate groups that seek to distinguish

---

8 See Fleras (1994), Murphy and Murphy (1981: 71-75) and Murphy (1982: 52), St Leger (1979), and Wilson II and Gutierrez (1985, 1995).
Chapter 2 Indigenous Peoples and the News Media

their perspectives from that of the dominant group.' In this conception, the process of constructing cultural hegemony allows minorities to win space for counter-hegemonic struggles.

According to Fairclough (1992: 92), hegemony operates through leadership as much as by domination, across the economic, political, cultural and ideological domains of a society. It is a focus of constant struggles around points of greatest instability between classes and blocs and across a broad front, which includes the institutions of civil society (education, trade unions, family, law, religion, and media).

Hall (1986: 8) argues that 'though Gramsci does not write about racism and does not specifically address those problems, his concepts may still be useful to us in our attempt to think through the adequacy of existing social theory paradigms in these areas.' He points out that hegemony is a very particular, historically specific, and temporary 'moment' in the life of a society. It represents a provisional degree of mastery over a whole series of different 'positions' at once.

Browne (1996: 9-10) also argues that 'hegemony' theory is useful in understanding indigenous media. He said the proponents of this theory believe media products and values are transmitted from one (often small, usually powerful) portion of society to society in general, thus making it difficult for alternative approaches to gain any toehold. The hegemony can be considered as evolutionary social change brought about through the interaction of numerous 'contesting groups'. So he said it should be helpful to explain the evolution of some of the indigenous media experiences.

Based upon the very brief discussion above, we can argue that the notion of cultural hegemony has important implications for the study of media-indigenous relations. In this context, indigenous battles for better mainstream coverage and for the access to media can be understood as counter-hegemonic struggles.

2.5.4 Racism and Ethnicity in the Media

Jakubowicz et al. (1994: 11) argue that in Australia, while there have been vigorous community debates about issues of race and ethnicity, most academic investigations of the media have neglected them. In contrast, in the northwestern
countries, especially in the USA and the UK, media and minority studies in recent years have looked long and hard at the issue of race in the media. Husband (1994: 14) contends that there is now a very considerable literature revealing the stereotypical and ideological representation of ethnic minorities in the mass media. Misrepresentation and underrepresentation, which were discussed earlier, have been the major targets of most criticisms. Studies tend to conceptualise 'race' as a social construct, as a matter of power relations rather than skin color or genes. For example, Pieterse (1995: 26) notes: 'It is not ethnicity, or "race" that governs imagery and discourse, but rather, the nature of the political relationship between peoples which causes a people to be viewed in a particular light' (emphasis in the original).

Teun A. Van Dijk (1991: 26) mobilises the term 'contemporary racism' (or modern racism) as the theoretical basis for his work, Racism and the Press. He defines it as more sophisticated and subtle than the traditional form, which is based upon cultural difference rather than on phenotypic 'race'. This general conception of 'modern racism' has gained wide currency and been deployed in the recent works of Robert Entman (1990, 1994) and Jack Lule (1995), among others. Van Dijk argues that modern racist ideology is enacted, sustained and reproduced in the mainstream media and that the role of the media in the reproduction of the racism is 'problem-oriented' rather than 'discipline-oriented' (1993a: 18). He does not operate within a pre-established paradigm or 'school' to describe and explain racism. Rather, he uses a multiperspectival approach.10

Fleras has recently presented research findings derived from studies conducted on the Canadian press, arguing that:

One rarely encounters blatant expressions of discrimination or explicit racial slurs in the mass media. Overt hostility and open discrimination are neither acceptable nor legal.

---
9 Roth (1994: 62) notes: 'Modern racism means racism is typically far more subtle, indirect and ostensibly nonracial now than before, especially in the U.S. case, during the full swing of the Civil Rights Movement. It was also termed as "symbolic racism" by John M. McConahay, David O. Sears and Donald Kinder who argue that Americans rationalise this new racism in terms of a commitment to traditional values.'

10 More discussion of media and racism will be given in Chapter 8.
Various human rights codes and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms prohibit discriminatory behaviour of any kind on the basis of race, colour, or national origin. Granted, there is reporting that verges on the openly racist.... Polite forms of discrimination are certainly in evidence, and may be reflected in refusal to hire or promote racial minorities in the workplace for one reason or another. The decision is not overtly discriminatory, but phrased in a manner consistent with abstract principles of justice, equality, or fair play (1994: 277).

Stuart Hall has explored the links between racism, ideology and the media. He argues that the media are especially important sites for the production, reproduction and transformation of ideologies. In Hall’s view, ‘ideologies “work” by constructing for their subjects positions of identification and knowledge which allow them to “utter” ideological truths as if they were their authentic authors’ (1995: 19). Hall then sets out to investigate the ‘chains of meaning’ and the ‘different ideological discourses’ in British racism. His approach is historical, which has drawn on a reservoir of racist imagery established in the course of slavery and Empire. Hall also introduces the concept of a ‘grammar of race’ in the media by which he means that the typical figures of the slave, the native, or the clown/entertainer can be worked and reworked in particular stories, in news, current affairs, fiction and comedy.

Solomos and Back (1996: 157-158) argue that in the history of European societies, racism is not viewed as an ideological hiatus, since it constitutes a key element in the history of modernity. The history of European expansion and colonialism is replete with attempts to produce visual images and cultural representations of the ‘other’. They argue that such attempts were an integral component of the history by which European societies came to conceptualise the ‘people without history’. It was in the late 19th and early 20th centuries that the powerful role of visual culture in reproducing images of race became most evident. In their expositions on media stereotyping of Britain’s black population, they reveal that there has been a shift in terms of media contents and representations of the blacks, but they emphasise that as these media discourses change, the historical continuities of these discourse are still maintained. For example, the media racism in post-war Britain, they argue, is characterised by two features: 1. the black presence is seen to have a racially corrosive effect on British culture; and 2. the race/cultural difference of black
people makes them incompatible with the British way of life (Ibid.: 184). Therefore, they argue that it is necessary to understand the media racism in its historical moment.

The issue of racism and ethnicity in the media needs to be contextualised in a wider historical and social context and carefully reassessed in devising a theoretical framework for studying media-indigenous relations.

2.5.5 Indigenous Movements and Media

Last but by no means least, in mapping out a blueprint for a theoretical framework, we need to take full account of the historical relations between indigenous news media and movements. Riggins (1992:12) argues that apart from the state, social movements provide the major ‘external structural support’ for ethnic minority media.

As recent research has shown, indigenous media are often born out of a crisis. Wilson II and Gutierrez (1995: 177-195), for example, have demonstrated that the first newspapers of Latino, Black, Native American and Asian American in the U.S. ‘appeared at a time when the mainstream media were playing an active role in ridiculing and disparaging members of that group.’ And Keith (1995:17) adds that the American Indian Movement (AIM) contributed significantly to a growing appreciation by Native Americans of the power of the media, through the coverage given to actions such as the AIM’s takeover of Alcatraz in 1969 and their seizure of Wounded Knee, South Dakota in 1972. He (1995: 18) cites AIM leader, Vernon Bellecourt, as claiming that ‘AIM helped create the environment in which Native

---

11 The emergence of indigenous media is deeply intertwined with the development of indigenous movement which will be discussed in Chapter 9.

12 Schaefer (1988: 200-201) notes that AIM came into existence as a result of the ‘pan-Indianism’ which refers to intertribal social movements in the US dating back to the late 1960s. AIM was founded in Minnesota in 1968 by Clyde Bellecourt (of the White Earth Chippewa) and Dennis Banks (of the Pine Ridge Oglala Sioux). Its objectives include exposing treaty violations and reformulation of the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA). In protest, members briefly took over the Washington D.C. office of the BIA in 1972, and have since illegally occupied several Indian historical sites and battlefields.
electronic media could happen. It brought about the reawakening that was necessary for this step to be possible.'

The close historical relations between indigenous news media and movements in the U.S. parallels, to great extent, the development of the Taiwan indigenous press in the 1980s, which will be discussed in more detail in Chapter nine of this thesis.

Finally, it is important to remember that as the demographic, political, cultural and socio-economic characteristics of Fourth World peoples are widely divergent in different countries, and there are marked differences in historical experience and state policies, it is virtually impossible to devise a universal theoretical framework. Therefore, it may be better to examine the relations between indigenous peoples and the media case by case and, where applicable, to take the five ‘crucial elements’ as a starting point.

As Riggins succinctly observes:

It is important to take into consideration the characteristics of ethnic minorities: the absolute and relative numbers of the ethnic minority population, the degree of homogeneity and self-organisation, whether it is a literate or oral culture, the degree of assimilation and integration that the minority has achieved or the repression and persecution it has experienced, the degree of self-sufficiency or dependence on external assistance, and the degree of self-reliance with respect to financing, administering and handling the technological components of the media (1992: 16).

In addition, he (1992: 16) suggests that other variables that condition the emergence and evolution of ethnic minority media should also be considered, such as the political structure and prevailing ideology of the state as well as the international context of ethnic minority’s empowerment. The five ‘crucial elements’ proposed above are suggestive, if not exhaustive, hints in understanding the dynamic mechanism between the indigenous peoples and the news media. They are not ‘theories’ but can serve as the useful blueprints. Now we shall turn to discuss the concept of self-determination and indigenous media from indigenous struggles’ perspective.
2.6 Self-Determination and Indigenous Media

Why is ‘self-determination’ so important that it needs to open a section in this chapter? Cassidy’s following observation may be helpful in answering this question:

Self-determination, sovereignty, and self-government are for some people dry and ultimately meaningless terms. For others, they are misleadingly loud bullets in the arsenal of rhetoric. Upon occasion, they can be terms which represent great emotion and deep aspiration. This is particularly so when a people are struggling, as the First Nations in Canada are, to assert their independence and identity, to become more self-sufficient and to gain freedom (Cassidy, 1991:1).

Brysk (1994: 33) has argued that ‘the diverse needs of a pan-American movement eventually coalesced around the concepts of self-determination,’ and the assertion of ‘self-determination’, despite the disagreements over its political definition, has expanded into a cultural struggle. In order to understand contemporary indigenous struggles, we need to explore the meaning of self-determination for indigenous peoples, because as a counter-discourse, it is so resounding in the Fourth World studies that it can encapsulate all aspects of their cultural struggles. I would argue that in this context, the existence of indigenous media and their struggles to survive and operate can be seen as a path for achieving indigenous self-determination.

Van Cott (1994: 13) argues that since their emergence in the 1970s, indigenous organisations have consistently framed their demands in terms of self-determination, recognising that this claim has a basis in international law. However, there has also been considerable disagreement over what ‘self-determination’ means. As Mascarenas in his doctoral thesis points out:

A major obstacle in discussing self-determination is definitional. To US politicians this term meant allowing Indian involvement, participation and direction of certain service programmes initiated by government. To Indians it means the right to freely determine their political status, and to freely pursue their economic, social and cultural development (1991: 105).

At present, most nation-states view strong claims to self-determination as challenges to their sovereignty. This stance was clearly expressed in the United Nations Working Group meeting in August 1993, where the majority of government representatives expressed reservations about including a right to self-determination in the draft Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (Van Cott, 1994: 13). Dodson (1994: 69) argues that 'self-determination' is held to be the most fundamental right of indigenous peoples, but it is not accepted as a right in international law by these states.

However, in recent years there has more openness and accommodation in particular nation-state's understandings of indigenous 'self-determination'. For example, the Australian government tends to conceive of it as more related with preservation of culture, distinct identity and language, together with a power to take decisions over their own affairs. In this context, it holds that indigenous peoples do not have a right of secession, although they do have a right of self-determination. Consequently, 'self-determination' should not be equated with the 'secession' from a nation-state.

In the same vein, Wilmer (1993: 169) argues that the exercise of the right to self-determination does not necessarily lead to secession. He elaborates on the struggles for self-determination as saying:

"The denial of indigenous peoples' self-determination represents the unfinished business of decolonisation....Indigenous nations of the Fourth World share some of the perspectives of the Third World, yet their marginalisation is a step beyond in that they have not yet benefited from the international principle of self-determination that both the Third World and now Second World nation-states enjoy (Ibid.: 5-6)."

As we will see later, opposition to this continuing exclusion and colonisation is central to the rhetoric of indigenous self-determination, and the establishment of

---

14 This source is taken from an Internet document 'Consideration of A Draft for “United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples”: Self-Determination-The Australian Position'. It is provided by the Centre for World Indigenous Studies, which can be downloaded from the Netsite—http://www.halcyon.com/FWDP/cwiscat.html.
autonomous indigenous media is vital to this cultural struggle. More recently, 'self-determination' has been forcefully articulated and manifested in terms of the indigenous access to and ownership of the media. As the media today have become a 'contested site' for indigenous peoples, struggles center not only on the meaning of news texts and the conditions of access to mainstream media, but also around the ownership of media. Many scholars, especially indigenous media critics and theorists,\(^{15}\) have stressed the particular importance of indigenous media to indigenous peoples. Riggins underlines the symbolic significance of the ethnic minority media, arguing that possession of the means of media production could be seen as a public validation of a minority's sophistication or modernity, and that it may contribute to a determination to resist assimilation (1992: 284).

Gross (1995:68) notes: 'The ultimate expression of independence for a minority audience struggling to free itself from the dominant culture's hegemony is to become the creators and not merely the consumers of media images.' Fleras (1994:270) extends this point, claiming that aboriginal media is a space for Aboriginal peoples to reclaim identities and to explore lived-in experience. Similarly, Langton (1993: 10) celebrates aboriginal access and ownership of media as making it possible 'to control the means of production and to make our own self-representation' (emphasis mine).

Molnar (1995: 171) points out that the accessibility and relative cheapness of radio and video have meant that Aborigines and Islanders in Australia can now control their own information agenda. She asserts that this is crucial, 'for regardless of how sympathetic some of the mainstream media may be to indigenous issues, indigenous control is essential for self-determination' (emphasis mine).

'Self-determination' then has become a general characterisation covering all aspects of indigenous struggles. In this context, the very act of establishing indigenous (-owned) media can be considered a form of self-determination. For example, Daley and James (1986), in their studies of the native press in Alaska, claim that the

\(^{15}\) Those who are especially interested in indigenous media research include: Faye Ginsburg, Marc Grenier, Andrew Jakubowicz et al., Marcia Langton, Michael Medawars, Eric Michaels, Helen Molnar, James and Sharon Murphy, Stephen H Riggins, Gail G. Valaskakis, Mary Ann Weston, among others. Their research has been mainly conducted in the USA, Australia, and Canada.
establishment of the *Tundra Times* by Alaska natives in the early 1960s represented 'a fundamental act of self-determination in response to technocratic hegemony, including white man's monopoly on the right to define reality both symbolically and materially (Ibid.: 13).'

In his doctoral thesis, Olson (1985: 186) proposes that indigenous mass media have been of vital importance in supporting Inuit (Eskimo) nationalism in Alaska and Sami nationalism in Sweden by promoting 'a struggle for self-determination, as did *Tundra Times* in the early days.'16 He argues (Ibid.: 225) that both Inuit and Samis are in a stronger position to oppose the dominant ideology of the state because they have access to their own media, which in turn contribute to their sense of ethnic nationalism and demands for devolution.

Likewise, Australian art critics Tony Fry and Ann-Marie Willis have welcomed Aboriginal media with a postmodern embrace, arguing that: '[Aboriginal] video trades on the assumption that its application and cultural production are a form of resistance. This is not because of its content, but rather because it is *occupied* as a cultural space' (emphasis original).17

In brief, establishing indigenous media can be understood as an important part of indigenous struggles for self-determination, which aims to control the means of symbolic production about their own affairs and to deliver a counter-thrust against the assimilationist and hegemonic discourses of the nation-state.

16 The first issue of the *Tundra Times* was on 1 October, 1962. Olson (1985: 89) notes: "Through its role as an outspoken "pipeline" of indigenous information, the *Tundra Times* was of preeminent importance in the gestation of Eskimo sovereignty."

2.7 Questions of Identity and Indigenous Media

One of the most important debates about race and ethnicity in the last decade has been the rediscovery of ethnicity. It is mainly articulated by writers influenced by postmodernism and post-colonial cultural theory. The principal thrust of their arguments is that human identity does not possess a fixed, permanent or essential quality. Solomos and Back (1996: 17) argue that a number of recent developments have meant that the neo-Marxist critiques of the early 1980s have not been able to cope with the complexities of theorising racism in the 1990s. The first of these is the crisis within Marxism itself. In this context, some have called for a radical revision of class analysis in order to incorporate political movements which mobilise around forms of identity other than class.

In this 'new cultural politics of difference' [Cornel West's phrase], new perspectives have been developed and new syncretic cultures have been fermented within the global networks of the African and Asian diaspora. Hall is one of the leading figures in enunciating the new theorisations of race and ethnicity. Writing from the perspective of cultural theory and postcolonial theory, Hall has argued forcefully that notions of 'ethnicity' and 'cultural identity' are meaningful in the present socio-political environment. Within this context or this 'new ethnicities' framework, there are no essential racial, ethnic national identities outside the social, political and historical processes which shape understandings of what race and ethnicity mean in particular societies (Ibid.: 20).

According to Hall (1992: 275-278), there are three types of conception of identity—the **enlightenment subject**, the **sociological subject**, and the **postmodern subject**. It is the latter that has the immense effects on recent debates on race and ethnicity. It is 'de-centering the subject', which is the rejection of the notion of a unified identity that can be justified in terms of a biological or cultural essence. In this sense, Hall suggests a model of the human subject which allows for the occupation of a range of identities at different times (Solomos and Back, 1996: 133).

For Hall, as for others, cultural identities are always constructed through memory, fantasy, narrative, and myth. They are the points of identification, constituted within the discourses of history and culture. Hall (1992: 280) argues that there can be no
single identity and no overarching 'master identity' since identity shifts according to how the subject is addressed or represented. So, identity, to Hall, is never complete, always in process and always constituted within representation. Consequently, the politics of identity is a constant process of negotiation and 'translation'.

The new cultural politics, according to Hall, engages rather than suppresses differences and depends, in part, on the cultural construction of new ethnic identities. 'New ethnicities' are produced in part through a productive tension between global and local influences, which avoid the tendency to define ethnicity in primordial ways and acknowledges local and translocal nature of these identities. Thus, 'new ethnicities' open a range of issues that are related to the way notions of authenticity and belonging are defined within racist and absolutist conceptions of culture (Solomos and Back, 1996: 137).

However, these new theorisations on race and ethnicity revolving around notions of cultural identities, diaspora, and hybridity have been subject to criticisms in recent years. The tendrils of these debates have been extended to a reexamination of the postcolonial writings. Since the publication of Edward Said's Orientalism in 1978, there has been a stream of literature on postcolonialism, strongly influenced by post-structuralism and deconstruction, specifically the break from essentialism and dichotomic thinking or binarism (Pieterse and Parekh, 1995: 13). The initiators of this 'postcolonial enterprise' have mostly been third-world diasporic intellectuals, working within the American/British academies.

Shohat and Stam describe the principal thrust of postcolonial theory in this way:

Postcolonial theory, in so far as it addresses complex, multilayered identities, has proliferated in terms having to do with cultural mixing: religious (syncretism); biological (hybridity); human-genetic (mestizaje); and linguistic (creolisation). The word "syncretism" in postcolonial writing calls attention to the multiple identities generated by the geographical displacements characteristic of the post-independence era, and presupposes a theoretical framework, influenced by anti-essentialist

---

18 According to Hall (1992: 309), globalisation has two effects on identity: one is tradition and the other is translation. 'Tradition' attempts to restore purity and recover the unities and certainties which are felt as being lost. Others accept that identity is subject to the play of history, politics, representation and differences, so that they are unlikely ever again to be unitary or 'pure'; and consequently gravitate towards 'translation'.

40
poststructuralism, that refuses to police identity along purist lines. It is largely diasporic intellectuals, hybrids themselves (not coincidentally), who have elaborated this hybrid framework (1994: 41).

In terms of representation and the question of the other, postcolonial theory deals very effectively with the cultural contradictions generated by the global circulation of peoples and cultural goods in a mediated and interconnected world, resulting in a kind of commodified or mass-mediated syncretism. While reacting strongly against the colonialist mania for purity, contemporary hybridity theory also counterposes itself to the overly rigid lines of identity drawn by Third World discourse. This has led Chen (1996: 51) to critique the postcolonial enterprise as an 'Anglo-American academic product'.

Also, Saba has offered her criticism recently on the notion of 'cultural hybridity' in cultural and postcolonial writings, arguing that: 'While arguments (by Hall, Rushdie, Bhabha, etc.) for the merits of hybridity are understandable in light of appeals to essentialist notions of racial/ethnic identity, their celebratory nature seems dismissive of political struggles' (Saba, 1996: 9). She said: 'The success of socio-political movements against cultural and political assimilation is often critically dependent on the ability of a group to mobilise on the basis of a shared past and historical identity-fragmented as it may be' (Ibid.).

Saba elaborates on her criticism on the 'dismissal of political struggles in notions of 'hybridity'' further:

Hall's (and others') analysis also seems to ignore how mobility and displacement are characteristics of modern political power that have, more often than not, resulted in forced assimilation, political co-optation, destruction of linguistic and cultural heritages, as well as internalised prejudice among communities undergoing hybridisation... Native Americans and Palestinian histories are further illustrations of the same point (Saba, 1996: 10).

The strictures are echoed by other scholars critical of postcolonial theorising. Shohat and Stam (1994: 39), for example, argue that: 'While "colonialism" and "neocolonialism" imply both oppression and the possibility of resistance, "postcolonial"
posits no clear domination and calls for no clear opposition. This structured ambivalence, while appealing in a post-structuralist academic context, also makes "postcolonial" a fragile instrument for critiquing the unequal distribution of global power and resources." In addition, Chen contends (1996: 54) that: 'To utter the arrival of a postcolonial universe is, in effect, speaking from a privileged hegemonic space and from specific geo-political locations, and escapes the question of power and subordination on different levels.'

The purpose of briefly reviewing debates about cultural identities and postcolonial discourses here, is to serve as a prelude to my later discussion of the question of 'indigenous identity' and 'indigenous media'. To begin with, the persistence of political and cultural struggles waged by Fourth World peoples for collective identity as an 'indigenous peoples' do not fit easily with contemporary post-theories, such as postmodernisms or postcolonialism. In my view, indigenous identity politics produces a space that is used to strengthen a unified pan-aboriginal identity, which still largely remains in the domain of what Hall characterises as 'tradition', rather than 'translation'. This inevitably generates an uneasy tension with the mediating, fluid, contradictory, ambivalent, fragmentary, diversified and constituted constructions of identity politics.

Nagel's (1994: 948) account of the politics and the resurgence of American Indian identity is a case in point. She argues that the 'Red power' Indian political activist movement of the 1960s and 1970s started a wave of 'ethnic renewal' that surged across reservations and urban Indian communities, instilling ethnic pride and encouraging individuals to claim and assert their 'Indianness'. She goes on to argue that the federal Indian policy of 'termination', coupled with American ethnic politics (civil rights movement) and American Indian political activism were integral to raising American Indian ethnic consciousness and encouraging individuals to claim or reclaim

---

19 Roughly speaking, in postmodernism, there is no such a thing as 'identity' out there because it is disappearing, whereas in postcolonial theory a mixture of unstable, fragmentary and hybrid identities abound in societies characterised by dislocation, diaspora, discontinuities and disjunctions.
their Native American ancestry, culminating in the emergence of pan-Indian identity (Ibid.: 947, 954-955).\(^{20}\)

Sullivan (1995: 44) offers an insightful observation on Maori tribal identity, arguing that 'Tribal identity has enabled Maori to survive as a distinct and separate people in spite of the assimilation practices of previous governments and in spite of the loss of their land which is the very essence of Maori identity.' In the special issue of Cultural Studies on First Peoples, Bennett and Blundell meditate more generally on 'indigeneity' in this way:

'Indigeneity' which, reflecting a territorial groundedness rather than diasporic dispersion, both preceed and stubbornly refuse engulfment in a singular nationalised imaginary. And it is for these reasons that First Peoples' cultural struggles in these societies have resisted assimilation within the identity politics of multiculturalism; partly because the issues at stake in the politics of culture and identity are different in kind where relations of 'indigeneity' are concerned from those which characterise the multicultural pluralising of diverse diasporic relations and identities; and partly because, for First Peoples, questions of culture and identity are always inextricably caught up with questions of self-determination and with questions of land (1995: 2, emphasis mine).

They suggest that in Cultural Studies, the cultural forms and relations of 'indigeneity' be accorded more attention, arguing that First Peoples' struggles require 'an organised and focused engagement with the bureaucratic mechanisms of government' (Ibid.: 8).

Shohat and Stam also offer insightful comments on the contradictions between indigenous and postcolonial discourses:

The cases of the kayapo and the Borroloola throw into the sharp focus some of the theoretical ambiguities of the currently fashionable term 'postcoloniality.' While Fourth World peoples emphasise an indigenising discourse of territorial claims, symbiotic links to nature, and active resistance to colonial incursions, postcolonial thought stresses deterrioralisation, the constructed nature of nationalism and national borders, and the obsolescence of anticolonialist discourse (1994: 38).

\(^{20}\) As we shall see in Chapter 3, Taiwanese indigenous peoples have also undergone a parallel 'ethnic renewal' in the context of Taiwan's nationalism debate.
Following this line of argument, I want to stress that work around indigenous identity is a necessary alternative to the emphasis on hybridity in postcolonial theories. Morris (1982: 129) has pointed out ‘contemporary Native American discourse remains little known, little understood and little appreciated.’ It is certainly different from the constructions promoted by postcolonial discourse on ethnic minorities. For example, Jones (1994: 105) argues ‘While the marginality of many post-colonial ethnic minorities is characterised by diaspora, by a perpetual ‘immigrant’ status, the Maori people of Aotearoa inscribe their identity in the land as Tangata Whenua—the people of the land.’ So in my view, native discourse is more likely to revolve around notions of ‘indigeneity’ than of ‘displacement’ or ‘diaspora’.

As Vine Deloria, a well-known native American writer of the Lakota tribe and author of *Custer Died for Your Sins* (1969) has pointed out: ‘America’s refusal to give up its long-standing misconceptions of Indian identity is the greatest barrier to the solution of the problems of the Indians. *Indian land is the sine qua non of Indian identity and spiritual life*, but the dominant society is unable to understand the uncommodiflable value that native peoples place on their land’ (emphasis mine). 21

In re-asserting the importance of pan-aboriginal identity or ‘indigeneity’, I am not proposing that there is an *authentic* indigenous identity ‘out there’. At the same time I do want to stress that it is misleading to interpret the relatively *centripetal* and *collective* nature of pan-aboriginal identity in the terms usually proposed by cultural identity theories. It is also morally problematic to explain the ongoing struggles of indigenous peoples against the assimilationist and hegemonic practices of the nation-state, through the lens of ‘depoliticised’ postcolonial perspectives. While making this statement, I am keenly aware of the fact that indigenous identities, though relatively centripetal and collective in character, have also emerged from a fluid set of historically diverse experiences and political struggles. Indeed, pan-aboriginal identity is itself a historical construction derived from many years of indigenous struggles. As Jakubowicz (1994: 34) points out, ‘Much of the history of Aboriginal and Torres Strait

---

21 Cited from *Yellow bird* (1994: 13).
Islander survival in Australia over the past 200 years has been the story of cultural resistance--struggles to sustain a sense of specific (localised) Aboriginal identity.'

Using the above debate on cultural identities as a point of departure, we will now turn to discuss the constructions of indigenous media and identities. Jakubowicz points out (1994: 35): 'The assertion of Aboriginal identities in contemporary Australia is greatly strengthened by Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander control of their own media, and the inclusion of Aboriginal programming in various other community outlets...For aborigines, identity, community and survival are indeed closely linked to the way the media operates.'

Riggins (1992: 278) argues that ethnic minority media provide information that prevents, or at least delays, the assimilation of their audiences to mainstream culture. However, he also concedes that there is much content that would appear to promote assimilation. He therefore concludes that it would be simplistic to conceptualise content as a unified whole that lends itself to only one interpretation, noting that: 'One would expect to find in mainstream commercial media both a dominant ideology, information consistent with the interests of an elite, and traces of a counterideology, information opposing elite interests....Both ideologies also characterise ethnic minority journalism' (Ibid.: 277).

'Indigenous media' are defined by Shohat and Stam (1994: 35) as 'an empowering vehicle for communities struggling against geographical displacement, ecological deteriorations, and cultural annihilation.' They cite the Kayapo people in central Brazil as an example, detailing how they have used video 'to record their own traditional ceremonies, demonstrations and encounters with officials (so as to have the equivalent of a legal transcript). They have documented their traditional knowledge of the forest environment and plan to record the transmission of myths and oral history' (Ibid.: 36).

Ginsburg\textsuperscript{22} (1992: 369) argues that indigenous media are not about recreating a preexistent and untroubled cultural identity already 'out there', but exemplifying 'the

\textsuperscript{22} Faye Ginsburg is an associate professor of anthropology at New York University, where she is Director of the Graduate Programme in Culture and Media and Director of the Rockefeller Centre for Media, Culture and History.
construction of contemporary identity of Fourth World people in the 20th century, in which historical and cultural ruptures are addressed' (Ibid.: 370).

Arguing for a 'discursive space' for indigenous media that respects and understands the work on its own terms, Ginsburg (1995: 122) notes that: 'In line with such theories of cultural production, indigenous media can be understood as part of a powerful new process in the construction of contemporary and future indigenous identities.' However, she commented that indigenous people are faced with a 'Faustian dilemma' when possessing their own media. On the one hand, they are finding new ways of expressing indigenous identity and gaining access to film and video to serve their own needs. On the other hand, the spread of communications technology threatens to be a final assault on pre-existing culture, language, imagery, and on the relationship between generations.

So in Ginsburg's view, indigenous media are full of contradictions not only in programming and their identity constructions but in their future development.23 Apparently, she is influenced by the cultural and postcolonial theories, that has led to the depoliticisation and decontextualisation of the political and cultural struggles of indigenous peoples, who have been fighting for the possession of their own media and reaffirmation of their identities.

Above all, rather than arguing that indigenous media have created new discursive space where contemporary and future indigenous identities have been constructed, I would argue there is a special need to celebrate the survival of indigenous media under the cultural politics of the Fourth World. They can also be used to promote cultural and educational purposes for indigenous peoples.24

---

23 According to Ginsburg (1993: 569), while Imparja is the only large-scale commercial television station owned by Australian aboriginal people, only 10 percent of the television staff is aboriginal. Other aboriginal people have also complained of the short air time for aboriginal programming.

24 Browne (1996: 6) argues: 'The present-day majority owes much to, and has much to learn from indigenous peoples. The indigenous media can help that educational process. They can also help present generations of indigenous peoples to rediscover their pasts, as well as to learn of their present-day achievements.'
Summarising the discussion above, it can be argued that indigenous identities are characterised more by their centripetal and collective orientations than by displacement and diaspora, and that in recent years there has been a constant process of ethnic renewal and a gathering movement towards a 'pan-aboriginal identity', which provides a site for the contestation of dominant and colonialist discourse and hegemony. Indigenous media play a key role in shaping and constructing the identity of Fourth World peoples by embodying indigenous cultural struggles and symbolising their fight for self-determination.

2.8 Concluding Remarks

This chapter has attempted to map out a possible framework for studying the complex and dynamic power relations between indigenous peoples and news media. Drawing insights from across the range of media-minority research, but particularly those related to indigenous peoples, I have placed particular emphasis on three major dimensions—representation, access, and self-determination. The first addresses the news coverage of ethnoracial minorities by the mainstream media, the second discovers their hiring practices, and the third explores the cultural struggles of indigenous peoples. Research has shown that in recent years the media's treatment of ethnoracial minorities in terms of both coverage and hiring practices has become more self-conscious and relatively positive than before, but as argued by many scholars, it is still far from ideal. I have also argued that we need to explore the ways in which the voice of indigenous peoples makes itself heard through the mobilisation of media in indigenous struggles.

However, instead of formulating a theoretical 'master narrative' which I regard as an impossible goal, this chapter has proposed a 'multiperspectival' approach to understanding the dynamic and shifting power relations of indigenous peoples and the news media. I have suggested that there are five crucial elements that need to be considered. They are:
1. That the role of the state in fostering indigenous media can not be overemphasised.
2. That the relations between indigenous peoples and the media need to be anchored in a political economy perspective.
3. That the notion of cultural hegemony can make a useful contribution.
4. That the issues of racism and ethnicity in the media have to be fully explored.
5. That the development of indigenous media is closely related to indigenous movements and resistances.

Most importantly, I have suggested that any account will be incomplete if the 'bottom-up' struggle of indigenous media is not taken fully into account. As asserted by a number of indigenous media scholars who have linked their studies to the cultural struggles of the indigenous peoples, this point needs to be reiterated that the symbolic significance of indigenous struggles for self-determination is of fundamental importance in understanding the cultural struggles of Fourth World peoples and their ongoing fight for access to the means of symbolic production. For indigenous peoples, the media today have become 'contested sites' in terms of news texts, access and ownership.

Although 'cultural hybridity' theories are clearly relevant in the contemporary world of globalisation, I have argued indigenous identities are characterised more by centripetal and collective orientations than by displacement and diaspora. Indeed, there has been a constant movement toward a pan-aboriginal identity in recent years, which creates a major site on which to contest dominant and colonialist discourse and hegemony in the 'not yet post-colonial era'. Nevertheless, it has to be noted here that to assert the importance of pan-aboriginal identity or 'indigeneity' does not necessarily imply that there is an authentic indigenous identity 'out there'. These are completely different issues. Indigenous discourses, especially the counter-discourses of aboriginal rights and self-determination, are themselves historical and political constructions.

In opposition to Ginsburg's conception of indigenous media as a hybrid product, I have argued that there is ample evidence to provide an alternative to her argument in terms of understanding the indigenous media. In view of indigenous peoples' painful
experiences of struggling to own their own media, there is a particular need to stress the importance of these media as vehicles of self-determination. In the cultural politics of the Fourth World peoples today, it is indispensable to take these struggles into serious account in formulating a theoretical framework for understanding indigenous peoples' relations to the news media more fully.
Chapter Three
Indigenous Struggles in Taiwan

3.1 Introduction: The History and Population of Taiwan

Taiwan had been inhabited by indigenous peoples for many millennia before it began its 'modern' history of Han Chinese settlement and western colonialism in the 17th century. The history of Taiwan can be divided into five stages:

1. Early aboriginal history (Prehistory to the 1620s)
2. Western colonialism (1624-1662)
3. Early Han Chinese Settlement (late Ming and Ching dynasties, 1662-1895)
4. Japanese colonialism (1895-1945)
5. Republic of China on Taiwan (1945 to the present)

During the immensely-long period of early aboriginal history, indigenous peoples operated within an economy based on hunting, fishing and gathering for subsistence.

---

1. Taiwan, an island about 160 kilometers off the southeast coast of mainland China, has an area of 35,834 square kilometers (13,836 square miles).
2. Han is a term which refers to the Chinese race. It is used by the Chinese to distinguish them from the other 55 minorities in China, such as Mongols and Tibetans. In this sense, both the Mainlanders and Taiwanese in Taiwan are Han. According to The Republic of China Yearbook 1994 (p.26), members of the ethnic majority group in China have for most of the Christian era traditionally referred to themselves as the Han race. This may well be because of the relatively long period of social, political, economic and military consolidation and stability enjoyed by the Chinese nation during the Han dynasty (206 B.C.- 221 A.D.).
3. If we view the history from an indigenous perspective, even Han Chinese rule over Taiwan from the mid-17th century until the present can be considered as colonialism. However, this indigenous view of Taiwan's history may arouse disagreement and criticism from Chinese historians.
They were self-sufficient and able to care for their own needs. In 1517 Portuguese vessels en route to Japan caught sight of Taiwan and exclaimed 'Ilha Formosa' (beautiful island), giving Taiwan its alternative name of 'Formosa'. This sighting set the modern history of colonisation in motion. The Portuguese navigators, who were the first to reach the Orient, did not lay claim to Taiwan however, nor did they try to colonise it. As western expansion was consolidated, the island gradually became a way station between the East Indies and Japan as the Portuguese, Dutch, Spanish and English developed trade ties in the Far East.

Dutch conquerors came to the island in 1624, followed in 1626 by the Spanish who were themselves driven out by the Dutch in 1641. During the 38 years of Dutch rule in Taiwan, Dutch administrators encouraged sugar production by importing Chinese labor and converted the plains aborigines to Christianity. Meanwhile, on the mainland of China, the Ming dynasty was overthrown by the Manchus in 1644 who established the Ching dynasty. A Ming general, Cheng Cheng-kung (also known as Koxinga) established a foothold in Taiwan in 1661 which he hoped to use as a base for restoring the Ming dynasty. He launched an attack on the Dutch stronghold and after two years of fighting expelled the Dutch troops from the island. The Dutch surrender in 1662 was followed by a massive emigration of Ming loyalists to the island. The Manchus were unable to overthrow Cheng Cheng-kung and his followers and only asserted Manchu rule over Taiwan in 1683.

---

4 After 1636, when the Dutch colonisers began to encourage agriculture, especially the growing of sugar cane, more labours were needed to work in the plantations. Due to the fact that the aborigines were mainly hunters and fishermen, who sometimes supported themselves with the small-scale, primitive cultivation of rice, they were, as a whole, less familiar with agricultural farming than the Han immigrants. In order to ensure maximum exploitation of agricultural production, the Dutch sent their own ships across the Taiwan Straits to the mainland coast opposite to transport Chinese immigrants to Taiwan (See Vertente et al., 1991: 75).

5 The plains aborigines who had early contact with western colonisers and Han Chinese settlers were members of the Pingpu tribes who were mainly scattered on the western plains of Taiwan. Since most of them had already been assimilated by the 18th and 19th centuries, they are not included as an aboriginal tribe under the current aboriginal policy of Taiwan.
From 1683 to 1886 Taiwan was ruled as a part of the Fukien Province of China under the Ching dynasty. In 1886, Taiwan was accorded provincial status. But ten years later, the island became a casualty of the first Sino-Japanese War in 1895. Under the Treaty of Shimonoseki, China ceded Taiwan and the Pescadores islands to Japan, and Taiwan became Japan's first major colony. At the end of World War II in 1945, Taiwan, which had been occupied for three centuries successively by the Dutch, the Spanish, the Manchu Ching dynasty and the Japanese, was returned to the Nationalist Republic of China. In the wake of their defeat in the Chinese civil war, however, Nationalist army, civilians and government officers led by Chiang Kai-shek retreated to Taiwan in 1949, establishing the island as a frontier base from which they hope that one day nationalist troops would recover China from the Communists. However, by the late 1950s, when it was clear that there was little hope of ousting Mao from power, the Nationalist determined to defend and build Taiwan—'the last frontier base'—as the model province for all of China.

Over the past fifty years or so, the Republic of China on Taiwan has consistently enjoyed one of the highest rates of economic growth worldwide, while inflation has remained moderate compared with other countries. These economic achievements have classified Taiwan as one of the 'newly industrialised countries', and one of the 'four dragons' in east Asia. A number of factors have contributed to Taiwan's economic success. Among them; the long-term stability of cross-Straits relations with mainland China; the arrival of many skilled technicians from the Chinese mainland in the late 1940s; and the provision of substantial US aid which played an integral part in agricultural and industrial development and economic reconstruction in the early years.

---

6 1995 was the fifty year anniversary of Nationalist government's rule since Taiwan was retroceeded to the Nationalist in 1945. It is equivalent to the 50 years' Japanese occupation from 1895-1945.

7 In 1992, the economy in Taiwan grew at an average of 6.1 percent, down from 7.3 percent in 1991. The gross national product (GNP) for 1992 was US $211 billion, ranking 20th in the world, up from the previous year's US $180.3 billion, which ranked 21st worldwide. Per capita GNP rose from last year's US $8,815 to US $10,215 in 1992, ranking 25th in the world. In 1996, the per capita GNP was slightly over US $13,000. This figure shows that among Asian countries, Taiwan came after Japan, Hongkong and Singapore but ahead of Korea and other countries.
In Taiwan, people are commonly categorised according to their place of origin. The term ‘Mainlander’ refers to those who were born on the continent of China and came to Taiwan with Chiang Kai-shek in the late 1940s or early 1950s to escape from communism. In contrast, ‘Taiwanese’ is commonly used to denote those Han Chinese whose ancestors were the early Han Chinese settlers migrating to Taiwan during the 17th century. The term today mainly refers to two major Han Chinese groups: Fukiens and Hakkas. Fukien Taiwanese came mainly from the southern part of today’s Fukien province in China, and Hakka from Kwangtung province in southern China. When the Dutch arrived in 1624, about 30,000 Chinese settlers were already living on the island, but Han Chinese settlers did not begin to arrive in large numbers until the mid-17th century. Table 3.1 shows the distribution of ethnic groups in Taiwan today.

Table 3.1
Ethnic Groups in Taiwan Today

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Han Chinese</th>
<th>Non-Han Austronesians</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mainlanders</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fukien Taiwanese</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hakka Taiwanese</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous Peoples</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The percentage distribution of ethnic groups is derived from Lin and Lin, 1993: 104.

According to the Ministry of the Interior, the population of Taiwan numbered over 20,752,000 as of December 1992. It is estimated that approximately two million Chinese civilians and soldiers came with Chiang Kai-shek’s Nationalist government from mainland China in the late 1940s. At present, ‘Mainlanders’ or ‘late-comers’ account for about 14 percent of the total population, while ‘Taiwanese’ or ‘early-comers’ constitute the great bulk of the population with Fukiens accounting for roughly 74 percent. Taiwan’s indigenous peoples, who are widely considered by many Japanese and Chinese anthropologists as non-Han people, having relatively similar cultural and linguistic systems to the Austronesian groups, constitute approximately two percent of the total population.
3.2 Aboriginal Policy in Taiwan since 1945

Since 1945 when Taiwan was handed over to Chiang Kai-shek's Nationalist government following Japan's unconditional surrender in the Second World War, Taiwan has been a Han Chinese nation-state ruled by the Kuomintang (KMT), the Nationalist political party established by Sun Yat-sen. The KMT's aboriginal policy is based upon the Three Principles of the People and the parts of the national Constitution concerned with 'frontier minorities'. The ROC Constitution, which was originally enacted and promulgated by the national government in China in 1947, was brought to Taiwan by Chiang Kai-shek as the foundation for a national policy. Although Articles 168 and 169 provide various protections and special assistances to the 'various racial groups in the frontier regions,' this originally referred to the various minorities on the border regions of Nationalist China during the 1940s, such as the Mongols, Tibetans, Hui and Uighur. It is therefore still legally disputable whether the indigenous peoples in Taiwan can be included as a 'frontier group'. Consequently, the protection of indigenous rights in Taiwan is based more upon the spirit, rather than the letter of the Constitution. This has resulted in many temporary and provisional administrative measures and executive orders which can be 'terminated' when the living standards of indigenous peoples reach those of the Han Chinese.

Indigenous peoples in Taiwan used to be known collectively as 'Shanpao', which literally means 'mountain people', but they are now divided by the KMT government.

---

8 In 1923, Sun Yat-sen, delivered a series of lectures in Canton city, in China. These were later compiled into a book entitled The Three Principles of the People. The KMT adopted the ideals in this work as its basic approach to government and nation-building. The Three Principles take traditional Chinese culture as its foundation and uses Western political, economic, and social theories as the mortar and bricks to build on this foundation. The three tenets are the Principle of Nationalism, the Principle of Democracy, and the Principle of Social Well-being (or the Principle of the People's Livelihood). These become the backbone of the ROC Constitution. The Principle of Nationalism advocates not only equal and independent status for China in the community of nations, but also equality for all Chinese ethno-racial groups within the Chinese State (Government Information Office, 1994a: 139).
into 'Mountain Shanpao' and 'Plains Shanpao' for administrative purpose.\(^9\) There are currently nine major tribes that are officially recognised by the government: the Atayal, Paiwan, Bunun, Rukai, Yami (most of whom are mountain aborigines), and the Ami, Saisiyat, Puyuma and Tsou (most of whom are plains aborigines). Each tribe speaks different languages and has distinct cultures, traditions and customs. According to the Ministry of Interior, the total population of aboriginal people in 1991 was 345,274, accounting for approximately 1.7\% of the total population. Table 3.2 shows the demographic distribution of aboriginal tribes in Taiwan in 1991, and Figure 3.1 presents the geographical location of Taiwan indigenous tribal groups.\(^10\)

**Table 3.2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tribal groups</th>
<th>Atayal</th>
<th>Saisiyat</th>
<th>Bunun</th>
<th>Tsou</th>
<th>Paiwan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>population</td>
<td>81,800</td>
<td>3,939</td>
<td>37,922</td>
<td>6,192</td>
<td>62,110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent</td>
<td>23.69%</td>
<td>1.14%</td>
<td>10.98%</td>
<td>1.79%</td>
<td>17.99%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tribal groups</th>
<th>Rukai</th>
<th>Puyuma</th>
<th>Ami</th>
<th>Yami</th>
<th>Total population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>population</td>
<td>8,670</td>
<td>8,792</td>
<td>131,845</td>
<td>4,004</td>
<td>345,274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>percent</td>
<td>2.51%</td>
<td>2.55%</td>
<td>38.19%</td>
<td>1.16%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ministry of Interior (Cited from Chen, 1994: 31)

\(^9\) The terms 'Mountain Shanpao' and the 'Plains Shanpao' have been used by the government of the ROC on Taiwan since 1940s, with the former referring to those tribes who, during the Japanese occupation period (1895-1945), lived in the mountain areas and were recorded as 'mountain tribes' in their family books. The latter refers to those tribes who, during this period, lived in the plains area near the east coast of Taiwan and were recorded as 'plains (mountain) tribes' in their family books. This Japanese dualistic way of distinguishing aboriginal people was later adopted by the Chinese government which divided them into the aforementioned groups.

\(^10\) Taiwan indigenous peoples are scattered all over the island, mainly in the central mountain range and the east plains of Taiwan. Han Chinese mainly dwell in the vast west plains. With one of the top population density, Taiwan's different ethnic groups live and mix together. Due to Taiwan's economic development and urbanisation, nowadays, approximately over a quarter of indigenous peoples have migrated to the cities.
Figure 3.1
Geographical Distribution of Indigenous Tribal Groups in Taiwan
In Taiwan, the Ami are the largest of the nine aboriginal tribes, accounting for 38.19% of the total indigenous population, followed by the Atayal tribe at 23.69%; the Paiwan tribe at 17.99%; and the Bunun tribe at 10.98%. The population of the other tribes are no more than 3%. Of the population overall, 53.65% are male and 46.35% are female.

Because aboriginal peoples have been regarded as backward, primitive and disadvantaged compared with the Han Chinese, over the years many special measures have been taken to protect them and to assist them in keeping pace with mainstream Chinese society. In the early stages of aboriginal policy, many administrative measures were aimed particularly at mountain people who were living in the aboriginal townships. At that time, most governmental efforts aimed to accelerate the socio-economic development of aboriginal society. Later on, especially in the mid 1970s, aboriginal policy shifted to pay more attention to issues of cultural preservation and to the newly-emergent problems of urban aborigines. Although the aboriginal mountain townships and urban communities made substantial progress in socio-economic development, compared with the Han Chinese, they were still relatively underdeveloped. Therefore, from the late 1980s government policy shifted again to place more emphasis on social development projects aimed at 'modernising' aboriginal society and facilitating their integration with mainstream Han Chinese society.

The fundamental tenet of contemporary Han Chinese aboriginal policy in Taiwan then is assimilation through modernisation. This corresponds to the particular Chinese racial ideology that celebrates the cultural superiority of Han Chinese and denigrates non-Han minorities' cultures as primitive, backward, and uncivilised. The historical roots of this cultural sinocentrism (Han Chinese ethnocentrism) and the emphasis on assimilation can be traced back to Confucius' (551-479 B.C.) argument that: 'when the barbarian enters China (Chinese civilisation), he becomes Chinese.' Mencius (372-289 B.C.), the next most important thinker in the Confucian tradition, underlines this position, stating that: 'I have heard of men using the doctrines of our great land to change barbarians, but I have never heard of any being changed by barbarians.'

11 The term 'barbarian' refers to the Mongols, Manchus and the other non-Han minorities.
Kao (1993: 23-28) argued that the aboriginal policy in the past five decades can be divided into four stages:

1. Political integration period (1945–1950)
2. Assimilation (plainise\textsuperscript{12} the mountain aborigines) period (1951–1962)
4. Policy ambiguity period (1988–the present)

Although Kao argued that, at present, the aboriginal policy is ambiguous, it is important to note that there were two dramatic milestones in government's policy toward indigenous peoples during this period, especially in the 1990s. One is the unprecedented incorporation of indigenous rights in the Constitutional amendments in 1992. The government’s official recognition of indigenous peoples as ‘Yuanchumin’ (original inhabitants of Taiwan) was given in 1994 instead of the derogatory term—‘Shanpao’ (mountain people). The other is the KMT’s establishment of a new ‘Yuanchumin Commission’ for indigenous affairs in December 1996, which is tantamount to a ministry level in the central (federal) government of Taiwan. They are the encouraging signs of the recent turning point of aboriginal policy which should be duly recognised in evaluating the policies. Basically, this change in the government’s aboriginal policy is closely related to the ongoing political liberalisation and democratisation which were initiated in Taiwan in the late 1980s. This will be discussed later in this chapter.

\textsuperscript{12} Because most indigenous tribes lived in the mountains and in the east coast valley of Taiwan, while Han Chinese mainly settled in the plains, therefore, the term ‘to plainise’ the mountain aborigines means to ‘assimilate’ them into Han Chinese culture and ways of living.
3.3 Taiwan’s Indigenous Peoples Today

In this section, I will briefly describe the current state of Taiwan’s indigenous peoples in terms of major socio-economic characteristics, such as education, occupation, sources of income and political participation as an essential background to understanding their current social status in Taiwanese society.

To begin with, in terms of aboriginal education, according to the 1994 Yearbook, during Japanese occupation, only 19 aborigines graduated from middle school. In 1991 the figure exceeded 44,000 and more than 3,800 graduated from a university or technical college. A few also participated in master’s and doctorate programmes in foreign countries. But compared with Han Chinese education, aboriginal students, who receive higher education (university and college level), are considerably less than those of Han Chinese in 1985 and 1988. However from Table 3.3, we can see that approximately four times more non-indigenous Taiwanese receive higher education (10.6%) than either mountain (2.6%) or plains (2.3%) aborigines. Also, although over the years there has been a slight increase in terms of the absolute number of aboriginal recipients of higher education, compared with the Taiwan total, the gap has grown wider. This can be seen by comparing the 1985 and 1988’s figures in Table 3.3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>1985</th>
<th>1988</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mountain Aborigines</td>
<td>1.97%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plain Aborigines</td>
<td>2.07%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan Average</td>
<td>7.61%</td>
<td>10.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Hsu (1992:24-25)

As for the occupational distribution, in 1991 almost half (49.12%) of the aboriginal working population were engaged in ‘agriculture, forestry and fishery sectors’ and one third (33.64%) are employed in the ‘manufacturing, transportation and storage industries.’ The next most important areas of employment were the
‘service industries’ (6.79%); ‘professional workers and technicians’ (2.88%); and ‘supervisors and assistants’ (2.52%). Other sectors accounted for less than two percent each (see Table 3.4). In other words, the aboriginal population were evenly distributed across ‘agricultural’ and ‘non-agricultural’ industries. Most of those involved in the latter live in urban centres and are mainly employed in unskilled, low-paid, labor-intensive, and highly dangerous work, such as mining & quarrying, sea fishing, manufacturing, construction and transportation industries.  

Table 3.4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational Distribution of Aboriginal Peoples in Taiwan (1991)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional workers and technicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4,448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing, transportation and storage industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51,970</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.64%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Chen et al. (1994: 30)

Hsu (1992: 21) notes that since 1978 non-agricultural income has become the major source of income for both mountain and plains aborigines. Table 3.5 demonstrates that the average income of each household was 112.7 thousand New Taiwan Dollars for mountain aborigines, a figure only 37% of the national average in 1978. Although it had increased to 267.1 thousand in 1985, it remained almost the same proportion of the national average. As for the plains aborigines, the income distribution is not significantly different from that of mountain aborigines. In spite of

---

13 Chen et al. (1994: 30) finds ‘manufacturing, transportation and storage industries’ ranks the highest in Taiwan province (69.53%) for urban Yuanchumin.
the fact that the average household income for aboriginal people in 1985 is more than double than that of 1978, the ratio of aboriginal to national income is almost unchanged, that is, both aboriginal groups earned no more than 40% of the national average.

Table 3.5
Income Distribution of Aboriginal Household

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mountain Aborigines</th>
<th>Plains Aborigines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average household income</td>
<td>112.7</td>
<td>267.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural income (%)</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>27.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-agricultural income (%)</td>
<td>55.2</td>
<td>72.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal income</td>
<td>17.8</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National income (%)</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Cited from Hsu, 1992: 22.
Unit: Thousands (New Taiwan Dollars).

In addition, the fact that the non-agricultural income of aboriginal peoples has rapidly increased in the 1970s and 1980s is a clear sign of the decreasing importance of aboriginal hometown agriculture. The reason behind this shift in the income structure is two-fold. On the one hand, due to the galloping economic development in Taiwan in the 1960s, there has been a dramatic increase of aboriginal peoples, especially the younger generation, migrating to cities to sell their labor and integrate into the capitalistic market economy. On the other, affected by lack of labor, transportation

---

14 Plains aborigines started the urbanisation process earlier than mountain aborigines because of geographical location, land loss, economic decline in their hometowns.
and marketing problems as well as middleman's exploitation and price fluctuation, aboriginal hometown agriculture is virtually in a state of dependency. Most importantly, along with the entry of more capital and business into aboriginal townships, more aboriginal land has been sold or transferred to Han Chinese owners illegally.\(^\text{15}\) It is estimated that between 10 to 20 % of aboriginal land in the northern part of Taiwan has been transferred into Han Chinese hands. In some villages the figure is even higher.\(^\text{16}\) The loss of the land ownership (although strictly prohibited by the government) has deteriorated into an intractable situation, giving rise to many social problems and aboriginal protests in recent years.

Finally, we need to look briefly at the political participation of aboriginal peoples in mainstream politics. Aboriginal citizenship and suffrage rights can be traced back to 1950, the year when the government determined to empower local self-government in Taiwan. At present, six seats (3 seats for mountain aborigines and 3 for plains aborigines) are reserved for aboriginal representatives in the two chambers of Parliament, the Legislative Yuan and the National Assembly respectively. A quota of four seats is allocated in the Taiwan Provincial Assembly. In local councils, there are 51 aboriginal county councilmen, 30 representing aboriginal townships (one county council member representing each mountain aboriginal township) and 21 representing plains aboriginal constituencies. As for the executive leaders, since only the mountain aboriginal peoples are entitled to run for the post of aboriginal township leaders, there are 30 mountain aborigines who are the heads of these townships. It is important to note that in addition to the (affirmative) measures related to these public posts, legally speaking, aborigines are also entitled to elect or to be elected in contests for county magistrate,\(^\text{17}\) mayor and above.

\(^\text{15}\) The transfer of aboriginal land to non-aboriginal hands is strictly prohibited by the government and cannot be registered as a land transfer by the land authorities. However, private contracts between the buyer and the seller are widespread and are not easily curtailed by the authorities.

\(^\text{16}\) Cited from Hsu (1992: 23).

\(^\text{17}\) Of the 16 counties in Taiwan, one county magistrature (Taitung county in the southeastern part of Taiwan) was won by a Puyuma in 1994, a record-breaking achievement in aboriginal politics.
Table 3.6

Representation of Aboriginal Peoples in Public Posts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Representative Posts</th>
<th>Aboriginal Seats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legislative Yuan</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Assembly</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Assembly</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County Council</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive Posts</th>
<th>Aboriginal Seats</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>County Magistrate</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aboriginal Township leaders</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hsu Mu-chu who was asked to evaluate government's administrative measures toward aboriginal peoples, interprets aboriginal problems in his report in this way:

There has been substantial progress in economic and educational developments in aboriginal society in recent years, but owing to the integration of the aboriginal economy into the wider economic system, aboriginal society, which belongs to the periphery, theoretically speaking, finds it very difficult to keep up with the mainstream society in terms of the standard of economic development. Therefore, unless aboriginal society develops other resources or produces internal dynamic power for self-development, the aboriginal economy will be a long-term problem for the whole society. In contrast to Han mainstream society, the progress of aboriginal society is apparently in a relatively backward situation, especially in the areas of economy, education, health, etc. They are the major sources of their frustration, and their sense of 'relative deprivation' is being strengthened by the hopelessness of their political power (Hsu, 1992: 77).

How do indigenous peoples react to government's policy? It is interesting to note Chu's (1993) recent research where he found that more than half of aboriginal peoples are satisfied with government's aboriginal policy, with mountain aborigines recorded at 52.3% and plains aborigines at 60%. Nevertheless, this leaves approximately 40% of mountain aborigines and 33% of plains aborigines who are still not satisfied with the policy. In this research, he also found that the most serious social problems perceived
by mountain aborigines are in order: alcoholism (60%); employment (59%); education (52%); the economy (49%) and outgoing migration (47%). For plains aborigines, they are: employment (61%); outgoing migration (58%); education (55%); the economy (50%) and cultural preservation (42%).\textsuperscript{18} Although more aboriginal peoples are satisfied with aboriginal policy according to this research, the figures might have recently increased significantly in response to the two ‘milestones’ in aboriginal policies discussed above.

3.4 Taiwan’s Ethnic Politics and Cross-Straits Relations

Many political analysts have argued that there are two important political developments in Taiwan today that may exert a tremendous impact on the island’s future. One is the delicate state of cross-Straits relations with mainland China, the other is the continuing debate on nationalism. Taiwan’s economic growth was accompanied by social transformations, including the rapid growth of a middle class, greater Western influence,\textsuperscript{19} and by a series of political liberalisation programmes in the late 1980s. In July 1987 the Emergency Decree (the basis of martial law) was lifted. Four months later, Taiwan residents were allowed to visit their relatives on the Chinese mainland for family reunions. When Chiang Ching-kuo, the son of Chiang Kai-shek, died early in 1988, Lee Teng-hui, then the vice president, succeeded him to become the first Taiwanese President of the Republic. He subsequently assumed the leadership of the Kuomintang (KMT), thereby consolidating his political power. Lee’s leadership symbolised a peaceful transition of political power from Mainlander to Taiwanese. On May 1st, 1991, the National Assembly abolished the \textit{Temporary Provisions} \textsuperscript{20} and since

\textsuperscript{18} Hsu (1992:54).
\textsuperscript{19} Copper (1990: 30).
\textsuperscript{20} The \textit{Temporary Provisions Effective During the Period of Communist Rebellion} were adopted in 1948 to waive some provisions of the Constitution and to give the ruling Kuomintang more power.
then has added and amended the *Ten Additional Articles of the ROC Constitution.*\(^{21}\) On the same day, Lee announced the termination of 'the Period of Communist Rebellion,' moving from authoritarian to normal constitutional rule.\(^{22}\)

In recent years, especially after the passage of the constitutional amendments, Taiwan has witnessed unprecedented political reforms. In domestic politics, a vigorous programme of political democratisation has been implemented. For example, the KMT has for the first time in the Republic's history allowed direct elections for the Governor of the Taiwan Provincial Government in 1994. More significantly, the first direct vote election for President of the Republic was held on 23 March, 1996.

Since the late 1980s when Taiwan first embarked on a programme of political reforms, it has also experienced a powerful burgeoning of national consciousness. Over the years, more and more 'Mainlander' politicians under the wing of Chiang's family\(^{23}\) have been phased out of power politics, and their places taken by a young generation of mainly local-born 'Taiwanese' politicians. In Taiwan, traditionally, *Mainlanders* have tended to dominate political power, whereas the *Taiwanese* were mainly involved with finance and business. As Taiwan's democratisation has progressed, many public posts long been held by *Mainlanders* through political appointments, have become open to election. As Taiwanese are the majority group, more and more win elections and enter the political arena. In contemporary Taiwan, the series of political reforms, coupled with President Lee's influence, has ensured that political power is now largely controlled by *Taiwanese*. However, this has exacerbated the ethnic conflict between the two groups and deepened the division between *Mainlander* and *Taiwanese*. Although in recent years the government has made every effort to alleviate ethnic

---

\(^{21}\) Ten additional articles to the Constitution were adopted to provide a constitutional basis for the election of all central parliamentarians, and for the legislation that governs the development of relations between the two sides of the Taiwan Straits.


\(^{23}\) Here I refer to Chiang's family as the late presidents, Chiang Kai-shek and his son, Chiang Ching-Kuo.
divisions through measures such as abolishing the 'place of origin' column on ID cards and encouraging the *Taiwanisation*, the divide has continued to widen.

In the *quasi-international* arena, relations between the two sides of the Taiwan Straits over the past forty or so years can be roughly divided into three periods: military confrontation (1949-1978), peaceful enmity (1979-October 1987), and private-sector exchange (1987 to present). The Taiwan government's decision to allow Mainlanders to travel to family reunions on the Chinese mainland on Nov. 2, 1987 marked the turning point in cross-Straits relations. In October 1990, an advisory National Unification Council was instituted under the auspices of the Office of the President, and the *Guidelines for National Unification*, which outline the principles and steps to expedite the unification with China were issued. This eased relations across the Straits considerably. Between 1987 and 1992, Taiwan citizens made over four million trips to the mainland via a third country or territory, and mainland visitors to Taiwan registered nearly 37,000 trips. According to unofficial estimates, Taiwan businessmen invested as much as US $3 billion in the Chinese mainland during the same period. In 1992, trade conducted via Hong Kong amounted to US $7.4 billion.

Until now private trade and tourism between both sides have been conducted *indirectly*, i.e., they have to go through the third country, such as Hong Kong or Singapore. With Hong Kong being transferred to China in July 1997, a negotiation is currently under way to implement the *direct* trade by cargo shipping.

As relations between the two sides of the Taiwan Straits have thawed in recent years, there has been an increasing growth of postal, telecommunication, indirect trade links and private-sector contacts, such as family reunion, tourism, education, business

---

24 *Taiwanisation* is a process of encouraging the formation of a new Taiwanese identity mobilised by the government which was initiated in the 1980s. It is a policy programme that aims to encourage all peoples from the different ethnic groups to identify themselves as *Taiwanese* in a new and broad sense. However, it can also be defined as strengthening the political representation of the local-born Taiwanese elites to high-ranking government posts through political appointment.

25 Recently some Taiwanese scholars have argued that Taiwan's relations with China are one of *quasi-international* relations.


& trade, culture & art, and academic exchange programmes. Meanwhile, private-sector organisations are authorised to deal with the matters relating to the cross-straits relations, such as the Straits Exchange Foundation (SEF) in Taiwan and the Association for Relations Across the Strait (ARATS) in China.

In spite of the increasing private-sector contacts, however, political and governmental negotiations are still stuck in an ideological mire. The main source of difference lies in the fact that China insists that Taiwan is part of the PRC and therefore conceptualises its relation with the island as a matter of internal affairs. Taiwan, on the other hand, demands equal status as an autonomous government in its relations with the PRC. Moreover, it will not negotiate with the PRC over unification unless the latter gives up Communism and adopts a western democracy. In addition, there are other, more recent obstacles in the way of Taiwan's mainland relations. Firstly, Taiwan's efforts to win international recognition and the declared hope of joining the United Nations and regional international organisations, coupled with the first direct-vote Presidential election in March 1996 have been severely criticised by China as premeditated steps towards Taiwanese independence, which could justify military invasion by the PRC. Secondly, the newly-elected President, Lee Teng-hui's, mainland policy has been denounced by the PRC as ambiguous and more apparent than real, although he has repeatedly proclaimed the one China policy and stressed the unification theme in his speeches. His trip to Cornell University in USA, his alma mater, in June 1995 irritated China, planting the seeds for their recent military manoeuvres and missile test in the Taiwan Straits in March 1996. Thirdly, the KMT's declared goal of unification has been threatened by the growing Taiwan independence movement led by the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP), the largest opposition party in Taiwan.

Since the military manoeuvres in March 1996, relations between Taiwan and China have reached deadlock and the operations of the SEF and ARATS have come to

---

28 Lee Teng-hui was reelected in March 1996 for his second term as the President.
29 The Chinese military manoeuvres were deliberately set near the voting date (23 March, 1996) of Taiwan's first direct-vote Presidential election. It served two purposes for the PRC. One was to
a standstill. Arguably, Taiwan has now reached a crossroads, even a crisis, in national identity. At this moment, no one can be sure whether she is drifting towards eventual unification with China, or Taiwanese independence, or the current mixed, blurry and unpredictable status of unipendence (whereby the current status quo which has operated between unification and independence will be maintained).

3.5 Chinese Nationalism vs. Taiwanese Nationalism

The debate on nationalism in Taiwan is now at a crossroads because there has been a major dispute on the national identity issue and uncertainty about Taiwan's future. Wu (1993), who conducted research on public attitudes to the issue of unification in 1992, found that 66.6% of Taiwan's population endorsed unification with China and 21.3% were against, with the remaining 12.1% being undecided. The division was largely drawn on ethnic lines, with more Mainlanders than Taiwanese supporting unification.

Since January 1988 when Lee Teng-hui succeeded to the Presidency, he has been widely acclaimed for his efforts to promote Taiwanisation and democratisation and his advocacy of the idea of 'popular sovereignty'. However, he has also been castigated for not trying hard enough to curtail the fermenting distrust and animosity between Mainlanders and Taiwanese. Out of this situation two conflicting strands of identity have emerged, one Chinese, the other Taiwanese. Ger (1991: 123-134) argues that because Taiwanese and Mainlanders all came from China, they share a common background of Chinese history, culture, language, lineage, race and religions. 'Chinese identity' identifies them as first and foremost Chinese, based upon Han Chinese primordialism and constitutes a basic group identity. He traces the roots of this identity to the early phases of immigration (the Dutch and Koxinga periods), when immigrants held on to a strong belief that their ancestral homeland was rooted in China and argues damage Lee's reputation in the election, and the other was to send a clear warning signal that China will use military force should Taiwan pursue independence.
that it was only in the Ching dynasty that they started to have a strong feeling of settling down and taking root in Taiwan.

It is not until the February 28th Incident in 1947 that this Taiwanese identity was transformed into a political search for Taiwanese independence. The February 28th 1947, later referred to as the ‘2-28’ Incident, was by far the most bloodcurdling clash between Mainlander and Taiwanese, with thousands of local Taiwanese being killed.\(^{30}\) Although there were virtually no bloody clashes between these two groups after Chiang Kai-shek retreated to Taiwan and adopted an iron-handed rule over the island in 1949, the earlier Incident had a lasting and traumatic impact on relationships.\(^{31}\) Many Taiwanese perceived it as part of the KMT authorities’ plan to systematically wipe out the political and intellectual elites of Taiwan. Due to the KMT’s failure to address adequately the deep anger that Taiwanese felt, a strong sense of victimisation became deeply rooted. Therefore, memories of the 2-28 Incident became ‘an effective tool to mobilise support for Taiwanese nationalism’ (Wachman, 1994b: 47).\(^{32}\)

Since May 1991 when the taboo on public debate about independence was lifted, Taiwanese scholars have started to elaborate a theory of ‘Taiwanese nationalism’ through historical reinterpretations of Taiwan and the Taiwanese people. Independence is placed at the centre of Taiwanese nationalism, but its justifications and views on how to accomplish it vary considerably. Some Taiwanese nationalist theorists argue for achieving independence through the democratic process and a popular referendum. Others insist that the Taiwanese are now a different nation from the Chinese due to Taiwan’s long separation from China.

Wachman (1994b:62), in an attempt to locate the sources of contemporary Taiwanese nationalism, points to four factors that have contributed to its formation:

---

\(^{30}\) It is said that over 20,000 Taiwanese were killed in the Incident, but the exact figure of the casualty is controversial.

\(^{31}\) Mainlander soldiers who first arrived to take control of the island were viewed as carpetbaggers, bunglers or thieves by the Taiwanese. On the other hand, the Mainlanders suspected that the Taiwanese had collaborated with Japan during the war (See Wachman, 1994b: 20-21; 46-47).

\(^{32}\) For more details of the Incident, see Copper (1990:27) and Wachman (1994a: 98-99).
1. The historical mentality of geographical isolation, coupled with the experiences of being ruled by outsiders.

2. The tensions resulting from the KMT’s efforts to impose an elite, gentry culture represented as the national culture of China, at the expense of the native, folk culture of Taiwan.

3. The tension that emerged from early confrontations between Taiwanese and Mainlanders—culminating in the February 28th Incident and the residual indignation, mistrust and hostility stemming from this incident.

4. A wide range of policies that institutionalised differences between Mainlanders and Taiwanese—especially those concerning language, culture, and attitudes toward Taiwan.

In contrast, Bosco (1994: 401) argues that the Taiwanese nationalism which was formed in the conflicts with Japanese colonial rulers and later with Mainlander domination, does not necessarily imply independence, because of recent shifts in the political structure.

The forced retirement of mainland representatives completes the Taiwanisation process. The KMT will soon no longer be able to rely on mainlander-dominated national bodies for control. Democratisation of Taiwan politics is easing the resentment against Mainlanders and the KMT; it will no longer be necessary to argue that independence is necessary to remove the dominant mainlanders and achieve democracy....The new sense of Taiwanese identity is emerging not from Ching-period nationalist longings, as argued by Taiwan independence activists, but from the current relations between the island and the mainland. As a result, this new sense of Taiwanese identity finds mainlanders and native Taiwanese both becoming ‘Taiwanese’ in contrast to the PRC (Bosco, 1994: 400-401).

Bosco is right in saying that a new sense of Taiwanese identity is being nurtured in Taiwan, aiming to cross the ethnic boundaries and mould a new melting pot. Indeed, despite the growing crisis of national identity on the island, there has been an increasing consensus that no matter who he/she is, *taro* (Mainlander) or *sweet potato*
everyone is entitled to be a Taiwanese if he/she loves and identifies with the native soil. Nowadays, this new sense of Taiwanese identity has evolved into the so-called ‘four major ethnic groups’ discourse which has gained wide currency. This proposes that the four main groups: Mainlander, Fukien, Hakka and Yuanchumin (indigenous peoples) are distinct but equal symbolically in their status within Taiwan. However, many indigenous peoples are skeptical of this rhetoric, because the cruel reality is that Yuanchumin are not equal to the other groups in political, economic or social terms. In the new ethnic politics of Taiwan today then, what are the meanings of indigenous struggles? Are they playing any role in the ‘national imagination’ of Taiwan in the 1990s?

3.6 Aboriginal Struggles for Self-Determination and Indigenous Identity

Many scholars have pointed out that indigenous peoples in Taiwan are caught between the two conflicting strands of contemporary ‘Taiwan nationalism’. Although most aborigines are still loyal to the KMT and ‘Chinese nationalism’, in my view there has been a convergence of aboriginal struggles on the question of ‘indigenous nationalism’ in recent years.

In the early period of aboriginal policy, considerable efforts were taken by the nationalist government to strengthen the Chinese identity of aboriginal people by means of homogenising measures, such as the ‘plainise the mountains’ and assimilation policies. Under the KMT’s educational system, students were taught to identify with

---

33 Taro and sweet potato are Taiwanese slang for the main ethnic group distinctions. The label of Taro started circulating in the army in the 1950s when Taiwanese soldiers were referring to their old sergeants from the mainland. It is neither biased nor prejudiced but a word more colloquial and cunning in usage. Sweet potato is a term of self-ridicule of the Taiwanese people which they use to distinguish themselves from Taro (See Hu, 1993: 282-3).

34 In this thesis, ‘Taiwan nationalism’ is defined here as consisting of both ‘Chinese nationalism’ and ‘Taiwanese nationalism’.
the Chinese nation through learning its history, geography, culture and value systems and speaking Mandarin— the national language. As a result, many aborigines, who were originally Austronesian speakers, feel that they belong to the Chinese nation and are no different from the descendants of the Yellow Emperor, the legendary progenitor of the Chinese nation.

Hsieh (1994: 412) observes that there are two divergent perspectives among indigenous elites. The ‘political elites’ or party (KMT) elites, and some ‘intellectual elites’ support the traditional ideology of unification with China rather than the aboriginal movements led mainly by the Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines (ATA). In contrast, the ‘resistant elites’ in the ATA emphasise their identification as Yuanchumin and endeavour to unite all aboriginal groups around the indigenous cause. The political elites, on the other hand, stress identification with the ‘Chinese nation’ in an attempt to maintain the present cooperation with the government. However, Hsieh emphasises that the role of the political elites has recently changed, from endorsement of the KMT’s policies to a more outspoken stance, aligned with the positions expressed by aboriginal movements. He argues that:

> Radical sociopolitical change in recent years in Taiwan has made the resistance ideology much more positive. Indigenous representatives are not as quiet as before. They have begun to criticise some unreasonable policies of the government as well as the distorted history of and discrimination toward the indigenous people. Opinions and questions mentioned by those representatives in some aspects are identical to the ATA’s original appeal (Hsieh, 1994: 415).

In the more open context created by political democratisation and the resurgence of a new Taiwanese identity, indigenous elites from different political ideologies have

---

35 So far nearly all aboriginal political elites who have won elections are members of the KMT, the ruling party. They were nominated or supported by the KMT during elections. In most cases, particularly when they were involved with important national legislations, they have had to abide by the rules and orders of the KMT in councils and parliament.

36 The ATA was founded in December 1984. According to Hsieh (1994: 412), it is the first pan-ethnic and pan-aboriginal organisation. Most members of the ATA are either aboriginal intellectuals or students from Presbyterian seminaries.
developed their own strategies within the identity-centered politics of Taiwan today. No matter who they are, be they loyal to Chinese nationalism or even Taiwanese nationalism, there has been a confluence in their struggles for indigenous nationalism. The Constitutional amendment that has incorporated aboriginal rights, the demands for the replacement of the 'Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission' with the 'Minority Commission' and for the establishment of indigenous autonomous regions, all point to the consolidation of an indigenous nationalism based upon self-determination.

This nationalism is neither Chinese-oriented nor Taiwanese-oriented, but indigenous-oriented, corresponding in form and spirit to the universal struggles for self-determination by indigenous peoples in other parts of the world. It is a struggle for a political and symbolic space where indigenous peoples can control their own destiny, be it development, preservation, assimilation, segregation, isolation, autonomy or even secession.

Many aboriginal movements, led by the ATA, were, in the beginning, mainly targeted at political and economic (land) rights for Yuanchumin. However, with the upsurge of indigenous identity in the 1990s, there has been a strong focus, on the one hand, on asserting aboriginal cultures, languages and pan-aboriginal identity and, on the other hand, more symbolically, on reclaiming the 'master status' of Yuanchumin in Taiwan's history.

Perhaps no other example better demonstrates these struggles for indigenous identity than the demand to rename shanpao (mountain people) as Yuanchumin. As we noted earlier, when the nationalist government retreated to Taiwan in 1949, it adopted the official Chinese name Shanpao for aborigines and divided them into 'mountain shanpao' and 'plains shanpao' for administrative purposes without any consultation with the aborigines in advance. As the term shanpao carries derogatory meanings, 37 The ATA has organised many aboriginal movements, protests and demonstrations struggling for aboriginal rights since its establishment in 1984. In 1987, the ATA issued a 'Manifesto of Taiwan Aborigines' that listed land rights, local autonomy and inherent territorial rights, among others, as the fundamental aboriginal rights to be fought for.
indigenous peoples have strongly opposed it and urged its replacement by the term 'Yuanchumin' (Hsieh, 1987& 1994; Paluerh, 1994).\textsuperscript{38}

Paluerh (1994: 1-7), a famous aboriginal movement leader in Taiwan, has pointed out that the 10 years which the aboriginal movement organisations, such as the ATA and the Presbyterian church, among others, have spent fighting for this renaming right, roughly coincide with the history of the aboriginal movement in Taiwan. Yuanchumin as a pan-aboriginal identity was first introduced to the public by the ATA. However, the course of promoting the Yuanchumin movement has not been without difficulties. Paluerh criticised the role of some Chinese anthropologists in insisting on the incorporation of Shanpao into the Constitutional amendment. These anthropologists argued that their denial of the term 'Yuanchumin' is grounded upon the findings of scientific and academic research, showing that the ancestors of these tribes may not have been truly autochthonous to Taiwan. They also argued that new archaeological discoveries prove that there might have been other dwellers who inhabited the island before these tribes.

After many protests and demonstrations organised and supported by the ATA, the Presbyterian church, the DPP, and other concerned groups, including academic circles and the media, the KMT finally made a concession on July 28th, 1994, allowing the term 'Yuanchumin' into the Additional Articles of Taiwan's Constitution, mentioned earlier. Furthermore, in 1994 aboriginal names were officially permitted by the government to replace Chinese names on identification cards on a voluntary basis. After many years of aboriginal petitions, a revised version of Name legislation was passed by the Legislative Yuan (Parliament) allowing the registration of those

\textsuperscript{38} We can draw parallels here with minorities in the US. Winant (1994: 281-282) notes that tremendous battles have been fought about the names we use for racial subjects. 'In the wake of the civil rights movement, distinct Asian ethnic groups, primarily Chinese, Japanese, Filipino and Korean Americans, began to assert their common identity as Asian Americans. Latinos/Hispanics and Native Americans did the same.' He terms this phenomenon 'panethnicity'. He goes on to say that, 'Even the presence or absence of a hyphen in a commonly accepted racial term can be cause for concern, due to its implications for hybridity in concepts of identity. African-Americans want to retain the hyphen; Asian Americans to drop it' (p. 287).
Yuanchumin who wish to change from Chinese names to aboriginal names on their IDs and family books.

Apart from the use of 'Yuanchumin' in the Constitution as a term for the collective identity of indigenous peoples and the adoption of aboriginal names to supplant Chinese names for individual identity, the other notable struggle was the newly-emergent request of the Pingpu tribes for official recognition as one of the aboriginal tribes. As mentioned earlier, due to their geographical proximity and openness, the Pingpus were the first tribes to encounter Chinese immigrants and settlers and were therefore sinicised and assimilated much earlier than the other aboriginal tribes. Although the government has not yet responded to their request, the voices arguing for reclaiming Pingpu tribal identity have become loud and clear in recent years.

In brief, in the present identity-centered politics of Taiwan, there has been an upsurge of demands for indigenous identity which have taken three main forms: first, a decade of pan-aboriginal struggle for renaming rights has culminated in the inclusion of ‘Yuanchumin’ as a collective term to replace ‘Shanpao’ in the constitutional amendment in 1994. Second, the use of aboriginal names as an individual identity was adopted by the government for ID and family registration books in place of Chinese names in 1994 after the passage of the revised Name Legislation. Third, the early-assimilated Pingpu tribes have voiced requests to reclaim their tribal identity.

However, it has to be stressed here that these milestones in aboriginal policy are all long-overdue and were not initiated by the Han nation-state. In my view, three noteworthy developments in Taiwan have contributed to the KMT’s radical change of aboriginal policy.

1. The KMT has been forced to respond to the continuous pressure of aboriginal movements, mainly led by the ATA.
2. The roles of aboriginal political elites are increasingly important because they have become more outspoken and aligned themselves with the positions of aboriginal movements.
3. Much of the KMT's sincerity in dealing with aboriginal policy in recent years cannot be examined in isolation from Taiwan's ongoing political reforms and the democratisation process that initiated in the late 1980s. These moves contributed to reforms in other areas of domestic politics, particularly the Constitutional amendment.

3.7 Concluding Remarks

In Taiwan, the state\(^{39}\) has been vital to all aspects of aboriginal lives, making aboriginal policy, establishing administration systems and enacting legal institutions. Throughout the island's history no treaties have been signed between the state and indigenous peoples, and the local government system in Taiwan is not as well-developed as that of China and U.S. These factors have placed Taiwan's indigenous peoples in a more disadvantaged position than their counterparts elsewhere, especially in Canada and New Zealand. At the same time, the state has adopted significant protective policies to ensure aboriginal integration with mainstream society. Particularly in terms of political participation, the active steps taken to grant quotas for aboriginal representatives in the parliaments and various councils is in many ways unparalleled.

The fundamental ideology behind the past five decades' aboriginal policy is based upon the guiding assumption that Yuanchumin should be helped and protected in order to ensure their 'integration' with mainstream Chinese society. The euphemistic rhetorics of 'integration' or 'plainise mountain people' are, in effect, assimilationist ideologies in letter and spirit. From a brief look at the current situation of indigenous peoples in Taiwan, it demonstrates that this policy objective of assimilation or integration has never been completely fulfilled. On the contrary, it has led aboriginal society to underdevelopment and disintegration, constituting them as a weak and

---

\(^{39}\) Here I mean the State and its apparatuses, such as administrative measures, laws and aboriginal administration agencies.
marginalised minority, an ‘underclass’ in the hierarchical social structure of the Han-dominated nation state of Taiwan. In other words, they are still suffering the ‘double jeopardy’ of interlocking race and class exploitation.

Accepting that there have been substantial innovations in aboriginal policy in recent years, we cannot simply bypass the hard reality of the ‘internal colony’ status of Taiwan’s indigenous peoples and their continuing cultural extinction, social disintegration and economic exploitation. In addition, along with Taiwan’s democratisation and ‘popular sovereignty’, Han Chinese ethnocentrism remains very forceful. It has recently been refuelled by the KMT and the DPP’s political discourses on Han cultural superiority, particularly during the presidential election campaign in March 1996.41

On the other hand, it also has to be noted that the political reforms and general democratisation process in Taiwan in the late 1980s have created the condition for a resurgent ethos of ‘cultural nativisation’, or cultural localism. The reaffirmation of local Taiwanese culture and history symbolises a powerful counter-thrust against the long-term suppression of those terms and narratives by national Chinese ones. In addition, the political democratisation and Taiwanisation programmes have allowed Taiwanese nationalism to be pitted against Chinese nationalism, thus exacerbating a generalised national identity crisis.

In the new Taiwan, the nationalism debate has become increasingly bitter because of divergent attitudes towards the island’s future among different ethnic groups.

40 The term ‘double jeopardy’ is used to describe the oppression of women of colour by race as well as gender (see Andersen and Collins, 1992: i). But it is borrowed here to describe the oppression of race and class.

41 For example, in the presidential election campaign, the most resounding political slogan of the KMT was ‘Build great Taiwan and establish new Chungyuan’ (Lee Teng-hui’s phrase). ‘Chungyuan’ means ‘central terrain’. It refers to the original birthplace of Han Chinese cultures and has now become the ‘imagined community’ of the Han Chinese. On the other hand, in the first direct-vote Taiwan governor’s election in 1994, the DPP claimed in its political propaganda that the election was ‘the first sacred war of four hundred years’. This highlights the 400 years of Taiwanese history but excludes or forgets the much longer history of indigenous peoples in Taiwan mentioned earlier in this chapter.
However, it has to be stressed that the future development of nationalism in Taiwan is inevitably conditioned by two important factors: one is the ongoing political democratisation of domestic politics, and the other is the military threat from Communist China should Taiwan seek to consolidate independence. The increasing momentum of Taiwanese debates around nationalism has also coincided with the development of nationalism in mainland China, but this complete interconnection is beyond the scope of the present thesis, although in my view it deserves particular attention.

The Han Chinese nation-state has consistently excluded indigenous peoples from the 'national imagination' of Taiwan. Consequently, indigenous struggles for self-determination today can be understood as a rejection of this exclusion and a fight for the reassertion of indigenous identity. Stimulated by the shifts in ethnic politics in Taiwan’s mainstream society in the 1990s, there has been an upsurge of indigenous demands aimed at reaffirming the values of indigenous cultures, languages and pan-aboriginalism. In my view, the significance of these struggles is, symbolically speaking, their desire to reclaim a 'master status' within Taiwan’s history through being recognised as Yuanchumin but not Shanpao.

Manuel and Posluns conclude in The Fourth World (1974: 217) that: 'The way to end the condition of unilateral dependence and begin the long march to the Fourth World is through home rule.' In the new Taiwanese society, still haunted by the old spectres of sinocentrism and bewildered by the Chinese/Taiwanese nationalism debate, the best prospects for Yuanchumin to achieve ideological decolonisation from Chinese cultural hegemony may lie with an indigenous nationalism that responds to the clarion call of self-determination, which has long been striven for by Fourth World peoples.

Above all, the recent advances in aboriginal policies have taught Taiwan’s indigenous peoples that rights have to be initiated and fought for by indigenous peoples themselves, and that little reliance can be placed on Han Chinese tokens of sympathy or benevolence.
Chapter Four

Political Liberalisation and the Changing Structure of the Press in Taiwan

4.1 Introduction

This chapter opens with a brief introduction to the recent process of political liberalisation in Taiwan and its impact on press freedom. I will then discuss the changing structures of the Press, focusing on the seven Chinese newspapers under study. Drawing insights from critical political economy, the discussion will examine the production and consumption of newspapers from the late 1980s until now (the post-martial law period). I will explore current state regulations, patterns of ownership, advertising, and newspaper readership.

Murdock (1995: 91) argues that critical political economy insists that the press and other 'meaning-making' institutions are increasingly incorporated into the structures and logics of contemporary capitalism, particularly those organised around private property and commodification. Golding and Murdock (1991: 19) point out further, that critical political economy is necessarily historical and must include accounts of the growth of the media, the extension of corporate reach, commodification, and the changing role of state and government intervention. Using Golding and Murdock's schema as a starting point, I will begin with a discussion of state interventions and their impact on press freedom. Then I will turn to the shifting press structure in terms of ownership, circulation and advertising. Finally, I will conclude with a discussion of cultural consumption and the advertising market.
4.2 Political Liberalisation and Press Freedom

1987 was a turning point in Taiwan’s political development. Faced with increasing demands for more political liberalisation and democratisation, the late President Chiang Ching-kuo embarked on a programme of reform aimed at maintaining the Kuomintang’s leadership as the ruling party in Taiwan. This entailed three major moves: 1. the termination of martial law; 2. the lifting of the newspaper ban; 3. allowing the registration of new political parties. In July 1987, martial law, which had been in force in Taiwan for over four decades, was formally rescinded, permitting the formation of new political parties. On 2 November, the government decided to allow local residents, mainly retired veterans, to visit relatives in mainland China. This historic move was followed by a string of new measures allowing journalists, tourists, and investors to travel to the Chinese mainland. The new openness and liberalisation served as a prelude to the government’s lifting of the 38-year ban on newspaper registration on 1 January 1988.

The ensuing constitutional reforms, as well as the continuing social and cultural transformations, and the democratic developments after the lifting of martial law, breathed new life into the island’s press. Along with the lifting of the newspaper ban, the twelve-page limit on newspaper size was also scrapped. This paved the way for a tremendous increase in the number of newspapers, from 31 dailies to a total of 275 newspapers by the end of 1992. On 1 May 1991, President Lee Teng-hui abolished

---

1 In 1949, the Communists launched an all-out offensive on the mainland. On May 19, the Taiwan Garrison Command proclaimed the Emergency Decree (martial law) throughout Taiwan.
2 When Chiang Kai-shek lost the civil war in China and retreated to Taiwan in 1949, there were approximately two million government officials, civilians and soldiers from mainland China coming to settle, including those who arrived in Taiwan in 1945 to recover the island from the Japanese after the Second World War. Many of the Mainlanders still have relatives on the mainland. As noted in chapter 3, on 2 November, 1987, Chiang Ching-kuo decided to let retired veterans return back to their hometowns in China for family reunions after nearly 40 years of separation, a decision the government defended as mainly based on humanitarian concern as well as their initiative to thaw cross-strait relations.
4 Ibid.
Chapter 4
Changing Structure of the Press in Taiwan

the 'Temporary Provisions' appended to the ROC Constitution in 1948 that had expanded the powers of the President and significantly increased his ability to limit freedom of press and speech.

Rampal (1992), who conducted an observational study in Taiwan observes that: 'The lifting of martial law and the "Temporary Provisions," along with moves toward constitutional reform, have created a climate for press freedom in the ROC unparalleled in the history of the island (p. 637).’ He adds:

Freed of the martial law and ‘Temporary Provisions’ restrictions, and aided by democratic influences, ROC’s mass media are covering constitutional reform and other political issues with an unprecedented vigor and candidness. The range of viewpoints expressed in news columns, in editorials, and on broadcasting stations is so wide and the tone so uninhibited that one is reminded of the American press (p. 642).

The increased freedom of the press in Taiwan observed by Rampal was further supported by the International Press Institute (IPI) analysis of the media situation there in 1991. The IPI Report said: 'In 1991, the Taiwanese press witnessed an almost entire absence of restriction on press freedom. Even opinions concerning the Taiwan independence movement, a political taboo in the past, can often be read in the Taiwan press, although organised promotion of the movement is still forbidden by the law.' However, Rampal argues that further improvements are needed in press law and media ownership patterns to secure a stronger framework for press freedom.

In terms of press law, Rampal is mainly referring to increased access to classified government documents related to the proposed ‘Sunshine laws’ and to the sedition law concerned with the freedom of expression on the sensitive issue of Taiwan independence. The ‘Sunshine laws’, which were passed in 1993 have created more room for the media to publicly disclose private properties including personal and real estates as well as the stockholdings owned by government and publicly elected officials above the level of county councilman, up to the President of the Republic. On the other hand, although the Legislative Yuan approved the abolition of the ‘Statutes for

the Punishment of Insurrection' in May 1991, allowing free discussion and expression on the independence issue in public, the government still considers it necessary to ban acts organising on behalf of independence, for the sake of national security and the potential military threat from the other side of the Taiwan Straits. The relatively 'free marketplace of ideas' enjoyed by the press is, however, not fully reproduced in the broadcasting media in Taiwan, especially in the television industry.

4.3 Changing Structures of Taiwan’s Press

At the end of 1987, before the lifting of newspaper ban, Taiwan had 31 newspapers, 29 in Chinese and two in English. Among the Chinese newspapers, there were 23 dailies and six evening titles (Cheng, 1988: 22). These 31 newspapers had largely remained unchanged in Taiwan from 1960 to 1987. Among them, five were

6 At present, Taiwan's three television stations are largely owned by political agencies. China Television Company (CTV) is held by the Kuomintang (KMT), the ruling party and Chinese Television System (CTS) is owned by the Ministry of Education and Defense. Taiwan Television Enterprise (TIV) is the only station with private Taiwanese investment (26%). Another 25% of stock was Japanese-held, and the Taiwan Provincial Government owned the remaining 49%. There are two major criticisms that are levelled against the three TV networks by communication scholars and opposition party politicians. First, the government and KMT's monopoly over the television ownership in Taiwan is manifested not only in the sense of predominant stockholdings but also in programme direction. Second, the government and KMT's monopoly of the three TV stations has led to biased coverage of election news in Taiwan, giving more time and prominence to KMT-nominated candidates than those who belong to opposition parties, especially the DPP, the Democratic Progressive Party. A new public television station, which would be required to provide a greater diversity of political viewpoints, was expected to go on the air in 1995 and become Taiwan's fourth network. However, the Public Television Bill, which was submitted to the Legislative Yuan for review in September 1992, is still being debated in the legislature, postponing the establishment of the expected Chinese Public Television (CPTV). The long delay in the birth of CPTV is indicative of the power struggles between the state monopoly and civil society, in which the latter has imposed a tremendous pressure on the government and the KMT to liberalise their authoritarian control on the TV industry.
owned by the ruling party, KMT; 16 were privately owned; three were government-owned and seven were owned by the military. So at this period, 15 newspapers were owned by the state, accounting for about 50% of the press market (Chen, 1991: 123). Following the lifting of the newspaper registration ban in 1988, many new newspapers entered the market. According to Chen (Ibid.: 126), directly after the ban was lifted, 87 papers registered, but only 53 went to press. In 1988, the registration figure had risen to 203, with 97 being published. The Republic of China Yearbook 1994 described the current situation of press development in Taiwan in this way:

While many new newspapers never went to press, or closed down soon after publication due to poor market response, inadequate capital or a lack of trained personnel, new ones continue to be registered each year. As of December 1992, there were 276 newspapers in the Taiwan area, most of which were privately owned. Nearly all the papers were based in western Taiwan, particularly in Taipei (GIO, 1994a).

Lai (1991:64) offers four reasons to explain why new newspapers have difficulties in surviving in Taiwan’s press market:

1. Due to the entrenched positions of the United Daily News and the China Times, which have for a long time controlled a lion’s share of both the circulation and advertising markets, new newspapers have suffered considerable setbacks in expanding their own markets.
2. The lack of trained personnel and the policy of inviting experienced journalists from the existing newspapers to fill senior posts, have hindered the dynamic development of new newspapers.
3. The limits on financial capability and journalistic talent have meant that many new titles have been unable to produce newspapers that satisfy the need of the consumers.
4. Following the lifting of the 12-page limit and the emergence of new titles, many newspapers have dramatically increased their number of pages to attract readers. The competitive race among newspapers has worsened to such an extent that it has imposed a burden on readers’ news consumption, thus putting the survival of new newspapers at risk.

However, despite all the difficulties experienced by new entrants to the press market, the extension of press freedom, particularly the lifting of restrictions on newspaper licensing and the number of pages per issue in January 1988, has redrawn
Chapter 4 Changing Structure of the Press in Taiwan

the map of the press structure in Taiwan in significant ways. The dramatic increase in the number of newspapers from 31 in 1987 to 300 by December 1994 has been accompanied by a steep rise in circulation. While the daily circulation in 1987 was estimated at about 3.9 million copies, this figure has risen to over six million copies today.⁷

4.3.1 Ownership Patterns: The Duopoly of the China Times and the United Daily News

Chen (1991: 123-124) notes that before the lifting of martial law, Taiwan was ruled by an authoritarian government in which the State—the party, the government and the military—intervened extensively to control press ownership. Even so, the years 1977 to 1981 saw frequent transfers of ownership among the existing newspapers because both the China Times and the United Daily News started purchasing small newspapers to expand their concerns. In 1978 the United Daily News bought the registration permit of the Hua Pao with some 20 million Taiwan dollars and eventually reorganised it into the current Min Sheng Daily. Meanwhile, the China Times purchased the Ta Chung Daily and later relaunched it as the present Commercial Times.

The United Daily News

In the wake of the lifting of newspaper restrictions, the press market entered a period of cut-throat competition. Many new and old newspapers become more market-oriented and more diversified in management in order to ensure their survival or to consolidate their foothold in the market. This state of flux provided favorable conditions in which the two major press groups, the United Daily News and the China Times, could increase their capital accumulation and become giant enterprises. The

*United Daily News*, a private paper founded in 1951, has grown into one of the largest newspaper publishing groups in the country. Its affiliated publications and companies include:

1. The *United Daily News*
2. The *Economic Daily News*
3. The *Min Sheng Daily* (a leisure and sports title)
4. The *United Evening News*
   (The four newspapers above are all based in the capital, Taipei.)
5. The *World Journal* (in New York)
6. The *Europe Journal* (in Paris)
8. The *United Daily News* (in Hong Kong)

The latter four newspapers are targeted at overseas Chinese. Apart from these eight newspapers, the *United Daily News* Group also owns the Linking Publishing Company, the China Economic News Service, United Informatics, Inc., the World Television Corp. (in New York), and the two monthlies, *Historical Monthly* and *Unitas.*

*The China Times*

The other 'superpower' in the Taiwanese newspaper industry is the *China Times*. Originally entitled the *Cheng-hsin Hsin-wen Pao*, this began as a mimeographed sheet in 1950. It now owns the *Commercial Times* and the *China Times Express*, which like its main title are all published in Taipei. In addition, the Group owns four journals, one publishing house, the *Times Weekly* Corp., the *Commercial Times* Corp., eight affiliated enterprises and two foundations. Since 1991, it has established Times

---

8 The source is from a booklet 'United Daily News Group', provided by the *United Daily News* on 21 Dec., 1994.
Informatics, Inc. and Times Sports and Leisure, Inc. and is the only newspaper to own professional baseball teams.\(^9\)

Many scholars around the world have expressed concern over the growing monopolisation of the press industry and have warned of the dangers of the increased concentration in cultural productions (e.g. Curran, 1991: 86-87; Murdock, 1990: 3, in the UK and Chen, 1991: 125; Cheng, 1988: 48-53; Tang, 1991: 81 in Taiwan). Concern revolves particularly around the concentration of ownership, circulation and advertising revenue, and the lack of diversity in newspapers' editorial positions. Certainly, the domination of the Taiwanese press market by two giant news groups has limited the viability of many newly-registered newspapers and may have exerted considerable control over public opinion. Tang (1991: 81-82) has calculated that if we add together the four newspapers owned by the United Daily News Group and the three owned by the China Times Group, these seven titles and their various local editions claim roughly 70% share of the total newspaper circulation in Taiwan, with the remaining 30% shared by hundreds of other new and old newspapers. Both the China Times and the United Daily News have repeatedly claimed that they sell over a million copies, though in 1986 they accused each other of having exaggerated their circulation figures.\(^10\) Despite the continuing disputes over the exact circulation of the two newspapers, no one denies that they are the largest newspapers in Taiwan.

Cheng (1988: 41-42) argues that concentration of ownership has become one of the most notable features of the Taiwanese press. This position is closely related to the advertising revenues accrued by the two newspapers in recent years, which have increased from 36.28% of the total advertising dollars in Taiwan in 1983 to 44.12% in 1986. Table 4.1 shows the advertising revenues earned by the two newspapers from 1983 to 1986.

\(^9\) Yang, Chih-hung (1993: 87).

\(^{10}\) The China Times joined the US Audit Bureau of Circulation in 1980 and became the only ROC member in that organisation. In 1982 it claimed to have sold over a million paid copies. The United Daily News entered the list by claiming it had a circulation of 1.44 million copies in 1986. The dispute over the circulation by the two newspapers is still continuing. See Chen and Chu (1987: 200-203).
### Chapter 4 Changing Structure of the Press in Taiwan

#### Table 4.1

**Advertising Revenues by China Times and United Daily News**

(1983 to 1986)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China Times</td>
<td>1,372,306</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2,041,969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(18.95%)</td>
<td>(21.01%)</td>
<td>(20.90%)</td>
<td>(22.34%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Daily</td>
<td>1,254,912</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1,990,243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News</td>
<td>(17.33%)</td>
<td>(25.48%)</td>
<td>(20.76%)</td>
<td>(21.78%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:**

1. Unit: thousands (New Taiwan Dollars).
2. The figure in parenthesis is the percentage of the CT and UDN earnings divided by the total advertising turnover of all Taiwan newspapers. The figures do not include their affiliated newspapers.

In 1989, after the government relaxed the restrictions on newspaper, the yearly revenues of the two newspapers experienced a quantum leap to 4.85 billions New Taiwan (NT) dollars for China Times and 4.8 billions NT dollars for United Daily News, approximately 2.5 times those of 1986. Table 4.2 gives the advertising revenues earned by the seven leading dailies (together with their affiliated newspapers) in 1989. [Six of these have been selected for intensive study in later chapters of this thesis and are marked (x).]

As we can see from the Table 4.2, the advertising market is dominated by the two major newspapers. Firstly, They earned near to five billions in advertising income, about 25 times that of the tenth ranked title, the Independent Morning Post. The advertising incomes earned by the United Daily News and its sister newspapers, including Min Sheng Daily, United Evening News and Economic Daily News, add up to 6,622,160 thousands NT dollars in 1989, while the China Times group (including the Commercial Times and the China Times Express) achieve a total of 5,896,000 thousands NT dollars. According to Chen's calculations (1991: 149), the two newspapers account for two thirds of the advertising market in Taiwan, up from 60%...
before the lifting of the newspaper ban, and approximately 50% in 1980 and 45% in 1979.\textsuperscript{11}

Table 4.2

Adverting Revenues Earned by the Seven Dailies and Their Affiliated Newspapers (1989)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Newspapers</th>
<th>Revenues</th>
<th>N.B.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>China Times (x)</td>
<td>4,856,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>United Daily News (x)</td>
<td>4,800,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Min Sheng Daily</td>
<td>1,320,000</td>
<td>(affiliated with UDN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Taiwan Times (x)</td>
<td>860,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Commercial Times</td>
<td>690,000</td>
<td>(affiliated with CT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Commons (x)</td>
<td>499,400</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Central Daily News (x)</td>
<td>467,500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>United Evening News</td>
<td>357,310</td>
<td>(affiliated with UDN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>China Times Express</td>
<td>350,000</td>
<td>(affiliated with CT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
<td>193,070</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Economic Daily News</td>
<td>144,850</td>
<td>(affiliated with UDN)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
1. Unit: thousands (New Taiwan Dollars).
2. The figure of Independent Evening Post is not listed but should be in the vicinity of that of IMP.

Not only have the immense market resources of the two newspapers been questioned over the years, their editorial positions have not escaped vehement criticisms either. Chen and Chu (1987: 193-194) argue that during the long period of martial law the two newspapers exerted a powerful influence in maintaining political

\textsuperscript{11} Chen argues that since 1973 the advertising market has started to concentrate on the few largest circulation dailies in Taiwan.
stability by their conservative and moderate political stances. Chen (1991: 125) points out that the founders of both the China Times and the United Daily News, Yu Chi-chung and Wang Tih-wu, have been very close to the KMT in their past backgrounds and were appointed as members of the Central Standing Committee of the KMT in 1979. He goes on to say that almost all the founders of the 31 newspapers operating under martial law, be they Mainlanders or Taiwanese, had some relations with the KMT, the government and the military (Ibid.: 128-129). However, during the post martial law period, the two giant newspapers have had to shift both their management strategies and their editorial positions in order to keep their lead in the market. According to Chen (Ibid.: 148), the United Daily News has a total staff of 5,600 and China Times has 4,200.

4.3.2 Diversification and Commercialisation of the Press

In the 1980s, especially after the lifting of restrictions on newspaper, many newspapers engaged in a modernisation process, building new office mansions and importing more advanced communication technologies and electronic typesetting equipment (Chen, 1991: 146-147). Meanwhile, state intervention declined, and economic dynamics gradually replaced political force as the central factor shaping press development (Ibid.: 152). The political liberalisation initiated in the late 1980s has had the effect of further strengthening the trends towards diversification and commercialisation of the press.

Although the government has retained restrictions on media concentration, such as the curbs on cross-media ownership contained in the many revisions of the Broadcasting and Television Law, there is little it can do to limit 'vertical expansion' by the two major newspaper chain groups.

---

12 Cheng (1988:48) explains that in contrast to 'horizontal expansion', which refers to cross-media ownership, 'vertical expansion' means conglomerate within the press industry, such as newspapers acquiring printing and publishing houses and distribution networks.
Having briefly described the *United Daily News* and *China Times* above, I will now give brief accounts of the other five newspapers under study in this thesis.

**The Liberty Times**

According to the *Republic of China Yearbook 1996*, the *Liberty Times* has gained in circulation through advertising and lotteries, breaking away from the pack to attain a distant third place behind the 'big two'. Started as a local paper based in Taichung, it changed hands in 1980 and moved to Taipei in 1986. It is now owned by Lin Jung-shan, who is National Policy Advisor to the President and a former Control Yuan member. Lin heads the Lienpang Enterprise, which deals in land estate, housing and construction development. Despite the owner's close relations with President Lee Teng-hui, Chairman of the KMT, interestingly enough, the *Liberty Times* is vocal in its criticism of the KMT and the government, anchoring itself as an oppositional paper. Nevertheless, it remains loyal to President Lee and his political reforms.

**The Central Daily News**

*Central Daily News* is the official news organ of the KMT. It was founded in Shanghai in 1928 and moved to Taiwan in 1949. The other media organisations run by the KMT now include: the *China Daily News*, the Central News Agency, the Broadcasting Corporation of China (BCC), and the China Television Company (CTV). However, many other KMT-run newspapers were either sold to private investors or suspended publication because they found their political propaganda mission at loggerheads with market and audience needs in the 1980s, particularly after the lifting of martial law (Chen and Chu, 1987: 196; Cheng, 1988: 57).

**The Independent Morning Post**

The Independent Post Group pursues a liberal approach in its news coverage. It was founded by the late Wu Shan-lien, a famous Taiwanese politician and former
Taipei mayor who was involved in forming the first opposition party—the China Democratic Party—in the 1950s. The group owns two newspapers and one publishing house. The *Independent Evening Post* established in 1947, was the first evening daily and the first private newspaper in Taiwan. Its sister publication, the *Independent Morning Post* hit the newsstands in 1988. The shift in the *Independent Morning Post*’s ownership to a KMT Taipei city councilor and business tycoon in 1994 gave rise to newsroom protests, a refusal to accept the editor-in-chief appointed by the new management and demands for ‘newsroom autonomy’ including editorial freedom from the owner’s possible intervention in the future, and the election of a new editor-in-chief by the newsroom staff.

*The Taiwan Times*

The titles I have discussed so far, are all based in Taipei, the capital city of Taiwan. In contrast, the other two newspapers under study, the *Taiwan Times* and the *Commons* are based in the southern port metropolis of Kaohsiung. Both compete with each other as local dailies reflecting opinions from the south, and both are more aggressive and critical. They place more emphasis on political news as well as local culture, literature and history. The *Taiwan Times*, established under another name in 1946 in Hualien (an eastern city of Taiwan), moved to Kaohsiung and assumed its current name in 1971. It eventually became the largest daily in southern Taiwan because it has been vocal in its political criticism. After it was sold to Wang Yu-yun, the former Kaohsiung mayor (and KMT member) and now a National Policy Advisor to the President, its political coverage became more moderate, and its sales have decreased (Chen and Chu, 1987: 198).

*The Commons*

The *Commons* began as a small daily in northern Taiwan and moved its headquarters to Kaohsiung in 1979. It was founded by Lee Shui-piao, a former city council member and now the general manager of the Hsin-lung Gas Co. and Chairman
of the ROC Newspaper Business Association. It is known for its adversarial and politicised stance, catering to southern readers' demands for more political news and commentary. Its sensational style in dealing with political news has boosted sales dramatically and offered strong competition to the *Taiwan Times*, vying for the title of 'the largest daily in southern Taiwan.' Since 1991 the *Commons* corp. has expanded its business into the real estate and tourism industries.\(^\text{13}\)

In terms of the owners of the seven newspapers under study, six are privately owned, the exception being the *Central Daily News* which is a KMT-run title. The owners of the *United Daily News* and the *China Times* came from mainland China and are close to the KMT and the military. The two major press groups are both characterised by family ownership. Within the UDN group, all four newspapers which circulate in Taiwan (*United Daily News, United Evening News, Economic Daily News* and *Min Sheng Daily*) are headed by Wang Tih-wu’s sons and daughter who hold the position as publishers. In the CT group too, the publishers of the profitable *China Times, Commercial Times* and the *China Times Express* are all children of Yu Chi-chung.

The other four private newspapers (*the Independent Morning Post, Taiwan Times, Liberty Times, and the Commons*) were all founded or bought by Taiwanese capitalists and politicians who enjoy a certain relationship with the state. The current owners of the *Taiwan Times* and the *Liberty Times* are business tycoons and have close relations with the KMT and President Lee Teng-hui. Although the owners of *Independent Morning Post* and the *Commons* have not been as intimate as the owners of TT and LT in their relationships with the state, but they are also from a big business background. The acquisition of the *Independent Morning Post* by a KMT politician and business tycoon in 1994 is expected to change the paper's opposition tradition, but this still remains to be seen. Nevertheless, the four newspapers founded by Taiwanese business tycoons claim to represent the 'true' opinion of the majority of people on the island by taking a vocal and adversarial line in political coverage, and being more or less concerted in their criticisms against the KMT.

\(^{13}\) Yang (1993:87).
Turning now to the circulation of newspapers, it has to be admitted that accurate statistics are not easy to obtain. However, the figures provided by the companies themselves enable us to obtain some rough estimates of the circulation of the seven newspapers under study. Table 4.3 details the ownership and circulation of the seven titles.

Table 4.3
Ownership and Circulation of the Seven Newspapers under Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>paper</th>
<th>ownership</th>
<th>headquarter</th>
<th>circulation</th>
<th>main cir. area</th>
<th>news type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. China Times</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>Taipei</td>
<td>1.2 million</td>
<td>nation-wide</td>
<td>comprehensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. United Daily News</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>Taipei</td>
<td>1.2 million</td>
<td>nation-wide</td>
<td>comprehensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Central Daily News</td>
<td>Kuomintang</td>
<td>Taipei</td>
<td>0.51 million</td>
<td>nation-wide</td>
<td>comprehensive &amp; finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Independent Morning Post</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>Taipei</td>
<td>0.33 million</td>
<td>northern Taiwan</td>
<td>comprehensive &amp; politics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Taiwan Times</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>Kaohsiung</td>
<td>0.6 million</td>
<td>southern Taiwan</td>
<td>comprehensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Commons</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>Kaohsiung</td>
<td>0.7 million</td>
<td>southern Taiwan</td>
<td>comprehensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Liberty Times</td>
<td>private</td>
<td>Taipei</td>
<td>0.62 million</td>
<td>northern &amp; central Taiwan</td>
<td>comprehensive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: As there is no organisation to monitor the circulation of newspapers in Taiwan (such as the Audit Bureau of Circulation in the USA), the circulation figures above are provided by the respective news organisation and are thus very likely to be over-estimates.

Source: Kuo Hua Advertising Inc. (1994)

As part of a large-scale study of social change in Taiwan conducted by Chu Hai-yuan in 1993, a researcher at the Ethnology Department of the Academia Sinica, explored the popular consumption of media based on national sample of 1,964. One of the questions asked was ‘Which newspaper do you read most often?’ The results are listed in Table 4.4.
Table 4.4
Newspaper Readership in Taiwan (1993)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspapers</th>
<th>No. of Respondents</th>
<th>Percentage Claiming to Read</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. China Times</td>
<td>470</td>
<td>23.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. United Daily News</td>
<td>422</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Liberty Times</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Min Sheng Daily</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>5.4% (sister paper of UDN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Commons</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Taiwan Times</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. United Evening News</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>1.7% (sister paper of UDN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Central Daily News</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. China Times Express</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0.7% (sister paper of CT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Commercial Times</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.7% (sister paper of CT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Independent Morning Post</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 Independent Evening Post</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.4% (sister paper of IMP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Others¹⁴</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Don’t know/ not applicable¹⁵</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>25.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1964</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


From Table 4.4, of the seven titles included in this study, it is clear that the newspapers that people read most often are the China Times (470, 23.9%), followed by the United Daily News (422, 21.5%); the Liberty Times (139, 7.1%); the Commons (77, 3.9%); the Taiwan Times (58, 3%); the Central Daily News (23, 1.2%); and the

¹⁴ Here, the ‘others’ include KMT-run China Daily News (16, 0.8%); Pacific Daily News (8, 0.4%) and the government-owned Taiwan News Daily (6, 0.3%) and other newspapers.

¹⁵ This category includes ‘don’t know”; ‘don’t answer’ and ‘not applicable’.
Chapter 4 Changing Structure of the Press in Taiwan

*Independent Morning Post* (8, 0.4%). If we add in their sister publications, then the UDN Group accounts for the largest share of readers, 29.8%, with the CT Group accounting for 25.3%. Both groups together therefore command 55.1% of the press market in Taiwan. This finding lends further support to fears over the duopoly control of newspaperdom in Taiwan. For greater clarity, Figure 4.1 presents the readership shares of the newspaper groups in a pie chart.¹⁶

---

¹⁶The percentage figure in this pie chart is rounded off.
4.3.3 Newspaper Strategies and Contents in the 1990s

4.3.3.1 Competitive Marketing and Selling Strategies

In order to attract more readers in southern Taiwan and meet long-standing criticisms that they place too much emphasis on northern affairs, the four newspapers of the UDN Group and the three titles of the CT Group have opened new editions for readers in central and southern Taiwan. Recently, they have established branch offices in Taichung and Kaohsiung. This has posed severe challenges for local dailies which depend heavily on local readers and advertisers for their existence. The lifting of the restrictions on pages and the relaxation on the permitted ratio of news to advertising have consolidated the advantageous position of the two press majors against new and financially weaker papers. The *United Daily News* and *China Times* each regularly produces 44-48 page editions daily. This is not only efficient in preventing readers from buying other newspapers but also beneficial to advertisers’ concerns.

As newspaper competition has intensified in Taiwan, a whole gamut of selling strategies have been employed to promote the sale of newspapers and solicit subscribers. They range from TV advertisements, prize draws and coupon giving to holding exhibition and mountain-climbing activity, and even buying insurance for readers. The vicious competition for readers and advertising is indicative of many newspaper struggles for survival today, a situation which is unprecedented in Taiwan's press history.

4.3.3.2 Content Pluralism and the Integration of Editing and Reporting Staff

In response to Taiwan's fast-changing society, newsrooms have initiated programmes to strengthen synergy in teamwork and ensure efficient news process and production. Most notable have been the introduction of a new integration system to report and edit news and the adjustment of editorial policy to implement pluralism in news contents to cater to the various tastes of heterogeneous readers. The lifting of the 12-page limit gave rise to a dramatic increase in news coverage aimed at attracting readers. The UDN Group was the first to initiate the 'integration of editing and reporting system' designed to bring editing and reporting staffs together on a page
basis, granting respective page editors more autonomy in deciding contents, designs
and layouts for their own pages—and coordinating manpower. Later on, this system was
adopted by the other newspapers, including the China Times, Independent Morning

In terms of contents, newspapers in Taiwan have launched many new pages
devoted to special themes untouched before, in an effort to attract different segments
of readers. Those which highlight the themes of tourism, leisure, real estate and cross-
straits relations are the most popular.\(^\text{17}\) However, Lai (1991: 69) points out that there
are three major pages which are more likely to catch the attention of readers. First, the
opinion page which publishes readers’ letters to the editor; second, the mainland China
news page; third, the stock market page. According to Chu’s research in 1993,
‘domestic politics’ is the most popular news genre (24.8%), followed by ‘social
problem’ news (20.9%), ‘art and entertainment’ (7.2%), ‘sports’ (4.3%), ‘consumer
information’ (4.1%), ‘medicine and health’ (3.3%), ‘international news’ (2.9%), and
‘literature’ (2.3%) (Chu, 1993: 250). Figure 4.2 summarises the general distribution of
readers’ interests in chart form.

‘Content pluralism’ is further enhanced by a wide range of weekend supplements
which feature various ‘soft’ themes such as the book supplement, the family
supplement, and the TV & Movie supplement. It can be plausibly argued that this
diversification of editorial contents is reflective of politico-economic developments in
Taiwan, whereby people are becoming better off and consumerism is taking root.

\(^{17}\) Yang. op.cit. p. 88.
4.3.3.3 The Wider Use of Opinion Surveys

In addition to providing a greater diversity of national and local news, newspapers often conduct public opinions polls and academics are called upon to voice their opinions on national policies. Due to the increased intensity of election campaigns produced by Taiwan’s democratisation process in recent years, opinion surveys are often used as political barometers of public opinion. Newspapers frequently display the results of polls that are either conducted by newspaper institutions or by independent polling organisations. They include opinion surveys which deal with, election candidates from the KMT and DPP; the public rating of government ministers, and the public policies such as mass rapid transit systems and bus ticket price hikes. Yang (1993:88) argues that this is indicative of a rising trend of ‘precision journalism’ in Taiwan’s press today.
4.3.3.4 The Ideological Orientation of Political News Reports

Last but not least, in the 1990s, the continuing political reforms in Taiwan have launched constitutional amendments with a view to creating a new legal basis to accommodate more rigorous democratisation and liberalisation programmes. The first gubernatorial and the two special municipalities mayoral elections in 1994, as well as the first direct-vote presidential election in 1996, were historic milestones unprecedented in ROC’s political development. Furthermore, the major political parties, the KMT and the DPP, have been competing with each other more vigorously to consolidate their power bases and attract popular support. In this changed context, Taiwan’s press is often filled with ‘domestic politics’ news, which as we saw above, is the most popular news genre. At the same time, the press is strongly marred by political partisanship, especially when covering such important political events as the first presidential election in Taiwan or those that are somehow related to owners’ interests. Coupled with the tension of ethnic politics in Taiwan discussed in Chapter 3, it is therefore not surprising to find that many political news reports are strongly biased and ideological. Sensationalism in political news coverage is also rampant, and the traditional professional ideology, which highlights objectivity and responsibility, is rapidly becoming an exception to routine practices.

Political partisanship in Taiwan’s newspapers is therefore not uncommon. The easiest way to label their political orientations is through the editorial positions adopted on the following three issues:

---

18 Rampal (1994: 630) notes that ‘The push for democratisation in Taiwan is perceived by political analysts as Taiwan’s desire to become a model both politically and economically to the mainland Chinese in its campaign to remove the Communist regime there. Having lost China, the KMT had to convert Taiwan both into a platform for the reconquest of the mainland, and a showcase of what the reformed KMT could do for China and for the Chinese, knowing that only genuine political reforms will help it establish the force of its moral superiority over mainland China, a factor critical in winning international, especially Western, support.’

19 In the previous discussion, we noted that some owners (e.g., those of Liberty Times and Taiwan Times) are holding positions as ‘National Policy Advisor to the President’. Therefore, it is reasonable to expect that during the Presidential election, they will exert a certain influence on the election news covered by their papers.
Chapter 4 Changing Structure of the Press in Taiwan

1. Taiwanese independence or unification with China.
2. The degree of their support for the KMT, the DPP or the CNP (the Chinese New Party).\(^2^0\)
3. How they evaluate the power struggles between the 'mainstream faction' and the 'non-mainstream faction' within the KMT.\(^2^1\)

If we apply these criteria to the seven newspapers selected for this study, the China Times and United Daily News, the largest circulation papers in the country, both position themselves as relatively autonomous, though the former is generally considered more liberal and somewhat more balanced in its views on the mainstream and non-mainstream factions of the KMT, while the latter is widely regarded as more conservative and more sympathetic to the CNP and the non-mainstream faction in the KMT. However, both are inclined to support unification with China and are opposed to Taiwan independence. The KMT-owned Central Daily News is widely considered as a propaganda organ for the ruling party and the government. The Independent Morning Post has formally adopted an independent posture, but many readers perceive it as an opposition newspaper with DPP leanings. The Taiwan Times, which won growing circulation for its independent position in southern Taiwan, emphasises local news and culture and is more supportive of the mainstream faction of the KMT led by President Lee Teng-hui. The Commons, which is also based in southern Taiwan, is more vocal in its pro-independence and pro-DPP position. The Liberty Times is publicly acknowledged to be an absolute proponent of President Lee and his reforms,

\(^{20}\) The CNP was established by a group who broke away from the KMT. The founders of the CNP are mainly incumbent members of the Legislative Yuan (Parliament) and mostly belong to the Mainlander elites.  
\(^{21}\) The 'mainstream faction' of the KMT largely refers to those who render absolute support for the leadership of President Lee Teng-hui and his ongoing political reforms. This faction is now the majority in the KMT and mainly composed of local Taiwanese politicians. The 'non-mainstream faction' refers to the minority within the KMT who disagree with some aspects of President Lee's democratisation process and are often critical of his position on 'independent Taiwan' (ideologically different from 'Taiwan independence'). They are mostly the senior diehards of the KMT supporting for the unification with China who have gradually lost power in the party.
thus favouring the 'mainstream faction' of the KMT and the cause of an 'independent Taiwan,' which calls for more breathing space in the international arena for Taiwan to manoeuvre as a de facto independent country. However, according to research on newspapers in Taipei, the *Liberty Times* claimed more quotes from DPP's candidates in its headlines during the 1991 national assemblyman's election. Figure 4.3 represents my personal assessment of the ideological positions of the seven newspapers under study.

**Figure 4.3**

I ideological Positions of the Seven Newspapers in Taiwan

![Diagram showing ideological positions of seven newspapers in Taiwan]

Notes:
1. CT: China Times; UDN: United Daily News; CDN: Central Daily News; IMP: Independent Morning Post; TT: Taiwan Times; C: Commons; LT: Liberty Times.
2. KMT: Kuomintang; DPP: Democratic Progressive Party; CNP: Chinese New Party; Mainstream: Mainstream faction of the KMT; Non-mainstream: Non-mainstream faction of the KMT but some were later split into the CNP.

---

22 This is the current foreign policy of the KMT. 'Independent Taiwan', in my view, is Taiwan as a country ruled by the KMT, which does not have a clear schedule for unification with China, although unification under free and democratic system is set out as a long-term national goal. 'Taiwan independence' is complete secession from China politically and is mainly articulated by and striven for by the DPP.

23 Yang, op cit. p. 92.
Yang (1991: 86) notes that after the lifting of the newspaper ban it became increasingly common for newspapers to carry political overtones in their coverage. Due to the wide discrepancies in the ideological orientations of newspapers, he argued that readers have to read at least two newspapers in order to gain a more accurate picture of news events. However, this may be asking too much of average readers since the average time spent reading newspapers is less than 30 minutes and 25% 'don’t read newspapers at all'.

4.4 Newspaper Consumption

Studying the impact of material and cultural inequalities on cultural consumption is one of the core tasks of a ‘critical political economy of communications’ (Golding and Murdock, 1991: 22). For the purpose of this research, however, I will focus particularly on the materials’ aspect of newspaper consumption in Taiwan in recent years. During the 1970s to the 1980s, when Taiwan enjoyed the new wealth generated by successful land reforms in the 1950s and the comprehensive export economic strategy of the 1960s, per capita income rose dramatically (See Table 4.5).

We would expect that increased disposable spending power and the rising educational levels of recent decades to lead to easier access to media services and increasing expenditure of cultural products. Table 4.6 shows the purchase of print media per hundred households in Taiwan from 1970 to 1988. The rising per capita income shown in Table 4.5 is positively related with the growing ownership of print media shown in Table 4.6 during the 1970s to the 1980s. Whereas the number of newspaper per hundred household was 17.04 in 1970, this figure had risen to 75.54 by 1986 after which it began to decline. The ownership of magazines attained its highest point in 1987, but again began to fall thereafter. One reasonable explanation for this pattern is that a greater variety of media equipment and communication technologies other than print media, began to be marketed for popular consumption.

25 Also see note 7 in Chapter 3 for the recent figures.
### Table 4.5
Per Capita Income from 1970 to 1989

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>360</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>410</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>482</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td>642</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>853</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>890</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>1,041</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977</td>
<td>1,193</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>1,443</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>1,758</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
1. Unit: US dollars.

Nevertheless, the overall trend is clear. As individual and household’s disposable spending power has grown, popular consumption of media products has expanded facilitating the emergence of ‘consumer sovereignty’. In this circumstance, the media as a corporate cultural producer has to adjust editorial and management policy in order to attract more readers and advertisers. As newspapers have become more ‘service-oriented’, consumer issues are more widely covered and special pages on the environment, leisure and travel, real estate, finance and investment, culture and arts, health and medicine and books have been added.
Table 4.6
Purchase of Print Media Per Hundred Households in Taiwan
(1970 to 1988)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>No. of Newspapers</th>
<th>No. of Magazines</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>17.04</td>
<td>4.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>23.35</td>
<td>7.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972</td>
<td>31.52</td>
<td>9.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td>33.67</td>
<td>7.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>34.16</td>
<td>10.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>37.06</td>
<td>9.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>42.34</td>
<td>8.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977</td>
<td>50.91</td>
<td>9.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>57.56</td>
<td>11.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>58.58</td>
<td>10.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>58.85</td>
<td>9.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>64.75</td>
<td>12.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>63.96</td>
<td>13.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>65.88</td>
<td>13.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>67.96</td>
<td>15.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>72.71</td>
<td>16.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>75.54</td>
<td>17.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>70.34</td>
<td>19.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>67.37</td>
<td>17.83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.5 Advertising Market

In tandem with rising cultural consumption, the media advertising market has also grown rapidly. Table 4.7 presents information on the growth of media (newspapers, magazines, television, and radio) advertising revenues as a proportion of the total turnover of the advertising market in Taiwan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Average Rate of Economic Development</th>
<th>Total Advertising Turnover</th>
<th>Media Advertising Revenues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Total Turnover (millions)</td>
<td>Average Growth Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962-1966</td>
<td>12.56</td>
<td>1980.60</td>
<td>21.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967-1971</td>
<td>15.90</td>
<td>5588.24</td>
<td>22.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977-1981</td>
<td>20.13</td>
<td>41212.01</td>
<td>22.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982-1986</td>
<td>9.58</td>
<td>94852.34</td>
<td>15.26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:  
1. Unit: millions (NT dollars).  

From the Table 4.7, we can see that the average growth rate of media advertising revenues has, generally speaking, been higher than the rates for economic development or total advertising turnover. The highest growth rate, of 62.89%, in the period 1962-6 is probably related to the initial entry of television in 1962. Although there has been a gradual decrease in the average growth rate since then, the share of media advertising within the total advertising market continues to grow, rising to 85.91% during the period 1982-1986, up from 73.54% in 1962-1966. However, as we saw
earlier, the advertising market for newspapers has been dominated by the two giants, the *United Daily News* and the *China Times* groups. Table 4.8 presents the distribution of the advertising turnover in the different media from 1981 to 1990.

**Table 4.8**

Distribution of Advertising Turnover in the Different Media of Taiwan

(1981 to 1990)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Newspapers</th>
<th>Television</th>
<th>Radio</th>
<th>Magazines</th>
<th>Others</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>550,952</td>
<td>373,521</td>
<td>90,720</td>
<td>64,933</td>
<td>190,611</td>
<td>1,270,737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(43.36%)</td>
<td>(29.39%)</td>
<td>(7.14%)</td>
<td>(5.11%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>605,626</td>
<td>430,632</td>
<td>102,000</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>214,987</td>
<td>1,433,245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(42.25%)</td>
<td>(30.05%)</td>
<td>(7.12%)</td>
<td>(5.58%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>724,162</td>
<td>510,863</td>
<td>135,963</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>259,586</td>
<td>1,730,574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(41.85%)</td>
<td>(29.52%)</td>
<td>(7.85%)</td>
<td>(5.78%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>800,300</td>
<td>621,061</td>
<td>146,351</td>
<td>119,474</td>
<td>298,787</td>
<td>1,991,983</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(40.48%)</td>
<td>(31.18%)</td>
<td>(7.34%)</td>
<td>(6%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>762,177</td>
<td>722,063</td>
<td>149,852</td>
<td>143,863</td>
<td>265,671</td>
<td>2,043,626</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(37.30%)</td>
<td>(35.33%)</td>
<td>(7.33%)</td>
<td>(7.04%)</td>
<td>(13%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>913,847</td>
<td>774,722</td>
<td>148,090</td>
<td>152,001</td>
<td>297,156</td>
<td>2,285,816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(39.98%)</td>
<td>(33.89%)</td>
<td>(6.48%)</td>
<td>(6.65%)</td>
<td>(13%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>1,262,712</td>
<td>895,499</td>
<td>166,495</td>
<td>229,705</td>
<td>381,694</td>
<td>2,936,104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(43.01%)</td>
<td>(30.5%)</td>
<td>(5.67%)</td>
<td>(7.82%)</td>
<td>(13%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>1,593,631</td>
<td>1,135,447</td>
<td>191,450</td>
<td>264,327</td>
<td>562,034</td>
<td>3,746,889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(42.53%)</td>
<td>(30.3%)</td>
<td>(5.12%)</td>
<td>(7.05%)</td>
<td>(15%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>2,083,955</td>
<td>1,413,989</td>
<td>227,593</td>
<td>307,211</td>
<td>768,142</td>
<td>4,800,892</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(43.41%)</td>
<td>(29.45%)</td>
<td>(4.74%)</td>
<td>(6.4%)</td>
<td>(16%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>1,975,039</td>
<td>1,587,879</td>
<td>246,988</td>
<td>323,942</td>
<td>850,000</td>
<td>4,983,849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(39.62%)</td>
<td>(31.86%)</td>
<td>(4.96%)</td>
<td>(6.5%)</td>
<td>(17.06%)</td>
<td>(100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
1. Unit: Millions (NT dollars).
3. The category of 'Others' includes letters, cinema, shop and outdoors ads.
We can see that the total turnover of the media advertising in Taiwan in 1990 is 3.92 times that of the 1981, an increase of 3,713,112 millions NT. In the decade, the annual growth rate of the media advertising were at the highest in 1987, 1988 and 1989, particularly in 1987 which enjoyed a sharp increase of 28.45% than 1896. This can be explained by the fact that more newspapers and magazines were established due to the lifting of the newspaper ban and page restrictions during these years and thus more spaces and revenues accrued from the advertising. Figure 4.4 clearly shows the marked difference of the annual growth rate of the media advertising turnover in chart form.

**Figure 4.4**

**Distribution of Annual Growth Rate of Media Advertising Turnover**

(1981-1990)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rate</td>
<td>12.79%</td>
<td>20.83%</td>
<td>15.11%</td>
<td>2.59%</td>
<td>11.85%</td>
<td>28.45%</td>
<td>27.61%</td>
<td>28.13%</td>
<td>3.81%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the 1980s, newspapers have always enjoyed the largest share of the media advertising revenues, followed by television. The sum of the advertising revenues from newspapers and television have accounted for over 70% of the total media advertising turnover every year. Newspapers enjoyed the highest advertising shares and revenues in 1989, while television enjoyed the highest shares in 1985 (35.33%), keeping a stable growth of the advertising revenues every year. Generally speaking, comparing the revenues earned between 1981 and 1990, the magazines enjoyed the highest growth rate of the advertising revenues, then the 'others', television, newspapers, and radio.  

4.6 Concluding Remarks

This chapter has attempted to briefly introduce the politico-economic environment within which Taiwanese newspapers operate in the 1990s, touching upon both production and consumption.

I have paid special attention to the development of political liberalisation and democratisation in Taiwan initiated during Lee Teng-hui's Presidency and continued since 1988, and its impact on the press freedom and structures. This movement has breathed new life into Taiwan's press, not only by lifting the 38-year ban on newspaper registration and the printing page limit, but through the relaxation of general restrictions on the freedom of the press and public opinion.

As a result of these changes, in the post-martial law period, the political force of the state has been in decline and the economic logic of the press market has come more to the forefront. However, it is important to remember that the state still exercises considerable direct influence through the state-owned media, owned by the KMT (the ruling party), the government and the military. Although in the new market-oriented society, about 300 newspapers have been engaged in a cut-throat competition, vying for larger shares of the readership and advertising markets, these

---

26 The magazines' advertising revenue in 1990 is 3.99 times that of 1981, while the 'others' came second (3.46 times), followed by television (3.25 times), newspapers (2.58 times), and radio (1.72 times).
markets remain dominated by the two giants, the *United Daily News* and the *China Times*. Furthermore, as we also noted there has been growing concentration of newspaper ownership and commercialisation from the mid-1970s, and both the *United Daily News* and the *China Times* have become media conglomerates. Meanwhile, in the 1990s, Taiwanese business tycoons from large enterprises in other economic sectors, often with strong political and ideological orientations, have joined in the race for the press market hoping to break the duopoly. Therefore, it is not surprising to see there has been a commercialisation of newspaper management. However, this development is not boundless and is still constrained by state intervention, such as legal restrictions on the cross-media ownership of the media.

In order to survive in the increased competition of the 1990s, newspapers have had to devise new strategies. The most notable ones include competitive marketing and selling; content pluralism; the integration of editing and reporting staff; the wide use of opinion surveys; ideological orientations in political news reporting; and an emphasis on the sensational. At the same time consumerism is in full swing and people have cultivated a certain taste for cultural commodities. This has not only accelerated the transformation of newspapers into consumer-oriented and financial enterprises where contents and pages have to be adjusted to the demands of 'consumer sovereignty', it has also boosted the general prosperity of advertising sectors and reinforced the press position within it.

Generally speaking, after the lifting of the newspaper ban, the press market in Taiwan has developed in a peculiar fashion in which 'the better newspapers have become the best, and the worse have become the worst.' Under the rules of the new economic jungle, many newspapers have halted publications, not because of state intervention or martial law restrictions as before, but because of the remorseless logics of advertising and circulation figures. The unprecedented political reforms have therefore brought forth an unforeseen situation in the press in Taiwan. Although more and more new newspapers have been registered, both press ownership and the

---

27 It has to be noted here that some scholars have scruples about the notions of 'consumer sovereignty' and 'consumer representation', such as Murdock (1980:57) and Curran (1991: 96).
circulation and advertising markets have become increasingly concentrated. The already advantageous position of the two major newspapers, the United Daily News and the China Times, has been further consolidated, with hundred of other titles left vying for the remainder of the market. The new conditions have led to the demise of many of the government and party-owned newspapers and a number of small private newspapers as well. At the same time, the political partisanship of major Taiwanese business tycoons and press owners has opened space for dissident newspapers to enter the market, while with the rise of consumerism, a few local and specialised newspapers have also emerged. In conclusion, we can say that the politico-economic changes in Taiwan have redrawn the map of the press structure, led to new systems of management and new competitive strategies, and that in the remaining years of the 1990s it is certain that the map will continue changing.
Part Two

Research Methodology and Empirical Work
5.1 Introduction

This chapter introduces the empirical framework of the thesis by charting the course of the fieldwork undertaken and detailing the methodological approaches employed. To begin with, I will discuss the ‘triangulation’ procedure used, explaining why I choose to combine three research strategies—interviews, content analysis, and critical discourse analysis (CDA). The advantages and disadvantages of each research method will also be discussed, with a particular emphasis on the newly-emergent area of CDA. Then I will elaborate on the practicalities of the fieldwork process and the types of data collected.

5.2 Research Methodologies

As one of the principal purposes of this thesis is to explore how Taiwanese mainstream newspapers portray the island’s indigenous peoples, a systematic content analysis of this coverage is a necessary starting point. Research on minorities and media generally has been heavily reliant on content analysis of media images (e.g., Greenberg, 1986: 181; Wimmer and Dominick, 1983: 141).

Greenberg (1983: 671) suggests that in order to examine contemporary news coverage of minority peoples (here he specifically refers to Mexican Americans), there are ‘four central questions’ that have to be tackled by content analysis:

---

1 For the summary of the US content analysis research results in the 1980s, see Greenberg (1986).
1. **Prominence**: How much or what proportion of the total 'newshole' is given over to minorities? How and where is coverage displayed?

2. **Representation**: To what extent are the news sources or the bylined reporters identified or featured in stories?

3. **Content**: How often are members of minority groups the central characters in crime stories, sports, other hard news, or cultural features?

4. **Variability**: Are newspapers similar or disparate in the extent and kinds of coverage they provide?

These 'four central questions' were used as a basis for organising the content analysis of indigenous news in the mainstream newspapers of Taiwan reported in Chapter 7 of this thesis.

Although this framework provides a serviceable starting point for analysis, many scholars have observed that content analysis has its limits as a research tool. Fiske (1993: 140) comments that 'What content analysis cannot do is to help us answer the question, why?' Macdonald and Tipton (1993: 197) argue that in dealing with complex documents, content analysis does no kind of justice to an author's intentions. Moreover, Hartmann and Husband (1974: 128), who conducted one of the pioneering studies on news coverage of immigrant minorities in UK through a large-scale content analysis, note: ‘Newspapers make people aware of certain things, and suggest the degree of importance that different events and issues have by the amount and prominence of coverage that they give them....But the content analyst cannot claim to be studying events or their social consequences as such, nor can he claim to say much about what determines news output.'

Williams et al. (1988) summarise the strengths and weaknesses of content analysis in media research as follows:

Strengths are that content analyses can be used to describe trends in content over time. It provides a theoretical connection between the intentions of individuals and organisations producing media content and possible social consequences related to audience use of that content. It can test theories about the meaning of messages. Weaknesses are that content is often stripped of both its context and of the development of meaning occurring through relationships of the communication participants. Transcribing and coding messages is usually lengthy and costly (p. 37).
Nevertheless, as this thesis aims to uncover how indigenous peoples are represented and portrayed by the mainstream press of Taiwan, content analysis is still an important and indispensable method.

It is important to remember that in recent years, there has been a qualitative 'turn' and a greater insistence on methodological 'triangulation' in media research. Van Dijk (1988:125), for example, argues that a combination of quantitative and qualitative analysis is the only adequate approach to the study of mass media messages. He has frequently used both content analysis and discourse analysis in his own research on immigrant minorities in the Netherlands and UK, including the case studies in his books *News Analysis: Case Studies of International and National News in the Press* (1988)\(^2\); *Racism and the Press* (1991a); *Elite Discourse and Racism* (1993b), and his articles in the journal *Discourse and Society*, of which he is the editor.

He (1988: x) argues that discourse analysis complements traditional quantitative methods by allowing us to inquire into the formal structures of news reports and their subtle underlying meanings, in a way usually ignored in content analysis. He notes: ‘In principle a qualitative analysis, based on a theory of news discourse structures and processing, provides a more adequate approach to the study of news than classical content analysis’ (Ibid.: 123). Comparing content analysis with discourse analysis, he elaborates:

> While content analysis is primarily based on observable...data such as words, phrases, sentences or stylistic features, a discourse analysis will—apart from making explicit such surface structures in terms of modern grammars—also pay attention to underlying semantic structures, and make explicit implications, presuppositions, connections strategies, etc., which usually remain implicit in the discourse (Van Dijk, 1983).

In his ‘Editor’s Foreword to Critical Discourse Analysis,’ in *Discourse and Society* (1993c) he notes that: ‘One of the reasons that led to the foundation of this journal was to provide an international forum for critical research, and to stimulate

---

\(^2\) The case studies include the analysis of the international press coverage of the assassination of president-elect Bechir Gemayel of Lebanon, the Tamil panic and the squatters in the Dutch press. The three cases were all conducted by an integration of content and critical discourse analyses.
more active sociopolitical analyses in the study of discourse. After 20 years and many studies in the fields of pragmatics, semiotics, and discourse analysis, we need to go beyond mere description and explanation, and pay more explicit attention to the sociopolitical and cultural presupposition and implications of discourse analysis'(Van Dijk, 1993c).

Van Dijk and other critical linguists have been particularly active in advancing the claims of 'Critical Discourse Analysis'. Van Dijk argues that CDA should deal primarily with the discourse dimensions of power abuse and the injustice and inequality that result from it. He emphasised that unlike other currents of work within discourse analysis, it should take an explicit sociopolitical stance, in which the critical target is 'the power elites that enact, sustain, legitimate, condone or ignore social inequality and injustice' (Van Dijk, 1993a: 252). Claiming that CDA cannot therefore be neutral, he explains: 'Although our first task is to systematically examine the many textual and contextual properties of the exercise of dominance for this example, and to provide explicit evidence for such an account, analysis is not—and cannot be—"neutral". Indeed the point of critical discourse analysis is to take a position'(Ibid.: 270), 'against the power elites and in solidarity with dominated groups'(Ibid.: 279).

Van Dijk (1997: 22) elaborates on this position further, saying that instead of merely focusing on their discipline and its theories and paradigms, critical discourse analysts focus on relevant social problems, i.e., their work is more 'issue-oriented' than 'theory-oriented'. He argues:

Analysis, description and theory formation play a role especially in as far as they allow better understanding and critique of social inequality, based on gender, ethnicity, class, origin, religion, language, sexual orientation and other criteria that define differences between people. Their ultimate goal is not only scientific, but also social and political, namely change. In that case, social discourse analysis takes the form of a critical discourse analysis (emphasis original) (Ibid.: 22-23).

Van Dijk (Ibid.: 23) adds that this enterprise is a political and moral task. Critical scholars hold that it is not always possible to neatly distinguish between doing 'value-free' and technical discourse analysis on the one hand, and engaging in social, cultural or political critique on the other. In their view, discourse is an inherent part of society
and partakes in all society's injustices, as well as in the struggle against them. They do not merely observe such linkages between discourse and societal structures, but aim to be agents of change, and do so in solidarity with those who need such change most.

Although Fairclough and Wodak (1997: 258-9) concur with Van Dijk in arguing that CDA is not dispassionate and objective but engaged and committed, they are at pains to stress that it employs rigorous and systematic techniques of analysis which meet the 'normal' standards of the social sciences. They note:

It is a form of intervention in social practice and social relationships: many analysts are politically active against racism, or as feminists, or within the peace movement, and so forth. But CDA is not an exception to the normal objectivity of social science. . . . What is distinctive about CDA is both that it intervenes on the side of dominated and oppressed groups and against dominating groups, and that it openly declares the emancipatory interests that motivate it. The political interests and uses of social scientific research are usually less explicit. This certainly does not imply that CDA is less scholarly than other research: standards of careful, rigorous and systematic analysis apply with equal force to CDA as to other approaches (Ibid.).

According to Fairclough and Wodak (1997: 260), CDA was developed within 'Western Marxism', where culture (and particularly, ideology) is more emphasised than in other forms of Marxism. Critical discourse analysts do not always explicitly place themselves within this legacy, but it frames their work nevertheless. They also offer an overview of some of the most important theoretical approaches to CDA. They are:

1. French Discourse Analysis (represented by Michel Pecheux)
2. Critical Linguists (Roger Fowler et al., Gunther Kress and Robert Hodge)
3. Social Semiotics (Robert Hodge and Gunther Kress)
4. Sociocultural Change and Change in Discourse (Norman Fairclough)
5. Socio-cognitive Studies (Teun A. Van Dijk)
6. Discourse-Historical Method (Ruth Wodak)
7. Reading Analysis (Utz Maas)
8. Duisburg School (Siegfried Jager) (Fairclough and Wodak, 1997: 262-268)
Kress (1996: 15) has summarised the goal of critical linguistics and CDA in this way; that they have from the beginning had a political project of altering inequitable distributions of economic, cultural and political goods in contemporary societies. He argues that 'the intention has been to bring a system of excessive inequalities of power into crisis by uncovering its workings and its effects through the analysis of potent cultural objects—texts—and thereby to help in achieving a more equitable social order' (Ibid.). In recent years, CDA has become increasingly important in critical studies of language, and has effectively encompassed a wide variety of critical linguistic enterprises under its banner.

This present thesis combines Greenberg’s programme for content analysis with CDA. The reason is two-fold. First, it is hoped to make best use of the advantages of content analysis by answering Greenberg’s ‘four central questions.’ Secondly, it is hoped to overcome the limitations of content analysis raised by the scholars mentioned above, by drawing on the style of discourse analysis propounded by Teun A. Van Dijk and Norman Fairclough, among others. The other major method employed in this thesis is the personal interview. They were used to collect first-hand accounts of the news production process in the mainstream media organisations and to explore the meaning and motivations of indigenous media for practitioners. The interview process will be described in more detail later.

5.3 Data-Collection Fieldwork

On June 7, 1994 I set out for Taiwan. During the following eight-month fieldwork research period (June 7, 1994–Feb. 17, 1995) in Taiwan, I successfully collected a very substantial amount of data relating to the main foci of my research. In retrospect, I deem the exercise a success in the sense that I collected or photocopied all the empirical data required by this thesis. I was especially impressed by the levels of support offered by my interview subjects. This section describes the fieldwork process, the steps taken to collect the basic sets of data, and the analytical rationales for the three research methodologies selected.
5.3.1 The Content Analysis Study

In the first three months of my fieldwork, I was engaged mainly in collecting and photocopying all the relevant news items in sample newspapers selected for the content analysis study. Most of the materials were obtained through the National Central Library in Taipei.

However, in the course of the data collection, new ideas and thinking spurred by my continuing literature survey and by my interviews led me to amend parts of my fieldwork proposal. For example, the newspaper sample originally included four titles: the China Times; the United Daily News; the Central Daily News; and the Independent Morning Post, all based in Taipei, the capital city in the north part of Taiwan (see Table 4.3). However, later on, I became increasingly aware that this selection excluded important southern newspapers. Given that the research aims to explore indigenous news portrayals in the mainstream press as a whole, I felt obligated to include additional titles. These were: the Taiwan Times, the Commons (both based in Kaohsiung, the southern port metropolis in Taiwan) and the Liberty Times, which, although it is headquartered in Taipei, has acquired recognition as one of the leading nationally-circulated newspapers of Taiwan.3

The sample period selected for the analysis ranged from 1 January, 1994 to 30 June, 1994. This was a carefully considered choice. On the one hand, I tried to avoid collecting news stories in 1993. Because this was the year declared by the United Nations as the ‘International Year of the Indigenous Peoples’, this could have distorted the normal distribution of news production. On the other hand, there was an unprecedented election for provincial Governor of Taiwan in December 1994, which is generally recognised as an important milestone in Taiwan’s democratisation. On a closer examination, I found that national attention, including public opinion and the media, had been focused on this historic event since July or August 1994, and as I argued in Chapter 4, the mainstream press of Taiwan is strongly politically-orientated and ideologically-imbued. I therefore selected the first half of 1994 as the sample period with a double purposes. One was to minimise the effect of the Governor

---

3 For more details about the seven sample newspapers, see Chapter 4.
election on indigenous news production, the other was to acquire the most recent possible data for analysis.

As a result of this decision, 880 photocopied news items about Taiwan's indigenous peoples printed in the seven national newspapers between 1 January and 30 June, 1994 were collected. These were analysed using the mainframe SPSS (see Chapter 7 for the resulting content analysis).

5.3.2 The Critical Discourse Analysis Study

The content analysis study reveals that the area of indigenous news covered most by the mainstream newspapers are cultural events, in most cases accompanied by colorful pictures. I therefore decided to undertake a case study of one particularly important aboriginal cultural event in the hope of developing a further understanding of the implicit meanings underpinning indigenous cultural news and their possible articulations with Chinese racial ideology. The case in point is the Mayasvi, a traditional war ritual of the Tsou tribe in central Taiwan. This was held on February 15, 1995 near at the end of my fieldwork period. Coverage of this rite by the seven sample newspapers was collected for the period from February 12-18, 1995, and provided 16 news items and 10 photos.

The critical discourse analysis conducted on this material aims to elucidate how mainstream newspapers construct indigenous peoples as others, and to what extent indigenous cultural news reinforces and reproduces the racist ideology of sinocentrism. These are issues of central concern to this thesis, and since they cannot be uncovered by content analysis alone, it is necessary to analyse in a more qualitative and critical way not only news texts themselves but their articulations with institutional and societal domains (see Chapter 8 for this analysis).
5.3.3 The Interview Study

The interview study set out to collect first-hand accounts of both Han Chinese and aboriginal journalists. The reasons were two-fold. One was to explore the degree of relative autonomy enjoyed by indigenous news production in the mainstream newspapers. The other was to gain insights into the professional experiences of journalists and the general contextual constraints operating in news production.

As mentioned earlier, content analysis has limits as a research tool. Negrine (1989: 130) argues that although useful and informative, it is unable to reveal anything about either news producers' intentions concerning content or actual or intended audience effects. For the purpose of this thesis, interviews were vitally important in order to elicit the intentions of news producers and, more importantly, to explore the dynamics of gathering, processing and selecting indigenous stories in the news organisations. The interviews were informal, unstructured, and in-depth in order to maximise the possibilities for exploring underlying ethnic opinions and attitudes (Van Dijk, 1987: 18).

I conducted a total of forty two interviews with news reporters, editors, editor-in-chiefs and publishers, from both mainstream newspaper organisations and indigenous-owned journals. Among the interview subjects, 28 were Han Chinese and 14 belonged to indigenous groups (See Appendix 1-'List of the 42 Interview Subjects'). Thirty six subjects were personally interviewed, all in Taipei, except for no. 13. The other six subjects were interviewed by telephone. Among the 36 face-to-face interviews, 21 were conducted in the interviewee's office, and the others were held either in public places, such as coffee and tea shops (10 ), in the office of the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly (4) or at home (1). Most of the face-to-face interviews lasted for

---

4 No. 13 is the founder of Hunter's Culture, who teaches in a primary school in an Atayal aboriginal township in central Taiwan. The interview was conducted in his office at the village school.
5 The telephone interviews were conducted because of time constraints. They were with subjects nos. 27, 32, 39, 40, 41, and 42 (see Appendix 1). Four were carried out near the end of my fieldwork.
6 The office of the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly is ideally located in Taipei and often used as a meeting place for indigenous and Chinese university students, intellectuals, writers, artists and journalists to exchange views and opinions about aboriginal issues.
about one hour, though some were half an hour and some more than two hours. The telephone interviews were relatively short, ranging from 10 to 30 minutes.

On the whole, I deem the interview exercise a success, for three reasons. Firstly, almost all the subjects who received my letter accepted my request for interviews, although a few either altered the time of the appointment or had to curtail the interview due to an unexpected or important meeting. Secondly, all the face-to-face interview subjects agreed to my request for tape-recording which had been mentioned in my formal request letter sent previously and confirmed by an oral request at our meeting. The 36 tape-recorded interviews and the six telephone interviews were recorded on to 30 one and half hour audio tapes which were then transcribed in Chinese during my fieldwork period. These interview cassette tapes were very helpful not only in transcribing but enhancing the reliability of the interview data.

However, it has to be admitted that the interview exercise was not without its problems. This seems unavoidable. As mentioned earlier it was not until the later stages of my fieldwork that I included the other three titles—the Taiwan Times, the Commons and the Liberty Times—in the sample. Because of time constraints only one telephone interview from this group was made, with the editor of Literature Supplement page of Taiwan Times (No. 42 in the Appendix 1). In an attempt to compensate, materials from a range of journals and articles relating to the news and management strategies of the three newspapers were collected for reference. On the other hand, the interviews with indigenous elites were relatively comprehensive and included the founders or publishers

---

7 Only no. 30 was conducted at the interviewee's home. See Appendix 1.
8 The interview request was only turned down by one reporter and by the editor-in-chief of the KMT-owned Central Daily News. The former explained that he was not covering indigenous news anymore, and the latter claimed he had a very tight schedule. However, the KMT's newspaper assigned a deputy editor-in-chief to receive me. The acting editor-in-chief of the Independent Morning Post had to run an errand to southern Taiwan on account of the Taiwan Provincial Governor's election. For this reason he altered the pre-arranged time of our appointment twice. However, he has also apologised twice for the postponement before the scheduled interview. Finally, the editor-in-chief of the China Times was summoned to attend a reception meeting for a visiting delegation of foreign journalists, so he apologised for having to end the interview after 25 minutes.
of the three major indigenous journals, the *Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly*, the *Hunter's Culture* and the *Indigenous Post*.

In addition, I have managed to collect a range of other important materials relating to these three indigenous journals, concerning their contents, advertising, and layout format. The results will be discussed in Chapter 9. Most importantly, my interviews with the founders of these indigenous magazines produced revealing insights into their formation, management and predicament, enabling me to understand their dynamics and meanings more fully.

As for the questions asked in interviews, I designed four sets: two for Chinese journalists and scholars, and two for indigenous interviewees. The questions for Chinese interviewees were designed mainly to illuminate indigenous news production process and its contextual factors. On the other hand, the questions for indigenous interviewees revolved around their motives and experiences as well as the difficulties and outlooks of their journals and magazines (see Appendix 2—'List of Questions for the Interviewees').

However, it has to be pointed out that these protocols were intended simply as a general guide for the interviewer. In practice, they were implemented on a selective basis, depending upon the organisations the interviewees worked for and their positions. For example, questions on editorial policy, organisational challenges and personnel and circulation strategies were raised with the Chinese editors-in-chief and indigenous publishers, not with reporters and editors. The interview technique was designed to stimulate free-flowing discussion in an open and informal atmosphere, in the hope of encouraging respondents to reveal insights and points that the interviewer may not already know.9

Finally, it is worth noting that some of the Han journalists I interviewed were well-known among indigenous intellectuals, having covered aboriginal news for many years. The interviewed Chinese scholars were mainly from the Department of Ethnology, Academia Sinica, the most prestigious research institute in Taiwan. They are widely considered as 'experts' on aboriginal affairs on the basis of their research on

---

aboriginal cultures in such fields as anthropology, ethnology and ethnic relations. I included them on the interview list to obtain information relating to their views on ethnic relations and general media performance. The interviews with indigenous subjects included those attending the 'pre-job' training programme held by the Public TV Organising Committee,\(^{10}\) though some were already employed in radio broadcasting and print media.

Overall, the 42 interviewees can be divided into a 'media group' (30 out of 42) and a 'non-media group' (12 out of 42). Table 5.1 shows the distribution of the 42 interview subjects.

As we can see from Table 5.1, of the 30 interviewees in the 'media group', 22 work for newspapers and journals, whereas eight work for the broadcasting media, including the four indigenous 'reporters-to-be.' Among the 'non-media group', half are scholars, evenly divided between the Academia Sinica (3) and universities (3). If we look at the gender of all interviewees (detailed in Appendix 1), we see that there are 13 females (31%) and 29 males (69%).

As a supplement to the interviews, I designed an 'Interviewee's Background Form' (see Appendix 3) for the interviewees to fill out as soon as the interview finished. It included name, age, gender, level of education, race, organisation, position, years of experience, religion and political affiliation. This was designed to provide more details about the background of subjects.

\(^{10}\) At the present time, the proposed Chinese Public TV (CPTV) is not formally established because its organisational bill is still under review in the Legislative Yuan. Therefore, I dubbed the indigenous journalists who were attending the 'pre-job' training programme as 'reporters-to-be,' because they were not formally employed as staff reporters by the proposed Public TV.
Table 5.1
Distribution of 42 Interview Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Media Group (30)</th>
<th>Media Organisations</th>
<th>No. of Interviews</th>
<th>Media Organisations</th>
<th>No. of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China Times</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Indigenous Post</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Daily News</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Jade Bi-weekly</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Reporters to be for the proposed CPTV</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Taiwan Television (TTV)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Radio Station</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Communication and Video Co.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunter’s Culture</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-Media Group (12)</th>
<th>Occupations</th>
<th>No. of Interviews</th>
<th>Occupations</th>
<th>No. of Interviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Scholars</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Indigenous</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>representative</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government officials</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Poet</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous movement leader</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Advertising agent</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Total                                                 | 42                  |                   |                         |

Note:
One of the interviewees from the CT, the UDN and the IMP each is from their affiliated evening newspapers—China Times Express, United Evening News, and Independent Evening Post.

As for the indigenous materials collection, I collected all the issues of the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly, most of the Indigenous Post, and a few from the
Hunter’s Culture, in addition to interviewing 14 indigenous subjects. On the whole, I was satisfied with the amount and quality of the data collected during my fieldwork. This was probably due to the fact that most of the journalists and scholars I interviewed were either experienced in covering indigenous news or well-known as leading experts in aboriginal studies and therefore had a special interest in the topic of the thesis.

5.4 Concluding Remarks

For the purpose of this study, this thesis applies a ‘triangulation’ approach, pulling together the results of these methodological exercises—interviews, content analysis and critical discourse analysis. The content analysis is used to examine the general patterns of representation of indigenous peoples by the mainstream press of Taiwan, while the CDA approach explores the coverage of one aboriginal cultural event more qualitatively. Since this thesis also investigates the production of the indigenous news, interviews were an indispensable research method. As mentioned earlier in this enterprise, the counter-discourses of the indigenous press are as important as the analysis of discourses in Taiwan’s mainstream newspapers. How they are constructed in indigenous journals will therefore be explored through a combination of qualitative textual interpretation and interviews. However, it is with an analysis of the mainstream that we begin.

11 Indigenous journals are irregularly produced and Hunter’s Culture already ceased its publication (which will be discussed in Chapter 9), so the collection of them is not an easy task. The author subscribed the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly during my fieldwork and managed to get most of the Indigenous Post, but the Hunter’s Culture was hard to get.
6.1 Introduction

This chapter elaborates on some important factors, external and internal, that shape and constrain the presentation of indigenous news in the mainstream press. Most of the discussion that follows is based upon the information collected from my interviews with Han Chinese journalists employed in the sampled newspapers. It starts with an account of external influences, including the impact of the ongoing process of political democratisation on press performance, and the roles of advertising and audience seeking strategies as a possible contextual constraint on reporting. It then proceeds to look at key internal influences on news production, particularly the relative professional autonomy of journalists within news organisations.

6.2 External Influences

6.2.1 Political Democratisation and Historical Debt

Golding (1974: 78) has argued that 'it is meaningless to discuss any social institution such as mass communication as though it operated in isolation, unconnected to other social processes.' In Taiwan's context, any attempt to contextualise the news-making process needs to begin with political influences. In Chapter 4, I noted that in the wake of the Taiwan's continuing political democratisation, there have been

---

1 The discussion of this chapter is mainly based upon my interviews with 17 Han Chinese journalists from the mainstream newspapers (see Table 5.1 in Chapter 5).
substantial changes in the structure and performance of the press. This chapter intends to flesh out these political impacts in as far as they are manifest in the process of indigenous news production. In making sense of the changing newspaper environment Chang's vivid description serves as a good start:

Before the government lifted its ban on the registration of new newspapers five years ago, there were only thirty-one dailies on the island, about twelve of them in Taipei. The flimsy twelve pages that were then the legal limit have also expanded to a fat thirty to fifty pages per issue. Leafing through those pages reveals big changes inside. Increased coverage of environmental protection issues, health and consumer information, travel and leisure, women's issues, and the arts show that papers are responding to the changing lifestyles of Taiwan's newly prosperous society. Even the design of many papers is different, most of them now full of high-quality color photos. Computerisation has also brought a higher quality of design and more creative use of ad. space. The most significant changes, however, are found in the content of the news. Gone are the one-sided articles on government policy announcements, bland reports of predictable legislative sessions, and stereotypically negative stories on mainland China that once made up a large part of news coverage. Now newspapers are reporting on sensitive subjects once considered taboo—opposition party politics, the Taiwan independence movement, disagreements within the ruling party, and mainland Chinese culture. And few news reporters worry about offending government officials or politicians, as was once the case. In fact, they are likely to play up disagreements between political figures. Even the president can no longer escape the rolling wheels of the printing press (Chang, 1993: 4-6).

The deputy editor-in-chief of the KMT-run Central Daily News (No.31/M/41/HQ2), while admitting that indigenous affairs were 'relatively neglected' before political democratisation, argued that there has been increased attention and coverage in recent years, attributing this to Taiwan's democratisation. He said:

After the lifting of the newspaper ban, this is, of course, related to Taiwan's greater openness and democratisation. When democracy is more open, more voices come out. When these voices come out, you as a spokesman for public interest, you, of course, have to reflect their voices. So after the lifting of the ban, coupled with the democratisation, there is no more restrictions on the number of pages. Everyone and every media can pay more attention to the news of civic organisations and minority groups. It is particularly so in the recent two or three years. Therefore, the Central Daily News is now also heading toward this direction.

---

2 This refers to subject no. 31 on the list of the interview subjects who is a male, 41 years of age and a Han Chinese (See Appendix 1).
However, he made it clear that the increased attention to indigenous news can not be explained only by the increase in pages, which, he argues, is merely a 'technical' factor. Democratisation, he asserts, is the fundamental cause of this change.

The most important, of course, is the democratisation! After the democratisation, nowadays, everything (.)³ This is what Lee Teng-hui [the president] called 'people's sovereignty.' The sovereignty of the people means that we have to reflect the vox populi. The whole society now is different from the past which had more homogeneous voice. It is a plural society and plural voice! As a media, of course, you have to reflect the vox populi!...If the media can pay more attention to these problems, or even encourage and monitor the government, or let the submerged and repressed voices of the minority groups speak out, I believe the newspaper will be more responsible to the readers, won't it? Basically, it was caused by the democratisation....It is not only because of the increase in pages. The page increase is, after all, a technical dimension only.

The editor-in-chief of the China Times (No.36/M/50s/HC)⁴ argued that more attention should be given to indigenous concerns. He offered two reasons. One is the 'historical debt', and the other the need to support disadvantaged groups. He gave the following account of the 'historical debt':

They [Yuanchumin] came earlier to this place [Taiwan]. Their problems, their encounters, and their sense of belonging need our concern. But there is none [no concern from us]. We feel that this is like a debt and you have to pay the debt by forty years' installments. Due to the historical factors and the special situation of the current environment, we have to hurry to clear all our debts before the lifting of the martial law and political relaxation. Otherwise, it will become a big problem. So, as a media, we feel (.) it is as if we had a debt and should face this problem. So we feel...our government should step up its effort to pay more concern to these problems. The media should also report well. This is the first reason. The second reason is, ...take Yuanchumin as an example, indeed, it is a disadvantaged group worthy of more concern.... Indigenous problems have already taken shape in the 60s and 70s, not to mention of the 80s. But whoever it is, the government, society or the people, no one has paid any attention to their problems. Even if there was any, it would be very superficial. So standing on the position of the historical debt of the government to solve their problems on the one hand, and aligning ourselves with the disadvantaged group on the other, we [China Times] have consistently attached much more attention to this problem.

³ Pauses are marked with a dot in parenthesis—(.)
⁴ Among the face-to-face interview subjects, the editor-in-chief of the China Times is the only one not to complete the 'Interviewee's Background Form' (see Appendix 3). Therefore, his age, '50s' is my guesstimate.
So both editors above agreed that indigenous concerns had been neglected before, but that democratisation and the ensuing relaxation of press legislations have created favourable conditions for the press’ increasing attention to indigenous affairs and to other disadvantaged minorities, such as women, labor, consumers, the disabled, anti-nuclear and environmental groups. Up until recently, these have always been considered ‘marginal issues’ or ‘weak issues’ in the media. For example, a researcher in the News Department of the Public Television Organising Committee (No.6/F/38/HC) argued strongly that:

I have always thought that public TV should belong to the people. I also support the views that Yuanchumin deserve a niche in the domain of public TV, because the three network TVs and the other media have always regarded indigenous news as a marginal issue. Despite the fact that some important and large-scale social movement news may hit the front page, almost all of the others are subject to neglect and exclusion. Not only indigenous news, but women and labor have had the same mistreatment from the media.

However, the fact that there is more indigenous news now than before does not necessarily indicate that there has been better coverage since democratisation. Nor should we think that the status of indigenous news as a ‘marginal issue’ has been greatly improved, as will be discussed later in this chapter. At the same time, there is little doubt that the new political environment has, at least, opened up more spaces and prompted by guilt-stricken feelings of an ‘historical debt’, spurred the news media to attach more attention than before to previously neglected issues and groups, including the indigenous minority. As the director of Dimensions Communications (No.9/M/41/HC), who has produced several documentary films about indigenous culture and society for the public TV\(^5\), put it:

The media tended to have a more sympathetic coverage [to Yuanchumin]. We can see from the news about Yuanchumin in the big dailies that there seemed to be a redemptive feeling [ in the papers] that started to generate very sympathetic writings....Such stuff did not really appear until one or two years ago.

---

\(^5\) It has to be pointed out that although Public TV is not yet formally established in Taiwan, the current three network TVs, as required by the Broadcasting Law, have been allotting air time for the CPTV’s (Chinese Public Television) educational and cultural programmes and documentaries for many years.
It is against the background of the altered political environment of Taiwan's press and its influence on performance, that we now turn to examine the economic dimensions of indigenous news production.

### 6.2.2 Economic Constraints: Advertisers & Audiences

In this section, I will discuss the relation of indigenous news to advertisers and audiences, focusing particularly on changes in the press environment, readers' tastes, and advertisers' (dis)interest in news about indigenous affairs. The question of how important (or unimportant) indigenous news and stories are to advertisers and newspapers will be tackled here based upon the interview data.

In capitalist countries, newspapers often depend for their survival more on advertising revenue than on circulation sales. As Grenier (1994: 332) notes: 'Since it is known that the bulk of the revenue of newspapers is derived directly from advertising, it is clear that newspapers are not only, or even mainly, in the business of selling a commodity called “newspapers”. Total reliance of newspapers on circulation revenue would almost certainly lead to the rapid disappearance of newspaper organisations as we know them.' Silverblatt (1995: 145) observes that newspapers' dependence on advertising revenue can have an impact on content, and that instances in which reporters have been called off stories involving advertisers are innumerable. Shoemaker and Mayfield (1987) further underline the view that sources of finance (including, of course, advertisers) are generally strongly influential on all aspects of news production and that a funder's ideology is likely to have an ultimate effect on editorial decisions relevant to this ideology.

In an attempt to give these assertions a more concrete foundation, Grenier (1994: 327-332) suggests four thesis for explaining the negative coverage of the 'Oka Crisis'

---

6 For example, during the interview, the editor-in-chief of the China Times (No.36/M/50s/HC) revealed that approximately 80% of its net income comes from advertising revenue and the other 20% from circulation sales.

7 Cited from McQuail, 1992: 133.
in Canada. They are the audience thesis, the activity thesis, the organisational thesis, and the power structure thesis. He argues strongly that the last of these provides the best explanation of the coverage, since representations of this incident cannot be isolated from the overall economic structure of the news organisation, in this case, the Montreal Gazette. As he explains the central argument of the power structure thesis is that newspapers are first and foremost business enterprises constrained by the need to design and direct their internal and external environment to permit the acquisition and maximisation of capital (profit). He also points out that newspaper organisations are primarily in the business of selling fractions of the general public (audiences) to interested advertisers hoping to sell their products or services. He notes:

*From the point of view of such advertisers, it probably matters little how particular social groups, individuals or events are portrayed by the newspaper in which they advertise their goods or services, unless such portrayal directly or indirectly adversely affects business sales or image. The more newspapers that are sold by a particular newspaper enterprise, the more advertisers in that newspaper are afforded access to a larger audience for their commodities (emphasis mine, Ibid.: 332).*

However, his analysis of the coverage of Oka crisis (which is based on a content study) fails to provide a robust empirical evidence to support the power structure thesis. In the absence of information on the inner workings of the news organisation, he is unable to specify how significant or in what ways advertisers and other financial backers directly (or indirectly) exerted influence. Admittedly, exploring how the economic and financial structures of a news organisation constrain or affect news production may be a hard nut to crack, however, it is possible to derive some insights into this ambiguous area from fieldwork interviews.

---

8 The 'Oka crisis' refers to the Oka Mohawk Indians' blockade against the riot-geared provincial police of Canada, resulting in a tragic and bloody clash in July 1990.
'Indigenous news is not saleable.'

In terms of the economic influences on the specific areas of news under discussion here, perhaps the first question that is directly related to the media's attention is to ask how saleable and marketable indigenous news is. The editor of the 'Formosa Island' edition of the *China Times* (No.8/F/31/HC) claimed (when she worked for the *Times Weekly* [affiliated with the *China Times News Group*] before joining the *China Times*), that 'Indigenous news is not saleable.' She remembered that at that time, only one indigenous story featured prominently in the *Times Weekly*. This was a family suicide tragedy involving four deaths in the Fu-hsing aboriginal township in northern Taiwan. It would be a little too crude, however, to say that no indigenous news is saleable. The saleability of news often depends upon the genre and the availability of pictures, and the newspapers' willingness to use 'tabloid' techniques of presentation. In the Oka crisis, for example, Grenier (Ibid.: 333) draws attention to the sensationalisation of information. In addition to the growth of 'tabloid' techniques in Taiwan, readers' tastes are also changing. In the recent years of political democratisation, an increasing number of readers have become more concerned about local cultures and human interest stories. This new situation dictates that newspapers have to swim with the tide and adjust themselves to cater to readers' needs. This, in turn, imposes new constraints on journalists.

A reporter from the *Independent Morning Post* (No.12/F/29/HC) expressed her misgivings about the growth of 'reader's supremacy' in the media today. She said: 'The communication media in Taiwan are too ingratiating to the needs of the average public and readers. They are relentless and cannot lead social customs. [They are] too obsequious to the market. They have to survive, but they can't help it.'

The importance of the market to the media was nowhere better described than in the following comment made by the Chief Editorialist of the *Jade Bi-weekly* (No.38/M/55/HC):

---

9 *Jade Bi-weekly* was involved in a dispute with Fu-hsing Atayal tribe township on account of its biased and sensational coverage of the township's young prostitutes, resulting in aboriginal fury and protest.
We are totally private. We, of course, follow entirely market orientation as our [management] basis. One of the regrettable things today is that, the mass media in Taiwan have entered into the phase of the Warring States Period.\footnote{The expression ‘Warring States Period’ (originally 403-246 B.C.) now refers in modern usage to the present tumultuous situation.} ...I feel that a lot of things today have become totally centered on the needs of the audience, how to ingratiate the audience and how to attract the audience and readers' attention....But regretfully speaking, for the purpose of its survival and a need of the market, it [the news organisation] often has to ingratiate....This is a very sad thing. But fortunately, Jade has been in Taiwan for 12 years.... most of the time, we feel that we grasp the so-called [social] pulse.\footnote{David Deacon’s handout for his class of ‘Producing the News’ in the Department of Social Sciences, Loughborough University, in 1995.} This so-called pulse, frankly speaking, is to the effect that, we must grasp the so-called needs of the market. That’s all.

A reporter on the United Daily News (No.22/M/40/HC) talked of the particularly disadvantageous position of Yuanchumin in relation to the current political and economic marketplace:

When a newspaper is considering editorial policy, it has to consider its market. And Yuanchumin, basically.\footnote{Broadsheet press are more keen to the imperative of advertising maximisation than the other print media, as evidenced by the China Times.} First, they are disadvantaged in terms of political power. In terms of apparent newspaper circulation or advertising support, they are more disadvantaged. They are a minority. In other words, it is very difficult to have a large newspaper page [to cover their news] in response.

‘The advertisers are very realistic.’

Although more research needs to be done on the degree of the dependency of the Jade Bi-weekly and other broadsheet newspapers on advertising revenue,\footnote{The more the circulation figure of the newspaper, the more advertising revenue it accrues. As was said by the editor-in-chief of the China Times (No.36/M/50s/HC):} it is widely known that advertising revenue follows the tail of the circulation figure which is vital to the prestige of all media.\footnote{Advertisers are very realistic. One classified ad., for example, a house for rent, probably needs thousands of [Taiwan] dollars. But [it matters a lot] whether you get forty phone}
calls of inquiry or 20 or not even one [call]. [So] advertising clients are very realistic as to whether the ad. has an effect or not. The readership [figure] can not be fabricated [to win advertisers].

This outline of the external forces shaping news suggests that indigenous news is inevitably constrained by the logic of the newspapers' changed context, 'they have to survive, but they can't help it.' Indigenous peoples are disadvantaged as a potential focus of attention because they are both relatively politically-powerless and economically insignificant. As a consequence, they are incapable of wielding significant power over newspaper owners and advertising barons, as they constitute such a tiny and poor segment of the audience market, either as readers of newspapers or consumers of the advertised commodities. This is the hard reality that underlines our discussion of the production of indigenous news.

At this point, it seems that there has been no concrete evidence produced which suggests that advertising clients interfere directly or indirectly with indigenous news makers. However, we cannot rule out the possibility that advertisers may intervene if the actions of indigenous peoples threaten their corporate interests, for example, by protesting against a development project they have proposed in aboriginal townships and communities. Nevertheless, generally speaking, my evidence suggests that advertisers are not at all interested in indigenous news production, let alone interfering directly with portrayals and contents. As noted by McQuail (1992:299), many social or cultural minority groups are probably 'under-represented' by the media (in the sense of attracting insufficient and ill-proportioned coverage), but the reason is that they lack advertiser appeal, intrinsic glamour or audience appeal.

The War between the 'Formosa Island' and the 'Flourishing' Editions

To illustrate the importance of a market (audience) perspective in explaining indigenous news production, I'd like to briefly review the cut-throat competition between the ‘Formosa Island’ edition of the China Times and the ‘Flourishing’ edition

---

13 See 3.3- ‘Taiwan Indigenous Peoples Today’ in Chapter 3 of this thesis.
of the *United Daily News* to attract local readers.\(^\text{14}\) Both papers claim to have the largest circulations in Taiwan, but the sales figures are highly confidential.\(^\text{15}\) In recent years local 'culture and art' and 'human interest' stories have increasingly become a mainstay of the mainstream newspapers. This may be explained by the fact that, on the one hand, local culture and art news and human interest stories are perhaps more saleable now and, on the other hand, that many 'cultural' editions in the mainstream newspapers have been established to cater to the needs of readers.

The editor of the 'Formosa Island' edition of the *China Times* (No.8/F/31/HC) recounted that the establishment of this edition was based strongly upon circulation considerations:

> At that time the reason why the newspaper [*China Times*] had such an edition was principally because of the circulation....The consideration of the newspaper was to promote the sales in the local areas....The local reactions were extremely good, because many small towns and townships have never been reported. They have their own characteristics and their own cultures. We went to do in-depth reports. Local folks were very pleased too.

She added that the *China Times* is a fast-changing newspaper. Many editions have been replaced, usually in two or three years, if they were no longer popular or saleable. 'Formosa Island' however has received glowing reviews and many newspaper chiefs have insisted on keeping it. As the editor-in-chief of the *China Times* (No.36/M/50s/HC) commented on this edition in this way: 'The more local, more native, and the more capable of integrating the characteristics of various ethnic cultures, the better. So its many years of management are not bad.'

Another important motivation behind the launch of 'Formosa Island', as the editor admitted, was the *China Times*’ desire to attack the 'Flourishing' edition, the cultural edition of the rival *United Daily News*. 'In fact, in the very beginning, the mission it

---

\(^\text{14}\) The 'Formosa Island' section of the *China Times* and the 'Culture Square' section of the *United Daily News* are the two editions that are most likely to carry indigenous cultural news and human interest stories. The 'Flourishing' edition of the UDN is also noted for its cultural news.

\(^\text{15}\) See Chapter 4 of this thesis.
[China Times] gave me was to set up an edition to compete with the "Flourishing" edition, said the editor of the 'Formosa Island' edition.

Believing the news management philosophy that 'News is an everyday war....Even if there is no strong competitor outside, you have to compete with yourself,' the editor-in-chief of the United Daily News (No.33/M/48/HC) argued:

If it doesn't have its readership, if it doesn't do good to our circulation or the whole image [of the newspaper], does the [cultural] edition still have a need to exist?

So the continuing existence of the cultural editions, such as the 'Formosa Island' edition of the CT and the 'Culture Square' and the 'Flourishing' editions of the UDN are clearly indicative of the fact that they command a market— a readership who wants to consume the local culture.

At this point, three points pertaining to external influences on the production of indigenous news can be summarised as follows:

1. In general, indigenous news is not salable because in the current press market, news must appeal to the largest possible readership, in this case, the non-indigenous Han population. However, indigenous news and stories, if given a suitably sensational and colorful appeal, may be saleable.

2. As indigenous peoples constitute only a small and relatively poor sector of the consumer market, they are not particularly attractive to the advertisers.

3. There have been considerable changes in readers' tastes in recent years in Taiwan. The mainstream newspapers have been highly attentive to this tendency, resulting in their reformulation of page layouts and the creation of more cultural editions to accommodate this changed situation. This has opened up more potential spaces for indigenous cultural news.

This shift may provide a partial explanation for the relative prominence of aboriginal news in recent years, despite its other economic disabilities.
6.3 Internal Influences

6.3.1 The Role of Owners

McQuail (1987: 154-155) notes that there is much evidence to confirm the view that the piper’s paymaster ultimately calls the tune. He argues that in many circumstances, financial pressure does restrict real freedom and has consequences for quality, and that with market considerations penetrating all levels of decision making, the scope for professional freedom seems very restricted. In addition, he writes that despite the widespread norm that proprietors ought to refrain from using their power to interfere with editorial decisions (as this would eventually destroy credibility and business effectiveness), most theorists, especially those critical of monopoly media, hold that proprietorial influence is ever-present, even inevitable, as a latent force (McQuail, 1992: 117).

‘All newspapers will live well if there is no indigenous news.’

It is problematic to assume that there is a definite policy in relation to indigenous news. Indeed, most of the newspapers denied it on the grounds that it goes against the grain of journalistic professionalism. This view was strongly stated by the editor-in-chief of the United Daily News (No.33/M/48/HC), who argued that he had not given any directives to journalists and editors.

Basically speaking, news reporting has no fixed and specific position. News is news and news value is judged by a basic professional principle. But the media, whatever they are, have a common direction, that is, they are concerned about society and disadvantaged ethnic groups. So we don’t say that indigenous news should (.) If they have problems, I think that we should do something to help them. If they suffer unfair treatment or run into difficulty in their development, then we will give extensive coverage to this social problem.

Although broadly in agreement with this view, the acting editor-in-chief of the Independent Morning Post (No.35/M/44/HC) stressed the importance of the long-standing tradition created by editor-in-chiefs, past and present, who have been always concerned about weak and disadvantaged groups and by the readers. He said:
There is no fixed policy. But this will become [a tradition], because quite a few editor-in-chiefs have been doing this. And this will gradually become a tradition. Also the public will have certain expectation and they think that you are a paper which is very attentive to the news of disadvantaged groups. So I have to tell you that this [concern for the indigenous news] is not the paper’s fixed guideline.

He went on to elaborate on the Independent News Group’s long-standing concern for disadvantaged groups in this way:

In the past, before the lifting of the martial law, Independent [News Group] gave more sympathy to the opposition movements, standing behind the great direction of the whole democratic development. In order to encourage a wholesome democracy in Taiwan, we had to support an opposition party and make it strong enough to be able to counterbalance and compete. When you are doing this, you are, in effect, supporting the disadvantaged groups. Then, for example, the Tangwai [opposition parties], such as the Minchintang [Democratic Progressive Party], is a politically disadvantaged group. Then in that case this same belief can also be applied to social issues. Therefore, relatively speaking, in terms of social issues, the Independent has consistently lent more support to women’s issues, indigenous issues, and environment protection problems.

Apart from the claims of journalistic professionalism and historical tradition, the other reason why there is no specific policy on indigenous news may well be explained by its low status in the news hierarchy. Judgements about ‘marginal’ or ‘weak’ issues are often made against the background of the owner’s known interests. The reporter from the China Times (No. 7/F/34/HC) said:

...But such stuff as indigenous news is not very sensitive. Unlike the President’s Office news and political party news beats, basically, it does not jeopardise the political interest of the [newspaper] boss. So, averagely speaking, the boss doesn’t care so much about indigenous news. He may care how the newspaper covers Lee, Teng-hui, how it covers Sung, Chu-yu [the Taiwan provincial Governor elected in 1994], and how it covers the Central Standing Committee of the Kuomintang. He does not care how good or how bad your writing about indigenous news is, because it does not jeopardise his political regime. 16

The marginal position of indigenous news in mainstream newspapers is perhaps best encapsulated in her sharp-witted observation that ‘All newspapers will live well if

16 The singular third personal pronoun, ‘he’ or ‘she’, is pronounced the same as ‘ta’ in Chinese. In this thesis, I mainly used ‘he’ in the interview transcripts.
there is no indigenous news.' The reporter from the *Independent Morning Post* (No.25/M/33/HC) who had won the Journalist Award from Taiwan Human Rights Association in 1993 for his 14 investigative articles on the dispute between indigenous peoples and the national park, supported this view:

As we often said, political issues of unification [with China] or independence [of Taiwan] will affect a newspaper's editorial policy and even a political party's orientation. Some newspapers either don't criticise the Kuomintang in public or they are less critical of Kuomintang. But the indigenous issues which I have told you about have not reached such a serious level as to hold a certain position for indigenous news.

Another reporter from the IMP (No.10/M/31/HC) linked the subordinate status of indigenous news to the prevailing interest structure of the Han Chinese owners and readers:

From a politico-economic view, the media are run by the Han Chinese. He certainly pays more concern to the affairs of his own group....Because the media are owned by Han Chinese. No matter how important he thinks [the indigenous news], it is only a matter of degree....No matter how important he thinks their problems, he still has to place Han's problems in a higher scale in importance....It is very realistic, because he knows his readers are the Han people. So it is impossible for him to put more indigenous problems [in his newspaper], because he thinks Han readers will not be interested.

McQuail (1987: 271) argues that although it is not clear how much power over representations lies with owners and chief editors, studies of newspapers do indicate a strong sense on the part of journalists that editors and publishers have a general 'policy', which tends to dictate either the kind of story to be chosen or the manner of its treatment.

Statements by the deputy editors-in-chief from the two largest dailies, the *China Times* and the *United Daily News* are helpful in throwing light on the issue of owners' intervention. Rong Fu-tiang (deputy editor-in-chief, the *China Times*) was quoted in a seminar held by the *Free China Review* in 1993 as saying:

In a market economy, a newspaper is like merchandise, so the concepts of positioning and marketing also apply. To survive, a newspaper or magazine must have its own character to attract readers....A newspaper is responsible to its readers, but its first
priority is to survive in the market. To do so, the publishers needs to set a policy that combines different opinions. People in the various newspaper subsections might not be totally satisfied with the overall policy, but they can all live with it. Of greater importance, the policy has to make the paper competitive. Thus, journalists may have their own points of view, but they need to be aware of the broader perspective of the paper (emphasis mine). 17

In the same seminar, however, Alice Kao (deputy editor-in-chief, the United Daily News), gave a more political account of her paper’s policy, pointing out that:

The UDN is a private, family-owned newspaper, and the owners’ ideology and political standing certainly have an influence on its editorial policy. Because of this, the paper has been characterised by its anti-Taiwan independence, anti-Communist stance. But this does not prevent us from striving to serve the common interest, which is our ruler in measuring the appropriateness of news reporting. After all, our editorial stand and policies are decided by the editorial department, not by the publisher. 18

Both these quotations indicate that the owners and publishers of the two largest dailies do have policies designed either to make their newspapers competitive in the market or to cling to their titles’ political stance and tradition. The interviews with reporters I conducted confirm these views. Their organisations do have a policy on sensitive political issues, such as unification or independence, and their bosses do wield power over editorial policy in these areas. However, the reporters were also unanimous in their beliefs that there is no fixed policy on indigenous news in their organisations, though they give different reasons for this. While editors-in-chief stress the importance of journalistic professionalism or newspaper traditions in news reporting, reporters assert that indigenous news is not considered ‘serious’ or ‘sensitive’ enough to attract owners’ attention.

This inability of indigenous news to arouse owners’ interests or chief editors’ attention confirms the fact that it occupies a marginal and weak position in the overall news agenda of Taiwan’s newspapers. Conversely, issues that touch on owners’

17 Free China Review (FCR) (1993) ‘From the Editor’s Desk,’ in vol. 43, no. 6, p. 32-33. FCR is a government-owned bi-lingual monthly.
18 Ibid., p. 34-35.
corporate or political interests will attract their attention. The reporter from the Independent News Group (Independent Morning Post) (No.12/F/29/HC), for example, a paper whose journalists take pride in their high degree of professional autonomy, said her newspaper publisher and boss felt that such issues as golf course development news and the Tsu-Chi religious and philanthropic groups are 'better not to be touched', because the former has connections with the Tung-Yi Business Enterprise, which holds the largest block of shares in the newspaper, and the latter is related with Wu's (the publisher) family.

I feel that indigenous issues are not so sensitive to them [publisher and boss]. Basically, they rub shoulders with Han's political circle. Indigenous issues may perhaps be added with moral concern, but to them, these issues are not very influential. I feel that they must have bet that Yuanchumin are not so powerful that can jeopardise the survival of my little news kingdom, or in other words, the survival of Tung-Yi Enterprise.

The editor of the Taiwan Times (No.42/M/30/HC) states that the owners basically respect the professional autonomy of the editorial department, except when there is a real turmoil in politics. He elaborates that although the Taiwan Times and the Commons have long enjoyed a reputation for being the 'non-establishment' newspapers in southern Taiwan, and have been more critical of the KMT and supportive of the DPP ( the opposition party), when a real political crisis occurs, both newspapers will still lean towards the KMT, because their owners are KMT members and major entrepreneurs.\(^{19}\) Thus the exercise of operational power by owners, although unclear and contingent upon a newspaper group's particular interest, is a permanent possibility. As argued by McNair (1994: 57), 'the exercise of this power will vary from one proprietor to another, but the fact of its existence is undeniable.' However in the Taiwanese case, the owners' 'undeniable' interventions tend to operate in terrains other than indigenous concerns.

If there is no official policy on indigenous news, because the owners don't care about the issues, then who holds the power to put them on the agenda? In seeking an answer to this question, it is to the journalists' role that we now turn.

\(^{19}\) For the discussion of the two southern newspapers, see Chapter 4 of this thesis.
6.3.2 The Professional Autonomy of Journalists

While reporters are primarily responsible for news gathering in the ‘field’ and for drafting stories, editors take up the job of processing and rewriting within the news organisation. Journalists regard themselves as having a reasonable degree of autonomy, even if the problem of pressure from ‘policy’ does arise. Weaver and Wilhoit (1986) report that 60 percent of the journalists in their American study thought they had almost complete freedom in selecting stories they wanted to work on and 66 percent in deciding which aspects of a news story to emphasise. Participant observation research by Gans (1979) also in America shows that his journalist respondents also perceived themselves as having a reasonable degree of autonomy, but that at each level they were conscious of pressure from within the organisational hierarchy. Silverblatt (1995: 152) notes that control of the story rests in several different hands at different times in the news-gathering process. The Assignment Editor exercises significant control by deciding which stories to spend time on and by selecting the reporters to cover them. The reporter controls who will be interviewed and how the story will be organised and contextualised.

However, although they enjoy a certain degree of professional autonomy, this is not without its limits. McNair (1994) provides a revealing insight into the organisational constraints:

It is beyond argument that journalists are limited in their work by constraints built into the production process, such as deadlines, limits on space, and access to sources. All contribute to the shaping of output and the form of the final product. *Any sociological account which fails to acknowledge the importance of these constraints is of minimal value in our understanding of how journalism is made.* But neither can one allow journalists to refer all criticisms of their work to ‘organisational factors’ over which they have no control. Journalists hold beliefs and assumptions about who are the most authoritative and credible sources in the construction of a given story; about what is the most important story on a given day; and about how a story fits in with ‘consensual’ ways of seeing the world. These beliefs and assumptions are—inevitably—value-laden, and will tend to reflect the elite culture within which the journalist is working and has been—or wishes to become—professionally successful (p. 57, emphasis mine).

---

McQuail (1987: 160) argues that the issue of influence or autonomy cannot be clearly settled on its own, nor is it easy to separate freedom of expression and reporting from the normal hierarchy of bureaucracy. In this study, the basic questions related to organisational structure of indigenous news are: in the news hierarchy is there an 'indigenous news beat' and how important is indigenous news in the eyes of the staffed journalists compared with the other news?

6.3.2.1 The Missing 'Indigenous News Beat'

There is no agreed indigenous news 'beat' in the mainstream Chinese newspapers in Taiwan. Certainly none of the Chinese journalists interviewed ever mentioned one. Rather, it is often the case that indigenous news is handled simultaneously by reporters covering civic organisations, social groups and human rights issues. For example, the reporter from the China Times Express (No.11/F/32/HC) said that in her organisation:

Because social movements in Taiwan were in transition, the discussion models and movement models of the human right issues were also changing. The paper didn't set up the human rights beat anymore. So indigenous issues were assigned to the civic organisation beat and so far this has always been the case. Therefore, strictly speaking, there is no reporter who is exclusively in charge of indigenous news. But broadly speaking, when Yuanchumin have a big news, there will always be reporters who can handle it. That is, the civic organisation beat reporters will go and deal with it.

Similarly, the deputy editor-in-chief of the Central Daily News (No.31/M/41/HC) said that the one reporter assigned to the civic organisation news beat will also cover indigenous news, but that no one is assigned to cover only indigenous news.

In the Independent Morning Post, indigenous news was grouped together with news on labor, woman, and gay and lesbian issues, in one working news unit. According to a reporter from the paper (No.29/F/29/HC), the reason for including indigenous news in this unit is two-fold. One is the personal preference of the acting editor-in-chief who thinks indigenous news is important. The other is the long-standing tradition within the Independent News Group of concern about socially-disadvantaged groups (as was mentioned above). However, the acting editor-in-chief (No.35/M/
44/HQ explained during interview, that in this working unit, labor issues stand out as the most important.

In our newspaper, indigenous news is not a single beat....She [No.29] is mainly responsible for the labor beat....In addition to the labor and labor movement beats, we assigned indigenous news to her because of her personal interest.

From the evidence I collected, we may come to the provisional conclusion that since there is, strictly speaking, no single ‘indigenous news beat’, the production of indigenous news is not necessarily a routine practice for Taiwan's reporters. Consequently, how it is pursued and how often are likely to depend largely on the personal initiative and creativity of individual reporters.

### 6.3.2.2 Reporters' Personal Initiatives & Professional Ethics

'Indigenous news is totally up to a reporter’s initiative in a newspaper.'

In a situation where indigenous news neither attracts the attention of owner nor constitutes a single beat in the structure of news assignment, it is reasonable to assume that individual reporters play a much more important role in the news gathering and selecting processes. Indeed, some interviewees argued that it was left entirely to reporters' judgments. For example, the reporter from the *China Times* (No.7/F/34/HC) said:

Indigenous news is totally up to a reporter's initiative in the newspaper. I think most people who have participated in aboriginal movements are very clear that if the reporter is really concerned about Yuanchumin or if he is really interested in reporting indigenous news, he will spend more time to report [it]. Naturally the newspaper will give more space to publish it. This has a very direct relationship with reporters' initiatives but not with news organisations. So if a newspaper has presented a great deal of indigenous news, this is entirely because of reporters....Because in the idea of the newspaper, it is impossible to be concerned with such a tiny population of 320,000....In addition, indigenous news is considered as marginal and peripheral among other news. So I think the reporter's initiative is of vital importance.
In line with this general argument, other interviewees expressed the view that reporters should take the initiative in 'digging out' indigenous problems and news on the one hand, and persuading their editors to publish the results on the other. The reporter from the *United Evening News* (No.1/F/32/HC) said:

...But in terms of our position as political reporters, we tend to start from the problem side, in which, I should say, not from a negative but from an issue-digging attitude, to seek out a problem and find the materials for our news writings. In terms of the present law or newspapers' internal codes concerning indigenous news reporting, there is no clear and explicit [regulations] in the *United Daily News*. So it is purely up to reporters' judgments and how editors think about the importance of this news.

Another reporter who holds the same view is No.29/F/29/HC from the *Independent Morning Post*. She said that because sometimes her editor did not know how important indigenous news is, she had to ring him asking why the special report she filed three days ago had not come out on the paper. She certainly thought that reporters' initiatives were crucial:

Even if the newspaper has the tradition [of placing more emphasis to indigenous news], or the boss [editor] attaches more importance to it. But in light of the voluminous amount of news produced everyday, indigenous news, compared with the other news, may not be that important to the boss. So reporters often have to take the initiative of digging out good issues and then persuade the boss to print it.

*News is News and news is not fabricated!*

The editor-in-chief of the *United Daily News* (No.33/M/48/HC), however, was strongly opposed to the idea of reporters taking the initiative saying that:

Basically, I don't think so, because I want to stress that news is news and news is not fabricated!...News and academic inquiry have two different scopes. In academic inquiry, you investigate some problems of your own accord, but the reporter, although bearing the same functions to some degree, he has to know that the problems exist, then he will go on to report it. He can not dig out. Digging, after all, is an academic or a government's business. These functions have to be distinguished.
The acting editor-in-chief of the *Independent Morning Post* (No.35/M/44/HC), although admitting that the reporters in his newspaper have a strong initiative in reporting indigenous news, was concerned about the question of news professionalism posed by his reporters becoming too involved in the indigenous news-making process:

In our newspaper, it has often been the case that reporters' initiative is very strong. In other words, the reporters, who cover the news beat of disadvantaged groups, join the Independent because of a very strong sense of mission. This has advantages and disadvantages for a beat reporter. The advantages mean that they are deeply involved and have a deep understanding of the problems, while the disadvantages are relatively more involved in dealing with problems. If we speak of news professionalism, we can say that they didn't pay due respect to the issue of balance, because they are too much involved.

The emphasis on reporters' initiatives in the interviews above offers further powerful evidence in support of the marginal and peripheral position of indigenous news in the hierarchical structure of the news organisation. Granted that the reporter's initiative is vitally important in producing indigenous news, it is important to remember Golding's (1974: 62-64) remarks on the notion of 'creativity and control', arguing that all organisations in the production of culture are faced with a persistent dilemma. They must find ways of reconciling the organisational needs for regularity and control with creators' (writers, producers and journalists) commitment to their skills and professions. He argued that the journalist is not the arbiter of his own product, which has to be tailored for and judged by organisational demands, such as the style and tone of a newspaper or the technical demands of the production. In addition to the organisational demands, the journalist's creativity is often constrained by other factors—delimitation of the job, organisational ideology and policy, limitations of resources and legal curbs.

Bearing these general remarks on the limits of the journalists' creativity and initiative in mind, we will turn now to examine the editor's role in the production of indigenous news in juxtaposition with the reporter's initiatives.
6.3.2.3 Editors and Reporters in the Newsroom

Reporters and editors have different jobs in a news organisation. The former collects/pursues information and writes the first draft. The latter commissions news gathering activity (sometimes), evaluates news materials (always), edits and reworks (very regularly). These roles are linked to different ‘organisational goals’. Editors are more orientated to audience goals, whereas reporters are more concerned with non-revenue goals. Also editors are more concerned about news receivers (comprehension) but reporters are more concerned about news sources (content).

Chen (1994: 157), in a study of the journalistic roles at the Liberty Times, argues that, professionally speaking, reporters and editors are ‘totally antagonistic’. This adversarial relationship is often abetted by their different understandings of indigenous news. As a reporter from the United Evening News (No.1/F/32/HQ noted:

In fact, reporters and editors are two antagonistic groups, because they [editors] often edit and even delete our drafts and then make headlines. To the reporters, there are few chances to file complaints, because newspapers pass into the past everyday unless there is a serious mistake. So we have kept such a relationship. As to how well they understand indigenous news, this is something we frontline reporters cannot control.

‘Editors are our boss and big master.’

Although the exact news flow process varies in each newspaper, most of the titles under study here have recently given more powers to page editors. In Chapter 4, I mentioned the trend towards the ‘integration of editing and reporting staff,’ first initiated by the United Daily News Group in order to achieve more efficient production. The system integrates editing and reporting staffs and divides their workloads on a page basis, granting page editors decision-making powers over the contents, design and layouts of their own pages and editions. Later on, this integration system was adopted by the other newspapers. Under this system, because editors are responsible for the entire production of their own pages, they become more powerful. The reporter (No.1/F/32/HC) quoted above put it like this:
Chapter 6 Producing Indigenous News

Everyday I cover the news of Legislative Yuan, [my stories are] more often spiked than published. Editors are our boss and big master. The page of every newspaper has a different news flow. The editor-in-chief decides the front page, and the other pages are decided by each page editors.

This power can be used to advance as well as to block coverage of indigenous affairs however. Although as we saw earlier, reporters' initiatives are vitally important in promoting indigenous news, the reporter from the Independent Evening Post (No.25/M/33/HC), who won the Journalist Award from the Taiwan Human Rights Association was careful to emphasise the support of the editor-in-chief of his newspaper. The many protests of indigenous peoples coming to Taipei to file their complaints against national parks prompted his original interest in writing the award-winning stories and he took the initiative in deciding to pursue the issue. But he added that if it was not for the editor-in-chief's support and the esprit de corps among his colleagues, he would not have been able to complete the stories which were printed on 14 consecutive days.

In fact, our newspaper has been very concerned about disadvantaged groups. So, including the editor-in-chief, he even offered such a big space on the fourth page and printed my stories consecutively for half a month. I think a lot credit should be given to his support. Of course, in the beginning, you are right, it was my initiative. But the other colleagues in the newspaper have also supported me.

He said that the greatest challenge in working on this investigative story, apart from the transportation problems of reaching the less-developed aboriginal townships located in the national park, was the limited time allowed by the newspaper to complete the story. Within the newspaper his beat covers labor, human rights and other disadvantaged groups, including Yuanchumin. If he was away from Taipei visiting the aboriginal mountain villages, other staff had to run his beat. Therefore, he said, it was impossible for the newspaper to give him two full weeks to cover the story. So he had only three days a week scurrying through many aboriginal villages and national parks in central and southern Taiwan to do his interviews. For the rest of the week he had to return to his office in Taipei to work on his normal beat. Therefore, it took over a
month to finish the interviews and another month to write the whole story. He recollected the hastiness caused by the pressure of time limits in this way:

I have to admit that, the news-gathering process was, in fact, very hasty. I always made this joke that, in fact, no sooner had I just set my front foot on the soil of a national park, than I had to be ready to pull out the other foot [to return to his office in Taipei].

However, in addition to reporters’ initiatives, the editor of the ‘Formosa Island’ edition in the China Times (No.8/F/31/HQ argued that editors have also played an important role in producing indigenous news. She said:

In terms of the China Times, both reporters and editors’ interest and concern are greater motivational forces. It is because the director of our Culture Centre has neither told us that we should give a certain space to women’s culture and aboriginal culture, nor has he reminded us that these are very important areas. We don’t have such a strategy, a strategy of requiring us to allot a certain space to cover these [areas] in our daily or monthly newspapers. 21

This lack of an official ‘quota’ for allotting space gave her considerable flexibility. She also emphasises that as editor for the edition she has enjoyed extraordinary freedom and has never encountered any problem caused by a directive or control from above.

The editor of the ‘Culture Square’ edition in the United Daily News (No. 27/M/37/HC) put forward a similar view in this way: ‘In fact, it [indigenous news] is nothing to do with the newspaper position, instead, both reporters and editors’ interactions are more important [in its production].’ He said: ‘Many news stories have to be given up if they cannot make it before deadline.’

21 In the China Times, all the cultural and family editions, including the ‘Formosa Island’ are within the Culture Centre Department.
22 The ‘Culture Square’ edition was established in the United Daily News on 1 January, 1988 and appears daily. The editor said that the publisher decided to create more space for this edition in April 1994 due to the increase in the ‘cultural population’ in Taiwan and the growing number of international activities held there.
Chapter 6 Producing Indigenous News

'They raised the question and asked if we can use “Yuanchumin”?'

Although, generally speaking, reporters and editors both maintain that they have enjoyed extraordinary freedom in writing and editing indigenous news, there have been struggles and debates. I would like to illustrate this from the experiences of two journalists and one editor. The two reporters originally had a considerable struggle to persuade their editors to accept the term ‘Yuanchumin’ instead of ‘Shanpao’ (with its negative connotations) in news about aboriginal movements. One reporter from the United Daily News Group (No.1/F/32/HQ recalled her experience with her editor when she first used the term ‘Yuanchumin’ in her report in the mid-1980s:

Working in the United Daily News Group, I have never experienced any interference from above. But in the beginning [1987-1988], they [editors] might raise some doubts, because newspapers were popular to readers and because the term ‘Yuanchumin’ sounds greek to readers. So at that time, the paper, when considering the terminology, purely speaking, (.) Because everybody was in the habit of using Shanpao [mountain people]. Now, if we want to change it to Yuanchumin, readers will not understand. From this standpoint, they [editors] raised the question and asked if we can use Yuanchumin. However, in the course of using this term, we were not forced to stop using it or suffered interference of any sort....It is not until recent years that this [term] has become popular because almost everybody is now using Yuanchumin. 23

'But in some of the avant-garde theories relating to Yuanchumin, we had some discussions with the chiefs.'

The other reporter from the China Times News Group (No.11/F/32/HC) said that she had to explain to her editors what was at stake:

During the period of my covering the indigenous ‘beat’, I truly feel that there is a big space. In fact, the reason why they set up a human rights beat was because there is an immense possibility, because they [editors] didn’t tell you what is human rights. They let you reporters have total freedom to develop it and the newspaper was also extremely hopeful for your capability to create such a space. At least in the course of my covering Yuanchumin's problems, I haven’t felt any pressure from the newspaper [telling me that] you cannot deal with their problems or how you should deal with their problems. But in some of the avant-garde theories relating to Yuanchumin, indeed, we had some

23 It has to be pointed out that Taiwan’s media have, indeed, played a tremendously important role in promoting the term ‘Yuanchumin’ in various news reports during the 1980s, although it was not officially recognised by the government or by the public. It was not until 1994 that ‘Yuanchumin’ was first included in the Constitution after many years of indigenous struggles (see Chapter 3).
discussions with the chiefs [editors]. For instance, when Yuanchumin fought for their land rights, some chiefs were very confused. They didn’t understand what is the so-called 'land rights.' Then you will have to explain to him,... because when your chiefs don’t understand, perhaps your readers don’t understand either. Therefore, it is equivalent to say that, before I reported it to the readers, perhaps I should let my chiefs know why Yuanchumin did these things, why they took to the streets to fight for their land rights and even for such an ideology as self-government rights. According to my experience, after I have discussed with them, they did not interfere with the direction of my report.

‘He thought I am an Yuanchumin.’

The editor of the Taiwan Times (No.42/M/30/HQ, which is located in Kaohsiung city in southern Taiwan, is in charge of the literature supplement edition. He claims the edition aims to publicise local literature, art, land ethics and acts as an important symbolic space that can revitalise both creative thinking and various social movements. He said that at the moment Taiwan is currently in a situation that people have come to realise the importance of the local land and culture and 'various wars and integration' of different ethnic groups, so, as a journalist, he has to reflect this situation.

It is important to note that the Taiwan Times is the only newspaper in the sample which provides a literature supplement page to reprint indigenous contributions from the Hunter’s Culture and the Indigenous Post. From his accounts, the idea for this synergy with indigenous journals was his, though he admitted that there was some pressure from the editor-in-chief after he actually implemented the scheme in the newspaper. He claims that the then editor-in-chief (who later moved to the Commons) was taken aback by the plethora of indigenous-written articles appearing in the supplement and voiced some criticisms. He said:

I received some lessons from the former editor-in-chief. He asked whether the editor [of the literature supplement edition] is an Yuanchumin or not?...He thought I am an Yuanchumin.

In this section I have discussed the interactions between reporters and editors and their impacts on the production of indigenous news. From the evidence collected for this study, it can be concluded that although reporters’ initiatives are vital to the
making of indigenous news, editors' interest and support are also crucial to the later stages of the production process. Without the editor's help, the prize-winning investigative story of the IMP reporter (No. 25) might not have been possible. Also from the personal experiences of the news professionals interviewed, editors usually adopt a 'hands off' policy in relation to indigenous news, with the exception of 'some avant-garde theories relating to Yuanchumin,' such as the land and political claims made by aboriginal movements. To Han editors, the ever-increasing aboriginal movements and the rise of the term 'Yuanchumin' in the mid-1980s were indeed news to them. However, editors' interventions emerged as soft-handed rather than coercive and capable of being worked through by discussion and negotiation.

Overall, throughout the post-martial law period, reporters and editors have been very active in reporting aboriginal movements and using the controversial term 'Yuanchumin', at a time when the government still employed the old derogatory term 'Shanpao' (mountain peoples).24

6.4 Concluding Remarks

This chapter has explored the external and internal forces shaping indigenous news production process. Based upon the interview data, I have argued that the new political environment has allowed the press more space, autonomy and diversity and directed more attention to 'minority' issues and groups, including the indigenous Yuanchumin. At the same time, I would like to stress that although there have been more sympathetic portrayals of indigenous problems in the post-martial law period, this is not necessarily synonymous with better coverage or treatment of indigenous issues, or with the end of indigenous news' marginal status within the hierarchical structure of newspaper organisations.

24 For the renaming struggles of indigenous peoples into the term 'Yuanchumin', see Chapter 3 of this thesis.
In relation to external economic constraints, this chapter finds that indigenous peoples of Taiwan are unable to exert significant power on the advertising barons, because they constitute such a small segment of the audience, either as readers of newspapers or as potential consumers of advertised commodities. Their marginal status means that advertisers are not interested in or concerned about indigenous news production on the one hand, and are disinclined to interfere directly with it on the other.

In 'Taiwan today, readers' tastes and interests are also changing constantly. The resurgence of local Taiwanese culture in the recent years has led to an increased number of readers who have become more concerned about local culture and art as well as human interest stories. This situation means that newspapers have to swim with the tide and cater to readers' needs in order to survive. One response has been the increasing emergence of cultural editions in the newspapers that provide additional 'homes' for indigenous coverage.

Turning to internal influences, the remark of one interviewee, that 'All newspapers will live well if there is no indigenous news' sums up the area's marginal and weak position in the news agenda of Taiwan's newspapers. Owners don't pay attention to it because it has little capacity to jeopardise their political or economic interests. This, in turn, means that in contrast to issues 'serious' or 'sensitive' enough to attract owner's attention such as the heated debate on national identity and Taiwan's future with China, newspapers do not have fixed policies on it.

Against this backdrop of owner nonchalance, the marginal status of indigenous news, and the lack of a defined 'indigenous news beat' in news organisations, many reporter-interviewees, if not all, stressed the importance of their own personal initiatives in producing indigenous news. These included not only routine news-gathering practices, but the special effort devoted to digging out indigenous issues as well as, in a few extraordinary situations, hard-selling work to editors.

Generally, however, the interviews reveal that editors usually adopt a 'hands off' policy in relation to indigenous news, with the exception of 'some avant-garde theories relating to Yuanchumin,' such as the land and political claims made by aboriginal movements. However, reporters stressed that editorial interventions were not usually
coercive but soft-handed, and could be worked out through discussion and negotiation. Although there were exceptions, most journalists interviewed, including both reporters and page editors, maintained that they enjoyed a high degree of relative autonomy in the production of indigenous news within their organisations. However, the presence of a relatively open production situation does not tell us what sort of coverage is likely to eventuate. And it is to this question that we now turn.
Chapter Seven
Reporting Indigenous News in the Mainstream Press:
A Content Analysis

7.1 Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to analyse the overall pattern of news about indigenous peoples in the mainstream Taiwanese newspapers using content analysis. It deals with four main dimensions of portrayals:

1. Prominence and attention
2. Theme and content
3. Quotation and representation
4. Newspaper variability

As mentioned in Chapter Two, recent research shows that the relation between news media and indigenous peoples is characterised by misrepresentation (problematisation, and decontextualisation) and problems of access (under-representation). American research suggests that the stereotypical coverage of indigenous peoples is not dissimilar from that of the other ethnic minorities, such as Blacks and Latino and Asian immigrants. To counter these negative media portrayals, many scholars have repeatedly argued that employing more indigenous peoples in the media, both mainstream and indigenous, is crucial to both better news coverage and their cultural self-determination, although a few have expressed doubts about the 'automatic' gains envisaged by more optimistic writers. Since the 1970s there have been improvements in minority employment in the mainstream American media, however, research shows that they are more often cosmetic than substantial.
Moreover, among minority groups, indigenous peoples remain the least represented in the workforce.

It is important to re-emphasise at this point that over the years content analysis studies on media and minorities have, in large part, dealt with the larger and ‘fast-growing minorities’, for example, Black and Hispanics minorities in the United States or Asian and Caribbean immigrants in Britain. Despite the fact that an increasing number of essays, commentaries and articles that have stressed the growing political significance of indigenous peoples, quantitative studies of the way they are represented are still rare.

Murphy and Avery’s (1983: 322) content analysis of press coverage of native peoples in Alaska in 1980 is a significant exception however. Contrary to the supposition of many critics, they found that both the native and non-native press were essentially positive toward native peoples in their coverage, but that the amount of coverage varied widely between the two press systems. Indeed, non-native papers covered so little native news that they did scant justice to native issues. This finding suggests that it is the relative invisibility of native peoples in the mainstream press, rather than their negative misrepresentation, that is the main problem. Whether this is the case in Taiwan remains to be seen. However, whatever the findings, the present content analysis provides one of the few substantive ventures into what remains a very underdeveloped field of research.

7.2 Samples & Procedures

Given that this study aims to explore the performance of the nationally-circulated Taiwanese mainstream newspapers in covering indigenous news, I initially chose four titles, the China Times, the United Daily News, the Central Daily News, and the Independent Morning Post for analysis as being broadly representative of the national daily press in terms of readership, political orientation and ownership. However as I noted earlier, since all four newspapers are based in Taipei, the capital city of Taiwan, it was then decided to add two southern newspapers, the Taiwan Times and the
Chapter 7
Content Analysis

Commons which are widely seen as 'locally-oriented newspapers' emphasising local people and culture. A further daily, the Liberty Times, although headquartered in Taipei, was also included for analysis because it is said to have acquired an increasing share of the highly competitive news market in Taiwan in recent years, and because it represents the mainstream political faction supporting President Lee Teng-hui's political position.¹ (For the basic details of the seven sample titles, see Table 4.3.)

The seven sample dailies were analysed for a co-terminus six-month period from 1 January, 1994 to 30 June, 1994. As mentioned in Chapter 5, this time period was a carefully considered choice. The materials used for empirical investigation consist of all types of news items that appeared in the seven sample newspapers in Taiwan during the first part of 1994, ranging from general news stories, to features, editorials, columns, commentaries, and reader's letters to the editor. Any item that dealt in any substantial way with events or issues of concern to indigenous peoples as a whole or to a specific tribe was included, provided that indigenous peoples were an explicit part of the main subject matter. Pictures ( photos, cartoons and illustrations ) were counted as integral parts of items. Altogether, 880 items qualified for inclusion in the sample. All were independently and carefully coded by the author.²

As mentioned above, the major findings of this research are grouped into three broad headings:

1. Attention & Prominence: including frequencies, item size, page, section, type, picture, and image.
2. Theme & Content: including news actors, subjects and themes.
3. Quotation & Representation: including authors, headline actors, and sources of quotations. For the full code book used in the content analysis, see Appendix 4.

¹ For more details on the political stance and ideological orientation of the sample newspapers, see Chapter 4.
² The author collected the data in Taiwan from June 1994 to February 1995. All items were photocopied. The data were coded independently and carefully by the author from May to July 1995 to generate systematic and coherent coding results. Then they were prepared for processing and analysed by using the Mainframe SPSS.

157
Chapter 7  

Content Analysis

The issue of variability in performance between the sample newspapers in reporting indigenous news will be discussed in various places throughout this chapter, rather than in a separate section.

7.3 Findings

7.3.1 Attention & Prominence

In content analysis studies, it is commonly acknowledged that frequency of occurrence, size of item and location may be taken as basic indicators of the emphasis or degree of importance attached to particular events or groups. As Table 7.1 shows, indigenous items occurred most often in the months of April and June. Both months had the same number of items, 206, followed by May (142) and then March (140). The number of items appearing in April and June therefore accounted for nearly half (46.8%) of the total. This highly concentrated pattern of coverage was due to two important news events that occurred in these two months, the unprecedented Indigenous Cultural Conference in Taiwan on 9-11 April, and the indigenous demonstration for 'Renaming, Land and Self-government Rights' on 23 June, 1994 [38 news items appeared on the 11th of April, and 21 on the 10th and 19 on the 24th of June].

Among the seven sample newspapers, the Taiwan Times printed the most indigenous items during the sample period (221), over a quarter, 25.1% of the sample total, followed by the China Times (153 items, 17.4%), United Daily News (129 items, 14.7%), Commons (126 items, 14.3%), Independent Morning Post (125 items, 14.2%), Liberty Times (80 items, 9.1%), and the Central Daily News (46 items, 5.2%).

If we look back at Table 4.3 in Chapter 4, which presents the ownership and circulation of the seven sample newspapers under study, we can see that all the sample newspapers except the Central Daily News (owned by the KMT, the ruling party) are privately owned. The Taiwan Times, which leads in reporting indigenous stories, is based in Kaohsiung port city in southern Taiwan. As I mentioned in Chapter 4, it is
Table 7.1

Frequency of Indigenous News in Taiwan, Newspaper by Month

(1 January - 30 June, 1994)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>January</th>
<th>February</th>
<th>March</th>
<th>April</th>
<th>May</th>
<th>June</th>
<th>Row Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China Times</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Daily News</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inde. Mom. Post</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberty Times</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Column Total</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>880</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

noted for its emphases on local Taiwanese culture, literature, history and the opinions of the southern readers.\(^3\) It can be argued that the two newspapers based in southern Taiwan—the Taiwan Times and the Commons—should feature indigenous stories more

---

\(^3\) It is worth noting here that the Mainlanders are mostly employed in the government, schools and the military and dwell mainly in Taipei and the north, while the Fukien Taiwanese, although they live all over the island, relatively speaking, concentrate more in the south than in the north. So, it is said, the southern readers are more 'locally-oriented' (or native-oriented) than the northern readers. In other words, they are more concerned and interested in Taiwanese culture and history rather than Chinese. Therefore, the southern newspapers, such as the Taiwan Times and the Commons in this sample, are noted for their 'locally-oriented' news characteristics.
significantly than the northern titles. However, from Table 7.1, we see that the Commons ranks fourth after the China Times and the United Daily News which are based in Taipei. Therefore, the most plausible explanation for why the Taiwan Times covered indigenous news the most is, as we discussed in Chapter 6, that it was the only newspaper in the sample that used its literary supplement pages to reprint indigenous contributions from the Hunter’s Culture and the Indigenous Post, two Taiwanese aboriginal journals. This is confirmed by our findings. As we will see later, the Taiwan Times carried most of its indigenous items in its literary supplement page in terms of page distribution.

The KMT-run Central Daily News gave the least attention to indigenous affairs during the sample period. Although in Chapter 6, the deputy editor-in-chief (No.31/M/41/HC) of the CDN argued that due to the democratisation process in Taiwan, there has been increased attention given to minority affairs in recent years by ‘every media’, the result of the Table 7.1 clearly shows that the CDN is the exception. As the CDN is the KMT’s mouthpiece, it has been burdened with propagandising government and KMT policies. In this context, indigenous stories and news are marginalised and subordinated to an editorial policy that aims to prioritise the KMT’s overall political ideology.

Size

As many writers acknowledge, frequency by itself does not fully reflect degrees of importance or prominence. Accordingly, item size was also measured in square centimeters. ‘Size’ here refers to the total newshole occupied by each item including headlines, pictures (photos and cartoons, etc.) and captions, as well as the main text. We calculated the mean size of indigenous items in each sampled title. The overall space given to indigenous stories by each titles was then obtained by multiplying the

---

As the KMT has been the ruling party in Taiwan for the last five decades, the government’s policies are often identical with the party’s policies.
mean size of indigenous items and the number of items in each sampled title.\(^5\) Table 7.2 shows the results.

### Table 7.2
Total Space Occupied by Indigenous Items and Average Pagination of Each Title

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Titles</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Average Daily Pagination</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China Times</td>
<td>41,542 cm(^2)</td>
<td>44-48 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Daily News</td>
<td>31,614 cm(^2)</td>
<td>44-48 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
<td>6,848 cm(^2)</td>
<td>20 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
<td>24,065 cm(^2)</td>
<td>20 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
<td>56,311 cm(^2)</td>
<td>28 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>22,361 cm(^2)</td>
<td>28 pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberty Times</td>
<td>15,169 cm(^2)</td>
<td>24-36 pages(^6)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We can see that the *Taiwan Times* held the leading position in terms of the space given to the indigenous stories, accounting for 28.45% of the total sample. It is

---

\(^5\) The mean size of indigenous items in each sampled newspapers is: *China Times*, 271.5163 cm\(^2\); *United Daily News*, 245.0698 cm\(^2\); *Central Daily News*, 148.8696 cm\(^2\); *Independent Morning Post*, 192.5200 cm\(^2\); *Taiwan Times*, 254.8009 cm\(^2\); *Commons*, 177.4689 cm\(^2\); and *Liberty Times*, 189.6125 cm\(^2\). As a result, the total space given to indigenous items by the sample newspapers is: CT, 41,542 cm\(^2\) (the product of 271.5163 cm\(^2\) times 153 items) which accounts for 20.99% of the total sample; UDN, 31,614 cm\(^2\) (245.0698 cm\(^2\) times 129 items), 15.97%; CDN, 6,848 cm\(^2\) (148.8696 cm\(^2\) times 46 items), 3.46%; IMP, 24,065 cm\(^2\) (192.5200 cm\(^2\) times 125 items), 12.16%; TT, 56,311 cm\(^2\) (254.8009 cm\(^2\) times 221 items), 28.45%; C, 22,361 cm\(^2\) (177.4689 cm\(^2\) times 126 items), 11.30%; and LT, 15,169 cm\(^2\) (189.6125 cm\(^2\) times 80 items), 7.66%.

\(^6\) The daily news output of the *Liberty Times* is irregular. In January and February, 1994, the paper produced an average of 24 pages a day. In March 1994, it produced mostly 24 pages but sometimes up to 36 pages. The paper published a few advertisements in the end of March, notifying that for the sake of providing more service to the readers it would, from 2 April, 1994, increase its output to 36 pages. From 16 June, 1994, it has expanded to 40 pages.
followed by the China Times, 20.99%; the United Daily News, 15.97%; the Independent Morning Post, 12.16%; the Commons, 11.30%; the Liberty Times, 7.66%; and the Central Daily News, 3.46%. Figure 7.1 shows the total space occupied by indigenous coverage.

Figure 7.1
Distribution of Size of the Taiwan Indigenous News in the Sample Newspapers (1 January - 30 June, 1994)

Also, from Table 7.2, we can see that the sample newspapers varied greatly in the number of pages they produced daily. Roughly speaking, during the sample period the China Times and the United Daily News mostly produced 44-48 pages each day, with the Liberty Times mostly ranging between 24-36 pages, and the Taiwan Times and the
Chapter 7

Content Analysis

Commons being always 28 pages, followed by the Independent Morning Post and the Central Daily News, with 20 pages. Therefore, it can be argued that more available space does not necessarily mean that more prominence and attention will be given to indigenous news. For example, the space allocated by the Taiwan Times, which has a daily output of 28 pages, is significantly greater than for either the China Times or the United Daily News, which mostly produced 44-48 page editions. Similarly, the Independent Morning Post which produces only 20 pages a day gives more space to indigenous affairs than the Liberty Times (24-36 pages) or the Commons (28 pages).

Further evidence of differential patterns of coverage can be obtained if we multiply the average daily pagination of each title by the total sampling days (181)\(^7\), and calculated the mean size of indigenous news (based on the total space they occupied in each title). Table 7.3 shows the average size of indigenous items in each titles by page basis.

Table 7.3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Titles</th>
<th>Total Page Output</th>
<th>Average Size of Indigenous Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China Times</td>
<td>8326 pages</td>
<td>4.99 cm(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Daily News</td>
<td>8326 pages</td>
<td>3.80 cm(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
<td>3620 pages</td>
<td>1.89 cm(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
<td>3620 pages</td>
<td>6.65 cm(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
<td>5068 pages</td>
<td>11.11 cm(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>5068 pages</td>
<td>4.41 cm(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberty Times</td>
<td>5430 pages</td>
<td>2.79 cm(^2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^7\) During the sampling period in 1994, there were altogether 181 days—the sum of January, 31 days; February, 28; March, 31; April, 30; May, 31; June, 30.
Table 7.3 reveals that the TT still holds the leading position (11.11 cm²), while the LT and the CDN are still last, with 2.79 cm² and 1.89 cm² respectively. However, interesting enough the IMP, which ranks fourth in terms of 'total size', now comes the second in 'item size' with 6.65 cm². The CT is surpassed by the IMP, ranking third (4.99 cm²), followed by the C (4.41 cm²) and the UDN (3.80 cm²). It is interesting to note that the UDN, which ranks third in the 'total size', is relegated to fifth place by 'item size', while the C moves up from fifth to fourth.

These findings further confirm that the southern title, TT, gives more prominence to indigenous stories than the other titles. In contrast, the KMT's organ, the CDN, gives the least attention. Therefore, we have every reason to argue that privately owned newspapers give more attention to indigenous concerns than the KMT-owned title in Taiwan. In addition, the 'Taiwanese'-run newspapers, the TT (more supportive of the KMT and the 'independent Taiwan' and the IMP (more sympathetic to the DPP and its demand for 'Taiwan independence'), lead ahead of the other titles in reporting indigenous news. However, the 'Mainlander'-owned CT, one of the giant newspapers in Taiwan, also features indigenous news prominently (ranking 2nd by 'total size' of coverage and 3rd by 'item size'). Widely regarded as liberal in its political coverage, it endorses the KMT and Taiwan's ultimate goal of unification with China in a peaceful and democratic system. Therefore, both Taiwanese and Mainlander newspapers are in the forefront of featuring indigenous news prominently, regardless of their political ideologies.

In terms of relative size, almost three quarters, 73% (642 out of 880) of all the items coded were less than 250 cm², 15.9% (140) were between 251-500 cm², and 11.1% (98) ranged from 501-1800 cm². The smallest item in the sample measured 10 cm², and the largest 1788 cm², with the median being 146.5 cm². As these findings show, some indigenous news items are very small, just an announcement, but others, especially articles printed on the literature supplement pages or as special features, can be as large as one or two pages.

8 See my observation on political orientation of the sample newspapers in 4.3.3.4 in Chapter 4.
Chapter 7

Content Analysis

Location: Page & Section

The other major indicator of attention and prominence employed in content analysis is location, where is the news item printed. Page here refers to the page on which the item appeared. Section is divided into national and local. In the former the item was distributed for a nation-wide readership, and in the latter for a local or regional readership. In journalism, two basic rule of thumbs are that the more important the item, the more likely it is to be carried on the front pages or that it will appear in the national section. Although each sample paper had a different editing and page layout policy, as a matter of routine, most newspapers in Taiwan consider the front four pages as the most important for distribution to a national audience. Generally speaking, items such as special features, reader’s letters to the editor, and literature supplements are included in the national section, so are the coverage of art, the movie & entertainment pages and sports news.

In the sample as a whole, only 10 items appeared on the front page, 57 on the second page, 21 on the third page, and 44 on the fourth page. Among the 10 items on the front page, the Independent Morning Post carried the most items (4), followed by Commons and Liberty Times (with 2 each), and the Central Daily News and Taiwan Times (with 1 each). No indigenous stories appeared on the front page of either the China Times or the United Daily News. Among the 10 items appearing on the front page, six were political stories, one related to education, one to culture and art, one to medical and health issues, and one to the natural environment.

Items appeared most often on the 22nd page (95 items or 10.8%) of the sample. This is mainly designated as the ‘culture & art’ and ‘movie & TV’ news sections in the China Times and United Daily News, and as the literature supplement featuring culture & art stories in the Taiwan Times. Out of the 95 items on this page, 85 appeared in the Taiwan Times.

Items also appeared frequently on the 5th page (84 items, 9.5% of the total). However, its function varied widely between papers. It is, in the main, a comprehensive news section in the China Times (6 items) and the Independent Morning Post (15 ), a lifestyle section in the United Daily News (15 ) and the Taiwan Times (23 ), a space for major domestic news in the Central Daily News (13 ), for
reader's letters to editor in the *Commons* (8), and for social news in the *Liberty Times* (4).

Overall, all the sample newspapers carried most of their indigenous items in the national section, with only 20 percent (176) appearing in the local section. This can be seen from the Table 7.4 below.

### Table 7.4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>China Times</th>
<th>United Daily News</th>
<th>Central Daily News</th>
<th>Inde. Morn. Post</th>
<th>Taiwan Times</th>
<th>Commons</th>
<th>Liberty Times</th>
<th>Row Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>704 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>176 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Column</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>17.4%</td>
<td>14.7%</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>25.1%</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: chi-square = 64.23; p < .001.

### Types of Indigenous News

Out of the total sample population of 880 news items, 55% (484 items) were general news, the other 45% were distributed between literature supplements 15.6% (137), features 9.9% (87), columns 9.4% (83), letters to the editor 3% (26), commentary 1.4% (12), and others 5.8% (51). Editorials were also included as a category, but none of the items printed during the sample period fell into this group.9

---

9 Feature is defined as an investigative or in-depth report. Column refers to items in which columnists and scholars convey their views on a specific issue. Other articles, often inset with photos, paintings and illustrations of aboriginal cultures, customs and lifestyles as well as profiles of indigenous characters in the specially-designated columns such as 'Taiwan Indigenous Peoples' and 'Photographer', were also included in this category. Commentary includes short comments and
Figure 7.2 above presents a detailed picture of the distribution of item types during the sample period.

leaderettes often displayed in a box format in which staff writers express their opinions on a news event. Literature supplement refers to those articles, be they essays, poems, short fictions, or investigative reports, which are printed on the literature supplement page of each paper. In Taiwan, most newspapers have a literature supplement edition which appears daily (All the sample newspapers of this study had such edition). This edition is open to the literati—writers and scholars. Others includes those items which have photo and caption only, but were not accompanied by text. Otherwise they refer to the proceedings of a symposium administered by newspaper organisations on a specific aboriginal issue.
Pictures & Images

43.9 percent of all items (386) carried at least one picture. The total of 493 pictures was made up of 459 photos and 34 non-photos (paintings, drawings and illustrations). In some cases, aboriginal photos appeared alone without text. They were mostly inserted in items on non-indigenous issues. In terms of journalistic practice, this is somewhat peculiar. It is interesting to note, however, that many of the photos which appear without text feature aboriginal peoples in traditional clothes. This suggests that Han Chinese editors prefer to use such images of aboriginal peoples as an accompaniment or, we may say, an ornament to highlight non-indigenous news.

For instance, Figure 7.3 is a reproduced version of a China Times story. It carries a picture of the President Lee who gave the audience to aboriginal movement leaders [in traditional clothes] on 1 July, 1994 on the front page. It is a response to aboriginal demands for a meeting with the President during their demonstration on ‘Renaming, Land and Self-government Rights’ on 23 June, 1994. In this instance, only this photo appeared on the front page but the accompanying story and photo came on the 4th page (See Figure 7.4). The stories which accompanied the photo of the President meeting aboriginal leaders on the front page, concerned an intended power cut by the Taiwan Power Company and an old man’s pension story. This is one of the examples to illustrate how Chinese newspapers deal with or capitalise on the aboriginal traditional image in an important and prominent space, and I stress that it is not an unusual practice.

The content of the pictures, grouped under the image variable in the codebook, was classified into 51 categories. Table 7.5 presents the 20 images that appeared at least five times in the total sampled items.

---

Table 7.5 (not shown here)

---

10 Image refers to the main subject of the pictures. However, difficulties arise in coding a photo showing, for example, the President of the Republic meeting indigenous movement leaders dressed in traditional clothes. Is it the ‘government officials’ (the President) or the ‘indigenous peoples in traditional clothes’ that should be coded? One way to avoid such confusion is to read the caption with the photo. In most cases, this highlights the President as the subject, and in some his views are indirectly quoted. So in this case the author has coded ‘government officials’ as the major image. In
President Lee Teng-hui gave an audience to aboriginal movement leaders.

President Lee was pictured shaking hands with the aboriginal movement leaders wearing traditional clothes and bonnets. The four large Chinese characters on the right hand side are the masthead of the China Times.

(Courtesy of the China Times, 2 July, 1994)
The headline reads: President received Yuanchumin representatives of the Constitutional Movement Alliance [major headline]
Both parties communicated in Mandarin and Japanese. Yuanchumin hope to solve the problems of the reserved land [sub-headline].

(Courtesy of the *China Times*, 2 July, 1994)
## Table 7.5

Main Images of Indigenous Peoples in the Sample Items

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image</th>
<th>No. of Pictures</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Indigenous peoples (IP) in traditional clothes</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. IP (not in traditional clothes)</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Indigenous movement in protest</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Government officials</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Various representatives: legislator, assemblyman and councilman</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Aboriginal children and school students</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Art museums and artworks</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Scholars &amp; anthropologists</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Indigenous villages and communities</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Animals and hunting traps</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Mountain and seacoast scenery</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. The Pingpu tribe's temple and sacrificial offerings</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Indigenous artists</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Indigenous hunters</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 7

Content Analysis

| 15. Plants and agricultural products | 8           | 2%          |
| 16. Indigenous farmers               | 6           | 1%          |
| 17. Indigenous athletes              | 6           | 1%          |
| 18. Traditional artifacts and musical instruments | 5 | 1% |
| 19. Religious workers and missionaries | 5 | 1% |
| 20. Books and magazines              | 5           | 1%          |

Note: The other 31 image categories have less than five photos each. 59 pictures are in these categories. The other 39 pictures were coded in both the 'others' and 'unclear / cannot code' categories.

From Table 7.5, we can see that 'indigenous people (IP) in traditional clothes' was the most frequently appearing image in the items sampled, accounting for almost a quarter, 23% of all the pictures. It is interesting to note that most of the pictures in this image category were taken at special occasions, such as during aboriginal celebrations of the annual harvest festival, traditional rites and ceremonies in their home villages, or song & dance performance and competition in cities organised either by the government or by performing troupes themselves. Some photos featured the tattooed face of a particular individual character or the paraphernalia of traditional clothes, but most depicted groups of indigenous peoples in traditional clothes, singing and dancing in collective presentation.

In addition, many indigenous activists wear traditional clothes during protests and demonstrations, demanding more government protection of aboriginal rights in relation to land, culture and politics. In Taiwan's contemporary cultural politics, traditional clothes have become assertive symbols of the indigenous identity. Since both aboriginal cultural events and indigenous movements are regarded as newsworthy in the eyes of journalists, this partly explains the reason why both images were so
popular among the sample newspapers. This will be discussed later in next section of this chapter.

Most of the major images in the sampled items displayed in Table 7.5 can be roughly divided into two major categories, 'traditional' or 'modern' images. The former is defined as reproducing long-standing ways of life and social practices, whereas the latter relates to the on-going process of making the future through political participation and entering into general consumer culture. Table 7.6 presents the 'traditional' and 'modern' images of indigenous peoples.

Table 7.6
'Traditional' and 'Modern' Images of Indigenous Peoples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional Images</th>
<th>Modern Images</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Categories</td>
<td>No. of Pictures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous peoples</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in traditional</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clothes (1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous village</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and community (9)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous farming</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and hunting (10)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(14) (15) (16)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous artists,</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>arts and artifacts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(7) (13) (18)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ritual/religion (12)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
1. The number in parenthesis corresponds to the 'Image' category number in Table 7.5.
Chapter 7 Content Analysis

2. Other image categories of the Table 7.5, such as 'government officials' (4), 'various representatives' (5), 'scholar and anthropologist' (8), and 'religious workers and missionaries' (19) do not only refer to aboriginal people but Han Chinese as well.

Among the 493 pictures, we can see that the 'traditional' pictures (205) occurred almost twice as often as 'modern' pictures (104) [The others (184) do not easily fall into either of these two groups]. From this pattern we can conclude that, overall, there is a strong leaning towards 'traditional' representations of indigenous peoples—they are associated with the past, with reproduction and continuity rather than with the future and change.

7.3.2 Actors and Themes

News Actors

The 'news actor' variable is defined here as the specific tribal groups among the indigenous peoples with which the news story is concerned. In this variable, 373 items (42.4%) of the sample (880 items) were concerned with Taiwan's indigenous peoples as a whole. Of the other 507 'specified' items, 324 items (36.8%) were concerned with 'mountain Yuanchumin', 59 (6.7%) with 'plains Yuanchumin' and 92 items (10.5%) with 'urban Yuanchumin'. [32 items (3.6%) were classified as 'unclear/cannot code."

Hence, when particular sections of the aboriginal community are specified, mountain Yuanchumin attract the most attention, followed by the urban Yuanchumin, and the plains Yuanchumin.\textsuperscript{11}

\textsuperscript{11} As we noted earlier, the term 'mountain people' (Shanpao) has long been used by the government of the ROC on Taiwan since 1940s. It was not until 1994 when the ROC government on Taiwan amended the Additional Articles of the Constitution of the Republic of China, that the government finally abolished this term, granting the aboriginal peoples the term 'Yuanchumin' (original inhabitants of Taiwan). Since 1994, the ROC government has employed the term 'Yuanchumin' in official documents, using 'the mountain Yuanchumin', 'the plains Yuanchumin', and 'the urban Yuanchumin' to classify the indigenous peoples of Taiwan. For more details of this renaming struggles, see Chapter 3 of this thesis.
As mentioned earlier, of nine major aboriginal tribes in Taiwan, six, the Atayal, Paiwan, Bunun, Tsou, Rukai, Yami are thought of as 'mountain Yuanchumin', and three, the Ami, Saisiyat, and Puyuma tribes are thought of as 'plains Yuanchumin'. The Pingpu tribe, who were early assimilated with the Han Chinese during Ching dynasty, has recently revived its indigenous identity and ethnic cultures. Although not yet formally recognised by the government as an indigenous group, the Pingpu tribe's cultural resurgence paves the way for it to become the tenth indigenous group in Taiwan in the future. The relative attention paid to these various indigenous tribes in the sampled items is detailed in Figure 7.5.

From this we can see that the Atayal tribe appears most often, accounting for 31.56% (160 items) of the 507 'specified' items. The Ami tribe comes second with 9.86% (50); the Bunun tribe third with 8.68% (44); followed by the Pingpu, 8.48% (43); Yami, 7.50% (38); Paiwan, 6.51% (33) and Tsou, 5.33% (27) tribes. The Saisiyat and Rukai tribes have equally low shares 3.55% (18) whilst the Puyuma tribe got the least attention, accounting for only 2.37 % (12) of the total. There are 64 (12.62%) indigenous items which were coded in Others. For example, those items which refer to two or more tribal groups in the same item were coded in this category. Figure 7.5 presents the distribution of press attention to the various tribal groups in Taiwan.

From the Figure 7.5, we can see that the Atayal group was featured particularly prominently in the sample newspapers, attracting more than three times more mentions than any other titles. If we look back at Table 3.2 in Chapter 3, the Atayal tribe is the second largest 'mountain Yuanchumin' group, with a population of 81,800, accounting for 23.69% of the overall population of Taiwan's indigenous peoples. In contrast, the largest tribe, the Ami, which accounts for 38.19% of the total indigenous population features only 9.86% of the 'specified' indigenous items. So why was the Atayal tribe

---

12 According to December 1992 statistics, the population of Taiwan's aborigines amounts to just under 350,806 individuals living in over 76,000 households. Also see Table 3.2 in Chapter 3.

13 Pingpu tribe, together with members of other tribes who dwell in urban centres, is coded in the 'urban Yuanchumin' in this study.
Figure 7.5
Distribution of Attention to Major Tribal Groups in the Press Sample

The distribution of attention to major tribal groups in the press sample is as follows:

- **Others**: 64
- **Puyuma**: 12
- **Rukai**: 18
- **Saisiyat**: 18
- **Tsou**: 27
- **Paiwan**: 33
- **Yami**: 38
- **Pingpu**: 43
- **Bunun**: 44
- **Ami**: 50
- **Atayal**: 160

The Atayal tribe is featured so prominently by the sample titles? It is partly due to the fact that this tribe is widely spread out in Taiwan in terms of their geographical location. They are scattered across the central, northern and eastern part of Taiwan, covering eight counties and many other cities (See the map of geographical distribution of indigenous tribal groups in Taiwan in Figure 3.1 in Chapter 3). In contrast, the other tribes are mainly concentrated in one or two counties in the east or south of Taiwan. This general availability and, particularly, the proximity to the capital, has a considerable effect on indigenous coverage by the mainstream newspapers. Reporters pressed for time are

---

14 Apart from the offshore islands such as Kinmen and Matsu, the frontier military bases, Taiwan has altogether 16 counties on the island.
more likely to gravitate towards sources close at hand. But familiarity carries symbolic costs.

The Atayal tribe’s culture and rituals are no more spectacular than those of any other tribe. Nor is it particularly famous for mobilising indigenous movements, since these movements are pan-aboriginal in character. Rather, the tribe is most noted for its ‘social problems’, for instance, its relatively higher degrees of prostitution and its suicide rates.15

Over the years, through the long-term coverage by the mainstream media, the Atayal tribe has gradually become ‘reader-friendly’, or we may say, ‘reporter-friendly’. As a consequence, the media have long been in the practice of highlighting the whole aboriginal ‘problem’ through the specific lens of the Atayal tribe’s problems.

Subjects and Themes

In this study, both major and secondary subjects and themes were coded.16 Though the ‘major’ subject and theme were coded for each indigenous items, almost three quarters (73.1%) of the items coded didn’t have a ‘secondary’ subject or theme. The ‘subjects’ of indigenous items were roughly divided into 13 main categories (see Table 7.7). Table 7.7 shows that the Taiwan newspapers concentrated most heavily on the areas of culture and art which were mentioned in 30.1% of the coded items, followed by political news, which was mentioned in 17.8%, tourism, media and entertainment news (9.4%); the natural environment (7.3%); and educational news (6.5%). If we combine the cultural and political news together, almost a half (47.9%) all mentions fall into these two subject categories.

15 According to Hsu’s (1987: 44) research, prostitution in the Atayal tribe is a major concern for aboriginal human rights, and it has been widely publicised by the mainstream media.

16 The ‘major’ and ‘secondary’ subject and theme were coded in this study. The ‘major’ subject and theme were coded for each indigenous items. If there were more than one subject and theme in the items, then the secondary subject and theme were coded.
Table 7.7
Relative Prominence of Major Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>No. of Mentions</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Culture &amp; Art</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>30.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Political News</td>
<td>157</td>
<td>17.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Tourism, Media &amp; Entertainment</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>9.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Natural Environment</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>7.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Educational News</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>6.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Human Interest Story</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>6.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Social Problems &amp; Crimes</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>5.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Economic News</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>4.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Social Affairs</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Sports News</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Agriculture &amp; Forest</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Military &amp; Police</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Medical &amp; Health</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Others</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>3.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Unclear/cannot code</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>880</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of thematic categories, altogether, there were 85 themes in this study. If we look in more detail at the major themes covered, we see that they are in order: 1. ‘annual harvest festival and traditional rites’ (59 items, 6.7%); 2. ‘indigenous song and

---

17 In the thematic categories, 6 themes were coded in the ‘political news’ subject; 5 in ‘economic news’; 10 in ‘educational news’; 15 in ‘culture & art’; 7 in ‘social affairs’; 3 in ‘agriculture & forest’; 3 in ‘medical and health’; 10 in ‘social problems & crimes’; 9 in ‘natural environment’; 5 in ‘tourism, media & entertainment’; 4 in ‘sports news’; 2 in ‘human interest story’; and 6 in ‘military & police’ subject (See Appendix 4—Code Book of the Content Analysis).
dance, presentation and contest' (50, 5.7%); 3. ‘indigenous movements and protests demanding for aboriginal rights’ (49, 5.6%); 4. 'Indigenous Cultural Conference' \(^{18}\) (42, 4.8%); 5. ‘special characters profiles in literary and feature stories’ (40, 4.5%); and 6. the ‘constitutional amendment for indigenous rights’ (39, 4.4%). The 1st, 2nd and 4th themes belong to the cultural subject area and the 3rd and 6th fall within the domain of politics. Only the 5th could be placed in another category—the ‘human interest story’.

Why did aboriginal political and cultural stories and events appear in the papers more frequently than the other subjects? Why were indigenous cultural events so welcomed by the mainstream newspapers and so often accompanied by colourful photos? These are fundamentally important questions that need to be discussed here.

As mentioned earlier in Chapter 4, after the abolition of martial law in 1987, Taiwan's press has experienced a tremendous change in management and editing policies to meet the challenges brought about by the new political and market situation. More decision-making powers on page layouts and contents were given to page editors. In response to the political shift in which Taiwanese politicians took over the reins of central government from the hands of Mainlanders in the late 1980s, and the growing emphasis on reviving local Fukienese (majority Taiwanese) culture, many newspapers launched new pages devoted to local (Taiwanese) culture, art and literature. Both the major titles, the China Times and United Daily News, took appropriate measures to become locally-oriented (or native-oriented), and most other newspapers competed to be genuinely local Taiwanese newspapers. In this changed political and cultural climate, the cultures and problems of indigenous peoples, who were formally recognised by the government in 1994 as the ‘original inhabitants’ (Yuanchumin), received more attention from both the state and civil society including the press. Featuring indigenous news enables newspapers to win credits for becoming more locally-oriented, more concerned with local issues on Taiwan itself, instead of the more remote China complex in political and cultural terms.

\(^{18}\) The ‘Indigenous Cultural Conference’ was held on 9-11 April, 1994 in Taiwan. It was the first academic conference on aboriginal cultural issues which was sponsored by the government of Taiwan.
Alongside this growing ethos of localism in Taiwanese society, indigenous peoples have also revived their own languages and cultures, demanding that the government incorporate aboriginal history in textbooks, practising bi-lingual education in aboriginal primary schools, and restoring traditional rites. As part of this movement, annual harvest festivals featuring indigenous song and dance celebrations have increased phenomenally and become the mainstay of the indigenous cultural revival. These cultural events held in aboriginal townships or performed in cities for a wide public and attended by indigenous peoples adorned in traditional clothes, as I argued in Chapter 3, have not only contributed to the consolidation and unity of aboriginal community but, above all, have strengthened pan-aboriginal identity in the new ethnic politics of Taiwan.

As we can see from the findings of the thematic categories above, we find that the other notable phenomenon which has attracted media attention to Yuanchumin's issues is the growth of indigenous political mobilisation which originated a decade ago. In the wake of Taiwan's democratisation and the establishment of the 'Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines' in 1984, indigenous movements have frequently taken to the streets in Taipei with a view to attracting central government's attention and the media's coverage, staking their demands for more legal protection of aboriginal rights. In the last decade, generally, in most cases, social movements have been characterised by conflicts and tensions between the state and civil society, which have become a major priority within the news agenda. Aboriginal movements in Taiwan have in turn benefited from this. 19

To sum up the findings presented in this section, overall, Taiwanese mainstream newspapers tended to give most prominence to indigenous 'culture and art' subjects, particularly to the theme of 'annual harvest festival and traditional rites' which is often accompanied by aboriginal song and dance celebrations. In terms of political news, the theme of 'indigenous movements and protests' is most often the target of the press

19 In general, the media has preferred reporting social movements, but attached different degrees of attention and prominence to different movements. This will be discussed in Chapter 9 of the thesis.
attention. This finding roughly coincides with the result of the image category discussed above.

7.3.3 Quotation & Representation

Authors

In this study, the question of 'Who writes indigenous stories' is regarded as vitally important. Consequently, wherever possible I have coded the ethnic group of the author (news writer, journalist, editor, freelancer, story contributor, columnist, scholar, etc.)20 Due to the inaccessibility of reliable data on aboriginal employment in Taiwan's media organisations, this variable can at least provide some proxy clues to the degree of indigenous access to Taiwan's press industry. Table 7.8 presents the distribution of authorship of coded items by ethnic group.

Of the entire sample, only 73 items were written by indigenous peoples, accounting for 8.3% of the total.21 Han Chinese wrote almost three quarters of items

20 In the codebook, authors are classified into four broad categories as follows:
1. The item was written by an aboriginal writer or contributor.
2. The item was written by a non-indigenous Han Chinese author.
3. The item was translated into Chinese but the original author was a foreigner.
4. Unclear/cannot code.

However, it should be noted that it is not at all easy to arrive at an accurate coding for the authors' (mostly journalists') ethnic group, because many aboriginal writers used their Chinese names in their writing contributions. Some items hint at the authors' ethnic membership by using aboriginal pseudonyms but mostly not. However, with the advantage of having a strong network of communication among aboriginal elites and intellectuals in Taiwan, and being familiar with the few indigenous journalists working in the mainstream newspapers, I was reasonably confident in coding the ethnic group of the authors. If doubts and uncertainties arose, then 'unclear/cannot code' would be marked.

21 The 73 items written by aboriginal writers were derived from the 57 pieces of articles, because some articles were lengthy that were serialised for two or three days in the newspapers. One article was even printed serially for four days, thus it was coded as four items. The number of items were
Table 7.8
Distribution of Authorship by Ethnic Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnic Groups</th>
<th>Number of Items</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous People</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Han Chinese</td>
<td>638</td>
<td>72.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreigner (Japanese)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclear/cannot code</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 'Unclear/cannot code' includes: 1. unidentified ethnic groups; 2. anonymous and unbylined news stories and articles; 3. collective presentation in which the author cannot be identified individually; 4. Photo-only presentation in which only photos appear without news text accompanied.

(72.5%) with Japanese authors contributing two articles about aboriginal history and culture. The other 19% (167) of items were coded as 'unclear/cannot code'. In most cases, unbylined items were presented in the name of the newspaper organisation instead of the individual journalist. This was particularly evident in the Commons (71 coded based upon the frequency (times of appearance) on the newspapers, but not counted, per se, by the number of articles or stories. However, most indigenous articles were printed once, not serially. Further breakdown calculated by using hand counts of the contributions by tribal groups reveals that out of the total of 57 stories and articles, 16 were contributed by Atayal authors, followed by Paiwan (11), Bunun (5), Pingpu (5), Tsou (5), Rukai (4), Ami (3), Puyuma (2), and Yami (2) tribes. As to the other four articles, one was written in the name of the organisation—the Indigenous Voice Association of Taiwan University. The other three articles were written using their aboriginal pseudonyms, but the tribal groups of these authors could not be identified. The most productive aboriginal writer is Walis Yukan (his Atayal's name), the founder of Hunter's Culture, who has produced 10 stories during the sample period, followed by his wife, Likelale Awu (Paiwan's name) who produced 6. Yukan is a primary school teacher and was interviewed in this study (see Chapter 9). Yukan and Awu halted the publication of Hunter's Culture and established an 'Indigenous Human and Culture Centre' near his school at his hometown in central Taiwan, aiming to preserve the history and culture of Yuanchumin. Yukan is now devoted to writing the local history of the Atayal tribe, Awu to aboriginal women's problems. The other indigenous contributors are teachers, physicians, missionaries, legislators (MP), university students and media workers.
out of 167 items) and the *Taiwan Times* (54). However, it is reasonable to assume that most of the 167 items in this 'unclear/cannot code' category were written by non-indigenous staff journalists in the sample newspapers. Consequently, the total share of indigenous coverage written by non-indigenous Han Chinese is almost certainly rather more than 72.5%.

By matching authors with item types (See Table 7.9), we see that none of the general news items or commentaries were written by aboriginal writers. Out of the 73 items written by indigenous authors, over two thirds (49, 67.1%) appeared in the literature supplement pages, followed by columns (11) and reader's letters to the editor (10). This suggests that the only direct access to the mainstream press for indigenous peoples is through the pages that are open to outside writers. They were able to write about their own culture but were not in a position to compile general news stories about the politics of indigenous issues and movements or to offer comments on them. In these key areas, they were spoken about but did not speak for themselves. This finding lends strong support to the argument that very few indigenous peoples, if any, work in the editorial departments in the major mainstream newspapers in Taiwan and that when they contribute, they do so as outside writers rather than staff reporters. This supposition is supported by recent research.

According to a study conducted by Lo Ven-hwei\(^{22}\) in 1994, out of the 1,003 Taiwanese journalists who replied to his questionnaire, only 4 claimed to be indigenous (Cited from Peng & Fang (*in press*), 652). This finding provides strong support for the argument that indigenous peoples are virtually absent from the workforce in the mainstream media.

The indigenously authored items mainly focused on 'profiles of particular individuals in literature and feature stories' (13 items); 'annual harvest festivals and traditional rites' and 'the indigenous cultural conference' (10 items each); and 'aboriginal history' (6). It is also important to note the wide variation between titles in their openness to indigenous contributions. The *Taiwan Times* printed the most,

\(^{22}\) Lo Ven-hwei is a professor of National Chengchi University in Taiwan.
Table 7.9

Type of Taiwan Indigenous News Written by Different Ethnic Authors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>IP Author</th>
<th>Non-IP Author</th>
<th>Foreign Author</th>
<th>Unclear/can’t code</th>
<th>Row Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General news</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>371 (58.2%)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>113 (67.7%)</td>
<td>484 (55%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feature</td>
<td>2 (2.7%)</td>
<td>79 (12.4%)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>6 (3.6%)</td>
<td>87 (9.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Editorial</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Column</td>
<td>11 (15.1%)</td>
<td>65 (10.2%)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>7 (4.2%)</td>
<td>83 (9.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commentary</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>11 (1.7%)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (0.6%)</td>
<td>12 (1.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letters to the editor</td>
<td>10 (13.7%)</td>
<td>12 (1.9%)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>4 (2.4%)</td>
<td>26 (3.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>literature supplement</td>
<td>49 (67.1%)</td>
<td>65 (10.2%)</td>
<td>2 (100%)</td>
<td>21 (12.6%)</td>
<td>137 (15.6%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>1 (1.4%)</td>
<td>35 (5.5%)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>15 (9%)</td>
<td>51 (5.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>638</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>880 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 1. IP: Indigenous people.
2. Most of the ‘unclear/can’t code’ news items are unbylined and presented in the name of the newspaper organisation.

accounting for 30 items out of 73, with the China Times carrying 25 items. Together they accounted for approximately two thirds of all indigenous contributions (55 out of 73). The Commons carried 7 items; the United Daily News, 6; the Independent Morning Post, 4; and the Liberty Times, 1. However, the KMT’s organ, the Central Daily News didn’t publish a single indigenous contribution during the sample period.
Figure 7.6 shows the distribution of items written by aboriginal authors in the sample titles.

At the same time, since most indigenous contributions appeared in the literature supplement page, which usually takes up one or two whole pages, a great proportion of indigenous items were relatively extensive. Of the total of 73 items, approximately 60% (44) took up more than 250 square centimeters; Among them, 20 items fell into the range of 251-500 cm$^2$, 21 items in between 501-1,000 cm$^2$, and three between 1,001-1,800 cm$^2$. 
Headline Actors

Headlines are considered important both because they are more often read than the texts of stories and because they influence the interpretations made by readers (Grenier, 1992: 284; Hartmann and Husband, 1974: 141; Van Dijk, 1991: 51; Wimmer and Dimminick, 1983). In this study, the variable headline actor aims to tap three aspects of headlines: 1. Who are they?; 2. Which ethnic group they belong to?; and 3. Are they quoted or referred to?

Both primary and secondary actors are coded. Their group affiliations are divided into five categories:

1. Indigenous peoples (IP)
2. Han Chinese (HC)
3. Foreigner
4. Unidentified ethnic group
5. Collective actors

In this study the first four categories can be coded individually, while the fifth cannot. In the sample, 66.4% of all items (584) featured primary actors in the headlines and 12.6% (111) of them carried quotations. Table 7.10 summarises the overall distribution. Among the 584 items which featured primary actors in the headlines, collective actors were the most frequently featured (44.9%), followed by members of indigenous groups (11.1%), Han Chinese (9.0%), and foreigners (1.4%). Leaving aside collective actors and concentrating simply on individuals, indigenous peoples were ‘referred to’ as primary actors in twice as many cases as the Han Chinese—73 as against 37. However, many more Han Chinese were directly ‘quoted’—42 as against 25.
Table 7.10
Primary Actors in Headlines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary Actors</th>
<th>Number of Items</th>
<th>Percent of Total Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Neither referred to nor quoted</td>
<td>296</td>
<td>33.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quoted</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Referred to</td>
<td>473</td>
<td>53.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of social or political positions, the most frequently 'quoted' actors in the headlines were, in order: Han government officials (29 items); Yuanchumin and tribal names\(^{23}\) (15); indigenous public officials\(^{24}\) (10); indigenous representatives\(^{25}\) (9). The most frequently 'referred to' were: Yuanchumin and tribal names (166); county and township government agencies (28); Han government officials (26); cabinet ministries and central government (23).

The findings on the 'headline actors' clearly indicate that:

1. Indigenous peoples are most often seen as a group, i.e., they are constructed as the anonymous 'other' to be looked at from outside as either a 'problem' or as exotic (see the distribution of 'referred to' above).

\(^{23}\) It is important to note here that in the coding of 'Yuanchumin and tribal names', the terms 'Yuanchumin' and tribal names such as the 'Atayal', 'Ami', 'Yami' appeared most frequently in the headlines. In most cases, they were used as adjectives, for example, 'Yuanchumin culture' or 'Yuanchumin art', 'Yuanchumin problems', 'Yuanchumin girls', 'Yuanchumin rights', and 'Yuanchumin song & dance', etc. Tribal group names also appeared frequently in the headlines as adjectives. However, as they were used as adjectives in these contexts, they were not coded as actors. They were coded in this 'headline actor' category only when the 'Yuanchumin' and the 'tribal groups' were agents (subjects) that could produce actions.

\(^{24}\) 'Indigenous public officials' includes indigenous government officials and aboriginal township and village chiefs.

\(^{25}\) Indigenous representatives include aboriginal township representatives, county council representatives, Taiwan provincial assemblymen, legislators (MP), and national assemblymen.
2. When indigenous peoples are talked about, the talking is more often done by Han Chinese (see the distribution of 'quotations'). This reinforces the construction of them as the 'other'.

3. The Han perspective is very much an 'official' perspective enunciated by Han government officials.

Only 141 headlines in the total sample featured secondary actors. Here again, Han Chinese were more likely to be quoted than members of indigenous groups (11 as against 7 quotes), but the latter were 'referred to' more often.

**Quotations in Stories**

Quotations function in several ways to make news reports more persuasive and credible (Van Dijk, 1991: 152). The core question for this present study is how often indigenous groups are quoted as speakers in news about themselves. In other words, how often are they given the chance to define their own situation? In this study, speakers are divided into three groups: 'major speaker', 'secondary speaker 1' and 'secondary speaker 2' in accordance with their degree of prominence and importance. The major speaker who is quoted most prominently is coded first, then secondary speaker 1 and secondary speaker 2. If there is no secondary speaker in the news, only the major speaker is coded. A large number of news items (371, 42.2%) did not have any quoted speakers.

The findings reveal that when individuals are quoted, Han Chinese are quoted more often as major speakers (in 51.3% of items) than members of indigenous groups (43.8%). But there are major differences between papers concealed by these overall averages. For example, in three titles CT, IMP, and TT, members of indigenous groups are quoted more often, whilst in the three other titles—UDN, CDN, and C, Han Chinese account for a very substantial percent of quotes—over 60% in each case (see Table 7.11).
We know from our earlier discussion that the TT, IMP and CT are the three newspapers that give the most prominence to indigenous stories in terms of 'item size'. From the Table 7.11, we see that they are also the three titles in the sample that quoted more indigenous peoples as major speakers than HC in indigenous news. I have briefly explained their ideological orientations in relation to indigenous news above. The TT and IMP are more *locally-oriented*, emphasising local Taiwanese culture and art, whereas the CT has long been noted for its liberal position in dealing with political news and minorities' (women, environment and Yuanchumin) issues. This can be positively argued by the finding on the use of aboriginal contributions by the sample titles discussed above. The TT printed 30 aboriginal-authored items (out of 73) and the CT carried 25. Together, both titles accounted for two thirds of all aboriginal
contributions. In my view, despite Yuanchumin’s criticisms of the mainstream press coverage of their affairs as a whole, these three titles are perhaps most favoured by indigenous elites and activists, due to their long-term interest and openness in their editorial management of indigenous news.

The other four titles in the sample carried more Han Chinese as major sources in the news. They are the C (68.6%), UDN (61.2%), CDN (60.9%), and LT (55.6%). It is interesting to find that the southern-based Taiwanese-owned Commons, which is noted for its emphasis on local Taiwanese news and its adversarial stance to the KMT in Taiwan, carried the least indigenous major quotes (27.5%). The other Taiwanese-owned newspaper, the LT, which also privileges Taiwanese localism (e.g., emphasising Taiwan's culture, history, art and language, in contrast to those of mainland China), carried comparative few quotes from indigenous speakers. This finding is thought-provoking since it indicates that locally-oriented Taiwanese-owned newspapers do not necessarily privilege indigenous opinions. To the C and the LT, indigenous peoples are regarded as secondary to the HC, or more specifically, the Taiwanese voices in terms of news quotation. In contrast, the TT and the IMP, which are also Taiwanese-owned and locally-oriented, offer more space to indigenous voices. These newspapers were all founded by Taiwanese capitalists and politicians who share something in common: they all come from a strong economic background. The TT and LT are close to the KMT\textsuperscript{26} in political positions, while the IMP and the C are not (see Figure 4.3 in Chapter 4).

The other two titles, the UDN and the CDN, also quoted less indigenous major speakers than Han Chinese. As the CDN is a KMT mouthpiece and, as we have already seen, gave the least attention to indigenous stories and did not publish a single aboriginal contribution during the sample period discussed above, it is not surprising to find that it carried less IP than HC as major speakers in its coverage. The UDN of the largest news group in Taiwan has long been labeled as a relatively more conservative

\textsuperscript{26} I argued in Chapter 4 that although the owners of the TT and the LT are close to the KMT, particularly to the Mainstream faction of the KMT led by President Lee Teng-hui, generally speaking, their editorial policies remain critical of the KMT.
and sympathetic to the Chinese New Party and the non-mainstream faction of the KMT. However, since the political democratisation of Taiwan in the late 1980s, this paper has shifted to place more emphasis on local cultural issues to swim with the market tide.

Therefore, what we can argue here is that, apart from the KMT's organ, the CDN, which certainly marginalises indigenous issues, the other six titles in the sample are widely varied in their reportings of indigenous affairs. After briefly reviewing their political positions, owners' ethnic background and editorial policies, it seems that none of these factors can sufficiently explain the wide difference in their coverage of indigenous affairs. This finding is in line with our previous argument, that since owners do not have defined policies on indigenous coverage, there is considerable scope for editorial and journalistic discretion.

Turning to the question of who is quoted, the study reveals that the five actors, either individual or collective, most quoted as major speakers in the sample as a whole were: 'Han Chinese government officials' (82 items, 9.3%); 'various government agencies' (76, 8.7%) \(^{28}\); 'Han Chinese scholars and intellectuals' and 'indigenous representatives' (34, 3.9% each); 'indigenous public officials' (24, 2.7%). Figure 7.7 shows the major quote distribution of the five most frequently quoted actors in the indigenous news.

As individual actors then, Han Chinese government officials are the most frequently quoted, as major speakers, accounting for 9.3% of all citations. Various government agencies rank second, accounting for only marginally fewer mentions, 8.7%. So among those quoted as major speakers, the opinions of Han Chinese government officials as individual actors and the various government agencies as collective actors can be said to act as the 'primary definers' of news about aboriginal affairs, accounting for 18% of all the major quotes in the indigenous news. This finding lends further support to the argument that there is an 'authority orientation' ethos deeply embedded in mainstream newspapers' reports about aboriginal groups.

\(^{27}\) See 4.3.3.4 in Chapter 4.

\(^{28}\) Various government agencies include the central government (27 items, 3.1%); Taiwan provincial government (14, 1.6%); and county and township government (35, 4.0%).
In the wake of Taiwan’s political reforms and democratisation, various elections have taken place almost every year in the last decade. As a result, political news is abundant, and press partisanship is rampant, as argued in Chapter 4. In this context, government officials are often drawn upon as primary sources to explain or clarify a certain political issue. Indigenous news is no exception to this. In response to the indigenous movements and demonstrations which are usually targeted at the central government agencies, Han Chinese higher-ranking government officials are asked to reformulate aboriginal policies. Even in relation to indigenous cultural events, Han Chinese government officials are often now involved in defining and promoting aboriginal cultural policies. Indeed responding to aboriginal demands for the preservation of their cultural legacy, rituals, language and artifacts, which were on the wane, has increasingly become a task for government. This further reinforces the authority orientation of news quotation, which has long been a tradition of the Taiwan’s press.
Among Han Chinese government officials, President Lee Teng-hui was quoted most often as a major speaker (in 11 items), followed by the Governor of the Taiwan Provincial Government (TPG) (10); the KMT whip in the National Assembly (7); the President of the Executive Yuan (Prime Minister) (6); Ilan Hsien (county) Magistrate (5). In general, government officials were quoted mainly to explain government policies and assistance measures, during important occasions such as National Assembly’s provisional session for Constitutional amendment, the Indigenous Cultural Conference, visiting the quake-hit aboriginal townships and answering indigenous legislators’ interpellations in the Legislative Yuan.

Counts of quotations from indigenous speakers reveal that the most frequently quoted individual is Yichiang Paluerh (from Ami tribe), who has been a very important leader of the aboriginal movement in Taiwan for the last ten years. Paluerh was quoted nine times as a major speaker, followed by Walis Yukan (7 quotes), the founder of Hunter’s Culture; Malai Kumai (Atayal, 6 quotes), an aboriginal legislator (MP); Sun Ta-chuan, the editor-in-chief of the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly (4); Taipang Sasale (Rukai), the editor-in-chief of Indigenous Post (4); Naneng Mo, an aboriginal poet (4); Mingte Shen, an aboriginal township chief in central Taiwan (4); and Yule Chang, an aboriginal township chief in northern Taiwan (4). Figure 7.8 shows the individual actors most frequently quoted in indigenous news stories during the sample period.

As we can see from the Figure 7.8, Han Chinese government officials, President Lee Teng-hui and the governor of Taiwan Provincial Government (TPG) are the most frequently quoted as major speakers in the indigenous news items, followed by Yichiang Paluerh, a very famous aboriginal movement leader. The KMT whip in the National Assembly (NA) is on the list because the NA was having a convention for amending the Constitution, and aboriginal demand for renaming ‘Shanpao’ to ‘Yuanchumin’ was one of the issues on the agenda. The KMT whip was often drawn upon as a major source to speak on the constitutional amendment regarding aboriginal rights.
Consequently, the 'authority orientation' of the indigenous news is further confirmed by these results in that the most frequently quoted individuals are either Han Chinese government officials or the KMT’s whip. On the other hand, the three indigenous actors were mostly quoted in relation to indigenous demonstrations and protests, such as the protest to the 'Indigenous Cultural Conference' in April 1994 and the demonstration highlighting the theme of 'Renaming, Land and Self-Government
Rights' in June 1994.\textsuperscript{29} Therefore, although indigenous voices were also quoted, but they were mostly mobilised during indigenous protests and demonstrations and remained marginalised when the news was related to their general welfare and concerns.

If we now cross-tabulate aboriginal major speakers by major subject and theme, we find that they are most often quoted as major speakers in relation to 'indigenous movements and protests' (9 quotes), followed by 'politics and elections' (6 quotes), 'annual harvest festival and traditional rites' (5 quotes), 'TV and movie programmes and film exhibition' (5 quotes), and 'particular characters profiled in literature and feature stories' (5 quotes).

Looking now at secondary speakers, only 23.2\% of items (204) had one secondary speaker and 9.4\% (83) a second secondary speaker. Among sole secondary speakers (secondary speaker 1), Han Chinese speakers and indigenous people enjoyed almost equal representation (89 to 87). While among secondary secondary speakers (secondary speaker 2), they were marginally more prominent with 37 quotes as against 32. Therefore, Han Chinese are more likely to be quoted as secondary speakers in the news, but only by a small margin. This finding suggests that although (as we saw earlier in Table 7.11) Han Chinese speakers appear more often as primary speakers, members of indigenous groups have a greater opportunity to reply, respond or comment. However, although this increases their overall visibility and their access to readerships, it can be argued that they are still in a subordinate position since they are working within an agenda of debate set by Han Chinese.

If we take a closer look at sole secondary speakers, the most quoted actors are: Han Chinese government officials (31 items); Han Chinese scholars and intellectuals (20); indigenous representatives (17); and indigenous public officials (14). As to

\textsuperscript{29} Yichiang Paluerh was the leader of the 'Renaming, Land and Self-Government Rights' demonstration, while Walis Yukan mobilised a protest to the 'Indigenous Cultural Conference' during its opening ceremony where he criticised the organiser for inviting less aboriginal members of indigenous participants than the Han Chinese, although he himself was invited as a speaker on educational issues. The author was also invited to speak on indigenous peoples and the mass media in this conference, but was not able to participate due to my study in the UK.
secondary secondary speakers, the most quoted actors are: Han Chinese scholars and intellectuals (8), Han Chinese political party leaders (8), Han Chinese government officials (6) and indigenous scholars and intellectuals (6).

The result of both secondary speakers counts reveals that Han Chinese were more frequently quoted as speakers than indigenous counterparts. In a word, in the mainstream press reports about indigenous news, Han Chinese featured more than indigenous peoples not only in the major quotes but also in the sole and secondary secondary quotes. In terms of social positions, HC government officials and HC scholars and intellectuals were the most popular sources in the indigenous news. HC scholars and intellectuals were frequently relied upon as authoritative speakers to comment on indigenous issues from different academic disciplines, such as anthropology, ethnology, political and social sciences. Indigenous representatives were the most frequently mentioned among the indigenous sources in the news, but their voices were relatively submerged and marginalised in the Han Chinese-owned press within a news framework that frequently prioritised dominant official and academic interpretations.

7.4 Concluding Remarks

First, in terms of the prominence and attention dimension, with 880 items of indigenous news collected from January to June, 1994, we cannot say that Taiwan's mainstream press has simply neglected indigenous issues. If we divide 880 by 181 sampling days, the seven titles produced nearly 4.86 indigenous items per day. Further, the fact that 80% of items (704) were printed in the national section of the sampled newspapers that carry materials judged to be of primary importance, suggests that indigenous affairs are considered significant.

In addition, 43.9% of items (386) carry at least one illustration, producing 493 pictures in all, 459 of which were photos. However, almost one fourth (114, 23%) of all illustrations featured indigenous peoples in traditional clothes. Most of these
pictures were taken at special occasions, either during indigenous song & dance celebrations in connection with annual harvest festivals and traditional rites, or song & dance performance and competitions. These occasions often involve hundreds of indigenous Yuanchumin in colorful traditional regalia and ornaments singing and dancing in a collective presentation. Since these events are photogenic, vibrant and mostly large scale, they provide perfect conditions for 'symbolic tourism', giving readers a glance of primitivism. Hence, whatever the editor's motivations in featuring them, they operate to reinforce a stereotypical view of indigenous peoples as exotic 'others'.

Second, in terms of themes and contents, we found that indigenous 'culture and art' stories received the most coverage overall, accounting for 30.1% of the items sampled (265), with 'political' news, 17.8% (157), as the next greatest. The theme of 'annual harvest festival and traditional rites' (59 items, 6.7% of the total) is the area most covered by the newspapers, followed by 'indigenous song and dance, presentation and contest' (50) and 'indigenous movements and protests demanding aboriginal rights' (49).

In this chapter, we linked the increasing attention to indigenous affairs by the mainstream press and the concentration on cultural and political indigenous news to changes in Taiwan's social and cultural contexts, particularly to the political reforms initiated a decade ago. I argued that the growing localism of Taiwanese culture, the indigenous cultural revival, and the political mobilisation of indigenous peoples have combined to shape a news framework that is more attentive to cultural and political concerns of Taiwan Yuanchumin in recent years. The findings lend credence to this explanation.

Third, in terms of quotation and representation, the findings are more revealing. This study has focused on three variables of author, headline actor, and news quotation. Of the 880 items of indigenous coverage sampled, only 73 (8.3%) were written by members of an indigenous group. In contrast, Han Chinese were identified as writing 638 items (72.5%). However, this is almost certainly an underestimate, because we have every reason to believe that items falling into the 'unclear/cannot code' category were written by staff journalists on the sample
newspapers who were very unlikely to come from indigenous groups. If we add this figure in, we may argue that nearly 90% of indigenous items were written by non-indigenous Han Chinese.

Of the 73 items written by indigenous authors, 49 appeared in literature supplement pages, followed by columns (11), reader's letters to the editor (10), features (2) and others (1). Not a single item of general news or commentary was written by an indigenous author.

At this point, we may sum up by arguing that the problem with the mainstream Taiwanese newspapers' coverage of indigenous issues is not a lack of attention caused by neglect or indifference, nor an emphasis on negative reporting as in press portrayals of various minorities in northwestern countries. Rather, the fundamental difficulty lies with the virtual absence of indigenous staff employed, a situation confirmed by Lo's (1994) recent study.

Consequently, in this situation, it is more likely that news reporting works with assumptions and frameworks that are firmly embedded in the majority Han Chinese culture and less likely that it will mobilise perceptions or priorities current within the indigenous community. This argument is supported by the finding on 'headline actor' that although indigenous actors were more frequently 'referred to' than the Han Chinese as primary actors in headlines (73 appearances as against 37), Han Chinese were 'quoted' on more occasions (42 as against 25). In other words, they were more likely to be objects of attention than speaking subjects.

Quotation in indigenous news stories is a central question in any analysis of media coverage of minority affairs. Many researchers investigating the area have concurred in suggesting that minority people are less quoted in the news and if quoted, are less likely to be quoted as major sources and speakers. This study found that the most quoted major speakers were: 'Han Chinese government officials' (82 items, 9.3%); 'various government agencies' (76, 8.7%); 'Han Chinese scholars and intellectuals' and 'indigenous representatives' (34, 3.9% each); 'indigenous public officials' (24, 2.7%).

The data shows that Han Chinese government officials are the primary actors being quoted most often as major speakers in both the body of the texts and in the
headlines. This in turn points to an ‘authority orientation’ in the coverage of indigenous news in the mainstream press in Taiwan. It works with a top-down ethos which is more likely to attach importance and prominence to government sources than to members of indigenous groups.

However, it should also be recognised here that although Han Chinese were most often quoted as major speakers, indigenous speakers were far from voiceless (see Table 7.11). Indigenous representatives, movement leaders and intellectuals were also frequently called upon for comments; nevertheless, their voices remained marginalised within a Han Chinese-dominated news framework that privileges official and academic interpretations from Han perspectives. So it is important to note here that although there has been an increasing attention paid to indigenous affairs by the mainstream press in the new climate brought about by Taiwan’s political liberalisation and democratisation, indigenous voices, as we can see from the findings of the author, headline actor and news quotation, were still marginalised because they were not able to access and own the tools of communication, neither were they featured as prominently as Han Chinese officials and academicians as the primary definers of their own situations.

Finally, turning now to newspaper variability, the Taiwan Times emerged ahead of the other newspapers in terms of the number and size of indigenous items it carried, followed by the China Times and the United Daily News. The Independent Morning Post and the Commons carried almost equal numbers of item though the former is larger in size than the latter. The Liberty Times was second to last, while the Central Daily News (owned by the KMT) had the least coverage.

Furthermore, out of the 73 items written by indigenous authors, the TT printed the most (30) and the CT scored second, with 25 items. Together they accounted for approximately two thirds of all indigenous contributions (55 out of 73). They were followed by the C (7), UDN (6), IMP (4) and the LT (1). The KMT’s organ, the CDN published no piece by an indigenous author during the sample period. In addition, the CT, TT and IMP are the only three titles of the sample which carry more indigenous sources as major speakers in the stories than Han Chinese counterparts.
On the whole, the TT, CT and IMP treat indigenous stories more prominently and openly than the other titles. The TT and IMP are Taiwanese-owned and noted for their *locally-oriented* editorials, whereas the CT is Mainlander-owned and renowned for its liberal posture. As we know, the TT is based in the south, while the CT and IMP are based in the north of Taiwan. If we look at their 'ideological positions' in Figure 4.3 in Chapter 4, these three titles are positioned in three different quadrants (CT is in the first quadrant, TT is in the third, and the IMP is in the fourth.) Regardless of the varied political orientation in their editorials, they featured indigenous news, stories, sources, and voices more prominently and openly than the other titles.

Also, it is important to note here that the TT is the only newspaper in the sample which provides a literature supplement page open to the indigenous journals. This is an important factor to consider as the TT carried the most indigenous contributions (30 items).

Above all, this study reveals that the mainstream newspapers are widely varied in their treatment of indigenous news and stories. After carefully examining the various aspects and dimensions discussed above, we can say that at this moment the TT, CT and IMP covered indigenous affairs more fully than the others. In contrast, the title (CDN) owned by the ruling party, the KMT, had the least extensive coverage.
Chapter Eight

Representing Aboriginal Culture: A Case Study of the Mayasvi Rite

8.1 Introduction

The content analysis study reported in the last chapter found that culture and the arts news stood out as the major focus of the press attention and that stories are often accompanied by colorful news photos featuring indigenous Yuanchumin adorned with traditional clothes. Moreover, within this general thematic category, 'harvest festival and traditional rites' constituted the mainstay of coverage. But why is the mainstream press so oriented towards aboriginal cultural news and pictures? And how are aboriginal culture and tradition reproduced and constructed in the news? These are the questions that will be explored in this chapter.

In media studies, research on coverage of indigenous cultural events is a fresh ground that needs to be explored further. The case study presented in this chapter deals with mainstream press coverage of one particular aboriginal cultural event in Taiwan. It was chosen not only because it occupied a prominent position in mainstream coverage of indigenous affairs, but because it enables us to explore further the question of whether or not there is an implicit racial ideology underpinning aboriginal cultural news in the mainstream press of Taiwan. For these reasons, this chapter employs a qualitative approach—critical discourse analysis—to explore the inner mechanisms of Taiwan's mainstream press representations of aboriginal culture.

---

1 The media's coverage of indigenous cultural events such as the powwows in North America, which constitute the important part of their cultural lives, has seldom been treated as a topic in media studies.

2 For an introduction to critical discourse analysis (CDA), see Chapter 5 of this thesis.
8.2 Racist Discourse and Ideology in the Media

Before turning to the practical analysis of the case study, I would like to sketch out the theoretical framework I am using for exploring discourse and racism in the news media. Discourse, according to Fairclough (1989:17), is the social practice of producing text or talk, though he (1995: 54) also extends the term to include other types of semiotic activity, such as visual images and non-verbal communication. He argues that 'in seeing language as discourse and as social practice, one is committing oneself not just to analysing texts, nor just to analysing processes of production and interpretation, but to analysing the relationship between texts, processes and their social conditions' (1989: 26). In other words, it is necessary to analyse the situational context and the general institutional and social structures that shape discourse, as well as texts. This conception of critical language study (CLS) 'adopts many of the insights of critical linguistics but places a greater emphasis on social theory to explain and analyse the social conditions within which texts are read and acted on' (Graddol, 1994: 223).

Discourse, as a site or force field of struggle dialectically related to social structures, is always shifting and frequently subject to contradictions. Louw (1994) commenting on shifting patterns of political discourse due to the altered balance of power within the new South Africa in the 1990s, argues that the African National Congress has effectively moved from non-racialism to a black (African) national discourse, while the National Party has shifted from Afrikaner nationalism to a form of non-racialism. So in this case, discourse is an articulation of power struggles constitutive of and determined by social and political relations.

Potter and Wetherell (1988: 60) assert that there is 'the pervasive presence of contradictions within people's discourse,' and suggest that a close examination of racist discourse often reveals the flexible and inconsistent nature of representation. In

---

3 Fairclough (1989:17) notes: 'Discourse has effects upon social structures, as well as being determined by them, and so contributes to social continuity and social change.'

4 According to Louw, non-racialism should not be confused with multi-racialism. The former ignores race as a social-organizing principle, whereas the latter incorporates race and ethnicity into its vision of social organisation (see Louw, 1994: 28).
mapping the language of the white Pakeha population in New Zealand, Wetherell and Potter (1992: 70) define racist discourse as having 'the effect of categorising, allocating and discriminating between certain groups, and, in the context of New Zealand, it is a discourse which justifies, sustains and legitimates those practices which maintain the power and dominance of Pakeha New Zealanders.' However, they (Ibid.: 139) stress that discourse is not inherently ideological. Rather it is ideological in argument, debate and application. They argue that Pakeha discourse is ideological when it attempts to justify, incorporate and 'normalise' the official history and current position of the Maori people. Introducing the 'interpretative repertoires' used to sustain different social practices, they distinguish two distinct constructions of culture in the Pakeha's discourse about Maori people: heritage and therapy.\(^5\)

They argue strongly that the conflicts and dilemmas characteristic of modern racism should be located within argumentative and rhetorical resources (Ibid.: 197). Billig (1992) expands on the debate between traditional social psychologists and discourse theorists on modern racism in this way:

The theory of 'modern racism' suggests that the ways that many majority members talk about race is hedged with ambivalence....In order to explore further these ambivalences, or ideological dilemmas, there is a case for examining directly what people say, rather than relying upon their responses to preformed attitude questionnaires. This is a strategy of research particularly recommended by discourse and rhetorical theorists (p. 40).

Racism, for discourse theorists then, is a product of argument, fluid and dilemmatic in nature. I will not elaborate on the perspective on racism propounded by discourse theorists further. However, it is important to note that in recent decades the terms of general debates on race have shifted from biological categories to questions of cultural difference, as rightly pointed out by Wetherell and Potter. Pieterse (1992:14), for example, argues that: 'Racism is no longer a satisfactory term to understand the changing realities. Culture as a new basis for differentiation is much more diffuse in its

ideological claims than race theory, but is in some ways equally effective in establishing boundaries and demarcations.

Van Dijk (1991: 26-29) explores the construction of this variance of racism in his major work Racism and the Press. He notes:

Immigrants of non-western origin, or peoples of Third World countries generally, are not only or primarily categorised and (negatively) evaluated in terms of bodily appearance (whether or not conceptualised as different 'race'), but also on the basis of cultural, that is 'ethnic' characteristics. Throughout western history, such social representations have been used to distinguish in- and out-groups according to a variable mixture of perceived differences of language, religion, dress or customs, until today often associated with different origin or bodily appearance.... We see that this 'ethnic' positioning of self and others may underlie the same hierarchisation as that based on 'race', which may in turn give rise to and legitimate a system of ethnic dominance or exclusion, that is, ethnicism. While seen as morally less reprehensible, the emphasis on culture and cultural differences has become the modern variant of racial differentiations of earlier western ideologies. Hence, racism is being transformed into ethnicism (p. 26).

'Contemporary racism', in Van Dijk's view, is more sophisticated and subtle compared with traditional racism. He interprets it in this way:

It has been repeatedly observed, for instance, that the more overt and blatant forms of legal and social structures and everyday practices that define ethnic or racial discrimination are slowly being replaced by more implicit, indirect, subtle, or otherwise less open, though not necessarily less effective or insidious, forms of dominance and inequality, variously called 'new', 'modern', or 'symbolic' racism. We have seen that one aspect of this change is the apparent displacement of racism by ethnicism, through an ideological substitution of the relevance of 'race' by that of the rich set of sociocultural factors (Ibid.: 28).

Van Dijk is not alone in suggesting 'contemporary' or 'modern' racism as a new framework for understanding media coverage of racial minorities in northwestern Europe and the United States [see e.g., Robert Entman (1990, 1994) and Jack Lule (1995)]. Indeed, explanations of modern racism in media reporting have gained increasing currency in recent years.

At the same time, the concept of ideology remains of central importance for understanding the media's dynamic power relations with culturally-distinct and socially-disadvantaged minorities. As Hall (1995: 20) argues: 'In modern societies, the
different media are especially important sites for the production, reproduction and transformation of ideologies. The media are not only a powerful source of ideas about race. They are also one place where these ideas are articulated, worked on, transformed and elaborated.

There has been an increasing consensus in the media studies that in the process of ‘making news’, media institutions construct reality in a manner congruent with their underlying ideological and political functions (Fang, 1994: 463-464). In his earlier discourse analytic research on press reports about immigrant minorities in UK and Netherlands, Van Dijk (1991: 208) argues that the media, as major institutions of symbolic reproduction owned by elites, have symbolic power over definitions of the ethnic situation. In ‘Mediating Racism: The Role of the Media in the Reproduction of Racism,’ he further observes:

The media not only express, reflect or disseminate ethnic opinions, but actively mediate them, both among the various power elites themselves, as well as between the elites and the public. They autonomously (re)interpret, (re)construct and (re)present them, and therefore contribute themselves to their production, and hence to the construction of the ethnic consensus that underlies the racist ideologies and practices of our society (Van Dijk, 1989: 211).

Given the role of the media in the reproduction of racism, we are left with two questions: what forms does racist ideology take in the media and how do they work to sustain and legitimate ethnic dominance. In ‘The Whites of Their Eyes: Racist Ideologies and the Media,’ Hall (1995: 19) argues that racism is one of the most profoundly ‘naturalised’ of existing ideologies. According to him, the historical base-images in the ‘grammar of race’, such as the ‘slave-figure’, the ‘native’, the ‘clown’ or the ‘entertainer’ continue to reappear on the television screen, especially in the form of ‘old movies’, thereby replenishing their popular resonances.

In parallel to Hall’s argument about the naturalised character of racist ideology, Kellner (1995:7) asserts that ‘Ideologies of race use racist representations of people of color and various minority groups. Ideologies make inequalities and subordination appear natural and just and thus induce consent to relations of domination.’ Conducting a critical discourse analysis of news on Africa in the British press, Brookes
(1995: 487-488) found that the discourse on Africa is both highly uniform and completely naturalised. This adds credence to Hall’s claim that ‘discourses are more uniform than they would appear to be and that there is not the wide range of views that the media and society would have us believe, but views contained within narrow ideological parameters’ (Hall et. al, 1978).

To summarise, although vernacular racist discourses are fluid, contradictory and dilemmatic; paradoxically, popular expressions of racist ideology in the main media have been found to be both natural and relatively uniformly reproduced and reworked.

At this point we can turn to the discussion of how racist ideologies work in news discourses. Fairclough (1995: 44-45) argues that representations in media texts may be said to function ideologically in so far as they contribute to reproducing social relations of domination and exploitation. As we can see from the discussion above, this view is shared by a number of critical writers.

Many scholars argue that the study of media language is crucial to understanding the representations the media construct as well as the power and ideology embedded in discourse. (Bell, 1991: 7; Fairclough, 1989:17; Jackson, 1989:133; Kress, 1985:29-30; Hodge & Kress, 1993:6; Muecke, 1992: 32-33; Thompson, 1984:131).

Kress (1985: 29-30) argues that because ideologies find their clearest articulations in language, examining language offers a powerful way of examining ideological structure. The connection between language and ideology exists at both the lexical level and at the grammatical-syntactic level. He and his associates hold that transformations of the text, such as nominalisation, passivisation and the transactive and nontransactive clause of a sentence, are not a matter of chance but an ideological expression.

Fairclough (1989:12), who sees ‘ideology as a mechanism of power’ and ‘language as a major locus of ideology’, notes that: ‘Language is centrally involved in power, and struggles for power, and that it is so involved through its ideological properties’ (Ibid.: 17). Drawing insights from this general view, he provides a new perspective on media discourse analysis:
particular sort is capable of making such a contribution. A rather arid, formalist analysis of language, in abstraction from social context, still tends to dominate many departments of linguistics. That sort of approach cannot be the basis for effective interdisciplinary work on the media... We need to analyse media language as discourse, and the linguistic analysis of media should be part of the discourse analysis of media... But discourse analysis is concerned with practices as well as texts, and with both discourse practices and sociocultural practices (Fairclough, 1995: 16).

Critical discourse analysis (CDA), in his view, must analyse three dimensions—text, discourse practice, and sociocultural practice. 6

John Thompson in Studies in the Theory of Ideology (1984: 131) also argues that 'the analysis of ideology is fundamentally concerned with language, for language is the principal medium of the meaning' (emphasis original). Defining ideology as 'meaning in the service of power,' he observes:

Ideology must be conceptualised within the framework of a general social theory, one which explores the relation between action and structure and gives a central role to the concept of power. To study ideology, within such a framework, is to study the ways in which meaning (signification) serves to sustain relations of domination' (Ibid.: 146).

To this end, he proposes a 'depth-interpretative' approach which combines social analysis, discursive analysis and interpretation. 7 He argues that an inquiry into the interrelation of meaning and power may be seen as a form of 'depth hermeneutics', which is mediated firstly by the discursive analysis of linguistic constructions and secondly by social analysis of the conditions of discursive production. He holds that 'the depth interpretation of ideology issues in a projection of meaning that unfolds the

---

6 See Fairclough, 1995, Chapter 1 & 4.

7 Thompson argues that the social analysis dimension can be further broken down into action, institution, and structure categories, and that discursive analysis should include narratives (stories), argumentative structures and syntactic structures. As for the interpretation dimension, he explains: 'Interpretative explication always goes beyond the methods of formal analysis, projecting a possible meaning which is always risky and open to dispute.... Reconnecting discourse to the relations of domination which it serves to sustain: such is the task of interpretation' (1984: 137-138). For the discussion of Thompson's 'depth-interpretative' approach, see Ibid.: 133-147.
referential dimension of discourse and connects it with the relations of domination which meaning serves to sustain. As such, the study of ideology bears a close connection to the critique of domination' (Ibid.: 146).

The discussion above suggests not only a new perspective for exploring contemporary media racism, but offers valuable clues for conducting a critical qualitative analysis of media texts. Though to some degree, a flexible and synthetic selection from the analytical approaches of these theorists is needed if we are to develop a comprehensive approach in future, in this chapter, I will mainly draw upon the methods of analysis propounded by Teun A. Van Dijk and Norman Fairclough together with insights offered by recent postcolonial and postmodern studies.

8.3 Aboriginal Culture and Mayasvi Rite: A Background

8.3.1 The Rising Importance of Aboriginal Culture

In the concluding remarks to the content analysis chapter, I noted that along with the democratisation and Taiwanisation programmes in the late 1980s, there has been an upsurge of interest in local Taiwanese culture that broke the reins of the 40 years’ suppression (from 1945 to the mid 1980s) of Mainlander Chinese cultural and ideological domination imposed by the nationalist government of Chiang Kai-shek. In the newly democratic society of Taiwan in the 1990s, one of the most important debates that is going on is how to properly (re-)define and separate Taiwanese identity from Chinese identity. Nowadays, a broad (re)definition of Taiwanese identity that can sufficiently encompass the ‘four major ethnic groups’—the Mainlander, Taiwanese, Hakka and Yuanchumin (see Table 3.1)—is being nurtured. It aims to reduce ethnic tensions and conflicts, particularly those between the Taiwanese and the Mainlander groups. At the same time, multiculturalism is also being mobilised as a keystone of the Taiwan’s contemporary cultural policy with a view to accommodating and appreciating the cultural diversity and heterogeneity of the different ethnic groups. The shift of the political power from the Mainlander to the Taiwanese has opened up a
space for the development of local Taiwanese (Fukienese and Hakka) cultures, arts, language, and history, including those of the Yuanchumin.

Meanwhile, in the new ethnic and cultural politics of Taiwan, the indigenous struggles for the aboriginal rights of self-determination and for the government’s recognition of ‘Yuanchumin’ as a pan-aboriginal identity have also gathered momentum. Ten years of aboriginal movements and pressures from indigenous representatives and intellectuals have exerted considerable influences on the government and the KMT to reformulate aboriginal policy not only in the political but in the cultural domains. The past five decades of aboriginal policies emphasising modernisation and assimilation, indeed, have seen remarkable absolute improvements in many aspects of aboriginal lives compared with before, but relative deprivation and underdevelopment among indigenous Yuanchumin compared with the Han Chinese are still very marked (see Chapter 3).

Also, in the course of Taiwan’s economic development, industrialisation and urbanisation since the 1960s, many young aboriginal peoples have left their impoverished mountain communities to seek better opportunities in the cities, becoming incorporated into the mainstream labor market. Roughly speaking, more than one quarter of all aborigines have left their hometowns, settled down in the cities and become ‘urban Yuanchumin’. Today, the majority of them are suffering from maladjustments to urban life, that include the problems of unemployment, housing, working insurance, poor children’s education, alcoholism, suicide and prostitution. The exodus of the youngest and most able members of tribal communities has not only weakened the agriculture and economy of their hometowns but undermined their cultural and social fabric.

The consequent loss of aboriginal cultures, arts, languages, traditions and value systems are now seen as problems that necessitate solutions from the government and the wider society. Therefore, in recent years, programmes for preserving aboriginal cultures have received added attention and effort by the government. It is against this

---

8 See Chapter 3 of this thesis.

background that a marked cultural revival among Taiwan Yuanchumin has emerged. Many aboriginal organisations devoted to cultural preservation and dancing troupes have emerged, and many young aboriginal intellectuals have written and made tape and video recordings of oral cultures and tribal histories on their own. At the same time, more funds and subsidies, mainly from government, have become available for the promotion of native cultures. Therefore, I argued that indigenous culture has now entered a renaissance period. 10

As aboriginal cultural preservation has become a task of government, and state funds for cultural activities have become more available, viable conditions for a marked increase in aboriginal cultural events have been created. Indeed, the dramatic increase in aboriginal cultural events and activities, particularly harvest festivals and traditional rites, has been a notable feature of the cultural revival during this period. Because hundreds of aboriginal participants are often involved, considerations of cost would render them impossible if there was no financial help from government. Consequently, one of the main tasks of government with regard to aboriginal affairs is to subsidise and co-sponsor aboriginal cultural events and activities. To this end, certain part of the 'cultural construction' budget is earmarked for the purpose of promoting the cultural events. For example, the 1995 budget of the 'Council for Cultural Planning and Development', the main agency in charge of cultural affairs in the central government, appropriated 14.5 million New Taiwan dollars for aboriginal cultural construction purpose, of which 17.43 % (2.5 million) was earmarked for subsidising harvest festivals and traditional rites.

As the organising committees for aboriginal cultural events and traditional rites always suffer from a shortage of revenues due to limits on their own resources, it is often the case that they have to rely upon the county, provincial and central governments to subsidise operational and personnel costs.

---

10 This argument is based upon my personal experience of handling funds for various indigenous cultural organisations in the Aboriginal Administration Section, Ministry of Interior in Taiwan (1988 -1993).
As mentioned in Chapter 3, because the nine aboriginal tribes are culturally distinct and geographically spread out, cultural festivals and rites are held almost island-wide. Many of these events are held in the aboriginal townships and dwelling places on the east coast of Taiwan, but many also take place in metropolitan cities, like Taipei and Kaohsiung, where an increasing number of urban aborigines now live due to migration since the 1960s when Taiwan’s economic development took off.

Table 8.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>NT dollars (thousands)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Subsidising the ‘Taiwan Aboriginal Culture Park’</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Promoting aboriginal cultural festivals and activities</td>
<td>2,533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Preserving aboriginal culture and art</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Holding urban aboriginal conferences</td>
<td>2,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>14,533</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note:
1. The ‘Taiwan Aboriginal Culture Park’ is operated by the Taiwan Provincial Government (TPG).
2. The fact that the budget accounted for only 0.69% of its overall fiscal budgets in 1995 has aroused criticism from an aboriginal legislator (see Hua, 1994: 68).

Apart from self-initiated aboriginal cultural festivals, aboriginal traditional song and dance contests and performances have also been organised by the government, in the hope of strengthening the ‘native’ identities of indigenous peoples. Most of these festivals, contests and performances, whether community-organised or government-organised, are non-profitmaking in character, free and open to the public. At the same

---

11 The Ami and Puyuma tribes have traditionally dwelled in the east coast valley of Taiwan, especially in Hualien and Taitung counties.
time, many other aboriginal song and dance performances are presented in tourist sites and cultural villages. There are two famous aboriginal cultural villages in Taiwan; one is the ‘Taiwan Aboriginal Culture Park’ in southern Taiwan operated by the TPG, and the other is the privately operated ‘Formosan Aboriginal Culture Village’ in central Taiwan. The former was established partly for the purpose of preserving aboriginal cultures, artifacts and architecture and partly for tourism. The latter is entirely private and profit-making, offering a few Disneyland-type attractions as well as a European-style formal garden. Figure 8.1 presents views of these two cultural parks and villages.

8.3.2 The Meaning of Aboriginal Culture in ‘Postmodern’ Taiwanese Society: A Critique

As the traditional social and cultural systems of indigenous peoples are currently in a rapid decline for the reasons mentioned above, many aboriginal leaders and young members of the indigenous elites feel an urgent need to revive their own tribal languages and traditional cultures. According to research conducted by the Academia Sinica, 68% of Yuanchumin held the opinion that aboriginal cultures should be preserved, but this figure reached 90% in 1991 (Hua, 1994: 69). This result reveals that indigenous peoples wish to recognise and celebrate their own cultures. At the same time, it also confirmed the fact that aboriginal cultures are fast disappearing.

In (post)modern Taiwanese society, the aboriginal cultural revival is significant as a powerful indication of the cultural difference between the non-Han Austronesian cultures of Yuanchumin and the cultures of Han Mainlander and Taiwanese with their

12 The preservation of aboriginal languages has long been regarded as the major task in preserving aboriginal cultures today. Partly because of the government’s language policy and the biased educational system which have only promoted Mandarin, the nationally spoken language, a great number of aboriginal younger generation don’t know how to speak their own tribal languages today. However, since the democratisation process in the late 1980s, a bi-lingual system was introduced mainly in the primary schools of aboriginal communities, where both Mandarin and tribal language are taught. However, in this system, Mandarin is still the major spoken language, while the tribal language is taught during extra-curricular class periods.
Formosan Aboriginal Culture Village, which integrates the 'traditional' (see the picture on the top) with the 'modern'.

Taiwan Aboriginal Culture Park
Chapter 8

A Case Study of the Mayasvi Rite

origins on the mainland of China. At the same time, by celebrating cultural difference, the collective identity of Yuanchumin is separated from the hegemonic Chinese (or Taiwanese) conception, and their 'master status' in Taiwan's early history is further recalled. This involves a subtle and complicated ethnic and cultural politics of aboriginal culture in relation to Chinese culture, which is beyond the scope of this thesis.

I want to argue here that in view of all the problems of indigenous Yuanchumin today, the celebration of aboriginal cultures is important because it serves both as an affirmative symbol of indigenous cultural identities and as an effective tool for their cultural cohesion. Of all aboriginal cultural events, harvest festivals and traditional rites are the most conspicuous and eye-catching, because they are living cultures, involving songs and dances as well as the large-scale participation by tribal peoples from different aboriginal villages and communities. Some festivals and rites modest in scale are held locally in villages, but some are massive and involve thousands of tribe people, e.g., the annual harvest festival of the Ami tribe in Hualien and Taitung counties in eastern Taiwan.

There are a great variety of festivals and rites among indigenous tribes, and each tribe is noted for particular rituals. The Ami tribe is noted for its 'harvest' rite. The Saisiyat tribe is famous for its 'Pastaa' rite (or 'Ai-ling' rite, which means the 'Ceremony of Dwarfs'). The 'Flying fish' rite of the Yami tribe is also well-known as is the 'Mayasvi' rite of the Tsou tribe. These aboriginal rites are frequently covered by the media. Some are organised by the government for political purposes, but many are initiated by indigenous communities at the grass-roots level for cultural and social purposes. Apart from the government-organised rites, the date for holding community-organised rites varies considerably in different tribes and is often decided by the leaders of the tribe. For example, the Ami harvest festivals are mostly held during August and September after the harvest season of the rice, millet and corn. But other tribes have their own traditional rules for deciding a date for holding their cultural activities.

Doyou (1995: 53-54) (from the Atayal tribe), argues that the purpose of aboriginal rites is to strengthen the younger generation's knowledge of and identification with their own tribal cultures. The events celebrate a culture rooted in
ordinary lives, thus there are rites for harvest, marriage, weaving and hunting. She argues that through theatrical forms of song and dance, and through tribe-wide participation, the culture can be passed on to the younger generation and thus cultural inheritance can be achieved.

Sun Ta-chuan, a well-known aboriginal scholar (from the Puyuma tribe), is more pessimistic about the aboriginal culture today however, saying: 'Every time an old indigenous person passes away, a piece of tribal history dies.'\textsuperscript{13} He argued that bringing back the rituals is one way of keeping the younger generation informed about their culture and traditions. He said: 'It is also a way of accompanying the elderly on their last walk in life.'\textsuperscript{14}

I would like to stress here the social meaning of the aboriginal rites in addition to their cultural meaning. As these festivals and rites are held everywhere, in the cities for the urban Yuanchumin and in the mountains and east coast valley for the mountain and plains Yuanchumin, their social roles have become increasingly important, particularly against a background where a strong sense of relative deprivation (in social and economic terms) among indigenous peoples lingers on. Generally speaking, they are not only a social occasion for Yuanchumin to entertain each other and celebrate their own cultures and traditions, they can also serve as an emotional outlet for those who are deprived and depressed, particularly for urban Yuanchumin. Therefore, in terms of their social meanings, they have contributed significantly to the consolidation of cultural identities, pride and belonging among the urban, mountain and plains Yuanchumin.

Although aboriginal rites are potent symbols of cultural heritage, unity and belonging, they are also a very effective medium through which Han Chinese government officials can propagandise the achievements of aboriginal policy and indigenous politicians can solicit votes for elections. Even indigenous community-operated, traditional rites are often no exception to this political purpose. On the one hand, as mentioned above, holding these ritual activities often involves enormous cost

\textsuperscript{13} Free China Review (1992), vol. 42, no. 6. p. 27.

\textsuperscript{14} Ibid.
which cannot be born solely by the organisers, this has paved the way for the state's intervention as subsidiser. On the other hand, as these events are mostly large in scale, attended by hundreds or even thousands of tribal members, they are perfect occasions for the political purposes mentioned above. Also, through the dissemination of news reports, the interests of the politicians are further served by having their names reported on newspapers or on screen.

In addition to the political intervention by the state in the aboriginal ritual activities, the other intervention, which compromises their original cultural meanings, is commercial perpetrated by tourism. As I argued above, except for profit-making performances designed for tourists, virtually all aboriginal cultural events and activities, be they government-organised or community-operated, in the mountains, plains, or cities, are free and open to the public. As these harvest rites and festivals feature aboriginal peoples performing lively songs and dances in their traditional attire, they have become increasingly popular with the exotica-hungry Han audience. This fact necessitates a brief discussion of the postmodern consumption of cultural difference in Taiwan.

Jordan and Weedon (1995a: 149) suggest that two key characteristics of 'postmodern' society are the celebration of difference and the cultural commodification of (racial) Otherness. They argue that postmodernism celebrates plurality, heterogeneity, difference and encourages the consumer to shop for (cultural and racial) difference. So today's Descartes, they argue, declare: I consume. Therefore, I am (Ibid.: 150). Their arguments in 'The Celebration of Difference and the Cultural Politics of Racism' can be outlined in this way:

1. that fascination with the racialised and primitive Others is a long-established feature of Western culture and art.
2. that 'shopping' for racial and cultural difference, whether in the form of style, music or sexual partners, suggests that such differences have become commodified, thus the term 'shopping for difference'.
3. that difference is an effect of power. Consequently, the material interests and structures of power that produce cultural meanings and values need to be
uncovered, otherwise, existing material relations of exclusion, oppression and even brutality will remain unchallenged (See Jordan and Weedon, 1995; 1995a).

Shopping for and consuming the difference of aboriginal cultures has long been one of the main pastimes of the Han and Japanese tourists in Taiwan. Before the two cultural villages (mentioned above) were established about a decade ago, the internationally-renowned scenic spots where the tourists can consume aboriginal cultures were:

1. The Wulai village, a hot spring resort just outside of Taipei, featuring mainly the Atayal culture, song and dance performance.
2. The ‘Ami Culture Village’ in the Hualien county on the island’s east coast, featuring mainly the Ami culture and performance.
3. The Sun Moon Lake scenic spot in central Taiwan, featuring mainly the Tsou tribe culture and performance.

In his article entitled ‘Preservation or Perversion,’ Wieman (1992: 75) has argued that Taiwan’s native tribes are being tapped as a rich tourism resource and that tourism can do much to help preserve native culture and keep it alive, although the danger of tourism to the culture is undeniable. He argues that in some of the aboriginal performances for tourists, tribal dances and songs are adulterated by combining features of different tribes together and adding modern (even Western and Japanese) songs to programmes. A particularly striking instance of ‘cultural perversion’, he cites,

15 Although the Japanese left Taiwan in 1945, their legacy still persists. Most of the older-generation Taiwanese, including Yuanchmin, can speak Japanese fluently. As many of this generation (perhaps above 65 years of age) may speak better Japanese than Mandarin, they are emotionally nostalgic for the Japanese culture rather than the Chinese. As Japanese visitors accounted for the largest number of foreign tourists to Taiwan in 1988, 47.11 percent of the total (911,599 persons), followed by Hongkong, 11.54% and the US, 11.19%, aboriginal cultures, song and dance performances are often very attractive to Japanese tourists and target them as major consumers. (The figures for tourism are cited from Government Information Office, 1990: 85).
is that a videotape of a Taiwan ‘aboriginal cultural show’ performed in Japan showed the female dancers wearing hardly any costume at all, and the rhythms of the songs had been changed to fit Japanese preferences.

As argued above, multiculturalism is being actually developed within cultural policy and education in contemporary Taiwan. This, coupled with the fact that the spending power of the general public has greatly increased, has not only altered popular conceptions of non-Han aboriginal cultures but changed patterns of cultural consumption. In view of many news reports carrying information about tourists swarming to the well-known ritual activities mentioned above, nowadays, many Han tourists have become interested in attending the traditional rites held in aboriginal hometowns in order to consume more authentic and exotic exemplars of aboriginal culture than those scheduled in tourist sites.

The continual influx of an increased number of tourists and their lack of respect for the traditional rites when shopping and viewing cultural difference has touched off severe criticisms, particularly from highly-educated aboriginal youths. Commenting on one harvest festival rite, Doyou, for example, has complained that:

The participants came from everywhere. They were tribal folks, higher government officers, cultural workers, media workers, curious tourists and various vendors. Everytime when a host of song and dance performances and weight lifting competitions was going on, our views were always filled with photographers coming one after another. These photographer friends scrambled to focus their camera on those who wore traditional clothes, particularly those old folks or those with very indigenous looks. At the moment when the photographers pressed the button, he was already engaging a cultural invasion. Thus the portrayal and picture of Yuanchumin were established by the subjective identification of these photographers. So the tribal folks who wore traditional clothes were repeatedly consumed under the magnesium light. In this process, aboriginal culture was being interpreted by those who held the camera (1995: 53).

The crucial question, she argued, is whether the aboriginal rite should open to tourists or not. But this is a dilemma. Thus, the question of how best to allow traditional culture and modern tourism to coexist with each other has become a

---

16 Taiwan enjoyed a per capita income GNP of US $10,215 in 1992. This figure rose to about US $13,000 in 1996 (also see note 7 in Chapter 3 of this thesis).
substantial challenge now to the Yuanchumin. She suggests that it might be necessary
to limit the number of tourists, and that they should follow certain tribal rules
whenever necessary. Also, she claims that the overdependence on government’s
subsidy undermines the ‘subjectivity’ of these cultural festivals, and that consequently,
tribal folks should insist on commanding the meanings of ritual activities lest they
become victims of tourism.

The aboriginal journal, *Indigenous Post*, carried a report about aboriginal
grievances in relation to ritual activities in its issue in 1992. It wrote that aboriginal
youths were strongly dissatisfied with the ‘tourism orientation’ of the Saisiyat tribe’s
‘Pastai’ rite. The second paragraph of this report read:

The Ai-ling rite which is called ‘Pastai’ in the Saisiyat language was held every two
years. The organiser is planning to hold a talent competition unrelated to this rite in
order to attract more tourists. This has provoked anger and dissatisfaction among the
young folks. These youths believed that this rite is solemn and dignified, so there should
be no disturbance from the tourists. Now the organiser is playing a gimmick to attract a
host of tourists who don’t know and respect minority peoples’ cultures. There is no
worse sacrilege than this.

The reporter interviewed from the *Indigenous Morning Post* (No. 29/F/29/HC),
was present at the 1992 ‘Pastai’ rite. She complained about the tourists who were
taking pictures and argued that perhaps shopping for aboriginal culture has become a
newly-emergent consumption pattern in Taiwan. She said:

Perhaps some market strategies are being operated to encourage the Han people to
consume the particularity of Yuanchumin. It has become a newly-emergent consumption
pattern. But I doubt their sincerity and concern. Maybe they just want to consume
Yuanchumin’s culture.

Graburn (1993: 6-7) has noted that: ‘the cultural and political struggles of native
peoples often involve a reification or reinvention of ethnic markers, differing from
group to group but usually related to visual symbols and the arts, as well as ceremonies
and other forms of cultural expression.’ In the ‘postmodern’ age, the fact that
aboriginal art and culture are continuously being shopped for and commodified reflects
the hard reality of cultural colonisation perpetrated by the interlocking interests of the state, tourism and consumerism. Indigenous arts and cultures, which have long been incorporated into the market economy and mass consumption, are a fashionable pastime, particularly so in a society shaped by multiculturalism. The political and commercial interventions mentioned above are major challenges facing Yuanchumin who are now more than ever eager to hold on to their own cultures in the 'postmodern' society of today's Taiwan. Both interventions are dilemmatic because they may bring both fortune and harm to aboriginal rites at the same time. Having sketched this general background to contemporary aboriginal culture in Taiwan, it is now time to turn to the case of the Mayasvi rite.

8.3.3 The Tsou Tribe and the Dispute over the Mayasvi Rite

As I noted in Chapter 3, Taiwan's Yuanchumin are composed of nine major tribes, distinct in their languages, cultures, customs and habits, and strikingly different in their songs, dances, traditions and ceremonies. The particular event chosen for this case study is the Mayasvi rite of the Tsou tribe. Apart from offering a good opportunity to explore in more detail how aboriginal cultural news is represented and constructed in the mainstream newspapers, the reason for choosing this rite is three-fold. First, it is one of the most well-known among the aboriginal ritual activities. Second, because it took place just a few days before I completed my fieldwork, it was the most contemporary instance I could find. Third, because I had advanced notice of its staging, I could collect the original (not photocopied) newspaper stories.

The Tsou tribe had a population of 6,192, accounting for 1.79% of the total aboriginal population, which is slightly more than the Yami (1.16%) or Saisiyat (1.14%) tribes (see Table 3.2). The Tsou tribe people are mainly spread across the western slopes of Mt. Alishan in central Taiwan, which is adjacent to the Jade Mountain, the highest peak of the island. They mainly live in the Alishan aboriginal township in Chiayi county, which is one of the 30 aboriginal townships on the island.
Some other groups of the Tsou tribe live in other counties, such as the Nantou and Kaohsiung counties in central and southern Taiwan. Under the current aboriginal policy of Taiwan, the tribe is considered one of the ‘mountain Yuanchumin’ group. As with other mountain tribes, the Tsou people, particularly the older generation, live mainly by farming (tea, millet, potato) and hunting. As Mt. Alishan is one of the most famous scenic spots in Taiwan, tourism is also well-established in Alishan, and many tribe people work in restaurants, hotels and souvenir shops. Others work in the school, township office, police station, and medical centre. In addition, quite a few numbers of the tribe have migrated to the cities, either for better education or for better employment.

The Mayasvi rite is the largest ritual activity of the tribe, traditionally held before or after battles against enemies, or following the millet-harvest festival in peaceful times. Now the elders of the tribe have decided that it be held alternately in the Tapang and Tefuyeh villages on August 15th and February 15th respectively. These two villages were chosen as the traditional sites for the rite because they have Kupa, the sacred house for men’s meetings from which women are excluded. According to their traditions, the Mayasvi was held in the square in front of the Kupa. The proceedings of this rite comprises five stages:

1. Welcoming god ritual
2. Solidarity ritual
3. Sending off God ritual
4. Road ritual

The Mayasvi is administered by the chiefs and elders of the tribe and attended by males only. Women are not allowed to participate until at the end of the ritual event (Ibid.). In most cases, aboriginal cultural events are organised by an ad hoc organising committee, the members of which include the leaders and elders of the tribe. In the case of the Mayasvi rite analysed here, the organisers were the ad hoc Alishan Mayasvi Organising Committee. It had its own operating fund but this fund was, as always,
insufficient, so it had to seek for financial help from the government and the local private sector to cover the operating cost. According to Shih Hsin-chung, the head of the Alishan Aboriginal Township Office and a member of the organising committee, the total cost of holding the 1995 Mayasvi rite was over two millions NT (New Taiwan) dollars. He said apart from the committee’s own funds, the bulk of this expenditure was subsidised by local enterprises and various central and provincial government agencies, including the Chiayi County Government ($100,000 NT dollars), Chiayi County Council ($250,000NT), Alishan Aboriginal Township Office ($100,000NT), the Ministry of Education, Ministry of Interior and the Council for Cultural Planning and Development. Apart from the general outlay required by the activity itself, a small portion of this fund was used in refurbishing the Kupa and maintaining the surrounding facilities, such as the railing and the stand for spectators. 17

Shih argued that the Mayasvi rite, as with the other aboriginal cultural events, has been always open to the public and that it has never prohibited the tourists until 1995. The reason for not welcoming tourists in that year was due to concern that a possible ‘flood’ of visitors might disturb the due process of the cultural activity. In an attempt to limit the number of tourists they introduced a highly controversial admission ticket system, charging all visiting members of the audience 500NT (approximately 11 pounds) per person. This admission charge was the first and only one in the history of the Tsou Mayasvi rite and perhaps unprecedented in aboriginal cultural events which are non profit-making. 18

Wang Nien-hsing, the county councilman representing the Tsou tribe in Alishan township, was adamant in holding the view that this rite should not be open to the public for the sake of maintaining the sacred meaning of the Mayasvi rite and passing it

17 Shih’s post as the head of the Alishan Township Office was won by election, so he is the administrative leader of that township.

18 According to the international edition of the Central Daily News of Feb. 13th, 1997, the 1997 Mayasvi rite which was held at Tefuyeh village on February 15th did not charge tourists for admission, although the organising committee still warned that the rite was not open to the public mainly because that the mountain road to Alishan was destroyed by a typhoon earlier that year and was not yet recovered.
on to the tribe's youth. However, because the date for the Mayasvi rite, February 15th, was close to the New Year's festival in the Chinese lunar calendar, the flow of the tourists visiting the Alishan scenic resort and the Mayasvi rite simply could not be controlled. It was therefore against this background that the elders of the Organising Committee decided to open it to the public but imposed the unprecedented admission charge for visitors, except for noble guests, Han government officials, indigenous representatives and other invited guests.\textsuperscript{19}

Therefore, we can see that the nature of the Mayasvi rite was ambiguous in many respects. According to Tsou's tradition, it has been always open to the public and tourists, but in 1995 it broke with tradition in implementing an admission charge which, we will see later, touched off severe criticisms from both journalists and the tourists. Although this measure was originally designed to reduce the number of visiting tourists, it had the effect of opening up the Mayasvi rite and transforming it from a purely traditional activity into a profit-making one. The introduction of the admission ticket system therefore had the uninvited consequence of colluding with the market economy and with the consumerist ethos of modern tourism. In my view, this ambiguity surrounding the 1995 Mayasvi rite set in motion two news discourses: the 'traditional culture discourse', and the 'modern consumption discourse'. Here I will define the former as those news discourses that highlight the setting and atmosphere of the rite itself or its meaning to the Tsou tribe as an important part of their cultural heritage, and the latter as those which foreground the tourist gaze or the commodification of the event. Table 8.2 contrasts these two discourses.

\textsuperscript{19} Wang, in his 30s, is a young aboriginal representative reflecting the Tsou tribe concerns in the Chiayi County Council.
Table 8.2

Two Major Discourses in the Mayasvi Rite News

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>News Discourses</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Culture Discourse</td>
<td>1. Highlight the dignified setting and atmosphere of the Mayasvi rite.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Emphasise the meaning of the rite to the indigenous Tsou tribe.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Cultural heritage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Consumption Discourse</td>
<td>1. Tourist Gaze.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Commodification of aboriginal culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Performance and entertainment as a cultural commodity.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8.4 Critical Discourse Analysis of the Mayasvi Rite

8.4.1 The Corpus

In this case study, I will examine mainstream Taiwanese newspapers' coverage of the rite. The corpus of the data consists of one-week reports by the seven sample newspapers, spanning the three days before and after the event, which was held on February 15th, 1995. The case period therefore ranges from February 12th to 18th, 1995. The local issues of the seven sample newspapers distributed in Chiayi Hsien (county) were collected for this study. Table 8.3 shows the total number of news stories and photos devoted to the Mayasvi event during this week.

As Table 8.3 shows, 16 news items and 10 photos about the Mayasvi cultural event were carried by the sample between Feb. 12th and 18th. The Liberty Times had the most coverage, with four news and three photos (4N3P); followed by the Taiwan Times (3N2P) and the China Times (2N2P). The United Daily News, the Central Daily
News and the Commons each had two news items and one photo. The Independent Morning Post covered only one news item. Most of the coverage was concentrated on Feb. 16, the day after the event. The fact that every sample newspapers carried at least one news item about this event lends strong support to the general finding on the popularity of aboriginal cultural news found in the content analysis study.

Table 8.3
Distribution of Mayasvi News Stories and Photos by the Sample Newspapers
(Feb. 12th-18th, 1995)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China Times</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1N 1P</td>
<td>1N 1P</td>
<td>2N 2P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Daily News</td>
<td>1N</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1N</td>
<td></td>
<td>1N 1P</td>
<td>1N 1P</td>
<td>2N 1P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Morn. Post</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1N</td>
<td></td>
<td>1N</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3N 2P</td>
<td></td>
<td>3N 2P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2N 1P</td>
<td></td>
<td>2N 1P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberty Times</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4N 3P</td>
<td></td>
<td>4N 3P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1N</td>
<td>1N</td>
<td>13N 9P</td>
<td>1N 1P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16N 10P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: IN: One news item; IP: One news photo.

On Feb. 16th, 1995, the day after the Mayasvi event, all seven of the sample newspapers covered it in their local issues. From Table 8.3 above, we can see that a total of 13 news items and 9 photos appeared.

In terms of location, the four news items and three photos in the Liberty Times all appeared on page 9 in the local section. The Taiwan Times put one news item and one
photo on the page 8 (in the national section), and the other on the page 16 (local section), while the Commons put all its coverage of the event on page 6 in the national section. The China Times, the Central Daily News and the Independent Morning Post all covered the event in their local sections. Only the United Daily News printed one news item and colored photo on the front page and the other item in its local section (page 14).

This unusual handling requires a few words of explanation. I pointed out in the content analysis chapter that in the new era of political, social and cultural transformation in Taiwan, stressing the importance of indigenous news enables newspapers to win credit for becoming more 'locally-oriented'. The United Daily News, which is one of the largest newspapers in the country, has been particularly criticised for its long-standing role in supporting the KMT's ideology and promoting China's rather than Taiwan's culture. Indeed, this resulted in a 'withdraw of subscription protest' by the opposition party and movements a few years ago. In response, the UDN has recently changed its editorial policy to swim with the rising tide of Taiwanese culture, art and history. Printing coverage of the Mayasvi event on the front page is part of this shift and should be understood in this political and socio-economic context.

As for the general overview of the 16 items about the Mayasvi rite, Table 8.4 provides full information on the news data used in this case study.

The 16 news items displayed in Table 8.4 can be usefully divided into 'general news reports' and 'background features'. The former are the main news accounts of the event, while the latter comprise the supplementary features on the Kupa and the meaning of the Mayasvi rite.

Table 8.4 shows that, generally speaking, the 'locally-oriented' newspapers carried only a little more attention to the Mayasvi news than the other titles. The Liberty Times, which privileges local and Taiwanese news in its news and editorials and which is proud of its fast-rising circulation in recent years, carried the most items about the Mayasvi, one general news and three features. The other 'locally-oriented' and southern-based titles, the Taiwan Times and the Commons carried at least one feature on Feb. 16th. Other titles did not carry any features in reporting this cultural event, in
### Table 8.4

**Headlines and Types of the 16 News Data (1995)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Main Headlines</th>
<th>News Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Feb. 12</td>
<td>UDN</td>
<td>Alishan <em>Mayasvi</em> rite will not be open to outsiders.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Feb. 14</td>
<td>CDN</td>
<td><em>Mayasvi</em> rite will invite Tsou tribe people to participate.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>CT</td>
<td>Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite was worth seeing.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>UDN</td>
<td>Tsou tribe <em>Mayasvi</em> rite was proceeding in the rain in a dignified and solemn atmosphere.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>CDN</td>
<td>Tsou tribe <em>Mayasvi</em> rite appeared onstage solemnly.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>IMP</td>
<td>Tsou tribe greeted <em>Mayasvi</em> rite with full passion.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite greeted noble guests with song and dance.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Kupa was the most dignified place for Tsou tribe.</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Tsou tribe ‘harvest rite’ had nothing to do with millet harvest.</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Tsou tribe <em>Mayasvi</em> rite took place solemnly.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Kupa, orchid and red banyan tree were three important characters in the rite.</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>In the <em>Mayasvi</em> rite, Tsou tribe brave men performed war dance.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>War god came down to the world. Sacred tree was the ladder and flower was the mark.</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>‘<em>Mayasvi</em>’ was not a harvest rite.</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>Kupa, men’s meeting place, prohibited women.</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Feb. 17</td>
<td>CT</td>
<td>Tsou tribe ‘<em>Mayasvi</em> rite’ brought down the curtain in joy and happiness.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
other words, they reported it as a general news only, without digging any further into the meaning of the Mayasvi rite or the meaning of the Kupa. Therefore, the locally-oriented and Taiwanese-owned titles paid slightly more attention to the event in the sense that they carry features in addition to general news. However, the other locally-oriented and Taiwanese-owned the Independent Morning Post carried the least attention in the sample—one general news without any photo. This perhaps can be explained by its limited resources in central and southern Taiwan due to the shortage of manpower and branch offices and its long-term focus on the northern news in Taipei. 20

As for the two Mainlander-owned major titles, the China Times and the United Daily News, although both carried only 'general news', their coverage did not concentrate solely on one day. The former carried one item on Feb. 16th and the other on 17th (which is the last item of the sample), while the latter carried one item on Feb. 12th (an advance announcement prior to the event) and the other on 16th. The KMT-owned Central Daily News carried one item on Feb. 14th and the other on 16th, which indicates that it also followed up the cultural event attentively. Generally speaking, despite the difference of coverage mentioned in the last chapter, almost equal attention was paid to the Tsou Mayasvi rite by the sample newspapers, be they Taiwanese-owned, Mainlander-owned or the KMT-owned.

20 The acting editor-in-chief (No.35/M/44/HC) of the Independent Morning Post said during the interview that the IMP has been focusing its attention on the northern news and northern readership for a long time for its own benefit. This is because it is very difficult for the IMP to win the southern readership as the IMP shared many similarities with the TT and the C in their political stances and 'locally-oriented' editorial policies.
8.4.2 Headline Analysis

Because headlines codify what editors consider the most important aspects of an event, they are an important mechanism for constructing a particular ideological view (Brookes, 1995: 467; Van Dijk, 1991: 50-51).

8.4.2.1 Advance announcements of the Mayasvi rite

From Table 8.3, we can see that only two items gave advance announcements of the event, in the United Daily News on Feb. 12 and the Central Daily News on Feb. 14. Both items were texts only, without any photos and both carried statements made by Tsou leaders. Let's look at the translated versions\(^\text{21}\) of these two headlines (For translations of the headlines for all 16 items in the sample, see the Appendix 5- ‘Headlines of Mayasvi News Items’).

United Daily News (Feb. 12)

Alishan Mayasvi rite will not be open to outsiders.
Wang Nien-hsing: this is a Tsou tribe war skill ritual activity and it is completely unrelated to the 'bumper year'.\(^\text{22}\)

Central Daily News (Feb. 14)

Mayasvi rite will invite Tsou tribe people to participate.

\(^{21}\) It has to be noted here that in the following quotations, bold characters refer to the main headline, and the lighter ones to sub-headlines. Also the headlines are marked by italic characters. As Mandarin has no markers for tense though it does have aspect morphemes, for example 'le' stands for 'perfective' and 'kuo' for 'experienced action', etc. (Li and Thompson, 1981: 13), so in the translated versions, I will mainly use past tense to refer to the reported Mayasvi rite which was already happened, but in these two advance news I will use the future tense.

\(^{22}\) 'Bumper year' is a direct translation of the Chinese words 'feng-nien'. 'Feng nien chi' in Chinese is therefore 'bumper year rite', but in the content analysis and in this chapter I have referred it to the 'harvest festival' or 'harvest rite', because this expression is more readily understood by non Chinese readers.
Figure 8.2 is an illustration of the two advance items in the *United Daily News* and the *Central Daily News*.

The main headline in the *United Daily News* is a negative statement indirectly quoting Wang Nien-hsing, while the sub-headline explains why he asserts that the Mayasvi rite will not open to the public. Fairclough (1992: 121-122) notes that ‘negative sentences carry special types of presupposition which also work intertextually, incorporating other texts only in order to contest and reject them.’ The negative headline *‘Alishan Mayasvi rite will not be open to outsiders’* presupposes the proposition that the public would want to attend the Mayasvi rite, as is common practice with most other aboriginal cultural events mentioned above. Uncomfortable with the notion that the Mayasvi might be misconstrued by the public as an ordinary aboriginal harvest festival, Wang is quoted in the sub-headline, again, in a negative tense, as saying that it has nothing to do with the ‘harvest rite’, which, in Taiwan’s context, is more similar to the aboriginal song and dance carnival mainly presented by the Ami tribe.

Wang is concerned to stress that the Mayasvi is a Tsou tribe war ritual activity and not a carnival-like ‘harvest rite’, so it is not open to the public. This statement is premised upon the common-sensical Han assumption that all aboriginal ritual events are harvest rites, and are therefore ideal sites for tourism replete with exotic entertainment, pleasure and excitement. The UDN headline is a summarised formulation by the newspaper from original extended quotes in the lead and third paragraphs of the news text. The UDN story of Feb. 12 reads:

**Lead**

1. The ‘Mayasvi’ ritual activity, which will be held in the Tsou tribe Tefuyeh community at the Alishan township on 15th February, is widely considered by the outside public as a ‘harvest rite’. 2. Chiayi county councilman Wang Nien-hsing yesterday demands the correction of the name to ‘War Skill’ ritual activity. 3. He said this ritual activity is a roots-searching activity for the Tsou tribe, (it is) not open to visits from the outside (public). 4. People had better not go unless they have a visitor’s pass, otherwise, they will go with great enthusiasm and return disappointed.
Figure 8.2

United Daily News

Central Daily News
1. Wang Nien-hsing said that it is completely wrong for people to think that Mayasvi ritual activity is a harvest rite for the Tsou tribe. 2. Strictly speaking, it is the most solemn and respectful war skill ritual activity for Tsou tribe people. 3. It is completely unrelated to the ‘harvest rite’. 4. He hopes that from now on (people) don’t call it a ‘harvest rite’ but call it the ‘Mayasvi rite’. From these two paragraphs, we can see that the United Daily News adopts the voice of the news source and puts his opinions into the headlines without quotation marks. This is, in Fairclough’s terms (1992: 108), an instance of ‘ambivalence of voice’, where the newspaper blends the voice of the news source with its own voice. 23 This can be further illustrated in the first sentence of the lead paragraph: ‘The “Mayasvi” ritual activity, which will be held in the Tsou tribe Tefuyeh community at the Alishan township on 15th February, is widely considered by the outside public as a “harvest rite”.’ Here the reporter faithfully reflects and adopts Wang Nien-hsing’s comments quoted in the first sentence of the third paragraph as the paper’s voice. From this blending of the voices of the reporter with the aboriginal source, 24 we may say that the newspaper endorses and incorporates the position of the source and the presupposition behind his negative statement.

The United Daily News then, serves as a good publicity vehicle for the Tsou tribe who want to make their position known to the ‘outside’ public, who are mainly thought of as Han Chinese. At the same time, because the negative statement ‘the Alishan Mayasvi rite will not be open to outsiders’ is unequivocally discouraging and inhospitable to majority readers, the newspaper may attract readers’ attention by printing a headline, so strongly against the common-sensical grain.

---

23 Fairclough (1992:108) explains that ambivalence of voice can be achieved by employing ambiguous linguistic form and is somewhat similar to the concept of ‘double-voicing’ (Bakhtin, 1981).

24 The concept of voices is presented as important in doing critical discourse analysis by Fairclough (1992: 1995). He (1995: 81) notes that in analysing discourse, it is important to distinguish between the voices representing the discourse, the voice of the reporter, and the represented discourse, the voice of the person reported.
On the other hand, the editor of the United Daily News also manages to maintain a certain distance by using the colon (:) in the sub-headline, thus attributing the remark to the source, Wang Nien-hsing, and effectively passing the responsibility for using the 'wet blanket' headline to the aboriginal speaker.

The second headline appeared in the Central Daily News one day before the event. It is much smaller (72 cm²), about one third the size of the first one. It reads 'Mayasvi rite will invite Tsou tribe people to participate.' It is a call from tribe leaders for the Tsou people to participate in the activity. Here the Mayasvi rite is personified into the hosts—the Tsou tribe leaders. Again, in this headline only the Tsou tribe people are invited and the newspaper echoes the voice of aboriginal leaders. Therefore, in view of the advance headlines, the UDN endorsed the voice of the aboriginal source for explicating the meaning of the rite by using the quote in the headline, whereas the CDN employed the voice of Tsou leaders in its headline in an indirect manner.

8.4.2.2 Headlines of Feb. 16: Textual Analysis

The cultural event under study is variously described in the main headlines as the 'Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite' (United Daily News, Central Daily News, and Commons), the 'Mayasvi rite' (Independent Morning Post and Liberty Times) and the 'Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite' (China Times and Taiwan Times).

So apart from the CT and the TT depicting the event erroneously as the 'Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite', all the other titles employed the term 'Mayasvi rite'. It is controversial to group all aboriginal cultural events under one umbrella term 'harvest rite', because the term invariably evokes the popular image of carnival-like, open to the public and consumable aboriginal song and dance activities. So from this perspective, the editors in the CT and the TT were less careful and sensitive than those of the other newspapers. Indeed, the Liberty Times even carries a headline reading "'Mayasvi' was not a harvest rite,' which parallels the wording of the UDN's advance announcement discussed earlier. The reiteration of the negative statement 'not a

---

25 See no. 14 headline in the Appendix 5.
harvest rite' not only underlines the importance of understanding aboriginal cultural events accurately, but indicates that there is a deep-seated misunderstanding toward them among the mass public.

Here I will focus my analysis only on the headlines of the general news stories which appeared on Feb. 16th. The main (bold italics) and sub-headlines (light italics) describing the event are as follows:

**China Times**

*Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite was worth seeing.*

The rite was held yesterday. *The visit card which was sold for 500 yuan each has aroused criticism.*

**United Daily News**

*Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite was proceeding in the rain in a dignified and solemn atmosphere.*

Following traditional customs, brave men started welcoming god, solidarity and adulthood ceremonies, etc. *In the night the song and dance rite continued till daybreak.*

**Central Daily News**

*Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite appeared on stage solemnly.*

*It opened the climax for harvest rite at Alishan township in Chiayi county.*

**Independent Morning Post**

*Heavy rain did not discourage the determination of restoring traditional culture.*

*Tsou tribe greeted Mayasvi rite with full passion.*
Chapter 8 A Case Study of the Mayasvi Rite

Taiwan Times

Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite greeted noble guests with song and dance.
It was the first time to practise the admission ticket purchase system. The simple and crude visitors' seats made the people who spent 500 yuan exclaim 'Not worthy'.

Commons

Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite took place solemnly.
This year was joined by two tribal communities from Taoyuan township, Kaohsiung county. All ceremonies were proceeding in accordance with the ancient rite.

Liberty Times

In the Mayasvi rite, Tsou tribe brave men performed war dance.
Welcoming war god, adulthood ceremony. Inheriting culture was significant.
Receiving admission ticket, selling programme list. Visitors had criticism.

Here I will argue that the above headlines operate mainly in or across two major discourses displayed in Table 8.2. According to Langton (1993: 33), Julia Kristeva's concept of 'intertextuality' involves 'the transposition of one or more systems of signs into another, accompanied by a new articulation of the enunciative and denotative position.' Fairclough (1995: 61) observes that intertextual analysis focuses more on the 'borderline between text and discourse practice in the analytical framework.' It looks at text from the perspective of discourse practice and at traces of discourse practice in the text, aiming to unravel the various genres and discourses which are articulated together in the text. He notes that intertextual analysis is 'at one remove in abstraction from' what is there in the text and is 'more dependent upon social and cultural understanding' (Ibid.).

In the headlines of the UDN and the C above, the words 'solemn' and 'dignified' are used as modifiers to describe the setting and atmosphere of this event. In Chinese
terminology, these terms are commonly used to characterise and describe an official event, assembly, parade or a national ritual ceremony. The use of these 'lofty' terms to describe the Mayasvi event therefore evokes the strong sense of admiration and respect normally attached to a noble activity. Also in the IMP's headline, the expression 'restoring traditional culture' is emphasised, and the Tsou tribe is used as an agent who 'greeted Mayasvi rite with full passion'. In this context, the way that the headline privileges the Mayasvi rite and its surrounding atmosphere as well as the Tsou tribe can be classified in the domain of the 'traditional culture discourse' (see Table 8.2).

The second major ideological mechanism in the headlines is derived from the tourist gaze where journalists act not only as writers producing but tourists consuming. This gaze which involves Han Chinese spectators looking on from the outside subjugates the native as passive 'objects'. Spurr (1994: 15) argues that it is a commanding view which offers aesthetic pleasure on one hand, and information and authority on the other. Langton (1993: 40) also observes: 'Representational and aesthetic statements of Aboriginal people by non-Aboriginal people transform the Aboriginal reality. They are accounts. It is in these representations that Aboriginal as subject becomes, under the white gaze imagining the Aboriginal, the object' (Italics original).

For example, the CT's headline which reads 'Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite was worth seeing' explicitly indicates a public entertainment for consumption, or in other words, a cultural exhibition for voyeuristic and tourist purposes. It is not only journalistic voyeurism that is at work here however. The phrase 'worth seeing' carries a double meanings. Firstly, it positions the writer as a spectator or tourist relaying a commanding and colonising gaze on the event. Secondly, it reinforces the mainstream Chinese views of aboriginal cultural events as exotic and bizarre activities that are 'worth seeing' and consuming.

The CDN headline reading 'The Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite appeared onstage solemnly', compares the rite to an actor on stage, raising the question, 'performing for whom?' Since the aboriginal county councilman, Wang, Nien-hsing has already emphatically denied that it is a public performance for outsiders, the expression
‘appeared onstage solemnly’ can be seen as an ideological construction rooted in a dominant and authoritative gaze which constructs the rite as a cultural commodity.

From this perspective, it is not difficult to make sense of the TT’s headline ‘Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite greeted noble guests with song and dance’ which uses the rite as a personification to ‘greet’ the ‘noble guests’, who are mainly referred to Han Chinese government officials and indigenous representatives, and perhaps journalists as well as tourists. The colonising term ‘noble guests’ evokes the unintentional cultural superiority of Han journalists, and the fact that they are greeted by an aboriginal song and dance performance inextricably evokes the coloniser’s imagination.

The headlines in the three titles above operate within the ‘modern consumption discourse’ which highlights the tourist’s or coloniser’s gaze to consume the cultural commodity and exotic performance rather than highlighting the rite itself. In other words, it prioritises the consumption of tourists over the cultural inheritance of the Tsou tribe.

The LT’s headline is more ambiguous however, operating across the range of the both discourses. This can be detected from its sub-headline. The expression of ‘Welcoming war god, adulthood ceremony. Inheriting culture was significant’ falls in the range of the traditional culture discourse, while the ‘Receiving admission ticket, selling programme list. Visitors had criticism.’ falls in the modern consumption discourse. However, in the major headline, the journalist tended to conceive of it as a ‘performance’. Table 8.5 shows the discourse patterns by the sample newspapers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discourse Patterns</th>
<th>Newspapers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Culture Discourse</td>
<td>UDN, IMP and C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Consumption Discourse</td>
<td>CT, CDN, and TT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Discourses</td>
<td>LT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.5
Headline Discourse Patterns in Reporting the Mayasvi Rite
Chapter 8

A Case Study of the Mayasvi Rite

The intertextual analysis of these headlines, however, needs to link the texts with the dimension of discourse and power. The ‘traditional culture discourse’ operates through those headlines which insist that the Mayasvi rite is not a harvest rite and which prioritise its significance to the Tsou tribe, while the ‘modern consumption discourse’ works through those headlines which label the rite as a harvest festival attractive for the tourist gaze and interpret it in commercial terms. These two contradictory discourse patterns incorporated in the texts of the headlines are articulated with the power relations between indigenous performers and Han tourists.

Urry (1990: 57) has argued that the tourist gaze is produced from a specific social relations between ‘hosts’ and ‘guests’, and that this relation is a power relation. He elaborates that where an ethnic group (e.g., Maoris in New Zealand) is the predominant object of the tourist gaze, that gaze is more intrusive than those involved with observing physical objects. From this case study, we find that the modern consumption discourse is characterised by its construction of unequal power relations between the Han subjects and the indigenous objects of the tourist gaze.

8.4.2.3 The Last Headline

The last news about the Mayasvi event appeared in the China Times on Feb. 17. The headline reads:

Tsou tribe ‘Mayasvi rite’ brought down the curtain in joy and happiness.
One hundred years’ loss of ancestral lineage was recovered. The wild pleasure of singing and dancing in Alishan lasted for two days and one night.

The expression ‘brought down the curtain in joy and happiness’ still envisions the ‘Mayasvi rite’ (in quotation mark) as a drama or an entertainment show performed for public amusement. The description ‘the wild pleasure of singing and dancing in Alishan lasted for two days and one night’ evokes a carnival-like event in which tourists can paint the town red.
Again, we find the two conflicting discourses at work. The sentence ‘One hundred years’ loss of ancestral lineage was recovered’ draws on the ‘traditional culture discourse’, while the other elements in the headline fall within the domain of the ‘modern consumption discourse’. However, the last headline presents the Mayasvi rite more as a public entertainment than a cultural event. In brief, this headline subordinates the rite to the ‘modern consumption discourse’ that underpins the main headline.

8.4.3 Analysis of News Texts

Space does not allow for all 16 printed news articles to be fully analysed here. Consequently, I will mainly focus on the two analytical dimensions: 1. the semantic macrostructure and superstructure of news texts; 2. and the significance of quotation.

8.4.3.1 Semantic Macrostructure and Superstructure of the News Texts

In this section, I will focus particularly on the general news reports of Feb. 16, 1995, rather than on the features and the advance announcement items. As Table 8.4 shows, each newspaper carried at least one main news story about the event on Feb. 16, 1995. [They are, according to the Table 8.4, no. 3-7, 10 and 12].

Van Dijk (1991: 71-73) explains that topics act as semantic macrostructures that ‘reduce the complex information of the text to its essential gist’, and ‘summarise it with a single macroproposition.’ He also argues that some topics may have a higher hierarchical position in the overall topical structure than others, and that all topics can be manipulated. For example, a lower placed topic can be ‘upgraded’ to the headlines. So Van Dijk (1991: 121) argues, news schemata may manipulate the topical organisation in news reports and may have ideological implications.

Using the image of the pyramid in news writing, which places the most important and topical information at the front of the text, Table 8.6 summarises only the first three paragraphs from the seven main news stories of Feb. 16, 1995. I will also use...
Van Dijk’s “Theory of Superstructure”\textsuperscript{26} to categorise the topical structure of the news, but I do not intend here to compare all the news schemata and topical structures of the seven newspapers in detail, only to single out those which are strikingly different in terms of ideological implications by way of illustration.

**Lead**

All seven newspapers started their reports with the ‘kickoff’, which is defined here as the ‘what’, ‘when’ and ‘where’ of the rite. Typical expressions are: ‘The traditional ritual activity of the Tsou tribe Yuanchumin in Alishan, Chiayi county—the “Mayasvi”-was grandly held in Tefuyeh community at 10:00 A.M. on the 15th (China Times).’ This is then followed by different news topics such as ‘participants’ (CT and IMP), ‘setting and atmosphere’ (UDN, CDN, C and LT), and ‘visitors’ turnout ’(TT). Table 8.6 outlines the topical structure of the first three paragraphs in each of the seven general news stories on Feb. 16th.

**Table 8.6**

Topical Structures and News Categories in the General News Stories about the Mayasvi Rite on Feb. 16th, 1995

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Newspapers</th>
<th>Topical Structure</th>
<th>News Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>China Times</td>
<td>1. The kickoff of the Mayasvi rite and the participants (noble guests and Tsou tribe from other counties). 2. The speech of county magistrate, Li Yaching. 3. The speaker of the county council, Hsiao Teng-piao, gave a present.</td>
<td>1. Lead 2. Verbal reaction 3. Main event</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{26} For Van Dijk’s theory of superstructure and schema of news reports, see Van Dijk (1991: 118-121).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Lead</th>
<th>Context and main event 1</th>
<th>Main event 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>United Daily News</td>
<td>1. The kickoff, setting and atmosphere of the Mayasvi rite.</td>
<td>2. The date of previous Mayasvi rites and the participants (noble guests and Tsou tribe from other counties).</td>
<td>3. Ceremonial proceeding of the rite.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
<td>1. The kickoff and the setting (weather) of the Mayasvi rite.</td>
<td>2. The participants (noble guests and Tsou tribe from other counties) and the speech of county magistrate, Li Ya-ching.</td>
<td>3. The speech of county council, Hsiao Teng-piao, gave a present.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
<td>1. The kickoff of the Mayasvi rite and the participants (noble guests and Tsou tribe from other counties).</td>
<td>2. The meaning and purpose of the Mayasvi rite.</td>
<td>3. The speech of county magistrate, Li Ya-ching.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
<td>1. The kickoff of the Mayasvi rite and the less turnout of the visitors because of the rain.</td>
<td>2. Ceremonial proceeding of the rite.</td>
<td>3. Ceremonial proceeding of the rite.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Commons</td>
<td>1. The kickoff, setting and atmosphere of the Mayasvi rite.</td>
<td>2. Ceremonial proceeding of the rite.</td>
<td>3. Ceremonial proceeding of the rite.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Liberty Times</td>
<td>1. The kickoff, setting and atmosphere of the Mayasvi rite.</td>
<td>2. The participants (noble guests) and the speaker of the county council, Hsiao Teng-piao, gave a present.</td>
<td>3. The speech of county magistrate, Li Ya-ching.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
1. The number column in this Table corresponds to the numbers displayed in the Table 8.4.
Chapter 8

2. The numbers in the columns of 'Topical Structure' and 'News Category' represent: 1. lead (the first paragraph); 2. the second paragraph; 3. the third paragraph of the news texts.

Since the lead is the most important summarisation of the news, the news components above reflect the different judgements of importance and newsworthiness made by the newspapers. I have chosen examples of each to illustrate their ideological implications. The following texts are my translations from the leads of the United Daily News (setting and atmosphere), the China Times (participants) and the Taiwan Times (visitors' turnout).

**The United Daily News Lead**

The Mayasvi rite of the Tefuyeh community in Alishan township, Chiayi county, was proceeding in the rain yesterday. Following traditional customs, Tsou tribe brave men started the ceremonies of welcoming God, solidarity, men's initial entrance to the meeting place, adulthood, sending off God and song and dance rituals.... The sound of the chanting was dignified and solemn and the dancing gait was slow, which displayed the sincere and respectful feelings of Yuanchumin. The whole ceremony ended after one hour or more.

**The China Times Lead**

The traditional ritual activity of the Tsou tribe Yuanchumin in Alishan, Chiayi county—the 'Mayasvi'—was grandly held in Tefuyeh community at 10:00 A.M. on the 15th. The noble guests who visited the ceremony included county magistrate Li Ya-ching, speaker Hsiao Teng-piao.... In addition, there were those representatives of the Tsou sub-tribes scattered in kaohsiung and Nantou counties who also came to join the grand event. The venue was extremely cheerful.

**The Taiwan Times Lead**

The Alishan Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite (commonly called a harvest rite) took place in Tefuyeh community yesterday morning. Due to the fact that it was the first to practise the admission ticket purchase system, and coupled with the drastic fall of yesterday's temperature and incessant rain, this year the mountain-going visiting audience were not as numerous as in previous years.
Figure 8.3 reprints the Mayasvi news stories in the UDN, CT and the TT on Feb. 16th, 1995.

The UDN lead underlines the importance of the Mayasvi rite itself. The chanting is described as 'dignified and solemn' which echoes the tone of its major headline: 'Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite was proceeding in the rain in a dignified and solemn atmosphere.' This formulation, which foregrounds the topic of 'setting and atmosphere', is in a stark contrast to the leads in the two other newspapers.

The China Times foregrounds the topic of 'participants' in its lead after the normal 'kickoff'. Instead of describing the setting and atmosphere, emphasis is placed on the names and positions of the Han Chinese VIPs who 'visited the ceremony', and the speech of the county magistrate is put in the second paragraph (see Table 8.6). This topic formulation is clearly indicative of the newspaper's view that the participation of government authorities is the key feature of the event. If we look at the Table 8.6, we see that the topic of 'participants' [noble guests, Tsou tribe people from other counties] is mentioned in every newspapers except the TT and the C, which are based in southern Taiwan.

From the Table 8.6, we see that the IMP also positions 'participants' as the lead topic, complete with the names and positions of the VIPs. Apart from the county magistrate and the county council speaker, the aboriginal legislator (MP), Kao Tien-lai was also mentioned, but only after the magistrate and the speaker who are Han. In the UDN, the CDN, and the LT, the 'participants' topic is placed in the second paragraph. Therefore, it is not misleading to say that the 'ideology of noble guests' is deeply embedded in the general news writings about the Mayasvi event whose intrinsic meaning and purpose are thereby marginalised.

Furthermore, in contrast to Han dignitaries, the Tsou tribe's people from other counties are described collectively rather by their individual names and positions in all the titles which have the 'participants' topic. The event was described by the China Times as: 'The venue was extremely cheerful.' This divests the Mayasvi rite of its solemn and sacred meanings and constructs it as a carnival-like festival.

In the lead of the Taiwan Times, the topic of the 'visitors' turnout' is highlighted. As we know from the content analysis, the TT is the newspaper which carries
Figure 8.3
Mayasvi News Stories in the UDN, CT and the TT on Feb. 16th, 1995.

[Image of United Daily News article]

United Daily News
頭看有祭年豐族鄒 山里阿
評批起引元百五賣張一證觀參 行舉日昨典祭

阿里山鄒族原住民舉行豐年祭，射殺壯族，以表達一年的收穫與感謝。

阿里山國家公園管處表示，射殺壯族是鄒族的傳統習俗，以表達對神明的敬畏和感謝。

報導指出，豐年祭是鄒族最重要的祭典，也是原住民與外界交流的重要時刻。

中國時報 2023年10月1日
賓嘉迎舞歌 祭年豐族鄒山里阿

得值不，喊大眾民的元百五花令 席衆觀的陋簡 制場入票購施實次首

Taiwan Times
aboriginal news most in terms of frequency and size. However, this case study suggests that this attention is not entirely positive or sympathetic. It is clear that the lead paragraph in the TT lays more emphasis on tourist turnout than on the Mayasvi rite.

Adjacent to the news but under the same headline, the TT has a short comment whose lead reads:

*The expanded Alishan Tsou tribe 'Mayasvi' rite this year was the first to practise the admission ticket purchase system. Coupled with the simple and crude visitors' seats which provided no cover from the rain, this made people exclaim 'Not worthy!' to the admission ticket sold at such a high price as 500 Yuan.*

The information that this was the first to implement the admission ticket is not only reproduced in the both leads of the *Taiwan Times*, but in the headline. This coverage clearly indicates that the *Taiwan Times* privileges the pleasure of Han tourists and visitors rather than the meaning of the Mayasvi rite for the Tsou Yuanchumin.

If we look at the leads above and articulate them with their headlines, we may conclude that the headlines of the UDN and the TT are faithful summaries of the leads. Only the headline of the CT is constructed differently. It reads: *'Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite was worth seeing.' The rite was held yesterday. The visit card which was sold for 500 yuan each has aroused criticism.* This is not a straight derivation from the lead. Rather, in Van Dijk's words, it is a 'manipulative' construction which 'upgrades' the fourth paragraph of the text in the *China Times*, reading:

*The fourth paragraph---The rite was held in the square in front of the 'Kupa' (men's meeting place). It broke the record this year. For the first time the host set up a stall near the entrance selling the so-called 'visiting card' and collecting 500 yuan from every visitor. In addition, the host printed the ceremonial proceedings into a manual and charged another 100 yuan. This new practice touched off many disputes.*

---

27 This short comment in the *Taiwan Times* is considered as one news item because both news and comment share the same headline.
I have illustrated through the examples above that the leads of the Chinese newspapers in covering the Mayasvi news are strikingly different in their topical structures, emphasis, orders of news schemata and ideological influences. Comparatively speaking, we can say that the United Daily News is more 'culture-oriented' or more devoted to the rite itself because it offers a brief summarisation of the setting and atmosphere of the ceremony. The China Times has more of an 'authority-orientation' and is deeply embedded in 'noble guests' ideology, signified by the inclusion of VIP name lists. It emphasises the dignitaries, especially the government officials and representatives, who graced the venue with their presence. This style of reporting is quite common in news about aboriginal celebrations, festivals and ceremonies. The Taiwan Times conveys a particular ideology of tourist consumption in its compliance with the critical voice of visitors. To the Taiwan Times, the Mayasvi rite is nothing more than public entertainment or cultural commodity for Han Chinese consumption.

The results of our analysis of the news texts in the UDN, CT and the TT in this case study can be described as follows:

1. From the content analysis study earlier, we found that both the locally-oriented Taiwan Times and the liberal China Times paid more attention to indigenous news than the other newspapers during the sample period, but in this case study, we found that they constructed and constrained the Mayasvi rite under the framework of the modern consumption discourse, so did their headlines. In contrast, the more conservative United Daily News showed more empathy to the rite, highlighting the traditional culture itself rather than its consumption. Therefore, the good newspapers which produced more indigenous news quantitatively are not necessarily good qualitatively.

2. In terms of reporting aboriginal cultural events such as the Mayasvi, most of the mainstream newspapers in Taiwan are more 'authority-oriented' in the sense that the names and positions of participant dignitaries are mentioned in a prominent way, either in the lead or the second paragraph of the news texts. In other words, the 'noble guest ideology' is deeply embedded in the aboriginal cultural news.
However, in this case study, both the southern-based *Taiwan Times* and the *Commons* did not carry any trace of this authority orientation. This is probably related to their editorial positions which privilege local (Taiwanese) cultures and their long-standing oppositional stance.

### 8.4.3.2 The Significance of Indigenous Quotation

As mentioned in the last chapter, questions of *quotation* are central to any analysis of media coverage of minority affairs. Van Dijk (1991: 151) observes that in the coverage of ethnic affairs, possible biases not only reside in the selection and prominence given to news actors, but also in the ways they are presented as speakers who interpret and comment on news events. He (Ibid.: 174) and many other commentators have argued that minority group members are quoted less often and less extensively than majority group members, even when the topics directly concern them. The content analysis study in this thesis shows that overall, although indigenous peoples are far from voiceless in the news, nevertheless, they are still marginalised by Han controlled and dominated news institutions and frameworks. The other important finding from the content analysis is that there is an 'authority-orientation' in the coverage of indigenous news, i.e., news reports are likely to attach more importance and prominence to government sources than to indigenous actors. In this case study, the quotation pattern for the coverage of the Mayasvi rite is shown in Table 8.7.

From the Table 8.7, we can see that in the advance announcements of the Mayasvi (no. 1 and 2), Tsou leaders, Wang Nien-hsing and his elder brother Wang Nien-yeh, were quoted. The latter was also quoted in one item carried on the 17th, the day after the main coverage. Since features, in this case, are mainly journalists' interpretation of the Mayasvi event as information kit or supplementary backgrounders of the ceremonial meaning and procedure, it is understandable that on Feb. 16th, none of the 6 features has used any quotation. However, in the main news stories on Feb. 16, only the Han Chinese county magistrate, Li Ya-ching, and county council speaker, Hsiao Teng-piao were quoted. Li was the only quoted source in the CT and the LT,
while Li and Hsiao were both quoted in the CDN and the IMP, with Li quoted first and Hsiao second.

Table 8.7
Quotation Pattern of the Mayasvi News

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Quotation Patterns in the News Texts</th>
<th>News Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Feb. 12</td>
<td>UDN</td>
<td>Wang Nien-hsing (Tsou tribe county councilman) quoted only.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Feb. 14</td>
<td>CDN</td>
<td>Wang Nien-yeh (Tsou tribe chief) and other leaders quoted.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>CT</td>
<td>Li Ya-ching (Han Chinese county magistrate) quoted only.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>UDN</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>CDN</td>
<td>Li Ya-ching and Hsiao Teng-piao (Han Chinese county council speaker) quoted.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>IMP</td>
<td>Li Ya-ching and Hsiao Teng-piao quoted.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>TT</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>TT</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>TT</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>Li Ya-ching quoted only.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Feb. 16</td>
<td>LT</td>
<td>No quotation</td>
<td>feature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Feb. 17</td>
<td>CT</td>
<td>Wang Nien-yeh quoted only.</td>
<td>general news</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These findings suggest that indigenous Yuanchumin are marginalised not because they are not quoted but because they are quoted in marginalised news presentations. [Only HC government officials were quoted in the main news stories of Feb. 16th, while the Tsou tribe leaders were quoted in the advance announcements and on Feb. 17th]. It also confirms the 'authority-orientation' of indigenous news revealed by the content analysis. Only Han Chinese magistrate and council speaker were quoted in four
Figure 8.4
event. Because of his position and influence, Li was invited to give an opening speech for this event. This may partly explain why the county magistrate’s quotation is so prominent, but not the whole picture, since the other three newspapers, the United Daily News, Taiwan Times and Commons did not quote his speech at all.

One of the news functions of quotation is that statements by prominent news actors may be newsworthy in their own right, simply because they express the interpretation or opinions of important news actors (Van Dijk, 1991:152). Also, a story may become more lively by occasionally quoting news participants. But these observations cannot fully explain the prominence given to the Han Chinese magistrate and speaker. Why were aboriginal leaders not quoted on Feb. 16th? Perhaps this can be explained by the ‘noble guest’ ideology and ‘authority orientation’ discussed above, both of which exclude aboriginal voices. The other possible interpretation is that aboriginal leaders were considered as hosts and entertainers at the service of the visiting ‘noble guests’, thus none of them were quoted by the sample titles on Feb. 16th.

8.4.4 Analysis of the Mayasvi Photographs

There were a total of 10 news photos accompanying the Mayasvi coverage. Apart from the Independent Morning Post, all newspapers carried at least one (see Table 8.3). Urry (1990) has noted that:

To photograph is in some way to appropriate the object being photographed. It is a power/knowledge relationship. To have visual knowledge of an object is in part to have power, even if only momentarily, over it. Photography tames the object of the gaze, the most striking examples being of exotic cultures (p. 138-139).

The late Eric Michaels, who worked as a Visiting Research Fellow at the Australian Institute of Aboriginal Studies from 1982-1986, undertook a study at Yuendumu to assess the impact of television on remote Aboriginal communities. He points out that the camera, for Australian aborigines, is a ‘dangerous, magical instrument capable of stealing some essential part of their beings’, for example, the
'spirit theft' (1994: 1-2). Michaels identifies 'four areas' in which Aboriginal culture may be compromised and Aboriginal people offended when they, or information about them, become photographic subjects. One of his concerns is the 'rhetorical narrative devices that isolate Aborigines and constitute them as exotic rather than contemporary peoples, or otherwise depict Aborigines in what they judge to be a negative manner (Ibid.: 3).'

Around the same time, Kung (1993: 21) offered some critical observations on the media's negative and stereotypical reports about aboriginal cultural news in Taiwan. I argued that the host of repetitive texts and images in the media, ranging from 'chiefs', the 'barbarian's sword', alcoholics, the 'Ai-ling rite' to 'mountain flowers', have reinforced an inaccurate knowledge of the Yuanchumin over the long-term.

In terms of the potential impact on how we see the world, visual images are often presented as more powerful than texts. Price (1993: 193), for example, cites Sontag as saying 'Photographed images...now provide most of the knowledge people have about the look of the past and the reach of the present.'

In this case study, the seven photos, which accompanied the main news stories on the Mayasvi rite can be divided into three groups:

1. The first four photos (no. 1-4) depict Tsou tribe dancing in a circular shape with hands crossed with one another. [This formation is typical of most of aboriginal dances.]
2. Two photos (no. 5-6) depict Tsou tribe raising swords.
3. The last photo of tourists and Tsou people together (no. 7).

Details of these photos are given in Figure 8.5.29

Roland Barthes uses the term anchorage to describe the way that the words used as captions for photographs help fix the floating chain of signifieds of the visual

---

28 'Ai-ling rite', one of the popular objects of media attention in Taiwan, is a traditional rite of the Saisiyat tribe, while the term 'mountain flower' refers to the aboriginal fledgling prostitutes.
29 The seven photos in Figure 8.5 reproduce the original photos of the newspapers, identical in size and colour.
Figure 8.5
Mayasvi Photos and Captions (16 February, 1995)

The ‘Mayasvi’ rite of the Tefuyeh community, Alishan township, was proceeding in the rain yesterday.
(United Daily News)

The ‘Mayasvi’ harvest rite of the Tefuyeh community, Tapang village in the Alishan township was grandly held.
(Central Daily News)
In the Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite, warriors were chanting the tune of welcoming god to welcome the advent of the War God.

(Taiwan Times)

Brave men were surrounding the sacred fire and chanting the tune of welcoming god and holding the welcoming-god song and dance rite.

(Commons)
Alishan Tsou tribe Yuanchumin were holding a harvest rite where they killed a little pig as an offering to the heavenly god. Brave men used a mountain sword stained with pig's blood to call out to the heavenly god.

(China Times)

Tsou tribe brave men soaked sword with blood and roared to the war god.

(Liberty Times)
The Alishan township 'Mayasvi' rite was held till daybreak. The host feasted homecoming guests with millet wine.

(China Times)
images. But elsewhere he calls the caption a 'parasitic message designed to connote the image, to quicken it with one or more second-order signifieds.'³⁰ Price (1993: 192) argues that captions are used to position or interpellate readers, requiring them to fall into line with the preferred interpretation of the image and that we should not therefore regard the written text as the 'natural' part of the equation between image and words. The story chosen can be inflected to produce a variety of readings.

At a first glance, the denotative meanings of the group 1 photos (no. 1-4) are clear. They are:

1. These are news photos taken live by reporters;
2. They show Tsou tribe people in their traditional attire singing and dancing in a circular shape;
3. They are taken from a top view and a panoramic position.

There are some differences however. Numbers 1 and 3 are color prints, and in no. 1 women participate in the dance and two video cameramen standing in the middle of the circle are shown shooting the scene. It also offers a clearer view of the Kupa (the hut cottage in the background) and of the visitors, who are holding umbrellas on the left side. In contrast, the other three photos foreground the Tsou tribe dancers in the middle. Overall, though, the main visual image of Tsou tribe dancers in full traditional attire singing and dancing in a circular shape with hands crossed with one another, is clear and consistent.

The captions are markedly divergent however. The caption to no. 1 in the UDN is a factual assertion that the 'Mayasvi rite' was 'proceeding in the rain', as highlighted in the headline. The caption to no. 2 in the CDN terms the event the 'Mayasvi harvest rite' and describes it as 'grandly held', carrying overtones of political ceremony. In both these captions, the Mayasvi rite is presented as a single and whole entity. In contrast, no. 3 in the TT and no. 4 in the C, certain aspects are foregrounded. For example, in no. 3, the Tsou tribe dancers are termed 'warriors' and described as

³⁰ See Fiske (1990: 110).
chanting the tune of welcoming god to welcome the advent of the War God. In the no. 4 caption, although ‘chanting the tune of welcoming god’ is also mentioned, it is against the background provided by the terms ‘brave men’ and ‘sacred fire’ to anchor the image. The captions show that there is an intertextual articulation between the headlines, news texts and the captions that constantly reproduce the two major conflicting discourses—tradition and consumption.

In contrast to the four photographs which show the Mayasvi rite from a panoramic position capturing the Tsou singing and dancing in a circular shape, no. 5 in the CT and no. 6 in the LT use the close-ups depicting ‘brave men’ raising mountain swords soaked with pig’s blood to call out to the war god. Here, the harmonious symbol of aboriginal singing and dancing in a circular shape is supplanted by a more primitive and barbarous image of the Tsou tribe. There is a very strong metaphor in the phrase ‘pig’s blood’, because in the old times it symbolised the blood of those beheaded whose head skulls are used as sacrificial offerings to the war god. In the captions, the image of the mountain sword and the blood are particularly highlighted, and coupled with the close-up image of the sword-raising ‘brave men’, reinforcing and recalling the return of the old beheading and bloodthirsty image of the tribe, e.g., the famous story of Chinese legendary hero Wu Feng. In these captions, the term ‘brave

---

31 Wu Feng is a Han legendary hero who lived during the Ching dynasty and operated as an ‘expert’ between the Han and the Tsou tribe. He is said to have been very popular and respected mediator among the Tsou tribal communities. After many attempts to educate the Tsou tribe to eradicate their savage beheading customs failed, he was said to have allowed the ‘aboriginal savages’ to kill ‘an old man in red robes riding a white horse’ who, to the great astonishment of the Tsou tribe, turned out to be Wu Feng himself. After this tragic incident, so the story goes, the wrath of heaven reigned curses and famines upon the tribe as a revenge for Wu Feng’s death. As a result, the Tsou people were so stricken by remorseful feelings that in the end they finally ceased their beheading customs. Therefore, Wu Feng’s willingness to sacrifice himself as an offering to aboriginal gods eventually achieved his life-long goal to civilise savage habits and customs. This story, because of its dramatic appeal, has been widely reproduced in films and TV dramas and was circulated in the elementary textbooks until 1988, when the Ministry of Education decided to delete it due to strong opposition from aboriginal movements (see Kung, 1993: 29).
men’ could be read as ironical because the image translates the meaning into ‘barbarians’.

No. 7, which accompanied the last news story about the Mayasvi rite on Feb. 17 in the China Times, conveys a more ambiguous image. It shows aboriginal women and tourists dancing together which matches quite well with the main headline: ‘Tsou tribe “Mayasvi rite” brought down the curtain in joy and happiness.’ Both the image and the headline claim the victory of the carnival-like, wild pleasure of a tourist gaze over the dignified and solemn sense of aboriginal cultural ceremony. The last sentence—‘The host feasted homecoming guests with millet wine’—ties the rite further to a carnival-like tourist attraction and reinforces the notion that the rite is an open event in which guests are entertained by millet wine. The phrase ‘homecoming guests’ is a contradictory combination of ‘homecoming Tsou people and tourist guests’, placing both sets of visitors on a par. Also, the image shows a young girl in ordinary clothes (not in aboriginal clothes) serving the wine to the dancers. This young girl could be a Tsou or a Han Chinese tourist. However, she is shown acting as a hostess, feasting the dancing guests with millet wine. Again, this photo shows that the two conflicting discourses are pitted against each other, creating a space for ambiguity and contradiction that flow from the headline, news texts and the photos. In view of the advance announcement of Wang Nien-hsing, the aboriginal county councilman, who argued forcefully that the Mayasvi rite is not open to outsiders, there should be no host to entertain ‘guests’. So this last and not least important photo which celebrates the cheerfulness of the Mayasvi rite can be described as marking the victory of the ‘modern consumption discourse’ over the ‘traditional culture discourse’.

32 It has to be noted that the white millet wine is a general symbol of pan-aboriginal hospitality. It is widely known that the wine is very popular among Yuanchumin for hosting guests and friends in occasions of celebration.
8.5 Concluding Remarks

This chapter has used a qualitative method—critical discourse analysis—to explore the implicit racial ideology underlying the news coverage of a particular aboriginal cultural event—the Tsou Mayasvi rite—in the mainstream newspapers, in an attempt to complement and extend the findings of the content analysis.

I began this chapter by outlining an approach to the question of how racist ideology and discourse are constructed and reproduced in the news media, drawing upon current theories from critical linguistics and discourse studies. Since the content analysis study had demonstrated the striking prominence of the aboriginal cultural news in the mainstream newspapers, I therefore chose the Tsou tribe cultural event as a case study.

Many people in Taiwan have expressed their concern at the flood of tourists swarming to gaze at aboriginal cultural events, but many have also argued that tourism is a necessary evil for the development of the aboriginal economy and even the culture itself. Therefore, indigenous peoples are currently faced with a dilemma in preserving their cultures. The challenge is to find ways of allowing traditional culture and modern tourism to coexist and, most importantly, to allow indigenous peoples to pass on their cultures to their offspring in a context where traditions are rapidly disappearing.

The other problem at issue in terms of preserving aboriginal culture is how to maintain the 'subjectivity' of aboriginal cultural events and activities. I argued above that most aboriginal cultural productions rely heavily upon subsidy, funds, and donations from the public and private sectors. They are particularly overdependent on the government's sector. As a consequence, the 'subjectivity' of aboriginal culture is severely undermined [although Casey et al. (1996:5) have argued that the dependence of cultural productions, events and activities, on the public sector is inevitable].

I have made it clear in the beginning of this analysis that except for those private and profit-making performances for tourists in the scenic resorts or culture parks, virtually all aboriginal cultural events and activities were free and open to the public until the 1995 Mayasvi rite under study started charging admission to all visiting tourists. Although there were reasons to introduce this system in the context of a public aboriginal cultural event (partly to control visiting tourists and maintain the
integrity of the rite on the one hand, and partly to expand revenues to improve the kupa and its surrounding facilities), we found that it was controversial decision within the Tsou tribe as well as a major focus of criticism by Han journalists and tourists. Whatever the intention, the Tsou leaders’ decision had the effect of converting their own rite into a cultural commodity and selling it to Han tourists. This undermined the ‘subjectivity’ of the rite and colluded with the modern tourism and consumerism underpinning the capitalist market economy. However, we should be careful not rush too easily to ‘blame the victims’, because their decision was made in the context of a system of social inequality in which they are relatively weak in socio-economic terms. Nevertheless, the unequal social relations between the indigenous hosts and the Han guests, although ambiguous in some way, created an environment for the formation of the two recurrent and contradictory discourses in reporting the Mayasvi rite: the ‘traditional culture discourse’ and the ‘modern consumption discourse’ (see Table 8.2). The case study shows that these two discourse patterns are continually operated in and threaded through the headlines, news texts and the photos of the event. In addition, through the intertextual analysis we found that they are deeply embedded in representations of the unequal power relations between the indigenous performers (host) and the Han tourists (guest).

In terms of the attention paid to the rite by the sample titles, we found that the LT carried the most items, followed by the TT and the CT. I argued that the ‘locally-oriented’ newspapers, with the exception of the IMP in this case, paid slightly more attention to Mayasvi news than the other titles since they carried features. However, most of their reports concentrated only on Feb. 16th. In view of the fact that the ‘conservative’ UDN and the KMT-owned CDN printed the advance news (on Feb. 12th and 14th respectively) and that the ‘liberal’ CT printed the follow-up (on Feb. 17th) for this event, I argued that the differences in attention to the Mayasvi rite among the sample were only minimal. In other words, we can argue that the mainstream newspapers were more or less equally attentive to the Mayasvi rite, despite different ownership patterns and editorial positions. The only exception is perhaps the IMP, also considered as a locally-oriented and oppositional paper in Taiwan, which carried only
one news item. This is, as explained earlier, because of its limited resources in southern Taiwan and its market strategy.

A more detailed analysis of the headlines of the main news stories on Feb. 16th, however, reveals that the UDN, IMP and the C fall in the range of the 'traditional culture discourse', while the CT, CDN and the TT are in the domain of the 'modern consumption discourse', with the LT ranging across the both discourses.

It was impossible to conduct a full critical discourse analysis of all the news texts, so I have paid particular attention to the topical structure of the UDN, CT and TT. We found that the TT and the CT, which carried the most indigenous items in the content analysis study, represented the Mayasvi from within the modern consumption discourse, divesting the rite of its cultural meaning to the indigenous Tsou tribe. They highlight the tourist gaze and privilege the pleasure and entertainment of the rite as a cultural commodity. In contrast, the UDN, which was considered a more conservative title among the sample, located its Mayasvi news within the traditional culture discourse and displayed more empathy to the rite itself. In addition, the Commons, which ranked 5th in covering aboriginal news in terms of the major criteria in the content analysis study, also represented the Mayasvi rite within the traditional culture discourse. Consequently, I have argued that the good newspapers which produced more indigenous news quantitatively are not necessarily good qualitatively.

In the analysis of the quotations, this chapter reveals that the sample Chinese newspapers tend to cover the Mayasvi rite from within the 'noble guest ideology', with the exception of the southern-based and locally-oriented titles (TT and C). The noble guest ideology is defined here as giving major prominence to government officials and their speeches in aboriginal culture news reports. I have mentioned that this ideology is pervasive in Taiwan's mainstream newspapers' reports on any events, ceremonies and festivals that are related to aboriginal affairs. Even so, it is surprising to find that none of the Chinese newspapers quoted Tsou tribe members as speakers in the main news stories on Feb. 16th. This reveals that the Tsou tribe was marginalised not in the sense of not being quoted but being quoted in marginalised news locations and at marginal times. More generally, we can argue that indigenous leaders are absent from the main
accounts of the event because they are interpellated as hosts and entertainers at the service of the 'noble guests'.

Finally, this chapter underlines the importance of undertaking photo analysis. Although the photos were found to be highly concerted in reinforcing and reproducing the themes of cultural difference and primitive and exotic others through images of Tsou tribe dancers in traditional attire, we found that the two conflicting discourses were also at work in the photos and that there was an intertextual articulation between the headlines, news texts and captions that constantly reproduced and reinforced the emphases on tradition and consumption. However, the last photo of the China Times conveys a contradictory image and ranges across the two discourses highlighting the conflict and ambiguity surrounding interpretations of the event.

Spurr (1994: 7) argues that 'for the coloniser as for the writer, it becomes a question of establishing authority through the demarcation of identity and difference.' Ramos (1992:62) observes that exoticism is not created by a particular subject matter itself but by the mode of expression used to describe it, arguing that with rhetorical devices, one can create 'the illusion that the exotic is in the world rather than of the imagination.' In this case study, we found that the aboriginal cultural news is replete with symbols and metaphors of sacred tradition and gallantry which may at times have been marked more by a pursuit of the exotic rather than the pursuit of an understanding of aboriginal culture.

Above all, this case study reveals that the two discourses of traditional culture and modern consumption are constantly pitted against or mixed with each other in the Mayasvi news texts and discourses. This is an outcome of the fact that indigenous peoples are now constantly placed in a dilemma, caught between their intention to preserve their own culture and their increasing incorporation into the value system of modern consumption and the dynamics of tourism. It is this ambiguous and dilemmatic social environment that above all has shaped and constrained both the development of their culture and the mainstream news discourses of the Mayasvi rite.
Part Three

Indigenous Press and Counter-Discourses
Chapter Nine
Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements in Taiwan: Predicament of Counter-Discourses

9.1 Introduction

Having presented an empirical analysis of mainstream news coverage of indigenous peoples in the two previous chapters, it is now necessary to look at the issue from the bottom-up and to pose the following questions; how did the indigenous press come into existence in Taiwan? What counter-discourse does it present and what predicaments and problems does it currently face? In order to place the development of Taiwan's indigenous press in a wider context, when applicable, this chapter draws upon relevant experiences elsewhere, especially the cases of the Native American press in the U.S. and aboriginal media in Australia.

Wilson II and Gutierrez (1995) identify three basic options for minorities in their relations to media:

Faced with Anglocentric mass media tainted by racism and insensitive to their needs, non-whites in the United States have three options: a.) they may develop and maintain their own alternative communications media; b.) they may seek access into mainstream media through employment; and c.) they may apply pressure techniques of various forms to effect changes in mainstream media content as it relates to them (p. 214-215).

This analysis can certainly be applied to aboriginal involvement in Australian media. Jakubowicz (1995: 181) cites Michael Meadows as saying that 'Aborigines have been involved in struggles with the media over negative and stereotypical representation (usually as violent, drunk, or dangerous); with media bureaucracies over their reluctance to employ Aborigines, particularly in creative roles; and with the wider
communications environment as they have sought to bypass Anglo-Australian-controlled media through the creation of their own media for their own audiences.'

These three interrelated tasks are at the heart of the contest of power between minorities and the media system. This chapter is an attempt to explore how they operate in the context of Taiwan. It has three main aims; first, to examine the historical counter-discourses promoted by aboriginal media and movements; second, to investigate the problem of minorities' access to mainstream media; and third, to explore the current predicament of the indigenous press in Taiwan and their counter-discourses.

### 9.2 Indigenous Media and Movements

It cannot be overemphasised that the emergence of indigenous media is deeply intertwined with the use of indigenous movements and the counter-discourses they have promoted. Riggins (1992: 12), in his book Ethnic Minority Media: An International Perspective, argues that apart from the state, social movements have played the most central role in the formation of minority media and that they therefore need to be conceptualised within the larger framework of social movements. He notes that 'mass media affiliated with social movements are essential for creating and sustaining beliefs in collective goals. The life cycle of social movements and media organisations are intertwined' (Ibid.). However, in my view, the relationship between social movements and minority media, must also be placed in a historical perspective.

#### 9.2.1 The Emergence of Minority Journalism

To begin with, it has to be understood that minority media were often born at moments of crisis, in the context of minorities' (Black, Hispanic and Native Indians) movements. Wilson II and Gutierrez (1995: 177-195) trace the history of the first newspapers of Latino, Black, Native American, and Asian Americans in the U.S., and come to the following conclusion:
One similarity has already been established, they were all founded in a period when the members of each group were facing a crisis of unusual stress or pain that was not being experienced by the majority population. For example, two newspapers, Freedom's Journal and Cherokee Phoenix, were established for the primary purpose of providing a voice that would be an alternative to the established press, and a third, the Golden Hill's News, appeared at a time when the mainstream media were playing an active role in ridiculing and disparaging members of that group.¹

These pioneering journals were 'a small chorus amid the thunder of American racism' in the 19th century. In 1827, after a series of especially vituperative anti-black attacks by several New York City editors, John B. Russwurm and Samuel E. Cornish collaborated to produce the paper in which they hoped to counter the stereotypes that prevailed in American popular culture. They wrote in the first issue:

We wish to plead our cause. Too long have others spoken for us. Too long has the public been deceived by misrepresentations in the things that concern us dearly (Kessler, 1984: 21).

However, Rhodes (1995: 36) comments that 'their efforts at counter-discourse were only marginally successful in ameliorating American racism....A prime function of these newspapers was to establish community ties among a fragmented population, and to foster a black nationalist identity.' Kessler (1984) notes that Freedom's Journal, produced by and for Blacks, was the first of the more than 2,700 Black newspapers. She gave the following succinct observation on the evolution of the Black press and Black journalism in America:

Originating both because and in spite of adversity, the Black press has had a rich, varied, volatile history. It is the story of persistent struggle against widespread cultural prejudice mirrored by stereotyping and rejection in the conventional white media. It is the story of powerless, often penniless men and women who devoted their energies, and sometimes risked their lives, in hopes of bettering the condition of their race. The journalistic effort of Blacks is one part-one very important part-of the political and economic struggle for equality that continues today (p. 21).

¹ Freedom's Journal (1827) is the first Black newspaper in the U.S., whereas Cherokee Phoenix (1828) and Golden Hill's News (1851?) are the first Native American and Asian American newspapers.
Chapter 9  Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements

Let's now take a brief look at the emergence of the first Native American newspaper, the Cherokee Phoenix, which is perhaps more pertinent to the focus of this research. Murphy and Murphy (1981: 21-30) and Wilson II and Gutierrez (1995: 184-189) have documented the history. The Cherokee Phoenix was launched on Feb. 21, 1828 in response to the federal government's efforts to displace the Cherokee Nation from the millions of acres of land it held in North Carolina, Georgia and Tennessee in the hope of unifying and expressing the opinion of the Cherokee people. It appeared weekly, with a few gaps, for 6 years until 1834, when it folded. It was printed in a bilingual format, making use of both English and the 86-character Cherokee alphabet that had been introduced by Sequoyah (also known as George Gist) after 12 years of work in 1821 (Wilson II and Gutierrez, 1995: 184-186).

The Indian editor, Elias Boudinot, who was a Cherokee school teacher, wrote in the first editorial:

We would now commit our feeble efforts to the good will and indulgence of the public, praying that God will attend them with his blessings, and hoping for that happy period when all the Indian tribes of American shall rise, Phoenix-like, from their ashes, and when terms like 'Indian depredations', 'war whoops', 'scalping knife' and the like shall become obsolete and forever be buried 'under deep underground'.

Wilson II and Gutierrez (1995: 186) note that the newspaper was started out of two needs. 'One was the desire of missionaries to use print media to spread Christianity among the Cherokees. The other was the desire of the leaders of the Cherokee Nation to unify Cherokees and others in support of the fight to keep their homelands.' Murphy and Murphy (1981: 17) further note that 'Although many of the early tribal publications were engineered by religious missions scattered throughout Indian country, most were started by tribal leaders.'

Murphy and Murphy (1981: 71-75) elaborated on the basic characteristics of the Amerian Indian press as follows:

---

1. The Indian press is almost entirely an English-language press today, although a growing number of papers are being used to teach tribal languages.

2. They are anything but profitable business ventures.

3. They usually get their start and often continue to exist through forms of tribal, educational or governmental subsidy. Some are financially independent, but most are shoestring operations. However, increasing attention is now being given to the development of strong advertising programmes, conferences, training programmes and exchanges among newspapers.

4. As stories are written from the Indian point of view, they are often 'unabashedly opinionated'.

5. They emphasise coverage of council meetings and cultural traditions, folklores and legends which are intended to re-establish pride in the Indian heritage. In addition, they are used as organs to promote the welfare of Native Americans.

Sharon Murphy (1982: 52) has pointed to infrequent publication, high mortality rates, minimal staff and minimal resources as the recurrent features of the smaller Indian papers today. Along with the development of Indian journalism, many problems have arisen, most notably, the precarious financial status of most Indian newspapers, the lack of visible incentives for young Indians to pursue journalism as a career, and conflicts between the Indian press and politicians concerning the critical contents of the Indian newspapers. In this context, Wilson II and Gutierrez (1995: 189) argue that: 'Those Native American newspapers that appear to have had the greatest success have been the tribal newspapers that have an affiliation and receive a portion of their financial support from a specific tribe.' Summarising the evolution of 154 years of Native American journalism, James Murphy (1982: 59) notes: 'The history of the Indian press is the history of an uphill fight to fill otherwise unmet communication needs of Indian people.'
9.2.2 Aboriginal Movements’ Media Strategies

9.2.2.1 Protests against Negative Coverage

There is ample evidence from a number of societies that media organisations are often the target of the vehement criticisms by indigenous movements on account of the perceived bias and stereotypicality of their coverage.

In Taiwan, many cases can be found of aboriginal movement organisations, especially the Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines (ATA), and indigenous communities having launched campaigns against mainstream media’s coverage. For example, in Nov. 1987, the ATA organised a protest against the Taiwan Television Enterprise for its soap comedy which portrayed one Atayal old woman selling her daughter into prostitution and distorted the tribe’s habits and customs. As a result, the organisers won an apology from the programme producer and correction notices in advertising slots. More recently, in December 1993, residents of Fuhsing aboriginal township went to Taipei to protest against the Jade Biweekly’s coverage of child prostitutes in the area. The sub-headline reads:

The men in Fuhsing township marry their wives who are trash and whom others are tired of fucking. The mothers of Fuhsing township not only lament the loss of their fledgling daughters but have also been upset about the background of their daughters-in-law.

The three busloads of Fuhsing residents who participated in the protest finally made a private agreement with the Jade Biweekly not to file a lawsuit against the magazine on three conditions: 1.) that an apology notice be published in the magazine and other big newspapers, such as the United Daily News and the China Times; 2.) that the magazine donate one month’s revenues to the ‘Help Child Prostitutes

---

4 There are many popular tabloid magazines in Taiwan that are notorious for its sensational coverage of sex, violence and crimes. Their purpose for doing this is nothing but profit-making. It is not surprising to see many of these magazines are sued for defamation and libel.
Chapter 9  Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements

Foundation"; 3.) that it undertakes to cover more positive news relating to indigenous peoples.6

The two examples suggest that in Taiwan, direct protests against mainstream media coverage are both effective and successful. In addition to applying pressure on mainstream media to discontinue negative reporting, mainstream media are often crucial to the success of an aboriginal movement’s cause simply by covering it.

9.2.2.2 Attracting Mainstream Media Coverage

As with other minority movements, aboriginal movements have strategies to attract mainstream media attention, and they are often very effective in capturing coverage, be it favorable or negative. As Julian Burger (1987: 44-61) argues, as more and more indigenous and tribal peoples have brought their cases to international fora and more non-governmental organisations have been established, their demands have become more visible and their struggles can no longer be considered marginal to the main concerns of governments and, more generally, mankind.7

Keith (1995: 17) observes that although not all Native Americans were supporters of the American Indian Movement (AIM)’s aggressive tactics and policies, ‘they did contribute significantly to a growing appreciation by Native Americans of the power of the media.’ He points particularly to AIM’s seizure of Wounded Knee, South Dakota, in 1972, which ‘marked the high tide of the most remarkable period of activism carried out by Indians in the 20th century,’8 as an example highlighting the

---

6 These three conditions are based upon my interviews with the editorial writer of Jade Biweekly (No. 38/M/55/HC), and aboriginal protesters (No.39/M/42/IP) and (No.40/M/40s/IP). (See Appendix 5.1).

7 Julian Burger (1987: 44-49) singles out tropical rainforests, hydro-electric projects, mineral resources and tourism as the major issues facing indigenous movements today. The non-governmental organisations referred to are the World Council of Indigenous Peoples (WCIP, established in 1975); the International Indian Treaty Council (IITC, in 1974) and Working Group on Indigenous Populations (WGIP, in 1982).

8 Cited from the Salt Lake Tribune, Aug. 25, 1996 by Mark Trahant through Native-L E-mail channel. This description was cited by Trahant from Like a Hurricane: the Indian Movement from Alcatraz to Wounded Knee by Paul Chatt Smith and Robert Allen Warrior.
importance of the media in publicising their cause. In this incident the media were used to 'dramatise the situation, raised Native American awareness of the potency of television and radio' (Ibid.: 18). He elaborates on the relationship between AIM and the media in this way:

The media (television in particular) were an integral part of AIM's strategy to expose to the world what it perceived to be gross injustice against its people. Broadcasting was a key player in launching its movement. Clearly indebted to the examples established by the campus and Black militants who had preceded them, the red militants used media to maintain enthusiasm and popular support....Events were staged as much for their media potential as for their significance to the issues (Keith, 1995: 18).

Keith (Ibid.: 19) cites the takeover of Alcatraz in 1969⁹ as another example to show that media, especially the radio 'could leap barriers and roadblocks and reach the ears and hearts of the public.' He quoted Ray Cook, executive director of the Indigenous Communications Association, as saying that: 'This impressed Natives everywhere, and it definitely got people thinking about having their own broadcast facilities. Alcatraz was a turning point in Indian self-determination. It was the point of conception for Nationalist Native broadcasting' (emphasis mine).

In this case, 'AIM helped create the environment in which Native electronic media could happen. It brought about the reawakening that was necessary for this step to be possible,' observes national AIM leader Vernon Bellecourt (emphasis mine).¹⁰ Therefore, aboriginal movement actions not only attract mainstream media

---

⁹ The takeover of Alcatraz in 1969 was a very significant event in the 'Red Power Movement'. The Indians took possession of the island in the name of all American Indians. They issued a proclamation reclaiming the island by right of discovery and offered the United States $ 24 in beads and trade cloth for it. This proclamation and dozens of other statements by those occupying the island were broadcast via Pacific station KPFA-FM in Berkeley between November 1969 and June 1971. The station loaned the Indians on the island a Marti transmitter to send their message to the station, which then broadcast it live to listeners in the Bay Area. 'Radio Free Alcatraz', as it was called, focused on the impoverished state of Indian affairs, demanding that attention be paid to Indian health, education, and cultural issues (See Keith, 1995: 19).

attention, they can also raise Native Americans’ awareness of the need to possess their own media.

Many scholars have found that the way the news media represent a social movement can affect its ability to mobilise members, to construct a viable public identity, or to build a public policy agenda. Barker-Plummer (1995: 315), for example, examines the interaction between the women’s movement and the media and suggests that the two branches of the women’s movement, the ‘older’ and ‘younger’, understood news differently and developed quite different strategies, *media pragmatism* and *media subversion*. The former refers to the ‘older’ women’s organisations’ supportive and friendly relations with the media. The latter refers to the younger branches’ antagonistic relations. However, these strategies are in turn related to the groups’ available sources, their media skills and their political identities.

If we follow Barker-Plummer’s distinction, we find that the media strategy of Taiwan’s aboriginal movements is characterised by *pragmatism*, in the sense that activists distribute news releases and hold news conferences in advance to disseminate news about movements and their major demands. According to Lawakao, a former president of ATA, there are three ways to gain access to the media. In the first place, the ATA writes a news release detailing the purpose, date, participants, routes and targets (usually central government ministries or the KMT headquarter in Taipei) of planned actions. Then it distributes the release to the news delivery centre, where there are pigeon boxes for the major media organisations in Taiwan, a few days before. Secondly, the ATA usually hold a press conference to publicise news about movement, the date and place having been given in the news release. Thirdly, the ATA, having established friendly relations with ‘participant journalists’ who have been covering Yuanchumin’s issues for a long time and are supportive of the movements, would fax news releases or any other important news to these journalists directly.

The content analysis findings lend further support to the argument that aboriginal movements are relatively effective in capturing media attention. We found that

---

11 From my correspondence with Lawakao in July 1996.

12 The news delivery centre is located on the ground floor of the Central News Agency Headquarter building in Taipei.
'indigenous movements and protests demanding aboriginal rights' was the most covered theme. Despite this attention however, the media have been criticised by aboriginal activists for paying relatively less attention to them than other movements, such as the anti-nuclear movement. Lawakao, for example, claims that: 'Aboriginal movements are weak compared with other social movements.' The famous aboriginal activist, Yichiang Paluerh (No.24/M/34/IP) concurred, saying that ‘Aboriginal issues are the weakest of all the social movement issues.'

Aboriginal movement criticisms of mainstream media can be summarised as follows:

1. TV pays less attention to aboriginal movements than newspapers—Lawakao.
2. Generally speaking, cable TV stations are not very keen to cover aboriginal movements—Lawakao.
3. Most media reports are merely descriptive. Very few offer in-depth analysis of the causes—Paluerh.

As this list suggests, both aboriginal movement leaders, Paluerh and Lawakao, claimed that, although the press has paid more attention to aboriginal movements in recent years, this attention is still less than that accorded other major social movements. They also felt that the broadcasting media paid less attention than the press in covering their movements and that most reports were decontextualised, detached from the socio-economic roots of aboriginal protests and movements. In addition, Chen Chao-zu (No.12/F/29/HC), a reporter from the Independent Morning Post, argued that there has been deliberate understatement in newspapers' reports on the sensitive and provocative demands of aboriginal land movements. In research on the aboriginal three 'land return' movements, she (1994a: 140-141) found that newspapers' interest of the third movement was the lowest as the target of aboriginal movements shifted to Han racism and aboriginal sovereignty from just a demand for their land rights.

However, contrary to the conspiracy arguments raised by the aboriginal leaders and by Chen above, a China Times reporter (No.7/F/34/HC) stressed that diminishing
Chapter 9  Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements

media attention is related to the decline of social movements themselves and should not be seen as deliberate suppression by media and journalists. Many Chinese reporters observed that after martial law was abolished, party politics became well-established in Taiwan, and many opposition parties were formally recognised by the state, especially the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP). They argued that since the 1990s, when Taiwan's democracy developed fully, many social movements, including aboriginal movements, have lost momentum now that there are alternative and legitimate channels to express grievances other than protests and demonstration on the streets. This has resulted in a decline in media coverage of aboriginal movements in recent years.

Though it is plausible to contend that, comparatively speaking, coverage of aboriginal movements and protests in recent years has become relatively less than before, particularly during the late 1980s when a variety of social movements emerged. The findings from the content analysis suggest that some commentators may be exaggerating this shift, since we found that political protests remain one of the most-covered themes in the sample and are very often accompanied with photos. Despite the difference of opinion between aboriginal activists and Chinese reporters, at least one thing is shared by them, that is, the more conflict and blood in the movement, the more media attention they will get.

9.3 Problems of Minority Access to the Media

As I have argued in the content analysis chapter, the fundamental problem in the relation between indigenous peoples and the news media in Taiwan lies not so much in misrepresentation as in the underrepresentation of minority journalists in mainstream media. Encouraging more aboriginal access to mainstream media assumes that it will improve their performance in covering aboriginal affairs.

Downing (1994: 36) observes: 'The presence or absence of members of ethnic minority groups in all echelons of the communications industry is not only vital in terms of employment justice, and is not only crucial in terms of non-racist and anti-racist
media representation and discourse, but is practically speaking pivotal to the proper future employment of members of ethnic minority groups.' This position is widely endorsed within minority communities. As Meadows (1992: 92-93) found from his interviews with Aboriginal media workers in Australia, his respondents all agreed that greater access to the media by Aborigines was very important to counter the perceived sensational reporting of Aboriginal issues.

However, research has revealed that although there has been some improvements in minority hiring in mainstream media, the present situation is still far from ideal in terms of minority access. Criticisms revolve around two dimensions: one is the continuing underrepresentation of minority journalists in the media, the other is their lack of decision-making power within news organisation (Corea, 1995: 360; Henningham, 1992: 160; Jakubowicz et al., 1994: 147; Ngui et al., 1994: 78-79; Van Dijk, 1991: 15; Wilson II and Gutierrez, 1985: 166-167); 1995: 212).

Wilson II and Gutierrez have recently updated their pioneering research on U.S. minorities and mainstream media in their book Race, Multiculturalism and the Media, in which they (1995: 204-205) argue that: 'It is important to note that the 1990 U.S. Census Bureau data showed that people of color comprised about 25% of the nation’s population and the number was growing rapidly. Against that criteria none of the news media industries has achieved statistical parity in minority hiring.' Downing (1994: 22-23) adds that according to a 1990 national survey commissioned by ANPA (American Newspaper Publishers’ Association), ethnic minorities composed 18% of the newspaper industry workforce, but that the largest percentage (25%) was in circulation and the smallest in news/editorial (10%).

Wilson II and Gutierrez (1995: 203-204) further conclude that daily newspapers, which unlike broadcasting media are not subject to specific licensing and regulatory oversight, are the most grudging employers of people of colour. They also offer a revealing insight into the composition of minority employment in different media sectors (see Table 9.1).

---

13 For more detailed statistics of minority employment in US media, see Downing, 1994.
### Table 9.1


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Newspapers</th>
<th></th>
<th>Radio</th>
<th></th>
<th>Television</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blacks</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latinos</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asians</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Americans</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Unit: percentage

Table 9.1 shows that of the four major U.S. minority groups, Native Americans were least represented in white-owned media, accounting for only 3% of all non-white employees in both mainstream newspapers and television in 1992. However, Jakubowicz et al. (1994: 143) offer a rather more positive picture from Australia, arguing that the ABC (Australian Broadcasting Corp.) and the SBS (Special Broadcasting Service) are bound by section 22B of the Public Service Act to adopt equal employment practice and that both stations have responded by establishing units related to aboriginal programming, hiring and training. Jakubowicz goes on to compare the roles of US, UK and Australia governments in dealing with ethnic minority media in this way:

If the US reflects a media policy situation where government stands back almost completely from engagement with the media on behalf of minorities or in pursuit of a socially just multicultural society (in part as a consequence of the First Amendment to the Constitution, which guarantees free speech), and Britain reflects a policy situation where government acts on the margins but leaves the market and the industries to control the mainstream situation, Australia can be said to have developed a far more interventionist (and many would argue successful) multicultural media strategy (Jakubowicz, 1995: 177).
However, despite the gains in the numbers of aboriginal journalists employed, Jakubowicz et al. still express concern over their power and relative positions within the ABC and SBS. They write:

Staff from Aboriginal and non-English-speaking backgrounds emphasise the fact that while some positive steps have been taken towards increasing staff from non-Anglo backgrounds at SBS and ABC television, most of these positions are on-screen journalistic and non-management. While this increase in on-screen representation is commendable since it visibly reflects the pluralistic nature of Australian society, there is also a real need for better representation of people from non-Anglo backgrounds in areas where they can have a direct influence in determining programme content. Upper management of both ABC and SBS television remains firmly in the control of Anglo-Australian men, and there are still very few people of non-English-speaking background who have any real decision-making power in management positions (Jakubowicz et al., 1994: 157).

What is at issue then in terms of minority access to the media is not only related to the absolute dearth of minority employment but to their relatively powerless positions within the hierarchical structures of media organisations. In addition to these two major problems of aboriginal employment in mainstream media, other criticisms are:

1. ‘As a representative of the white power structure, it (the press) has consistently limited the access, both as to hiring, promotion, or points of view, of ethnic groups’ (Van Dijk, 1991: 20-21).
2. ‘Minority journalists lament the newsroom atmosphere that forces them to see their profession from a White perspective. They complain that colleagues and superiors, not overly racist but insensitive or ignorant, evaluate their performance on culturally biased news criteria. To focus too heavily on minority-related issues jeopardize peer esteem, and work on such issues rarely results in the kind of recognition that leads to promotion’ (Wilson II and Gutierrez, 1995: 146).
3. 1.) Newsroom managers are not committed to retaining or promoting Black journalists.
   2.) Black journalists spend longer than non-Black journalist in entry-level positions.
3.) Black journalists are not kept informed, as non-Black journalists are, about seminars and other opportunities to advance their careers. (Corea, 1995: 349)

Wilson II and Gutierrez conclude with this comment on minority access:

The slow rate of news media integration- with little penetration into power management levels- is a precursor to non-White attrition in the workforce. Meanwhile, journalists of color are leaving the profession over the lack of inclusiveness of perspective in news coverage and charging their superiors with a lack of respect for their skills, Predictably, the result is media product that continues to distort the reality of the United States' multiracial society (1995: 212).

As for indigenous employment within the mainstream press in Taiwan, I have already illustrated the notion of underrepresentation in the content analysis chapter, in which I argued that virtually none of the news was written by indigenous authors. Furthermore, I go on to argue that compared with western countries, where it is not uncommon to see minority staff in a range of jobs in the media, Taiwan has hardly begun to tackle the issue, so that the fundamental problem of indigenous access still remains one of basic underrepresentation, and the virtual absence of indigenous journalists working in Han Chinese media. As we noted earlier, this argument has been strongly supported by a recent survey conducted by Lo Ven-hwei in 1994, in which he found that only 4 respondents described themselves as indigenous in his questionnaire sample of 1,003 Taiwanese journalists.  

---

14 See Chapter 7 of this thesis.
9.4 Indigenous Press in Taiwan

In Taiwan, the development of the indigenous press parallels the emergence of minority media in the US. It was emerged in specific historical circumstances and was greatly stimulated by the rise of indigenous movements. However, it was not until the late 1980s when Taiwan underwent unprecedented political and cultural liberalisation that it gained some degree of momentum. Prior to the abolition of martial law in 1987, there were sporadic indigenous publications, mostly infrequent in publication and low in circulation, with a few being subsidised by the government.

9.4.1 The Indigenous Press before 1987

*Aboriginal Culture (1986-1990)*

Before 1987, a number of newspapers and journals were distributed mainly for aboriginal readers, some subsidised by government and some founded by indigenous activists and intellectuals. The earliest title is probably *Aboriginal Culture*, whose first issue dates back to the 1950s. It was a project of the Taiwan Provincial Government (TPG) to propagandise aboriginal policy and administrative measures. Then there was a long gap until 1986 when the Taiwan Aboriginal Mountain Construction Association was asked by the TPG to run the paper. Since then it has been reorganised into a bimonthly format with Hua Chia-chih, the president of the Association and then Taiwan provincial assemblyman and a (cabinet) member of TPG, as the publisher.\(^\text{15}\) Due to Hua's personal influence, *Aboriginal Culture* has been successful in acquiring subsidy from the TPG.

The editor, Danaifu Chingzo (No.2/M/37/IP) claimed in interview that although it took government funding, it managed to publish news that Yuanchumin want to read in the areas of aboriginal rights, culture and urban welfare as well as fulfilling the propaganda mission assigned to it by the TPG. The funding was just enough to pay the production costs and the editor's salary. Among the 2,000 copies printed, about 500

\(^{15}\) In 1996, Hua (Paiwan tribe), a long-time KMT member and a senior aboriginal politician, was appointed as the Chairman of the newly-established Taiwan Yuanchumin Commission.
were sent to paid subscribers, and a further 700 were sent free of charge to aboriginal representatives, teachers, civil servants (in the 30 aboriginal township offices), priests, and other opinion leaders in aboriginal communities. The other 800 were distributed to participants at meetings and conferences concerning aboriginal affairs organised by the Association or the TPG. After producing 23 issues however, *Aboriginal Culture* ceased publication in 1990 when Hua had to resign both posts as the President of the Association and a member of TPG, due to the fact that he was elected as the member of the Legislative Yuan (MP) in the central government.

Chingzo, who was later invited by Hua to be his assistant in the Legislature, said that the major reason behind the closure of this bimonthly was financial. He added that apart from the government subsidy, the title had almost no other sources of money. As a civic organisation, the Association was not able to generate funds to support the magazine, a situation exacerbated by the small base of paid subscribers and the free copy distribution pattern. The other problem, he explained, was that there had always had the lack of writing to print. Since *Aboriginal Culture* had long been labelled as a government's mouthpiece by aboriginal intellectuals and activists, who were, in turn, the major critical and productive writers, they would not contribute to the magazine. However, he added that the enthusiasm of an aboriginal politician in running the magazine is one important element that may lead to a resumption of publication in the future. This depends on the personal interest of the new president of the Association, Li Wen-lai, who, like his predecessor, is also a member of the TPG. However, to date *Aboriginal Culture* has not resumed publication.

*Lanyu Biweekly (1979- )*

The opening issue of *Lanyu Biweekly* appeared in 1979 on the southeastern off-shore island of Lanyu (or Orchid Island), which is mainly inhabited by the Yami tribe. The publisher and founder, Lin Mao-an, who is a Han Chinese and, originally, a physician by profession, said this is a magazine for Yami people aiming to maintain and strengthen communication for those living in Taiwan and Lanyu. It is mainly distributed on Lanyu, but is also sent to about 600 Yami readers scattered across Taiwan island.
Since 1979 it has been running at about 1,500 copies, except in 1989 when it suspended publication for the entire year.\(^{16}\)

**Evergreen Mountain (1983-1987)**

The first indigenous newspaper established by and for Yuanchumin was the *Evergreen Mountain*, which began appearing in 1983 in a tabloid format. It was established by Evan Yukan who was then a university student.\(^ {17}\) Hsieh (1987: 155) notes that the purpose of this tabloid was two-fold; one was to raise public awareness of the fact that aboriginal people were facing a major crisis of genocide. The other was to promote an aboriginal self-awakening movement. Aiming to uncover the failures of the KMT's aboriginal policies, this university underground tabloid won widespread recognition as the first dissident newspaper of the emerging aboriginal movement. Its radical rhetoric and vehement criticism made a tremendous impact in the beginning, even though it was circulated mainly on university campuses.\(^ {18}\)

Yichiang Paleurh (No.24/M/34/IP), a prominent young aboriginal movement leader\(^ {19}\), who was editor of the *Evergreen Mountain*, noted that between 1983 and 1987, it only published 7 issues. The first ran to only 500 copies, though circulation did increase a bit later. It folded because Lin went to Japan for advanced study and did not find a successor to take it over.

---


\(^{17}\) Evan Yukan (from the Atayal tribe) is one of the leaders of the aboriginal movement. When he established the *Evergreen Mountain* in 1983, he was studying at Taiwan University.


\(^{19}\) Paleurh graduated from the Political Science Department of Taiwan University. He has served as President of the Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines for two terms and is now working as an executive officer of Aboriginal Commission in the Democratic Progressive Party.
Other Indigenous journals

Apart from the three titles noted above, other indigenous journals emerged in the period prior to the abolition of martial law. In the wake of the establishment of the Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines (ATA) in 1984, the organisation published Sanyaisan and Yuanchumin in 1985 to promote its platform. Yichiang Paleurh, who was responsible for editing issues 4-10 of Yuanchumin during his incumbency as president of ATA, said that only one issue of Sanyaisan was published and they then renamed it Yuanchumin, and produced a total of 12 issues in the decade following the establishment of ATA. He added that the publication largely depended on the continuing interest and willingness of the head of ATA. Yuanchumin, which was circulated among ATA members and Han activists, was discontinued in 1992.

Sun (1996: 101) noted that the coverage of the early ATA's papers run the whole gamut of aboriginal issues, including culture, education, media, names, labor, fishermen, language, prostitutes, nuclear waste, alcoholic, land, economy, regional autonomy, aboriginal administration, racism, and urban aborigines. He argued that this inclusiveness is indicative of the rise of pan-aboriginalism in Taiwan in the 1980s.

During this period, the 30 aboriginal township offices also occasionally published their own organs for the people in their particular township. Understandably these are mainly propaganda sheets either publicising the government's aboriginal policy or serving to promote township leaders, who acquire their positions through an electoral process. In addition, there have been a few religious newspapers and journals such as Aboriginal Youth Forum (1986-1987) for missionary and other purposes published mainly by the Presbyterian and Catholic churches.

Even from this brief overview, it is evident that most of the papers published before 1987 were shoestring operations. They were in simplified printing format, short-lived, infrequent in publication and insignificant in circulation. Apart from the Lanyu Biweekly, all the indigenous papers discussed so far have ceased publication.

---

20 None of the indigenous press owns typesetting and printing facilities. It is often the case that after proofreading, editing and designing layouts, the editor, usually the publisher himself, gave it to printing houses for typing and printing.
9.4.2 Taiwan’s Indigenous Press Today: Formation, Management and Predicament

As I argued in Chapter 4, the political liberalisation and cultural transformation that followed in the wake of the abolition of martial law, breathed new life into the mainstream press industry. It also provided an incentive for the indigenous press to grow. After 1987, with the rise of Taiwanisation and nativisation in the political and cultural arenas, increasing attention has been paid to aboriginal problems, policy and legislation as well as indigenous culture and arts. Mainstream media, as I have argued, have had to adjust their management and editorial policies to swim with the tides brought forth by greater democratisation in domestic politics and the rising force of civil society, social movements and consumerism. In this new political and social environment, more efforts have been undertaken by the government to reinvigorate aboriginal policies and legislations. The cultural industries, especially the media and bookpublishing, have also offered more time and space to aboriginal news and to reviews and writings by aboriginal authors. Not surprisingly, this increasing vibrant cultural field has strengthened the determination of aboriginal intellectuals to establish their own news media.

In the decade after the ending of martial law, a number of indigenous papers emerged in the market place, but many did not last long due to formidable financial problems. This difficulty is not unique to Taiwan. Demay (1993: 90) describes the havoc wreaked on Canada’s aboriginal newspapers by the federal government’s cancellation of the Native Communications Programme in 1990 in this way: ‘The first element which strikes any observer of the Aboriginal press is the precariousness of its financial situation. While talking with the editors across the country, the word “desperate” comes back again and again like a death chant.’ In my experience of conducting fieldwork interviews, this ‘death chant’ was also ringing in the heads of indigenous publishers in Taiwan.

In addition to community newsletters and papers run by churches, religious organisations and aboriginal associations, the major periodicals, which are still in

---

21 For a discussion of Taiwanisation and nativisation, see Chapter 4.
existence, are the *Indigenous Post* (founded in 1989) and the *Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly* (founded in 1993). Although *Hunter's Culture* folded in 1992, it is still worthy of a note since it was one of the important journals in the post 1987 period. The following discussion explores the motives and difficulties of indigenous journalists in running their magazines, as well as the contents, management, production and distribution of these journals.

9.4.2.1 The Indigenous Post (1989- )

Three major aims were printed under the editorial logo on the early issues of the *Indigenous Post*. They are: first, to seek for the true face of Taiwan’s history; second, to re-establish pride in Yuanchumin; and third, to support multiculturalism. Established in Pingtung, a southern city, in November 1989, it was the brainchild of four young and aboriginal intellectuals, Taipang Sasaler (then a university graduate), Le Shih (a computer worker), Lin Min-ter and Walis Yukan (both primary school teachers).

*Indigenous Post* is a black and white newspaper with a changeable format ranging from two big sheets of eight pages to a tabloid size of 28 pages. However, more recently, it used coloured cover as will be shown in Figure 9.1 later. Sometimes two issues are published together. It carries extensive coverage of aboriginal news, ranging across all subjects. However, news of political, cultural and social problems stand out as the areas most focused on. Advocating the protection of aboriginal rights, promoting the causes of aboriginal movements and reclaiming aboriginal status in Taiwan’s history are major themes. Many of the stories and reports are written by the four founders though some are from outside contributors. Other minority and indigenous items from foreign countries are also printed occasionally. They are either reviews by contributors or direct copies from other mainstream newspapers and journals.

Table 9.2 shows that the publication frequency of the *Indigenous Post* is irregular. By the end of 1994, 25 issues had been published, though 14 of these were printed in 1992 and 1993.
Table 9.2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>No. of Issues</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>2-6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>8-14</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>15-21</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>22-25</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


As an aboriginal movement organ, the paper underwent a major shift in 1992 when Sasaler, the editor, decided to return to his hometown, Haochao village in Pingtung, and to publish the paper from there. As he explained (No. 17/M/29/IP):

Tribal support for the aboriginal movement has always had problems. No matter what it is, mobilisation for movement or the result of elections, we have always shouted in a loud voice and advocated excellent political ideas, but problem is that tribal people can not accept all of them. In my personal view, it is because the power and tendrils of the aboriginal movements have not extended to the tribal villages or grasped the pulse of hometown. 22

Sasaler characterised his decision as an instance of ‘tribalism’, whereby aboriginal intellectuals are urged to go back to their hometown ‘to revitalise tribes and to rebuild hometowns’ and ‘to live with tribal folks.’ He said: ‘What we are doing now is to let tribal people support the paper and change it into a community journal.... Change it from a market-oriented journal into a community and movement journal.’

Other indigenous intellectuals however disagree over the value of tribalism. For example, Sun Ta-chuan (No.4/M/42/IP), the editor of the *Taiwan Indigenous Voice*  

22 It has to be noted here that most aboriginal mobilisations, since their targets are mostly the (central) government, take place in Taipei, the capital city, not in the villages.
Bimonthly, contends that returning to tribal hometowns to run the paper doesn’t necessarily mean that it will get any closer to the voice and needs of tribal people.\textsuperscript{23} Even one of the co-founders of the Indigenous Post, Lin Min-ter (No.16/M/37/IP) is suspicious of tribalism, arguing: ‘It is not an exaggeration to say that the indigenous press has no conditions for survival. Although the Indigenous Post is now developing in tribal villages, it still needs support from mainstream society.’

In addition, the paper has been accused by aboriginal politicians and local church leaders of being too provocative and harsh in its criticisms of government policies, although most of its reports have covered them in a favorable light. Sasaler claims that these attacks are politically motivated:

> The most critical are civil servants, because they are local interest blocs and a group in favor of the status quo. After we went back [tribal hometown], it may well be said that we have stolen their words. On the other hand, this has also had some impact on their interests. The rhetorics, speeches, which they used to educate people, and our rhetoric and ideas,...they will compare, village people will compare and tribal people will compare. (.) [People will say] oh, my God! We are cheated by these civil servants.

In his view, in running the Indigenous Post, Sasaler is not simply producing a newspaper. It is part of a social movement and a matter of gathering together a few comrades who have the same ideals. The social causes advocated by the paper include the rebuilding of the old Haocha village\textsuperscript{24} and rescuing the ‘twin ghost lakes’ from pollution. More recently, Sasaler has been opposing the planned construction of an hydro-electric dam near his village. But the village people whom he has lived with are not particularly supportive of his initiatives. Due to disagreements over ‘tribalism’ and other reasons, the original founding ‘gang of four’ broke up,\textsuperscript{25} leaving Sasaler to fight a lone struggle for tribalism and to run the paper like an aboriginal Don Quixote.

The Indigenous Post prints about 2,000 copies per issue. A quarter of these are sent to paid subscribers. The others are given away as free copies. Of the paid


\textsuperscript{24} Old Haocha village is the original hometown of the Rukai tribe in Pingtung county.

\textsuperscript{25} Walis Yukan established the Hunter’s Culture in 1990 and Lin Min-ter established the Australian News in 1995. Both are full-time primary school teachers but also engage themselves in journalism.
subscribers, three fifths are Han Chinese and the rest are indigenous readers. The free copies are distributed to as many tribal people as possible. Altogether, its readership includes: aboriginal intellectuals, activists, school teachers, civil servants, church leaders and other Han Chinese who are concerned about aboriginal movements and problems.

With the small subscriber base and virtual absence of advertising income, it is not surprising the paper finds itself in financial difficulties. The major source of income comes from readers' donations and the meager subscription fees. But these are barely enough to cover production costs, such as typing, printing, layout, and postage. With nothing left to pay Sasaler a salary, or to meet rent, water and electricity bills. Talking about his experiences, Sasaler notes, somewhat sarcastically, that he has sacrificed the income a man in his 30s would reasonably expect to earn. He has been able to keep on running the paper because he said, rather jokingly, that he is still single without family burdens.

9.4.2.2 Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly (1993- )

Unlike the Indigenous Post, which presents itself as an aboriginal movement paper, the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly (TIVB) is a comprehensive, coloured journal renowned for good quality paper, layout, printing and contents. The five eye-catching words that appear under the nameplate—'indigenous, literary, artistic, cultural and worldly'—clearly announces its style and character. Sun Ta-chuan (NoANMAP), the editor-in-chief, is the prime mover behind the journal. From the Puyuma tribe, he is now a lecturer in the Department of Philosophy at Soochow University in Taipei. He explains that his motive in founding the magazine was to 'consolidate the existence of indigenous cultures' which, he thinks, is part and parcel of 'cultural accumulation'.

For Sun, it would be impossible to run the magazine without support from outside. It is, in effect, published in the name of the Taiwan Yuanchumin Cultural

---

26 The total cost for typing, printing, layout and postage, according to Sasaler, is approximately 40,000 New Taiwan dollars, around 900 pounds.
Development Association, whose President is Hua Chia-chih discussed earlier, now the highest ranking aboriginal politician in Taiwan. When the Association was established in 1992, Sun was appointed by Hua as the Secretary. Given the routine practices of the government, it is easier to apply for financial support to start up a magazine if the application is made in the name of the Association rather than the magazine. This is the reason why the magazine has been published in the name of the Association from its first publication in 1993. However, Sun stressed that neither the Association nor any aboriginal politicians has ever interfered in the running of the magazine.

In contrast to the other indigenous journals, the Taipei-based TIVB carries advertising pages and coloured covers as well as pictures. Most importantly, it is the only indigenous journal sold in the mainstream market, though its outlets are confined to major bookstores near universities and book fairs, rather than small newsstands. Like Aboriginal Culture above, it pays to contributors if their writings are printed and, to Sun, it is never short of articles to fill in the 150-200 pages. He said: 'There are many contributors. Some of the contributions are sent from foreign countries. We have very strong capabilities of inviting contributions.'

However, the contents have attracted criticisms from aboriginal journalists and intellectuals. Some have charged that most of the contributors are Han Chinese scholars, writers, intellectuals, culture critics, anthropologists, and media workers, although their articles are mainly concerned with aboriginal rights, culture, literature, history and even indigenous struggles in other countries. Others have accused it of lack of radicalism and of lukewarm support for aboriginal movements. Walis Yukan, the founder of the Hunter's Culture and a well-known aboriginal writer, observed: 'With more and more Han Chinese writings in the magazine, TIVB has become a very important indigenous journal. Han Chinese scholars have won recognition for their

---

27 In general, aboriginal administration sections at various levels of government set aside a budget for supporting aboriginal associations in promoting cultural and artistic activities, but no such budgeting is earmarked for the indigenous press.

28 According to my interview with Sun in October 1994, Han Chinese and aboriginal contributors were approximately in a ratio of 7:3. He hoped that it would become 6:4 next year and reach at least 5:5 in the future.
research Yuanchumin through the publication of their writings in the TIVB, thus they can prove their understanding of the people. This is not good. He saw it as confirming a ‘top-down’ view:

Because its contents are too deep, we don’t have to fancy that it will spread out to tribal villages. This can be imagined. Besides, it has been academised and is not a common and popular product anymore. Therefore, it has distanced itself further from the authentic dimension of Yuanchumin.

Sasaler also had criticisms but his charges focused more on its editorial position. ‘If it wants to survive, its criticism cannot be too harsh and radical. It has to cooperate with the ruling party, no matter which party is going to rule in the future.’

In response to these criticisms, Sun argued that considering the instability of its financial conditions and dearth of aboriginal contributions, inviting Han Chinese scholars to write for the magazine has always been part of his original plans. He added:

At the moment when the subject discourse of Yuanchumin concerning their own society and culture is not mature yet, it is not an unworthy task to borrow Han Chinese current discourse achievements to help us ponder our own ethnic problems. 

However, the plethora of cultural critiques and reviews has worried Sun and prompted him to encourage more works of literature and less of cultural commentary. In addition, he hoped to encourage more aboriginal writers to write critiques and reviews in the coming issues.

The TIVB is almost certainly the best organised indigenous journal. It has 4 salaried staff workers and two volunteers, both of whom work for Hua and his Association and receive salaries from the Legislative Yuan. They hold the position of treasurer and executive secretary of the magazine. There are also two other voluntary workers, who were Sun’s students at university. Even with this work force, Sun still feels that they are barely keeping their heads above water. He complained that after publication of the first issue in Nov. 1993, the Association to which the magazine

belongs, has shown no interest to the magazine, leaving him to fight for its survival alone. Apart from writing and editing, he undertook all the responsibilities of marketing and management as well as seeking investment from interested advertisers and holding fundraising activities. He explained his problems in this way:

I think financial funding is not the major problem. The most fundamental problem is because our representatives and those who are in charge of aboriginal affairs are not so serious or determined to carry out the cultural task. They merely give a lip service. This is the biggest problem and obstacle I have faced since last year.

Given that advertisers are not particularly attractive to the indigenous press in view of its small readership, it is not surprising that the TIVB receives very limited advertising support. Table 9.3 shows the number of advertisements and their location, size, colour and together with the total pagination for each issue from vol. 1-12 (Nov. 1993-Feb. 1996).

From Table 9.3, it is clear that even the best indigenous journal attracts no more than six advertisements in an average issue size of 161 pages.30 As we can also see, most of the ads. were printed as one whole page, and that advertising only occupies an average of 3.75 pages per issue. The logic of a market economy dictates that less advertisements means less revenues. It is therefore not hard to imagine the severity of the TIVB’s financial difficulties, although Sun tried to play down the issue from his extract above.

In terms of location, 26 ads. appeared on cover pages, slightly more than half of the total. Seven were on the inside front cover (IFC), 10 on the inside back cover (IBC), and 9 on the outside back cover (OBC). These pages are all coloured and prominent. Even so, according to Chingzo (No.2/M/37/IP), the former editor of Aboriginal Culture and now executive secretary of the TIVB, revenues from ads. on these pages only cover about a quarter of production costs, and returns on the

30 The total pagination of the magazine from vol. 1-12 is 1,933 pages. When divided by 12, the result is 161.08.
average of only 2-3 ads. on inside pages fall somewhere short of meeting the remaining balance.\textsuperscript{31}

Table 9.3
Advertising in the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly, Vol. 1-12
(Nov. 1993-Feb. 1996)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Issue (volume)</th>
<th>No. of advertisements</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Size</th>
<th>Colour</th>
<th>Total Pages of the issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1                     | 3                     | 1) IFC  
2) IBC  
3) OBC  | 1) whole page  
2) whole page  
3) whole page | 1) colour  
2) colour  
3) colour | 156         |
| 2                     | 5                     | 1) IFC  
2) Page 2  
3) Page 46  
4) IBC  
5) OBC  | 1) whole page  
2) whole page  
3) whole page  
4) whole page  
5) whole page | 1) colour  
2) b&w  
3) b&w  
4) colour  
5) colour | 162         |
| 3                     | 5                     | 1) IFC  
2) Page 61  
3) Page 177  
4) IBC  
5) OBC  | 1) whole page  
2) whole page  
3) half page  
4) whole page  
5) whole page | 1) colour  
2) b&w  
3) b&w  
4) colour  
5) colour | 194         |
| 4                     | 6                     | 1) IFC  
2) Page 49  
3) Page 82  
4) Page 145  
5) IBC  
6) OBC  | 1) whole page  
2) whole page  
3) whole page  
4) whole page  
5) whole page  
6) whole page | 1) colour  
2) b&w  
3) b&w  
4) b&w  
5) colour  
6) colour | 172         |
| 5                     | 3                     | 1) Page 138  
2) IBC  
3) OBC  | 1) whole page  
2) whole page  
3) whole page | 1) b&w  
2) colour  
3) colour | 162         |

\textsuperscript{31} According to Chingzo, the total production cost per issue is about 400,000 New Taiwan dollars (approximately 9,000 pounds). The net income from the three cover pages is about 110,000 dollars.
### Chapter 9

**Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements**

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1) IFC</td>
<td>1) whole page</td>
<td>1) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2) Page 104-105</td>
<td>2) two pages</td>
<td>2) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) Page 111</td>
<td>3) whole page</td>
<td>3) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1) IFC</td>
<td>1) whole page</td>
<td>1) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2) Page 52</td>
<td>2) whole page</td>
<td>2) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) Page 59</td>
<td>3) whole page</td>
<td>3) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4) Page 67</td>
<td>4) whole page</td>
<td>4) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5) IBC</td>
<td>5) whole page</td>
<td>5) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6) OBC</td>
<td>6) whole page</td>
<td>6) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1) IFC</td>
<td>1) whole page</td>
<td>1) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2) Page 67</td>
<td>2) half page</td>
<td>2) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) Page 168</td>
<td>3) whole page</td>
<td>3) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4) IBC</td>
<td>4) whole page</td>
<td>4) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5) OBC</td>
<td>5) whole page</td>
<td>5) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1) Page 5</td>
<td>1) whole page</td>
<td>1) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2) IBC</td>
<td>2) whole page</td>
<td>2) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) OBC</td>
<td>3) whole page</td>
<td>3) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1) OBC</td>
<td>1) whole page</td>
<td>1) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1) Page 75</td>
<td>1) half page</td>
<td>1) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2) Page 152 and IBC</td>
<td>2) two pages</td>
<td>2) b&amp;w; colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1) Page 90</td>
<td>1) whole page</td>
<td>1) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2) Page 126</td>
<td>2) whole page</td>
<td>2) b&amp;w</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3) IBC</td>
<td>3) whole page</td>
<td>3) colour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:**

1. **IFC:** inside front cover; **IBC:** inside back cover; **OBC:** outside back cover; b&w: black and white.
2. In the vol. 6 and 11, ‘two pages’ means one advertisement spreads across two pages. Thus it is still counted as one advertisement.

Moreover, the situation has worsened recently. To take a closer look, in the six issues, vol. 1-4 and 7-8, every issue had the cover ad., IFC, IBC, and OBC and other ad. inside the pages. From issue no. 9, no ad. appeared on the IFC and the issue no. 10 carried only one ad. on the OBC. Not only has the location of the ad. become less...
prominent (or profitable), the number of ad. has also decreased. In an attempt to reverse this trend, from the issue no. 9 until 11, the magazine ran a page promoting sales and seeking more subscribers. It reads:

Hoist up our own stage. Taiwan has 21,000,000 people. Taiwan’s Yuanchumin number 340,000. Taiwan has over 1,000 different kinds of magazines. There is only one Indigenous Cultural magazine-Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly. TIVB has only 700 subscribers. TIVB swears that it will accompany Yuanchumin to walk through year the 2,000. This swearing and hope need your assistance. Subscribe to the ‘Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly’ magazine. Build a stage of your own. Please act immediately.32

It prints 3,000 copies sold at 200 NT dollars (less than five pounds) per issue. According to Sun, to make ends meet, the magazine needs 2,300 subscribers (1,600 more than it has at present). With an inadequate subscriber base and meager advertising income, it is continually in a very fragile financial situation. This has seriously affected the periodicity of publication for the recent series, in spite of its insistence on a bimonthly format. Both issues–no. 11 and 12–were badly overdue. The former, which was supposed to appear in July 1995, did not come out until January 1996, and the latter, which was due in September 1995, did not reach subscribers until February 1996.

It is also interesting to note that of the 45 ads. printed in issues 1-12, 47 % were placed by government organisations or state-run enterprises, more or less related with aboriginal affairs. They include: the Taiwan Aboriginal Cultural Village (5 ads.), the National Park Administration Office (3), the Tourism Bureau (2), the Department of Agriculture and Forestry (2), China Petroleum (2), and 7 others which placed the magazine one ad. each. By means of buying advertising pages, the government has indirectly supported the magazine.

Among the ads. placed by private clients, the Contemporary cultural magazine had the most (5 ads.), followed by the Re-Shi Workshop (3), the Shung Ye Museum of Formosa Aborigines (2), the Human and Educational Foundation (2), the New Idea

32 The block letters correspond to the block type in the ad.
Corp.(2) and 10 other private accounts which bought one ad. each. However, it has to be stressed that, some of these ads. may be free of charge. For example, the Contemporary, a well-reputed cultural magazine, has been supportive of the new entrant–TIVB–in the magazine industry. As the Contemporary had its own financial problems and it has recently halted its publication, it is reasonable to say that the five ads. were more likely to be a free publicity.

Because subscription and advertising revenues are insufficient to keep the magazine running, Sun has taken on government and other commissions to conduct cultural activities and seminars in order to raise operational funds. For example, TIVB was commissioned by its major advertising patrons, the TPG-owned Taiwan Aboriginal Cultural Village, to hold an ‘Aboriginal Cultural Task Training Camp’. Later the proceedings were published, jointly between the Cultural Village and TIVB. The other activities engaged in by TIVB are mostly sponsored by central government agencies in charge of aboriginal affairs. Table 9.4 gives details of these.

Table 9.4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Government Organisation</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ministry of Interior</td>
<td>Taiwan Aboriginal Policy and Social Development Seminar</td>
<td>Dec. 1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council for Cultural Planning and Development</td>
<td>Indigenous Cultural Conference</td>
<td>April, 1994</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Part of the commissions paid for these activities has been used to supplement the operational funds of the magazine. The other main source of funding is fundraising.

33 It should be noted that the Indigenous Post has also held some local cultural activities in collaboration with local governments and associations for sustenance. However, this is not as frequent
For its one year anniversary in Nov. 1994, it organised a banquet to let readers meet writers and asked an aboriginal dance troupe to mount a fundraising performance.

Turning now to its contents, every issue has one major theme. From Table 9.5, we can see that three issues have been devoted to the achievements of indigenous sportsmen in national and international competitions, including the Olympics. Two issues have been taken up with the proceedings and papers of the 'Taiwan Aboriginal Policy and Social Development Seminar'. The others have dealt with important cultural issues facing Taiwan Yuanchumin. Many large and coloured pictures as well as paintings and portraits were used, interspersed with special layouts characteristic of aboriginal art patterns.

Table 9.5
Major Themes of *Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly*, Vol. 1-12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Issue</th>
<th>Major Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Reconstruction of Aboriginal Image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Retrospect and Outlook of International Year of Indigenous Peoples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Taiwan Aboriginal Policy and Social Development I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Taiwan Aboriginal Policy and Social Development II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>We are all Pingpu Tribes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Taiwan Yuanchumin and Anthropologists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Tribes and Community Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Taiwan Indigenous Sportsmen I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Taiwan Indigenous Sportsmen II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Taiwan Indigenous Sportsmen III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Taiwan Yuanchumin and Election</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>The First Competition of the TIVB Literature Award</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

as the TIVB, and the activities (or commissions) are smaller in scale compared with the ones held by the TIVB.
Since this magazine aims to establish a literary and cultural basis for aboriginal 'cultural existence' or 'cultural accumulation', the terms coined by Sun, most contributions, whether short fictions, cultural critiques, history, seminar proceedings or anthropological research tend to be very lengthy and sometimes verbose. One article derived from anthropological research is 72 pages, almost half of the total pages of the magazine. Bilingualism is also one of the distinguishing feature of the magazine, with some of the literary and anthropological contributions written in international Romanised letters with a Chinese translation. Since the contents are almost all related to aboriginal culture, literature, history, folklore, anthropology, politics, sports, education and so on, TIVB can fairly claim to be a truly indigenous cultural magazine in both letter and spirit, even though more Han Chinese write for it than Yuanchumin writers.

One other notable characteristic is that there is a 'TIVB Calendar' at the end of the magazine, which summarises all kinds of ongoing aboriginal events from newspapers and journals as a memorandum. It is about 20-30 pages long and is divided into culture, education, environment, tourism, society, agriculture and forestry, politics and policy. It also carries reports on the activities of indigenous peoples in US, Australia and New Zealand. It serves as a valuable reference source for aboriginal news and events, and through 'cultural accumulation', becomes a news archive for Yuanchumin.

9.4.2.3 Hunter's Culture (1990-1992)

Walisl Yukan, who was one of the 'gang of four' that founded the Indigenous Post, established his journal Hunter's Culture in central Taiwan in 1990. Like the Indigenous Post, it is adless, and the major sources of income come from donations and fundraising. Its format is also similar. It is printed in black and white. There is no copy payment for contributors. It is a shoestring operation and publication is infrequent and irregular. However, editorially it has two characteristics that distinguish it from the Indigenous Post. One is that Hunter's Culture is not an aboriginal movement journal but aims to record and preserve tribal history. Second, in contrast to
the *Indigenous Post*, which focused more on the affairs of southern tribes, such as the Rukai and Paiwan, it carried more about the central Atayal tribe, e.g., its migration history and its history during the Japanese colonisation.

Yukan (No.13/M/30s/IP) claimed that there were three main reasons behind launching the *Hunter's Culture*. Firstly, by 1990, the early aboriginal movement organs, such as the *Sanyaisan* and the *Yuanchumin*, had folded, leaving significant gaps. Secondly, he felt that mainstream media were giving less coverage to aboriginal affairs. And thirdly, he hoped to promote the *democratisation* in his tribal village through the publication. In retrospect, he argued that his paper was, in effect, 'forced' to appear, and it arose out of his ambitious desire to re-create history and myth, but he was disillusioned to find out later that these aims were unobtainable. He said:

> I think the emergence of indigenous media is, in effect, forced to appear in large measure. Generally speaking, it is seldom the case that there is a real need to put out this magazine. So is the *Hunter's Culture* (*). The emergence of our indigenous media is, as a matter of fact, appeared like an inverse pyramid....Aboriginal reception to the media does not start from bottom, so as soon as it appears, it tries to cover all dimensions, including politics, economy, culture, and education and you name it. But this is counter-productive, dissolving our strength and missing the hard point....We seldom undertake those kinds of work that are more local and deeper, and produce stuff that can directly hit the point. We are still continuously hoping that we can create history and create some myths. This makes every one who wants to run magazines so tired, because in view of our conditions and resources, we can hardly compare with Han society. We cannot follow their way.

Yukan's ambitions were short-lived however, and after two years of struggle the magazine folded in 1992. Altogether it produced 18 issues. In the first year it appeared monthly and in the second year bimonthly. Of the 2,000 copies per issue, 700-800 went to subscribers. The production costs were one tenth of those of TIVB. When asked about why he gave up, he said money was not a big problem. Rather, the difficulties were cultural and communicative.

> In the past two years of running the magazine, we were indeed very tired.34 Our finance was entirely dependent upon outside donation and sometimes, if there was no money, we would write to earn some copy payments....This is roughly the way we have sustained the journal. The real cause for ceasing publications is that such a communication

---

34 Only Yukan and his wife, Awu, an aboriginal feminist writer, ran the paper.
method, in effect, has to be examined. Because we are quite clear that most of our readers who subscribed to this journal are Han Chinese friends, so Aboriginal subscribers are relatively fewer. In addition, we don’t have our own distribution networks, so it is very difficult to penetrate into the tribes. The other (.), I think, is that in the whole of our aboriginal society, our reading habit, in fact, has not been cultivated.

9.4.2.4 Towards a Summary

During the decade after the lifting of martial law, a number of indigenous journals have emerged. Most of them belong to association, community, and church (-affiliated) organisations, such as San Chung Yeh Yu, a Bunun tribe’s community journal and Indigenous Community established by the church-affiliated Yuanchumin Community Development Center in Taitung county (southeastern Taiwan). In addition, many indigenous legislators (MP) have also issued newsletters, recording their requests to the government and their service to their constituency. The Lanyu Biweekly is still circulating in Orchid island. Table 9.6 serves the purpose of clarifying the different features of the three journals we have worked at in detail.

More recently, it is important to note that the Austronesian News was established in Kaohsiung in 1995 by Lin Min-ter, one of the co-founders [gang of four] of the Indigenous Post. Since its first publication on 1 June, 1995, it has always remained as a weekly, which is an amazing achievement compared with the irregular publication of all the other indigenous titles. It has eight pages with relatively stable advertising (an average of 3-4 items per issue). The Austronesian News has established 7 branch offices on the island so far, and the circulation has remained around 5,000. It is a private title with a few employed staff. Because it is a weekly newspaper, it offers timeliness and provides the latest news and up-to-date information about Taiwan Yuanchumin, focusing mainly on political news. As a result, its influence has been growing rapidly among the aboriginal readership. Table 9.7 gives the characteristics of the readership of the Austronesian News.
## Table 9.6
Features of Three Indigenous Journals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Character</td>
<td>social movement</td>
<td>comprehensive</td>
<td>cultural and historical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution areas</td>
<td>southern Taiwan</td>
<td>national</td>
<td>central Taiwan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication format</td>
<td>infrequent</td>
<td>bimonthly</td>
<td>infrequent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printed copies</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>3,000</td>
<td>2,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>Mainly political criticism (Mainly Rukai and Paiwan tribes)</td>
<td>literature, art, culture, and history (bilingualism)</td>
<td>tribal history (Mainly central Atayal tribe)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>donation and fundraising</td>
<td>government support, and some from advertising and fundraising</td>
<td>donation and fundraising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print format</td>
<td>black and white</td>
<td>coloured</td>
<td>black and white</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid subscribers</td>
<td>more HC than IP (about 500)</td>
<td>more HC than IP (about 700-1200)</td>
<td>more HC than IP (about 700-800)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production cost (New Taiwan Dollars)</td>
<td>40,000-50,000</td>
<td>400,000</td>
<td>40,000-50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel</td>
<td>basically one editor</td>
<td>8 (6 staff workers and 2 volunteers)</td>
<td>basically one editor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selling pattern</td>
<td>free copy and some paid subscription</td>
<td>Major bookstores near university and paid subscription</td>
<td>free copy and some paid subscription</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Readers' characteristics</td>
<td>HC and IP elites (scholars, intellectuals, civil servants, teachers, activists, media workers and missionaries, and university students, etc.)</td>
<td>HC and IP elites (scholars, intellectuals, civil servants, teachers, activists, media workers and missionaries, and university students, etc.)</td>
<td>HC and IP elites (scholars, intellectuals, civil servants, teachers, activists, media workers and missionaries, and university students, etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
1. All the materials are based on my fieldwork interviews in 1994 with the founders of the three magazines. They are Taipang Sasaler of the Indigenous Post, Sun Ta-chuan of the TIVB and Walis Yukan of the Hunter's Culture.
2. HC: Han Chinese; IP: Indigenous People.
Table 9.7
Readership of the *Austronesian News*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Circulation 5,000 copies</th>
<th>Subscribers</th>
<th>Free Copies</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>65%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Southern Taiwan</th>
<th>Central Taiwan</th>
<th>Northern Taiwan</th>
<th>Eastern Taiwan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group</th>
<th>under 20s</th>
<th>20-30</th>
<th>30-40</th>
<th>above 40s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>28.8%</td>
<td>31.2%</td>
<td>22.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Primary School</th>
<th>Junior School</th>
<th>High School</th>
<th>University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Labor</th>
<th>Civil Servants</th>
<th>Businessmen</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20.5%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| | Soldiers | Farmers | Housewives | Others |
|----------------|---------|-----------|---------|
| 3.5%           | 15%     | 10.5%     | 7.5%    |

Sources: *Austronesian News*, 10 August, 1996.

Figure 9.1 reproduces examples of the front covers of the four aboriginal journals discussed earlier—the *Hunter’s Culture*, the *Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly*, the *Indigenous Post*, and the *Austronesian News*.

Other positive signs of aboriginal cultural production can also be seen in the bookpublishing industry. Mainstream publishing houses, such as Chen-Hsin, Tai-Yuan, and Tao-Hsiang, have published literature, essays, fictions, poems and critiques by Taiwanese and aboriginal writers in recent years. Through their marketing strategies and distribution networks, these books are available in chain bookstores, breaking the cycle of limited availability that has dogged indigenous-run journals and magazines.
Figure 9.1
Taiwan Indigenous Journals

The front cover of the Hunter’s Culture, no. 4, October 1990
The front cover of the *Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly* no. 1, November 1993

The front cover of the *Indigenous Post* no. 23, February 1994
The front page of the Austronesian News, 3 August, 1995
Chapter 9  
Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements

In relation to the development of the indigenous press, the following points need to be reiterated:

1. Strictly speaking, the indigenous press in Taiwan is still in the initial stage of development, as indexed by the precariousness of its financial situation. Accordingly, a ‘death chant’ prevails in virtually all the journals discussed above. Given the difficulties of production, publication format, distribution method and circulation, the indigenous press has no firm ‘condition for survival.’ Though keenly aware of the logic of the market economy, most publishers are still unable to gain access to newsstands, bookstores and advertisers. They are mostly adless, infrequent and short-lived, and to some degree alienated from or not yet fully integrated into a market-based journalism system.

2. Given the virtual absence of advertisers’ interest and investment, the precariousness of their financial situation can only worsen if aboriginal readers in Taiwan, in general, have not yet cultivated reading habits. (Though this begs the question of the possibility of broadcasting media development in the aboriginal community.)

3. It should be noted that apart from community and church publications, the indigenous press in Taiwan, like aboriginal movements, is in letter and spirit, a product of elitism, initiated, constructed, advocated and sustained by aboriginal elites. Aboriginal intellectuals, scholars, writers, and activists are both the major producers and consumers, along with university students and concerned Han Chinese. They haven’t yet penetrated into the wide under-class of the indigenous population scattered in tribal villages and urban cities, though the recently launched Austronesian News appears to be having some success with over a third of its readership coming from workers and farmers. Indigenous Post and the Hunter’s Culture have struggled for the market, but without success.

4. In spite of the differences in style, contents, management and purpose, the aboriginal counter-discourses of advocating tribalism and aboriginal movements (Indigenous Post), of building a stage for literary and cultural accumulation (Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly), or of collecting and rewriting tribal history
(the project of Hunter’s Culture, now continued in the Yuanchumin Culture Research Centre) are still alive and kicking, at least symbolically, in aboriginal struggles against the assimilationist and hegemonic discourses of Han Chinese.

9.5 Constructing Counter-Discourses

Granted that these aboriginal counter-discourses are alive and kicking in the current indigenous press of Taiwan, we have to ask now what they consist of, what dominant discourses they distinguish themselves against, and how they are enacted and constructed in the indigenous press.

I want to argue that it is possible for the indigenous media to promote counter-discourses, but that it is impossible to articulate a unified and coherent subject position. Given the difficult circumstances surrounding the emergence and continuation of minority printed media discussed above, and the long-standing misrepresentation of indigenous issues in the mainstream press, I have stressed the need for indigenous media to articulate ‘our’ struggles against ‘their’ domination and to link these struggles to the clarion call of indigenous ‘self-determination’, noting:

The indigenous media have to take the major responsibility to construct indigenous counter-discourses from the subject position. It is, to the effect that, under the dominant discourse of assimilation and integration of the nation-state, indigenous media have to, from that position, take the initiative to construct the counter-discourses of self-determination of indigenous peoples (Kung, 1994: 120).

Terdiman (1985) has argued that counter-discourses represent the world differently, but that their projection of difference goes beyond simply contradicting the dominant, beyond simply negating its assertions. He notes that: ‘The power of dominant discourse lies in the codes by which it regulates understanding of the social world. Counter-discourses seek to detect and map such naturalised protocols and to project their subversion’ (p. 149).
In addition, Green and LeBihan (1996: 283) argue that 'counter-discourse' is 'a form of writing which resists the powerful influence of empire not by denying but by engaging with it.' They also argue that in contrast to the deconstruction of identity and difference advocated by poststructuralists and postcolonialists, many feminists and other theorists of representation argue that it is very difficult to explain racism if the category of race itself is denied. It is therefore better to 'write back' and celebrate their ethnic identity and cultural heritage, rather than trying to dismantle the categories of definition which is the main aim of the deconstructionists. 'They write as a means of exploring their ethnic identity, and as a way of representing themselves' (Ibid.: 289).

The Native Point of View: Do They Have A Voice?

I want to particularly highlight the importance of 'representing themselves' or 'self-representation' in relation to the issue of the counter-discourses of self-determination. In my view, indigenous 'self-representation' or the construction of a 'native point of view' constitutes an important part of a counter-discourse which allows them to speak from the first subject position 'we' and to oppose the dominant discourse, which constructs 'them' as the racial others. Later on I will argue that it is the (subject) position and not necessarily the content or the identity of the speakers which articulates this difference. However, as a first step we need to look briefly at controversies surrounding construction of the 'native point of view', and here I will take the Hawaii case as an example to illustrate the debate.

Tobin (1994: 114-5) has argued that calls for sovereignty have grown so strong in recent years that the debate within the Hawaiian community has moved from whether self-determination should be sought, to disputes over strategies for achieving it. In this context, he argues, definitions of aboriginal 'culture' become politicised and the role of anthropologists criticised. Because Hawaiians are not granted the authority to speak for themselves, to define their own culture, their own past, present, and future, the 'native point of view' is inevitably constituted as an object for study rather than as a legitimate voice to be reckoned with. No matter what Natives say, to
anthropologists they remain 'natives' (Ibid.: 124). Consequently, he argues, native Hawaiians do not have a voice within that system.

He elaborates on the contradictions in the role of the new anthropologist in relation to the native point of view in this way:

The new anthropologist's call to dialogue turns out to be more of the same old totalling discourse, differing from 'old-fashioned' anthropology only in its greater sophistry and sophistication. Genuine dialogue remains impossible so long as anthropologists persist in analysing, rather than listening to, Natives. So far, Natives have been able to enter the anthropological discourse only as 'the native point of view.' A Native may even become an anthropologist. But if she dares to claim subjective authority to expound on her own culture, she is instantly re-relegated to the status of informant- a voice to be interpreted (Tobin, 1994: 125).

He goes on to illustrate the conflict between native struggles for decolonisation and the fashion for postcolonial frames and deconstruction:

In more recent years, Natives have begun to find concepts such as 'culture', 'nation' and indeed 'native' to be adaptive to their own decolonising interests. Precisely in this postcolonial era, anthropologists and historians have come to notice that these concepts are artificial, even colonial. As Western scholars have lost control of the culture/nation discourse, they have taken to proclaiming 'culture' and 'nation' to be Western, colonising inventions. Just as Natives engaged in decolonisation have begun to find these concepts useful, anthropologists and historians have begun to feel the urge to demystify them. What seemed so natural in colonial contexts is, in a postcolonial context, perceived to be constructed (Ibid.: 127-8).

Tobin argues that in this situation, demands for sovereignty and self-determination are not reconcilable with intervention by outsiders, even if the outsiders happen to perceive themselves as 'radicals' (Ibid.: 132).

African-American feminist theorist, bell hooks, develops this argument, pointing to the problem of the 'appropriation of voice', which she argues, threatens the very core of the self-determination. She notes that: 'Appropriation of the marginal voice threatens the very core of self-determination and free self-expression for exploited and oppressed peoples' (hooks, 1989: 14-15). She argues that:
Chapter 9

Indigenous Press and Aboriginal Movements

The struggle to end domination, the individual struggle to resist colonisation, to move from object to subject, is expressed in the effort to establish the liberatory voice—that way of speaking that is no longer determined by one's status as object—as oppressed being. That way of speaking is characterised by opposition, by resistance. It demands that paradigms shift— that we learn to talk— to listen— to hear in a new way (Ibid.).

The struggle for counter-discourses then is a process of establishing a voice that moves the speaker from an object to a subject, aiming to end domination and colonisation. At the same time, advocates of the indigenous voice or the 'native point of view' need to be careful not to fall prey to the fashionable construction of their position as only an 'account', to be reckoned with or even amended and deleted. In this context, the indigenous press offers as a site on which to develop, manifest and articulate an indigenous counter-discourse with the least external interventions.

In order to flesh out the current terms of indigenous counter-discourses, I will use the indigenous press as a site and analyse its coverage of aboriginal cultural events, contrasting it with the dominant cultural discourses discussed in Chapter 8.

Before engaging in this analysis, however, it is important to underline the point that aboriginal culture and tradition are not fixed or reified but are always in the process of transformation and change. The influential American Indian writer, Vine Deloria, contended in his various writings from the late 1960s and early 1970s, that the key to a Native American future was a return to Native ceremonies and traditions within a framework of asserting sovereignty. This position was at a variance with the AIM's demands for Native rights at that time. He criticised the urban-based movements for becoming embroiled in reservation political battles rather than developing its own agenda. In his view, 'the return to tradition cannot be an unchanging and unchangeable set of activities, but must be part of the life of a community as it struggles to exercise sovereignty'(Warrior, 1994: 53-56).

Drawing on a 'poststructuralist' approach, which is highly critical of presumed essences and continuities, Fry and Willis also argue that: 'In Australia, the romantic recovery of the past as a pre-colonial life is impossible....The return to the old culture is therefore really a new culture built upon the signs of the past' (Meyers, 1992: 338).

With this point firmly in mind, I will turn now to discuss how aboriginal culture is constructed in the indigenous press. Since as we have seen, most indigenous titles are
Irregularly published, underfunded and underemployed, I found that they have carried no items regarding the Tsou tribe’s Mayasvi rite. Consequently, it is impossible to directly compare their representations with those discussed in Chapter 8. However, these indigenous journals have printed stories regarding other aboriginal cultural events. These are mainly about the Ami and Atayal’s Harvest rites and the Saisiyat’s Pastaai rite. They are mainly written as either general cultural commentaries or investigative features which chronicle and record the process of the rituals and ceremonies. None are written in a ‘news’ format.

The commentaries on general aboriginal cultural events carried in the TIVB and the Indigenous Post are the best ‘fit’ and will be used here. I have argued in Chapter 8 that there were two competing discourses underlying coverage of the Mayasvi by the mainstream newspapers of Taiwan: the ‘traditional culture discourse’ and the ‘modern consumption discourse’. The former refers to those news discourses that highlighted the event’s meaning to the Yuanchumin as an important part of their cultural heritage, whereas the latter was centered around the tourist gaze or the commodification of the aboriginal culture.

Counter-Discourses of Subjectivity

The most prominent counter-discourses in relation to aboriginal rites revolve around the problem of ‘subjectivity’. I have mentioned in Chapter 8 that Doyou (1995:56), from the Atayal tribe, has illustrated the importance of subjectivity for aboriginal organisers in her contribution to the TIVB, where she argued that both appropriate control of visiting tourists and less dependence on the government subsidy are integral to achieve the ‘subjectivity of the ritual culture’ (the topic of her article). This issue of ‘subjectivity’ was taken up by other writings in the indigenous press, including one contributed by a Han Chinese to the TIVB.35 Liu Shih-chieh (1994), in

---

35 The tribes of the authors who have their articles published in the TIVB are mentioned in a parenthesis under the topic. For example, ‘The Subjectivity of the Ritual Culture,’ is followed by the author’s name—‘Yulan Doyou (Atayal tribe)’; ‘A Distant Respect’ is followed by ‘Liu Shih-chieh (Han tribe).’
his article entitled 'A Distant Respect', commented on the general problems of the aboriginal cultural activities:

The most dignified and sacred ritual music was recorded and played by the vendor truck to attract customers. The rite became a new power game between the local government and the higher-ups, and the tourists from the outside became the masters who were entertained by tribal folks. The tribal chiefs only served as embellishments, and the photographers were roaming about everywhere like hunters. Such an activity brought the greatest harm to aboriginal communities, because the re-establishment of the rite has become the last hope of Yuanchumin's cultural preservation. Therefore, how to reduce the government's interference and avoid the bad elements of non-indigenous tourists are necessary questions in order to let Yuanchumin have their rites that are truly of their own, quietly. In the process of adjusting to modern life, let Yuanchumin grope for a new culture that is compatible to the spirit of their traditions. Let the tribal people decide whether to open the rite to outsiders or not. Let them recover lost tribal culture and feeling through the rite, and establish the tribal sovereignty and subjectivity. This is the beginning of inheriting the tribal life (p. 51).

This extract clearly demonstrates that even a Han Chinese writer can adopt an indigenous subject position in order to articulate a counter-discourse against government and tourist interventions in aboriginal rites. As we can see, this argument and its position are similar to those made by Doyou of the Atayal. It stands in stark contrast to both the 'noble guest ideology' and the 'modern consumption discourse', which privileges the tourist gaze and the notion of cultural commodity. At the same time, the discourse of aboriginal rites in the indigenous press also conforms to the terms of the 'traditional culture discourse' to a great extent. Some thoughts can be sorted out as follows:

1. Discourses in the indigenous press do not necessarily counter dominant discourses. Sometimes they work within their terms. The commentaries on aboriginal rite under study here oppose the 'modern consumption discourse' but work with the 'traditional culture discourse'.
2. Counter-discourses are articulated by non-indigenous peoples as well as indigenous speakers, but all speak from the same position, aligning themselves with an indigenous 'us', criticising the others—visiting tourists and government interference.
3. However, as we saw in the last chapter, it is important to remember that the counter-discourses, articulated particularly by indigenous speakers, do not necessarily counter against Han Chinese others but against indigenous peoples themselves, e.g., against the organisers of the Mayasvi event who have maintained a collusive relationship with modern tourism and consumerism.

To illustrate this last point further, Walis Yukan, the founder of the *Hunter’s Culture*, offered a highly critical observation on the issue of the aboriginal ‘subjectivity’. He noted:

> If we trace back to the 400 years of Yuanchumin’s contact with the alien tribes, we found that the biggest mistake of aboriginal society lies in the lack of the subjectivity. Looking through at the historical context, we realise that Yuanchumin have always played the poor role of the ‘subordinate character’ and the ‘dominated character’. Even in today’s world of an open and developed information society, there are still some Yuanchumin who can not dismantle the dominated and the enslaved ideology that have historically shaped the destiny of the aboriginal tribes (Yukan, 1990: 3).

Indigenous counter-discourses then not only have to counter Han Chinese historical domination, they also have to oppose collusion with a historically-embedded ‘subordinate and dominated character’. I have also pointed out elsewhere that although the present revival of indigenous culture should be carried on, Yuanchumin’s ‘self-indulgent narcissism’ with their own reified and ossified culture and tradition should be criticised (Kung, 1993: 189).

In my view, only through self-criticisms and the mobilisation of a *self-critical gaze*, which counter not only Han Chinese conceptions of others but essentialist indigenous definitions of us, can indigenous peoples achieve a genuine sense of ‘subjectivity’, that can underpin a liberatory struggle for indigenous cultural self-determination free from the dominant sinocentrism of the Han nation-state.

bell hooks’ suggestion is therefore particularly worthy of note here. She argues that: ‘Marginalised groups must not simply begin telling their own stories and creating their own images of themselves; they must, as well, develop a critical gaze, a way of
critiquing their own discourse within the frame of the coloniser' (cited from George, 1995: 431).

The Predicament of Indigenous Counter-Discourse

After sketching out the basic contours of the counter-discourse above, I will turn now to explore the way its separation from the Han Chinese dominant discourses is constructed, drawing upon my interviews with indigenous ‘reporters-to-be’, who were, when interviewed, attending a reporters’ training programmes offered by the future Chinese Public Television. Many indigenous interviewees criticised Han Chinese reporters for not understanding aboriginal culture and claimed that they know their own culture and problems better. For example, the Pingpu reporter-to-be (No.15/M/39/IP) argued that the major difference between Han Chinese and indigenous reporters-to-be is that he understands the Yuanchumin better. Another indigenous reporter-to-be for the Public TV (No.2/M/37/IP) (from the Paiwan tribe) used the metaphor of ‘doctors’ and ‘patients’ to explain their difference. He said:

I feel that they [Han Chinese reporters] pose like a doctor to diagnose aboriginal problems. If the Yuanchumin go to do the reporting, I will look at the problems from the stance of a patient. So I can clearly tell where is my pain. But a doctor, to tell the truth, can not grasp where is the Yuanchumin’s pain...So I think this is the difference (>). The reason is that I know our Yuanchumin’s pain. I know the place where I live and what predicament we have. I know where the real pain is. But Han Chinese reporters come here and may stay for a week to understand [us]. So I feel that they are not able to grasp the pain....All cultures, all pains, have to be experienced and have to be felt, and in so doing, then you will understand. They are not to be seen [or diagnosed]. You have to experience the life and you will know their problems.

He went on to argue that language is one of the key differences separating HC reporters and indigenous reporters-to-be. He said:

36 I argued earlier in this thesis that the Chinese Public Television (CPTV) is now still debated and not yet formally established in Taiwan, so I termed those indigenous interviewees who were attending the reporter’s training programmes as ‘reporters-to-be’.
Because they [HC reporters] use interpreters. Basically it involves, first, the expressive ability of the interpreters, whether he can clearly interpret the whole thing...So in view of the fact that Yuanchumin’s education, generally, is not so good, coupled with the language problem, it is, in fact, impossible to clearly interpret them into Han Chinese language.

In addition, Yichiang Paluerh (No.24/M/34/IP), the aboriginal movement leader from the Ami tribe, said during interview:

If you are an indigenous reporter, you may have the Yuanchumin’s complex. So your reports will be taken relatively more from the stance of the Yuanchumin. Also perhaps you may be a victim, or your tribe is a victim. In this case, you will have a very clear idea of how to present indigenous views. But general Han reporters will perhaps address the issues from an observational position. He will feel less about these problems.

These celebrations of the differences between the HC and IP reporters in covering aboriginal affairs are, however, strongly countered by Sun Ta-chuan (No.4/M/42/IP), the editor-in-chief of the TIVB from the Puyuma tribe. Sun argued that because indigenous reporters-to-be have a particular feeling of pain, they will easily fall into subjective points of views, which, he claims, is not beneficial either to Yuanchumin or to media workers as a whole. Dismantling the pitfalls of ‘indigenous ethnocentrism’ is, he argued, a continuous learning process for indigenous reporters-to-be. In addition, he argued that Han Chinese reporters have to avoid ‘sympathetic humanism’ in reporting Yuanchumin.

The biggest challenge for these prospective indigenous journalists is, in effect, not much different from their Han Chinese colleagues. The reporter from the China Times Express (No.11/F/32/HC) said during the interview that since we cannot change the whole world simply by writing an article, the biggest challenge facing indigenous reporters will be themselves. She said:

He joins the journalistic profession today because he hopes to change something through this profession. He will find that he cannot change anything no matter how hard and how long he has worked. He may become frustrated, so the biggest challenge for him is himself.

The other reporter (No.7/F/34/HC) from the China Times argued that they should not bear too much of an ‘ethnic burden’ in reporting indigenous news. She said:
Yuanchumin intellectuals, who are willing to engage in journalistic work, should not bear too much of an ethnic burden and, like general reporters, they can be a very good journalist. Perhaps because he is a member of the tribe, it will be easier for him to report aboriginal news than us. But I don’t think they should emphasise too much a sense of mission [for their tribes], because reporters cannot stay on just because his sense of mission is too strong.

It may be too early to judge how these indigenous reporters-to-be, who are to be employed by the CPTV, will cover indigenous news in the ‘yet-to-be-established’ Public TV, but the arguments above provide a revealing insight into their views and motivations.

9.6 Concluding Remarks

One of the main arguments of this thesis is that in the current world-wide context of indigenous struggles for decolonisation, indigenous struggles for ownership of indigenous media should be recognised as integral to the pursuit of self-determination by the Fourth World peoples.

Despite all the obstacles and predicaments, the indigenous media continue to exist and survive not only to preserve the linguistic and cultural identity of Fourth World peoples, not only to resist being exoticised or transformed into mere objects by the tourist gaze, but to affirm and celebrate their ownership of media from which to articulate the counter-discourse of indigenous self-determination. This struggle is not only against the cultural domination and ideological colonisation of the Han nation-

37 Due to a strong lobby by the Working Group on Indigenous Populations (WGIP), the United Nations has expanded the international year for indigenous peoples (1993) into an 'International Decade'. Nowadays, the draft of the 'UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples' was presented to the Commission on Human Rights for further discussion and consultation, in which more demands of self-determination by indigenous groups from the nation-state have been incorporated in this draft. The complete version of this draft can be downloaded from: http://www.halcyon.com/FWDP/drift9329.html.
state, but also, most importantly, against the 'ethnic insiderism' or ethnocentrism that exists among indigenous peoples themselves.

Marcia Langton, an anthropologist of Aboriginal descent from Australia, has argued that the motivations behind Aboriginal community video production and television transmission can be seen as basic issues of self-determination, cultural maintenance and the prevention of cultural disruption. The strategies which they have employed to overcome the problems posed by the impact of television and video include: cultural and aesthetic interventions; control of incoming television signals; control of self-representation through local video production in local languages; refusal to permit outsiders to film; and negotiation of co-productions which guarantee certain conditions aimed at cultural maintenance (1994: 105).

Jordan and Weedon (1995:497-498) have noted that: 'One of the most visible effects of attempts to resist the negative inscription of Aboriginality within mainstream Australian culture has been the publication of fiction, drama, and poetry by Aboriginal people themselves, both in English and in Aboriginal languages. Aboriginal writing has played a central role in the struggle for positive identity and self-determination. It is an intervention in cultural politics, an ongoing struggle over meaning, power and subjectivity.'

It is also important to remember again the argument of Shohat and Starn (1994: 35) that indigenous media comprise an empowering vehicle for communities struggling against geographical displacement, ecological and economic deteriorations, and cultural annihilation. They spoke of the camcorder activism of the Kayapo in Brazil where the video camera is used to communicate between villages, to record and thus perpetuate their own ceremonies and rituals, to record the official promises of Euro-Brazilian politicians and to disseminate their cause around the world.

In Taiwan, we have seen, the indigenous press was 'forced' to emerge spurred on by the ongoing political and cultural transformation of Taiwan. Despite all the predicaments and obstacles, such as the unhealthy financial base, low circulation, alienation from the market, and the distance from the wide under-class of the Taiwan Yuanchumin, it remains a central symbolic site for the development and articulation of counter-discourses of self-determination.
Chapter Ten
Conclusion

10.1 Review of General Arguments

The principal objective of this thesis has been to explore the dynamic power relations between indigenous peoples and the news media in contemporary Taiwan in the context of a rapidly changing socio-political, economic and cultural environment. The focus is on three main dimensions of these relations: representation, access and self-determination. Representation invites us to explore mainstream media from 'top-down' perspective, whereas access and self-determination draw attention to the 'bottom-up' resistance of indigenous journalists and media.

I have followed the general understanding within the media research community in basing my examination of questions of representation around a study of how indigenous minorities are represented by Taiwan's mainstream newspapers. However, unlike many studies in the area I have used a combination of quantitative and qualitative approaches. For the quantitative content analysis, seven mainstream Taiwanese newspapers were selected for study: 1. the China Times; 2. the United Daily News; 3. the Central Daily News; 4. the Independent Morning Post; 5. the Taiwan Times; 6. the Commons; and 7. the Liberty Times. They were analysed for a co-terminus six month period, starting on 1 January and ending on 30 June, 1994. Four dimensions of indigenous news portrayals were investigated: 1. prominence and attention; 2. themes and content; 3. quotation and representation; and 4. newspaper variability. I have already provided a detailed summarisation of the results in the concluding remarks to Chapter 7. However, it is appropriate here to re-emphasise the major threads from the various findings.
Chapter 10 Conclusion

1. Coverage by the seven sample newspapers is by no means insufficient or indifferent to indigenous concerns. It is not predominantly negative nor does it frequently present indigenous peoples as a ‘problem’, though it does continually draw on stereotypes in both news and picture selections. In terms of quotation, which is regarded by many media-minority scholars as the core question in the discussion of minority representation, indigenous peoples (IP) are found to be almost as frequently quoted overall as major speakers as Han Chinese (HC). This suggests that the ‘problematic’ model of media-minority relations developed in western countries may not be the most useful way to look at indigenous news portrayals in Taiwan. However, I have argued in Chapter 7 that although indigenous voices were heard almost as often as those of Han Chinese, their statements were relatively submerged and marginalised as ‘Others’ by a Han Chinese-owned mainstream press and news framework that frequently prioritised dominant official and academic interpretations.

2. In terms of the variations between titles, the Taiwan Times carried the most coverage in terms of both ‘frequency’ and ‘item & size’. It was followed by the Independent Morning Post and the China Times in terms of the average size of indigenous items. The Central Daily News, the only public (KMT-owned) newspaper of the sample, provided the least. The China Times, the Independent Morning Post and the Taiwan Times used more indigenous peoples than Han Chinese as major speakers, while the United Daily News, the Central Daily News, the Commons and the Liberty Times quoted more Han Chinese.

3. The content analysis suggests that the fundamental problem lies not so much in the mainstream’s press coverage (or misrepresentation) of indigenous affairs, but in the relations between the press and the indigenous peoples and the chronic underrepresentation of indigenous staff in the mainstream press. This argument is supported by the finding that virtually none of the news items in the sample was written by indigenous authors. In addition, it was further confirmed by Lo’s

---

1 The ‘problematic’ model here refers to the western media’s generalised misrepresentation that tends to depict ethnic minority groups as ‘problems’ and threats.
research in 1994, that out of the 1,003 Taiwanese journalists who were the subjects of his questionnaire, only 4 claimed to be indigenous. So it is not an exaggeration to say that indigenous peoples are virtually absent from the workforce in the mainstream media.

4. Newspaper coverage of indigenous news is not an isolated phenomenon. It has to be examined in its relevant political, economic, social and cultural contexts. This thesis demonstrates that this holistic approach is particularly relevant in Taiwan, where since the late 1980s, when the state apparatus embarked on political reforms, social and cultural liberalisation have generated both increased diversity and increased commercialisation of the press. In this changed climate, the state, civil society and the market have intersected with each other to exert influence on both the structure and performance of press industry. Political reforms and increasing press freedom coupled with a rising trend of the localism of Taiwanese culture, have increased the salience of indigenous issues, especially in the areas of cultural and political news.

Although the content analysis reveals that the mainstream press in Taiwan does not fit the 'problematic' misrepresentation found in the western media, it does provide strong evidence that 'news subjects' and 'picture selections' are rooted in stereotypes. Cultural and arts items stand out as the major news category with stories often being accompanied by colorful news photos featuring indigenous peoples adorned in traditional clothes. This coverage offers a road map that enables us to find a way into our central concern with the implicit racial ideology of Han Chinese news discourses. For this reason, a qualitative 'critical discourse analysis', drawing on methods developed by Teun A. Van Dijk and Norman Fairclough, was undertaken to tease out these ideological dimensions. The Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite, which was held on 15 February, 1995 in Taiwan, was selected as a case study. The corpus of the data consists of one-week's reports about the event from the seven sample newspapers, spanning the period of 12-18 February, 1995.
Chapter 10

The analysis of the case study revealed that representations of the Mayasvi event were underpinned by two main conflicting discourses: the ‘traditional culture discourse’ and the ‘modern consumption discourse’. The former was defined as a news discourse that highlighted the event’s meaning to the Yuanchumin as an important part of cultural heritage, whereas the latter was based around the tourist gaze or the commodification of aboriginal culture.

The ‘tourist gaze’ constructs the event as exotic and primitive (un)worthy for consumption and marginalises and excludes its meanings for Tsou tribe participants. It draws on and re-works the older colonising gaze of the Han Chinese which constructed indigenous peoples as others, objects rather than subjects.

At the same time, the Mayasvi rite is itself a typical example of the growing world-wide commodification of aboriginal culture and tradition. Against the wishes of many indigenous participants, it was conceived by its organisers partly as a public entertainment for noble guests and Han Chinese tourists. The act of charging for admission colluded with the newspaper’s activation of an imaginary and nostalgic kind of ‘symbolic tourism’ designed to offer modern consumption of primitive and exotic others for a wide Han Chinese readership.

In addition to the empirical analyses of news products, I also conducted an interview study in order to examine the production process. The interviews aimed to collect first-hand data from Han Chinese and aboriginal interviewees and to explore the major factors that have exerted an impact on indigenous news productions in newspaper organisations. During my eight-month fieldwork in Taiwan (June 1994 to Feb. 1995), I conducted a total of 42 interviews with journalists, editors, scholars, activists and government officials. I found that because indigenous peoples constitute a tiny segment of the potential audience, either as readers of newspapers or consumers of advertised commodities, they are not an attractive market in the eyes of either newspaper owners and advertising barons. Consequently, proprietors and advertisers are not particularly interested in or concerned about indigenous news production and have little motivation to interfere with news production process or with content.

This marginal status means that there is no single ‘indigenous news beat’ in newspaper organisations, and virtually all the reporters interviewed stressed the
importance of their own *initiatives* in producing indigenous news and particularly in *digging out* indigenous issues. It is not unusual for reporters to have to persuade their editors to print the results. However, reporters' initiatives and creativity have also prompted concern among editors, who feel that it may undermine traditional tenets of professional objectivity.

At the same time, the content analysis reveals that virtually none of the 'news' is written by indigenous authors. Compared with western countries, where it is not uncommon to see members of minorities in a range of positions, the main problem in Taiwan is still the virtual absence of indigenous journalists working in Han Chinese media. Some scholars doubt that more minority journalists working in the mainstream media will provide better coverage of minority issues. I am of the view that it is, at least, an important first step to achieving more adequate coverage not least because minority journalists' access to mainstream media is inextricably related to a minority's control of symbolic power and their ability to define their own ethnic situation. This is particularly relevant in Taiwan where indigenous media are precarious, mostly powerless and virtually insignificant in exerting influence on the non-indigenous audience. The predicament of the indigenous press is explored in Chapter 9 of the thesis.

Drawing upon the painful experience of indigenous media in US, Canada and Australia, I have explored the emergence of minority journalism in Taiwan and argued that indigenous movements and protests are of vital importance in fostering the emergence of indigenous media. Their absence until recently is a major reason for Taiwan's late development. In contrast to the Native American journalism, for example, which emerged in the early 19th century, the indigenous press in Taiwan did not appear until the late 1980s when Taiwan underwent unprecedented political and cultural liberalisation. In addition to providing a brief account of the development of the indigenous press before 1987, the year that martial law was abolished, I have placed particular emphasis on the formation, management and predicament of the indigenous press today. The journals selected for sustained investigation were: the *Indigenous Post* (1989- ); the *Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly* (1993- ); and the *Hunter's Culture* (1990-1992).
The problems and predicaments of these indigenous journals can be summarised as follows:

1. Continual financial difficulties have seriously affected the production process, publication format, distribution method and circulation figures of Taiwan's indigenous press. Unable to gain access to newsstands, bookstores, mainstream readers or advertisers, they are mostly adless, infrequent and short-lived. Consequently, they are still, to some degree, alienated from or not yet fully integrated into the market-based journalism.

2. As aboriginal readers in Taiwan have not yet cultivated reading habits, the continuing absence of advertiser interest and investment can only aggravate the present precarious financial situation of these indigenous journals.

3. The indigenous press in Taiwan, like aboriginal movements in general, is in letter and spirit, a product of elitism, that is initiated, advocated and sustained by aboriginal elites. Activists, intellectuals, scholars, writers, and university students are both the producers and consumers of their own products. They haven't yet penetrated into the wide 'underclass' of the rural and urban indigenous population.

4. Despite all the difficulties and challenges, the indigenous press continues and promotes the aboriginal counter-discourses of advocating tribalism and aboriginal movements (the Indigenous Post), of building a stage for literary and 'cultural accumulation' (the Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly), or of collecting and rewriting tribal history (the Hunter's Culture). However weak and precarious their material base, these counter-discourses are still very much in evidence, at least among aboriginal elites.

It is also important to note that the painstaking efforts of indigenous peoples to run their own media should be linked with the generalised cultural struggle of Fourth World peoples for self-determination. As the master rhetoric of indigenous movements today, self-determination represents the unfinished business of decolonisation for Fourth World peoples, who are struggling to control their own future and destiny in all
aspects of their lives. The concern is not only to raise a counter voices against the assimilationist and hegemonic discourses of the dominant nation-state in terms of content and position, but to secure cultural spaces in which the right to speak is asserted in terms of ownership. This thesis suggests that indigenous struggles for greater access to the means of symbolic production must be seen as an embodiment of indigenous struggles for self-determination more generally.

This perspective has important consequences for currently fashionable theories of hybridity. Rather than constructing indigenous identity around the notions of displacement and diaspora characteristic of these theories, I would argue that it is better characterised by its centripetal and collective orientations. In the context of ethnic renewal and the movement toward pan-aboriginal identity in Taiwan in recent years, collective indigenous identity has become a site on which to garner strength in order to contest colonialist discourses and hegemony in the 'not yet post-colonial era'.

This thesis suggests that rather than arguing that indigenous media are hybrid products in which a whole range of diversified, negotiated and fragmentary identities are constructed, transformed and reproduced, there is a need to stress the key role they play as points of access to self-determination. Although this view is at variance with fashionable postcolonial theories, it is supported by a number of indigenous media scholars, including Daley and James (1986: 13), Michael Meadows (1992b), Eric Michaels (1994: xxxvi), Helen Molnar (1995: 171), and Olson (1985: 89).

This thesis also argues that indigenous struggles to obtain the ownership of the media can be understood as an important part and parcel of their bottom-up struggles for self-determination and self-representation.
10.2 Limitations and Suggestions for Further Research

Although this thesis has been an ambitious and pioneering undertaking, the constraints and limitations that inevitably accompanied the research suggest several sites for further academic work in this area:

1. Although I explained in Chapter 1 the reasons for my exclusion of electronic media from this study, they offer an obvious focus for follow-up research. Given that radio and video in particular, are ideally suited to oral cultures and indigenous cultural expressions and have the advantages of accessibility and relative cheapness, exploring the extent to which they have been mobilised by indigenous communities and activists is one clear priority. The other is to explore representations of indigenous peoples on mainstream broadcast television and the current development and predicament of indigenous-operated electronic media, particularly in the United States, Canada and Australia. What is the relationship between the indigenous media and the nation-state and what are their counter-discourses?

2. I have argued that there is an 'abysmal dearth' of aboriginal journalists hired by the mainstream media. It needs to be stressed here that this conclusion is derived from logical deductions from the content analysis and from the 'indirect' finding revealed by Lo's research in 1994 mentioned earlier, rather than a basis of direct and focused empirical evidence. This is therefore clearly an area that merits further research devoted to answering the following questions:

- What is the current situation of aboriginal employment in Taiwan's mainstream media?
- To what extent are they integrated into the media structure?
- What are their positions, news beats and problems?
- What factors account for underrepresentation?
- Is there institutional racism? If so, how does it operate to exclude aborigines from employment in the media?

3. As we know, in media studies today, increasing attention has been given to audience reception. The 'audience' is not examined in this thesis. However, reception analysis
deserves more attention in the future in media-minority studies. We need to look at how mainstream audiences perceive, interpret and react to representations of ethnic minorities in the mainstream media, and at the communication and media consumption behaviour of minority audiences, and in particular, at their relations with minority media.

4. Although an increasing number of essays and papers have discussed the problems of media coverage of indigenous peoples and challenges faced by indigenous media today, they are mostly written as critiques and comments on the basis of literature surveys. It is suggested here that quantitative studies of mainstream media's coverage of the indigenous peoples are still rare and need to be developed in order to address core questions of representation between the majority media and the indigenous minorities more fully.

10.3 Concluding Remarks

More recently, the Internet has become a new site for indigenous peoples to promote self-determination. Drawing upon the experiences of the indigenous nations of the Americas, O'Donnell and Delgado (1995) argue that: 'Indigenous peoples are now a specific presence on the Internet, and they have made the global computer network a site for information exchange, analysis and action on self-determination.' They argued that the Internet is now an effective channel for the indigenous nations and organisations in the Americas through which they provide public information sites and over which they have complete control, using existing Internet sites and networks for their own purposes. In their views, the Internet is used as a site for the purposes that include research (information exchange), education (cultural heritage) and political networking (political mobilisation). So it is significant that initiatives are underway in
Chapter 10

Conclusion

North America to develop a full-service computer network owned and operated by indigenous peoples.²

Therefore, in the future there is a growing tendency to envision the use of the Internet by indigenous peoples as a counter-hegemonic practice to achieve the 'decolonisation' or the 'self-determination', which can be explained as the access to computer technology.

Above all, this thesis has employed a critical approach to examining 'media-indigenous' relations in Taiwan. Although the findings do not support the long-standing criticisms of insufficient coverage and indifferent treatment of minorities' concerns by Taiwan's mainstream newspapers, they do point to the problems of underrepresentation and social inequality, and particularly to the sino-centricism and cultural superiority of Han Chinese that arise from the activation of the modern consumption discourse, featuring the 'tourist gaze' and the 'commodification' of aboriginal culture and tradition.

This thesis also highlights the fundamental importance of viewing indigenous cultural struggles from the 'bottom-up'. These struggles are not only for increased access to the mainstream media, but for self-determined media spaces from which indigenous peoples can let their voices be heard. In view of the fact that battles for indigenous ownership of media are still going on, however precarious and frustrated their financial underpinnings, there is a particular need to emphasise the symbolic

---

² Scott Crawford and Kekula Bray-Crawford presented a paper on 'Self-Determination in the Information Age' at the Internet Society 1995 International Networking Conference in Honolulu, arguing that the swiftly evolving information and communication technologies and networking infrastructures are playing an expanding role in supporting the self-determination of peoples and emergent nations. In this paper, they took Tibet as an example, arguing that efforts have been taken to improve the online service in Dharamsala, the home of the Tibetan Government-in-Exile. It enables a more direct link between Tibet supporters and the officials and organisations where the bulk of Tibetans reside. In addition to the cultural and educational purposes of the Internet for the Tibetans, they argued that in the Tibet case, access from within Tibet itself is extremely limited both politically and technically, but by the government-in-exile working in partnership with its peoples and various supporters around the world. So they noted: 'a vital cyberspace community is being established to further the purpose of the people of Tibet.' They can be reached at: exec@hawaii-nation.org.
significance of indigenous media in articulating the counter-discourses of self-determination more generally. As this thesis has illustrated, the importance of this can be clearly seen in the painstaking struggles for survival by Taiwan’s indigenous press. This thesis has revealed that the indigenous press has opened up a cultural space for the voices, identities and dignity of Taiwan Yuanchumin. In the context of continuing democratisation and liberalisation as well as the rising force of civil society in Taiwan, it can be confidently predicted that their struggles for cultural survival will continue and will spill over into the other cultural industries, particularly the electronic media and even the Internet in the foreseeable future.
Appendix 1  
List of the 42 Interview Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Organisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter coordinator</td>
<td>United Evening News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>IP( Paiwan)</td>
<td>reporter-to-be</td>
<td>Public Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>IP( Bunun)</td>
<td>reporter-to-be</td>
<td>Public Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>04</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>IP( Puyuma)</td>
<td>editor-in-chief</td>
<td>Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>freelancer &amp; researcher</td>
<td>Hongkong Chinese University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>researcher</td>
<td>Public Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>China Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>editor</td>
<td>China Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>director</td>
<td>Dimensions Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 As I spent the first three months of my fieldwork in collecting and photocopying indigenous news data for content analysis, I did not begin the interview until September 1994. As for the actual process of the interview, first, I sent out a cover letter which contains my request for interview, self-introduction and the purpose of my research. The letter was enclosed with the interview question lists (see Appendix 2) and an official identity letter from the supervisor. Usually, one or two weeks after I mailed the letter and the enclosures, I made telephone calls to the interviewees and set up an appointment for interview. I started interviewing with Chinese and indigenous reporters, then page editors, editor-in-chief and scholars.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>China Times Express</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>30s</td>
<td>IP( Atayal )</td>
<td>teacher &amp; writer publisher</td>
<td>Primary school Hunter's Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>associate professor</td>
<td>National Taiwan University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>IP( Pingpu )</td>
<td>reporter-to-be</td>
<td>Public Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>IP( Paiwan )</td>
<td>teacher &amp; writer</td>
<td>Primary school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>IP( Rukai )</td>
<td>publisher</td>
<td>Indigenous Post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>IP( Paiwan )</td>
<td>poet &amp; massagist</td>
<td>Massage parlor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>freelancer and video worker</td>
<td>Video studio &amp; cable TV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>IP( Paiwan )</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>Taiwan Television Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>IP( Puyuma )</td>
<td>announcer</td>
<td>Educational Radio Station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>United Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>IP( Ami )</td>
<td>movement leader &amp; executive officer</td>
<td>Democratic Progressive Party Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>Independent Evening Post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>IP( Ami )</td>
<td>Section Chief</td>
<td>Ministry of the Interior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>editor</td>
<td>United Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>researcher</td>
<td>Academia Sinica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>professor</td>
<td>National Chengchi University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>deputy editor-in-chief</td>
<td>Central Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>30s</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>researcher</td>
<td>Ogilvy &amp; Mather Advertisement Co.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>editor-in-chief</td>
<td>United Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>researcher</td>
<td>Academia Sinica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>acting editor-in-chief</td>
<td>Independent Morning Post</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>50s</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>editor-in-chief</td>
<td>China Times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>researcher</td>
<td>Academia Sinica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>chief editorialist</td>
<td>Jade Bi-weekly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>IP(Atayal)</td>
<td>township officer</td>
<td>Fu-hsing Township Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>40s</td>
<td>IP(Atayal)</td>
<td>township councilor</td>
<td>Fu-hsing Township Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>30s</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>reporter</td>
<td>United Daily News</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>HC</td>
<td>editor</td>
<td>Taiwan Times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HC: Han Chinese
IP: Indigenous peoples, followed by the name of the tribe enclosed in the parenthesis, e.g., (Paiwan), which means that the subject belongs to the Paiwan tribe. The list is arranged in a chronological order, dependent upon the time of conducting the interview.
Appendix 2
List of Questions for the Interviewees

For Chinese Journalists:

1. How long have you covered indigenous news?
2. Can you tell me your experiences and difficulties in covering indigenous news?
3. According to your professional opinion, which kind of indigenous news do you think deserves more attention and coverage for the public consumption?
4. Is there any difference in reporting indigenous and non-indigenous news?
5. If compared with the other newspapers, what are the major advantages or disadvantages of your newspaper in dealing with indigenous news?
6. Is there any rules or policy in your newspaper in reporting indigenous news?
7. Are you satisfied with the professional autonomy in your organisation?
8. Who do you think holds the most power in shaping and producing of indigenous news?
9. Which one of the following do you think is more important that should be given more attention: government’s aboriginal policy or aboriginal movements and problems?
10. How do you evaluate the claims made by aboriginal movements? What position do you stand when reporting aboriginal movement news?
11. How do you evaluate aboriginal magazines run by indigenous intellectuals today?
12. What will be the major challenges for indigenous journalists in the future?
13. Are there any indigenous peoples working in the news department of your newspaper?
14. Is it possible to get the information related to the structure, circulation and advertising of your organisation?
For Chinese Scholars:

1. Can you tell me current race (ethnic) relations in Taiwan?
2. How significant does Chinese ethnocentrism or Han-chauvinism shape the Han–indigenous relations today?
3. How do you evaluate the government’s aboriginal policy?
4. How do you evaluate the claims of aboriginal movements today?
5. How do you evaluate mainstream media’s performance of covering aboriginal affairs?

For Indigenous Reporters-to-Be:

1. Why do you want to be a journalist?
2. How do you feel for being an indigenous journalist?
3. What do you think are the major challenges for an indigenous journalist?
4. How do you evaluate the general performance of the indigenous journals today?
5. How do you evaluate mainstream media’s performance in covering indigenous affairs?
6. Are Chinese media fair or biased in their portrayals of indigenous peoples?
7. What do you think are the major characteristics of indigenous news discourse?

For Indigenous Publishers:

1. What are your motive and goal for establishing the journal?
2. Are there any difficulties in running the magazine?
3. What is the major problem in running an indigenous journal?
4. How do you evaluate mainstream media’s performance in covering indigenous affairs?
5. Are mainstream Chinese media fair or biased in their portrayals of indigenous peoples?
6. Has your journal sufficiently reflected the majority opinions of indigenous peoples?
7. Who are the major subscribers of your journal?

8. What do you think are the major challenges for indigenous journalists in the future?

9. What is the major difference between indigenous and non-indigenous Han Chinese news discourses and journals?

10. Is it possible to get the information concerning the staff personnel, circulation and advertising figures of your organisation?
Appendix 3
Interviewee’s Background Form

1. Name:

2. Age:

3. Sex:

4. Level of Education:

5. Race:

6. Organisation:

7. Position:

8. Years of Experience:

9. Religion:

10. Political Affiliation:
Appendix 4

Code Book for the Content Analysis

News Coverage of Indigenous Peoples by Mainstream Newspapers of Taiwan (1 January–30 June, 1994)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coding Variables</th>
<th>Columns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case number</td>
<td>1-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>4-6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Because the sampling period ranges from January to June 1994, only three columns are needed to indicate the month (C4) and the date (C5-C6). For example, the code ‘329’ indicates that the news item was collected from the paper of March 29th (1994).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. The China Times.
2. The United Daily News.
4. The Independent Morning Post.
5. The Taiwan Times.
6. The Commons.
7. The Liberty Times.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>8-9</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

What page does the news item appear on the newspaper?
For example, ‘01’ indicates that the news item appears on the first page of the newspaper and ‘48’ is that the item is printed on the page 48.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

1. The news item appears on the national edition, that is, the item appears on the pages that are distributed for nation-wide readers.
2. The news item appears on the local edition mainly distributed for local readers.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

1. General news story.
2. Feature: Investigative & in-depth reporting and news analysis, often written by bylined senior journalists.
3. Editorial.
4. Column: Bylined articles in which columnists convey their views and analyses of a specific issue. The columns—‘Taiwan Indigenous Peoples’ and ‘Photographer’—are included in this category.
5. Commentary: Short comments and leaderette that are often displayed in a box format in which staff writers express their criticisms and opinions to a specific issue.
6. Reader’s letter to the editor.
7. Literature supplement: Those articles, essays, poems or short fictions printed on the supplementary page of literature & art of each paper are included in this category.
8. Others
0: No photo (appeared next to the news item).
1: One photo.
2: Two photos.
3: Three photos.
   The value is equal to the number of the photos.
9: Others: Cartoon, paintings, drawings or illustrations.

The code of 'Image' refers to the main contents of pictures.
01: Government officials: Administration workers & elected public officials
02: Various representatives: National assemblyman, legislators (MP), provincial assemblyman, county councilman and township representatives.
03: Indigenous movements and protests.
04: Indigenous peoples in traditional clothes and outfits.
05: Aboriginal village and community.
06: Traditional artifacts and musical instruments.
07: Motion pictures about indigenous peoples.
08: Indigenous Cultural Conference.
09: President Lee’s audience with indigenous peoples.
10: Ordinary indigenous peoples (not in traditional wear).
11: Ordinary Han Chinese.
12: City building & subway station.
13: Indigenous peoples listening to candidates’ campaign speech.
14: Animals & hunting traps.
15: Traditional sports contest & training.
16: Pingpu tribe’s temple and sacrificial offerings.
17: Indigenous scholars & intellectuals.
18: Mountain & seacoast scenery.
19: Art museum & artworks.
20: Democratic Progressive Party members.
21: Indigenous athletes.
22: Historical sites, relics and altars.
23: Media workers & reporters.
24: Indigenous hunters.
25: Indigenous farmers.
26: (Legendary) plants & agricultural products.
27: Han scholars and anthropologists.
28: National park patrolmen.
29: Earthquake disaster.
30: Religious workers & missionaries.
31: Aboriginal hunting sword, bow & arrow.
32: Indigenous artists.
33: Books and magazines.
34: Businessmen.
35: Construction sites & aboriginal workplace in cities.
36: Singers & actors.
37: Memorial service and funeral procession.
38: School students.
39: Physicians.
40: Tourists.
41: Witch doctors and sorcerers.
42: Radioactive contamination of a seacoast reef.
43: Teaching of aboriginal language.
44: Indigenous political victims.
45: Authors (writers) of news stories.
46: Church.
47: Police.
48: Dynamite explosion in mountains for mineral resources.
49: Aboriginal traditional wedding.
50: Yami people building canoe.
51: Local public officials: Aboriginal township & village chiefs.
98: Others.
99: Unclear/ cannot code.
00: No pictures.

Author 15

1: The item was written by an aboriginal writer or contributor.
2: The item was written by a non-indigenous Han Chinese author.
3: The item was translated into Chinese but the original author was a foreigner.
9: Unclear/ cannot code ( such as anonymous articles; unbylined news items and stories; or collective presentation in which the authors cannot be identified individually.)

Headline Actor 16-23

C16 and C20 are designated as coding the form of appearance of the primary actor in C16 and secondary actor in C20 in the headline.
1: The actor is quoted.
2: The actor is referred to.
0: Neither referred to nor quoted.

C17 and C21 are the spaces to code the actor’s group, either individual ( code 1-4 ) or collective ( code 5 ) in the boldface type as follows:

1. Indigenous Peoples.
2. Han Chinese.
3. Foreigners.
4. Unidentified ethnic individuals
C18-C19 and C22-C23 are designated as the spaces to code who are the primary (C18-C19) and secondary (C22-C23) actors in the headline listed as follows:

01: Government officials: Administration workers & elected public officials.
02: Various representatives: National assemblyman, legislators (MP), provincial assemblyman, county councilman and township representatives.
03: Police & judiciary.
04: Scholars & intellectuals (including writers such as essayists, novelists and poets as well as anthropologists).
05: Teachers & educators.
06: Experts.
07: Political party leaders.
08: Civic organisation leaders.
09: Social workers.
10: Members of business community.
11: Ordinary civilians.
12: Religious workers & missionaries.
13: Media workers and reporters.
14: Movement leaders & protesters.
15: Labours & workers.
16: Athletes.
17: School students.
18: Singers, dancers and movie actors.
19: Music & drama director and producer.
20: Traditional chiefs and local opinion leaders (including witch doctors and sorcerers).
21: Physicians.
22: Crime suspect & victim.
23: Artists.
24: Tourists.
25: Farmers & hunters.
26: Local public officials: Aboriginal township & village chiefs.
98: Others.

5. Collective Actors
01: Cabinet Ministries & central (Federal) government agencies and organisations.
02: Provincial & metropolitan government agencies and organisations.
03: County & township government agencies and organisations.
04: Legislative Yuan (Parliament), Control Yuan & National Assembly.
05: Provincial Assembly & metropolitan councils.
06: County & township councils.
07: Police & judiciary.
08: Kuomintang (KMT).
09: Democratic Progressive Party (DPP).
10: Social affairs organisations.
11: Business Community & financial organisations.
12: Hospitals & charities.
13: Religious organisations & missionaries.
14: Indigenous civic organisations.
15: 'Indigenous People' & tribal names.
16: 'Mountain People' (Shanpao).
17: Media institutions & film libraries.
18: 'Han' Chinese.
19: Academic institutions & schools.
20: Art museums.
21: Ordinary civilians.
22: Indigenous performing groups.
23: Physical education associations & organisations.
24: Indigenous movement leaders.
25: Military organisations.
26: Intellectuals & scholars.
27: Non-indigenous interest groups.
28: Farmers & hunters.
29: Crime suspect & victim.
98: Others.
999: Unclear/ cannot code.
000: No headline and no actors: Neither referred to nor quoted.

### News Actor

1: The actor with which the news story is concerned is the Yuanchumin (Taiwan indigenous peoples) as a whole.
2: The mountain Yuanchumin.
3: The plains Yuanchumin.
4: The urban Yuanchumin living in cities and metropolitan areas (The already-assimilated Pingpu tribe is included in this category).
9: Unclear/cannot code.

### Subject & Theme

The subjects are divided into 12 categories in boldface type, while the themes are grouped in normal type under the subject heading. The first four columns C25-C28 are designated as the spaces to code both the major subject C25-C26 and theme C27-C28. The secondary subject and theme are coded in C29-C32, with the subject in C29-C30 and theme in C31-C32.

#### 01. Political News:

01: General government policies.
02: Politics & elections.
03: Indigenous legislators & representatives demanding indigenous rights.
04: Indigenous movements & protests demanding indigenous rights.
05: Memorial service for an indigenous movement leader.
06: Constitutional Amendment for indigenous rights.

02. Economic News:
01: Aboriginal township development.
02: Urban living development.
03: Land & mineral resources development and disputes.
04: Community transportation development and problems.
05: Commerce & trade training for indigenous peoples.

03. Educational News:
01: Aboriginal bilingual education.
02: Aboriginal history.
03: Aboriginal school facility.
04: Educational privilege, scholarship & benefit.
05: School activity & alumni reunion.
06: Social education teaching curriculum.
07: General educational policy.
08: Teacher’s problems & training programmes.
09: Students’ problems.
10: Textbook.

04. Culture & Art:
01: Annual harvest festivals & traditional rites.
02: Indigenous Cultural Conference.
03: Art museum & handicraft exhibition.
04: Aboriginal religions.
05: Historical sites, relics and old villages.
06: Traditional musical instruments.
07: Indigenous customs & social organisations.
08: Indigenous song and dance presentation and contest.
09: Cultural preservation: establish cultural village and workshop.
10: Hunting & fishing cultural heritage.
11: Traditional village building and architecture.
12: Weaving, carving and sculpture.
13: Legend & myth (including sorcery).
14: Indigenous languages, literature & writing symbols.
15: New books about indigenous peoples and their reviews.

05. Social Affairs:
01: Government housing policy.
02: Charity & relief.
03: Social welfare programmes and problems.
04: Government loans for indigenous peoples.
05: Vocational training & employment incentive programmes.
06: Social work and assistance from independent organisations.
07: Establish service centre for urban aborigines.

06. Agriculture & Forest:
01: Agricultural harvests & products.
02: Agricultural development programmes.
03: Forest development programmes.

07. Medical & Health:
01: Health & hygiene.
02: Medical facility & benefit.
03: Aboriginal doctor & medical schooling.

08. Social Problems & Crimes:
01: Housing problems.
02: Drug & alcoholic.
03: Prostitutes.
04: Unemployment.
05: Urban aboriginal problems.
06: Labour insurance & work problems.
07: Hunting and fishing problems.
08: Accident & suicide.
09: Bribe & embezzlement.
10: Race relations problems.

09. Natural Environment:
01: Natural disaster: typhoon, flood & earthquake.
02: Soil conservation problems.
03: Water & dam problems.
04: Protect extinct animals & plant species.
05: Nuclear waste disposal disputes & radioactive contamination.
06: National park news and disputes.
07: General environment pollution: industrial wastes, air and traffic pollution.

10. Tourism, Media & Entertainment:
01: Scenery & tourism.
02: Aboriginal TV & movie programmes and film exhibition.
03: Aboriginal journalists training program.
04: Aboriginal song & movie stars.
05: Native press news.

11. Sports News:
01: Assistance for training Aboriginal athletes.
02: Sports competitions.
03: Physical education associations & organisations.
04: Sporting equipments and facilities.

12. Human Interest Story:
01: Special characters in profile in literature and feature stories.
02: Aboriginal interest stories.

13: Military & Police:
01: Law & order.
02: Lifting mountain control area.
03: National defense and security.
04: Search and rescue in emergency.
05: Military training and firing range.
06: Police interrogation and abuse.
98: Others.
99: Unclear/cannot code.
00: No secondary subjects and themes.

News Quotation 33-41

C33 -C35 are designated as quoting the major speaker in news stories. Code up to two secondary C36-C38 and C39-C41 in the order of importance in their quotes. C33, C36 and C39 are the spaces to code the group to which the actor belongs. They are listed in boldface type as follows:

1. Indigenous People.
2. Han Chinese.
3. Foreigners.
4. Unidentified ethnic individuals

01: Government officials: Administration workers & elected public officials.
02: Various representatives: National assemblyman, legislators (MP), provincial assemblyman, county councilman and township representatives.
03: Police & judiciary.
04: Scholars & intellectuals (including writers such as essayists, novelists and poets as well as anthropologists).
05: Teachers & educators.
06: Experts.
07: Political party leaders.
08: Civic organisation leaders.
09: Social workers.
10: Members of business community.
11: Ordinary civilians.
12: Religious workers & missionaries.
13: Media workers and reporters.
14: Movement leaders & protesters.
15: Labours & workers.
16: Athletes.
17: School students.
18: Singers, dancers and movie actors.
19: Music & drama director and producer.
20: Traditional chiefs and local opinion leaders (including witch doctors and sorcerers).
21: Physicians.
22: Crime suspect & victim.
23: Artists.
24: Tourists.
25: Farmers & hunters.
26: Local public officials: Aboriginal township & village chiefs.
98: Others.

5. Collective Actors
01: Cabinet Ministries & central (Federal) government agencies and organisations.
02: Provincial & metropolitan government agencies and organisations.
03: County & township government agencies and organisations.
04: Legislative Yuan (Parliament), Control Yuan & National Assembly.
05: Provincial Assembly & metropolitan councils.
06: County & township councils.
07: Police & judiciary.
08: Kuomintang (KMT).
09: Democratic Progressive Party (DPP).
10: Social affairs organisations.
11: Business Community & financial organisations.
12: Hospitals & charities.
13: Religious organisations & missionaries.
14: Indigenous civic organisations.
16: ‘Mountain People’ (Shanpao).
17: Media institutions & film libraries.
18: ‘Han’ Chinese.
19: Academic institutions & schools.
20: Art museums.
21: Ordinary civilians.
22: Indigenous performing groups.
23: Physical education associations & organisations.
24: Indigenous movement leaders.
25: Military organisations.
26: Intellectuals & scholars.
27: Non-indigenous interest groups.
28: Farmers & hunters.
29: Crime suspect & victim.
98: Others.
999: Unclear/cannot code.
000: No speaker is quoted or secondary speaker is absent.
The size of each news item is measured by the unit of square centimeters \( (\text{cm}^2) \). The actual value of the size is rounded off. The size of photo (cartoon, painting, etc.), the headline and the news items are summed up in this value category.
Appendix 5

Headlines of Mayasvi News Items¹
(Feb. 12–18, 1995)

Feb. 12

*United Daily News*

1. 阿里山瑪雅斯比祭 不對外開放
Alishan *Mayasvi chi* pu tui wai kaifang
(Alishan *Mayasvi* rite will not be open to outsiders.)
汪念星：這是鄒族戰技祭儀活動 和「豐年」完全搭不上邊
Wang Nien-hsing: Che shih Tsou tsu chanchi chiyi huotung
han ‘feng nien’ wanchuan ta pu shang pien
(Wang Nien-hsing: this is Tsou tribe war skill ritual activity, and it is completely unrelated to the ‘bumper year’.)

Feb. 14

*Central Daily News*

2. 瑪雅斯比祭典 邀鄒族人響應
Mayasvi chitien yao Tsou tsu jen hsiangying
(Mayasvi rite will invite Tsou tribe people to participate.)

¹ The Chinese characters of this appendix are identical to the headlines appeared on the newspapers. The bold characters refer to the main headlines and the light ones to the sub-headlines. The passages within the parenthesis are English translations of the headlines. The system of romanising Chinese characters adopted in this appendix is based on the Romanisation System pioneered by Thomas Wade, which is different from the one used in China. I opt on this system because it is widely used in Taiwan. The underlined words are marked by abbreviations in parenthesis which are derived from Li and Thompson’s *Mandarin Chinese: A Functional Reference Grammar* (1981). ‘ASSOC’ stands for ‘associative’; ‘CL’ for ‘classifier’; ‘NOM’ for ‘nominaliser’.
Feb. 16

**China Times**

3. 阿里山鄒族豐年祭有看頭
   Alishan Tsou tsu feng nien chi yu kantou
   (Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite was worth seeing.)
   祭典昨日舉行 參觀證一張賣五百元引起批評
   Chitien tsojih chuhsing tsankuan cheng yi chang mai 500 yuan yin chi piping
   (CL)
   (The rite was held yesterday. The visit card which was sold for 500 yuan each has
   aroused criticism.)

**United Daily News**

4. 鄒族瑪雅斯比祭典 雨中進行 莊嚴肅穆
   Tsou tsu Mayasvi chitien yu chung chinhhsing chuangyuan sumu
   (Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite was proceeding in the rain in a dignified and
   solemn atmosphere.)
   依循傳統習俗 勇士展開迎神、團結、成年禮等儀式 晚上歌舞祭通宵達旦
   yihsun chuantung hsisu yungshih chankai ying shen tuanchieh chengnien li teng
   yishih wanshang ke wu chi tung hsiao ta tan
   (Following traditional customs, brave men started welcoming god, solidarity
   and adulthood ceremonies, etc. In the night the song and dance rite continued till
   daybreak.)

**Central Daily News**

5. 鄒族瑪雅斯比祭 隆重登場
   Tsou tsu Mayasvi chi lungchung tengchang
   (Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite appeared onstage solemnly.)
   爲嘉縣阿里山鄒族豐年祭掀高潮
   wei chia hsien Alishan hsiang feng nien chi hsien kao chao
   (It opened the climax for harvest rite at Alishan township in Chiayi county)
6. 大雨不息尋回傳統文化的決心
Ta yu chiao pu hsi hsun hui chuantung wen-hua ti chuchhsin
(ASSOC)
(Heavy rain did not discourage the determination of restoring traditional culture.)

Tsou tsu manchiang jeching ying Mayasvi chi
(Tsou tribe greeted Mayasvi rite with full passion.)

7. 阿里山鄒族豐年祭　歌舞迎嘉賓
Alishan Tsou tsu feng nien chi ke wu ying chia pin
(Alishan Tsou tribe harvest rite greeted noble guests with song and dance.)

Shou tsu shihshih kou piao juchang chih chienlou ti kuanchung hsi ling hua
(CL)
(NOM)
500 yuan ti minchung tahan ‘pu chihte’
(NOM)
(It was the first time to practise the admission ticket purchase system. The simple and crude visitors’ seats made the people who spent 500 yuan exclaim ‘Not worthy’.)

8. 兩年小修 二十年大修 四十年得重建
Liang nien hsiao hsiu erhshih nien ta hsiu Szushih nien te chung chien
(Small fix in two years, big fix in twenty years and it needed to be reestablished in 40 years.)

庫巴　鄒族人最莊嚴的居所
Kupa tsou tsu jen tsui chuangyuan ti chuso
(NOM)
(Kupa was the most dignified place for Tsou tribe.)

9. 鄒族「豐年祭」與粟收無關
Tsou tsu ‘feng nien chi’ yu sushou wu kuan
(Tsou tribe ‘harvest rite’ had nothing to do with millet harvest.)

Tribe sought divine help. This year it was Tefuyeh community’s turn to host.)
10. 鄒族瑪雅斯比祭隆重舉行
Tsou tsu Mayasvi chi lungchung chuhsing
(Tsou tribe Mayasvi rite took place solemnly.)
今年增加高雄縣桃源鄉二部落原住民 所有儀式依照古禮進行
chin nien tsengchia kaohsiung hsien taoyuan hsiang erh pulo yuanchumin
soyu yishih yichao ku li chingsing
(This year was joined by two tribal communities from Taoyuan township,
Kaohsiung county. All ceremonies were proceeding in accordance with the ancient
rite.)

11. (祭典須知) 庫巴、木欏闌、赤榕樹祭典三要角
Kupa muchiehlan chih jung shu chitien san yao chueh
(Kupa, orchid and red banyan tree were three important characters in the
rite.)

12. 「瑪雅斯比」祭 鄒族勇士跳戰舞
‘Mayasvi’ chi tsou tsu yung shih tiao chan wu
(In the Mayasvi rite, Tsou tribe brave men performed war dance.)
迎戰神、成年禮 傳承文化意義深：收門票、賣簡介 參觀民衆有微詞
ying chan shen cheng nien li chuancheng wenhua yiyi shen;
shou men piao mai chenchieh chankuan minchung yu weitzu
(Welcoming war god, adulthood ceremony. Inheriting culture was significant.
Receiving admission ticket, selling programme list. Visitors had criticisms.)

13. 戰神下凡 神樹為梯花為誌
Chan shen hsiafan Shen shu wei ti hua wei chih
(War god came down to the world. Sacred tree was the ladder and flower was
the mark.)
神樹為赤榕 神花則為木欏闌
Shen shu wei chih jung shen hua tse wei muchiehlan
(Sacred tree was red banyan tree, while sacred flower was orchid.)
14. 「瑪雅斯比」非豐年祭
'Mayasvi' fei feng nien chi
('Mayasvi' was not harvest rite.)

15. 庫巴 男人會所、女人止步
Kupa nanjen huiso nujen chihpu
(Kupa, men's meeting place, prohibited women.)

Feb. 17

China Times

16. 鄒族「瑪雅斯比祭」歡樂落幕
Tsou tsu 'Mayasvi chi' huanle lomu
(Tsou tribe 'Mayasvi rite' brought down the curtain in joy and happiness.)
失散百年認祖歸宗 阿里山上歌舞狂歡兩天一夜
shihsan pai nien jenchu kueitzung alishan san ke wu kuang huan liang tien yi yeh
(One hundred years' loss of ancestral lineage was recovered. The wild pleasure of singing and dancing in Alishan lasted for two days and one night.)
Bibliography

**English References**


Free China Review (1993a) 'From the Editor's Desk,' in vol. 43, no. 6.


Government Information Office (GIO) (1994b) *Questions and Answers about the Republic of China on Taiwan*. Taipei: GIO.


Langton, Marcia (1993) ‘Well, I heard it on the Radio and I saw it on the Television...’: *An essay for the Australian Film Commission on the politics and aesthetics of filmmaking by and about Aboriginal people and things*. Australian Film Commission.


O'Donnell, Susan and Delgado, Guillermo (1995) 'Using the Internet to Strengthen the Indigenous Nations of the Americas,' in Media Development. no. 3.


Van Dijk, Teun A. (1993c) 'Editor's Foreword to Critical Discourse Analysis,' in *Discourse and Society*. vol. 4, no. 2.


Chinese References


Chen, Chao-zu (1994b) ‘Evergreen Mountain Villages Enjoy Scarce Applause from Tribal Folks,’ in Independent Morning Post, 13 June, 1994. (陳昭如，‘高山部落有著族人稀落的掌聲’)


---

1 As these Chinese references are my English translation of the Chinese books, journals, newspapers and articles, each entry is followed by author and title of the original reference in Chinese characters in the hope of improving the English translation and enhancing the originality of these references.
Magazine. (鄭元慶,「台灣原住民文化(1)」)


Hsieh, Shih-chung (1987b) 'Toward Dynamic Theories of the Origin and Development of Aboriginal Movements: The Cases of North America and Taiwan,' in Bulletin of the Institute of Ethnology. no. 64. pp. 139-177.(謝世忠,‘原住民運動生成與發展理論的建立’,出自「中央研究院民族學研究所集刊」第 64 期)


Hsu, Mu-chu and Chu, Hai-yuan (1992) An Examination of the Effects of Shanpao Guidance and Measures. Taipei: Research, Development and Evaluation Commission, Executive Yuan.(許木柱、翟海源,「山胞輔導措施績效之檢討」)


Hua, Chia-chih (1994) 'Some Thoughts about Aboriginal Cultural Policy,' in Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly. vol. 6. (華加志,“關於原住民文化政策的幾點思考”,出自「山海文化」雙月刊)

Huang Chao-tang (1994) 'Post-War Taiwan Independence Movement and the Development of Taiwanese Nationalism,' in Shih, Cheng-feng (ed.) Taiwanese Nationalism. Taipei: Taiwan: Taiwan Association of University Professors. (黃昭堂,‘戰後台灣獨立運動與台灣民族主義的發展’)

Huang Hsiu-cheng (1992) A Study of Taiwan's History. Taipei: Taiwan Students' Bookstore. (黃秀政,「台灣史研究」)


Li, C.C. (1989) The Thoughts of Neo-Marxism (Taipei, Taiwan: Kuei Kuan Co.)
L., (, 理公, 「新馬克思主義思潮」)


Lin, Chun-sheng (1953) Anthology of Frontier Culture. Taipei: Commission of Chinese Culture and Publication Affairs. (凌純聲, 「邊疆文化論集(1)」)


Liu, Shih-chich (1994) 'A Distant Respect,' in Taiwan Indigenous Voice Bimonthly. vol. 4. ( 劉世傑,「遠離的尊重」)


Paluerh, Yichiang (ed.) (1987) 'Foreword' to Yuanchumin. Taipei: Alliance of Taiwan Aborigines. (夷將・拔鹿兒〈劉文雄〉「原住民」)

Paluerh, Yichiang (1994) The History of Renaming Movement from 'Shanpao' to 'Yuanchumin'. A report to be published in the Taiwan Historiographical Study (Bi-annually). vol. 5. (夷將・拔鹿兒〈劉文雄〉「從〈山胞〉到〈原住民〉的正名運動史」,刊載於「台灣史料研究半年刊」第 5 期)

Peng, Chia-fa and Fang, Chien-san (in press) Journalism. Taipei: Open University. (彭家發、馮建三,「新聞學」)


Sun, Ta-chuan (1992) 'The Writings of Aboriginal Cultural History and Spiritual World,' in Chinese and Foreign Literature Monthly (Chung Wai Wen Rsueh). vol. 21, no. 3. (孫大川,‘原住民文化歷史與心靈世界的撰寫’,出自「中外文學」第21期第3號)


Sun, Ta-chuan (1995) 'From the History of Discourse to the History of Writing,' Paper presented at the Conference of Taiwan: One Hundred Years in Jan., 1995 Taipei. (孫大川,「從言說的歷史到書寫的歷史」,發表於「百年來的台灣研討會」)


Taiwan Provincial Historiographical Commission (1977) The History of Taiwan. Taichung: Taiwan Provincial Historiographical Commission. (台灣省文獻委員會編印,「台灣史」)


Teng, Hsiang-yang and Huang, Hsuan-hsing (1995) Ode to the Ho-huan Mountain. Nantou, Taiwan: Jen-ai Township Office. (鄧相揚、黃炫星,「合歡禮讚」)

Tsai, Chung-han (1993) The Origin of Taiwan Aboriginal Tribes. Paper presented at
the Conference of Taitung Adult Education. (蔡中涵,「台灣原住民族之起源」，
發表於「台東成人教育研討會」)

Tuan, Cheng-pu et al. (1992) *Postwar Economy of Taiwan.* Taipei: Jen-chien
Publishing Co. (段承琦等,「台灣戰後經濟」)

Ten Years,’ in *Press Milestones of the Republic of China.* Taipei: Taipei Journalists
Union. (王石福,‘十年來台灣地區廣告發展試析’,出自「中華民國新聞年鑑八
十年版」)

Wu, Nai-te (1993) ‘Provincial Ethnicity, Political Support and National Identity,’ in
Chang, Mao-kuei et al. *Ethnic Relation and National Identity.* Taipei: Chang
Yung-fa Foundation and Institute for National Policy Research. (吳乃德,‘省籍意
識、政治支持和國家認同：台灣族群政治理論的初探’, 收錄在「族群關係與
國家認同」一書)

Wu, Wen-min (ed.) (1992) *The Origin of Taiwan Mountain Tribes and Motherland.*
Taipei: Taiwan Shanpao Cultural and Economic Development Association. (吳文
明等,「台灣高山族與祖國之淵源」)

Conference of Ethnic Relations and Regional Development in Taipei. (吳燕和,‘族
類意識之創造與再創造’, 發表於「族群關係與區域發展研討會」)

國八十年、八十一周年報業回顧’, 出自「中華民國八十二年出版年鑑」)

Yang, Hsiao-zhong (1991) ‘An Observation on the Newspaper Management,’ in
*Press Milestones of the Republic of China.* Taipei: Taipei Journalists Union. (楊孝
榮,‘報社經營策略的觀察’, 出自「中華民國新聞年鑑八十年版」)

Culture Co. (余英時,「文化評論與中國情懷」)

Yukan, Walis (1990) ‘The Demise and Revival of the Twilight Tribes,’ in the
*Indigenous Post.* no. 4. (瓦歷斯・尤幹,「夕陽族群的死滅和重建」)

(瓦歷斯·尤幹,「番刀出鞘」)